Flying away, immigration and identity: How, and to what extent, did Welsh immigrants to Scranton, Pennsylvania retain their Welsh identity? 1850-1920

Student Dissertation

How to cite:

© 2022 Cheryl Gibbins

https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

Version: Version of Record

Link(s) to article on publisher’s website:
http://dx.doi.org/doi:10.21954/ou.ro.00014d10

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online's data policy on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.

oro.open.ac.uk
BA (Hons) History

EMA FOR A329: The Making of Welsh History Dissertation

May 2022

The Open University

FLYING AWAY, IMMIGRATION AND IDENTITY:
HOW, AND TO WHAT EXTENT, DID WELSH IMMIGRANTS TO SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA RETAIN THEIR WELSH IDENTITY?
1850-1920.

Cheryl Gibbins

Words, 7,662.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Firstly, many thanks to the supportive Open University tutors that have mentored me over the years. A special thanks to the A329 team and Dr Matthew Griffiths for his continued and unwavering encouragement and dedication.

I would also like to thank my husband Jeremy (you deserve a medal!) and daughter Ava for their love and support, along with my family and friends. You really did keep me going through the tough times!

Finally, a thanks to those who came before, I dedicate this dissertation to my Grandparents (including the Greats and In-laws). Along with my Dad, Barry Gelder who passed away a few months before my Open University journey began.
# Table of Contents

Introduction: Flying Away, From Wales to Scranton .................................................. p. 4.

Chapter 1: The Image of Welsh Identity projected onto the anthracite coalfield .......... p. 12.

Chapter 2: Welsh Identity and the Scranton community .......................................... p. 22.

Conclusion .................................................................................................................. p. 34.

Appendix 1: Distribution of the United States Born in Wales, 1900, by States .............. p. 37.


Bibliography ............................................................................................................. p. 41.
‘... no land has contributed to the citizenship of our country, a higher class of people, men of intelligence, industry and perseverance, men of brain and brawn, than has Wales’ (1897).

This dissertation will explore how, and to what extent immigrants from Wales to Scranton, Pennsylvania retained their identity, between 1850 and 1920. Pennsylvania attracted the greatest number of Welsh immigrants with Scranton having the largest single concentration outside of Wales during the period. Migration during this period was propelled by an unprecedented population increase within Europe which more ‘...than doubled, growing from 180 to 390 million people’. 

From 1815 to 1914 the largest voluntary migration took place with an estimated 90 million worldwide and 52 million from Europe. This was a world system of migration and those from Europe went to several host nations. Britons were particularly drawn to the colonies of

---

1 'Flying away' ‘...was a contemporary euphemism for emigration'. Jones, W. D. 'Raising the Wind: Emigrating from Wales to the USA in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries', Annual Public Lecture 2003, Cardiff, Cardiff University, School of Welsh, Available at: https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/48163/1/RaisingTheWind.pdf. Accessed 20 March 2022.


their Empire. Approximately 35 million Europeans were destined for America. Migration to America began to decline from the beginning of the twentieth century, due to changing attitudes to emigration and economic factors which affected the Transatlantic economy. Until this point, the emigration and investment from Britain were ‘…positively correlated with the U.S.’.

It is suggested that the Welsh contribution to these figures was comparatively low compared to other sending nations, an estimated 89,603 Welsh settled in America between 1820 and 1950 (5,500 before 1850). It is estimated by the end of the Napoleonic Wars America had received ‘…five and a half million from Germany, four and a half million from Italy, four and a half million from Ireland, four million from Astro-Hungary, three-quarters of a million from Russia and Poland, three and a half million from Great Britain, two million from Scandinavia. This led Alan Conway to suggest that the Welsh were little more than a corporal guard in comparison to the ‘…big battalions of England and central Europe’.

Despite the comparatively small influx of the Welsh, contemporaries declared they brought highly prized attributes such as culture and standards of behaviour to the development of America, more so than any other land. Welsh migration into America peaked in 1890 with 100,079 Welsh-born immigrants in comparison to the 1850s with 30,000, which coincides

---

7 Including former colonies of the British Empire such as the original thirteen seaboard colonies of America. From the United Kingdom: To the USA (11 million), Canada (2.55 million), Australia and New Zealand (2 million), and South Africa (0.85 million). Note: None of the data allows for return migration cited in, Pryce, W. T. R and Drake M ‘Studying Migration’, p. 20.
8 Jones, W, Wales in America, p. xviii.
13 Conway, A, Welsh in America, p. 5.
with the U.S. government interventions. Despite the problems with statistical data relating to migration,\textsuperscript{16} this indicates the peak of the Welsh migration to be the late nineteenth century.

This dissertation will utilise the Invention Theory to understand ethnicity as an ever-changing entity that is not eroded by the New World but instead is a ‘...process or invention that incorporates, adapts, and amplifies pre-existing communal solidarities and cultural attributes and historical memories. That is, it is grounded in a real-life context and also experience’.\textsuperscript{17}

The first half of nineteenth-century Welsh ethnic identity was shaped by economic, social, cultural, and political factors. The Welsh had experienced social unrest and injustice in the form of the Chartist Movement\textsuperscript{18}, the Rebecca Riots\textsuperscript{19} and the Treachery of the Blue Books\textsuperscript{20}. The Blue Books were a result of an inquiry ordered by Parliament on the state of education in Wales, released in 1847. The commissioners were Anglicans and attacked the language, culture, and institutions of Wales\textsuperscript{21}, this incensed the patriotic Welsh and nationalists used the reports as propaganda. Industrialised areas had born a working-class

\textsuperscript{16} Problems include inaccurate, missing, fragmented quantitative data which does not indicate occupation, areas of origin, or re-migration, and the quantitative data would often be an amalgamation of England and Wales. Jones, W., Wales in America, p. xvi.


\textsuperscript{18} The Chartist Movement was a working-class movement most active between 1838-1848, in response to the failure to implement the 1832 Reform Act which extended voting beyond land ownership, see; UK Parliament. ‘The Chartist Movement’, UK Parliament Online. Available at https://www.parliament.uk/about/living-heritage/transformingsociety/electionsvoting/chartists/overview/chartistmovement/. Accessed 17 May 2022.


\textsuperscript{19} The Rebecca Riots, 1839-1843 took place in rural Wales in response to taxes on tollgates and public roads and it was economically damaging the agrarian sector, see, Johnson, B. The Rebecca Riots, Historic UK (2022). Available at https://www.historic-uk.com/HistoryUK/HistoryofWales/The-Rebecca-Riots/. Accessed 17 May 2022.


movement in which the failed Chartist campaign would develop into unionism22 which ‘...took root in Welsh identity’23 Welsh identity was shaped through these collective events and entrenched in religious, patriotic, political, and cultural preservation in the face of Anglican oppression.

The history of the Welsh in America has seen numerous revisions over the years. During the nineteenth-century, the approach tended to be antiquarian and genealogical. The main aim was to bolster their nationalists' contribution and to express their religious views to their adopted country. Ebenezer Edward (William Penn, Pseud), Welshmen as Factors in the Development of the Republic ... Successful Prize Essay ... International Eisteddfod ..., 189324 reinforces the positive projection of prized Welsh identity which contributed to the success of the United States. This overzealous approach of the nineteenth-century Welsh historian was analysed by contemporaries such as E. W. Jones, who acknowledged ‘I am aware that this subject in the hands of the native Welshmen is in danger of suffering injustice, owing to the natural tendencies we have of overestimating the excellence of our own nation’.25

Welsh historian Glanmor William stated in 1979 that, ‘...it is the sin of the historiography of American emigration: excessive praise of one particular nation’.26 This prevented a true and accurate record of the experience of many in favour of the elite. Alan Conway wrote The Welsh in America letters from immigrants (1961) which offers a collection of letters27 as a gateway to the personal experiences and reclaimed voices from ‘below’.28

24 Ebenezer Edward (William Penn, Pseud). Welshmen as Factors in the Development of the Republic ... Successful Prize Essay ... International Eisteddfod ... Chicago 1893 (Utica, N.Y., 1899) Available at: https://ia800909.us.archive.org/cors_get.php?path=/31/items/factsaboutwelshf00edwaiala/factsaboutwelshf00edwaiala.pdf. The book was dedicated to his lifelong friend Benjamin Hughes (see chapter 1).
Welsh immigration history written in the last thirty years tends to be chronologically, geographically, and occupationally specific. Both Ronald, L. Lewis, and William Jones’s work follow and contribute to this trend. Lewis generally focuses on labour and industrial aspects of the nineteenth century migrant experience in ‘Welsh Americans: A history of assimilation in the coalfield’. The book observes how the Welsh values, skills, and culture interacted with core society while working in the northern coalfield.

William Jones’s work on the Welsh overseas has contributed to him becoming one of the most eminent academics on the subject. His main focus is the cultural and social experiences of migrants in receiving countries. ‘Wales in America: Scranton and the Welsh 1860-1920’ delves into aspects of immigrant life the nineteenth-century Welsh historian wished to conceal. There was a fear that traits deemed distasteful would harm the superiority the Welsh projected. He investigates how one ethnicity came to dominate both the industrial and social landscape and yet within sixty years had left little imprint of its ethnic culture behind.

Bill’s collaboration with Aled Jones ‘Welsh Reflections: Y Drych and America 1851-2001’ explores North America’s oldest Welsh newspaper and Welsh diaspora, the process of assimilation and culture, and Welsh identity. It provides a wealth of primary sources in the form of newspaper correspondence that has been translated into English, this dissertation will utilise the relevant sources.

---


30 For a biography and list of publications by Professor Jones see Bill Jones Biography, Cardiff University, Available at https://www.cardiff.ac.uk/people/view/73034-jones-bill, Accessed 10 May 2022.


32 Also know and published as Bill Jones.


Cherilyn, A. Walley’s ‘The welsh in Iowa’\textsuperscript{36}, explores the Welsh migrant’s assimilation into the agrarian and mining communities that formed in the midwestern states. She applies E. R, Barkan’s six-stage sociological theoretical model of ethnic assimilation to assess the retention of Welsh identity in those who emigrated to Iowa. Each stage acts as a loose spiral, bringing the immigrant closer to the core culture (American society) and the final transition of fully assimilated. This is a two-way interaction between immigrants and the core society in the host nation.

**BARKAN’S THEORETICAL MODEL OF ASSIMILATION**

A summary of the six stages;

1. **Contact - Initial experience.**
2. **Acculturation - Ethnic communities emerge in geographical locations and are exposed to the core culture.**
3. **Adaptation - English is spoken more and the ethnic community is beginning to have a balance between native-born members and foreign. Individuals experience more mobility out of the enclaves.**
4. **Accommodation – There are fewer foreign-born residents and English overtakes the Welsh language.**
5. **Integration - Ethnic assimilation, some enduring ethnic characteristics remain, such as food preferences, and the individual/group is included in general society.**
6. **Assimilation - Immigrants have lost substantial ties to their ethnic heritage. Although churches may remain that practise the English language.\textsuperscript{37}**

This model allows a rough measure of the ‘...ever-shifting balance between maintaining ethnic identity and adopting characteristics of general society’.\textsuperscript{38} It acknowledges that there has been no one pattern, no cycle, no one outcome that uniformly encompasses all ethnic experiences’.\textsuperscript{39} The theory is not suitable to assess the experience of non-voluntary


\textsuperscript{37} Ibid, p.6.

\textsuperscript{38} Ibid, p. 5.

\textsuperscript{39} Ibid, p. 4.
immigrants and it pays little attention to class, gender, or political engagement. It has also been critiqued as paying too much attention to the individual. Barkan observed that the Welsh ethnic group was ‘...one of only a very few who collectively advanced to the final, Assimilation stage of the ethnic transition model’. Although the Welsh will be discussed as a group, this dissertation asserts the individuals' experience must take priority and therefore Barkan’s model is suitable.

This dissertation will occasionally apply Barkan’s model and the invention theory to existing scholarly works regarding the trajectory of Welsh assimilation. The application of a sociological theory is lacking in the work of Jones and Lewis, concerning the Welsh in Pennsylvania. Bechhofer and Mc Crone believe that the study of national identity is not the ‘...preserve of any one discipline. This study offers two chapters to find a conclusion to explore, how and to what extent the Welsh retained their identity.

Chapter one, ‘The image of Welsh Identity projected onto the anthracite coalfield’ will focus on the occupational sphere of the mines and the hierarchy the Welsh enjoyed there. Welsh identity, politics, and the social-economic status of the miner will be explored to identify if there was a modification or retention of identity to enable upward mobility out of the mines. The relationship and opposition to other migrant nations will also be assessed.

Chapter two will focus on ‘Welsh identity and the Scranton community’ and the trajectory of the Welsh institutions of nonconformist chapels, newspapers, and Eisteddfod will be analysed in conjunction with the decline of the Welsh language, to assess the impact this had on the process of assimilation and the invention of ethnicity.

Historians are stepping away from government data and towards Census Enumerator Books alongside qualitative sources\textsuperscript{45} and this study will be in keeping with this trend. It will explore numerous primary sources in the form of periodicals, letters, industrial correspondence, and newspaper reports.

CHAPTER 1 - THE IMAGE OF WELSH IDENTITY PROJECTED ONTO THE ANTHRACITE COALFIELD.

‘Is it any wonder the Welsh emigrants coming to Hyde Park felt themselves at home at once? ...relatives, friends and acquaintances were all here waiting for them... Hyde Park, to thousands of incoming Welshmen, was another Wales’, Judge H.M. Edwards, 1909.  

Emigration from Wales to Scranton must be understood against the backdrop of real-life experiences in Wales in the first half of the nineteenth century. Ravenstein’s Laws of Migration offer a theoretical explanation of the factors which encouraged an individual to emigrate. The negative ‘push’ factors in the home nation such as economic decline, oppressive treatment, social disputes, lack of opportunity for personal development, and natural disasters led to a person being pushed away. The ‘pull’ factors of the host nation are economic opportunity, higher standards of living, and personal independence and development. A basic assessment of the push factors, which propelled immigrants to leave could be the economic depression that gripped Wales into the mid-nineteenth century and caused endemic poverty. While a pull factor could be, the industrial knowledge, which gave the Welsh miner greater opportunity for employment in the anthracite rich mines. Dudley Baines expresses caution about placing too much emphasis on where the immigrant is going, as several motives play a part including gender, age (lifecycle), and social and economic conditions at home. He emphasises the migration experience was an individual one and it is impossible to know what went through people’s minds. Hywel Davies notes that economic conditions are not always mutually exclusive and other factors, which remain

---

See also: Baines, D, Migration in a Mature Economy, Internal and Overseas Migration in England and Wales, 1861-1900, (CUP, 1986) and Emigration from Europe 1815-1939, (Macmillan, 1991).  
52 Jones, B, Raising the wind, p. 5.
personal to an individual play a part. Walter H. Davies attributed his father’s ‘...adventurous spirit...' and '...following in the footsteps of a neighbour...' to his parents emigration from Bedlinog to the U.S.A in the 1880s. Although higher rates of pay and assurance of work and accommodation also played a role in his decision. Throughout the second half of the nineteenth century, an emigration fever is said to have set in and this was fuelled by many mediums including, periodicals, newspapers, letters home, union and government aid, and the actions of others. Also, the technological advancement in steamships enabled a faster voyage.

Scranton’s link with Wales was reinforced by George W. Scranton when he established a rolling mill in 1846 and developed iron rails. Once he had hired an experienced Welshman, John R. Williams to organise and supervise the mine, others followed. The skills of the Welsh miner were sought after and by the end of the nineteenth-century anthracite-rich Scranton had the largest concentration of the Welsh outside Wales itself. The Welsh clustered together, a hallmark of an ethnic group and this settlement pattern was aided by chain migration which tends to see immigrants channelled to one or two locations. At this

---

57 Jones, B, Raising the Wind, p. 2.
58 Griffiths, W, A letter: Everyone thought that the deep would be his grave, 4 July 16, 1836, in Conway, A, Welsh in America, p. 23.
60 Lewis, R.L, Welsh Americans, p. 57.
62 Sanders, V, Wales, the Welsh and the making of America, p. 194.
stage, the Welsh immigrants passed through the Contact and Acculturation stages of Barkan’s model.\textsuperscript{65}

The recruitment of the Welsh miner began a hierarchy of nations within the mines with the Welsh at the top. The most notable and celebrated Welshmen was Benjamin Hughes\textsuperscript{66} (1824-1900), patriarch of the Scranton Welsh. His experience in the mines began at ten when he assisted his father and by the age of twenty-four, he had emigrated to Pennsylvania, settling in Pottsville and finally Scranton. He rose through the ranks, from foreman to superintendent and then general inside superintendent and he contributed to the growth and protection of the Welsh in the coalfield, they enjoyed a ‘...monopoly of positions and power under his leadership...’\textsuperscript{67} He witnessed the dramatic growth of the mining industry, with five shafts on arrival which expanded to thirty shafts and thirty-one breakers by 1900.\textsuperscript{68} The clustering of the Welsh and the manipulation of power to further a fellow Welshmen’s prospects did not just suit the Welsh miner it also suited those such as Hughes to perpetuate their dominance, power, and interests.\textsuperscript{69}

The social mobility offered to the Welsh did not go unnoticed and Hughes superior W.R. Storrs at Delaware, Lackawanna and Western Railroads stated the Welsh were ‘...clannish and the best places at their disposal are given to friends’.\textsuperscript{70} The notations of the clan-like behaviour were further reinforced by the use of the Welsh language by Hughes in the mines. He was known to write to subordinates in Welsh as a means of hiding misdeeds from his superior W. R. Storrs. Hughes wrote to superintendent S. D. Philips, he opens the letter with ‘A word in Welsh to you and in the utmost secrecy. In short, I heard one of the officers talking about you...’ and closes the letter with 'Take this as brotherly advice and do not

\textsuperscript{65} Walley, C. A, \textit{The Welsh in Iowa}, p. 6.
\textsuperscript{67} Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 30.
\textsuperscript{68} Lewis, R. L, \textit{Welsh Americans}, p. 6.
\textsuperscript{69} Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 33.
\textsuperscript{70} W.R. Storrs, Delaware, Lackawanna and Western Railroad Papers (21 August, 1871), in Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 33.

One cross-section of the mining community in which ethnic conflict existed was the Irish. Paul O’Leary attests that this was not a new development and anti-popery had existed since early modern times within Wales\footnote{O’Leary, P, ‘When Was Anti-Catholicism? The Case of Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Wales,’ Journal of Ecclesiastical History, Vol. 56, No. 2 (April 2005), p. 12.}. The Catholic church was in direct opposition to non-conformity and the antipathy to Rome occupied a central place in Welsh identity.\footnote{Ibid, p. 13.} The breadth and feeling of anti-popery can be seen in the estimated twenty ethnic riots which took place in Wales between 1826 and 1882.\footnote{Conway, A, Welsh in America, p. 16.} These feelings were not left at home when immigrants boarded for America. Conway concludes that the Welsh had ‘…almost a pathological dislike of the Irish…’ after curating immigrant letters for the ‘Welsh in America’.\footnote{Jones, E. Vinegar, Letter: Water to quench the thirst (NEW YORK, TO ED. 5 July 1837), in Conway, A, Welsh in America, p. 24.} This can be witnessed in several letters, Edward Jones and fellow preacher David Lewis wrote to a New York Newspaper in 1837, ‘There are many Irish crowded aboard. We were afraid many times that their ungodliness would move the lord to sink us all…’ and reasoned it was not just a religious dislike that drove this opinion but a cultural one too as ‘…they were barbaric…’.\footnote{78}

The non-conformist religion valued hard work and abstinence from alcohol and the letters show numerous times the Welsh were praised for this, in contrast to the drunk Irish. One
writer in 1829 wrote '...many families from Wales live in the town and neighbourhood, many of them rich, those who are hard-working, diligent, sober'. The letters also illustrate that the ideal good immigrant stereotype of the Welsh was not always upheld. Davies who settled in Ohio wrote to a friend and suggested 'The great fault of Welshmen in America was their tremendous thirst for liquor. They degrade themselves more than any other nation'. Welsh identity was in opposition to the Irish and this continued into future generations and the next century.

The dislike of the Irish can be seen in the hierarchal employment structure in the mines and the Baptist Church was said to be a recruiting ground. Ethnic tensions divided the immigrants from Britain and Ireland into two camps, the protestant miners who were mainly Scottish, Welsh, and English in contrast to the Irish miners. The Welsh miners’ wage was subject to fluctuation and deductions for tools as they worked on piece rate and allowances made for dead work. Despite this as contract miners, they were still the best paid and their working day reflected their privileged position. They had independence in their work and would often work for six hours a day in comparison to the unskilled labourer who worked between twelve and fifteen hours. This gave the Welsh miner greater leisure time and the ability to concentrate on educational courses to further his social and economic advancement.

---

82 The Molly Maguires were a product of the ethnic tensions and limited prospects the Irish worker experienced. They were a secret militant sect (active between 1861-1875). They were linked to the deaths of twenty-four mining Superintendents and Forman, for a brief overview of the group see, Schumm, L, Who Were the Molly Maguires (History.com, 2018). Available at: [https://www.history.com/news/who-were-the-molly-maguires](https://www.history.com/news/who-were-the-molly-maguires). Accessed, 10 May, 2022.
84 Jones, W, *Wales in America*, p. 49.
Writer and visitor to Scranton Phoebe Gibbons\(^{85}\) said a miner had told her he was finished by noon and could then write essays for the Eisteddfod and subsequently get them published in the papers.\(^{86}\) This was in contrast to the Irish, one labourer wrote to the Scranton Morning Republican in 1871 about his working day, ',...Mr Welshmen put on his coat and went home to enjoy himself in the bosom of his family, cultivate his mind and if he felt so disposed or to engage in other amusements.', ',... whilst we perform nine-tenths of the total work'.\(^{87}\) This was written during the strike of 1871 which was a consequence of the American Civil War\(^{88}\) (1861-1865). Phoebe Gibbons observed the leading Welsh were in favour of a compromise ',...but were outvoted by the more reckless of their own nation'.\(^{89}\) This suggests there were divisions within the Welsh mining community and anyone who did not side with the leading Welshmen was inferior to some extent.

The most prominent Welsh boss of all Benjamin Hughes symbolic of the ideal immigrant kept a discrete silence during the 1871 strike, he was in a difficult position but his inability to speak out made him fit into neither the miners' camp nor his superiors.\(^{90}\) The strike became ethnically entrenched and a New York Times reporter noted it had '...resolved itself into a war of the races'.\(^{91}\) The Welsh could be described as best armed for conflict as they had greater economic reserves due to their higher wages and lifestyle. Samuel Walker suggests the Welsh community was able to use '... ethnic, religious, civic, and linguistic cohesiveness to exercise a style of group discipline unmatched by any other

---


\(^{86}\) Jones, W, Wales in America, p. 49.

\(^{87}\) Scranton Morning Republican (11 May 1871), in Jones, W, Wales in America, p. 50.

\(^{88}\) During the Civil War there was an increased demand for coal and wages quadrupled, this was also facilitated by a labour shortage, as many miners joined the Union Army. Jones, W, Wales in America, p. 50, noted many Scranton miners enlisted in the Company G 77th Regiment.


\(^{90}\) Storrs concluded in correspondence with his superiors, Hughes must had felt sympathy for the miners but ultimately ‘...he was working in the interests of the company’, W.R. Storrs, Delaware, Lackawanna and Western Railroad Papers (12 July, 1871), in Jones, W, Wales in America, p. 97.

group in the city’. The support of the Workingmen’s Benevolent Association referred to as the First Union of the Anthracite Miners was heavily supported by the Welsh, although union support was not the only tactic the Welsh community used in times of occupational conflict.

Mass intimidation would often manifest into violent disturbances when many miners attended a meeting about returning to work and ‘...a crowd of frenzied Welsh females' attacked them with and used '...every opprobrious epithet their filthy mouths could muster'. Women’s agency regarding social issues was not a new development as from the beginning of the nineteenth-century women were visible in times of protest. Gibbons noted that the Welsh women held the purse strings and were responsible for the domestic economy within the house. The Victorian ideology of the male breadwinner and the treatment of the Welsh women’s respectability in the publication of the Blue Books contributed to the drive of the idea the home was the women’s domain. It did not take away her social agency and this must have been deemed acceptable by their husbands.

During the strike W.B.A men would smash up strike breakers' homes, inflict violence on mine foremen and burn down coal breakers, martial law was declared after protests left two dead. The actions of the Welsh miners and their families and the apathy of the Welsh

---

94 Scranton Morning Republican, (7 April 1871), in Jones, W, Wales in America, p. 50.
96 A husband would hand the wage over after he ‘...got his fill of beer’. Gibbons, P.E, Harper’s Magazine, p. 926.
100 Scranton Morning Republican, (7,8,10 April 1871), in Jones, W, Wales in America, p. 58.
elite were at odds with the celebrated character of the Welsh. The *Pottsville Miners Journal*’s Scranton correspondent declared a year before, 'They are an orderly, thrifty and religious community...so quiet and orderly within this Welsh town.'102 The *Record of the Times* reported the changing sentiment to the Welsh, there was shock at the rioting in Hyde Park which had previously '...been praised for the intelligence and the thrift of its miners, should be the scene of such riots, is astonishing.'103

Many Welsh identified as Republican104 and American Republicans sent out a clear message, even before the riots that they did not like the links with the militant unionist miners and their party. This sentiment intensified and in April the Welsh were refused service at a store and told by the shopkeeper, 'You are nothing but my enemy anyhow'.105 A letter writer called ‘Cyrmo' wrote to the *Drych* newspaper to declare that the Welsh had been pitted against other nationalities and the native Americans had a low opinion of all immigrants and likened them to '...white niggers'. They were only '...good citizens if they worked quietly...' and did not interfere with political matters. He also indicates the American need for the Welsh to buy into the respectable persona and yet if you ‘...lift the veil, it can be seen most Americans is a judas kiss.'106 During this time many Welsh voters drifted away from the Republican Party to the Democrats to take a stance on how they were vilified during the strikes, although they would later return to their normal voting behaviour by 1872.107 The W.B.A went into decline and after the long strike of Schuylkill County, it ceased to exist.108

As the nineteenth century drew to a close so did the intimate relationship between Welsh identity and occupation. The changing ethnic composition of the workforce was due to several factors. Firstly, there was a new wave of immigrant during the latter half of the

---

104 The party was supported overwhelmingly by northern native protestants and immigrant protestants, they were anti-Catholic, unlike the Democratic party, see Oestreicher, R, “Urban Working-Class Political Behaviour and Theories of American Electoral Politics, 1870-1940.” *The Journal of American History*, vol. 74, no. 4, (1988), pp. 1257–86, particularly p. 50.
105 Undated Newspaper Report, Jones, W, *Wales in America*, p. 60. Native American refers to those who descended from the earlier white settlers and they tended to be Protestant.
107 Ibid, p. 75.
nineteenth century from Eastern and Southern Europe\textsuperscript{109}. The new wave of immigrant did not have a grasp of English and was willing to work longer hours for a lesser wage and many were Catholic. The American core viewed them as alien and under suspicion which allowed the earlier Western Protestant Europeans to be viewed as familiar and more like them.\textsuperscript{110}

Secondly, the overworking of the thin coal seam left the thicker seams to be mined which did not require the Welsh skill in hand cutting.\textsuperscript{111} J.R. Williams observed in 1895 that the agrarian ‘… Poles and Hungarians are harder working people and physically stronger than the English and Welsh’ and the Welsh no longer hold ‘…the best show...’ in the mines.\textsuperscript{112} Lewis claims that most Western European immigrants had acquired the English language as a form of communication in the mines.\textsuperscript{113} The prestige of the English language was a factor in fewer Welshmen down the mines. Blunt reported in \textit{Llais Llafur}\textsuperscript{114} that the reason so many Welsh did not continue mining was due to an unwillingness to serve their two-year labouring apprenticeship as ‘…it goes against the grain in an English-speaking man to fetch and carry for a Slovak or Pole’.\textsuperscript{115} If the Welsh were in the mines at this point they were normally in supervisory positions.\textsuperscript{116}

Thirdly, the city’s commerce grew with various industries such as commercial admin and public services.\textsuperscript{117} \textit{Scranton City Directory} indicates that the sons of Welsh miners occupationally diversified with the city and found jobs away from the mines.\textsuperscript{118} In 1870 there was a stereotypical pattern of Welsh names followed by the occupation of a miner. In

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{109} In 1870 Southern and Eastern European born accounted for 1% of immigrants, in 1880 it was 16%, 1990s it rose to 60% and in the first decade of the twentieth century it was 65%. R. L., Lewis, \textit{Welsh in America}, p. 221.
\item \textsuperscript{110} Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 86.
\item \textsuperscript{111} There were no new major advances in mechanisation during the period but there was in the blasting techniques used. Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 83.
\item \textsuperscript{112} John R Williams to William Thomas, (10 November 1895), in Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 85.
\item \textsuperscript{113} Lewis, R, L, \textit{Welsh Americans}, p. 190.
\item \textsuperscript{114} A labour Newspaper serving industrial Glamorganshire and Carmarthenshire (1898-1971).
\item \textsuperscript{115} Blunt, J, \textit{Llais Llafur, Scranton and the changed city: Why Foreigners have displaced the Welsh} (January 2, 1915) Available at https://newspapers.library.wales/view/3977832/3977833/1/welsh%20day%20scranton Accessed 10 May 2022.
\item \textsuperscript{116} Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p.72.
\item \textsuperscript{117} Ibid, p. 83.
\item \textsuperscript{118} ‘Sons of Welshmen never work in the mines, unless it is a case of failure everywhere else’, \textit{Druid} (24 April 1913), in Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 82.
\end{itemize}
1900 Welsh names showed the Welsh had jobs that could be considered middle class such as clerks, bank tellers, shop assistants etc.\textsuperscript{119}

The shift away from the coalfield represented more than the American-born Welsh upward socio-economic mobility and self-improvement, it meant the loss of an ethnic occupational and class cohesiveness and in turn, left Welsh identity open to further invention. The second-generation merged into the wider Scranton community for work and they arrived at the Adaptation stage of the Barkan model.\textsuperscript{120}

\textsuperscript{119} Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, pp. 80-82.
\textsuperscript{120} Walley, C.A, \textit{The Welsh in Iowa}, p. 6.
CHAPTER 2: WELSH IDENTITY AND CULTURAL MAINTENANCE IN THE COMMUNITY.

...it was undoubtedly the greatest Welsh centre in the United States. The service in the Welsh Churches was altogether in the Welsh language. The Welsh people were the better Church-goers than they are now... The Eisteddfods were conducted almost altogether in Welsh... In the last fifteen or twenty years, there has been a great change. The use of the Welsh language is less and less every year and it is safe to say that in fifteen years hence there will be very little Welsh spoken. The Welsh churches will be altogether English, instead of half English, as they are now. Nether the less the Welsh Spirit will remain’.

Judge H.M, Edwards, Druid121, 1909.122

Judge Edwards123 a prominent Welshman was involved in several cultural projects during his forty-plus years in the Hyde Park community, particularly during the time of his reflection above on Scranton society between 1864 and 1875.124

The tone of the piece is in stark contrast to the stance Edwards took less than four decades earlier when in 1871 he was awarded first prize at Youngstown Eisteddfod125 and scolded the Welsh American society for their lack of cultural preservation and shortcomings in retaining the Welsh language.126 The decline of ‘Welsh Athens of America’127 was due to the Welshness waning, although its ‘...legacy still lingered to infuse the expression of the Welsh...’ Edwards refers to, something Bill Jones terms Welsh-Americanism.

121 For information on The Druid society, Druid newspaper (printed in English, est. 1897) and H. M. Edward’s involvement see: Jones W, Wales in America, pp. 118-119. The name ‘Druid’ is significant as it highlights and reinforces the eighteenth-century interest in Druidism. There was a belief that the Welsh bards had been the heirs of the ancient Druids, and had inherited their rites and rituals, their religion and mythology, See ‘Prys, M, Hunt for Romantic Death to the Welsh, in, The invention of tradition, ed, Hobsbawm and Ranger, T, (Cambridge University Press, 2012), pp. 57-67, particularly p. 61 on the Druids symbolic authority.
124 Jones, W, Wales in America, p. 86.
126 Lewis, R.L., Welsh Americans, p. 316.
127 Drych (20 April 1871), ed and trans. by Jones, W, Wales in America, p. 87.
Edward’s reminiscing signifies the importance of the co-dependent relationship between the Church\textsuperscript{128} and the Welsh language. The mid-nineteenth century immigrant had come from a land where the English language was used for all state administration and non-conformity despite different denominations acted as a unifying agent\textsuperscript{129} against Anglican oppression. The Welsh immigrants may not have considered themselves to be from a truly homogenous group, as Evan Davies from South Wales recalls when he was on route to America in 1864. He stated that an old man from North Wales listened to him talking with friends and was ignorant to the fact that they were also Welsh and was overheard saying ‘Here we are again, fallen into the midst of these damn Germans’.\textsuperscript{130}

Nonconformists took it for granted that Anglicans were the enemy of Welshness, ‘...therefore, religiosity, specifically nonconformity, was regarded by many as a national characteristic so much so that it had become central to the idea of Welsh nationality itself’.\textsuperscript{131} Prys suggests that the Blue Books enabled a reinvention of identity, filling the religious void left by the decline of the Catholic Church in the sixteenth century which had not yet been filled\textsuperscript{132} along with a decaying romantic culture that needed reinvention. The radicalism and nonconformity would enable a new identity to be subtly created going into the 1860s and 1870s.\textsuperscript{133} It was this reinvented sense of Welsh identity that was transplanted in Scranton when the Welsh emigrated, although it was still in its infancy and not all shared it.

\textsuperscript{128}Davies J, ‘...suggests the Church describes the denomination and Chapel is the building’. Cited in, Tyler, R.L Migrant Identity and Cultural Maintenance: The Welsh in Clearfield County, Pennsylvania, USA 1880-1920, Immigrants and minorities, p. 212.
\textsuperscript{129}‘The Treachery of the Blue Books propelled the Methodists to support the older dissenting denominations such as the Baptists and Independents, thus creating a united Welsh Nonconformist’, Knight, F, Religion, Identity and Conflict in Britain: from the Restoration to the Twentieth Century: Essays in Honour of Keith Robbins, Brown. S, (Taylor & Francis Group, 2013), p. 96.
\textsuperscript{130}Davies, E, Letter: A five-months-old baby died (13 July 4, 1864), in Conway, Welsh in America, p. 36
\textsuperscript{131}Tyler, R.L, Migrant Identity and Culture Maintenance, p. 212.
\textsuperscript{132}Tyler suggests the following reading to explore this phenomenon, Prys Morgan, ‘Keeping the Legends Alive,’ in Wales the Imagined Nation: Essays in Cultural and National Identity, ed. T. Curtis (Bridgend: Poetry Wales Press, 1986), pp. 19–41.
\textsuperscript{132}Prys, M, The Invention of Tradition, pp. 98-100.
The chapel was a vehicle for this identity to be reinforced and displayed in the first half of the nineteenth century when on average one was built every eight days in Wales.\textsuperscript{134} The immigrants ‘...imitated the Welsh in Wales in the frenzy with which they built chapels’.\textsuperscript{135} The First Welsh Baptist Church\textsuperscript{136} was considered the foremost dominant and influential in America.\textsuperscript{137} The congregation tended to come from industrial South Wales and not the rural areas which can explain how chapels would see attendances swell to eight hundred\textsuperscript{138} by 1867 in the anthracite-rich city.

The Welsh language was a medium that personified antiquity and conventional morality, these characteristics were thought to promote the Welsh as worthy ideal American citizens.\textsuperscript{139} The cohesive strength of the Welsh language was evident, although it was impossible to ascertain how many spoke Welsh in America\textsuperscript{140} during the nineteenth century. Bill Jones suggests that the early Welsh community of Scranton was ‘...overwhelmingly Welsh speaking’,\textsuperscript{141} although it was noted many could speak English\textsuperscript{142} and this bilingual ability aided a warmer reception from the core society. Although it was observed the Welsh language could be used in less than ideal ways when some of the community sang and swore in Welsh along Main Avenue.\textsuperscript{143}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{134}Tyler, R.L., \textit{Migrant Identity and Cultural Maintenance}, p. 212.
\textsuperscript{135}Bill Jones uses Church in the American context. The leading three denominations of Baptists, Congregationalists, and Calvinistic Methodists were built by the end of the 1850s, by 1870s there were seven Welsh Churches in the city \textit{Webb’s Scranton Directory, 1870-71}, in Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 91.
\textsuperscript{136}Established 1863, South Main Avenue, Hyde Park. Although the Church was present in Scranton in 1850, operating from a Sunday school room next to a rolling mill. For a brief early history of the Baptist Church in Scranton, see the \textit{History of Luzerene, Lackawanna and Wyoming Counties}.
\textsuperscript{137}Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 92.
\textsuperscript{138}Dedication Service Souvenir, First Welsh Baptist Church (Scranton, 1958) in Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 92.
\textsuperscript{141}Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 90.
\textsuperscript{143}\textit{Drych} (28\textsuperscript{th} July 1870), trans, by, Jones, W, \textit{Wales in America}, p. 90.
\end{flushleft}
The Catholics were the only other group that had a comparable cohesiveness although the core society saw them as a threat, unlike the Welsh whose religious denominations were similar to theirs. The Irish were a strong ethnic group whose cohesiveness of nationalism was fuelled by poverty. Contrastingly the Welsh used the Church for social and economic advancement mirroring the hierarchy seen in the mines and Benjamin Hughes used the Baptist Church as a recruiting ground.

The Church offered a full calendar of social activities, including choirs, Women's Missionary Society, Ladies Aid, and Band of Hope which meant the Church was central to everyday life. Sunday School and Bible schools were popular and one run by The First Welsh Baptist Church had over seven hundred and fifty members. They were attended by both sexes and delivered in English and Welsh. Sunday Schools were a symbol of Welshness from the time of the Blue Books, which were based on the critique of Welsh education.

The school and Church activity gave people the opportunity to learn new skills in a voluntary capacity as nonconformity encouraged the notion of bettering oneself. The origins of the religion were grounded in this concept as the preachers were unpaid laymen descended from Welsh Peasantry and became influential figures in society, both in Wales and America. The Welsh ability to utilise social and religious activities for social advancement outwardly portrayed their ‘middle class’ character which in turn served to show the American core culture that they had a shared ideology.

---

144 The English attended American Churches, the Germans were lacking in cohesion because they were split along protestant and catholic lines. They would be less likely to speak English.


148 Ibid, pp. 92-94.


Cracks began to appear in the bond between nonconformity and the Welsh language in 1871 when a younger section of the congregation of the First Welsh Baptists broke away to build their own English-speaking Church. The Congregationalists refused English to be spoken in their Church which led the defected to set up the Plymouth Congregational Church in Hyde Park in 1881, although the mother Church donated $5,000 to its founding. The breakaway did not affect the ‘Old Churches’ membership which doubled from 1870 to 1890, although from the 1890s both the Welsh Baptist and Congregational Church saw a sharp decline in numbers which affected finances, forcing the Church to adopt the English language to survive.

Many factors were responsible for the decline of the Welsh Language Church in the twentieth century. The second-generation either chose not to or could not speak Welsh or it was due to the passing away of the original members. The declining number of congregations in Welsh chapels was not solely a language issue as there was a shift away from religion in America as a whole. Emrys Jones describes how the American-born generation would rebel against the language and religion of the 'old world' their parents came from and embraced new 'worldly' cultural values such as dance, sports, and music.

American born Will Owen wrote to the Druid in 1937 and explained he felt Welsh had little or no use as English was used in business, law, and schools and reminisced about the isolating experience of being a Welsh monoglot child in America. He also suggested the Church’s downfall was to ignore the needs of the English speaking second-generation and

---

156 Ibid, p. 108.
ignored the sign of the times.\textsuperscript{159} The second-generation Welsh-Americans\textsuperscript{160} reluctance, inability or parental unwillingness was not confined to Scranton American-born Welsh nor the period under the review of this dissertation. In 1792 John Evans\textsuperscript{161} visited the Welsh Tract\textsuperscript{162} and found the older generations had still retained fluency in Welsh, while the children were monolingual English, and the fact they were not bilingual indicates a decision to discard the language was made.\textsuperscript{163} 

The extent of concern in this ethnolinguistic shift was discussed in the Welsh Newspaper \textit{Y Drych}\textsuperscript{164} and one reader wrote '...a man cannot be a Welshman without knowledge of Welsh' and if he did not he was an '...excommunicate'.\textsuperscript{165} In contrast Reverend Erasmus W. Jones's article ‘\textit{The Future of Welsh in America}\textsuperscript{166} identified that some loss of the language by immigrants was inevitable. Although there would be a decline he insisted Welsh would be ‘Preached in, spoken and read for some time to come...’.\textsuperscript{167} 

There were others such as Reverend W.R Evans who despised the attempts to maintain not only Welsh but all ethnic minority languages and if they were to be sustained, ‘...it would be a calamity beyond imagination...'. He believed that '...peace, civil and religious success...'

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{159} Appendix 5: for full quotation, \textit{The Druid} (June 1 1937), in Morgan, S, \textit{THE WELSH OF THE UNITED STATES AND PLAID CYMRU 1925-1945}, p. 213.
\textsuperscript{160} The Welsh second-generation immigrant was not alone in showing hostility to their mother tongue. One commentator originally from Mexico, whose mother tongue was Spanish, wrote thus, 'I determined to learn English, initially, as a way of hurting my parents... One day I lost my accent...For generations, this has been the pattern: immigrants have arrived in the city and the children of immigrant parents have gone off to school and come home speaking an American English'. Rodriguez, R, 'An American Writer,' in \textit{The Invention of Ethnicity}, ed. Werner Sollors (New York: Oxford University Press, 1989), p. 4.
\textsuperscript{165} Jones, A, Jones, B, \textit{Welsh Reflections}, p. 56.
\textsuperscript{167} \textit{Y Drych} 28 July 1898. \textit{Welsh Reflections}, p. 58.
\end{flushleft}
meant one language must ‘...swallow the others’.\textsuperscript{168} He went as far as suggesting those who wanted Welsh to be spoken move back home from the English-speaking American Republic.\textsuperscript{169}

It would appear that Judge Edwards’ fears, printed in the Druid were founded in truth as in the first few decades of the twentieth century ‘Welsh was seldom heard on the streets of Welsh American Communities, including leading centres like Scranton’.\textsuperscript{170} Lewis believes there was little regret in the loss of language and uses Bill Jones’s phrase that the language was not a ‘...negation of identity’.\textsuperscript{171} Connor Walker suggests that language is an objective feature of national identity and is important ‘...only to the degree to which they contribute to the sense of group identity or uniqueness’.\textsuperscript{172} Many Welsh-born were understanding of the American-born Welsh and linked their lack of ethnic language retention to the quest for a better life.\textsuperscript{173} Howell Williams wrote in 1923 that ‘We came here not to keep the language alive, but ourselves alive’.\textsuperscript{174} The Welsh-born did not have to navigate Anglican oppression in their motherland unlike their parents in their homeland therefore deploying the language was less crucial.

\textit{The Drych} (Mirror) newspaper was ultimately an immigrant publication\textsuperscript{175} and it wanted to make the most of the religious and cultural freedoms the new land had to offer in contrast to the oppression in the homeland.\textsuperscript{176} It was also influential in encouraging American citizenship to its readers and in 1893 the editor said the Welsh residing in America ‘...should take the first opportunity that came their way to become citizens so that they could vote and thereby influence society and politics...’.\textsuperscript{177} By 1900 over ninety percent of the Welsh in

\textsuperscript{169} Ibid, p. 58.
\textsuperscript{170} Lewis R. L, \textit{Welsh Americans}, p. 308.
\textsuperscript{171} Ibid, p. 308
\textsuperscript{175} Aled and Bill Jones suggest, it was an immigrant paper as it had adverts for emigration agents, shipping, land purchase, and railroads, Jones, A, and Jones, B, \textit{Welsh Reflections}, p. 58.
\textsuperscript{176} Ibid, p. 7.
\textsuperscript{177} Ibid, p. 53.
America had applied for citizenship or already become naturalized, one of the highest rates amongst foreign groups.\textsuperscript{178} This indicates that the Welsh displayed an agency to integrate with the American core. The Census of 1920 and 1930 noted that seventy-three percent of Welsh immigrants had become citizens.\textsuperscript{179}

Morgan links the eagerness to identify as a pro-active American with the lack of a ‘...vibrant sense of Welsh identity in the home country when Welsh communities in places such as Scranton were disintegrating.\textsuperscript{180} A new form of American-Welshness could be constructed\textsuperscript{181} which was more vibrant than the real-life context and social experience of Wales in crisis. Conway contrasts the rapid assimilation of the Welsh in America with the lack ‘...of nationalism and the desire to preserve the Welsh language in Wales were at their lowest ebb’.\textsuperscript{182} The ‘Welsh spirit’ Judge Edwards described had become an American Welshness which was a collaboration, not only the immigrants’ desire for assimilation in the form of citizenship but also the welcoming of the host nation\textsuperscript{183} and in the backdrop was Wales in crisis.

*The Drych* was metaphorically described by A and B, Jones as a ‘...cultural Ellis Island’\textsuperscript{184} in which the Welsh Immigrant passes through to obtain life in America. The Welsh were seen as desirable\textsuperscript{185} and they went unnoticed as they could usually speak English. They had shared political and legal traditions, and were protestant and skilled workers which mirrored the middle-class values promoted in America. Other nationalities which flooded the U.S in

\textsuperscript{178} Lewis, R.L, *Welsh Americans*, p. 309.
\textsuperscript{180} Morgan, S, *THE WELSH OF THE UNITED STATES AND PLaid CYMru 1925-1945*, p. 60.
\textsuperscript{181} Conzen, Gerber, Morawska, Pozzetta, and Vecoli, ‘The Invention of Ethnicity: A Perspective from the USA,’ pp. 4-5.
\textsuperscript{183} This is in contrast to how the American core society treat other immigrants such as the Italians, particularly the darker skinned Southern Italian. Wyman, M, *Round-Trip to America: The Immigrants Return to Europe, 1880–1930*. (Cornell University Press, 1993). Wyman suggest that while many Italians saw themselves as seasonal workers the anti-immigration nativist violence and aggression were too much for the immigrants to tolerate. The return rate for Italians was as high as 50 percent, Kivisto, P, ‘The origins of “new assimilation theory”’, *Ethnic and racial studies*, 40(9), (2017), p. 1422.
\textsuperscript{184} Jones, A, and Jones, B, *Welsh Reflections*, p. 71.
\textsuperscript{185} A higher proportion of Welsh achieved full neutralization as citizens than the Scottish and English. Thirteen percent of Scots and English had not been applied for citizenship by 1900 compared with seven percent of Welsh. Lewis R.L, *Welsh Americans*, p. 93.
the late nineteenth century contributed to scores of Welshmen trooping’... home to Wales, with ‘...their American citizenship forgotten’. Barkan estimates the return rate was much lower for the Welsh and Scottish who returned with a ratio of one to six in contrast to the English at one to four. This also contributed to a shift in the amount of Welsh-born in relation to the growing American-born Welsh population, this is a feature of Barkan’s Accommodation stage.

The nineteenth century was a time of pseudo-science which acted as a vehicle for society to justify extreme racism and xenophobia and this was reflected in the several immigration Bills passed due to changing attitudes toward immigrants. One Bill was effectively the Chinese Exclusion Act and the first Bill to bar immigrants based on nationality. The Bill to Regulate Immigration in 1892 was followed by the Emergency Quota Act of 1921. This Act set out to restrict the influx of undesirable immigrants and radicals after the First World War by setting a maximum number of immigrants allowed to

---

enter the U.S., although it was adapted to favour migration from Western Europe. This left the Scranton Welsh community without another wave of immigrants to keep the mother country's traditions and language alive. The government intervention contributed to Barkan’s Accommodation stage being completed as most residents used English instead of their ethnic tongue.

The Eisteddfod was another vehicle to retain Welsh cultural identity and as Judge Edward stated they had seen great change whilst in Scranton, moving away from exclusively using the Welsh language to it becoming a celebration of Welshness in America for all to enjoy. The Eisteddfod and Church experienced almost a simultaneous fate in regards to the loss of the Welsh language within the institutions. The use of the English language at Eisteddfods was minimal before the First World War with around twelve percent being performed in English, by 1930 this crept up to forty-five percent and by 1948 the Americanisation of the event was complete as the Welsh language had disappeared entirely.

The process of the Americanisation of the festival began in the latter decade of the nineteenth century, which coincided with the decline in the number of Welsh immigrants. The sentiment of sharing the festival with other nations was discussed in *Y Drych* in 1899 and one believed it would be more beneficial for all to join in and forge it with American identity so it can live on rather than ‘…die in obscurity.’ This individual’s sentiment must have been representative of the majority of the Welsh community or they were ambivalent because the festival became one which celebrated Welsh-American identity. The sharing of the Eisteddfod reinforced the similarity between Welsh cultural ideology and that of the American core.

---

195 The numbers were skewed to favour the immigration from Western Europe see, Laws: The Emergency Quota Act 1921. Available at https://immigration.laws.com/emergency_quota-act. Accessed 16 May 2022.
197 The Eisteddfod was a celebration of music, literature, and poetry. They were not a deliberate invention and began in 1176 in South Wales, the name means tradition. For its history see, Prys, M, *From a Death to a View* pp. 56-62.
198 Lewis, R. L, *Welsh Americans*, p. 315
The character of the Welsh-American Eisteddfod stood out to Thomas Darlington in 1894 who was struck by the cosmopolitan elements of the heterogenous Scranton community rather than being a Welsh institution it became a Scranton institution with German Glee bands and Irish Choirs. The Eisteddfod became predominantly a musical event and H.M. Edwards observed in 1910 (a year after his musings at the beginning of this Chapter) that was a positive development as it ‘... became a means of recreation and amusement as well as educational and instructional. The masses of Welsh people in Wales and the United States have taken the Eisteddfod into their own hands’. 203

The change in Edwards’s attitudes could lie in the complexity of his feelings regarding his assimilation into American society and the notion it was better to have something rather than nothing left of Welshness. While some felt the ‘...ancient institution had become an irrelevant token, subordinate to the popularity of singing within a generation’.204 Some aspects of Barkan’s Integration Stage had been met by the evolution of the Eisteddfod as the American Welsh used the festival to help retain ‘...some residual characteristics, such a community-specific expression, but for the most part, he or she has achieved inclusion in general society.205 Not all passed through the final stage at the same time as some felt conflicting and complex emotions, Judge Edwards expressed his view in an English speaking paper and clearly felt it was better to have something left of the Welsh cultural heritage than nothing at all.

*The Drych* Newspapers' aim in the first quarter of the twentieth century was to keep the English from crossing Offa’s Dyke and by 1930 the English content away from advertisements became six and a half percent. Much of the content came from Scranton which signals that Welsh language use was decaying faster in Scranton than in other areas it

---


206 A retiring editor used the euphemism to declare they would keep out English as long as possible by limiting English to Advertisements ‘...or at least until the Old Language had peace to die’, in Drych (21 June 1928) ed. and trans. by Jones, A, and Jones, B, *Welsh Reflections* p. 110.
served in the North of the Country. By the mid-twentieth century, it could no longer serve its fading Welsh demographic and became an English language Welsh newspaper.

The papers staunch holdout regarding the Welsh language did not mirror the assimilation process of the Welsh-Americans. By the 1920s the majority of Welsh-American Scrantonians had become citizens and lost a significant connection to their heritage, shared language, and ethnic church. They had affiliations to the core culture and self-identified as members of the American society. The core reciprocated the connection and the transition went unchallenged. Generally, they had advanced to the Assimilation Stage of Barkan’s Model.

---

208 Lewis, R.L, Welsh in Americans, p. 315.
209 All Ethnic newspapers in the United States after the depression and the Americanism the war instigated. Non-English language newspapers fell from 1,323 in 1917 to 1,037 in 1930 and 698 in 1960’, Jones, A, Jones, B, Welsh Reflections, p. 104.
210 Individuals who were not yet at this stage were likely to have been Welsh-speaking first-generation immigrants who had arrived during the first decades of the twentieth century and held significant ties to Wales.
CONCLUSION

In utilising the Invention Theory and Barkan’s Model of Assimilation this dissertation concludes that the Welsh immigrant experience was complex and how, and to what extent they retained their identity was influenced by several factors. This study acknowledges that the Welsh immigrant experience in Scranton was chronologically, geographically and occupationally specific. Several push factors founded in a real-life context could have prompted emigration to Scranton, but one notable pull factor appears to be economic advancement in the form of mining.

The settlement pattern of the Welsh in Scranton enabled a clustering to occur which strengthened the pre-existing communal solidarities transported from the homeland. This solidarity was based on the fledgling reinvention of Welsh identity formed in the face of Anglican oppression during the nineteenth century. This reinvention embodied the belief that non-conformity and the Welsh language was central to identity.

Despite low migration numbers the Welsh displayed cohesiveness, dominance and relative privilege which was noted by other nationalities. When this led to resentment it was not problematic to the Welsh, as Welsh identity was often developed and established in opposition to others. This can be specifically seen in the treatment of the Irish Catholics and the Welsh manipulation of the Irish stereotype as barbaric drunks. This stereotype was perpetuated despite evidence the Welsh were just as capable of displaying such distasteful tendencies. The need to play the ideal immigrant can be seen in the actions of the Welsh, as the core would rarely let them veer away from what was expected of them. This was particularly evident during the Strike of 1871 when the Welsh changed their voting habits and were expected to vote Republican or face the isolating consequences.

The new wave of Eastern and Southern European immigrant left the Welsh occupationally vulnerable at the end of the nineteenth century. The influx also amplified pre-existing ethnic ideology the core society and Welsh shared. The White Anglo-Saxon Protestant American society was less threatened by the English-speaking Welsh nonconformist than the ‘others’
and this brought them closer to the core. This was a two-way process and the Welsh accepted and adapted their identity further by identifying as Welsh-American.

The Welsh miner spent years working a shorter day than other nationalities and coupled with the involvement with Church activities, it enabled him to cultivate skills away from the mine. The ideology of self-improvement qualified him to become an ideal candidate for upward social-economic mobility within the wider Scranton commerce. The cohesive ethnic, social, religious and political strength deployed against the mine owners during the strike of 1871, would no longer be strengthened through occupation.

Welsh culture had taken root in Scranton and the chapel and Eisteddfod provided a vehicle to retain the Welsh language and further incorporate a middle-class ideology into everyday life. Many would not foresee the second-generation’s desire to adopt the English language. Once the institutions became Anglicised they acted as a propelling force toward the final stages of Barkan’s model. Unlike the first-generation of immigrants, the second-generation American-born Welsh did not need to maintain or cultivate aspects of the Welsh language to set themselves apart from Anglicans or protest against oppression. Many of the first-generation believed it was better to retain some aspects of Welshness than none at all.

The American-born Welsh were driven to join the American core. They chose not to connect with the ‘old world’, and their everyday life had little or no contact with Wales. The Welsh language paper Y Drych did not mirror the experiences of the Welsh-American society as a whole but rather its dwindling first-generation readership. It had little or no influence on the second-generation’s ability to retain their ethnic identity. The development of Welsh-American identity had taken place without it and at a faster rate than elsewhere.

This dissertation is lacking in the ability to hold politics, class and gender against a theoretical model of assimilation, although the themes have been explored and discussed to some extent within the work. Barkan’s model was criticised for focusing on the individual rather than a group. This dissertation concludes the importance placed on the individual is a strength. It enabled an exploration of everyday life experience which was under threat of being lost by historians such as Ebenezer Edwards, who helped cultivate a façade of Welsh
respectability. Ultimately how and to what extent a Welsh immigrant retained their Welsh identity was a complex and individual real-life experience which was cultivated by both the immigrant community and core.
**APPENDIX 1: DISTRIBUTION OF THE UNITED STATES BORN IN WALES, 1900, BY STATES.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>35,453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>11,481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>7,304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>4,364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisconsin</td>
<td>3,356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iowa</td>
<td>3,091</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah</td>
<td>2,141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>2,083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kansas</td>
<td>2,005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colorado</td>
<td>1,955</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>1,949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massachusetts</td>
<td>1,680</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missouri</td>
<td>1,613</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington</td>
<td>1,509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minnesota</td>
<td>1,288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>1,195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vermont</td>
<td>1,056</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montana</td>
<td>935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nebraska</td>
<td>922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idaho</td>
<td>732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryland</td>
<td>674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Dakota</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Virginia</td>
<td>482</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wyoming</td>
<td>393</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kentucky</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alabama</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tennessee</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhoades Island</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maine</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian Territory</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Dakota</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arizona</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nevada</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisiana</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arkansas</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District of Columbia</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Hampshire</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delaware</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alaska</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mississippi</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Carolina</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Carolina</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>93,744</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


*Note:* The total Figure cited in the table in the Census is 93,744 (incorrect addition). The correct total of 93,648 includes figures for Alaska and Hawaii (a figure for 1900 in Appendix 3).
**APPENDIX 2: POPULATION GROWTH: GREATER EUROPE 1-1913 CE**

![Graph showing population growth of Greater Europe 1-1913 CE](image)

**Fig. 2.** Population dynamics of Greater Europe, millions of people, 1–1913 CE

*Sources: Meddison 2010; data point for 1650 is calculated taking into account the estimates of the 17th-century depopulation presented by Geoffrey Parker (Parker 2013).*

Available at: [https://www.sociostudies.org/almanac/articles/the_demographic_transition/#:~:text=During%20the%2019th%20century,a%20historically%20unprecedented%20population%20increase](https://www.sociostudies.org/almanac/articles/the_demographic_transition/#:~:text=During%20the%2019th%20century,a%20historically%20unprecedented%20population%20increase). Accessed 20 April 2022.

**APPENDIX 3: BRITISH EMIGRATION TO THE UNITED STATES, 1820-1950**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Wales</th>
<th>England</th>
<th>Scotland</th>
<th>Ireland</th>
<th>Not Specified</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1820-1830</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>15,837</td>
<td>3,180</td>
<td>53,338</td>
<td>8,302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1831-1840</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>7,611</td>
<td>2,667</td>
<td>207,381</td>
<td>65,347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1841-1850</td>
<td>1,261</td>
<td>32,092</td>
<td>3,712</td>
<td>780,381</td>
<td>229,979</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1851-1860</td>
<td>6,319</td>
<td>247,125</td>
<td>38,331</td>
<td>914,119</td>
<td>132,199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1861-1870</td>
<td>4,313</td>
<td>222,277</td>
<td>38,769</td>
<td>435,778</td>
<td>314,537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871-1880</td>
<td>6,631</td>
<td>437,706</td>
<td>87,564</td>
<td>436,871</td>
<td>16,142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881-1890</td>
<td>12,640</td>
<td>644,680</td>
<td>149,869</td>
<td>655,482</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891-1900</td>
<td>10,557</td>
<td>216,726</td>
<td>44,188</td>
<td>388,416</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901-1910</td>
<td>17,464</td>
<td>388,017</td>
<td>120,469</td>
<td>339,065</td>
<td>146,181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911-1920</td>
<td>13,107</td>
<td>249,944</td>
<td>78,357</td>
<td>146,181</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921-1930</td>
<td>13,012</td>
<td>157,420</td>
<td>159,781</td>
<td>220,591</td>
<td>13,167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1931-1940</td>
<td>735</td>
<td>21,756</td>
<td>6,887</td>
<td>13,167</td>
<td>26,444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1941-1950</td>
<td>3,209</td>
<td>112,252</td>
<td>16,131</td>
<td>26,444</td>
<td>793,741</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total: 89,603, 2,753,443, 749,905, 4,618,552, 793,741

APPENDIX 4: POPULATION OF THE UNITED STATES BORN IN WALES, 1850-1970

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>No. born in Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1850</td>
<td>29,868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1860</td>
<td>45,763</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1870</td>
<td>74,533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td>83,302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890</td>
<td>100,079</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900</td>
<td>93,586</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>82,488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>67,066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td>60,205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1940</td>
<td>35,360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950</td>
<td>30,060</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>23,469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>17,014</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


APPENDIX 5: WILLIAM OWEN, LETTER TO THE DRYCH 1937.

Will Owen, condemned the aim of the Welsh Nationalists in respect of the Welsh language: ‘A small clique of Welsh-language intelligentsia… constitute the Nationalist party, and they aim to force upon the Welsh people the Welsh language against the people’s wishes. The Welsh people of Wales use the English language in business, in law, in schools and their amusements. They do not want to use Welsh nor do the people (except a minute minority) want Welsh taught to their children in the day schools. For what purpose? I know from experience that a monoglot child has a very unpleasant time among his playmates until he forgets Welsh and learns the universal language of the playgrounds… I can name more than a dozen churches whose usefulness in spreading the gospel were [sic] destroyed by a handful of Welsh-speaking officials who persistently insisted in ignoring the signs of the times to satisfy their own perverted views… the younger generation. How many people read ‘Y Drych’ today in the U.S.A?

The Druid (June 1 1937), in Morgan, S, THE WELSH OF THE UNITED STATES AND PLAID CYMRU 1925-1945, p. 213.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

PRIMARY SOURCES


Davies, D. T, Letter: The majority of the puddlers are Welshmen, (Ohio, October 17, 1868), in Conway, A. Welsh in America: Letters from the Immigrants, ed. by Alan Conway, (University of Minnesota Press, 1961).


SECONDARY SOURCES


Baines, D, Migration in a Mature Economy, Internal and Overseas Migration in England and Wales, 1861-1900, (CUP, 1986).


Jones, W. D, ‘Raising the Wind: Emigrating from Wales to the USA in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries. Annual Public Lecture for 2003 [Online]. Cardiff, Cardiff University, School of Welsh. Available at: [https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/48163/1/RaisingTheWind.pdf](https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/48163/1/RaisingTheWind.pdf). Accessed 20 March 2022.


Rea, R. C, M.A Thesis: *Political Transnationalism and Assimilation: A Case Study of Dominican and Mexican Immigrants* (George Town University, Washington, 2010),


Sanders, V., Wales, the Welsh and the making of America, Wales, (Welsh University Press, 2021).


Thomas, B, The Industrial Revolution and the Atlantic economy: selected essays. (London; Routledge 1993).


