



Open Research Online

Citation

Singh, Arun Deo; Jung, Simon J. A.; Anand, Pallavi; Kroon, Dick and Ganeshram, Raja S. (2018). Rapid switch in monsoon-wind induced surface hydrographic conditions of the eastern Arabian Sea during the last deglaciation. *Quaternary International*, 479 pp. 3–11.

URL

<https://oro.open.ac.uk/54021/>

License

(CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0) Creative Commons: Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 4.0

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

Policy

This document has been downloaded from Open Research Online, The Open University's repository of research publications. This version is being made available in accordance with Open Research Online policies available from [Open Research Online \(ORO\) Policies](#)

Versions

If this document is identified as the Author Accepted Manuscript it is the version after peer review but before type setting, copy editing or publisher branding

Title: Rapid switch in monsoon-wind induced surface hydrographic conditions of the eastern Arabian Sea during the last deglaciation.

Arun Deo Singh¹, Simon J.A. Jung², Pallavi Anand³, Dick Kroon⁴, Raja S. Ganeshram⁵

1 Arun Deo Singh (*Corresponding author*)

Department of Geology, Banaras Hindu University, Varanasi-221005, India

Email: arundeosingh@yahoo.com

Tel: +91-542-2366070, Fax: +91-542-2369425

2 Simon J. A. Jung

School of GeoSciences, Grant Institute, University of Edinburgh, The King,s Buildings,
West Mains Road, Edinburgh EH9 3JW, UK

Email: simon.jung@ed.ac.uk

3 Pallavi Anand

Department of Environment, Earth and Ecosystems, The Open University,
Milton Keynes, MK76AA, UK

Email: pallavi.anand@open.ac.uk

4 Dick Kroon

School of GeoSciences, Grant Institute, University of Edinburgh, The King,s Buildings,
West Mains Road, Edinburgh EH9 3JW, UK

Email: dkroon@staffmail.ed.ac.uk

5 Raja S. Ganeshram

School of GeoSciences, Grant Institute, University of Edinburgh, The King,s Buildings,
West Mains Road, Edinburgh EH9 3JW, UK

Email: r.ganeshram@ed.ac.uk

1 **Rapid switch in monsoon-wind induced surface hydrographic conditions of the eastern**
2 **Arabian Sea during the last deglaciation**

3
4 **ABSTRACT**

5
6 Surface water hydrography in the Arabian Sea is primarily governed by the Asian monsoon
7 wind system. Changes in the composition of fossil planktic foraminiferal assemblages and sea
8 surface temperatures (SST) in sediment core SK17, retrieved from offshore of central India, are
9 used to decipher past changes in sea-surface hydrographic conditions linked mainly to the winter
10 monsoon winds. The planktic foraminiferal assemblage and the SST records indicate a rapid
11 switch in sea-surface hydrographic conditions around 17.5 ka BP marking the end of last glacial
12 period. The data show that intensified winter winds during 17.5 to 23.5 ka BP, resulted in
13 nutrient injection into surface waters and eutrophic conditions, mainly through deep vertical
14 mixing and/or moderate upwelling; and reduction in winter wind intensity caused stratification
15 characterized by the high tropical SST since 17.5 ka BP. The timing of the rapid switch in
16 seawater conditions caused by a drop in strength of winter monsoon winds is coeval with the
17 cold climate excursion in the northern hemisphere (Heinrich Event 1), suggesting that the two
18 areas are climatically linked.

19
20 *Keywords:* Arabian Sea; hydrography; winter monsoon; last deglaciation; Heinrich Event

21
22 **1. Introduction**

23
24 In the Arabian Sea, seasonally reversing air flow of the Asian monsoon produces spatial
25 changes in surface circulation, hydrography and biological productivity. Through time, changes
26 in the composition of planktic foraminiferal assemblages and sea surface temperatures largely
27 reflect the history of upper water column conditions in response to changes in direction and/or
28 strength of seasonal monsoon winds. Previous paleoceanographic studies using fossil planktic
29 foraminifera were focused mainly on the western and northern regions predominantly influenced
30 by the southwest (summer) monsoon. These studies have provided crucial insights into the

31 processes controlling summer monsoon variability on orbital and sub-orbital scales (eg. Clemens
32 et al., 1991; Anderson and Prell, 1993; Venec-Peyre et al., 1995; Naidu and Malmgren, 1996;
33 Reichart et al., 1998; von Rad et al., 1999; Venec-Peyre and Caulet, 2000; Jung et al., 2002;
34 Gupta et al., 2003). However, high resolution planktic foraminiferal records from the eastern
35 Arabian Sea, a region sensitive to the winter (northeast) monsoon circulation, are scarce.
36 Therefore, our understanding of winter monsoon variability and associated changes in sea-
37 surface hydrography particularly remains poor.

38 Previous studies have shown that wind driven changes in productivity and sea surface
39 temperatures (SST) occurred at the millennial-scale in the western and northern Arabian Sea
40 (e.g. Schulz et al., 1998; Ivanochko et al., 2005). Summer monsoon wind-induced upwelling
41 generally reduced in the western and northern Arabian Sea during the glacial period, and
42 particularly during extreme cold phases (Heinrich Events) in the northern hemisphere (Sirocko et
43 al., 1993; Schulz et al., 1998; Ivanochko et al., 2005; Anand et al., 2008; Singh et al., 2011). The
44 pattern of changes in surface hydrography of the eastern Arabian Sea, however, may well be
45 different from those in the western and northern Arabian Sea, because of the dominant influence
46 of winter monsoon winds in this area. At present, the winter winds cause shallow vertical mixing
47 and sporadic upwelling along the central coast of India (Colborn, 1975; Zhang, 1985;
48 Madhupratap et al., 1996; Schott and McCreary, 2001). Stratification of the surface waters
49 occurs in summer because of increased fluvial runoff over the eastern Arabian Sea during the
50 rainy summer season. In recent years, attempts have been made to study millennial-scale
51 productivity variations in the eastern Arabian Sea influenced by seasonal monsoon air flow
52 intensities, based on changes in the planktic foraminifera (Singh et al., 2006, 2011) and
53 coccolithophore assemblages (Cabarcos et al., 2014). Changes in the upper water column
54 structure through time, however, relating to millennial-scale variations in monsoon winds have
55 not been studied in detail for the late glacial – Holocene.

56 We present planktic foraminiferal assemblage and Mg/Ca based SST records from
57 sediment core SK 17 retrieved off Goa. This core provides a continuous record of upper ocean
58 conditions in the eastern Arabian Sea during the last 30 ka BP. In particular, the reconstructions
59 reveal millennial- scale changes in trophic conditions of the upper water column influenced by
60 seasonal monsoon (summer vs winter) air flow intensities since the Last Glacial Maximum

61 (LGM). We explore links between these monsoon-induced air flow changes, global climate and
62 deep-sea circulation.

63

64 **2. Oceanographic Setting**

65

66 Surface ocean circulation along the west coast of India is driven by seasonally reversing
67 monsoon winds. Between June and September, SW monsoon winds prevail over the Arabian Sea
68 (Fig. 1a). During this season, the West Indian Coastal Current (WICC) flows southward along
69 the eastern margin of the Arabian Sea and joins the eastward flowing Southwest Monsoon
70 Current (SMC) in the southeastern Arabian Sea (Schott and McCreary, 2001). Locally, high
71 precipitation and runoff from the Western Ghats during the summer leads to a stratified surface
72 water (Joseph and Freeland, 2005). The fluvial runoff supplies nutrient into surface waters,
73 which can induce a local increase in productivity (Cabarcos et al., 2014). Further south, weak
74 upwelling occurs along the southwest coast of India (south of 10° N) during this season (Sharma,
75 1966; Wyrтки, 1973; Naidu et al., 1999) resulting in the presence of moderately cold, nutrient-
76 rich surface water in the region (Fig. 1a,b) .

77 During winter (December to March), the wind flow reverses and the NE monsoon prevails
78 (Fig. 1a). Because of the reversed air flow, a cyclonic circulation develops causing weak and
79 sporadic upwelling along the coasts off Pakistan and India (Colborn, 1975; Zhang, 1985; Bauer
80 *et al.*, 1991). The cool and dry NE monsoon winds intensify evaporation, leading to surface
81 cooling and vertical mixing in the eastern Arabian Sea, north of 10° N (Fig. 1b) [Banse and
82 McClain, 1986; Madhupratap et al., 1996; Kumar et al., 2000]. The vertical mixing leads to a
83 mild increase in primary productivity (Shalin, 2017). During this time, the WICC reverses and
84 the Northeast Monsoon Current (NMC) transports waters from the Bay of Bengal (BOB) into the
85 southeastern Arabian Sea up to 13° N (Sarma, 2003).

86

87 **3. Material and Methods**

88

89 Gravity core SK17 was retrieved from the sea bed off the central western Indian margin off
90 Goa from 840 m water depth (Lat. 15° 15 ' N and Long. 72° 58 ' E; core length 470 cm) during the
91 ORV Sagar Kanya Cruise in 1999 (Fig.1). The sediment sequence is characterized by alternating

92 dark-coloured laminated and light-coloured bioturbated layers, free of gravity flows (Singh et al.,
93 2006). Today the core site is well above the Calcite Compensation Depth (Belyaeva and
94 Burmistrova, 1984). Singh et al. (2006) have evaluated dissolution effects on planktic
95 foraminiferal tests in sediments of core SK 17. The results indicate that there is no evidence of
96 significant dissolution of the tests over the last 30 ka BP.

97 The core was sampled every 1 cm interval up to one meter and further at 2 cm regular
98 intervals. Alternate samples at 2 to 4 cm intervals were used in this study for planktic
99 foraminiferal census counts. Dried sediments were washed over a 63 μm screen. The resulting
100 dry residues were sieved over a 125 μm screen. Census counts of planktic foraminifera were
101 made on the $>125 \mu\text{m}$ fraction. The taxonomy of the planktic foraminifera is based on Kennett
102 and Srinivasan (1983) and Hemleben et al. (1989). The relative abundance (%) of each species
103 was calculated and plotted against depth to illustrate the down-core distribution patterns. In order
104 to explain interrelationships in a multivariate database by the presence of a few key factors, we
105 carried out Q mode factor analysis on the planktic foraminiferal relative abundances, using the
106 SPSS 10.0. All species with a relative abundance $> 2 \%$ were included in this analysis (Table 1).
107 Nitrogen isotopes ($\delta^{15}\text{N}$) were measured using a CE Instruments NA 2500 Elemental Analyser
108 interfaced with a VG PRISMIII stable isotope spectrometer in continuous flow mode with
109 helium carrier gas. The standard used is atmospheric nitrogen. The precision of measurement is
110 ± 0.2 per mil. In addition to our new data (foraminiferal assemblage and $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ records), we also
111 include previously published Mg/Ca -SST and $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{w}}$ time series (Anand et al., 2008), the C_{org}
112 record (Singh et al., 2006) and the aragonite record (Singh, 2007) of the same core SK 17. A
113 section of the foraminiferal data (abundance ratio of *Globigerinoides ruber* and *Globigerina*
114 *bulloides* and abundance total of fertile species viz. *G. bulloides*, *G. falconensis*, *G. glutinata*
115 and *Neogloboquadrina dutertrei*) has been published earlier (Singh et al., 2011). The age model
116 for core SK 17 is based on 26 AMS ^{14}C dates and has been published previously (Singh et al.,
117 2011). The AMS ^{14}C dates are based on monospecific samples of *Globigerinoides ruber*.
118 Further details on the chronology are given in Singh et al. (2011).

119

120 **4. Results**

121

122 *4.1. Planktic foraminiferal census counts*

123

124 In total, 27 planktic foraminiferal species were found in core SK 17. The most abundant
125 species, accounting on average for more than 80 % of the assemblage are: *Globigerinoides ruber*
126 (26 %), *Globigerinita glutinata* (14.5 %), *Globigerina bulloides* (9.5 %), *Neogloboquadrina*
127 *dutertrei* (9 %), *Globigerinoides quadrilobatus* (6 %), *Gobigerina falconensis* (5.5 %),
128 *Globigerinoides sacculifer* (4 %), *Globorotalia menardii* (4 %), and *Pulleniatina obliquiloculata*
129 (4 %). The relative abundance records of these species are shown in Fig. 2. The faunal record
130 reveals that the planktic foraminiferal assemblages of the core are generally characterized by
131 predominance of the *G. ruber* - *quadrilobatus* - *sacculifer* group (> 40 %). The cumulative
132 abundance of these three species shows minima in the period 17.5 – 23.5 ka BP and the late
133 Holocene (Fig. 2).

134 *G. bulloides* is an important species of the faunal assemblages of core SK17 with
135 minimum concentrations of 4 % and maximum concentrations of up to 21 %. Its abundance
136 maxima occur during the periods 22.5 - 23.5 ka BP and 18 -19 ka BP (Fig. 2). The abundance
137 pattern of *G. falconensis* generally follows that of *G. bulloides* (Fig. 2). *G. glutinata* is another
138 significant species, its relative abundance varies between 2 and 25 % (Fig. 2). This species shows
139 high abundances during the periods 18 - 22 ka BP and 27 - 28 ka BP, and in the late Holocene
140 (Fig. 2).

141 Other important taxa of the assemblages are *N. dutertrei*, *G. menardii* and *P.*
142 *obliquiloculata*. The relative abundance of *N. dutertrei* varies between 4 % and 17 %. This
143 species shows its maximum abundance during the period 17.5 – 23.5 ka BP. Its abundance
144 decreases rapidly from 17.5 ka BP, followed by an increase at around 14 ka BP (Fig. 2). The
145 relative abundance pattern of *G. menardii* broadly follows that of the *N. dutertrei* pattern,
146 although it shows a more gradual decline in abundance from 17.5 ka BP onward, eventually
147 disappearing around 15 ka BP. *P. obliquiloculata* shows a broad abundance maximum in the
148 period 10.5 - 14 ka BP (Fig. 2).

149

150 4.2. *Q* mode factor analysis on planktic foraminifera

151

152 Multivariate analysis provides information on interspecies relationships and their
153 dependency on varying environmental factors (e.g. Kroon, 1988; Caulet et al., 1992; Venec-

154 Peyre et al., 1995; Cayre et al., 1999; Venec-Peyre and Caulet, 2000). The factor analysis of
155 planktic foraminiferal assemblages of core SK 17 results in three distinct groups of species,
156 together accounting for 93 % of the total variance (Table 1). Factor 1 describes almost 40 % of
157 the variance.

158 The highest-positive score of Factor 1 is attributed to *G. ruber*. Other important species
159 having positive scores are *P. obliquiloculata* and *G. quadrilobatus*. These species are common in
160 warm tropical surface waters and have adapted to nutrient-poor, oligotrophic water conditions
161 (Bé and Tolderlund, 1971; Cullen, 1981; Cullen and Prell, 1984; Kroon, 1988). Factor 2
162 describes 35 % of the total variance. High positive scores of *G. bulloides*, *G. glutinata*, *G.*
163 *falconensis* and *N. dutertrei* characterise Factor 2. These species prefer nutrient-rich, eutrophic
164 water conditions, such as in a tropical upwelling environment (Bé and Tolderlund, 1971; Cullen,
165 1981; Cullen and Prell, 1984; Kroon, 1988). These species live mainly in the mixed layer except
166 for *N. dutertrei* that lives in the thermocline during the adult phase (Sautter and Thunell, 1991;
167 Ravelo and Fairbanks, 1992). Factor 3 describes 18 % of the total variance. This factor is
168 dominated by positive scores of *G. glutinata*, with secondary contributions from *G. ruber*, *G.*
169 *menardii* and *G. sacculifer*. Significantly, *G. bulloides*, *G. falconensis* and *N. dutertrei*
170 (important contributors of Factor 2) have negative scores in Factor 3. We interpret the
171 assemblage that contributes with positive scores to Factor 1 as the ‘assemblage representing
172 oligotrophic conditions in the mixed layer associated with surface water stratification’ and the
173 assemblage that contributes with positive scores to Factor 2 as the ‘assemblage representing
174 eutrophic conditions in the mixed layer associated with vertical mixing and/or upwelling’ (eg.
175 Venec-Peyre et al., 1995; Venec-Peyre and Caulet, 2000). The assemblage of Factor 3 appears to
176 characterise small variations in mixed layer trophic conditions. These are of minor importance,
177 because the assemblages of Factors 1 and 2 account for most of the total variance.

178

179 **5. Discussion**

180

181 *5.1. Planktic foraminifera reflect mixed layer nutrient status and productivity*

182

183 The multivariate statistical approach, employing abundance records of planktic
184 foraminifera, provides a way of connecting groups of species to environmental parameters. In the

185 case of core SK17, the first two factors describe 75% in the data set, where two distinct planktic
186 foraminiferal assemblages connect to two modes of ocean conditions related to the nutrient state
187 of the mixed layer with implications for productivity. The species, dominant on the positive side
188 of the first factor are *G. ruber*, *P. obliquiloculata*, *G. quadrilobatus* and *G. sacculifer*. These
189 species are common in nutrient-poor, oligotrophic conditions, mainly in the mixed layer of
190 highly stratified waters, such as in tropical gyre systems (Bé and Tolderlund, 1971; Ravelo and
191 Fairbanks, 1992). The species *G. bulloides*, *G. glutinata*, *G. falconensis* and *N. dutertrei*,
192 dominate on the positive side of Factor 2. These species are common in nutrient-rich, eutrophic
193 conditions in highly mixed waters, such as tropical upwelling areas and regions of deep vertical
194 mixing. Therefore, the two planktic foraminiferal assemblages dominant in the first two factors
195 describe perfectly two contrasting water mass conditions regarding upper water column structure
196 and nutrient concentration in the tropical Arabian Sea. Distribution patterns of these two
197 assemblages in core SK 17 reveal monsoon driven periods of alternating oligotrophic and
198 eutrophic surface waters in the region resulting from changes in the upper water column structure
199 from a stratified to a mixed surface ocean. Today, seasonal productivity patterns in the eastern
200 Arabian, particularly north of 10° latitude near the location of core SK 17 are governed by the
201 seasonal winter monsoon winds that induce vertical mixing and sporadic upwelling and summer
202 monsoon precipitations that induce surface water stratification (Madhupratap et al., 1996;
203 Joseph and Freeland, 2005). Therefore, the alternating planktic foraminiferal assemblages,
204 described by Factors 1 and 2, should reflect oceanic conditions associated with changes mainly
205 in the intensity of the winter monsoon winds through time (Fig. 3) given the position of core SK
206 17 in the eastern Arabian Sea.

207

208 *5.2. Changes in water column structure during key periods over the last 30 ka BP*

209

210 The last glacial period 17.5 - 23.5 ka BP

211

212 High abundance of the eutrophic species assemblage (*G. bulloides*, *G. glutinata*, *G.*
213 *falconensis*, *N. dutertrei*), described by the Factor 2, in the period 17.5 - 23.5 ka BP (Fig. 3),
214 suggests not only nutrient-rich conditions in the surface mixed layer but also in the thermocline,
215 where adult populations of *N. dutertrei* reside. Presence of this assemblage strongly indicates

216 periods of high productivity associated with nutrient supply to surface waters either due to deep
217 vertical mixing or upwelling or a combination of both, which is further corroborated by the
218 remarkably low SST based on Mg/Ca ratios in shells of *G. bulloides* (Anand et al., 2008) and
219 high C_{org} content (Singh et al., 2006)[Fig. 3]. Heavier $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values during this interval also
220 suggest high productivity conditions coupled with sluggish eastern boundary circulation and
221 denitrification (Fig. 4) (Naqvi et al., 1998; Ivanochko et al., 2005). The combined set of data
222 supports the notion that strengthened winter monsoon winds caused intense vertical mixing (eg.
223 Emeis et al., 1995) leading to nutrient –rich subsurface water into the photic zone, which in turn
224 fueled high productivity between 17.5 and 23.5 ka BP. Moreover, upwelling may have also been
225 enhanced during this interval. Today, the convective vertical mixing is the dominant driver of
226 eutrophic conditions in winter monsoon season, and it was probably the main driver in the glacial
227 period; but possibility of somewhat enhanced upwelling cannot be ruled out. At this stage,
228 however, it is difficult to separate the two physical processes resulting in eutrophic conditions.
229 This finding is in line with earlier publications (eg. Rostek et al., 1997; Ivanova et al., 2003;
230 Singh et al., 2011; Cabarcos et al., 2014).). It is intriguing to note that within the period 17.5 -
231 23.5 ka BP, *G. bulloides* concentrations declined for a short spell around 20 - 21 ka BP (Fig. 2).
232 This decline of *G. bulloides* abundance probably does not indicate a complete loss of
233 productivity, because concomitant increases in abundances of other nutrient loving species like
234 *G. glutinata* and *N. dutertrei* occurred. This finding probably suggests that nutrient availability in
235 surface waters remained relatively high during this period but perhaps subsurface waters,
236 brought to the surface, were not sufficiently enriched in nutrients for *G. bulloides* populations to
237 thrive, whilst the other eutrophic species flourished. The process of nutrient injection was
238 probably related to shallow winter convective mixing rather than upwelling, which generally
239 brings nutrient from deeper thermocline levels. Interestingly, such subtle changes in the
240 eutrophic species assemblage seem to support the notion that each species within the assemblage
241 has a unique response to changes in environmental conditions. Further studies in the modern
242 ocean will be able to shed more lights in our understanding of planktic foraminiferal responses,
243 leading to improved interpretation of species abundance records in paleoceanographic
244 reconstructions.

245

246 Rapid change in hydrographic conditions during the last deglaciation 15 – 17.5 ka BP

247

248 The planktic foraminiferal record of core SK 17 shows major changes during the last
249 deglaciation commencing around 17.5 ka BP. The abundances of species, indicative of eutrophic
250 waters (Factor 2), declined rapidly accompanied by concomitant increase in mixed layer
251 oligotrophic species (Factor 1), implying a change to oligotrophic waters prevailing during the
252 deglaciation (17.5 - 15 ka BP). This finding suggests a shift from a dominant nutrient-rich
253 productive environment to one characterized by relatively nutrient-poor stratified surface waters .
254 The new data are in line with a significant increase in surface temperatures of the mixed layer
255 (Anand et al., 2008) and lower C_{org} concentration (Singh et al., 2006), jointly supporting the
256 notion of low productivity during the deglaciation between 17.5 and 15 ka BP (Figs. 3,4). The
257 lighter values of $\delta^{15}N$ during this interval also imply low productivity related to nutrient
258 depletion in subsurface water, as compared to that of during the LGM (Fig 4). Thus, the changes
259 in planktic foraminiferal assemblage composition, SST, C_{org} content and $\delta^{15}N$ suggest a rapid
260 change in surface oceanic conditions, probably triggered by a change in strength of winter
261 monsoon winds around 17.5 ka BP: strong winter monsoon winds were replaced by moderate or
262 weak winter monsoon winds, reducing nutrient availability in surface waters.

263 The timing of this switch in intensity of winter monsoon winds is synchronous with
264 Heinrich Event 1 (H1), a cold event in the northern hemisphere, when the large-scale deposition
265 of ice rafted sediments occurred (Bond and Lotti, 1995). We are confident that the timing of the
266 winter monsoon weakening around 17.5 ka BP is well constrained by AMS ^{14}C -dates in core SK
267 17 and matches the timing of H1 within the uncertainties associated with radiocarbon dating.
268 Reichart et al. (1998) inferred intensified winter northeasterly wind induced convective mixing
269 in the northern Arabian Sea during this time. In such scenario, productivity would be maintained
270 during H1, but, in contrast, the planktic foraminiferal record from core SK 17 suggests reduced
271 productivity. Others suggest that variations in nutrient supply through intermediate waters may
272 have played a role in this reduction of productivity (e.g. Ziegler et al., 2010). However, this
273 would still require a mechanism that transfers intermediate waters across the thermocline to the
274 surface. The SST data from core SK 17 show evidence of a change from cold to warm surface
275 waters during the time period of H1, confirming a change from deep vertical mixing and/or
276 upwelling to stratified waters. Thus, although nutrient content of deeper waters may have played

277 some role in productivity changes (Ziegler et al., 2010), strength of winter monsoon winds likely
278 dropped during H1.

279 Similarly, reduced strength of winter monsoon winds resulting in stratified surface
280 waters and low productivity conditions during H1, can also be observed in the period 23.5 –
281 24.5 ka BP (equivalent to the North Atlantic H2), at least in this part of the Arabian Sea. The
282 reduction in productivity, however, was less prominent than during H1. The coupled cooling in
283 the northern hemisphere, reduction of productivity and warming of surface waters in the eastern
284 Arabian Sea occurred repeatedly during Heinrich Events in the glacial period (see also Singh et
285 al., 2011).

286 In contrast to our conclusion of a more stratified upper water column, low productivity and
287 weaker winter monsoon winds in the period 15-17.5 ka BP based on foraminifer assemblages,
288 SST and $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ records (Fig. 4), Cabarcos et al. (2014) suggested increased productivity and
289 stronger winter monsoon winds in this period based on coccolith assemblage data in the same
290 core (Fig.4). Indeed, the coccolith assemblage data (Factor 1, the productivity proxy as defined
291 by Cabarcos et al., 2014) indicate relatively high productivity in the prolonged period 17.5-10 ka
292 BP. Thus, the coccolithophore driven productivity remained largely unaffected during the cold
293 H1 event. A wider discussion on the coupling of low productivity events in the Arabian Sea and
294 cold events (Heinrich Events) in the northern hemisphere may be useful to speculate why the
295 coccolith and the foraminifer assemblage results are different. The changes in the planktic
296 foraminifer assemblage, SST and $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ records are in concert with northern hemisphere climate
297 events, not only during H1, but also during H2, and in the period LGM to H1 (Fig. 4). The low
298 productivity Arabian Sea events are clearly linked with the Heinrich cold periods in the northern
299 hemisphere. This is not necessarily new, because this pattern of coupling between Arabian Sea
300 low productivity and northern hemisphere cold climate events has been previously reported using
301 a wide variety of proxy data series in cores from across the Arabian Sea (Schulz et al., 1998;
302 Altabet et al., 2002; Ivanochko et al., 2005; Singh et al., 2006, 2011). It is intriguing to note that
303 a record of changes in dinoflagellate assemblage data, from another deep core offshore Goa
304 (water depth; 1807 m), suggested also low productivity during H1 (Narale et al., 2015). The
305 weak response of coccolithophores to millennial-scale climate change as evident in figure 4 is
306 anomalous. The coccolithophores dwelling in the mixed layer may have a specific response to
307 nutrient supply (Tarran et al., 1999; Le Mézo et al., 2017). Perhaps coccolithophore abundances

308 and assemblage composition are sensitive to nutrient supply from the continent either by
309 runoff/river or wind (Patil and Singh, 2013, Cabarcos et al., 2014), much more so than other
310 primary producers. Furthermore, coccolithophores are also known to be sensitive to salinity and
311 turbidity of surface waters (McIntyre and Bè, 1967; Baumann et al., 2005). The location of core
312 SK 17 is close to the coast where large variability in salinity and turbidity occurs. Intriguingly,
313 the reconstructed $\delta^{18}\text{O}_w$ values (salinity related) show large swings in the glacial-deglaciation
314 period (Fig 4), which may have played a role in the abundance changes of the coccolithophores.
315 Although nutrients, salinity and turbidity may explain the anomalous behavior of
316 coccolithophores ecology, the precise reason for this remains unclear.

317

318 The Holocene surface hydrography

319

320 Low abundances of planktic foraminifera that contribute positively to Factor 2, and
321 corresponding high abundances of species that contribute positively to Factor 1 in conjunction
322 with low C_{org} content and high Mg/Ca-based SST collectively suggest that a strongly stratified
323 upper water column prevailed during most of the Holocene except for the last 2.5 ka BP (Fig. 3).
324 A moderate increase in productivity over the last 2.5 ka BP probably marks the establishment of
325 modern conditions of weak winter vertical mixing and /or sporadic upwelling, driven by slightly
326 enhanced northeasterly winter monsoon winds in the eastern Arabian Sea. The coccolithophore
327 record of Cabarcos et al. (2014) indicates stratified surface water and relatively low productivity
328 during the Holocene.

329

330 *5.3. Abundance variations of G. menardii : implications for changes in thermocline ventilation*

331

332 Deep dwelling planktic foraminifera may reveal thermocline conditions in the eastern
333 Arabian Sea over the last 30 ka BP. Populations of *G. menardii*, *N. dutertrei*, and *P.*
334 *obliquiloculata* tend to flourish in areas where a deep chlorophyll maximum occurs (Sexton et al,
335 2011), although each of these species has adapted to slightly different ecological niches which
336 are yet to be fully deciphered. Despite this principle limitation, there is agreement that *G.*
337 *menardii* thrives in thermocline waters associated with the so-called deep chlorophyll maximum

338 where oxygen levels are relatively low and nutrient levels are high (Karstensen et al., 2008;
339 Sexton et al, 2011).

340 In core SK 17, the abundance pattern of *G. menardii* is broadly similar to that of
341 *N. dutertrei*, a thermocline, eutrophic species flourishing in upwelling conditions (Fig. 2). During
342 the periods of monsoon winds induced high surface productivity, upper thermocline waters are
343 enriched in nutrients and depleted in oxygen, a condition favourable for *G. menardii*. A change
344 in ventilation conditions of intermediate waters may lead to variation in oxygen levels at lower
345 thermocline depth, thus affecting *G. menardii* abundance. Hence, *G. menardii* populations in the
346 eastern Arabian Sea, though primarily governed by the productivity, may have been significantly
347 influenced by intermediate water ventilation influencing lower thermocline conditions in the
348 eastern Arabian Sea (Naidu et al., 2014).

349 High concentrations of *G. menardii* between 17.5 and 23.5 ka BP suggest poorly
350 ventilated thermocline waters, enriched in nutrients (Fig. 2 and Fig. 5). Notably, the abundance
351 of *G. menardii* declined conspicuously during 15- 17.5 ka BP, but more intriguingly, the *G.*
352 *menardii* population almost disappeared just after the H1. It appears that these changes are
353 related to the ventilation history of intermediate waters combined with the productivity
354 variations. Interestingly, during other North Atlantic cold phases (Younger Dryas and Heinrich 2
355 Events) *G. menardii* disappeared (Fig. 5). Other evidence for ventilation of the thermocline can
356 be found in geochemical data. For instance, aragonite concentrations can be very indicative of
357 changes in the ventilation state of the intermediate waters (Singh, 2007; Naidu et al., 2014). Old
358 water becomes more corrosive and dissolves aragonite, due to increased CO₂ content that lowers
359 the pH of the waters. The intervals of *G. menardii* abundance minima correspond very well with
360 the maxima in aragonite content in the core SK17 (Fig. 5). This finding suggests that *G.*
361 *menardii* disappeared during phases of enhanced ventilation pointing to periods of repeated
362 collapses of the oxygen minimum zone. Most likely increased ventilation of the deep waters in
363 the Arabian Sea during Heinrich events was triggered by world-wide global climate changes.
364 Jung et al. (2010) showed profound evidence of changes in ventilation state of the intermediate
365 waters in the western Arabian Sea. They concluded that intensified inflow of Antarctic
366 Intermediate Water to Arabian Sea probably ventilated the thermocline waters during northern
367 hemisphere cold phases. Thus, this likely happened in the eastern Arabian Sea in a similar way,
368 which caused the demise of the *G. menardii* populations. Interestingly, reduction in *G. menardii*

369 populations occurred during the Heinrich events, but complete collapse of these populations
370 occurred slightly later when the northern hemisphere was still cold, and the populations
371 recovered again during the warming phase.

372

373 **6. Conclusions**

374

375 Variations in the composition of planktic foraminiferal assemblages in core SK 17 from the
376 eastern Arabian Sea are used to reconstruct changes in upper water column structure over the last
377 30 ka BP. Down-core variations in faunal records (species abundances, factor loadings) correlate
378 with fluctuations of C_{org} % and SST. While strong monsoon winter winds drove deep vertical
379 mixing and/or moderate upwelling, in the period 17.5 - 23.5 ka BP, high abundance of *G.*
380 *menardii* during this period suggests that thermocline waters were poorly ventilated.

381 At 17.5 ka BP, a rapid decline in productivity and nutrient availability occurred with a
382 concomitant increase in SST, implying a change towards stratification of surface waters and
383 reduced winter monsoon winds. The *G. menardii* abundance record supports the notion that the
384 upper thermocline waters became ventilated during this period, but ventilation improved further
385 between 15 and 17.5 ka BP. These changes are synchronous with northern hemisphere climate
386 changes. Notably, the reduction in winter monsoon intensity, increased SST's, and better
387 ventilation occurred simultaneously with the onset of Heinrich event (H1), showing climate
388 connections between the two areas, through wind systems but also through flow regimes of
389 intermediate waters.

390 The faunal data further suggest a moderate increase in winter wind induced vertical mixing
391 and/or sporadic upwelling to modern levels since 2.5 ka BP.

392

393 **Acknowledgements**

394

395 This research was supported by funding to A.D.S. and by the GBP-ISRO (India) and from
396 the DST (New Delhi). Support to P.A. from NERC is also acknowledged. We thank the
397 anonymous reviewers for the constructive comments.

398

399 **References**

400
401 Altabet, M.A., Higginson, M.J., Murray, D.W., 2002. The effect of millennial-scale changes in
402 high frequency Arabian Sea denitrification on atmospheric CO₂. *Nature* 415, 159–162.
403 Anand, P., Kroon, D., Singh, A.D., Ganeshram, R.S., Ganssen, G., Elderfield, H., 2008. Coupled
404 sea surface temperature-seawater δ¹⁸O reconstructions in the Arabian Sea at the millennial
405 scale for the last 35 ka. *Paleoceanography* 23, PA4207, doi:10.1029/2007PA001564.
406 Anderson, D.M., Prell, W.L., 1993. A 300 kyr record of upwelling off Oman during the late
407 Quaternary; evidence of the Asian southwest monsoon. *Paleoceanography* 8, 193-208.
408 Banse, K., McClain, C.R., 1986. Winter blooms of phytoplankton in the Arabian Sea as observed
409 by the Coastal Zone Color Scanner. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 34, 201-211.
410 Bauer, S., Hitchcock, G.L., Olson, D.B., 1991. Influence of monsoonally-forced Ekman
411 dynamics upon surface-layer depth and plankton biomass distribution in the Arabian Sea.
412 *Deep-Sea Research Part A* 38 (5), 531–553.
413 Baumann, K.-H., Andrulleit, H., Böckel, B., Geisen, M., Kinkel, H., 2005. The significance of
414 extant coccolithophores as indicators of ocean water masses, surface water temperature,
415 and paleoproductivity: a review. *Paläontologische Zeitschrift* 79(1), 93–112.
416 Bè, A.W.H., Tolderlund, D.S., 1971. Distribution and ecology of living planktonic foraminifera
417 in surface waters of the Atlantic and Indian Oceans. In: Funnel, B.M., Riedel, W.R. (eds.),
418 *The Micropaleontology of Oceans*. Cambridge University Press, pp. 105-149.
419 Belyaeva, N.V., Burmistrova, I.I., 1984. Foraminiferal Lysocline and critical levels of carbonate
420 sedimentation in the Indian Ocean. *Litologiya i Poleznye Iskopaemye, Russian* 6, 57-66.
421 Blunier, T., Brook, E.J., 2001. Timing of millennial-scale climate change in Antarctica and
422 Greenland during the last glacial period. *Science* 291, 109-112.
423 Blunier, T., Chappellaz, J., Schwander, J., Dallenbach, A., Stauffer, B., Stocker, T.F., Raynaud,
424 D., Jouzel, J., Clausen, H.B., Hammer, C.U., Johnsen, S.J., 1998. Asynchrony of Antarctic
425 and Greenland climate change during the last glacial period. *Nature* 394, 739-743.
426 Bond, G.C., Lotti, R., 1995. Iceberg discharges into the north-Atlantic on millennial time scales
427 during the last glaciation. *Science* 267(5200), 1005-1010.
428 Cabarcos, E., Flores, J.A., Singh, A.D., Sierro, F.J., 2014. Monsoonal dynamics and evolution of
429 the primary productivity in the eastern Arabian Sea over the past 30 ka. *Palaeogeography,*
430 *Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 411, 249–256.

431 Caulet, J.P., Venec-Peyre, M., Vergnaud-Grazzini, C., Nigrini, C., 1992. Variation of South
432 Somalian upwelling during the last 160 ka: radiolarian and foraminifera records in core
433 MD85674. In: Summerhays, C.P., Prell W.L., Emeis, K.C. (eds.), *Upwelling Systems:
434 Evolution since the Early Miocene*. Geological Society Special Publication, London 64, pp.
435 379-389.

436 Cayre, O., Beaufort, L., Vincent, E., 1999. Paleoproductivity in the equatorial Indian Ocean for
437 the last 260,000 yr: transfer function based on planktonic foraminifera. *Quaternary Science
438 Reviews* 18, 337-342.

439 Clemens, S., Prell, W.L., Murray, D., Shimmield, G., Weedon, G., 1991. Forcing mechanisms of
440 the Indian Ocean monsoon. *Nature* 353, 720-725.

441 Colborn, J.G., 1975. The thermal structure of the Indian Ocean. In: *International Indian Ocean
442 Expedition Monograph*, University of Hawaii Press, Honolulu 2, pp. 173.

443 Cullen, J.L., 1981. Microfossil evidence for changing salinity in the Bay of Bengal over the last
444 20,000 years. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 35, 315-356.

445 Cullen, J.L., Prell, W.L., 1984. Planktonic foraminifera of the northern Indian Ocean:
446 distribution and preservation in surface sediments. *Marine Micropaleontology* 9, 1-52.

447 Emeis, K.C., Anderson, D.M., Dooze, H., Kroon, D., Schulz-Bull, D., 1995. Sea-surface
448 temperatures and the history of monsoon upwelling in the Northwest Arabian Sea during
449 the last 500,000 years. *Quaternary Research* 43(3), 355-361.

450 Gupta, A.K., Anderson, D.M., Overpeck, J.T., 2003. Abrupt changes in the Asian southwest
451 monsoon during the Holocene and their links to the North Atlantic Ocean. *Nature* 421, 354-
452 357.

453 Hemleben, C., Spindler, M., Anderson, O.R., 1989. *Modern planktonic foraminifera*. Springer-
454 Verlag, New York, pp. 363.

455 Hemming, S.R., 2004. Heinrich events: Massive late Pleistocene detritus layers of the North
456 Atlantic and their global climate imprint. *Reviews of Geophysics* 42, RG1005,
457 doi:1029/2003RG000128.

458 Ivanochko, T.S., Ganeshram, R.S., Brummer, G-J.A., Ganssen, G., Jung, S.J.A., Moreton, S.G.,
459 Kroon, D., 2005. Variations in tropical convection as an amplifier of global climate change
460 at the millennial scale. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 235, 302-314.

461 Ivanova, E., Schiebel, R., Singh, A.D., Schmiedl, G., Niebler, H.S., Hemleben, C., 2003. Primary
462 production in the Arabian Sea during the last 135000 years. *Palaeogeography,*
463 *Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 197, 61–82.

464 Joseph, S., Freeland, H.J., 2005. Salinity variability in the Arabian Sea. *Geophysical Research*
465 *Letters* 32, L09607. doi:10.1029/2005GL022972

466 Jung, S.J.A., Davies, G.R., Ganssen, G., Kroon, D., 2002. Centennial-millennial scale monsoon
467 variations off Somalia over the last 35 ka. In: Clift, P., Kroon, D. (eds.), *Tectonic and*
468 *Climatic Evolution of the Arabian Sea Region*. Geological Society of London, Special
469 Publication 195, pp. 341-352.

470 Jung, S.J.A., Kroon, D., Ganssen, G., Peeters, F., Ganeshram, R., 2010. Southern Hemisphere
471 intermediate water formation and the bi-polar seesaw. *PAGES news*, 18 (1), 36-38.

472 Karstensen, J., Stramma, L., Visbeck, M., 2008. Oxygen minimum zones in the eastern tropical
473 Atlantic and Pacific Oceans. *Progress in Oceanography* 77, 331-350.

474 Kennett, J.P., Srinivasan, M.S., 1983. *Neogene planktonic foraminifera, a Phylogenetic Atlas*.
475 Hutchinson and Ross Publications, Pennsylvania, pp. 265.

476 Kroon, D., 1988. The planktic $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ record, upwelling and climate. In: Brummer, G-J.A., Kroon,
477 D. (eds.), *Planktonic Foraminifers as Tracers of Ocean-Climate History*. Free University
478 Press, Amsterdam, pp. 335-346.

479 Kumar, S.P., Madhupratap, M., Kumar, M.D., Gauns, M., Muraleedharan, P.M., Sarma, V.V.S.
480 S., De Souza, S.N., 2000. Physical control of primary productivity on a seasonal scale in
481 central and eastern Arabian Sea. *Proceedings Indian Academy of Sciences (Earth and*
482 *Planetary Science)* 109, pp. 433-441.

483 Le Mézo, P., Beaufort, L., Bopp, L., Braconnot, P., Kageyama, M., 2017. From monsoon to
484 marine productivity in the Arabian Sea: insights from glacial and interglacial climates.
485 *Climate of the Past* 13, 759-778.

486 Madhupratap, M., Kumar, S.P., Bhattathiri, P.M.A., Kumar, M.D., Raghukumar, S., Nair, K.K.
487 C., Ramaiah, N., 1996. Mechanism of the biological response to winter cooling in the
488 northeastern Arabian Sea. *Nature* 384, 549-552.

489 Meese, D.A., Gow, A.J., Alley, R.B., Zielinski, G.A., Grootes, P.M., Ram, M., Taylor, K.C.,
490 Mayewski, P.A., Bolzan, J.F., 1997. The Greenland Ice Sheet Project 2 depth-age scale:
491 *Methods and Results*. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 102 (26), 411-423.

492 McIntyre, A., Bè, A.H.W., 1967. Modern coccolithophores of the Atlantic Ocean-I. Placolith and
493 cyrtoliths, Deep Sea Research 14, 561–597.

494 Naidu, P.D., Malmgren, B.A., 1996. A high-resolution record of late Quaternary upwelling along
495 the Oman margin, Arabian Sea based on planktonic foraminifera. Paleooceanography 11,
496 129-140.

497 Naidu, P.D., Ramesh Kumar, M.R., Ramesh Babu, V., 1999. Time and space variations of
498 monsoonal upwelling along the west and east coasts of India. Continental Shelf Research
499 19, 559-572.

500 Naidu, P.D., Singh, A.D., Ganeshram, R., Bharti, S.K., 2014. Abrupt climate-induced changes in
501 carbonate burial in the Arabian Sea: Causes and consequences. Geochemistry, Geophysics,
502 Geosystems 15, 1398-1406.

503 Naqvi, S.W.A., Yoshinari, T., Jayakumar, D.A., Altabet, M.A., Narvekar, R.V., Devol, A.H.,
504 Brandes, J.A., Codispoti, L.A., 1998. Budgetary and biogeochemical implications of N₂O
505 isotope signatures in the Arabian Sea. Nature 394, 462-464.

506 Narale, D.D., Naidu, P.D., Anil, A.C., Godad, S.P., 2015. Evolution of productivity and
507 monsoonal dynamics in the eastern Arabian Sea during the past 68 ka using dinoflagellate
508 cyst records. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 435, 193–202.
509 [http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1016/ j.palaeo.2015.06.006](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2015.06.006)

510 Patil, S.K., Singh, A.D., 2013. New record of magnetic properties of Late Quaternary sediments
511 from the Eastern Arabian Sea (off Goa): inferences on Palaeoclimate. In: Sinha, R.,
512 Ravindra, R. (eds.), Earth System Processes and Disaster Management. Springer, Berlin,
513 pp. 113–121.

514 Ravelo, A.C., Fairbanks, R.G., 1992. Oxygen isotopic composition of multiple species of
515 planktic foraminifera: Recorders of the modern photic zone temperature gradient.
516 Paleooceanography 7, 815-831.

517 Reichert, G.J., Lourens, L.J., Zachariasse, W.J., 1998. Temporal variability in the northern
518 Arabian Sea Oxygen Minimum Zone (OMZ) during the last 225,000 years.
519 Paleooceanography 13, 607-621.

520 Rostek, F., Bard, E., Beaufort, L., Sonzogni, C., Ganssen, G., 1997. Sea surface temperature and
521 productivity records for the past 240 kyr in the Arabian Sea. Deep-Sea Research Part II 44
522 (6–7), 1461–1480.

523 Sarma, V.V.S.S., 2003. Monthly variability in surface pCO₂ and net air-sea CO₂ in the Arabian
524 Sea. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 108: doi: 10.1029/2001JC001062.

525 Sautter, L.R., Thunell, R.C., 1991. Planktonic foraminiferal response to upwelling and seasonal
526 hydrographic conditions: sediment trap results from San Pedro Basin, Southern California
527 Bight. *Journal of Foraminiferal Research* 21, 347-363.

528 Schott, F.A., McCreary, J.P., 2001. The monsoon circulation of the Indian Ocean. *Progress in*
529 *Oceanography* 51 (1), 1-123.

530 Schulz, H., von Rad, U., Erlenkeuser, H., 1998. Correlation between Arabian Sea and Greenland
531 climate oscillation of the past 110,000 years. *Nature* 393, 54-57.

532 Sexton, P.F., Norris, R.D., 2011. High latitude regulation of low latitude thermocline ventilation
533 and planktic foraminifer populations across glacial-interglacial cycles. *Earth and Planetary*
534 *Science Letters* 311 (1-2), 69-81.

535 Shalin, S., Samuelsen, A., Korosov, A., Menon, N., Backeberg, B.C., Pettersson, L.H., 2017.
536 Delineation of marine ecosystem zones in the northern Arabian Sea using an objective
537 method. *Biogeosciences Discussions*, doi.org/10.5194/bg-2017-285.

538 Sharma, G.S., 1966. Thermocline as an indicator of upwelling. *Journal of Marine Biological*
539 *Association of India* 8, 8-19.

540 Singh, A.D., 2007. Episodic preservation of pteropods in the eastern Arabian Sea: monsoonal
541 change, oxygen minimum zone intensity and aragonite compensation depth. *Indian Journal*
542 *of Marine Sciences* 36(4), 378-383.

543 Singh, A.D., Kroon, D., Ganeshram, R.S., 2006. Millennial scale variations and OMZ intensity
544 in the eastern Arabian Sea. *Journal of the Geological Society of India* 68, 369-377.

545 Singh, A.D., Jung, S.J.A., Darling, K., Ganeshram, R., Ivanochko, T., Kroon, D., 2011.
546 Productivity collapses in the Arabian Sea during glacial cold phases. *Paleoceanography* 26,
547 PA3210, doi:1029/2009PA001923.

548 Sirocko, F., Sarnthein, M., Erlenkeuser, H., Lange, H., Arnold, M., Duplessy, J.-C., 1993.
549 Century-scale events in monsoonal climate over the past 24,000 years. *Nature* 364, 322-
550 324.

551 Tarran, G.A., Burkill, P.H., Edwards, E.S., Woodward, E.M.S., 1999. Phytoplankton community
552 structure in the Arabian Sea during and after the SW monsoon, 1994. *Deep-Sea Research II*
553 46, 655– 676.

- 554 Venec-Peyre, M.-T., Caulet, J.P., 2000. Paleoproductivity changes in the upwelling system of
555 Socotra (Somali Basin, NW Indian Ocean) during the last 72,000 years: evidence from
556 biological signatures. *Marine Micropaleontology* 40, 321-344.
- 557 Venec-Peyre, M.-T., Caulet, J.P., Vergnaud Grazzini, C., 1995. Paleohydrographic changes in
558 the Somali Basin (5⁰N upwelling and equatorial areas) during the last 160 kyr, based on
559 correspondence analysis of foraminiferal and radiolarian assemblages. *Paleoceanography*
560 10, 473-491.
- 561 von Rad, U., Schulz, H., Riech, V., den Dulk, M., Berner, U., Sirocko, F., 1999. Multiple
562 monsoon-controlled breakdown of oxygen-minimum conditions during the past 30,000
563 years documented in laminated sediments off Pakistan. *Palaeogeography,*
564 *Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 152, 129-161.
- 565 Wyrтки, K., 1973. Physical oceanography of the Indian Ocean. In: Zeitzschel, B., Gerlach, S.A.
566 (eds.), *The Biology of the Indian Ocean*. Springer-Verlag, New York, pp. 18-36.
- 567 Zhang, J., 1985. Living planktonic foraminifera from the eastern Arabian Sea. *Deep Sea*
568 *Research* 32, 789-798.
- 569 Ziegler, M., Lourens, L.J., Tüenter, E., Hilgen, F., Reichert, G.-J., Weber, N., 2010. Precession
570 phasing offset between Indian summer monsoon and Arabian Sea productivity linked to
571 changes in Atlantic overturning circulation. *Paleoceanography* 25, PA3213,
572 doi:10.1029/2009PA001884.