Towards Jerusalem: The Architecture of Pilgrimage

Thesis

How to cite:

For guidance on citations see FAQs.

© 2021 Gili Merin

https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

Version: Version of Record

Link(s) to article on publisher's website:
http://dx.doi.org/doi:10.21954/ou.ro.000146d6

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online’s data policy on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.

oro.open.ac.uk
TOWARDS JERUSALEM: THE ARCHITECTURE OF PILGRIMAGE

City/Architecture PhD by Design Program
Architectural Association School of Architecture
Director of Studies: Dr. Pier Vittorio Aureli | Supervisor: Dr. Maria Shéhérazade Giudici

Candidate: Gili Merin
This dissertation would not have been possible without the continuous and unconditional support and care of my supervisors, Pier Vittorio Aureli and Maria Shéhérazade Giudici. I would like to thank my peers, Brendon Carlin and Enrica Manneli, for their companionship and constant feedback regarding my work, and to the talented Michal Sahar and Tamar Shafrir whose careful edits and design gave form to this final work. To Daniel Tchetchik and Andrew Meredith for their contribution of photographic tools and knowledge and to Beatriz Flora from the AA library who laboured to get a hold of every book I needed for this research. To my fellow-pilgrim, Diana Ibáñez López, who had joined me (both physically and virtually) on many of these journeys, and was a constant source of new sites, books, and ideas. Finally, I would like to acknowledge Zvi Efrat, whose consistent mentorship had shaped my ideas and practice.

This dissertation is dedicated to the quintessential traveller, my mother, Ora Merin.
INTRODUCTION—

Suspended between heaven and earth, Jerusalem is not just a site—but an orientation. Occupying a place in the geographic subconscious of Western culture, its name is evoked in poetry and dedications of cities, its soil covers the floors of chapels, rocks collected from its ground are used as foundation stones for towns, and relics of those who lived and died there are enshrined in the world’s most visited sites. Despite this undeniable influence, the discussion is often not as clear-cut as the conditions that influence its character—namely systems of movement and modes of spirituality—are perpetually in a state of flux. As such, pilgrimage spans fields of scholarship in spirituality, history, topography, and memory in order to explore how themes such as ritual and faith, subjugation and identity, historical geography and landscape. Published and lanscape.

1. Introduction to Pilgrimage in Graeco-Roman and Early Christian Antiquity: Moving the Body, eds. Jan Elsner and Robert Sallnow (Oxford University Press, 2005), 2
7. Victor and Edith Turner define the anti-structure condition in community: “a... total anti-socialized communication, even community, between definite and determinate identities, which arise spontane-ously in all kinds of groups, situations, and circumstances;... the distinction between structures and communities... is that... social and sacred, communitas is an essential and generic human bond.” — Turner and Turner, Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture, 100
10. Ibid

INTRODUCTION—

In the next stage, the pilgrim enters an ambiguous state, a break from ties of kinship and domestic labour. By disengaging from these structures (and replacing one ritual for another), the pilgrim enters a state of anti-structure, becoming a subject driven by a crystallised sense of purpose, intention, and orientation. This places the pilgrim as a stranger in his or her travels, true to the etymological origin of pilgrimage from the Latin progenitus, or foreigner.

During this phase—defined by Victor and Edith Turner as liminal—the pilgrim develops a heightened mode of perception, as he or she becomes susceptible to new concepts and becomes acutely aware of the sensory details of their surroundings. Due to this receptive intensity during the pilgrim’s liminal stage, the thesis places particular emphasis on the envoilings written by pilgrims on their journeys. A neologism of travel and monologue, a travelogue is a form of writing that is between a survey and a diary; it implies being physically on the journey while also claiming a particular agency of personal interpretation and representation. This travelogue is written within a particular timeframe in a pilgrim’s life, what Turner defines as being out of time—beyond or outside the time which measures secular process and routine.” In From Ritual to Theatre (1982), Turner cites Arnold van Gennep’s Rites of Passage (1908) in defining the three phases of separation, transition and incorporation. At the initial stage of separation, the pilgrim is detached from daily life while entering into “a new state or condition.” In the next stage, the transition, the pilgrim enters an ambiguous stage of liminal nature where new social rules and rituals can be assumed. It is during this phase, I argue, that pilgrims document their
within this anthropological framework, who journeyed 150 miles to visit another god, his
a poem tells of the protective god of the city of Ur,
domestic realm into foreign territory, we can
ily between sanctuaries.
thus a key in this thesis and the design project
Travelogues and their topographic reading are
understood as the spatial envelope of pilgrimage,
and monuments, but also of natural landscapes,
and the rituals of those encoun-
tered within them: in a word, the topography
of their journey. This topographic understand-
ing of their journey is crucial for the thesis; it
is understood as the spatial envelope of pilgrimage,
found in the scale between buildings and places.
Travelogues and their topographic reading are
this a key in this thesis for each year, because
they not only except the condition of the pilgrim's journey and places of worship but
also continually rebuild the history of pilgrim-
ages throughout time, in addition to spiritual
and literal appropriation of the land by its traveler.

MEMORY, SCRIPT, AND PLACE

The history of pilgrimage is almost as fickle as the phenomenon itself. Using the criteria
that pilgrimage includes a journey from one's own domestic realm to a foreign land, we
conclude that its earliest possible origins would coincide with the establishment of
sedentary locations of human settlement. In Mesopotamia, a period of more than 6,000
years ago, the Mesopotamians would have maintained such a practice. In fact, it is
believed that a Mesopotamian town of the city of Ur, which journeyed 150 miles to visit
another god, his

Journeying is based on the assumption that pilgrimage is not dissimilar from
the Jewish and Islamic traditions in its ritual-
istic components. However, in stark difference,
Christian pilgrimage is not mandated by their religion:

Christian pilgrimage is not about
visiting a place that is venerated by institution-
ated religion, but "a journey undertaken by
a person in quest of a place or state that he or
she believes will provide a spiritual benefit," thus placing
the emphasis on the pilgrim's personal decision
rather than a theological framework. In this way,
these travelogues are significant for this thesis
in terms of how they travel; spiritual; it fed a religious
curiosity, elevated their piety, and perhaps increased their devotional
spiritual; it fed a religious

Christian pilgrimage is not similar to
the pilgrimage of a Roman emperor, who was
not forced to by theological law; they did
not move as part of a collective celebration
of people of faith, but rather as a single subject
who opts out of their own daily routine in order
to voluntarily enter this liminal stage. Their
topographic reading is thus crucial in light of their
initial expectations and motivations for the jour-
nery.

This personal aspect of Christian pilgrim-
ages stands in stark contrast to a journey cycle,

Christian pilgrimage is not dissimilar from
the Jewish and Islamic traditions in its ritual-
istic components. However, in stark difference,
Christian pilgrimage is not mandated by their religion:

Christian pilgrimage is not about
visiting a place that is venerated by institution-
ated religion, but "a journey undertaken by
a person in quest of a place or state that he or
she believes will provide a spiritual benefit," thus placing
the emphasis on the pilgrim's personal decision
rather than a theological framework. In this way,
these travelogues are significant for this thesis
in terms of how they travel; spiritual; it fed a religious
curiosity, elevated their piety, and perhaps increased their devotional
spiritual; it fed a religious

Christian pilgrimage is not similar to
the pilgrimage of a Roman emperor, who was
not forced to by theological law; they did
not move as part of a collective celebration
of people of faith, but rather as a single subject
who opts out of their own daily routine in order
to voluntarily enter this liminal stage. Their
topographic reading is thus crucial in light of their
initial expectations and motivations for the jour-
nery.

This personal aspect of Christian pilgram-
ages stands in stark contrast to a journey cycle,

Christian pilgrimage is not dissimilar from
the Jewish and Islamic traditions in its ritual-
istic components. However, in stark difference,
Christian pilgrimage is not mandated by their religion:

Christian pilgrimage is not about
visiting a place that is venerated by institution-
ated religion, but "a journey undertaken by
a person in quest of a place or state that he or
she believes will provide a spiritual benefit," thus placing
the emphasis on the pilgrim's personal decision
rather than a theological framework. In this way,
these travelogues are significant for this thesis
in terms of how they travel; spiritual; it fed a religious
curiosity, elevated their piety, and perhaps increased their devotional
spiritual; it fed a religious

Christian pilgrimage is not similar to
the pilgrimage of a Roman emperor, who was
not forced to by theological law; they did
not move as part of a collective celebration
of people of faith, but rather as a single subject
who opts out of their own daily routine in order
to voluntarily enter this liminal stage. Their
topographic reading is thus crucial in light of their
initial expectations and motivations for the jour-
nery.

This personal aspect of Christian pilgrim-
ages stands in stark contrast to a journey cycle,

Christian pilgrimage is not dissimilar from
the Jewish and Islamic traditions in its ritual-
istic components. However, in stark difference,
Christian pilgrimage is not mandated by their religion:

Christian pilgrimage is not about
visiting a place that is venerated by institution-
ated religion, but "a journey undertaken by
a person in quest of a place or state that he or
she believes will provide a spiritual benefit," thus placing
the emphasis on the pilgrim's personal decision
rather than a theological framework. In this way,
these travelogues are significant for this thesis
in terms of how they travel; spiritual; it fed a religious
curiosity, elevated their piety, and perhaps increased their devotional
spiritual; it fed a religious

Christian pilgrimage is not similar to
the pilgrimage of a Roman emperor, who was
not forced to by theological law; they did
not move as part of a collective celebration
of people of faith, but rather as a single subject
who opts out of their own daily routine in order
to voluntarily enter this liminal stage. Their
topographic reading is thus crucial in light of their
initial expectations and motivations for the jour-
nery.

This personal aspect of Christian pilgrim-
ages stands in stark contrast to a journey cycle,

Christian pilgrimage is not dissimilar from
the Jewish and Islamic traditions in its ritual-
istic components. However, in stark difference,
Christian pilgrimage is not mandated by their religion:

Christian pilgrimage is not about
visiting a place that is venerated by institution-
ated religion, but "a journey undertaken by
a person in quest of a place or state that he or
she believes will provide a spiritual benefit," thus placing
the emphasis on the pilgrim's personal decision
rather than a theological framework. In this way,
these travelogues are significant for this thesis
in terms of how they travel; spiritual; it fed a religious
curiosity, elevated their piety, and perhaps increased their devotional
spiritual; it fed a religious

Christian pilgrimage is not similar to
the pilgrimage of a Roman emperor, who was
not forced to by theological law; they did
not move as part of a collective celebration
of people of faith, but rather as a single subject
who opts out of their own daily routine in order
to voluntarily enter this liminal stage. Their
topographic reading is thus crucial in light of their
initial expectations and motivations for the jour-
nery.

This personal aspect of Christian pilgrim-
ages stands in stark contrast to a journey cycle,
However powerful these rituals are in fostering the recollection of memory, Halbwachs argues that in order to assure continuous recollection, Halbwachs argues that to assure unity, “[a] society, first of all, needs to find fixed places.” 2

The monument lies in its relationship to lived time and to beginnings. Antidote to entropy, the dissolving action of existence, a security measure. It is the guarantor of origins, and it effects a link between the past and the present. This is crucial for this thesis, since shrines such as those found in Rome or Compostella, despite their religious significance for Christian memory, are products of cultures of relics and martyrdom several centuries after the canonisation of the Bible, and are therefore excluded (in the context of this research) as sites of scriptural pilgrimage. Thus, this thesis’s focus on Christian pilgrimage but also to understand this phenomenon through a modern lens: that is, their subjugation to the cult of heritage, where the past is being continually exploited for economic and political gain.

IMAGE AND PILGRIMAGE

While script plays a crucial role in the history of Jerusalem pilgrimage, it nevertheless remains subject to the regime of visual perception. Unlike the Jewish or Islamic religions, Christianity (particularly the Roman Latin Church) instrumentalised religious art as the bridge between the visible and the invisible. Catholicism’s reliance on the agency of visual representations has been both its strength and its weakness; it allowed the Church to expand its power amongst the literate crowds of pre-Revolution Europe, while after 1571 it led to recurring attacks and finally to the purge of those images as anathema of idolatrous worship. This thesis studies the use of visual representation in theological art and acknowledges its centrality to the phenomenon of pilgrimage, as it oscillates between the symbolic element that is contingent on interpretation and religious experience and an aesthetic sensibility that relates to invention and localisation in space. This tension will group the unity and continuity. Their visibility and affectivity provide proof that the past is not just a series of ordinary events occurring in nondescript places, but meaningful spots in order to facilitate the transfer of Jerusalem’s typological, structural, and topographical attributes beyond its physical boundaries and onto other Jerusalem in Europe. The chapters which follow focus on the transfer of Jerusalem’s symbolism and topography in order to assure the transfer of Halbwachs’s typological, structural, and topographical attributes beyond its physical boundaries and onto other Jerusalem in Europe. The chapters which follow focus on the transfer of Jerusalem’s symbolism and topography in order to assure the

Halbwachs, on Collective Memory, 196

Halbwachs, 312

Choay, Françoise, The Invention of the Historical Monuments, A Very European Affair

Inb, 241

IMAGE AND PILGRIMAGE

While script plays a crucial role in the history of Jerusalem pilgrimage, it nevertheless remains subject to the regime of visual perception. Unlike the Jewish or Islamic religions, Christianity (particularly the Roman Latin Church) instrumentalised religious art as the bridge between the visible and the invisible. Catholicism’s reliance on the agency of visual representations has been both its strength and its weakness; it allowed the Church to expand its power amongst the literate crowds of pre-Revolution Europe, while after 1571 it led to recurring attacks and finally to the purge of those images as anathema of idolatrous worship. This thesis studies the use of visual representation in theological art and acknowledges its centrality to the phenomenon of pilgrimage, as it oscillates between the symbolic element that is contingent on interpretation and religious experience and an aesthetic sensibility that relates to invention and localisation in space. This tension will group the unity and continuity. Their visibility and affectivity provide proof that the past is not just a series of ordinary events occurring in nondescript places, but meaningful spots in order to facilitate the transfer of Jerusalem’s typological, structural, and topographical attributes beyond its physical boundaries and onto other Jerusalem in Europe. The chapters which follow focus on the transfer of Jerusalem’s symbolism and topography in order to assure the

Halbwachs, on Collective Memory, 196

Halbwachs, 312

Choay, Françoise, The Invention of the Historical Monuments, A Very European Affair

Inb, 241

IMAGE AND PILGRIMAGE

While script plays a crucial role in the history of Jerusalem pilgrimage, it nevertheless remains subject to the regime of visual perception. Unlike the Jewish or Islamic religions, Christianity (particularly the Roman Latin Church) instrumentalised religious art as the bridge between the visible and the invisible. Catholicism’s reliance on the agency of visual representations has been both its strength and its weakness; it allowed the Church to expand its power amongst the literate crowds of pre-Revolution Europe, while after 1571 it led to recurring attacks and finally to the purge of those images as anathema of idolatrous worship. This thesis studies the use of visual representation in theological art and acknowledges its centrality to the phenomenon of pilgrimage, as it oscillates between the symbolic element that is contingent on interpretation and religious experience and an aesthetic sensibility that relates to invention and localisation in space. This tension will group the unity and continuity. Their visibility and affectivity provide proof that the past is not just a series of ordinary events occurring in nondescript places, but meaningful spots in order to facilitate the transfer of Jerusalem’s typological, structural, and topographical attributes beyond its physical boundaries and onto other Jerusalem in Europe. The chapters which follow focus on the transfer of Jerusalem’s symbolism and topography in order to assure the
in sites of Jerusalem pilgrimage, it imagines a new topography that embodies the notion of being "there" rather than simply being "thereby." Jerusalem: documenting the enduring power of the holy city to attract pilgrims not only to its physical entity but also to locations where its identity has been displaced and celebrated as an idea that is larger than the city itself. This travelogue disrupts geographical trajectories and opts, instead, to move from station to station through means of association and imagination. By constructing this travelogue, the photographer becomes a designer of a new spatial entity, a topographical path with a clear orientation that provides an alternative to physical travel through the possibility of analogous journeys.

TOPOGRAPHY AND TOPOGRAPHIES

As a practice of actual movement through space, pilgrimage could not be understood merely as the intermitent fulfilment of the monument, but rather as the continuous sensation of topography. Topography, (literally 'place description') is understood here as the three-dimensional formation of the terrain (including both natural and artificial elements) that articulates the cultural and the natural. Topography is also fundamental to the experience of travel; it is perpetually redefined by the movement and perception of those who cross it; their projections, imaginations, and representations construct its surface and define its contours. As such, the topographical reading of pilgrimage can be understood as the methodological approach of this dissertation: the construction of a new topography of pilgrimage that is pragmatism and a representation of the world, the existence.

By adopting the 'indifferent' attitude of Baltz, Adams, and Shore, the photographs are my attempt to downplay the monumentality of Jerusalem and to break through its spiritual envelope. As a result of four years of fieldwork, these images illustrate the written chapters and compile the design project of this dissertation. Adopting the temporality and liminality of the on-the-road topographers, these photographs encapsulate both a physical terrain and a mental state, where real and imaginary elements construct the sacred topography of my own pilgrimage. Thus, this PhD by-design considers this topographical survey as a project, following the genealogy of architect-historians such as Denise Scott Brown and François Choay who have used photography to observe the built and devise a design methodology through image-making. The resultant images are then both the illustration of the historic component of the dissertation and the photographic travelogue that concludes it. By creating this body of work, this thesis will demonstrate that topography is manipulated not only by designation, enclosure, urbanisation, and agricultural improvement, but also through the carving of religious beliefs. Pilgrimages—myself amongst them— do not simply cross landscapes; they fabricate topographies through peripatetic rituals that redefine the three-dimensional surface of the earth. The pilgrim's journey is thus directed by a topographic perception of architecture, landscapes, and representations, resizing the contained spaces that are delineated by organised structures of power.

The notion of sacred topography is further discussed in Medieval Modern: Art out of Time (2012), where Alexander Nagel asserts that the transposition of Jerusalem's relics (both defined objects and formless earth taken from the city) to Rome generated a fluid territory, where one inhabits a space that is “both grounded and not grounded in real earthly territory.” This geographical detachment from both Jerusalem and Rome creates the possibility of being neither here nor there, an effect he calls "topographical destabilization.” The possibility of bringing Jerusalem to Rome reveals the true character of both cities, and confirms "the deeper philosophical conviction that earthly places are themselves only distributions within the spatial dimension, a dimension, like that of..."
14

Jerusalem has been reproduced in monuments, maps, and visual representations around the world, including both tangible elements such as relics and mnemonic replication of structures. In 2015, Between Jerusalem and Europe was published in honour of Kühnel, continuing the exploration into the appropriation of Jerusalem in specific case studies across Europe. This volume included the work of Robert Ousterhout, whose research paid special attention to the spatial and material of Jerusalem’s holy sites. His conceptualisation of flexible topographies, as well as his visual and theological analysis of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre in Bologna, informed my own approach to the essay on ontologies and Anabel Wharton. A historian of medieval architecture in the West, she edited the essay on the Real and Ideal Jerusalem in Jewish, Christian and Islamic Art (1998) and Visual Constructs of Jerusalem (2014), exploring the way


This thesis is largely devoted to archaeologists, theologians, and artists, the final chapter discusses topics that have been widely studied by historians and political scientists. This rich volume of the rich volume Jerusalem 1900: The Holy City in the Nineteenth Century is written extensively in Hebrew of the Ottoman Land Code in the nineteenth century, but also the mechanisms by which the rhetoric of ‘agrarian improvement’ served the British on the ground, a gradual process of abstraction of land and exclusion of entire populations from their productive territory. The presence of urban and rural transformations has been a major issue in studies of Jerusalem in recent decades. Eyal Weizman’s Hollow Land: Israel’s Architecture of Occupation (2007) demonstrates efforts to achieve this goal.


Daniel Monk’s An Architect’s Eye on Jerusalem: The Landscape of Power (1999) is a rich volume on Jerusalem and the Pro Jerusalem Society, the diaries of Governor Ronald Sterrs and Charles Ashbee, and the plans (both written and drawn) published by Jerusalem and Europe: Essays in Honour of Bliss Kühnel (Leiden: Brill, 2015). This volume in the early 2000s was a response to the conflict between the genuine beliefs of religious subjects and their desire of institutions to exploit these sentiments.

One of the major themes in this thesis is collective memory: the following theory put forth by Halbwarth, while attempting to bring forth a critical reading of the ways in which memory was spatialised. Studying the mobilisation of Jerusalem’s urban space reveals that the heritage project is fraught with artificial constructions, national aspirations, and a selective reading of history that ‘writes out’ the existence of those who are excluded from it. This


Pullen, Wendy, Foshage, Max, et al., (eds), The New City Plan, Preservation and Enclosure: Jerusalem 1900: The Holy City in the Age of Possibilities (London: Weizman/Eldridge/Mosrouw, 1988);


The theology of the city itself is the collective memory of its people, and is often constructed from institutions in order to foster a shared identity within a certain group. Rossi idealises the idea of collective memory as a peaceful agglomeration of cultural and political elements, when collective memory is formed by institutions in order to foster a shared identity within a certain group. Rossi idealises the idea of collective memory as a peaceful agglomeration of cultural and political elements, when collective memory is formed by institutions in order to foster a shared identity within a certain group.

Rossi’s seminal book had an incredible influence on the profession in the following decades: until today, we witness architects who romanticize the possibility of evoking collective memories through their design. Without realising the critical formation of such sentiments, the thesis aims to problematise the notion of ‘collective memory’ by demonstrating that not only political forces but also economic ones, as historic monuments have been valorised to maximise their profitability. In this way, the thesis aims to problematise the notion of ‘collective memory’ by demonstrating that not only political forces but also economic ones, as historic monuments have been valorised to maximise their profitability.

One of the major themes in this thesis is collective memory: the following theory put forth by Halbwarth, while attempting to bring forth a critical reading of the ways in which memory was spatialised. Studying the mobilisation of Jerusalem’s urban space reveals that the heritage project is fraught with artificial constructions, national aspirations, and a selective reading of history that ‘writes out’ the existence of those who are excluded from it. This

INTRODUCTION—TOWARDS JERUSALEM

This thesis will show, therefore, that the city itself is the collective memory of its people, and is often constructed from institutions in order to foster a shared identity within a certain group. Rossi idealises the idea of collective memory as a peaceful agglomeration of cultural and political elements, when collective memory is formed by institutions in order to foster a shared identity within a certain group.

Rossi’s seminal book had an incredible influence on the profession in the following decades: until today, we witness architects who romanticize the possibility of evoking collective memories through their design. Without realising the critical formation of such sentiments, the thesis aims to problematise the notion of ‘collective memory’ by demonstrating that not only political forces but also economic ones, as historic monuments have been valorised to maximise their profitability. In this way, the thesis aims to problematise the notion of ‘collective memory’ by demonstrating that not only political forces but also economic ones, as historic monuments have been valorised to maximise their profitability.

One of the major themes in this thesis is collective memory: the following theory put forth by Halbwarth, while attempting to bring forth a critical reading of the ways in which memory was spatialised. Studying the mobilisation of Jerusalem’s urban space reveals that the heritage project is fraught with artificial constructions, national aspirations, and a selective reading of history that ‘writes out’ the existence of those who are excluded from it. This

This thesis will show, therefore, that the city itself is the collective memory of its people, and is often constructed from institutions in order to foster a shared identity within a certain group. Rossi idealises the idea of collective memory as a peaceful agglomeration of cultural and political elements, when collective memory is formed by institutions in order to foster a shared identity within a certain group.

Rossi’s seminal book had an incredible influence on the profession in the following decades: until today, we witness architects who romanticize the possibility of evoking collective memories through their design. Without realising the critical formation of such sentiments, the thesis aims to problematise the notion of ‘collective memory’ by demonstrating that not only political forces but also economic ones, as historic monuments have been valorised to maximise their profitability. In this way, the thesis aims to problematise the notion of ‘collective memory’ by demonstrating that not only political forces but also economic ones, as historic monuments have been valorised to maximise their profitability.
also generating surplus value. Rossi’s book, written before the rise of UNESCO and the heritage industry, could not have predicted the ultimate commodification of what he described as “certain artefacts [that] become part of [the city’s] memory [...] in this entirely positive sense great ideas flow through the history of the city and give shape to it.” Indeed, these memories within the city have been enclosed, enhanced, and as this thesis will show - have turned into an asset under the cult of heritage which has seen exponential growth in the last three decades. This commodification distorts the phenomenon of spiritual travel and blurs the distinction between a pilgrim and a tourist; this economic aspect of collective memory will be scrutinised in this thesis for exploiting cultural and religious values for the creation and circulation of capital.

Once this legacy of corruption is confronted, the thesis will attempt to reclaim the enchantment initially found in pilgrimage by proposing alternative methods of devotion that could be enacted in flexible topographies through the combination of text, image, memory, and imagination. Using photography as a design tool to create an alternative travelogue, a new type of pilgrimage can emerge where the effect of ‘destabilising topography’ described above could be balanced by the stabilising quality of rituals, and where memory could be reclaimed in a personal, rather than collective, sense. Arguably, the effect of ‘destabilising topography’ described above can only be balanced by the stabilising quality of rituals. In the words of Antoine Saint-Exupery, rituals are “temporal techniques of making oneself at home in the world.” Like things in space, rituals offer structure, sameness, and repetition; they allow one to create distance or even estrangement from themselves. Be they physical or mental, still or peripatetic, speaking or silent, this thesis will thus try to untangle the rituals of pilgrimage from its ties to power in order to reclaim it as an act of liberty, of movement through space and time, progressing toward a destination that may never fully arrive, but nevertheless declares an orientation to life itself.

Chicago Press, 2002); Cosgrove, Denis E., Social Formation and the Symbolic Landscape, (Wisconsin, The University of Wisconsin Press, 1984)

Fig 6: Easter Friday procession at the “New Jerusalem” in Varallo, Italy. Photo by the author, 2019
PILGRIMAGE AND THE CHRISTIAN APPROPRIATION OF JERUSALEM

The earliest traces of human settlements in Jerusalem date to 5000 BC. A Canaanite village perched on the Judean Mountains above the Gibon spring, far from any strategic trade-route, it was populated mostly by graves. By the nineteenth century BC, Jerusalem was a substantial city-state, its name first recorded as “Urusalim”, perhaps after Salam or Shalom (“peace” in Arabic or Hebrew). Over the next centuries, Jerusalem experienced recurring attacks from the New Kingdom of Egypt to the south and Assyria to the north, which encouraged Jerusalemites to build their city as a citadel of steep fortification, terraced housing, and intricate tunnels. However, it was not until King David captured the stronghold in 1000 BC that Jerusalem was established as a capital city. This was also the beginning of the city’s spiritual significance as the centre of the Hebrews, a uniquely monotheistic tribe that had arrived centuries earlier from Mesopotamia.

David’s son, King Solomon, built the First (Jewish) Temple on top of Mount Moriah—believed to be the biblical site where the Hebrew patriarch Abraham nearly sacrificed his only son, Isaac—thus commemorating the site as one of unconditional devotion. Built over seven years, the shrine at the centre of Temple Mount housed “The Holy of the Holies”—the wooden Ark of the Covenant. According to the Book of Exodus of the Hebrew Bible, pilgrimage to the Temple was mandatory for all Jews three times a year, corresponding to the agricultural calendar. This ritual came to a halt in 587 BC when the city was besieged by Nebuchadnezzar, King of Babylon, who executed King Zedekiah, burned down Solomon’s Temple, and exiled the Hebrews. In Babylon, the Israelites formed the Biblical scriptures, solidified the religion, and awaited their redemptive day of return—and indeed, in 516 BC, the Second Temple was inaugurated on the ruins of Solomon’s first. This temple, which was modest in scale and decoration, was entirely remodelled in the first century BC by the half-Jewish, half-Arab Roman King Herod, who executed a megalomaniacal construction project that continues to dominate the topography of the Old City of Jerusalem until today. Over the next century, hundreds of thousands of Jews arrived in Jerusalem to visit the new altar built upon the exposed bedrock of Mount Moriah, in the heart of Herod’s vast man-made plateau.

This fortified city, with its monumental temple, was not only the bastion of Jewish tradition—it was also the city of Christ. Born in Bethlehem, a small village on the outskirts of Jerusalem, and raised in Nazareth, Jesus attended the Passover festivities in Jerusalem every year. After 30 AD, Jesus triumphantly returned to Jerusalem for what were to be his final days; the city’s streets and the Jewish Temple formed the backdrop for the Passion—Christ’s trial, crucifixion, entombment, and resurrection—and thus became inseparable from any Christian ritual of recollection. This heavenly city of both the Jewish Temple and Christ presented a unity between the ideal and the real for close to a century. In 70 AD, after years of siege, the Roman Emperor Titus captured the city and destroyed the temple, demolished houses, and burned most of the city’s trees. In that decisive moment, Holy Jerusalem was dispatched from its earthly corollary, which now lay in ruins and chaos.

For the next several decades, Jerusalem was reduced to a camp of the tenth Roman Legion (legio X Fretensis), and Jews and Nazarenes (a minor Palestinian sect that gradually separated from Judaism) were forbidden to live on its site, under the penalty of death. This urban vacuum gave rise to paganism. In 135 AD, following the defeat of yet another Jewish revolt, Emperor Hadrian changed the city’s name to Aelia Capitolina, after his own last name of Aelius and the Roman god Jupiter Capitolinus. Hadrian’s city was smaller than the one built by the Arab-Jewish King Herod only a century earlier, and held little religious or political significance within the Roman empire. As a pagan emperor, Hadrian obliterated the remains of monotheism in the city by transforming the ruins of the Jewish Temple into the Capitolium by covering the supposed burial place of Christ. While the primary goal of the Jews was to return and rebuild the physical city below, the nascent Christian religion ascribed increasing religious and symbolic significance to the Jerusalem above as the city of an idea.
Contrary to the hopes of Christ's prosecutors, the crucifixion of the charismatic leader from Nazareth did not put an end to his messianic fervour. As his movement spread, his disciples took up the narrative of salvation within a politically troubled region, endearing him among his followers (not to mention the proof of divinity through the many accounts of the resurrection). The movement began to take on a collective life of its own, transcending the capital of the empire—Rome. Mixed Jewish-Gentile communities flourished in urban centres across the Mediterranean; they would gather on Sundays to read scripture (often aloud), initiate new converts into the faith through baptism, and perform the ceremonial breaking of bread. In the apostle's own words, it was a communal offering, giving, Eucharist, or the Eucharist. Reading and the authority of the written word were crucial to the expansion of the Church, allowing a steady flow of information throughout the centuries. Questions of good and evil, life and death, order and chaos, sacred and profane—these fundamental issues were articulated in the letters that were eventually read aloud in Sunday gatherings. Literacy was thus a critical factor in the expansion of the early Church, creating an alternative channel of communication which functioned as an unconfined infrastructure for the spread of Christian theology.

In addition to the prescriptive letters of the apostles (and their successors, the pastoral fathers), the beliefs and teachings in the Old Testament Book of Prophecies, which chronicles the conquests and defeats of the Israelites in Judas, as well as the memories of the God of Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, could now be practised by retracing Christ's own pilgrimage in Jerusalem, which was now used as a symbol in sermons and prayers to facilitate orientation and give a clear orientation. The early Jerusalem was associated with the Jewish enlacement of sacrificial space and geographic specificity—was deemed inferior to the possibility of unbound ritual freedom. Christianity’s relocation into the spiritual realm was strategic: as an illegal cult operating within a pagan Roman empire, separation from land was required for the expansion of the religion. Indeed, early Christianity did not grow through forced territorial conquests, nor by subjecting nations to its control (at least not at first). It was a diffus form of power that spread throughout the Roman Empire. Minor, and thus a call to the Diaspora to submit to an imagined topography, which manifested during prayers as an orientation to the east—towards Jerusalem.

While the Gospel paints a picture of Christ’s entire life in the Galilee, the recollection of collective memories focuses on his last days in Jerusalem, remembering the Eucharist’s sacrificial nature (rather than his life with the disciples or his miracles) would eventually make Jerusalem the principal site for these memories to be localized. The Eucharist has morphed from an allegory of sacrifice into history, and now the present narratives as a literal account of events that happened to Christ as a matter of fact, rather than simply a symbol of real, historical action on earth. According to Halbwachs, when collective memories are projected onto a physical site, it becomes a landmark. While this material specificity eventually became the holy land, St. Paul’s decision to dedicate Constantine’s churches and the transformation of the city into a Christian spiritual centre. Acknowledging that he may be the first of many travelers to the Holy Land, the Apostle Paul can be roughly divided into two parts. The first part follows his journey from the cures publicus, an imperial road system for Roman messengers. During the second part, his journeys were limited to the precise distances between his resting stops, where he would change horses in monasteries or enjoy overnight lodging in monasteries of these texts not only gave instructions to the reader to call them by the same name, but also urged the reader to call them by the same name. The Invention of the Holy Land

1. The Earliest Record of Christian Pilgrimage From Bordeaux

The earliest record of Christian pilgrimage to the Holy Land is an itinerary from Bordeaux in 333 AD. Writing Palestine only two decades after the legalisation of Christianity, he probably had the last opportunity to describe the dedication of Constantine’s churches and the transformation of the city into a Christian spiritual centre. Acknowledging that he may be the first of many travelers to the Holy Land, the Apostle Paul can be roughly divided into two parts. First, his journey through the cures publicus, an imperial road system for Roman messengers. During the second part, his journeys were limited to the precise distances between his resting stops, where he would change horses in monasteries or enjoy overnight lodging in monasteries.
sites, thus creating a useful index for the scrip-
tural enthusiasts of the Roman province. The
Bordeaux travellers’ narrative shared some simi-
larities with the directory, namely the subordi-
nation of a place to text and the mythologisation of Palestine’s geography. However, in contrast to the alphabetical order of the Osmuncius, the novelty of the Itinerarium was its linear character: the pilgrim from Bordeaux lists the sites in order of geographic encounter, thus becoming a useful tool for future travellers.

Once the pilgrim passes Caesarea (the cap-
ital of the Roman Province of Judea) the initial brevity of the Itinerarium gives way to an elaborate guidebook, which uses affective language to con-
jure up scriptural memories in greater detail:

... A mile from there is the place called Sychar, where the Samaritan woman went down to draw water; at the very place where Jacob drew the well, and our lord Jesus Christ spoke with her. Some plane trees are there, planted by Jacob, and there is a baptistery which takes its water from the place where Jacob drew the well, and our lord Jesus Christ spoke with her.

This intricate account, which begins with a pre-
cise distance to direct future pilgrims, interlocks biblical toponymy (Sychar) with the new baptis-
tery erected by the Church to initiate believers into the faith. The references to the tangible natural elements that are infused with theo-
logical meaning. The plane trees he saw were planted by Jacob; a rock he described in a vine-
yard marks the site of Judas’s betrayal of Jesus; a palm tree is the same one “from which children took branches and strewed them in Christ’s path.” Places relating to Christ’s life as a man, however, had yet to be infused with a redemptive narrative, and were therefore omitted from the journey—or from its representation. Capernaum and Nazareth, located only a day’s trip from his route, were ignored. The Itinerarium projected a system of belief that was developed outside the Holy Land and thus was concerned only with the particular events recollected in Western services.

In the Holy City, the Bordeaux Pilgrim bore witness to the invention of Christian Jerusalem. This transformation was achieved through a large-scale construction project launched in the aftermath of the Council of Nicaea in 325 AD, when Constantine summoned the Empire’s bish-
ops (a recorded total of 318 attendees) to discuss the unification of the Christian doctrine and the celebration of Easter. As an emerging institution, Christianity was in need of newly-erected mon-
uments where its members’ recollections could be staged. Following a recommendation from Macarius, the bishop of Jerusalem, Constantine ordered the construction of a series of churches in Palestine to commemorate the events of the Passion, death, and resurrection.

Less than a decade after the Council, these recently established monuments would appear in the Bordeaux Pilgrim’s increasingly elaborate descriptions. He enters Jerusalem from the East Gate and proceeds west along a walled street towards the Temple Mount, thus tracing the path of Jewish pilgrims before 70 AD. He describes the enormous labour that went into its construc-
tion, the architectural remnants of the great vaults “where Solomon used to torture demons”, and the subterranean chambers of Solomon’s former palace where “he was when he wrote of Wisdom.” When he reaches the epicentre of the Temple Mount plateau, where the shrine used to stand, he describes the residues of both Pagan and Jewish presence:

And in the sanctuary itself, where the Temple stood which Solomon built there is marble in front of the altar which has on it the blood of Zacharias—you think it had only been shed today [...] two statues of Hadrian stand there. And, not far from them, a pierced stone which the

While archaeologically inaccurate, the text nev-
ertheless paints a picture of Jerusalem as a city
undergoing ideological and theological transfor-
mation. For the first time since 70 AD, Jews were allowed back into the city thanks to Constantine’s decision from 334. For him, Jewish Jerusalem was no longer a threat; much like the pagan Aelia, it was now part of the past. Indeed, Jeru-
salem was about to be transformed by a series of monuments that would shift the centre of gravity away from the palimpsest of the old Jerusalem on

... A mile from there is the place called Sychar, where the Samaritan woman went down to draw water; at the very place where Jacob drew the well, and our lord Jesus Christ spoke with her. Some plane trees are there, planted by Jacob, and there is a baptistery which takes its water from the place where Jacob drew the well, and our lord Jesus Christ spoke with her.

This intricate account, which begins with a pre-
cise distance to direct future pilgrims, interlocks biblical toponymy (Sychar) with the new baptis-
tery erected by the Church to initiate believers into the faith. The references to the tangible natural elements that are infused with theo-
logical meaning. The plane trees he saw were planted by Jacob; a rock he described in a vine-
yard marks the site of Judas’s betrayal of Jesus; a palm tree is the same one “from which children took branches and strewed them in Christ’s path.” Places relating to Christ’s life as a man, however, had yet to be infused with a redemptive narrative, and were therefore omitted from the journey—or from its representation. Capernaum and Nazareth, located only a day’s trip from his route, were ignored. The Itinerarium projected a system of belief that was developed outside the Holy Land and thus was concerned only with the particular events recollected in Western services.

In the Holy City, the Bordeaux Pilgrim bore witness to the invention of Christian Jerusalem. This transformation was achieved through a large-scale construction project launched in the aftermath of the Council of Nicaea in 325 AD, when Constantine summoned the Empire’s bish-
ops (a recorded total of 318 attendees) to discuss the unification of the Christian doctrine and the celebration of Easter. As an emerging institution, Christianity was in need of newly-erected mon-
uments where its members’ recollections could be staged. Following a recommendation from Macarius, the bishop of Jerusalem, Constantine ordered the construction of a series of churches in Palestine to commemorate the events of the Passion, death, and resurrection.

Less than a decade after the Council, these recently established monuments would appear in the Bordeaux Pilgrim’s increasingly elaborate descriptions. He enters Jerusalem from the East Gate and proceeds west along a walled street towards the Temple Mount, thus tracing the path of Jewish pilgrims before 70 AD. He describes the enormous labour that went into its construc-
tion, the architectural remnants of the great vaults “where Solomon used to torture demons”, and the subterranean chambers of Solomon’s former palace where “he was when he wrote of Wisdom.” When he reaches the epicentre of the Temple Mount plateau, where the shrine used to stand, he describes the residues of both Pagan and Jewish presence:

And in the sanctuary itself, where the Temple stood which Solomon built there is marble in front of the altar which has on it the blood of Zacharias—you think it had only been shed today [...] two statues of Hadrian stand there. And, not far from them, a pierced stone which the

While archaeologically inaccurate, the text nev-
ertheless paints a picture of Jerusalem as a city
undergoing ideological and theological transfor-
mation. For the first time since 70 AD, Jews were allowed back into the city thanks to Constantine’s decision from 334. For him, Jewish Jerusalem was no longer a threat; much like the pagan Aelia, it was now part of the past. Indeed, Jeru-
salem was about to be transformed by a series of monuments that would shift the centre of gravity away from the palimpsest of the old Jerusalem on

... A mile from there is the place called Sychar, where the Samaritan woman went down to draw water; at the very place where Jacob drew the well, and our lord Jesus Christ spoke with her. Some plane trees are there, planted by Jacob, and there is a baptistery which takes its water from the place where Jacob drew the well, and our lord Jesus Christ spoke with her.
as part of an official delegation to survey “the Eastern provinces, cities, and people, with a truly imperial solicitude.” This hybrid of religion and power portrays the gradual absorption of Christianity by the Empire, as well as the empowerment of foreign visitors to dramatically alter the conditions of prayer in Jerusalem. In the following decades, additional sites were erected and around in the Holy City to commemorate a growing number of sites: the Basilica of the Apostles on Mount Zion, the Chapel of St. James (352 AD), the Martyrium of the Baptism on the Mount of Olives (363 AD), an octagonal church on the site of the Ascension, and a church in memory of the Agony (358 AD). But the epiconome of this wide construction project was undoubtedly the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. The Church of the Holy Sepulchre, the most spatially complex and theologically charged site of them all, was created to commemorate Christ’s crucifixion and resurrection, the dogmatic events of the Christian religion. Although these events had an inherently spatial dimension in religious recollection, they were not readily visible as material traces or artifacts in fourth-century Jerusalem; therefore, a site for their localisation may be excelled by this”.

Fig 1: Eusebius’ description of the church on Golgotha (drawing by the author, after John Wilkinson)

The reappearance of Christ’s empty grave from the depths of the earth signalled the dawn of the New Jerusalem from above. While the accuracy of Eusebius’s description is debatable, its political implications for Jerusalem were undeniable: the recovery of Christ’s empty tomb was tangible proof of his resurrection (and would remain unchallenged until the late nineteenth century, as will be explored in chapter four). Jerusalem was destined to become the spiritual capital of the Roman Empire, and funds began to flow into the city from all directions. In a letter to Macarius, bishop of Jerusalem, Constantine delivered precise instructions for the erection of the world’s most beautiful church, and designated infinite amounts of marble, gold, and labour for the completion of the task.

The Boderno Pilgrims visited the Church of the Holy Sepulchre two years after the Council of Nicaea (in two years before the official dedication of the edifice). He describes the church’s multiple localities:

On your left is the hilllock Golgotha where the Lord was crucified, and about a stone’s throw away (from it the vault where they laid his body, and he rose again on the third day. By order of Emperor Constantine there has now been built there a basilica—’I mean a place for the lord’—which has beside it cisterns of remarkable beauty, and beside them a baptistery where children are baptised.

This description of the early phase of the erection of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre conveys the juxtaposition of two historical locations, coupled with liturgical vessels, such as the basilica (in Eusebius’s words, the place that became “the typological blueprint for Christian churches, as will be discussed in the following chapter”) and a baptistery, where new members were initiated into the faith (the Bethania has been eroded over Christ’s tomb). Eusebius’s text describes in great detail: from the north-south axis of Aelia’s cardo, the church’s layout extends towards the Holy Sepulchre, which is composed of three highly ornate, east-facing gates, designed to attract passers-by and welcome a multitude of visitors; next, an inner courtyard, or atrium, large enough to host a great amount of pilgrims; then the Colonnade ‘basilica’ (known later as the Martyrium), where congregations could gather in the central nave of 22 metres long, complete with marble floors and glazed ceiling; further on, an open-air open-air atrium and crypt, designed to accommodate the tomb of Christ, surrounded by twelve columns (after the apontes), and furnished, according to Eusebius, with “gold, silver, and precious stones.” The space around the tomb was initially designed as an open-air courtyard, and remained in this form at the time of the Boderno Pilgrims’ visit; however, it was soon enclosed and covered by a rotunda, and monumentalized by the Church of the Anastasis, to be covered of earth, appeared, immediately, and contrary to all expectation, the venerable and hollowed monument of the Blessed Emperor Constantine, therefore, a site for their localisation may be excelled by this.”

Fig 1: Eusebius’ description of the church on Golgotha (drawing by the author, after John Wilkinson)

The reparation of foreign visitors to dramatically alter the conditions of prayer in Jerusalem. In the following decades, additional sites were erected and around in the Holy City to commemorate a growing number of sites: the Basilica of the Apostles on Mount Zion, the Chapel of St. James (352 AD), the Martyrium of the Baptism on the Mount of Olives (363 AD), an octagonal church on the site of the Ascension, and a church in memory of the Agony (358 AD). But the epiconome of this wide construction project was undoubtedly the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. The Church of the Holy Sepulchre, the most spatially complex and theologically charged site of them all, was created to commemorate Christ’s crucifixion and resurrection, the dogmatic events of the Christian religion. Although these events had an inherently spatial dimension in religious recollection, they were not readily visible as material traces or artifacts in fourth-century Jerusalem; therefore, a site for their localisation may be excelled by this.”

Fig 1: Eusebius’ description of the church on Golgotha (drawing by the author, after John Wilkinson)

The reparation of foreign visitors to dramatically alter the conditions of prayer in Jerusalem. In the following decades, additional sites were erected and around in the Holy City to commemorate a growing number of sites: the Basilica of the Apostles on Mount Zion, the Chapel of St. James (352 AD), the Martyrium of the Baptism on the Mount of Olives (363 AD), an octagonal church on the site of the Ascension, and a church in memory of the Agony (358 AD). But the epiconome of this wide construction project was undoubtedly the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. The Church of the Holy Sepulchre, the most spatially complex and theologically charged site of them all, was created to commemorate Christ’s crucifixion and resurrection, the dogmatic events of the Christian religion. Although these events had an inherently spatial dimension in religious recollection, they were not readily visible as material traces or artifacts in fourth-century Jerusalem; therefore, a site for their localisation may be excelled by this.”

Fig 1: Eusebius’ description of the church on Golgotha (drawing by the author, after John Wilkinson)

The reparation of foreign visitors to dramatically alter the conditions of prayer in Jerusalem. In the following decades, additional sites were erected and around in the Holy City to commemorate a growing number of sites: the Basilica of the Apostles on Mount Zion, the Chapel of St. James (352 AD), the Martyrium of the Baptism on the Mount of Olives (363 AD), an octagonal church on the site of the Ascension, and a church in memory of the Agony (358 AD). But the epiconome of this wide construction project was undoubtedly the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. The Church of the Holy Sepulchre, the most spatially complex and theologically charged site of them all, was created to commemorate Christ’s crucifixion and resurrection, the dogmatic events of the Christian religion. Although these events had an inherently spatial dimension in religious recollection, they were not readily visible as material traces or artifacts in fourth-century Jerusalem; therefore, a site for their localisation may be excelled by this.”

Fig 1: Eusebius’ description of the church on Golgotha (drawing by the author, after John Wilkinson)
received particular knowledge through oral tradition. As Egeria explains, “I asked about it [a holy site] and the holy men replied, ‘Holy Moses was buried here’ [...] our predecessors were pointed this place to us, and now we point it to you. They told us that this tradition came from their predecessors.” With the help of her guides and a Bible in hand, Egeria meanders across Sinai in the following biblical localities:

All the way I kept asking to see the different places mentioned in the Bible, and they were all pointed out to me by the Holy Man [...] some of the places were to the right and others to the left of our route, some a long way off and others close by.

Throughout the text, Egeria’s tone remains some-what conversational and highly descriptive, often echoing lines from scripture. Like the pilgrim from Bordeaux, Egeria’s gaze hardly ever wanders beyond the biblical realm, and her representation omits any topographical details that could not be directly ascribed to scripture. This resulted in a compendium of desert locations that lacked an institutional system of commemoration, a little more than a cluster of generic features in a bar — institutional system of commemoration, a little compendium of desert locations that lacked an omits any topographical details that could not be beyond the biblical realm, and her representation from Bordeaux, Egeria’s gaze hardly ever wanders from the Books of Moses. The manna or the stream from which Moses drew and “large stone”, additional places from the when he had come back from the Mount. And all the way through the valley the holy men were showing us the different places. Right at the end of the valley, where we had spent the night and seen the Burning Bush out of which God spoke to Holy Moses, we saw also the place where Moses was standing before the Bush when God said to him “Unto the fastening of thy shoes: for the place where thou standest is holy ground” [Exodus 3:5, Acts 7:35] they showed us where the calf had been made, where a large stone was set in the ground and still stands [...] they showed us where holy Moses ordered the children of Israel to run “from gate to gate” [Exodus 32:27] when he had come back from the Mount.

This lengthy (and somewhat tedious) account goes on to include, alongside the “Burning Bush” and “large stone”, additional places from the Book of Moses, such as the site of the miracle of the manna or the stream from which Moses drew water for the Israelites to drink [Exodus 16:11]. Finally, Egeria concludes: I know it has been rather a long business writing down all these places one after the other, and it makes far too much to remember. But it may help you, loving sisters, the better to picture what happened in these places when you read the Books of Holy Moses.

This passage reveals Egeria’s candid motivation to write her letters not as a guidebook for future travelers, nor a self-interested memoir, but a visual aid for the imagination of those practicing scriptural recollections in Christian communities far from the holy places. In this passage, Egeria explains that the combination of land and text are crucial for the Christian faith because neither is legible on its own. Egeria’s pilgrimage exemplifies how text and place come together to foster an in situ recollection of Christian memories, similar to what took place in services in her home church. We learn of this ritual from Egeria’s description of her visit to Mount Sinai, where she met with the local presbyter (“a healthy old man [...] in fact just the man for the place”), and wrote:

...when the whole passage had been read out to us from the Book of Moses [on the very spot!] we made the offering in the usual way and received communion. As we were coming out of the church the presbyters of the place gave us ‘blessings’, some fruit which grows on the mountain itself [...] thus the holy men were kind enough to show us everything, and there too we made the offering and prayed very earnestly, and the passages were read from the Book of Kingdoms. Indeed, whenever we arrived anywhere, I myself always wanted the Bible passages read to us.

Egeria’s remark exemplifies her affinity for reading a site’s scriptural affiliation while remaining within the familiar framework of recollection—her “usual way.” Indeed, anthropologist Glenn Bowman argues that Egeria did not invent a Holy Land, but rather inherited one from the memories of her guides and the itineraries of her predecessors. Her mode of worship, much like the sacred topography of Sinai, was imported from the tradition of a religion in exile that maintained its continuity through textual recollection of memories. However, unlike the existing practice in the West of reading a text in successive installments in a single church, Egeria—as an observant to the “Holy Men”—introduced a new logic of dividing the Old Testament into its component verses and reading each one at the place where its narrative events transpired, thus creating a ritual path across the Sinai based on geographical progression rather than scriptural chronology. The seriality and fragmentation of the ritual in the desert, following the Exodus of the Israelites, foreshadowed what Egeria would experience in Jerusalem: the systematic stational character of the holy land’s liturgical structure in detail: the bishop was the father of the church; the presbyters read from the scriptures and preached to the crowd, prayed, and recited psalms; the deacons took part in the prayers but did not preach; and the clerics assisted with baptism. During the services, as each figure carried out their specific role while Egeria sat but a silent observer; her pilgrimage through the desert did not elevate her status in the church hierarchy, and she remained a passive participant in clerical routines, like the majority of Christian laity within the religion’s hierarchical structure.

Egeria’s letters are so exhaustively detailed that they preserve—“like a fly in amber,” according to historian Jonathan Smith—the process of transformation that was then underway. Egeria begins her letters from Jerusalem: “Loving sisters. I am sure it will interest you to know about the daily service they have in the holy places, and I must tell you about them.” She reports, in the third person, every movement, conversation, service, and location of a holy site, giving equal emphasis to important information (such as scriptural quotes or prayers) as to benign details such as a building’s smell, making the experience even more vivid for her audience. With great attention, she lists the elements of the services: poems, sung by the boys’ choir; prayers spoken by the bishop or a presbyter; lessons and preaching, where the Bible was read and taught; and the elaborate dismissal, or mass, when the bishop blessed all participants and sealed the service. Of special interest was the intricate daily service in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre:
All the doors of the Anastasis are opened before cock-crow each day, and the monasteries and parochies (monks and virgins), as they call them here, come in, and also some lay men. All these have a wall-like walk outside at such an early hour. From then until daybreak they join in singing the refrains to the hymns, psalms, and antiphons. There is a prayer between each of the hymns, since there are set times. By day and by night, the days are different [...] As soon as dawn comes, they start the morning hymns, and the bishop with his clergy come and joins them. He goes straight into the cave [of Christ’s burial] and into the tomb. [...] as Egeria describes in the day’s last prayers. [...]

Pel by the liturgy and the embodiment of the day’s last prayers.

Lychencon midday and three o’clock, as Egeria describes in the day’s last prayers. [...]

All members of the community as well as visitors, who invested in the construction and maintenance of the city, followed the streets with landmarks, and ritualised the urban fabric. This new incarnation of Jerusalem was the inevitable outcome of a process sparked by Constantine, whose patronage oriented the mortal geography of the Christian world to a topographical reality, and sustained by his successors, who invested in the construction and maintenance of the city, and ten days later was Pentecost, the feast of the coming of the Holy Spirit.

As Egeria shows, each of these festivities intersected with at least two of the ten holy sites in Jerusalem and its environs. Hence, the annual cycle of rituals was spread across the city, creating a Christian territory of monuments and churches. The celebrations of these sites were ritualised, we can refer to Egeria’s description of the Holy Week, which recalls the Passion of Christ and is thus the most strenuous ritual of the Christian year. The Bishop’s order on regular service is followed by a walk to “the place of the care where the Lord used to teach’ on the Mount of Olives, where Egeria listens to the ‘blessed, and the antiphons suitable to the place and the day, and readings too.’”[117] The group proceeds to the Immemen, “the place from which the Lord ascended into heaven”, where, at five o’clock, “the passeggers, that is, all the faithful anciently, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims themselves. Throughout the various daily, weekly, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims of Jerusalem would follow the bishop of the station, cemetery, procession, and praying aloud beside the temple walls, and basilicas while remaining within the walled perimeter of protection. By appropriating increasing urban territory for Christianity, the built two new shrines of special importance. And the Anastasis of Christ at Golgotha. On Pentecost, the ritual would visit up to eight different locations.[118]

The day continues with identical services at midday and three o’clock, as Egeria describes in similar detail. The Ezechias (or Lycencon) follows at four o’clock with the lighting of the lamps and candles, and finally, just before dusk, the congregation escorts the bishop outside of the Anastasis and to the Golgotha for the day’s last prayers.

This description reveals the intensity of the ritual, the clear hierarchy of the roles of the clergy, and the spatial deployment of the processional movement. Egeria’s letters document the schedule of services not only on a daily cycle, but also throughout the Christian week and year. The framework of processions is designed to evoke the intensity of the ritual, the clear hierarchy of the roles of the clergy, and the spatial deployment of the processional movement. In urban life itself.

When Solomon dedicated his Temple, became the Feast of Dedication (or the Encaenia), and on the Feast of Dedication (or the Dedications) in Jerusalem, was similarly celebrated by Christians across the by now vinocentia[119]. The Christians in Jerusalem would follow the bishop between the ten days after Easter, were the new readings and antiphons suitable to the place and the day, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims themselves. Throughout the various daily, weekly, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims of Jerusalem would follow the bishop of the station, cemetery, procession, and praying aloud beside the temple walls, and basilicas while remaining within the walled perimeter of protection. By appropriating increasing urban territory for Christianity, the built two new shrines of special importance. And the Anastasis of Christ at Golgotha. On Pentecost, the ritual would visit up to eight different locations.[118]

The day continues with identical services at midday and three o’clock, as Egeria describes in similar detail. The Ezechias (or Lycencon) follows at four o’clock with the lighting of the lamps and candles, and finally, just before dusk, the congregation escorts the bishop outside of the Anastasis and to the Golgotha for the day’s last prayers.

This description reveals the intensity of the ritual, the clear hierarchy of the roles of the clergy, and the spatial deployment of the processional movement. In urban life itself.

When Solomon dedicated his Temple, became the Feast of Dedication (or the Encaenia), and on the Feast of Dedication (or the Dedications) in Jerusalem, was similarly celebrated by Christians across the by now vinocentia[119]. The Christians in Jerusalem would follow the bishop between the ten days after Easter, were the new readings and antiphons suitable to the place and the day, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims themselves. Throughout the various daily, weekly, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims of Jerusalem would follow the bishop of the station, cemetery, procession, and praying aloud beside the temple walls, and basilicas while remaining within the walled perimeter of protection. By appropriating increasing urban territory for Christianity, the built two new shrines of special importance. And the Anastasis of Christ at Golgotha. On Pentecost, the ritual would visit up to eight different locations.[118]

The day continues with identical services at midday and three o’clock, as Egeria describes in similar detail. The Ezechias (or Lycencon) follows at four o’clock with the lighting of the lamps and candles, and finally, just before dusk, the congregation escorts the bishop outside of the Anastasis and to the Golgotha for the day’s last prayers.

This description reveals the intensity of the ritual, the clear hierarchy of the roles of the clergy, and the spatial deployment of the processional movement. In urban life itself.

When Solomon dedicated his Temple, became the Feast of Dedication (or the Encaenia), and on the Feast of Dedication (or the Dedications) in Jerusalem, was similarly celebrated by Christians across the by now vinocentia[119]. The Christians in Jerusalem would follow the bishop between the ten days after Easter, were the new readings and antiphons suitable to the place and the day, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims themselves. Throughout the various daily, weekly, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims of Jerusalem would follow the bishop of the station, cemetery, procession, and praying aloud beside the temple walls, and basilicas while remaining within the walled perimeter of protection. By appropriating increasing urban territory for Christianity, the built two new shrines of special importance. And the Anastasis of Christ at Golgotha. On Pentecost, the ritual would visit up to eight different locations.[118]

The day continues with identical services at midday and three o’clock, as Egeria describes in similar detail. The Ezechias (or Lycencon) follows at four o’clock with the lighting of the lamps and candles, and finally, just before dusk, the congregation escorts the bishop outside of the Anastasis and to the Golgotha for the day’s last prayers.

This description reveals the intensity of the ritual, the clear hierarchy of the roles of the clergy, and the spatial deployment of the processional movement. In urban life itself.

When Solomon dedicated his Temple, became the Feast of Dedication (or the Encaenia), and on the Feast of Dedication (or the Dedications) in Jerusalem, was similarly celebrated by Christians across the by now vinocentia[119]. The Christians in Jerusalem would follow the bishop between the ten days after Easter, were the new readings and antiphons suitable to the place and the day, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims themselves. Throughout the various daily, weekly, and yearly celebrations, the citizens and pilgrims of Jerusalem would follow the bishop of the station, cemetery, procession, and praying aloud beside the temple walls, and basilicas while remaining within the walled perimeter of protection. By appropriating increasing urban territory for Christianity, the built two new shrines of special importance. And the Anastasis of Christ at Golgotha. On Pentecost, the ritual would visit up to eight different locations.[118]
walls built with unusually large rocks and special cedar wood. Like Eudocia, Justianin included accommodation in the program of the new complex, with one hospice for the sick and another for “visiting strangers”, that is, pilgrims, in need of lodging. The sites erected in the first hundred years following Constantine’s conversion would shape the development of Christian consciousness until the Islamic conquest in the seventh century. The intervening centuries were a golden age for Jerusalem pilgrims and, by extension, for the church seeking to solidify collective memories. Jerusalem was experienced locally and re-enacted from afar as a sacred topography of natural elements and monuments, where the scriptural climax took place. Notably, the events commemorated in Jerusalem and formalized in the fourth century in the Christian annual cycle do not reflect the scripture in its entirety. Important sites in Nazareth, Mount Tabor, and Galilee, where Christ spent most of his life, are ignored, giving exclusive significance to the sites of Christ’s sacrifice. This process of selection and omission is emblematic of collective memory, which is not strictly obligatory to the past but shaped by the present events and conditions defining the emerging group of believers. As an institutional strategy, Christianity had to preserve and reproduce the memories of Christ’s triumph over death and Constantine’s defeat of Jerusalem’s pagan and Jewish past.  

**“THE BETTER TO PICTURE WHAT HAPPENED IN THESE PLACES”: TIME, SPEECH, AND SUPPRESSION OF PLACE**  

The succinct *Itinerarium Burdigalense* and the ex-biographical letters of Egeria construct a history of Jerusalem’s appropriation into Christianity through the eyes of its visitors. In the first text, an anonymous traveller from Bordeaux transforms the geography of fourth-century Palestine into a sacred Christian topography, thus materializing a religion that once preached against the very notion of territorial rootedness. In the second, a Spanish nun scripted her own “Exodus” across Sinai, with the help of the monks of the desert, and appropriated both the barren landscape and the ex-libris pilgrim laid the framework of collective memories by mapping their locations onto the land, while Egeria coded the ritualization of these locations into a systematic memorialisation of significant Christian events.

We understand these dramatic transformations through the personal writings of two travellers who both exemplify a new subject—the Bordeaux Pilgrim and Egeria. Leaving Jerusalem, Egeria spent three years in the Holy Land—these pilgrims moved as innate foreigners within familiar biblical lands. They were conscious of their intentions, eager to record their journeys, and motivated by spiritual goals. Their travels thus reveal not only the changing status of Jerusalem during the Christian conversion of the Roman Empire, but also the power of travellers to project a reality upon the landscape and alter both the real and imagined city. While this chapter links these two pilgrims through their roles in shaping Christian devotion in the Roman Empire, it must be acknowledged that they had contradictory motivations and wrote for different audiences. The Bordeaux Pilgrim used his text as a spatial path that could be retraced by future pilgrims heading towards Jerusalem. As a Christian traveller, he utilized a familiar literary technique to convince fellow Christians (often addressing his readers in the second-person present tense) that the Holy Land was within their reach. Arguably, his text rearranged the imperial hierarchy by documenting the Holy Land as a tangible territory: by localising Christian memories within a real terrain, he eventually reversed the allegorical process of de-materialisation of the Old and New Testament that Christianity had adopted in exile. Crucially, the *Itinerarium Burdigalense* legitimised and facilitated the physical travel to sacred locations for the purpose of recollecting Christian memories. As Hallowachs observes, the physical examination of symbolic sites reveals the essence of religious phenomena—those stones erected and preserved by crowds and by successive generations of people whose traces one can follow in these very stones. These are not traces of a human or supernatural individual but rather of groups animated by a collective faith. The Bordeaux traveller thus encourages participation in cyclical commemorative works re-enacted on sites and shared with a growing crowd.

Egeria had the opposite aim. By capturing a prescriptive account of Jerusalem’s liturgy to send back to the West, her detailed letters could serve as a guidebook to re-enact Jerusalem’s rituals anywhere, using the chronological system standardised across the empire. By reading the text according to the dates of the year, Egeria’s readers could re-enact her movements in the Holy Land, basing their confidence in her comprehensive personal account confirmed by geographic alignments with scripture. Egeria’s letters facilitated a withdrawal from the geographic specificity of Jerusalem and a focus on vivid imagination of spiritual places. She emphasises time over space, commending the liturgy for fixing texts as temporal events in a daily, monthly, and yearly chronology: “What I admire and value most is that all the hymns and antiphons and readings they have, and all the prayers the bishop says, are always relevant to the day which is being observed and to the place in which they are used.” Thanks to the letters of Egeria, a ritual born in Jerusalem could be replicated in the West with near-identical precision of time and speech. In this process, space was suppressed, giving rise to imagination, meditation, and visualisation as alternatives modes of recollection. This also allowed for new collective memory to conform with more flexibility of localisation and commemoration. As the physical city of Jerusalem grew less amenable to Western visitors in the centuries to come, this relocation of the faith proved valuable. As the next chapter will explore, other Jerusalems proliferated across Medieval Europe, offering pilgrims alternate destinations to the Holy Land—yet these places were still oriented towards Jerusalem, similar literary technique between Egeria and the Bordeaux traveller, combining movement, text and memory.
THE BASILICA AND THE ROTUNDA

THE CONCEPT OF ANALOGY AND THE RISE OF URBAN PILGRIMAGE IN MEDIEVAL EUROPE

The public form of Christian worship in Jerusalem would come to an end in the seventh century. The brief invasion by the Persians in 614 AD and the Islamic conquest of 638 AD destroyed the city’s shrines and left the Christian capital in ruins. As a result, the collective memories that were localised by Constantine and his successors were gradually lost; the rituals that maintained the possibility of recollection were suppressed. It was during those interim centuries between the fall of the city to Islam in the seventh century and its recapture by the Crusades in 1099 AD that Jerusalem’s physical unavailability was negated through the erection of alternatives in Europe. As such, the spiritual vector towards Jerusalem was inverted away from the city itself and toward the bastions of Christianity in the West, taking the shape of physical traces (such as relics, pieces of earth, and containers of specimens) and place-naming European shrines after sites in the Holy Land, which allowed recollection to occur away from the historical markers in the ancient city.

Another form in which Jerusalem was transferred outside its boundaries was through the spatial replication of architectural elements that held a mnemonic association with the Holy City. More specifically, this chapter will focus on the transfer of a spatial logic that was abstracted from Christianity’s most revered sites and transplanted into new locations. This translation will be explored through the concept of analogy in order to understand how an archetype that was born in Jerusalem was appropriated in the West for political, spiritual, and economic gain. These alternative Jerusalems—altars, churches, and landscapes—differed in scale and program, and yet they were all united by their commitment to a certain abstraction of the Holy City that can be understood through analogical thinking, an intelligence that is fundamental for both this chapter and the thesis at large, as it questions notions of territorial specificity in favour of a spatial temporality and flexible geography.

THE CASE AGAINST JERUSALEM PILGRIMAGE

While the idea of pilgrimage to an alternative Jerusalem became prominent in the Middle Ages, it should be understood within the political and theological framework of the fourth century. As the first chapter showed, the public worship that emerged in the urban condition of Jerusalem made Christianity visible and powerful. However, it also distanced the faith from the founding principles of its cult, established two centuries earlier. As described in the previous chapter of this dissertation, Christianity was developed as boundless, universal, and anti-world; the symbolic ownership of Jerusalem’s topography through the processional liturgy seems to contradict these notions, especially those put forth by St Paul. In his letter to the Corinthians, Paul argues that “your body is a temple of the Holy Spirit, who is in you.” His radical idea that God is found within one’s body was as strategic as it was spiritual: it allowed Christians under persecution and in exile to practice religion in solitude through contemplative prayer. It also separated Christianity from the Graeco-Roman traditions of celebratory public rituals, and thus from the sanctity of physical objects or geographical places. Within this theological framework, the journey to a divine site, with the associated physical and mental hardships, could be seen as superfluous to the faith. In the fourth century AD, as Christianity’s memories were being materialised in the Holy Land, some religious leaders voiced their opinion against the rise of Jerusalem pilgrimage. Two prominent figures were St Jerome and Gregory of Nyssa, who wrote letters to refute the rising phenomenon of spiritual travel to the Holy City. While their arguments were essentially theological, their reasoning was no doubt underpinned by political motivations, which are deeply embedded in the powerful vector that is pilgrimage.

St Jerome arrived in Jerusalem in 385 AD. He left Rome, where he was the secretary of Bishop Damasus I, with an entourage of noblewomen who intended to spend the remainder of their days in Palestine.
Due to the exposure to immoral behaviour that one may experience in the fourth-century city, where prostitution, crime, and evil are more prevalent than the spiritual degradation in the city: “if grace is not brought about any greater nearness to God.”

Jerome suggests that the archetype of salvation is the body itself, where it is protected from various forms of exploitation that can occur in liturgical worship. This attitude dominated the monastic movement which was emerging at the time amongst those who rejected the urban and opted for an internalisation of the faith. In that sense, Jerome advocated for a sedentary form of pilgrimage—a journey that would take place within one’s own mind.

Jerome’s contemporary, Gregory of Nyssa, shared a similar attitude towards physical pilgrimage to Jerusalem, but for completely different reasons. His letter 58 explains how he came to the conclusion that a pilgrim’s journey to Jerusalem was not a necessary one, as he claimed: “We who believe in the resurrection of the body believe that the place of our resurrection is in the heavens, not in the earth.”

Gregory’s last sentence is strikingly similar: unlike Jerome, he was not rejecting pilgrimage as such, nor was he preaching against physical journeys to sacred shrines. Claiming that Jerome has no advantage over other regions of the world, Gregory infers that our own places of worship can grant an equal, if not higher, spiritual gain. Gregory does not attempt to argue that Jerusalem’s spiritual ascendency is not granted to all regions—indeed, he reminds us that the body is the throne of men and women that here we will have to tolerate in its full dimensions as evil. As we have seen, Egeria prescribed the way the clergy should live in the third option—an earthly counterpart. But there is also an inherent contradiction between Jerome and Gregory. While one advocates worship through internal prayer and contemplation, the other promotes active participation in public services. This tension between the static and the choreographed is emblematic of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, where the conflict between the opinions of Jerome and Gregory remains spatially embedded.

Among those who dwell there. But as it is, there is no form of uncleanliness that is not brazen among them: fornications, adulteries, thefts, idolatries, drug dealing, murder, fraud, and the like; but I only want to say, and you will never lose your vocation.

Jerome’s letter would not be so influential if they merely reiterated the zeitgeist of the time amongst those who rejected the urban and opted for an internalisation of the faith. In that sense, Jerome advocated for a sedentary form of pilgrimage—a journey that would take place within one’s own mind.

Numerous scholars have noted similarities between the opinions of Jerome and Gregory remains spatially embedded. But there is also an inherent contradiction between Jerome and Gregory. While one advocates worship through internal prayer and contemplation, the other promotes active participation in public services. This tension between the static and the choreographed is emblematic of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, where the conflict between the opinions of Jerome and Gregory remains spatially embedded.

The Basilica and the Rotunda

Chapter Two—Towards Jerusalem

From his monastic cell in Bethlehem, Jerome dedicated himself to writing letters and translating the Old and New Testament to Latin. In his letter 58 from his cell to Bishop Paulinus of Nola from making a pilgrimage to the Holy Land. He claims that spiritual gain and pious behaviour are bound not by a specific territory but by personal belief and experience. Second, he reminds Paulinus that the “true worshippers worship the Father neither at Jerusalem nor on mount Gerizim,” and that access to the courts of heaven is as easy from Britain as from Jerusalem, for “the kingdom of God is within you” [Luke 17:21]. Material things may pass, and when that happens, he warns, so will the places made holy by history’s choice, only those who embody the cross within them shall remain.

But Jerome’s letters would not be so influential if they merely reiterated the zeitgeist of the time amongst those who rejected the urban and opted for an internalisation of the faith. In that sense, Jerome advocated for a sedentary form of pilgrimage—a journey that would take place within one’s own mind.

Jerome’s contemporary, Gregory of Nyssa, shared a similar attitude towards physical pilgrimage to Jerusalem, but for completely different reasons. His letter 58 explains how he came to the conclusion that a pilgrim’s journey to Jerusalem was not a necessary one, as he claimed: “We who believe in the resurrection of the body believe that the place of our resurrection is in the heavens, not in the earth.”

Gregory’s last sentence is strikingly similar: unlike Jerome, he was not rejecting pilgrimage as such, nor was he preaching against physical journeys to sacred shrines. Claiming that Jerome has no advantage over other regions of the world, Gregory infers that our own places of worship can grant an equal, if not higher, spiritual gain. Gregory does not attempt to argue that Jerusalem’s spiritual ascendency is not granted to all regions—indeed, he reminds us that the body is the throne of men and women that here we will have to tolerate in its full dimensions as evil. As we have seen, Egeria prescribed the way the clergy should live in the third option—an earthly counterpart. But there is also an inherent contradiction between Jerome and Gregory. While one advocates worship through internal prayer and contemplation, the other promotes active participation in public services. This tension between the static and the choreographed is emblematic of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, where the conflict between the opinions of Jerome and Gregory remains spatially embedded.

Among those who dwell there. But as it is, there is no form of uncleanliness that is not brazen among them: fornications, adulteries, thefts, idolatries, drug dealing, murder, fraud, and the like; but I only want to say, and you will never lose your vocation.
In order to understand how these two types work together, it is important to trace their typological origins as spatial basins. In that follows, I argue that the coupling of these two spaces—a centrally planned, double-shell structure and a strictly longitudinal basilica—created a composition that could be distilled and applied as an analogical target. It is an abstraction taken from Jerusalem, toward Jerusalem.

In their original form, these basilicas were developed in imperial Rome: the canonical structure measured 33.7 metres in diameter with an interior circular space measured by 2.5 metres, it is widely accepted by archaeologists that the Anastasis was built after the basilica, sometime between 339 and 348 AD.

The basilica was erected by Constantine I in Rome, in the immediate aftermath of his conquest of 312 AD. The single-nave basilica terminated in a semi-circular apse, with a pair of aisles on either side separated by arcades. Measuring 75 by 55 metres, it could hold a congregation of several thousand worshippers and at least two hundred members of the clergy. This strictly longitudinal space proved ideal for the needs of the early church: the procession of the bishop and his presbyters could move through the central nave of the basilica under the protection of the roof, while the aisles and apses could be directed from the apse and across the aisles; and offerings could be given in a line before the altar.

At the other end of the Cologha complex, across the open-air arena, stood the Anastasis Rotunda, whose origin can similarly be traced to pagan architecture. The double-shell, freestanding structure measured 33.7 metres in diameter. Inside, a circular ring of alternating piers and columns supported an arcade that surrounded Christ’s empty tomb. Missionaries from Jerusalem worshiped in the basilica by 2.5 metres, it is widely accepted by archaeologists that the Anastasis was built after the basilica, sometime between 339 and 348 AD.

...
Before the erection of the rotunda, and according to the description of the pilgrim from Bordeaux, Christ's tomb aedicule stood in the center of a semi-circular porticoed courtyard, open to the sky. This setting is reminiscent of the Christian Heroe, erected as early as the second century AD to honour sites of martyrdom. In the third century, these open-air spaces were replaced by monumental martyria, which accommodated both the grave of a martyr and space for memorial services. In Jerusalem, the Anastasis was erected as the grave of the martyr and a place to commemorate and recall the greatest martyrdom of all.

Spatially, the rotunda could accommodate a large congregation surrounding the tomb, while the barrel-vaulted ambulatory provided for circulation. This layout was common in Roman sepulchral architecture of the Third and fourth centuries, meaning that Christian martyr spaces were often indistinguishable from imperial mausolea, and thus inspired by the monumental pagan temples. This similarity, according to Krautheimer, became acceptable due to the negligence of original buildings, which were generally void of religious overtones due to their nature as private memorialis. It is possible, then, that the centrally-planned Anastasis was a mausoleum, a martyrium, and a house for Christ—a place to commemorate a man, God, and king.

The combination of a longitudinal basilica and a centrifugal rotunda expressed two distinct spaces for public and private modes of worship, and could accommodate a service that was mobile and hierarchical. Egeria, who stayed in Jerusalem from 381 to 384 AD, revealed in her letters their spiritual and physical connection to the Holy Land was established by the Crusades and the urbanisation of Europe. The ability to import spatial ideas from Jerusalem—be it the earthly, the heavenly, or a textually-bound ritual. In this transfer of geometrical and superficial similarity, the Anastasis Rotunda—be it the earthly, the heavenly, or a textually-bound ritual. In this transfer of geometrical and superficial similarity, the Anastasis Rotunda.


Fig 1: From left: St. Michael’s Church, Fulda (820 AD); Holy Sepulchre, Northampton (1184 AD); Holy Sepulchre, Fulda (820 AD) and Holy Sepulchre, Cambridge (1184 AD); Assisi Basilica, Bulgaria (1141 AD); Temple Church, London (1185 AD); drawnings by the author, not to scale.

The Martin and the Rotunda

In order to explain this particular kind of analogical thinking, and how it has facilitated the diffusion of Jerusalem, two case studies will be explored below. While essentially different from one another, these structures exemplify both the process of constructing an analogy and the intelligibility of its use. Both of the cases are set in the Twelfth Century, a time when the increased physical connection to the Holy Land was established by the Crusades and the urbanisation of Europe. The ability to import spatial ideas from Jerusalem—be it the earthly, the heavenly, or a textually-bound ritual. In this transfer of geometrical and superficial similarity, the Anastasis Rotunda—be it the earthly, the heavenly, or a textually-bound ritual. In this transfer of geometrical and superficial similarity, the Anastasis Rotunda.

In this transfer of geometrical and superficial similarity, the Anastasis Rotunda—be it the earthly, the heavenly, or a textually-bound ritual. In this transfer of geometrical and superficial similarity, the Anastasis Rotunda.
The most elaborate structure that maintains its analogical coherence is found in the complex of Santo Stefano in Bologna. While the dating of the complex is disputed by some traditions (Fifth Century) and learned archaeologists (Twelfth Century), it seems that the earliest reference to the church as a local Jerusalem dates to 887 AD. Located on the road leading east from Bologna’s old city centre, the complex has both Pagan and Paleo-Christian foundations: a shrine to the Egyptian goddess Isis was in use until the Fourth Century, when it was dedicated to the cult of Christ’s resurrection. In the Fifth Century, when it was converted into a baptistry, the adjacent structure was consecrated as the Vitale and Agnus and Collegiate Cathedral, where the remains of the two Bolognese martyrs (that were discovered in 393 AD) were interred.

The complex as we know it today was reconstructed sometime between 1164 and 1180 AD. Its main feature is the centrally-planned ‘Holy Sepulchre’, an irregular-octagonal structure that is covered by a dome. It is dominated by a large tomb in its center (though on a slight offset) that is encircled by a ring of twelve supports and an ambulatory that is accessed by a portal. While the proportions between the size of the tomb and the structure itself are different, the structure replicates several architectural elements that were discovered from the Anastasis Rotunda in Jerusalem. The octagonal structure is accessed from a porticoed courtyard. Together, these structures (set) that is encircled by a ring of twelve supports and an ambulatory that is accessed by a portal. While the proportions between the size of the tomb and the structure itself are different, the structure replicates several architectural elements that were discovered from the Anastasis Rotunda in Jerusalem. The octagonal structure is accessed from a porticoed courtyard.

Anastasis Rotunda in Jerusalem. The octagonal structure replicates the one between the courtyard and the Anastasis in Jerusalem; it evokes the figure of eight—hence of resurrection and salvation—while alluding to the form of the Anastasis in the city of Jerusalem. Like the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem, Santo Stefano played a role in both the local cult and as a peripatetic worship that is at the sacred sites within the church itself. This means that, according to his tradition, it was the demand for topographical recollection of scriptural events that structured the analogy: a visit to the tomb on Easter Morning required a Sepulchre, and a public procession demanded stations. The chronological discrepancy between the stations and their ritualization in the urban realm can be explained as part of an elaborate invention of an urban tradition that occurred in twelfth century Bologna.

A manuscript from 1180 that chronicles the life of the Petronian Colin Morris, the mobile form of devotion predated the sites, and it is the liturgical norms for physical stations that initiated their localisation in the city. In other words, it was the demand for the establishment of Santo Stefano as a surrogate Jerusalem. Scholars such as Krausheimer, Motzri, and Oosterhout render the manuscript’s claim for a Fifteenth-century structure unreliable, and suggest that the reference to the Jerusalem service of the Church of Santo Stefano as a ‘Jerusalem’ in Bologna the ritual he or she would perform in Jerusalem. An unknown pond supposedly marked the arch above the location of Christ’s arrest.

Similarly to the processions that occurred in twelfth century Bologna, a mechanical discrepancy between the stations and their ritualization in the urban realm can be explained as part of an elaborate invention of an urban tradition that occurred in twelfth century Bologna. A manuscript from 1180 that chronicles the life of the Petronian Colin Morris, the mobile form of devotion predated the sites, and it is the liturgical norms for physical stations that initiated their localisation in the city. In other words, it was the demand for the establishment of Santo Stefano as a surrogate Jerusalem. Scholars such as Krausheimer, Motzri, and Oosterhout render the manuscript’s claim for a Fifteenth-century structure unreliable, and suggest that the reference to the Jerusalem service of the Church of Santo Stefano as a ‘Jerusalem’ in Bologna the ritual he or she would perform in Jerusalem. An unknown pond supposedly marked the arch above the location of Christ’s arrest.

Similarly to the processions that occurred in twelfth century Bologna, a mechanical discrepancy between the stations and their ritualization in the urban realm can be explained as part of an elaborate invention of an urban tradition that occurred in twelfth century Bologna. A manuscript from 1180 that chronicles the life of the Petronian Colin Morris, the mobile form of devotion predated the sites, and it is the liturgical norms for physical stations that initiated their localisation in the city. In other words, it was the demand for the establishment of Santo Stefano as a surrogate Jerusalem. Scholars such as Krausheimer, Motzri, and Oosterhut render the manuscript’s claim for a Fifteenth-century structure unreliable, and suggest that the reference to the Jerusalem service of the Church of Santo Stefano as a ‘Jerusalem’ in Bologna the ritual he or she would perform in Jerusalem. An unknown pond supposedly marked the arch above the location of Christ’s arrest.

Similarly to the processions that occurred in twelfth century Bologna, a mechanical discrepancy between the stations and their ritualization in the urban realm can be explained as part of an elaborate invention of an urban tradition that occurred in twelfth century Bologna. A manuscript from 1180 that chronicles the life of the Petronian Colin Morris, the mobile form of devotion predated the sites, and it is the liturgical norms for physical stations that initiated their localisation in the city. In other words, it was the demand for the establishment of Santo Stefano as a surrogate Jerusalem. Scholars such as Krausheimer, Motzri, and Oosterhut render the manuscript’s claim for a Fifteenth-century structure unreliable, and suggest that the reference to the Jerusalem service of the Church of Santo Stefano as a ‘Jerusalem’ in Bologna the ritual he or she would perform in Jerusalem. An unknown pond supposedly marked the arch above the location of Christ’s arrest.

Similarly to the processions that occurred in twelfth century Bologna, a mechanical discrepancy between the stations and their ritualization in the urban realm can be explained as part of an elaborate invention of an urban tradition that occurred in twelfth century Bologna. A manuscript from 1180 that chronicles the life of the Petronian Colin Morris, the mobile form of devotion predated the sites, and it is the liturgical norms for physical stations that initiated their localisation in the city. In other words, it was the demand for the establishment of Santo Stefano as a surrogate Jerusalem. Scholars such as Krausheimer, Motzri, and Oosterhut render the manuscript’s claim for a Fifteenth-century structure unreliable, and suggest that the reference to the Jerusalem service of the Church of Santo Stefano as a ‘Jerusalem’ in Bologna the ritual he or she would perform in Jerusalem. An unknown pond supposedly marked the arch above the location of Christ’s arrest.
The significance of the Jerusalem site in the medieval sense was an essential part of the process of urban growth and civic identity. The invention of a local stational ritual Jerusalem in Bologna, setting the stage for an already-existing stational ritual Jerusalem in the Medieval Sense: not a replica but a structural analog, distilling Jerusalem's liturgical vessels to implement its form of worship in a European setting. The invention of a collective memory that is tied to Jerusalem as an ideal city was an essential part of the process of fashioning Bologna as a powerful urban entity.

In addition to serving as a landmark for the local community, Santo Stefano could also capitalize on its identity as Jerusalem by attracting pilgrims. During the height of the Middle Ages, pilgrimage to Santo Stefano was an important example of faith, but an institutional practice of repenting sins. In a society ruled by a church, an obsession with the penalties of the afterlife was constantly fed by the delicate balance between sin and punishment. While it preached for an earthly paradise, the Church also provided the possibility for salvation through the remission of sins, given in the form of a religious currency—indulgences—given to a sinner in return for confession, donation, or pilgrimage. Measured in units of time, indulgences were a sort of currency that could be exchanged for a certain number of years deducted from a sinner's time in the fire of purgatory (the temporal place of judgement between heaven and hell). On the scale of indulgences, Jerusalem stood at the highest rank. In that sense, Bologna succeeded in becoming a substitute to Jerusalem: the monks of the Celestial Order that had taken over the complex, published the indulgences provided for those making a pilgrimage to Santo Stefano as similar to those traveling to the city itself. And yet the ultimate remission of sins, the plenary indulgence, was only granted to one act: becoming a Crusader.

LONDON’S TEMPLE: A SOURCE WITH TWO TARGETS

When the Crusaders arrived at Jerusalem in 1099, the city had been under Islamic rule for over 400 years. Islam’s spiritual connection to Jerusalem is prescribed in the Quran, when Muhammad

embarked on a nocturnal journey (Izn) from Mecca to “the further sanctuary” (al-Masjid al-Aqsa). It is there that Muhammad meets Adam, Abraham, Moses, and Jesus, and is promised a seat in heaven. This mythical excursion ties the two cities together: the emerging religion with the origin of monotheistic faith, and Muhammad himself. Followed by the Biblical prophetic under AD the Islamic forces entered Jerusalem, led by Caliph Omar ibn al-Khattab, one of Muhammad’s first converts. Entering the conquered city from the south, Omar promptly and promptly took the title of ‘Solomon’s Temple’, the first Jewish temple which has been destroyed in 587 BC by the King of Babylon, and had since been replaced by the Herod’s project of the Second Temple in 66 AD by the Roman Legions in 70 AD. Notwithstanding this historical discrepancy, what Omar found on the Herodian man-made plateau were ruins, as the site has been left neglected as Christian re-

In Seventh Century Jerusalem, Temple Mount was left physically and symbolically out of the sacred topography of the city. Not only was it an empty place, but it was closely associated with the site—such as the creation of Adam and Abraham’s sacrifice of Isaac—have been relocated and commemorated in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. Jerusalem as the centre of spiritual gravity. When Omar and his men cleared the debris off Temple Mount and set the Qubla to Mecca, they were able to claim themselves as heirs to the City of the Great King:

Jerusalem, the Biography, 245

In addition to the eight Muslim shrines in the churchyard, a street of reliquary chapels was built on the opposite edge of the Atrium. Hence, the claim that they were built in the twelfth century Santo Stefano was indeed inspired by the same tradition, and the core of the church was completed in 1048, it included the Anastasis and the Church of Golgotha.

In the following years, as Bologna would be economically revived, the myth of Jerusalem as the foundation of the city will be crucial. Petronius’s supposed journey to earthly Jerusalem created an explicit connection between the holy city and Bologna. With or without exact measures, Bologna was Jerusalemized and implemented in Bologna, setting the stage for an already-existing national ritual by making it visible and physical. The invention of physical relics and a mythological story served local civic pride by making it true as Jerusalem in the Medieval Sense: not a replica but a structural analog, distilling Jerusalem’s liturgical vessels to implement its form of worship in a European setting. The invention of a collective memory that is tied to Jerusalem as an ideal city was an essential part of the process of fashioning Bologna as a powerful urban entity.

In addition to serving as a landmark for the local community, Santo Stefano could also capitalize on its identity as Jerusalem by attracting pilgrims. During the height of the Middle Ages, pilgrimage to Santo Stefano was an important example of faith, but an institutional practice of repenting sins. In a society ruled by a church, an obsession with the penalties of the afterlife was constantly fed by the delicate balance between sin and punishment. While it preached for an earthly paradise, the Church also provided the possibility for salvation through the remission of sins, given in the form of a religious currency—indulgences—given to a sinner in return for confession, donation, or pilgrimage. Measured in units of time, indulgences were a sort of currency that could be exchanged for a certain number of years deducted from a sinner’s time in the fire of purgatory (the temporal place of judgement between heaven and hell). On the scale of indulgences, Jerusalem stood at the highest rank. In that sense, Bologna succeeded in becoming a substitute to Jerusalem: the monks of the Celestial Order that had taken over the complex, published the indulgences provided for those making a pilgrimage to Santo Stefano as similar to those traveling to the city itself. And yet the ultimate remission of sins, the plenary indulgence, was only granted to one act: becoming a Crusader.

LONDON’S TEMPLE: A SOURCE WITH TWO TARGETS

When the Crusaders arrived at Jerusalem in 1099, the city had been under Islamic rule for over 400 years. Islam’s spiritual connection to Jerusalem is prescribed in the Quran, when Muhammad
conditions have changed in the Eleventh Century. On the one hand, the destruction of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre by the manic Caliph Hakim in 980, the persecution of Christians, and the banning of Easter had stirred the Western acceptance of foreign rule of Jerusalem; at the same time, the strengthening of religious sentiment and the burden of sin have brought pilgrims to earthy Jerusalem (and the quest for indulgences) back to popularity. Encouraged by the speech made by Pope Urban II in 1095 — who showed no reserves in advocating actual possession of the city — the first Crusade was born. Leaving the Pauline image of heavenly Jerusalem behind, the Crusaders headed for the Holy Land with faith and force. When the Crusaders entered Jerusalem, they had to rationalise Christianity’s memories in the city by constructing holy places. When possible, they relied on existing markers that could have remained since the Constantinian project — or even the days of Christ — that could be adopted and appropriated into Christiinity. Thus, when the Crusaders took over the city, it was not only the Holy Sepulchre that had to be reclaimed from Islam but also the Temple Mount. The large Al Aqsa Mosque was renamed the “Temple of Solomon,” and the octagonal Dome of the Rock transformed into the “Temple of the Lord,” attempting to bypass Islamic history and claiming a direct connection to the days of Solomon and the Kingdom of David.

With their new appropriated Temple, the reinstated Church in Jerusalem created a calendar of festivities that reflected their power over the city. An annual service traced a line between the hills of Moriah and Golgotha in the form of a bishop-lead public procession between the Holy Sepulchre and the Templum Domini where a prayer was cited across from the former al Aqsa Mosque. With the new monuments, the celebrations of the liturgical year that was common in the entire Christiindom was extended. On Palm Sunday, for example, palm and olive branches were blessed and distributed to the worshippers on the plateau of the Temple Mount, before they were to lead to the valley of Josaphat where they met another procession bearing the Cross from Bethany, after it was brought there early in the morning from its chapel in Golgotha. The joined procession returned to the Temple Mount through the Golden Gate—which was opened only once per year on this occasion — where they encircled the ‘Temple of Solomon’ (Mosque of al Aqsa) and finally ended with prayers in the Templum Domini.

This theatrical ritual — which was greater in length and geographical scope than any procession that took place in the Fourth Century — included Scriptural references to the Old Testament. Indeed, collective memory adapts itself to the contemporary needs of the group; in twelfth century Jerusalem, it was crucial for the Christian rulers, in their efforts to eliminate Islam’s legitimacy, to establish their direct genealogy from Judaism. As such, the Crusades, saw their war against Islam as analogous to the Israelites’ liberation from Egypt. The Bishop of Jerusalem at the time of the First Crusade, for example, preached to the camp from the Old Testament: “it is our duty to pray, and it is your duty to fight the Amalekites. With Moses [...] you, intrepid fighters, thrust your sword into Amalek. Their evocation of Solomon’s Temple could connect Christ to David (Solomon’s father who was not just a religious leader, but a king of the province of Judea). In that sense, Jerusalem, as the new capital of the Crusaders’ Latin Kingdom, was at once a spiritual centre, a subject of monachy, and a military headquarters.
The Templars arrived in London, one of the West’s most powerful secular centres, in 1128.144 By 1144 they were given a site in Holborn, on a former Roman temple site, which they built into the first church.145 In 1161, the expansion of the Order led the Templars to move to a new location given by King Henry II (1154–1189) on the banks of the Thames, where the building by the future Ludgate and Westminster.146 On the Thames, the Templars had both access to transportation and the prestige of the river exposure.147 This relocation to a new site was an expansion of a precinct that was protected from the city by walls and gates where they built gardens, courtyards and lodging for three groups: the fully-professed knights, the non-professed armours (who were their domestic concerns), and the laicized priests, who were appointed by the knights. At the center of the precinct was the Temple Church: the order’s focal point, it was a place for the celebration of mass, the conducting of business, the royal treasuries, and a source of revenue from pilgrims. Following the idea of analogy, I argue that the Temple Church became a target of a source that had now changed: it did not structurally relate to the relationship between the basilica and rotunda in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, but also to the composition of the two shrines on Temple Mount, the former basilica and the domed-ocotagonal, the ritualisation of these spaces will be explored below as a new analogous Jerusalem came to rise in London, appropriating not only Jerusalem’s spiritual aura, but also its economic power and political charisma. Like in Jerusalem, the Temple Church is composed of two distinct components: A rotunda, also called the “Round”, and a rectangular choir. In the Round, an inner ring of six marble pillars, each consisting of a cluster of four columns, is encircled by a lower vaulted ambulatory. Above the central space, eight arched windows punctuated the thick mass of the drum, which is supported by exterior buttresses. The Round was consecrated in 1185, and only half a century later, with the presence of King Henry III in 1240, a rectangular choir was added to its east.148 Replacing a former aislesless chancel, it was a Hall-church choir bears a structural, compositional, or analogical relationship to the structures in Jerusalem. When Jansen writes that “[any] distant allusions to typologies in Jerusalem can be surmised” and that “the hall-church choir bears no readily comprehensible relationship to structures in Jerusalem,”149 she ignores the function of the two structures and the dynamic relationship between them. In fact, the ritualisation of these spaces by the Templars, priests, and pilgrims are analogous to the ones practiced in Jerusalem. This analogy may not be a visual one (a “superficial” analogy), but its compositional similarities (a “structural” analogy) nevertheless bear a striking resemblance to the structures in Jerusalem.

Much like the Holy Sepulchre complex in Jerusalem and Santo Stefano in Bologna, the Temple Church in London served the liturgical needs of both its local population and of visiting pilgrims. As an institutionalised order, the Templars spent their time away from prayers not only by collecting alms and rent, but also by participating in Chapter meetings.150 These official

---

144 They were said to have vast possessions, both on this side of the sea and beyond. Although they were among the major religious foundations in the Christian world today that does not have some part of its possessions and properties, their wealth was attached to the sea and beyond.
146 Solomon prayer spelt in Whitton, melding Templars.
147 London: The Cities
148 Wilson, Chester, Gothic Wilson, Christopher, Architectura Wharton in A History of the Architectura

---

**Fig 10** Predicament of the New Temple, London, ca. 1210 Drawing by the author, after Simon I. Nicholson

---

**Fig 11** Floor plan of the Temple Church, London. Drawing by the author.
gatherings took place every Sunday, Christmas, Easter, and Pentecost in the Temple Church, and in particular within the Round, where the brothers would sit in a circle against the wall.152 The Round would also serve as the backdrop for another distinctively Templar activity, the infamous initiation ceremonies. These cyclical rituals were divided into two stages: the first would take place in the choir, the relatively public realm, where the novice would be surrounded by his family and friends. Then, only the brothers would escort him in a procession into the Round, where the candidate said his vows of chastity and poverty to God and the Order.153 Hence, there was a clear hierarchical distinction between the basilical space of the choir, where all believers were invited to partake in service, and the Round, where only those accepted into the order could enter during a specific ritual. This is clearly analogous to the relationship in Jerusalem between the Basilica and Rotunda, the spatial manifestation of the community’s hierarchy that is described by Egeria.

The weekly mass was attended not only by the brothers, but also by officials of the crown who were in the precinct to conduct business and, of course, pilgrims. The latter were frequent, as the Pope granted indulgences (the deduction of sixty days in purgatory) for those who visited the church annually.154 Its location between Westminster and St. Paul’s meant that the Temple Church was easily accessible on the pilgrim’s route through the city, and its display of relics from Jerusalem, such as wood from the cross and the blood of Christ, assured its popularity.155 Inside the church, the two distinct focal points—the Round on the west and the altar at the eastern wall of the choir—created an ambivalent hierarchy of space. As such, the Eucharist was performed in the altar, the congregation had to turn its back on the Round. This means that the sequential quality of Jerusalem’s complex—from the propylaea through the basilica, the atrium and finally the Anastasis—did not translate coherently to London, where the entrance was in the southern edge, and those who enter the church are positioned directly between two focal points. This disorienting setting is further enhanced by the fact that the

The fact that the actual Temple of Solomon was gone for over fifteen-hundred years when the Crusades captured its site and the lack of physical traces to supply both “archetypical [and] material models” did not matter to Billings or to the Templars. Connecting the Templars to Solomon and thus to the dynasty of Hebrew Monarch was crucial for the narrative of Christian victory, which finally united the earthly and heavenly Jerusalem. Before the final assault on Jerusalem in 1099, the Duke of Normandy told his soldiers: “Here you see the cause of all our labours. This Jerusalem is the reflection of the heavenly Jerusalem. This city has the form of the city to which we aspire […] this Jerusalem you see, which you face, prefigures and represents the heavenly city.”

This patrimonial and physical possession of united Jerusalem was readily translated into the urban realm of London, where the Templars embedded their metaphor of power in London’s urban fabric, reminding locals and visitors of their privileged position both in the East, as rulers of the Holy City, and in the West, as tightly connected to the monarchy.157 The analogy was constructed by utilising a stylistic framework that resonates with the Southern-England royal and noble patronage of the government, while incorporating a spatial logic that was imported from Jerusalem’s mobile and hierarchical liturgy.158 This transfer was not restricted to a singular monument, a sacred icon or a symbolic element, but as a complex of scriptural and contemporary references that were distinctively urban.

According to Annabel Wharton, this “inscription of an eastern presence into a western urban landscape uncannily corresponded to the Templar’s role in the West’s increasing familiarity with money and its abstraction.”159 Indeed, during the economic expansion of Europe’s cities, the body in charge of transferring capital from the West to the occupation of the East celebrated its victory through the image of the city of Jerusalem. The Temple then appropriated Jerusalem’s raciosity through institutionalized force exploited the city’s political charisma in order to construct a house for their accumulated capital, a monument of their political power, and a vessel for their monastic faith.

**THE INTELLIGENCE OF ANALOGY**

If we return to the definition of analogy by Agamben, we will learn that his reading of Aristotle defines analogy not as an induction nor a deduction, but a transfer of intelligibility from one singular to another singular. Within this framework, understanding Bologna and London as analogous Jerusalem can be seen through the transfer of the specific intelligibility of Jerusalem—from its hierarchical spatial compositions within the church across the services to a city-wide distribution of monuments—into the Western urban realm, where the analogy played a crucial role in the local development of religious power, civic identity, and economy.
The spatial logic discussed in this chapter is not only analogous to specific monuments in urban Europe, but is also embodied in the life of a Christian pilgrim and the tension in the Christian religion at large. The perpetual movement between the centrifugal and the axial is embedded in every stage of the pilgrim’s journey—a directional horizontal movement versus defined points of rest, or a passive participation in a mass congregation versus an inward focus on personal meditation. This configuration also embodies the contradiction in the founding principles of the church—the university of St Paul and his followers, embodied in the egalitarian rotunda, versus the hierarchical structure of power, developed since the second century, expressed in the linear composition of the basilica. In the Renaissance, architects attempted to solve this tension by designing churches that were both centralised and axial, such as the Santissima Annunziata in Florence by Leon Battista Alberti and San Bernardino in Urbino by Francesco di Giorgio. The latter exemplifies the ultimate abstraction of the basilica and rotunda, combining a wide transept with a centralised plan, the dome supported only by four monumental columns. The plan of San Bernardino shows how, with imagination and abstraction, archetypal concepts can be resolved in an innovative design, where universality and hierarchy are not in conflict but coincide in a spatial arrangement that derives meaning from their tension.

Indeed, the intelligence of analogical thinking is not confined to the transfer of spatial relations, but of a sociospatial system of rituals. As such, when this system was abstracted from its origin in Jerusalem into the metropolitan centers of urbanising Europe, it replicated not only a structural composition but a hierarchical system of Christian recollection. This geographical re-distribution of collective memories to analogous Jerusalems provided pilgrims with an easier path to recollection, while subjecting its faculty to multiple bodies of power that exploited its spiritual charisma for political and economic gain. In other words, the intelligence of analogical thinking has been utilised as a form of control over those who seek to locate their memories, who saw this spiritual desire as an opportunity for the transfer (and division) of power from one epicenter to its analogies.

While analogical thinking is not innocent, it should nevertheless be noted for its embedded potential in the field of sacred space. Behind the idea of the analogy we find an incredible imaginative capability that sees the notion of “real” as flexible and adaptable. Considering the violent wars that wage over sacred space, the value of alternative sanctuaries could not be overstated. Rather than searching for a singular site of objective authenticity, analogies allow for a proliferation of subjective truths that relieve the need for territorial specificity. Memories that were initially located in Jerusalem could then travel and multiply, creating temporalities for those seeking affective recollection, so long as the orientation of structures, landscape and rituals remains towards Jerusalem.
CHAPTER THREE

STATION TO STATION

THEATRALITY AND DISCIPLINE OF THE VIA CRUCIS IN THE SACRED MOUNTAIN OF VARALLO

The Stations of the Cross, also called the Via Crucis (Way of the Cross), is one of the most common rituals in the Catholic church. It consists of a sequence of numbered stations that commemorate Christ’s Passion, encompassing the sentencing, crucifixion, and entombment of Jesus. Today, the Stations of the Cross have been standardised and conceptualised both in their appearance and in their ritual protocol. Typically, there are fourteen stations: each one is numbered, marked with a wooden cross, and arranged along a circuit at intervals of a distance relative to the scale of the site. Usually located along the aisles of Catholic churches, in monastic cloisters, or across an urban quarter, the stations must be followed as a single devotional sequence. The movement between stations is a crucial element in the ritualised re-enactment of the Passion: it heightens the recollection of events that occurred in the Holy Land by embodying their spatial dispersion across a broad sacred topography.

The underlying mechanism of the Via Crucis derives from the paradoxic nature of the station as a sign that marks a stop in order to perpetuate movement. These periodic stoppages are instrumental in unravelling the Christological narrative and dividing it into fragments that are easier to grasp as episodes. The re-enactment of the Passion, a violent event full of tragedy and drama, maintains a degree of control by choreographing the narrative as a serial progression of emotions, formulating a mode of spirituality that is inherently theatrical. Theatrical, indeed, as each station must be staged, like a scene, through time, space, and text; theatrical, as the compositional relationship on the plane of interaction (the frame of a picture, the boundaries of a stage, the edge of a bas-relief or the viewing hole of a tableau) is directed towards a captive audience, and it harbours emotional excess that is known from theater.

This theological strategy was mobilised by the Franciscan Order in the late Middle Ages, but by the sixteenth century its legitimacy was being undermined by figures of the Reformation, who saw its embedded theatricality as a risk. This gave rise to a debate around the use of images in religious representation. To explore this dispute around the employment and restriction of theatricality, this chapter will study one of the most radical renditions of the Stations of the Cross—the Sacri Monti (sacred mountains), erected as strongholds of Catholic piety in the Italian Alps during the crucial decades of Protestant reform. Specifically, it will explore the inception, destruction, and reconstruction of the first example of such religious complexes: the Sacro Monte di Varallo (1491), which became a laboratory of artistic experimentation aimed at disciplining religious representations and taming excessive affectivity. Indeed, by the end of the turbulent sixteenth century, Varallo had undergone a radical disciplinary process: its artistic program was recreated under a new visual regime that encapsulated the moral and theological reform of the Catholic church. Devout, decent, and direct, Varallo’s art modelled an abundance of restraint not only in the use of images, but also in its tolerance for imagination, physical movement, and Christian behaviour. Varallo thus became a blueprint for devotional ceremony: the critical purge of theatricality brought to prominence a counter-belief in legibility, which ultimately shaped the coherent Catholic ritual we know today.

ORIGIN OF THE STATIONS OF THE CROSS

While the stations embody collective memories anchored in Jerusalem’s sacred topography, they belong to a ritual of recollection infused with a medieval sense of piety rooted in monastic orders and processional liturgies in the West. In

Fig 1: Easter Friday procession in the Sacro Monte di Varallo. Photo by the author, 2019
Jerusalem, the Stations of the Cross are known today as the Via Dolorosa (Way of Suffering), leading from the Arch of Ecce Homo (where Christ was tried) to Calvary (where Christ was crucified). The first documented pilgrimage through this route took place at the end of the thirteenth century, though a definite route was established only in the fifteenth century. This precedent for this route, written in 1384, was the Virgin Mary’s own pilgrimage between “the sites of her son’s last days in Jerusalem.”

Eventually, the Franciscan-led route did not follow the topographical locations of Christ’s real journey in Jerusalem, but oscillated between places of veneration that were enabled by Jerusalem’s conditions. The itinerary of the Via Crucis was neither geographically nor scripturally accurate, but derived from a geopolitical reality in Mamluk Jerusalem. Indeed, since the fall of Acre, the last Crusader’s stronghold in the Holy Land, in 1291, Christian territoriality had been suppressed in Palestine by the local regime, and the movement of Christian visitors was limited.

Yet even under Islamic rule in Palestine, Christian presence in the Holy Land was not completely eradicated, maintaining its continuity through the work of the Third Order of the Franciscans. The Order’s founder, St. Francis of Assisi, died in 1226. The Franciscan mission in the Holy Land was not a land they sought from the very beginning, but it evolved from the earlier activity of the Third Order. The order’s presence was tied to Jerusalem. The Franciscans were invited to the Holy Land by the Latin patriarchs in 1216 and 1219. They established their first monastery in Jerusalem in 1217, and expanded their presence from there to other sites in the Holy Land, including Nazareth, Capernaum, and Kfar Kana.

By the year 1260, the Franciscans had taken over a significant portion of the Holy Land. This expansion was facilitated by the treaty of Marainas, which granted the Franciscans full control over additional sites in and around the Holy City. The Franciscans also took over another crucial role from the Crusaders (in particular, the Knights Templar), becoming the sole providers of care and instruction for pilgrims in Jerusalem. Exercising the privileges given to them by the Crusaders, the Franciscans replaced the Crusaders’ military expeditions and became the official custodians of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. Over the next two centuries, the Franciscan order would gradually obtain control over additional sites in Jerusalem, including the Haram al Sharif, the Dome of the Rock, and the Temple Mount.

The Franciscans took over another crucial role from the Crusaders (in particular, the Knights Templar), becoming the sole providers of care and instruction for pilgrims in Jerusalem. Exercising the privileges given to them by the Crusaders, the Franciscans replaced the Crusaders’ military expeditions and became the official custodians of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. Over the next two centuries, the Franciscan order would gradually obtain control over additional sites in the Holy Land, including Nazareth, Capernaum, and Kfar Kana.

By the year 1260, the Franciscans had taken over a significant portion of the Holy Land. This expansion was facilitated by the treaty of Marainas, which granted the Franciscans full control over additional sites in and around the Holy City. The Franciscans also took over another crucial role from the Crusaders (in particular, the Knights Templar), becoming the sole providers of care and instruction for pilgrims in Jerusalem. Exercising the privileges given to them by the Crusaders, the Franciscans replaced the Crusaders’ military expeditions and became the official custodians of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. Over the next two centuries, the Franciscan order would gradually obtain control over additional sites in the Holy Land, including Nazareth, Capernaum, and Kfar Kana.
Kempe’s outward reaction to her imaginative visualisation was not only unusual in Jerusalem, but also inappropriate; it reflected a pious activity outside of Christ, an outward expression of truly compassionate devotion that was unthinkable in Jerusalem itself. Indeed, an immersive recollection of Christ’s route to salvation could only arise from the political and geographical constraints of earthly Jerusalem, making it the least plausible place to practise the Stations of the Cross.

The Franciscans to accommodate pilgrimage in Jerusalem mirrored the Order’s laborious activities and ideological tendencies in the West. The projection of the Passion onto Jerusalem’s urban space by the same monastic order in the West, the Franciscans, was portrayed in Passion-related imagery, now focused on scenes of betrayal, flagellation, mockery, the bleeding Crucifix, and the crucified Christ. “In Renaissance images of the Crucifixion, Francis himself made the outward display of pain an integral part of devotion, through his own stigmata in 1228 and the ‘love of the poor and crucified Christ.’”

This radical shift from icon to realism was portrayed in Passion-related imagery, now focused on scenes of betrayal, flagellation, mockery, the bleeding Crucifix, and the crucified Christ—all the events that were later commemorated in Jerusalem’s urban space by the Franciscans. “On Christ’s humanity in order to bridge personal recollection was formulated by the Franciscan Order’s custodian privilege of the Holy Land to Franciscan mentality, in Bethlehem itself. The humble staging of a grandiose event echoed that vision of Veronica.”

The humanist-realist representation of the Passion had a didactic purpose to be a popular vehicle for the imitation of Christ by the laity in the West. This style was widely disseminated after the death of St Francis in 1228, when the Order embarked on a large-scale project to erect permanent buildings decorated with images of the humanised Christ. In dramatic and brutally detailed sequenced compositions, these frame-by-frame representations of the Passion fragmented an event whose violence and cruelty would otherwise be too hard to grasp. These artworks not only addressed the desire for a realistic depiction of the Passion, but also created an epic genre not dissimiliar from the stational devotion in Jerusalem itself, making use of the theatricality introduced by Francis. These artworks not only spurred the pious beholder to emotional reaction, but encouraged an identification with the moral code of Christ: a life of submission, patience, and obedience.

The agency of the visual was promoted by the Franciscans, as the images were not used to show the invisible but to show the invisible. “Middle Ages. One of the earliest examples was installed in Nuremberg in 1490. Leading from the church to St Johannes Cemetery, six bas-reliefs depicted Francis encountering with Veronica were added to stretch out the narrative leading up to the execution. These episodic representations attempted to induce contemplation on Christ’s humanity in order to bridge personal memory of the Christian past according to their contemporary pedagogical needs. The method of recollection was formulated by the Franciscan philosopher Bonaventure (1221–1274), who wrote that the pious should regard the pious: “grant to me who did not merit to be present at these events in the body, that I may ponder them faithfully in my mind and experience them.”

To conjure these mental images, the Franciscans used text as a parallel mode of representation that could produce inter images. Known as meditational guidebooks or devotional tracts, these texts encouraged internal pictorial visualisation with tangable descriptions of places, distances, patterns, and materials, allowing Christians to real way to imitation and recollection. With their realistic specificity, these textual representations became incredibly popular, reflecting both a religious need and a political mission. In Meditations on the Life of Christ, the author instructs, “Turn your eyes away from the consolation of your sadness that you may, as a man before describing Christ’s bruised and beaten flesh: ‘look at him well, as he goes along, bowed down by the Cross and grasping about; feel as much compassion as you can...with your whole mind imagine yourself present.”

Indeed, being present in the scene was a key component of Franciscan piety. Before text became their main channel to induce meditative attention was focused on his pain and suffering, in parallel with a representational shift—from a stoic god who had triumphed death, to a vulnerable human being. “On the contrary, Francis himself made the outward display of pain an integral part of devotion, through his own stigmata in 1228 and the ‘love of the poor and crucified Christ.’”


Picturing the Passion in Late Medieval Italy (Springer, 1988), pp. 12-18.

In the Book of Margery Kempe, ed. Stanford Combs (Baltimore, 1980), 80–73.

Margery Kempe and “Franciscan Spirituality: Reading Images and Texts. They described the visualisation of memories could expand the emotional reaction, but encouraged an identification with the moral code of Christ: a life of submission, patience, and obedience. The agency of the visual was promoted by the Franciscans, as the images were not used to show the invisible but to show the invisible. “Middle Ages. One of the earliest examples was installed in Nuremberg in 1490. Leading from the church to St Johannes Cemetery, six bas-reliefs depicted Francis encountering with Veronica were added to stretch out the narrative leading up to the execution. These episodic representations attempted to induce contemplation on Christ’s humanity in order to bridge personal memory of the Christian past according to their contemporary pedagogical needs. The method of recollection was formulated by the Franciscan philosopher Bonaventure (1221–1274), who wrote that the pious should regard the pious: “grant to me who did not merit to be present at these events in the body, that I may ponder them faithfully in my mind and experience them.”

To conjure these mental images, the Franciscans used text as a parallel mode of representation that could produce inter images. Known as meditational guidebooks or devotional tracts, these texts encouraged internal pictorial visualisation with tangable descriptions of places, distances, patterns, and materials, allowing Christians to real way to imitation and recollection. With their realistic specificity, these textual representations became incredibly popular, reflecting both a religious need and a political mission. In Meditations on the Life of Christ, the author instructs, “Turn your eyes away from the consolation of your sadness that you may, as a man before describing Christ’s bruised and beaten flesh: ‘look at him well, as he goes along, bowed down by the Cross and grasping about; feel as much compassion as you can...with your whole mind imagine yourself present.”

Indeed, being present in the scene was a key component of Franciscan piety. Before text became their main channel to induce meditative attention was focused on his pain and suffering, in parallel with a representational shift—from a stoic god who had triumphed death, to a vulnerable human being. “On the contrary, Francis himself made the outward display of pain an integral part of devotion, through his own stigmata in 1228 and the ‘love of the poor and crucified Christ.’”


Picturing the Passion in Late Medieval Italy (Springer, 1988), pp. 12-18.

In the Book of Margery Kempe, ed. Stanford Combs (Baltimore, 1980), 80–73.

In Jerusalem, he witnessed the 38

Fig 6: The Manger and Crucifix in Greccio, La Sacra di San Michele (1223–1225). In The Book of Margery Kempe, ed. Stanford Combs (Baltimore, 1980), 80–73.

In the Book of Margery Kempe, ed. Stanford Combs (Baltimore, 1980), 80–73.

Fig 5: The Manager di Tredola, Painted Cross ca. 1240–50 A.D. Pisa, L. Martinelli.

This humble staging of a grandiose event echoed the humility of not only the Franciscan Order, but also the ‘real’ scene that occurred, according to Franciscan mentality, in Bethlehem itself. “The psanepo thus rid the sacred scenery of its formerly stiff, petrified, and lifeless character, and brought it to life, ushering a new era of realism. With its humanist overtones of humanity, forgiveness, and kindness, this new realism embodied the Franciscan mentality that culminated, one century later, with Ciotto’s Italian painting.”

The humanist-realist representation of the Passion had a didactic purpose to be a popular vehicle for the imitation of Christ by the laity in their own surroundings. This style was widely disseminated after the death of St Francis in 1228, when the Order embarked on a large-scale project to erect permanent buildings decorated with images of the humanised Christ. In dramatically and brutally detailed sequenced compositions, these frame-by-frame representations of the Passion fragmented an event whose violence and cruelty would otherwise be too hard to grasp. These artworks not only addressed the desire for a realistic depiction of the Passion, but also created an epic genre not dissimiliar from the stational devotion in Jerusalem itself, making use of the theatricality introduced by Francis. These artworks not only spurred the pious beholder to emotional reaction, but encouraged an identification with the moral code of Christ: a life of submission, patience, and obedience. The agency of the visual was promoted by the Franciscans, as the images were not used to show the invisible but to show the invisible. “Middle Ages. One of the earliest examples was installed in Nuremberg in 1490. Leading from the church to St Johannes Cemetery, six bas-reliefs depicted Francis encountering with Veronica were added to stretch out the narrative leading up to the execution. These episodic representations attempted to induce contemplation on Christ’s humanity in order to bridge personal memory of the Christian past according to their contemporary pedagogical needs. The method of recollection was formulated by the Franciscan philosopher Bonaventure (1221–1274), who wrote that the pious should regard the pious: “grant to me who did not merit to be present at these events in the body, that I may ponder them faithfully in my mind and experience them.”

To conjure these mental images, the Franciscans used text as a parallel mode of representation that could produce inter images. Known as meditational guidebooks or devotional tracts, these texts encouraged internal pictorial visualisation with tangable descriptions of places, distances, patterns, and materials, allowing Christians to real way to imitation and recollection. With their realistic specificity, these textual representations became incredibly popular, reflecting both a religious need and a political mission. In Meditations on the Life of Christ, the author instructs, “Turn your eyes away from the consolation of your sadness that you may, as a man before describing Christ’s bruised and beaten flesh: ‘look at him well, as he goes along, bowed down by the Cross and grasping about; feel as much compassion as you can...with your whole mind imagine yourself present.”

Indeed, being present in the scene was a key component of Franciscan piety. Before text became their main channel to induce meditative attention was focused on his pain and suffering, in parallel with a representational shift—from a stoic god who had triumphed death, to a vulnerable human being. “On the contrary, Francis himself made the outward display of pain an integral part of devotion, through his own stigmata in 1228 and the ‘love of the poor and crucified Christ.’”


Picturing the Passion in Late Medieval Italy (Springer, 1988), pp. 12-18.

In the Book of Margery Kempe, ed. Stanford Combs (Baltimore, 1980), 80–73.
loomed at the end of the fifteenth century was the growing power of Eastern Orthodox Christi anity—fostered by the fall of Constantinople to the Ottoman Turks in 1453—that was increasing ly pushing the Franciscans out of their shrines and putting into question their papally-awarded Custodia Terra Sanctae.

When Caimi returned to Italy, he embarked on a project to provide a local alternative to Jerusalem pilgrimage. Obtaining financial aid and papal permission, Caimi began the construction of a spiritual complex atop an uninhabited hillside by the Sesia river, whose topography resembled that of Jerusalem—at least in his eyes. Within this imaginary landscape, he erected three chapels and renamed some elements of the terrain: the Holy Sepulchre on the hill of “Mount Calvary,” Nazareth by “Mount Tabor,” and Bethlehem below “Mount Zion.” Caimi declared that the spatial configuration of the chapels, the topographical features to be identical to those of Jerusalem, would permit visitors to encounter such episodes in a linear fashion and in an attempt to resolve this spatial complexity and perhaps to bring the site even closer to the Custodia Terrae Sanctae, Franciscan guides were made available to lead visitors between the chapels. Unlike Jerusalem’s hurried tours, in Varallo the guides allowed and encouraged contemplation of each event of the Passion in its corresponding location, resulting in a combination of physical and mental imagination that was never possible through meditation guidebooks, and certain in his Jerusalem itself.

In 1507, the ambassador to the king of France, Gerolamo Morone, visited the Sacro Monte at Varallo. He recorded his moving visit in an emotional letter to his friend, the poet Lancino Curcio: “Because of the difficulties and dangers endured by the pilgrims who visit Mount Calvary in Jerusalem, the Franciscans have built in Varallo a copy... The events of the Gospels are represented on the chapel's floor, merging the site's landscape and the devout to generate a mental image; in that sense, it was not much different from Jerusalem itself, requiring much imaginative labour from the believer. Considering the site's audience—the semi-literate lay people and the unlettered clergy of vernacular origins—Caimi’s analogical Holy Land was not enough. Hence, to reach a popular audience, the order’s verbal sermons had to be translated into tangible representations using hyper-real art. This resulted in a project that would become what Rudolf Wittkower called “one of the most extraordinary enterprises in the history of Catholic devotion and religious art.”

The site’s artistic program owes its form to the Valencian artist Caudenzius Ferrari. Born in 1476, he arrived in Varallo in 1513 as an accomplished artisan, a painter, philosopher and mathematician. Ferrari’s project in Varallo sought to expand Caimi’s miniature Holy Land into a staging of Christ’s life and death by transforming each of the existing chapels (plus some twenty more) into a biblical tableau vivant using architecture, sculpture, relief, and paintings. With life-size terra-cotta figures, perspectival illusionism, natural light, and the site’s topographic conditions, Ferrari created mini-theatres that made Christ’s Passion an immediate reality. By 1514, close to thirty chapels were built in this manner, transforming the religious complex from a toponymic constellation of markers to an elaborate facsimile of the life of Christ.

In order to address the site’s audience, Ferrari’s polychrome figures were dressed in clothes made from real fabric, their heads covered with wigs, beards made from horsehair, and their eyes made of glass pebbles. Other artifacts and accessories, such as chairs, ropes, buckets, and beds, were incorporated with the painted and sculpted. Finally, sand, soil, and earth covered the chapel’s floor, merging the site’s landscape with scenic murals, and the Holy Land with Varallo. The use of vernacular imagery—regional clothes, landscapes, and even facial features—mediated the distant and foreign through the familiar and homely. The use of utilitarian objects in religious art merged the sacred with the everyday, giving a real form to the unseen, thus aligning Varallo with the Franciscan mission of giving Christ’s humanity a palpable immediate.

Over the next three decades, the site grew exponentially, both in scale and detail, into what Wittkower described as “an enterprise rarely matched in its successful appeal to popular imagina tion.” It was popular, for its intention was to deliver a clear, intense, and emotional message; popular for its childlike simplicity and immediacy; popular for staging spirituality with extreme


![Fig 8: Chapel of the Holy Sepulchre (s. 6th) by Gaetanina Ferrari, with a photo showcasing the original tomb in Jerusalem. Photo by the author, 2019](Image: Studies in the Idea and Renaissance of the Sacro Monte di Varallo: Anthropology and Latin America 1450-1650, New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1991), 116


Ferrari’s unidealised art was not invented in Varallo; it encapsulated a religious sentiment that stemmed from twelfth- and thirteenth-century monastic spirituality, conceived in St Francis’s nativity in Crecchio. In fact, affective life-size representations had been readily used in the sculptural works of Italian artists such as Guido Mazzoni and Niccolò dell’Arca, who created compositions of life-sized polychrome figures before Ferrari brought them to Varallo. Born in Modena around 1450, Guido Mazzoni spent fifty years working as an artist, goldsmith, and sculptor, creating ultra-realistic votive tableaux for various clients. Featuring extreme facial expressions created by a hyperactive display of dynamic movement and intense emotions of excitement, devastation, and pain. His mother collapses into the arms of Christ with a sponge soaked in vinegar; and St John gazes at the crosses. In addition to these canonical figures, Ferrari composed sub-narratives with criminals, witnesses, weeping children, wild horses, and dancing angels. This constellation of Franciscan-themed, para-scrip- tural occurrences echoes the fragmentation of the Passion as it was expanded in the mind, through meditation guidebooks, and physically, at new locations and markers in Jerusalem’s city space in the centuries to come.

Indeed, since the stigmatisation of St Francis himself, readers and beholders were encouraged to become not just spectators but actual actors through identification. Empathy was crucial: the power of the observer to project herself into the object of contemplation in order to fully understand it. In the chapel of the nativity, for example, a pilgrim could take part in the events that happened in Bethlehem. Located down the hill from Varallo’s Calvary, the complex of nativity chapels was completed in 1528 by Caudenzo Ferrari. Upon entry, the pilgrim encounters the Procession of the Magi to Christ’s birth: a densely populated space filled with life-sized sculptures, surrounded by floor-to-ceiling scenographic murals, scriptural characters, and their accompanying crowd. The first magus holds a golden box in his hand, dressed in a gold tunic with blue boots; his ter-
ra-cotta face, framed by long hair, is painted black to represent his African origin, following literally the tradition of the Magi from the continents of the world. Behind him another ‘black’ figure looks upward towards a sculpted horse emerging from the wall in relief, adding a sense of movement frozen in time. The second magus holds a gift for Christ the child, wearing a blue tunic and a red cape. He looks towards the ‘sky’, carefully placed skylight sheds a ray down onto the chapel, presumably representing the star that directs their way, in this case into the next room, where Mary and Joseph cradle their newborn.

At night, guided only by the Franciscans and candles, Varallo’s pilgrims would join the procession. Passing between the characters and paintings, they would pass through a small door from the chapel into the Nativity Grotto. Their performative involvement activated the scene; standing between the two spaces at the doorway, they were witnesses to the moment of Christ’s birth, caught between the Magi, Mary, and Joseph. Ferrari’s greatest creation was the chapel of Calvary, completed in 1520 on the site of the original chapel built by Caimi. Located at the top of the complex, it is a single monumental room, built as a continuous surface from walls to ceiling, painted with an immersive scenography of panoramic murals. In the centre, three wooden sculptures (today the only wooden sculptures in the site) emerge from an artificial elevated bedrock, surrounding the motionless bleeding Christ who bow his head, around him, ninety figures (some sculpted, some painted) contrast his static gesture with a hyperactive display of dynamic movement and intense emotions of excitement, devastation, and pain. His mother collapses into the arms of her companions, her arms outstretched with despair; Roman soldiers play a game over Christ’s garments; a grotesque tormentor reaches out to

Fig 9: The Procession of the Magi, the Bethlehem Complex (1515) by Gaudenzio Ferrari. Free by the author, 2019.

Fig 10: Christ on the Cross, Calvary Chapel (detail above) Gaudenzio Ferrari (1510), 1510-1520.
The participatory theatricality in the chapels of the Nativity and Calvary demonstrates an absolute reliance on the spectator in order to complete the artwork. This condition was criticized, half a millennium later, by Michael Fried in his seminal essay “Art and Objecthood” (1967). Fried rejected the tenets of minimalist art, where the condition of theatricality mandates participation from the beholder. He criticized the condition in which the space that surrounds an artwork becomes integral to the piece itself—when objects, light, and bodies become equal components—meaning that an artwork can only be complete when a spectator is present. Instead, he claimed that the distinction between art and life should be reinstated, and an artwork should be complete in itself. For him, a condition of “stage presence,” where there was no distinction between art and life, was aggressive and obtrusive, requiring “special complicity that the work extorts from the beholder”; in fact, he claims that “art degenerates as it approaches the life-world.”

Michael Fried’s discussion of theatricality had no intentional connection to Varallo’s chapel. In this respect, theatricality should not be mistaken for minimalist art. Rather, it is a concept that can be traced back to the work of Giovanni Battista della Porta, who in his De Fuguo (1558) and Ad Fugum (1570) described the relationship between the beholder and the artwork as an active participation. The concept of “theatricality” as a condition that is not confined to the artwork but is extended to the beholder’s experience of the space was later developed by the critic Michael Fried in his seminal essay “Art and Objecthood” (1967).

Fried’s emphasis on the role of the spectator in completing the artwork highlights the importance of participation in the experience of art. This is a concept that was particularly relevant in the context of Varallo’s chapels, where the visitors were actively involved in the performance of the scene. The chapel of Calvary, for example, was designed in such a way that the visitors were encouraged to participate in the drama, acting out emotions and reactions to the events depicted.

The participation of the visitor in the performance of the scene was not only a matter of aesthetic expression but also a religious practice. The visitors were encouraged to internalize Christian dogma through profound religious experiences. In this respect, the concept of “theatricality” as a condition that extends beyond the artwork itself is particularly relevant. It implies that the experience of art is not confined to the artwork but is extended to the beholder’s experience of the space. This is a concept that was later developed by the critic Michael Fried in his seminal essay “Art and Objecthood” (1967).
that Gospel illuminations are "the book of the unlearned", a set of instructions had to be devised for both image-makers and the clergy. Indeed, artists were to illustrate the merits of Christian doctrine in a manner that would present the possibility of confusion and distraction. This set of guidelines was legislated in the Council of the Catholic Church in Trent between 1545 and 1563, held in response to the Protestant Reform.

Alongside the clarification of the role of the clergy, the celebration of mass, and its attitudes towards sin, justification, and salvation, the Council also issued a decree about the use of images. Considering the uncontrollable expansion of representational themes and subjects, the decree sought to discipline the multiplicity of meaning created by those images. In other words, the Council sought not only to limit the number of images portrayed but to propose a framework for consultations, ordering the stational route. Alessi’s project thus led to the site’s revival, following an elaborately rearranged program to adjust, restrain, and discipline its theatricality by reinstating theological precision.

REFORMING VARALLO: SHIELDS AND FIXED ITINERARIES

Vulnerable to a Protestant invasion from the north and largely affiliated with Catholic Milan, Varallo stood at the forefront of the Counter-Reformation. It attracted the attention of a pivotal figure in the Counter-Reformation, the former cardinal and Archbishop of Milan, Carlo Borromeo. Borromeo was immensely popular amongst pilgrims, but also distracted their minds away from the solitary contemplation and emotional clarity they needed for spiritual ascension, compassion, and recollection. However, in the second half of the sixteenth century, Varallo would retain the centre-stage with a project of reconstruction that proposed new arrangements: restricting the gaze into the chapels and controlling the alms given by pilgrims to the site. Alessi’s project thus targeted for such reforms. Its numerous figures, emotional exaggeration, and plethora of symbols and unknown background characters constituted only the content of the chapels in which they themselves confusingly arranged and attended in a disorderly fashion. This not only caused confusion amongst pilgrims, but also distracted their minds from the solitary contemplation and emotional clarity they needed for spiritual ascent, compassion, and recollection. However, in the second half of the sixteenth century, Varallo would retain the centre-stage with a project of reconstruction that led to the site’s revival, following an elaborately rearranged program to adjust, restrain, and discipline its theatricality by reinstating theological precision.

In the mid-1560s, Giacomo d’Adda, a wealthy Milanese related to Varallo by marriage, became the administrator of the Sacro Monte. His appointment followed a period of turmoil: in 1554, an argument raged in the town between the Franciscans (affiliated with the founder of the site) and the local fabricieri, a civic elite who controlled the alms given by pilgrims to the site. Some franciscan reformers had attempted to implement these ideas in Varallo: from his first visit to the site in 1578 to his last in 1584, shortly before his death, the site was transformed into a systematic vehicle for pious devotion.

In 1563, Pope Pius IV issued a set of guidelines to the clergy to implement these ideas in Varallo: from his first visit to the site in 1578 to his last in 1584, shortly before his death, the site was transformed into a systematic vehicle for pious devotion. In 1563, Pope Pius IV issued a set of guidelines to the clergy to implement these ideas in Varallo: from his first visit to the site in 1578 to his last in 1584, shortly before his death, the site was transformed into a systematic vehicle for pious devotion.
The Transfiguration Chapel is but one example of Alessi’s revision of the site’s legibility. With the grille partitions, Alessi created a design to discipline the gaze in the site’s elder and future chapels, presenting each tableau as a representation—not an embodiment—of the divine. To assure complete clarity, Alessi inserted a device within a device, a viewing aperture in the Vetriate. Its particular width and placement created a condition for solitary devotion, withdrawing the pilgrim from risky engagement with a group of emotional fellow-travellers. Isolation, after Trent, was crucial; pilgrimage was to return to its eremitic origins, distanced from society in self-imposed exile, undertaking spiritual exercises in private through meditation and contemplation. The pilgrim would also be protected from what Trent referred to as confusing theological messages, preventing “dangerous errors to the uneducated” by directing the gaze to particular elements of the elaborate scene. Through careful placement, the viewing holes literally framed hand gestures, extreme facial expressions, and personal encounters that were familiar to the viewer from sermons. This not only made the lesson entirely legible to the viewer, but it portrayed nothing more nor less than the ‘prototypes’ prescribed in Trent.

It is important to remember that while Varallo’s stational ritual was constructed as a sequence of lessons and Christian rites to be followed physically, the route to personal salvation was contingent on an interior journey. After Trent, remission of sins and justification through action was crucial, and Alessi’s Vetriate should be viewed in the context of this religious climate. Like prayer itself, the confession of sin was spatially ordered in Milan in the 1560s through the church confessional, a device with two separate compartments for the kneeling confessor and the seated Father. Between them, a small window was fitted with a perforated metal grille, enabling the exchange of words but not gazes, preventing seduction by eliminating visual and physical contact. Not dissimilar from Alessi’s Vetriate, the confessional was widely introduced in order to regulate sensorial interactions; it fixed a spatial composition as a precondition for pious activity. An examination of a detail from Alessi’s Libro shows a pilgrim kneeling before a tableau, grasping his hands, lifting his gaze, and praying in stillness. According to scholars, it is not by chance that Alessi chose to demonstrate this device in the Chapel of the Temptation of Christ, alluding to the curiosities posed by images. Thus, Alessi’s penitential viewing device not only tamed but also channelled the viewer’s devotion. By likening the still tableau to a flesh-and-blood bishop, Alessi bestowed the terra-cotta figures with the authority of remission. This was not far from the truth: in 1587, Pope Sixtus V declared the Sacro Monte di Varallo a “religious [monument] of extraordinary antiquity” (religios antiquitatis monumenta insignis), and promised that a visit to each chapel within this complex would award the pilgrim with an indulgence of 100 days, an amount matched only by Jerusalem itself.

The second major revision proposed by Alessi was to give a sense of order to the physical movement of the pilgrim through the site. At a time when the church was trying to impose order and restriction on religious spaces by standardising the reception of images and their behavioural consequences, Varallo could not afford a lack of clarity. While each chapel represented a scriptural episode and an affective response, it was essentially a singular station that was part of a larger constellation in the devotional process. This process, given the site’s topographical conditions, had to be staged as a clear roadmap to salvation.

When Alessi arrived at Varallo, the neglected Franciscan complex was in disorder, suspended between its own geography and Jerusalem’s sacred topography; its spiritual narrative was only legible with the help of a local guide who was familiar with both Varallo’s mysteries and its prototype in the Holy Land. But Varallo was not Jerusalem, nor an urban entity at all: it was an isolated religious complex unaffected by the political, social, and economic constraints of a real city. Alessi, who was employed by the librerici rather than the Franciscan Order, could alter the site’s original layout in accordance with Trinidad concerns. Like the Vetriate, this new system had a twofold reasoning: to prescribe a fixed itinerary for the body (hence, of the mind), and to stage sufficient clarity to enable a solitary, unguided ritual.

As described earlier in this chapter, Caimi’s Varallo was constructed as a series of detached chapels, whose location supposedly corresponded to a hallowed site in the Holy Land. Visitors to Varallo who had never visited Jerusalem, and had
only encountered such events in the scriptures, must have been confused, wrote Alessi. In the preface of the Libro, he noted:

"Because of that, the first founders placed the chapels with little order so that what often happens is that visitors to the mysteries find first that which they should find later, which seems to me to be a huge defect of great importance."

This “huge defect” in the order of the mysteries would harm the affective progression expected from the site’s visitors. Varallo’s winding paths, haphazard placement of chapels, and overgrown greenery had to be completely rethought. Unlike his surgical intervention in the chapels themselves, here Alessi proposed to destroy the existing paths and create a clearly marked route across the site. This path would follow Christ’s life, disregarding the impossibility of any proximity between these places and the real Holy Land. For example, he proposed that the Annunciation (in Nazareth) and the Nativity (in Bethlehem) should be juxtaposed, thus following a narrative structure as opposed to a geographic one (as the cities are distant from each other in reality). While chapels were removed or remodelled, hills were flattened and trees planted; the original topography was removed or remodelled, hills were flattened and trees planted; the original topography was

To assure clarity and negate even further the pilgrim’s need for a local guide, Alessi numbered the chapels with a clear order, and used greenery, terraces, and paved paths to connect the entrance of each chapel both visually and physically to the next. Nearby chapels that were out of order were obstructed from view through the clever placement of hedges, stairs, terraces, arches, and walkways.

The complete sequencing of Varallo’s stations served the site’s role as an elaborate lesson on the importance of sin and justification. Though never completed, the pilgrim’s route was to end in the complex of stations representing the afterlife, with the chapels of Universal Judgment, Limbo, Purgatory, and Hell. The mirror image to the site’s conclusion in hell is its beginning in Heaven, or the Garden of Eden, where Adam and Eve are caught in their sinful temptation. Placed by the site’s porta principale in the new Varallo, the chapel framed the entire journey of the pilgrim through the site in the shadow of original sin. Kneeling in
front of the Vetrate’s opening, the pilgrim’s gaze was directed (albeit with a peripheral upheaval of exotic and domesticated wildlife) towards the fatal moment of humanity’s lustful appetite, a reminder of the need for personal redemption. From there, a path to salvation was activated not only for the pilgrim but for all mankind. Hence, a ‘correct’ passage through Varallo’s devotional stations would award the visitor with not only a reminder of the need for personal redemption. The reorganisation of Varallo reflected a desire to control the body and mind of the pilgrim by delimiting what their eyes could apprehend, and simultaneously to isolate them from the greater mass of spiritual movement, away from the experience of collective devotion. Notwithstanding the stylistic continuity of the tableaux, the transformation from Ferrari to Alessi pointed to a shift, as described by Annabel Wharton, “from experiential to dogmatic space.” In the process of systematisation, Varallo became a blueprint for stational devotion to Christ’s Passion—from an analogous Franciscan site, meant to emulate a distant experience, to a hyper-localised device of devotional piety; from a communal activity to a solitary one; from an interactive, dramatic, and theatrical performance of the body to a distant experience, to a hyper-localised device of devotional piety; from a communal activity to a solitary one; from an interactive, dramatic, and theatrical performance of the body to a disconnected, contained, and stationary meditation of the mind; from the proliferation of meanings and memories to a clear, unconfusing recollection; from an imitation of a pilgrim’s journey through urban complexity to a legible, prescribed, self-guided itinerary; from monastic spirituality to Catholic theology; from open-ended imagination to worship of archetypes; from spontaneous uncontrolled emotion to a steady progression of psychological affection. Thus, through Alessi’s removal of the spectacle from the represented, meditation was unburdened of all distractions and distilled the ritual itself from representation. This stripping of excess distractions initiated a process of systematisation that concluded with the stational ritual being reduced to mere units and the Via Crucis becoming impoverished of its initial intensity.

**CHAPTER THREE—TOWARDS JERUSALEM**

**STATION AS UNIT, RITUAL AS ALGORITHM:**

As shown in the case of Varallo, the angst incited by the Protestant Reformation impelled the Catholic Church to revise its position on artistic representations. The Sacred Mountains offered a comprehensive prototype—a controlled, affective environment embedded in a natural landscape—that could be replicated (with local variations) in a series of nine Sacri Monti, which acted as Catholic bastions in the Italian Alps. Addressing at once the risk from home and away, it kept the theatrical excesses of pilgrimage in check, while neutralising the threat of Protestant infiltration with Catholic compassion.  

The network of Sacred Mountains built over the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries lay sprawled, like a line of defence, along the Swiss border. Each was composed as a sequence of chapels (whose typology varied from site to site) that featured, behind a viewing partition, episodes from the lives of the saints, represented with polychrome terra-cotta figures and scenographic frescoes. The first Sacro Monte to succeed Varallo was built in Orta in 1591. It consisted of twenty-three chapels laid out by a member of the Franciscan order on the hilly landscape above Lago di Orta. Inside the chapels, local artists and craftsmen created figurative scenes from the life of St Francis; compared to the tableaux at Varallo, their works were less coherent, at times pairing sculptures with unrelated painted backdrops. Sacro Monte di Crea, where construction began in 1589, included twenty-three chapels illustrating the mysteries of the Rosary. Refurbished in the nineteenth century, its terra-cotta figures were replaced with plaster sculptures, also set against scenographic murals.

Among the Sacri Monti, the culmination of the developing stational order can be found in Varese. This design was initiated by Federico Borromeo, Carlo Borromeo’s nephew and successor as archbishop of Milan, and a similarly committed supporter of the Sacri Monti. Works begun in 1604 by the local architect Giuseppe Bernasconi, who designed fourteen monumental chapels, each a variation on the typology of a porticoed temple. By 1623, the chapels were complete, featuring scenes from the Mysteries of the Rosary with hyper-realistic figures and elaborate paintings, created by over a dozen painters and sculptors, which could be viewed through grille partitions on the chapel’s exterior. The placement in the site no longer reflects any desire for spatial similarity to Jerusalem or topographic mnemonics; the chapels were placed at regular intervals along a two-kilometre path that ascended the mountain to the cathedral at the top. Attention was given to the path’s width, for the easy passage of processions; the occasional chapel is turned ninety-degrees, almost as a side-note to movement itself. To add rhythm, triumphal arches subdivided the ascension further into three groups: joy, grief, and glory.

---

**Fig 19:** Sacro Monte di Crea. Photo by the author, 2019

**Fig 20:** Sacro Monte di Varese. Photo by the author, 2019

**Fig 21:** Sacri Monti: from a toponymic composition to a linear order. Drawings by the author.

Varallo (top left) Crea (top right) Orta (bottom left) Varese (bottom right)
Arguably, the Sacro Monte in Varese presents a crystallisation of the Stations of the Cross: the path as primary element and the chapels as mere progressive stoppages. In Varese, traces of Jerusalem or the urban as such were no longer necessary; the representation grew further from the represented, as detached from the archetype as they were removed from the viewer. Any possibility of theological conflation or disordered memories was removed; urban complexity disappeared in favour of linearity and legibility—no more nor less than the canonical fourteen stations.

Not long after the completion of Varese, the systematic order of the stations was imported back to the Holy City: penetrating through the intricate patchwork of space negotiated between the city’s diverse ethnic and religious communities, a path was finally carved, numbered, and ritualised by the Franciscans, who continue to control the Via Dolorosa today. Unlike the Sacri Monti, these stations are bereft of any distinct representation, displaying only a Roman numeral on the wall for those confirming the path as primary element and the chapels as mere progressive stoppages. In Varese, traces of Jerusalem or the urban as such were no longer necessary; the representation grew further from the represented, as detached from the archetype as they were removed from the viewer. Any possibility of theological conflation or disordered memories was removed; urban complexity disappeared in favour of linearity and legibility—no more nor less than the canonical fourteen stations.

Not long after the completion of Varese, the systematic order of the stations was imported back to the Holy City: penetrating through the intricate patchwork of space negotiated between the city’s diverse ethnic and religious communities, a path was finally carved, numbered, and ritualised by the Franciscans, who continue to control the Via Dolorosa today. Unlike the Sacri Monti, these stations are bereft of any distinct representation, displaying only a Roman numeral on the wall for those confirming the sequence. Despite the complexity of the urban route, Jerusalem’s numerous pilgrims undertake the journey in complete devotion. Drawing on their ingrained Western tropes of linearity and devotion, they are able to complete the route in a single trajectory, even without a guide, ignoring the realities of the contemporary city. In that sense, Giovanni Cale’s 1616 illustration prefigures the design approach of a 2021 tourist map: the city and its inhabitants disappear, leaving only markers, stoppages, or stations, which set the rhythm for an ordered, codified, and regimented spiritual movement. Indeed, the steady process of reciprocal influences from the fourteenth to the seventeenth century resulted in the popularisation of the Stations of the Cross.

The canonisation of the stations at the dawn of modernity can be ascribed to the rise of a condition known as Technic. Technic is “the spirit of absolute instrumentality, according to which everything is merely a means to an end”, writes Federico Campagna in Technic and Magic (2018). While a complete outline of Campagna’s argument is beyond the scope of this thesis, some of its notions can be applied to highlight what is at stake in this chapter and, to some extent, in the next. According to Campagna, the world, and our existential experience within it, derive from a system (or ‘reality-system’) of Technic, which is contrasted to that of Magic. The internal structure of Technic, which constitutes the anatomical components of our world, includes absolute language, measure, and unit. Campagna cites French philosopher Gilbert Simondon, who distilled his analysis of technology into an original theory of individuation, when “a thing […] is in a continuous process of actualisation of its original, overflowing potential. As the process of individuation unfolds, we witness the procession of a long series of ‘individuals’, each defined by the specific limits of its interaction with what constitutes its surroundings at that particular stage.”

Considering this interpretation, we can read the rationalisation of the stations as the first signs of Technic: a new order in which the station is but a component in an algorithm condition that sees the Via Crucis as a syntactic composition. In this new order, the mystery and miracles of the medieval church—its claims to magical powers—were eradicated through an empirical understanding of religious agency. Christ’s Passion had been abstracted into units, formalised as stations. In this process, it lost its autonomy, moving from a theatrical representation of emotions—trauma, arrogance, grief, pain, sympathy, anger, hate, and love—to a reduced chapter in Trent’s archetypal narratives and fixed affective cues. The algorithm of this plot is dictated by the Catholic pedagogy and its synthesis of the Passion as the logical outcome of all past events. Confusion and curiosity, once harbingers of imaginative labour, were eradicated to prioritize a confessional contemplative introspection, replacing theatricality with control and discipline, heralding a new era of intellectual inquiry where Technic triumphs.
THE INNOCENTS ABROAD

VALORISING MONUMENTS, COMMODOFING PILGRIMAGE

Jerusalem has always benefited from its image. Located at a distance from transportation routes (both over land and sea) and with little natural resources to extract, the city had to capitalise on its symbolic value for economic survival. However, this condition arrived at a point of excess in the nineteenth century, when the influx of visitors had completely destabilised the city in terms of its civic space. This long century, from Napoleon’s invasion of Egypt in 1798 to the British occupation of Jerusalem in 1917, was the period when Christian travel to Jerusalem reached its peak. Several factors—the decline of the Ottoman Empire, a series of local and foreign reforms, and technological advancements—allowed the West to reconquer the Holy Land through different means: tourism. During this era Jerusalem was transformed by the arrival of new types of pilgrims: surveyors and tourists.

The former appropriated the subjectivity of a spiritual wanderer into that of a mission-driven military man. Steeped in religious curiosity and equipped with modern tools, the surveyors did not perform religious rituals per se, but they were occupied with authenticating the Scriptures by studying the sacred topography of the Holy Land. Thanks to the Ottoman Land Code of 1858, the possibility of ownership allowed explorers to shift their investigation from the surface of the terrain to its depth, where evidence of Christian heritage could be recovered.

The exponential growth of archaeological sites changed the landscape of Jerusalem. Under the guise of spirituality, a Christian narrative was memorialised in a series of historic monuments that were ritualised, naturalised, and commodified by a mass movement of tourists—privileged travellers hoping to locate (and, to a certain extent, to project) a particular memory in and on the land. The ritualisation of Jerusalem’s city space by tourists perpetuated the process of valorisation (enhancement or expansion), defined as increasing the value of a certain resource in order to generate surplus. The heritage project in Jerusalem proved instrumental in the valorisation of its monuments: over the twentieth century, the British mandate would entirely reshape the city by simplifying its past for the sake of familiarity, legibility, and profitability.

Jerusalem in Transformation

In the years leading to the 1830s, Jerusalem was home to a population of about 9,000 residents, mainly shopkeepers and craftsmen who lived within a walled enclosed city. At the time, Jerusalem was a spiritual home to the three Abrahamic religions, and pilgrimage was just another of the city’s industries. Things began to change in 1831 when the Egyptian ruler Muhammad Ali revolted against Constantinople and occupied the region of Syria, which included Palestine. This event began a process of loosening the region’s physical and intangible borders by showcasing religious tolerance towards non-Muslims and even non-Ottoman subjects: pilgrim tolls were abolished, shrines of all denominations could be erected, and a freedom of religious practice meant that Christians and Jews were now equal, if not privileged, citizens.

In an attempt to gain support from the West, Ali permitted diplomatic institutions to be founded in Jerusalem: the first was the British consulate in 1838, followed by the consulates of Prussia (1842), France (1843), Sardinia (1843), America (1844), and Austria-Hungary (1849). Religious organisations were likewise welcome: the Latin Patriarchate was revived in 1843 for the first time since the Crusades, the Anglo-Episcopal See was established in 1841, and the Protestant Church inaugurated its first ‘cathedral’ in 1849, thus Declaring itself an equal to the prominent Orthodox and Catholic communities in Jerusalem.

Despite his efforts to win the endorsement of the West, Ali was ultimately disarmed by the peasant revolts that erupted in Palestine, which resulted in raids, destruction, and famine. He retreated from the region in 1840, but his encouragement of ‘soft’ Western imperialism could not be reversed. European powers now had a territorial footprint in the Holy Land (a territory whose boundaries were much clearer to Westerners than to the local population) in the form of diplomatic relations and official religious institutions, allowing them to mobilise their power for its official survey. Holy Land exploration was not a new phenomenon: in 333 AD, the pilgrim from Bordeaux recorded his encounter with Biblical Palestine in great detail, and the Dominican Felix Fabri wrote a descriptive travelogue in 1483 that
that they downplayed the subjective element of uniqueness within the sphere of pilgrim diaries is new property regime, which allowed Western powers to advance not only political agendas, but also economic aspirations.

In pre-reform Palestine, agriculture engaged both urban dwellers and village farmers in the production and exchange of grain, fruit, and oil. Land was divided into numerous categories whose intricacy is beyond the scope of this paper; however, it is crucial to understand that before the 1858 Land Code, the concept of private properties whose existence was unknown in Palestine: the majority of the population (about 80%) inhabited and cultivated land that was owned by the Empire (Miri) to whom they would pay tax (in kind or cash) through intermediary collectors, often the local elites. Miri land accounted for about 50% of agricultural land in the Empire, giving cultivators a durable right of use yet no possession over the land itself. In other words, a tree planted was owned by the cultivator, but the land itself belonged to the Sultan. Furthermore, the customary right to cultivate Miri land was contingent on continuous production: if left unattended for three years, the land would revert back to the state. Other types of land that are relevant for this discussion include the freehold Ma'tali, which often consisted of urban plots for dwelling, and Waqf or Islamic trust, which was untaxable land dedicated to services for the Muslim community (such as mosques, education, roads, and resting places for travellers). In many villages, the distribution of productive land was based on Musha tenure, where cultivators shared collective rights over land. In this self-governing model, parcels of land were redistributed amongst the village Hamulas (extended families) every five years. As all production was taxed by collectors (who were themselves pressured by the Empire), this system meant that the risks posed by the uncertainty of agricultural life would be pooled, thus preventing the impoverishment of individual farmers. However, in terms of surplus, it also meant that there was little incentive for individual farmers to improve the land by fertilising the soil or planting trees.

Since the Land Code sought to dramatically improve the Empire's revenue, the reform targeted two factors: the amount of land that was being cultivated and the incentive of each cultivator to increase production. The former was increased by awarding land-by-subscription to those cultivating 'dead' land; the latter was bolstered by allowing tenured farmers on Abri land to assume private ownership (giving the cultivator a full right of possession and heritable rights), in contrast to the collective Musha system. Peasant ownership of land through title deeds had two benefits for the empire: it forced cultivators to register their land and thus to subject it to regular taxation, and it allowed individual accumulation by encouraging improvement of a territory that was no longer shared. This shift from use-rights to private ownership re-ordered the land by employing the rhetoric of progress, improvement, and modernisation; in the process, it abolished existing notions of collectivity in favour of speculative investment targeted at increasing the value of soil. This commodification of land into an immovable asset was the manifestation of the state’s attempt to spatialise its power under the Tanzimat reforms by ordering, regulating, and classifying economic and social activities.

Though it was not successful on all fronts, the reform effectively liberalised the land market in Palestine. The abstraction of territory through mapping and registration reshaped the land according to a regime of enclosure and exclusion. Under the new legal conditions, land could be freely alienated and sold without discrimination—even to foreigners. Though the Christian Church had held ecclesiastical properties in Palestine since Byzantine times, only after the reform was it allowed to expand, develop, and enclose its own missionary institutions, educational facilities, hospitals and hospices. These included the German deaconess Hospital, the Anglican hospital, the Notre Dame Hospice and the Italian hospital, as well as St Joseph nursing school. On a larger scale, the monumental Russian compound was built on a hill across from the Old City under the name “Nova Yerusalam”, with an investment of about 250,000 pounds sterling from the Russian government. These ventures were to...
provide pilgrims with a home in the holy city, as well as subsidies in the form of food, lodging, and medical aid, while allowing foreign powers to expand their control on the ground. Beyond the accommodation of pilgrims, the mechanisms by which land was privatized, alienated and sold led to its radical transformation in the decades to come by allowing Western exploration on the surface of the land—and into its depths.

**ACT I: THE EXPLORER-SURVEYOR**

The quintessential pilgrim-explorer of Biblical Palestine was Edward Robinson. Born in 1794 in Connecticut, Robinson studied law, mathematics, and Greek, spending his early career translating the New Testament into English and publishing Hebrew-English lexicons of the Old Testament. In 1838, a year after being appointed as the first Bible, he discarded centuries of histories, a sentiment nonetheless revealing of the paternalistic approach to the territory and the ease with which he discarded centuries of histories, a sentiment of Western superiority that would be repeated by future travellers-cum-colonisers.

While Robinson expanded the field of vision by questioning existing traditions, he was still confined to the idiom of land-and-book research, where one was to be read in light of the other. That is to say, his mission was to identify and authenticate sites mentioned in the Scripture, not to conduct a general topographic or archaeological study of a given area. When encountering an ancient Christian inscription along one of his routes, for example, he did not bother to interpret the text as the site was not on his biblical checklist; when he passed by what would later be recognised as the remains of the ancient walls of Jericho, Robinson dismissed the site as a mount of “rubbish” due to its distance from known sites. This mode of specific inquiry changed in the 1860s when European powers began to send a different kind of explorer—not the learned scholars of the Bible, but surveying military men. In that sense, it is perhaps unsurprising that the first survey was framed not by religious intentions but by a prototypical colonial motivation: improvement.

Jerusalem’s recurring breakouts of cholera and dysentery were to be solved by a donation from an English noblewoman who was eager to rebuild the city’s water system. In 1864, she provided £500 to the Royal Engineers to conduct an accurate study of the city. Led by Captain Charles Wilson, this was the first Western mission to be sent by a government body rather than merely inspired by personal curiosity and interests. This time, skilled surveyors utilised modern equipment to map the city at a 1:2,500 scale, including the city walls and gates, layout of streets, and locations of important buildings and public facilities. The resulting “Ordnance Survey of Jerusalem” was the first accurate map of the city, and proved invaluable to the Empire in its eventual expansion to Palestine.

While the improvement plan for Jerusalem’s water supply was never realised, Wilson’s survey precipitated the foundation of the largest enter-

![Fig 4: Left: Robinson’s Arch (arch of the Jerusalem bridge that linked Moria to Zion, discovered in 1838 and still called by the same name today), projecting from the remaining walls of Temple Mount. Fig 5: Right: Restoration of Robinson’s Arch by Ernest Forrest 1890–1920.](image-url)

**TOWARDS JERUSALEM**

**CHAPTER FOUR—**

**The Innocents abroad**

![Fig 4: Left: Robinson’s Arch (arch of the Jerusalem bridge that linked Moria to Zion, discovered in 1838 and still called by the same name today), projecting from the remaining walls of Temple Mount. Fig 5: Right: Restoration of Robinson’s Arch by Ernest Forrest 1890–1920.](image-url)
that their publications would consist of facts, not opinions. By studying its archaeology, manners of the local population, topography, geology, and the narrow streets, the PEF could settle once and for all the various speculations regarding the origin of the Christian faith.

The PEF thus encapsulated the spirit of the time: on the one hand, it employed scientific tools to produce knowledge about distant lands, a quintessential Victorian trope (in fact, Queen Victoria was one of its first patrons); on the other hand, it was religiously motivated, responding to the industrialisation and secularisation endemic to England’s academic circles and to some extent European society at large. These two parallel sentiments were imbued with a sense of patrimony that was explicit in the PEF’s opening statement: “This country of Palestine belongs to you and me, it is essentially ours [. . .] We mean to walk through Palestine in the breadth of it because that land has been given unto us.” In the following decades, similar organisations joined England’s colonial-religious mission, including the American Society for the Exploration of Palestine (1870), the German Society for the Exploration of Palestine (1878) and the American School of Oriental Research (1900), although the PEF remained the wealthiest and most prolific of these institutions.

In 1878 the PEF published the ambitious “Survey of Western Palestine” (SWP) based on triangulation across the length of the territory of the so-called Holy Land. Funded by the War Office, the SWP had a clear strategic objective of achieving knowledge over the region in order to secure the Suez Canal (opened in 1869) and protect India in the Russo-Turkish War of 1877. However, the survey had an additional layer of the “sentimental character” (as the Chief of the War Office described it) and thus includes biblical, early Christian, and Crusaders sites. These maps, which took seven years to complete, provided the locations of every tells, ruins, and contemporary village in the land, more than 10,000 place-names in total (compared with Robinson’s 1,712), many of them previously unknown. Amongst the sheets were two special editions dedicated to illustrating the Old and New Testaments by mapping the Scriptures onto the terrain, including the boundaries of Israel’s twelve tribes, the borders of the ancient kingdoms of Israel and Judah, the locations of Canaanite cities and the divisions of King Solomon’s governments; the map of the New Testament also included cross-referenced biblical, Talmudic and modern names. The SWP presents a moment in which the certainty of modernity was met with something that was imaginary, mythical, and spiritual. No longer disputed or misidentified, Robinson’s studies and the PEF’s maps were actively appropriating the land and demarcating their territory by highlighting the specificity of the Christian narrative, excluding existing traditions, and eliminating the complexity that had been shared for centuries. In Enلوم, Gary Fields argues that cartography is a technological way of owning the land by mapping arguments over a represented territory. As an instrument of force, he argues that maps not only shape consciousness about the land, but they “become models for and not maps of what they represent.” This rearrangement of geological strata landscaped the PEF’s vision onto the ground, transforming it into what Edward Said refers to as “imagined geographies” — where groups project their own reading of a patrimonial territory before they act upon it with physical force. This particular vision was based on memories that had been constructed in the West for generations: it would soon spatialise itself in Jerusalem, both symbolically and literally, in a series of historic monuments.

Before addressing the concept of the historic monument, we should understand what constitutes a monument in Jerusalem. As this thesis shows, from as early as the fourth century AD, monuments have been erected in Jerusalem over places where biblical events took place in order to assure their emotional affectivity on the members of the group and their ability to recollect memory.
The basis of a particular knowledge that is based that did not initially have a memorial purpose.

In many respects, the historic monument is a 'treasury of truth'—biblical residues—referred to by a founder of the PEF as a "treasury of truth"—where foundations of Western society could be identified and memorialisid by appropriating elements of the existing city into historic monuments. In that process, the 'debris' of other narratives was discarded, thus legitimising future actions of exclusion, displacement, and demolition, advancing what is referred to by Halbwachs as a 'colonisation of memory.' In what is to follow, we will witness how archaeology was mobilised to bring invisible facts into the visible surface, and how the movement of pilgrims has fixed particular memories in space.

Condemned Jesus to his death not, originally, have a mnemonic intention; its significance in the present, however, is that it serves as the point of recollection of the saviour’s trial. The occasions on which Christ fell under the weight of the Cross or encountered various characters (Mary, Symon of Cyrene, Veronica, or the Women of Jerusalem) have been localised in pieces of pavement, a corner of a street, or fragment of buildings in Jerusalem that have since assumed a religious meaning within the systematised recollection of Stations of the Cross. The foundation of a historic monument is not based on sentiment or scripture, but on acquired, ‘objective’ data. This idiosyncratic process, often resistant to the work— which caused disturbance to daily prayers or were considered desecrating—and the Ottomans showed minimal interest in such activity, as they could not assume ownership over found items. Permits often dependent on diplomatic relations and religious bodies, which were in a constant conflict of interests over publication of theories and future funding to secure more strategic land.

However, this changed after 1858, when the Land Code allowed church bodies (such as the Greek and Russian Orthodox, Armenians, and the Catholic Dominicans and Franciscans) to buy land and freely excavate it as they pleased. Their hope was to find within their domain a trace of Biblical Jerusalem that could be transformed into a historic monument, which would then attract pilgrims and revenue.

While each institution sought after different traces of religious narratives, according to its group’s own collective memories, one sentiment was shared by all: historic Jerusalem was hidden beneath layers of a modern city, and the indigenous inhabitants of the city had been oblivious to this fact for centuries. "One of the wonders" of Jerusalem, writes Helen B. Harris in Pictures of the East (1897), is that “...beneath the t...
the Old City, “the Jerusalem of Christ will soon be reconstituted”22 suggesting the belief that all Western scholars had to do was find the “Bible under the cobblestones” of modern Jerusalem. In other words, it is there that memory can be literally excavated and brought into the surface where it will be readily available for recollection.

One of the recovered sites was the Sisters of Zion Convent, built on land purchased by Father Marie-Alphonse de Ratisbonne in the 1860s. Until excavations under the convent began, the convent carried no mnemonic function as it was merely in the vicinity of holy sites, such as the ruined section of a Roman arch that came to trace beneath the convent, the Sisters discovered the remains of a Roman room and pieces of an Ecce Homo Arch, where Christ’s trial and where Christ picked up his cross. In addition to events related to Christ and the Via Crucis, other minute details were erected the Monastery of the Flagellation, its location on a site that had been speculatively identified as the Tomb of Christ due to a supposed connection between the name of the place and the skull-shaped rock above. It is there that memory can be revived, and it is there where the Sacrament of Holy Communion is celebrated.

Recollection thus occurs based on affectivity; this ancient room gained a mnemonic function thanks to a pseudo-scientific fragment, a local figure of religious authority, and proximity to other holy sites. Following the monastery’s discovery, other holy sites proliferated nearby based on their perceived authenticity. Soon around Gabbatha were erected the Monastery of the Flagellation, where Christ was Rogued by the Romans, and the Church of the Condemnation, which Christ picked up his cross. In addition to events related to Christ and the Via Crucis, other minute details from the Scriptures were localised. The patrimonial inflation included not only religious bodies but also national institutions. As Hanna Harris writes, the English hospital excavated under its premises to discover: a very ancient and massive prison […] with several cells enclosed, and it is thought that very possibly it was in one of these that the Apostle Peter was imprisoned and from which he was so miraculously delivered, as described in the Acts of the Apostles. […] even if it be not the actual prison, it must be of equal antiquity, and serves to illustrate the Scripture incident most vividly.21

Harris admits that even if it is not exactly a prison, nor Peter’s cell, she can still understand the Scriptures better due to its authentic character.

This was the general sentiment for many holy sites, whose authenticity was questioned but nevertheless accepted. What initially emerged as Peter’s prison has remained as such, even though other researchers have re-discredited the initial findings. This tendency encapsulates what Vincent Lenzire calls a “patrimonial inertia”, a condition in which a historic monument’s status, once designated, is rarely reversed.22

While the notion of a patrimonial inertia is true for most of Jerusalem’s sites, it was not the case with the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, whose authenticity remained contested amongst explorers and archaeologists. While pre-modern pilgrims accepted the uncertainty of the site, in the nineteenth century this ambiguity was no longer tolerable.23 The first volume of the PEFS’s Recovery of Jerusalem (1871) reads: “There are differences of opinions […] whether the present church of the Holy Sepulchre does or does not cover the true Sepulchre of our Saviour; if not, whether the true site can yet be recovered.”24 Likewise, Lieutenant Claude Reignier Conder of the Royal Engineers writes in 1878 that “the study of the rock (the existing Calvary) drives us irresistibly to the conclusions given above, and thus forbids us to accept the traditional site of the Sepulchre as genuine.”25 The dispute surrounding the existing site further invigorated the controversy that was far beyond historical curiosity, and resulted in the invention of an alternative holy site: the Garden Tomb.

The British Major-General Charles Gordon arrived in Palestine in 1881. Following a quest to find the exact location of the Garden of Eden in Shechem, he visited Jerusalem with the aim of locating another sign of the divinity in the natural world: Golgotha, the hill where Christ was Crucified, also known as the place of the skull, or Calvary. Gordon traced contour lines onto Jerusalem’s PEF Survey in search of patterns that would suggest the position of Golgotha, only to finally confirm its location on a site that had been speculatively identified as the Tomb of Christ due to a supposed connection between the name of the place and the skull-shaped rock above. One of the strongest advocates of this site was Claude Reignier Conder, who had written an account that disregarded the existing Calvary and assumed this ancient rock tomb as the true site of Christ’s crucifixion. In his 2nd Work in Palestine (1878), Conder explains his findings using a process of identification similar to that applied to some of the Stations of the Cross: he emphasized its proximity to the place of St Stephen’s Martyrdon and to a Sephardic Jewish cemetery, as well as its location outside of the Old City walls, as written in the New Testament.26 Conder was convinced that the existing Calvary “lowers the Christian faith in the eyes of the Moslem” because of its desecrating falsehood.27 After laying out his detailed observation and investigations into his Calvary, he concludes, “we cannot, I would argue, consider these facts to be mere coincidence; they are rather strong confirmation of the accuracy of the more generally accepted views regarding the topography and monuments of ancient Jerusalem.”28

It took a decade to secure the purchase of the site that became known as “Gordon’s Calvary.” Initially bought by a Swiss investor, it was collectively purchased by the Garden Tomb Association, a private organisation composed of noblemen and women who showed an “earnest
desire [...] that the garden and its tomb should be secured from destruction, partition, or superstition on the other. The Association purchased the land and adjoining plots (measuring 6,440 sqm) that bordered the properties of Muslims and Jews, and was hidden beneath a Muslim cemetery, perched on the so-called “Skull Hill” above. Though the land was initially considered Mulk (freehold), in 1905 the association managed to change its designation to Waf in order to prevent it from reverting back to the state when its heirless owners would pass away. Over the next decades, the Association refrained from erecting structures within the grounds, investing instead in a lucid garden around the tomb, where Protestants could find secluded space for contemplation. This pious environment was radically different from the congested and contested atmosphere in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, located just a few hundred meters to the south inside the Old City walls. Despite the lack of a monument per se, the bower rock of the tomb and its surrounding gardens was invested with a memorial function; it became a historic monument of another typology—the garden—which became a place for the recollection for English and American Protestant communities.

The invention of the Garden Tomb was as strategic as it was spiritual. Unlike other ‘rediscovered’ holy sites in Jerusalem, the protestant Golgotha not only added an additional site to the pilgrim’s route, but also attempted to discredit another. This was a deliberate decision on the part of the Protestants—who were not recognised by the Ottomans as an autonomous confessional community, and thus did not share a piece of the city walls—that they refer to the Ottoman Walls which is incorrect. The first-century wall in Judaea closer to the Temple Mount, and the fourth-century wall found outside of it. This was a battle over identity; on the one hand, they embodied the possessive dynamics of ‘enhancement’ of value is referred to as valorisation. Therefore, to valorise in Marxist terms means to increase the surplus-value extracted from a commodity: valorisation is what converts the use value of a commodity into a marketable commodity; for Marx, the true site of Calvary: — ‘The Garden Tomb (Jerusalem) Purchase Final, February 15, 1879, A Vignette of the Garden Tomb in Jerusalem, England and Wales, and a Land Transaction in Late Ottoman Palestine,’ Palestine Exploration Quarterly, 11 (November 2010): 204

[Fig. 16: The Garden Tomb in 2010. Photo by the author]

**Fig. 16: The Garden Tomb in 2010. Photo by the author**

**ACT III: THE TOURIST**

The second half of the nineteenth century saw the total commodification of Jerusalem pilgrimage into tourism. While this dissertation has sought to problematise spiritual journeys across many centuries through the lens of their secular motivations—cultural curiosity, political aspirations, economic gain, and natural scenarios—these objectives were never pursued to such a marked degree as in the present essay. As explained below, pilgrimage—once a solitary experience based on the moral unit of the individual—was now organised in large groups, solitary experience based on the moral unit of the individual—was now organised in large groups, a chain of hotels, and well-trained tour guides, the tourist industry was able to capitalise on Jerusalem’s symbolic value and valorise each of its sites as a productive asset. Practices of recovery, reconstruction, and restoration, as applied to both forms of valorisation. On one hand, they designate existing artefacts with a form of meaning that can be consumed by the religious industry; on the other hand, they embody the M-CM model by investing in an archeological site to legitimise its inclusion in the patrimonial circuit as a historic monument, thereby generating surplus value by turning it into a marketable tourist attraction. Both forms of valorisation will be explored in further detail below.

The architect of Jerusalem’s tourism project was Thomas Cook. Born in 1808 in Derbyshire, England, Cook was a Baptist missionary who was both a faithful Christian and a businessman. Starting from a small endeavour to 88 TOWARDS JERUSALEM CHAPTER FOUR—THE INNOCENTS ABROAD 89
The best time of the year for being in Palestine—the best travelling facilities, the best hotel accommodation—the best guides that can be engaged—the best places of interest to be visited—the routes to and from England—and the cost of the whole tour for two months.

Indeed, Cook’s religious zeal and entrepreneurial spirit were born from the demand for marketing and turning the Holy Land into nothing less than a resort: one London-based journalist wrote that Cook’s travellers enjoyed a “healthful mode of travelling. The whole excitement and pleasure of camp life, the deepest interest of its hallowed spots, the wide field it allows for exploration, and the wild beauty that lingers everywhere, combined to make Palestine a place of resort as soon as the modern facilities for travelling brought about its easy fortnight’s distance from our own.”

In the spring of 1869, Thomas Cook led thirty visitors on his first organised trip to Palestine. These pilgrim-tourists were led across the country on horseback and housed in camps that were lavishly equipped with comfortable beds, dining rooms, and washing facilities. Every morning, these camps were easily dismantled, relocated, and erected in the next station before the travellers would return from their day’s trip. Each group was escorted by chefs, porters, donkeys, and a dragon—a local guide, translator, and dispenser of baksheesh, or passage bribes on the open road. Cook’s established familiarity with local authorities allowed his tours to camp in close proximity to the points of interest: in Jerusalem, for example, his groups were deployed by the Damascus and Jaffa Gates. By the 1870s, he purchased land and built a storage facility for his gear by the Old City; in the following years, he bought additional plots in order to accommodate his expanding agency. His first office in Jerusalem was opened in 1881; by 1903, he already had three in the city, in addition to outposts in Jaffa, Cairo, Constantinople, Algiers, Tunis, and Khartoum.

By 1883, less than fifteen years after he had set up, Cook was responsible for the escort of over two-thirds of all Holy Land travellers arriving from the West. One of the keys to his success, aside from catering to his clients’ needs for comfort and security, was the introduction of hotel coupons and circular notes. The former were pre-purchased accommodation vouchers that eliminated the need for currency exchange and price haggling, and the latter were the fore-runners of travel cheques, replacing heavy gold coins with notes that could be exchanged in Cook’s agencies. This vast economic network created a near-monopoly over the tourist industry in the Holy Land, positioning Cook and his clients as privileged amongst Jerusalem’s visitors; in one recorded anecdote, he threatened to withdraw his business from a local hotelier if he “does not treat our travellers and ourselves as they and we ought to be treated.”

This sense of paternalism is not surprising considering Cook’s ties to local diplomatic powers: in 1869, when one of Cook’s camps was robbed, the British consul in Beirut and the Turkish governor of Jerusalem conducted a month-long investigation to retrieve their belongings and bring them to the British Foreign Office in London. By the end of the nineteenth century, Cook’s representative in Palestine also served as the American vice-consul. Indeed, much of the power and fame of Cook’s Tours came from the support of the Empire; in return, Cook served the colonial powers with great loyalty. In 1881, Cook escorted a campaign to Egypt that resulted in the British occupation of the country; after the Battle of Tel el-Kebir, Cook evacuated wounded British soldiers; and in 1884, the British government employed Cook to transport supplies to their soldiers in Sudan. Cook was also in charge of the Royal Tours of the Prince of Wales (1862) and Prince George (1842) and the renowned visit of Kaiser Wilhelm II of Germany (1898). However, the social and political elites were not his target audience; these trips were merely tools to disseminate his message and advance his desire to democratise travel, as well as cater to the middle-class desire for self-improvement through leisure. He even encouraged women to travel, arguing that “with their energy, bravery, and endurance of toil […] they are fully equal to those of the opposite sex […] they push their way through all difficulties and acquire the perfection of tourist character;” these lines were written in Cook’s newsletter, The Excursionist (1851–1902) (later The Traveller’s Gazette, 1902–1939), which promoted Cook’s Tours by showcasing its development and published articles on new destinations, transportation fares, and testimonials from returning travellers and Cook’s employees. In addition to the newsletter, Cook created another publication: Cook’s Handbook, that published periodically and was to accompany Western travellers on their trip to Palestine. Cook’s Handbook included practical information for travellers—preferred season, currency exchange rates, dress codes, diet, camp life, and so on—as well as detailed itineraries, maps in various scales, and descriptions of the land’s natural features, various religions and sects, and local history, as well as addresses of post office, physicians, foreign consulates, and bankers. The vision of the guidebook, Cook explains, is that it could be read “without difficulty, either on horseback or in the dim light of the tent […] that in any moment any information may be ascertained.” Addressing a group that was literate and well versed in Biblical theology, Cook included not only practical information but also Scriptural references for all the sites on his itinerary. By combining the guidebook with the

 host Temperance Tours (helping men abstain from alcohol and nicotine) in 1841, Cook’s office expanded in 1850 to arrange tours to Paris, Italy, and the Alps. In 1851, he trekked to the Great Exhibition in London’s Crystal Palace, providing transportation and accommodation. Conducting the tours in person, buying wholesale tickets, and targeting the expanding middle-class—whose vacations were an integral part of ‘healthy work’—Cook positioned himself at the forefront of the business of leisure-making. The arrival of the steamship, improvement of railways, and the paving of roads encouraged his entrepreneurial spirit to expand his ‘educational’ services beyond Europe. Reflecting both the era’s expansionist sensibilities and his own missionary sentiments, Cook was oriented to the East. It was there that he could combine the curiosity of the ancient world with the comfort and security of modernism; above all, it is where he could merge business with piety.

When Cook arrived in Palestine in 1864, he wanted to revolutionise the existing model of pilgrimage. Until then, visitors were responsible for planning their own routes, hiring guides, preparing food, and booking transfers and accommodations for themselves. They travelled in large caravans that were crucial for economic and security reasons, often in the company of officers of the Ottoman army. Cook offered something completely different: a packaged deal that would provide all of his client’s needs on the ground. He visited Palestine twice to make connections and study the field so that he could promise his clients:
Bible, Cook assumes authority over all the didactic content (both spiritual and practical) of the traveller’s visit—and removes everything else as excess. As Cook himself writes in the introduction, the volume—

is intended as a handbook for Tourists; it does not, therefore, attempt to give exhaustive and analytical accounts of the multitudinous threads of controversy woven around nearly every sacred site [...] It points out all that is to be seen, and endeavours to provide concise information upon all subjects in which the Tourist [sic] may find interest.

Cook openly admits to reducing the complexity of the land for the benefit of the tourist. Controlling both the letter and the spirit of the words under his guidance, he projected a single narrative and frames a view over the land as the only truth. When faced with ambiguous sites or sites, the tourist could confer with the authority of the European guidebook (of which Cook’s was only the first), where they could be reassured with familiar facts and figures.

The guidebook also included detailed itineraries that are worth exploring. Day 1 on Cook’s “Ten Days Tour in Judea” is described as such: “Jerusalem to Mar Saba, Riding to Rachel’s Tomb, Solomon’s Pools, over the hills of the Wilderness of the land is communicated through narrative history, and its landscape through travelogues and personal experiences. Despite the author’s authority, the book is not about a tourist experience but rather a personal one that emphasizes the spiritual and cultural significance of the land for the reader.”

The guidebook also included detailed itineraries that are worth exploring. Day 1 on Cook’s “Ten Days Tour in Judea” is described as such: “Jerusalem to Mar Saba, Riding to Rachel’s Tomb, Solomon’s Pools, over the hills of the Wilderness of the land is communicated through narrative history, and its landscape through travelogues and personal experiences. Despite the author’s authority, the book is not about a tourist experience but rather a personal one that emphasizes the spiritual and cultural significance of the land for the reader.”

Cook warns that “the only water supply in the town it is quite possible that the women cite the spoken descriptions offered to them by their guides, Mr. Howard and Mr. Thimble.”

There is no clearer way of valorising the Holy Land and its historic monuments than Cook’s idiosyncratic itineraries, which naturalised and territorialised the landscape, turning it into a site of pilgrimage. Cook’s tours often ended with a sermon. Then Joseph’s workshop and Mary’s well, and as the Bishops to Cath and camp there. “This natural element thus gains a patrimonial value thanks to the authority of the guidebook. In this process of valorisation, it becomes a point of reflection within a constellation of attractions.”

The Valley of Elah is also mentioned in an unpublished travelogue written by mother and daughter Sophie and Emmeline Barnsley, who undertook Cook’s Eastern tour from England in 1888. Rather than read from the written guide, the women cite the spoken descriptions offered to them by their guides, Mr. Howard and Mr. Bernard:

We came to a large square building which contains a rock on which it is said that Jesus and His disciples ate before and after the Resurrection. Then we visited a very old church in which it is said that our Lord preached his first sermon. Then Joseph’s workshop and Mary’s well, and as the only water supply in the town it is quite possible that the women cite the spoken descriptions offered to them by their guides, Mr. Howard and Mr. Bernard.

We halted for lunch at the brook from which David select the pool from which he was able to resolve the battles with the Philistines. Then as we looked down the narrow valley it was easy to imagine the hills on either side covered with fighting men, Philis-

tic content (both spiritual and practical) of the traveller’s visit—and removes everything else as excess. As Cook himself writes in the introduction, the volume—

is intended as a handbook for Tourists; it does not, therefore, attempt to give exhaustive and analytical accounts of the multitudinous threads of controversy woven around nearly every sacred site [...] It points out all that is to be seen, and endeavours to provide concise information upon all subjects in which the Tourist [sic] may find interest.

Cook openly admits to reducing the complexity of the land for the benefit of the tourist. Controlling both the letter and the spirit of the words under his guidance, he projected a single narrative and frames a view over the land as the only truth. When faced with ambiguous sites or sites, the tourist could confer with the authority of the European guidebook (of which Cook’s was only the first), where they could be reassured with familiar facts and figures.

The guidebook also included detailed itineraries that are worth exploring. Day 1 on Cook’s “Ten Days Tour in Judea” is described as such: “Jerusalem to Mar Saba, Riding to Rachel’s Tomb, Solomon’s Pools, over the hills of the Wilderness of the land is communicated through narrative history, and its landscape through travelogues and personal experiences. Despite the author’s authority, the book is not about a tourist experience but rather a personal one that emphasizes the spiritual and cultural significance of the land for the reader.”

The guidebook also included detailed itineraries that are worth exploring. Day 1 on Cook’s “Ten Days Tour in Judea” is described as such: “Jerusalem to Mar Saba, Riding to Rachel’s Tomb, Solomon’s Pools, over the hills of the Wilderness of the land is communicated through narrative history, and its landscape through travelogues and personal experiences. Despite the author’s authority, the book is not about a tourist experience but rather a personal one that emphasizes the spiritual and cultural significance of the land for the reader.”

There is no clearer way of valorising the Holy Land and its historic monuments than Cook’s idiosyncratic itineraries, which naturalised and territorialised the landscape, turning it into a site of pilgrimage. Cook’s tours often ended with a sermon. Then Joseph’s workshop and Mary’s well, and as the only water supply in the town it is quite possible that the women cite the spoken descriptions offered to them by their guides, Mr. Howard and Mr. Bernard.

We halted for lunch at the brook from which David select the pool from which he was able to resolve the battles with the Philistines. Then as we looked down the narrow valley it was easy to imagine the hills on either side covered with fighting men, Philis-

...
to hide away everything that could obstruct the process of recollection. However, as the year 1900 approached, this reality could no longer be hidden. Jerusalem’s economy benefited tremendously from the capital brought by the religious industry, and the city was growing to unprecedented scale. By the end of the nineteenth century, the area surrounding the Jaffa Gate became a local “central station” for pilgrim-tourists, where carriages arriving from the port of Jaffa could discharge their riders at the junction of the Old City and the new, where trade, commerce, and transportation was centered. From Jaffa Gate grew the new Jaffa Road, which a plethora of hotels, restaurants, and tour agencies developed along the city’s only pedestrian sidewalks. In 1867, Jaffa Road was the first street to be paved in the city, leading to improved transportation and to the port from which the city’s economy could no longer be hidden. Jerusalem’s economy was growing at an unprecedented scale.

By the end of the century, the area surrounding the Jaffa Gate was transformed into a tourist center. From the 1880s, the arrival of mass-tourism—a development and directed through a cognitive work of constant tension that is negotiated by travel guides, heritage experts, and local religious authorities. This is all the more true in the case of Jerusalem, where the city is inevitably compared to its representations in biblical literature and religious imagery spanning millennia and disseminated through Sunday school and church sermons, museum frescoes and postcards, by class, gender, education, culture, and religion; their vision is filtered through memories and ideologies in a way that does not reflect an actual reality. Urry and Larsen argue that the tourist gaze is not individually determined, but is constructed and directed through a cognitive work of comparison, classification, and connection; it is heavily based on visual and textual representation, which foster great anticipation from the tourist’s destination.

The gaze and the gaze are in a relationship of constant tension that is negotiated by travel guides, heritage experts, and local religious authorities. This is all the more true in the case of Jerusalem, where the city is inevitably compared to its representations in biblical literature and religious imagery spanning millennia and disseminated through Sunday school and church sermons, museum frescoes and postcards.

In other words, Jerusalem could not live up to its image in the West. Constructed of signs, this image is a collage of collective memories that find their material form in the city’s various signifiers: its ancient walls, Oriental elements (such as indigenous characters, camels, or palm trees), or the dome of the Holy Sepulchre. These signifiers are refined by tourism professionals who produce, valorise, and disseminate them within society through posters, guidebooks, and travelogues for mass consumption.

Since Jerusalem’s tourist industry generates surplus by producing valorised heritage rather than goods, its value is very much dependent on the faculty of sight. The possibility of seeing ancient Jerusalem became the prime objective of Thomas Cook & Sons; it is what every pilgrim-tourist desired. But “we do not literally ‘see’ things”, Urry and Larsen remind us: tourists, we only see objects as signifiers of something else. In other words, it is the legibility of the signifier that dictates the satisfaction of the touristic gaze. This is problematic, of course, because when tourists see the city, they automatically complete an image according to the patterns of life necessary for their own recollection, while “various kinds of social experiences are in effect ignored or trivialised, such as the relations of war, exploitation, hunger, disease, the law and so on, which cannot be seen as such”, write Urry and Larsen.

Indeed, the complexity of the city cannot be understood by the touristic gaze: as we shall see, when something interrupts the image, the semiotic structure collapses.

In a word, we can barely recognise Jerusalem, wrote Constantin François de Chassebœuf in 1784. He saw an Oriental city which was far from the Jerusalem he expected, one of ancient beauty and history. While tourism had yet to be institutionalised when he wrote those lines at the end of the eighteenth century, this sentiment is emblematic of the touristic gaze of him and his fellow travellers who felt it their duty to report on the shortcomings of Palestine. The travelogues cited below, as well as dozens of others, are far from impartial representations of the East, and should be understood within the discourse on Orientalism. Travel writings from nineteenth-century Palestine should thus be studied for their agency in shaping Jerusalem. They directly contributed to its appropriation and exclusion by being complicit in colonialist discourse. As such, travelogues reveal the connection between travel, collective memory, imperialism, valorisation, and capitalism.

The first phase of travellers’ response includes a feeling of disappointment in reaction to the natural scenery. “Those who describe Palestine as beautiful”, wrote one traveller in 1875, “must have either a very inaccurate notion of constant tension that is negotiated by travel guides, heritage experts, and local religious authorities. This is all the more true in the case of Jerusalem, where the city is inevitably compared to its representations in biblical literature and religious imagery spanning millennia and disseminated through Sunday school and church sermons, museum frescoes and postcards.’’ — Said, Orientalism, 4
of what constitutes beauty of scenery, or must we measure the country through a highly coloured medium? Indeed, the gaze of these travellers over Palestine was framed by their own cultural and aesthetic expectations—here, by paintings and engravings of the British Romanticism—which could not find satisfaction in mid-nineteenth-century Jerusalem, where sanctity was not coupled with a land of abundance of monuments. Perhaps the most prolific critic of the Holy Land during those decades was Mark Twain. Travelling on board America’s first organised tourist excursion, the USS steamship Quaker City, Twain arrived in Palestine in 1867 with a group of one hundred fifty fellow Americans. Twain was so disappointed by the “hopeless, dreary, heart-broken land” that he decided to warn future travellers about the reality of Palestine by writing an entire book about his experience:

The Innocents Abroad

It is clear that the Jerusalem of memory did not make itself available to the tourist. Many of the sites that were expected to grace the tourist were not there by the time almost every turn reminds us of the city known from religious art. As the Irish Minister Jonas Leslie Porter wrote, “The City of the Great King, the Holy City of the Crusaders, the picturesque City of the Sarcophagus and the sepulchre of the Patriarchs—now, at the present time almost covered and concealed by the tasteless structures of modern traders and ambitious foreign devotes. It is doubtful that there were any graves in Jerusalem right [and] cleanse the city of the accumulated ‘filth’ was awarded to Sir Ronald MacDonald in the twentieth century. The gaze of Warburton, Schaff and Prime are connected with that scenery”, the real cinema of roads) was seen as no less than a desecration of Jerusalem railways in 1892 and the improvement of infrastructure (such as the opening of the Jaffa-Jerusalem railways in 1892 and the improvement of roads) was seen as no less than a desecration of the terrain. A British author commented: “The first feeling that comes to us as we stand on the platform at Jaffa in Jérusalem and the cross, the crescent and the cross, England’s voice of the conductor shouting, “All aboard for Jerusalem,” the second the tourist. The tourist was part of an industry that always put Jerusalem right [and] cleanse the city of the cultural pollution that has dimmed its spiritual brilliance. These aspirations became possible when the British Mandate began its occupation of Palestine in December 1917, following the invasion of Jerusalem by the British General Edmund Allenby and the subsequent withdrawal of the Ottoman forces. This was the first time, since the Crusade’s loss of Jerusalem in 1187 AD, that the pre-existing city was ruled by a power whose British saw it as their duty to “restore Jerusalem and Palestine to their place among the nations.”

The privilege of ‘cleaning’ Jerusalem of its accumulated ‘filth’ was awarded to Sir Ronald Storrs, the first British governor of Jerusalem. Storrs was struck by the beauty of the city and its geography, which he described as “unparalleled...
in the world, with an appeal to the imagination that not Rome, even not Athens, could rival. Storrss's sentiments for the city were not dissimilar to those of Palestine's late-nineteenth-century tourists, and he admitted little experience for the task at hand. One of his first actions as military governor was to put an end to all construction in Jerusalem: within four months of his appointment, he released a statement announcing that “No person shall demolish, erect, alter or repair” any structure within 2,500 metres of the Damascus Gate of the Old City, without his written permission. Cars were to be left out of Judea, and when asked about the possibility of a tram to run between Bethlehem and the Mount of Olives, he wrote that “the first rail section together ‘by their common love for the Holy City’.

As much as Storrss wanted to restore Jerusalem to its biblical past, he was advised that “there are many problems in economics, hygiene, town planning, social reconstruction, to which the sermon on the Mount and the teaching of Jesus give us a little clue.” He therefore entrusted the project to an independent committee, The Pro-Jerusalem Society, composed of the city’s mayor and members of the Muslim, Jewish, Christian, and Armenian communities. This uncommon union of civic and religious concerns was bound together “by their common love for the Holy City”.

Storrss appointed the Arts and Crafts advocate and William Morris follower C. R. Ashbee as director. Like Storrss, Ashbee believed that the urgency of their mission was a matter of not only archaeology or preservation but of beauty: “Everything that we associate with our sense of beauty is alike in danger: Landscape, the units of streets and sites, the embodied vision of the men that set the great whole together [...] all these things have to be considered practiceially.”

When Ashbee arrived in Jerusalem, it was in a desperate state: “It is difficult to imagine a sharper contrast than between the Jerusalem of man’s imagination [...] and the actual Jerusalem left us by the Turk.” He lamented his responsibility in shaping this “city of the mind,” evoking with despair its great builders of the past, and contemplating his abundance of freedom and endless possibilities. For him, there was no logic in the condition in which “the stranger had become a native, the pilgrim the resident.” But this was indeed the case, and with the Pro-Jerusalem Society, Ashbee intended to do well with the city—and prevent others from doing ill.

Within this framework, Jerusalem would become a project of two cities: a new metropolis to be regulated and an ancient city to be made legible. The first part was simple and well-known to English improvers: hundreds of kilometres or asphalt roads were to be constructed, soil erosion prevented by extensive afforestation, and terracing encouraged in order to improve the land’s fertility, making sure “the land can be made really productive.” The second part of his plan—the project of legibility—was more complicated: it did not have a blueprint, but was made up of a variety of plans, projects, and legislation drafted over several decades by prominent architects and planners. In the context of this paper—the discussion on collective memory, legibility of its urban signifiers, and the valorisation of Jerusalem as a historic monument—I have chosen to highlight the plans (both realised and unrealised) that treated Jerusalem as a project of landscape design. 1 position this hypothesis within the theoretical framework put forth by Deniz Cosgrove, Gary Fields, and W.J.T. Mitchell who argue not only that landscape is man-made, but that it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem as a historic site by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze. The first element of landscape design was chosen to highlight the plans (both realised and unrealised) that treated Jerusalem as a project of urban planning and development during —

![Image 1] Jerusalem from the south (American Colony Photographers, 1869–1907)

![Image 2] Alillery, Stones, and Arches on Temple Mount


“ornamental plantations” but would instead attempt to recover the past: Jewish and ancient Greco-Roman rock-tombs would be preserved as “features” of the park, while the rest would be discarded in order to return Jerusalem into its natural, pre-Ottoman state. As Geddes wrote:

It would be an easy matter to remove this earth and rubbish further downhill...[A] way may be laid out and kept permanently open the early Biblical Jerusalem, of which the present old city is but a later development.

The park plan was an elaboration of the 1918 Zoning Scheme by William McLean, which established four zones: the Old City, which should preserve its “Medieval aspect”, the park, which should remain unbuilt; and two additional zones designated with a specific character and height limit, “rendering them in harmony and in scale with the Old City.” Both the zoning and park plans were intended to appeal not to the city’s residents, those who live and work within the complexity of the city itself, but to those seeing Jerusalem would be ever-familiar to an arriving pilgrim and touristic fabric. The second design element proposed by the Pro-Jerusalem Society was an attempt to unify the natural aspect of the city, which expanded in 1918 to include the entire municipal area; created an aesthetic that allowed new neighbourhoods to be immediately accepted into Jerusalem’s holy landscape because its buildings (and later cladding) were made of stone. As an autochthonous material, the stone would serve future justifications of claims over the city, carrying a symbolic value for not only British colonists but also Israel’s master planners in 1967, who likewise claimed the stone to “stimulate other sensations embedded in our collective memory, producing strong associations to the ancient holy city of Jerusalem.” However powerful the stone legislation was, there were still major revisions to the image of Jerusalem that had to take place. The third and final element of the design is thus the construction of a clear, unobstructed, and familiar view onto Jerusalem. This was not undertaken in one plan or legislation, but as a series of surgical interventions, recreational projects, and sketches contained in the personal notebooks of Ashbee and in the 1919 publication by the Pro-Jerusalem Society. The latter begins by boasting of “cleaning the Citadel and clearing out of the city fosse”, which included the removal of “great masses of stone debris” and, of course, a mass of Ottoman refugees. In their camps, “there was much sickness, the misery and squall were pitiful, and it took a long time before the relief officers were able to cope with the difficulty.” The society found a creative way to deal with both the material and human remains of the war:

The Society then worked out a method by which the clearing and cleaning should be done by refugee labour, and such of the refugees were able-bodied were utilised, so to speak, tidying up their own house. Many hundreds of men, women, and children, organised in different working gangs, were thus used. The violence embedded in this efficient “method” could not be overestimated. The remainder of the publications maintain similar notions of clearing and beautifying Jerusalem’s signifiers, of which the Citadel was only one. The Ramparts Walk, for example, was a fortified walking path on the ancient walls, originally used for security. Under the new plan, it was to become a promenade: “the spinal cord on which is to be built the whole series of parks, gardens, and open spaces of which the new city will be composed.” For this project, the Society opened disused guardhouses, removed several feet of landfill, built steps, installed iron handrails, and removed around thirty “encroachments” that were built by the city’s residents in order to demarcate their domestic property. The Ramparts Walk is a classic example of valorisation: it enhances the Old City’s appeal by creating a quasi-historical attraction that engages with the materiality of the ancient. While it is based on the Ottoman walls, it was hailed by Ashbee as “the largest, and perhaps the most perfect, Medieval enceinte in existence.” Rising above the “wild
informal layout" of pine trees and flowers of the Green Belt, the Walk sold a biblical attraction that not only united the Old City in one perimeter, but allowed for an obstructed, dominating gaze on the sacred territory that it encloses.

Another substantial undertaking was the 'clearing-up' of the old city gates. First, the society removed locals (such as a bath contractor or dung-cake bakers) that appropriated St Stephen's Gate, repaired the guard-house at Herod's Gate, and designed a new monumental scheme for Damascus Gate. Jaffa Gate was to be completely remodelled: the Ottoman Clock Tower—described by Ashbee as 'hideous' and by the Pro-Jerusalem Society as 'unsightly'—was dismantled. A large open space replaced the existing make-shift market stalls, which would be cleared away, along with the shops that had been erected around the gate for decades. In addition, parts of the wall that had been breached over the years would be rebuilt "again exactly as it was", and a new flower garden would be planted around the citadel.

The Ramparts Walk ca. 1910 (left) American Colony, Jerusalem. Photo Department

The idea of creating Jerusalem as a landscape is evident not only from the projects and texts undertaken by the Society, but also from the medium used to devise these plans. The design of the Jaffa Gate is presented as a juxtaposition in the "before-and-after" style: above, we see a panoramic photograph taken beneath the Jaffa Gate, showing the situation at present. A cluster of houses of various materials and roof covers are stacked on the slopes that descend from the gate, where only the edge of the wall is visible beneath the yet-to-be demolished Ottoman Clocktower. The monumental tower of the citadel is not shown; it must have been cropped out due to the photographer's format. Below, we see a hand-drawn rendering of Ashbee's proposal: the medieval walls are clearly visible and intact, with the monumental tower of the citadel rising on the right. On the far left sprawls an Oriental-looking new city with domed roofs. The entire scene is framed by generous pine trees and luscious greenery; it is a projected vision of a productive, well-ordered world where old and new live together in harmony, encapsulating a Western vision of the beauty, the ancient, and the holy.

Below Ashbee's rendering, the subtitle reads: "The same [the view onto Jaffa Gate] as suggested when the unsightly obstructions that hide the wall line are cleared away." Indeed, Ashbee's picturesque scene sees actions of displacement and demolition as nothing but the clearing of obstructions. As a case-study for Jerusalem at large, the redesign of the Jaffa Gate reveals the primacy of the distant view over the discomforts of proximity; it encapsulates the sensibilities of a landscape painter employed by the Pro-Jerusalem Society. Indeed, the particular gaze that is associated with landscape painting is that of possession and authority; it is a form of control that positions the external viewer in a paternalistic relationship with the local-insider. The latter is flattened along with all the rest of the elements within the frame—greenery, houses, natural elements, ruins, and monuments—into a picturesque composition. At the same time, the outsider is at liberty to enjoy the affectivity of the scene—and then turn their back on it.

Ashbee's designs for Jerusalem elevate the sub-
In favour of an 
cpecific thing, but to
is an invitation not to look at a spe-
at a
landscape
W.J.T. Mitchell argues that “the invitation to look
reflects back to the viewer-as-creator an image of
British-Mandate Jerusalem, the constructed view
from landscape paintings. Relocated from the
only from religious collective memory but also
reassuring and familiar ancient city, known not
jectivity of its visitor-spectators while ignoring
the lives of its permanent inhabitants, who do not
have the privilege to walk away. He constructed a
reassuring and familiar ancient city, known not
only from religious collective memory but also
from landscape paintings. Relocated from the
walls of a European villa to the drafting tables in
British-Mandate Jerusalem, the constructed view
reflects back to the viewer-as-creator an image of
his static patrimonial possession.

**JERUSALEM AS
A HISTORIC MONUMENT**

W.J.T. Mitchell argues that “the invitation to look
at a landscape is an invitational not to look at a spe-
cific thing, but to ignore all particulars in favour of an
appreciation of the whole.” Indeed, the project of
Jerusalem in the wake of the British occupation
eliminated the spatial and social complexities of
the city in order to improve, preserve, and recover
an ideal city. The Jerusalem Park system created a
morphological void between ancient and modern
fabric, thus articulating the old and new cities
by the logic of difference, the Jerusalem stone
made all that it touches memorable and familiar,
creating an instant signifier for the ‘city of the
mind’, and the ‘removal of obstructions’ assured
that Jerusalem would be instantly legible from a
variety of distances. These interlocking interven-
tions—in plan, legislation and demolition—used
the medium of landscape to transform the city.
In its use of landscape, the project was oper-
ating not only along religious sentiments but also
under the rules of capitalism. Indeed, the
project was conceived on the principles of prop-
eerty, displacement, and exclusion, and it valorised
Jerusalem as a consumable urban attraction, an
enhanced historic monument. Its success was thus
determined by the real estate market, subject-
ing Jerusalem to a pattern common to ancient
cities across the globe, in which they are both
made banal and subordinated to their symbolic
value. In recent decades, the state of Israel and
the renewed municipality of post-’67 Jerusalem
have deployed mechanisms of enhancement that
exemplify both Choay’s and Marx’s interpretations
of valorisation. Viewing promenades, pedestrian
streets, artist colonies, and outdoor festivals align
the Holy City with tropes of leisure and increase
the visibility of its historic monuments. By apply-
ing a Marxist analysis of valorisation, we can view
the commodification of pilgrimage as the cause
for the eliminations of other industries from the
Old City and its environs in the hopes of increas-
ing its surplus value from tourism, thus resulting
in a condition where the city’s economic survival
may even depend on the tourist industry’s sus-
tained success.

In the process, Jerusalem became increas-
ingly similar to any other historic city. Choay
argues that “the valorisation of the ancient cen-
tres tends, paradoxically, to become the instru-
ment of a secondary form of trivialisation, as cities
begin to resemble each other so closely that
tourists and multinational companies feel iden-
tically at home in every one of them.” Heritage
thus becomes a cult that consumes the city, sym-
bolically and literally. It is a condition in which
capitalism exploits not only the city but also its
tourists. The desire for distraction merges with
the consumption of heritage, as historical knowl-
edge becomes a form of entertainment. From
pilgrims to surveyors, archaeologists, tourists and
colonizers—Jerusalem’s visitor has morphed from
a subject who undertakes a personal journey to
a passive participant in the mass movement that
generates capital. Along the way, the notion of
memory has been lost: what once carried anal-
gical power through textual and visual interpreta-
tion, has now been fixed in space and time, only
to be finally abstracted and reduced to a cyclical
recollection of drained values.

The design chapter of this thesis thus pro-
poses a counter-project to the valorisation of
Jerusalem. In order to untangle the tie between
pilgrimage and heritage, the project proposes a
journey, bound neither by geography nor by nar-
rativity, but sequenced according to association
and analogy. Its stations have not been scru-
tinised for authenticity, valorised for visibility,
or commodified for profitability; they cannot be
ritualised into one sequence, for their devotional
typology is as varied as pilgrimage itself. Instead,
the stations are composed as a multiple-choice
garden of forking paths that traverses the history
of the Holy City in order to carve an analogical
path towards Jerusalem.  

215 Ibid
216 Ibid, 166
217 Ibid, 166

218 In his “Garden of
the Forking Paths”
(1941) Jorge Luis Borges
writes; “I leave to the
various futures (not to
all) my garden of forking
paths (...) In all fictional
works, each time a man is
confronted with several
alternatives, he chooses
one and eliminates the
others; in the fiction of
Ts’ui Pên, he chooses—
simultaneously—all
of them. He creates,
in this way, diverse
futures, diverse times
which themselves also
proliferate and fork.”
In January of 1417, Sister Truyde of the St Mary and St Agnes Convent in Diepenveen asked her fellow nun, Sister Ghertruut Huginges, to join her on a pilgrimage to Rome. If they had left the convent on time, Truyde said, they could make it to Rome by January 27—the day of the virgin martyr Agnes. But on the day of their departure, January 7, Ghertruut fell ill and stayed behind; Truyde said goodbye to her fellow sisters and departed on her own.

While she did arrive in Rome on time to join the celebrations of St Agnes’s Day, Truyde had never actually left the convent; in fact, neither she nor her fellow nun Ghertruut had ever been to the real city of Rome, and it is unlikely that they had been outside the convent at all in decades. The pilgrimage Truyde undertook in 1417 (and Ghertruut several years before her) was not a physical journey, but a mental one, conducted through a choreography of prayers, meditations and physical actions.

This unique form of female spirituality was common in the Middle Ages amongst enclosed women who could not afford (financially or spiritually) a physical pilgrimage. It provided them with a different way to ‘travel’ to the holy sites, gain indulgences and reach spiritual ascension—all without leaving their monastic cell. A key component of this ritual was the devotional manuscript, that was based on travelogues written by real pilgrims to the Holy Land and could thus aid one’s personal imitation of Christ through compassion (from the Latin com + patior, “to suffer with”). Evolving in time and space, these manuscripts led the reader through the Christological narrative from page to page and from station to station in the actual geography of the land and within the imaginary topography of the the mind. Illustrations, descriptive text, and prescriptive prayers directed the virtual pilgrim through the sights of the journey, as it unfolded experientially in the imagination of the reader and spatially within the monastic cell.

The visual representations varied greatly in iconography and style, but maintained a consistent aim: to allow an enclosed woman to enact Christ’s last moments and thus embody his pain. The instructive manuscripts thus consisted of both figurative and symbolic motifs, from realist images of Christ’s bleeding body to measurements taken in the Holy Land such as the length of his tomb or number of steps between holy sites. These details provided the reader with the tools to reenact the exact ritual a pilgrim would undertake physically in Jerusalem, while her mind could meditate on Christ’s pain and suffering. She could, for example, climb 28 steps on her bleeding knees in the convent and walk the 232 “ells”

Fig 1: Folio in the Villers Miscellany, ca. 1320:
The measured wound of Christ incorporated into a word-image design (left)
With a textual description of the associated indulgences (right)
In addition to eliminating the dangers and hardships of physical journeys, virtual travel allowed the pilgrim to leap through time and space. While physical pilgrims had to choose between the sacred geography of Jerusalem or the holy artefacts in Rome, an imagined itinerary could combine both in a single day: one could be ‘walking’ in Jerusalem while ‘stopping’ on route at Rome’s Seven Churches. Virtual pilgrimage could also offer an improved version of the Holy Land in the eyes of the pilgrim: while the real Sepulchre was likely a dark and unappealing space during the years of Jerusalem’s non-Christian rule, the devotional manuscript presented a facsimile of a place that was well-lit, airy, and Western in its design and materiality. In his 1491 pilgrim guide, for instance, Felix Fabri attempted to rewrite the geographical reality of Mamluk rule over Jerusalem. He used Christian scriptural names for Islamic monuments and wrote about going to the House of Veronica and Pilate’s Palace, despite the entry restrictions on Christian visitors enforced at the time of his visit.

An additional manipulation by Fabri was the rearrangement of his itinerary into a more legible one for a distant reader. Instead of recording places in the geographical order he had seen in Palestine, Fabri chronicled his visits according to their Scriptural position. In other words, the sites appeared in his pilgrim guide as they would be read and preached, not as one would see them in reality. While a physical pilgrim could first see Nazareth, then Jerusalem, and finally Bethlehem, Fabri’s account reordered these sites to follow the narrative of Christ’s Nativity, miracle-working in the north, and finally the Passion in Jerusalem. This altered itinerary removed the confusing topographical conditions and thus made the narrative coherent for a virtual traveler.

Part-biblical, part-Crusader, and part-scriptural, Fabri’s Jerusalem could never exist on earth, but could be readily imagined in the minds of his readers. This appropriation and authored agency created the opportunity to trespass political, logistical, and economic constraints. Distilling elements of veneration from the complexity of the real Jerusalem, virtual travel, or mental pilgrimage, offers a far less violent appropriation of Jerusalem than the ones studied in the final chapter of this dissertation. Fabri’s symbolic appropriation of Jerusalem could proliferate in the minds of his readers and lead them through a pilgrimage from their own room. In other words, by disentangling collective memories from their physical markers (to refer back to Halbwachs’ ‘landmarks’), they could be recalled within a flexible topography through mnemonic association, sensorial interaction, and imaginative labour.

JOURNEY ROUND MY ROOM

Books and manuscripts regained their relevance as tools for sedentary pilgrimage in the nineteenth century with the invention of photography. Travelogues adorned with photographs were treasured as more than an assembly of postcards—they could transmit the spatial experience of pilgrimage for those unable to undertake the physical journey, just like in a medieval convent. In 1894, an extensive reportage was published under the suggestive title Earthly Footsteps of the Man of Galilee, showcasing over 400 photographs by the relatively unknown R.E.M. Bain and a text by the Bishop John H. Vincent. The book provides visual and textual descriptions of Christ’s life on earth using “notebook and camera” for armchair readers who could enjoy “a delightful tour of Palestine [...] without leaving home.” While Bain’s oversize photographs were the dominating element (Earthly Footsteps was over two feet wide), they were carefully mediated by scriptural verses and informative captions, such as “The Spot Where Christ Prayed” and “The Flock near the Pit into which Joseph was Thrown by his Brethren.”

As in the medieval guides for virtual travel, the text was an instrumental part of the remote pilgrimage by fostering a mnemonic affiliation between what is pictured and the collective memories that are embedded in the Scriptures. Thus, the bishop’s captions were infusing the landscape with transcendent meaning, thereby transforming Palestine’s nondescript sites into landmarks in the eyes of the book’s reader. Framed by the syntactic composition of the photo book, this appropriation of the landscape added legibility and credibility to the sights without valorising the land itself or creating permanent transformations. Similar to the medieval manuscripts, these devotional travelogues instrumentalised image-and-text to root the journey in a sacred topography, while shielding its surface from various forms of political and economic exploitation.

Following this lineage of devotional travelogues extending from the nineteenth to the twentieth centuries, the photographic project presented below is conceptualised as a travelogue for virtual pilgrimage to Jerusalem. This project, however, is not only the physical place in
Palestine, but the one enacted and adapted across the West as an idea and an orientation, using analogical thinking and theatrical staging. Entitled 'The Stations of the Cross, the project learns from the affective representational techniques explored above by juxtaposing image and text as parallel modes of representation. Rather than using illustrations or images of the Holy Land, like in the canonical Stations of the Cross that have been studied in this dissertation, it is composed of photographs of sites both in Jerusalem and outside of it. Instead of scriptural verses, prayers, instructions, or descriptions, it includes first-hand experiences of past pilgrims to Jerusalem. The text does not provide illustrative captions for the photographs or an explanation of the sights, but the reactions, disappointments, meditations, and subjective interpretations of the journey and its topography by pilgrims. By reading these excerpts alongside the photographs of Jerusalem's alternatives, one may consider the tension between the real and imagined Jerusalem, the sign, signified, and dislocation of collective memory.

**THE IMAGE AND THE CAPTION**

The choice of format for this project is lead not only with the historic research on virtual pilgrim guides, but is set within the theoretical framework proposed by theorist and photographer Allan Sekula. In his polemic response to the New Topographics exhibition (in particular the depictions of industrial warehouses by Lewis Baltz 12), Sekula argued that photography cannot remain as sparsely-captioned images on the gallery wall, and that text should be used to “anchor, contradict, reinforce, subvert, complement, particularize, or go beyond the meanings offered by the images themselves.” In the context of 1970s America, when photography was gaining currency as an autonomous artistic practice, Sekula worked to reclaim the medium's utilitarian origins and formulate an alternative practice by rethinking the relationship between image and text. His first major project, *Aerospace Folktales* (1973), follows the life of a middle-class family in Southern California after the father had lost his job as an aerospace engineer at Lockheed. Sekula photographs this prototypical family in and around their Los Angeles apartment as they go about their daily lives: the children read or play, the mother is mostly in the kitchen, and the father, coping with his new status as an unemployed white-collar professional, attempts to fix household appliances while applying for new jobs. Initially composed of 142 photographs, text cards, and a sound installation, *Aerospace Juxtaposes signs of everyday domesticity with behind-the-scenes details of his photographic process and anecdotes from the mechanism of family life. The novelty of *Aerospace* is not the subject matter per se—similar subjects had been documented by Stephen Shore and Robert Adams—rather, Sekula is distinguished by his choice not to distance himself from the critique of the disintegration of the American dream. In a surprise shift from observational to autobiographical, we discover that the unemployed engineer is in fact Sekula's father. Sekula thus presents a practice-based resistance to the modernist autonomy of the image, which viewed documental photography not as a utilitarian carrier of information, but as a means to rethink the relationship between image and text.

In a similar approach, *The Stations of the Cross* embraces this critique, and follows Sekula’s assertion that the photographer bears the responsibility to supplement the visual content with textual context.

Other combinations of text and image that inspired the Stations can be found in the works of artists Robert Smithson and Dan Graham. In 1967, Smithson travelled from New York City to his hometown in New Jersey with a notebook and a cheap camera. Traveling on foot, Smithson stops to photograph the entropic landscape of the Passaic River which he ironically (or perhaps poetically) captions as monuments: the pipes dumping polluted liquids into the river are entitiled the Fountain Monument, and a floating pumping derrick is simply Monument with Pontoon. When Smithson asks if “Passaic has replaced Rome as the eternal city,” he is questioning not only the idea of monuments as sites of collective memory, but the very essence of recollection as it could be represented photographically. His first major project, *Aerospace Folktales* (1973), follows the life of a middle-class family in Southern California after the father had lost his job as an aerospace engineer at Lockheed. Sekula photographs this prototypical family in and around their Los Angeles apartment as they go about their daily lives: the children read or play, the mother is mostly in the kitchen, and the father, coping with his new status as an unemployed white-collar professional, attempts to fix household appliances while applying for new jobs. Initially composed of 142 photographs, text cards, and a sound installation, *Aerospace Folktales* captures these details of family life with behind-the-scenes details of his photographic process and anecdotes from the mechanism of family life. The novelty of *Aerospace* is not the subject matter per se—similar subjects had been documented by Stephen Shore and Robert Adams—rather, Sekula is distinguished by his choice not to distance himself from the critique of the modernist American dream. In a surprise shift from observational to autobiographical, we discover that the unemployed engineer is in fact Sekula's father. Sekula thus presents a practice-based resistance to the modernist autonomy of the image, which viewed documental photography not as a utilitarian carrier of information, but as a means to rethink the relationship between image and text.

In a similar approach, *The Stations of the Cross* embraces this critique, and follows Sekula’s assertion that the photographer bears the responsibility to supplement the visual content with textual context. Other combinations of text and image that inspired the Stations can be found in the works of artists Robert Smithson and Dan Graham. In 1967, Smithson travelled from New York City to his hometown in New Jersey with a notebook and a cheap camera. Traveling on foot, Smithson stops to photograph the entropic landscape of the Passaic River which he ironically (or perhaps poetically) captions as monuments: the pipes dumping polluted liquids into the river are entitled the Fountain Monument, and a floating pumping derrick is simply Monument with Pontoon. When Smithson asks if “Passaic has replaced Rome as the eternal city,” he is questioning not only the idea of monuments as sites of collective memory, but the very essence of recollection as it could be represented photographically.
of suburbanized Los Angeles with a mix of attraction and repulsion, compelling his audience to perceive the spatial experience of the city with a detached estrangement.

Despite their different approaches to text, salience, and image sequences, these photographers were all meandering across America's roads and cities with a camera, performing what can be described as a secular pilgrimage. The photograph, like the station, was thus an index of the ritual subject matter and more the action itself. In 1972, Ruscha said, “Sometimes the ugliest things have the most potential. I truly enjoyed the whole journey and repulsion, compelling his audience to perceive the spatial experience of the city with a detached estrangement.

of suburbanised Los Angeles with a mix of attraction and repulsion, compelling his audience to perceive the spatial experience of the city with a detached estrangement.

Despite their different approaches to text, salience, and image sequences, these photographers were all meandering across America's roads and cities with a camera, performing what can be described as a secular pilgrimage. The photograph, like the station, was thus an index of the ritual subject matter and more the action itself. In 1972, Ruscha said, “Sometimes the ugliest things have the most potential. I truly enjoyed the whole afternoon while I shot these pictures. It's a great feeling to be on self-assignment, out looking for subjects. I went off in the car and I went down to these little towns, to Santa Ana, Downey, places like that. I was excited at the same time that I was repulsed by the whole thing." Ruscha had a key influence on the New Topographics exhibition, whose influence on this thesis is elaborated on in the introduction. For Balz, discovering his books was finding “photography degree zero”—in fact, he said that “Ruscha was the presiding spirit over the whole show, because we all knew those books, and we all admired them.” The legacy of Ruscha's photography outlined above inspired the New Topographics within it. Comprising 87 photographs of America's topographies of desolation resurrected the wandering foreigner who opts out of society in favour of a self-imposed exile.

As an alternative to the Via Crucis, this travelogue unfolds across a non-linear journey, without a clear geographical path, a historical lineage, or even a typological logic, but rather through nuanced associations. This mode of traveling requires no means. It costs nothing; traveling requires no means. It costs nothing; traveling requires no means. It costs nothing; traveling requires no means. It costs nothing; traveling requires no means.

There are no alms distributed or indulgences required. As an alternative to the Via Crucis, this travelogue unfolds across a non-linear journey, without a clear geographical path, a historical lineage, or even a typological logic, but rather through nuanced associations. This mode of traveling requires no means. It costs nothing; traveling requires no means. It costs nothing; traveling requires no means. It costs nothing; traveling requires no means.

stations along the journey are equally worthy of meditation, thus removing the sacro-geographic hierarchy introduced by institutions. Evans's radical photobook thus becomes the model for The Stations of the Cross, where every photograph carries the same amount of visual information: there is no progression of emotion or topographic escalation, but a steady journey towards a destination. The composition of the frames in the Stations echoes this assertion, as each monument is approached laterally, incorporating the path and landscape as equally valuable in the spatial envelope of the station, thus blurring topographic figure and ground. Images are organized in pairs that share superficial and structural analogies, and are complemented with a parallel stream of textual descriptions from pilgrim travelogues that open a field of associations and interpretations.

Ruscha's influence is profound throughout the exhibition, which is structured around a sequence of images that share superficial and structural analogies, and are complemented with a parallel stream of textual descriptions from pilgrim travelogues that open a field of associations and interpretations.
also travel writing, as a genre tainted with cultural bias and bound with colonial violence. The Stations does not attempt to demarcate a foreign territory, cast subjective judgment, or ‘write-out’ a disenchanted encounter.

One might argue that the possibilities provided by digital platforms make such projects redundant. Religious services are available on-demand, virtual experiences dissolve geographical boundaries, and the infinite stream of visual content relieves any need for mental imagination. As such, the labour that was invested in such rituals is no longer relevant. Pilgrimage ceases to disrupt one’s daily life: something which once signalled a complete break from routine disintegrates from an anti-structure back to structure. If Christ is indeed found within oneself, perhaps a retreat from the public realm and the removal of ritualistic interruption will mark not the end, but the beginning of an old-new mode of devotion that is practised with one’s own confines. However, as things stand today, this seems far from possible: the sedentary pilgrimages of the Middle Ages were exhausting undertakings, requiring intense physical, emotional, and mental labour. The nuns who created life-size dioramas within their monastic cells performed rituals that stabilised their lives in times of uncertainty and confinement. By repeating a set of prayers and actions, they could find a fleeting detachment from themselves in favour of a greater system of order.

If Christ is indeed found within oneself, perhaps a retreat from the public realm and the removal of ritualistic interruption will mark not the end, but the beginning of an old-new mode of devotion that is practised with one’s own confines. However, as things stand today, this seems far from possible: the sedentary pilgrimages of the Middle Ages were exhausting undertakings, requiring intense physical, emotional, and mental labour. The nuns who created life-size dioramas within their monastic cells performed rituals that stabilised their lives in times of uncertainty and confinement. By repeating a set of prayers and actions, they could find a fleeting detachment from themselves in favour of a greater system of order.

Today, virtual experiences that offer remote travel are mere simulations: they create visual shortcuts to cathartic endings, which fail to move us to the emotional depths once experienced in sedentary pilgrimage. While technology does offer comfort and security—negating the disturbance caused by rituals—it nonetheless erodes whatever is left of our ability to imagine. As Byung-Chul Han argues in The Disappearance of Ritual (2009), “perception is never at rest; it has lost the capacity to linger. The cultural technique of deep attention emerged precisely out of ritual and religious practices [...] Every religious practice is an exercise in attention.” When rituals no longer require investment, distraction takes command, and they lose their stabilising power. The Stations propose an exercise of attention, setting off from within one’s room and meandering between images and text of travellers’ past, and thus constructing a topography that merges movement, sentiment, and space into a mode of analogical travel—one that does not fix the course of movement, but simply provides an orientation: towards Jerusalem. As Xavier de Maistre wrote in Journey Around My Room:

Read if I have undertaken and performed a forty-two days’ journey round my room [...] the pleasure to be found in travelling round one’s room is sheltered from the restless jealousy of men, and is independent of fortune. [...] Every man of sense will, I am sure, adopt my system, whatever may be his peculiar character or temperament. Be he miserly or prodigal, rich or poor, young or old, born beneath the torrid zone or near the poles, he may travel with me. Among the immense family of men who throng the earth, there is not one, no, not one (I mean of those who inhabit rooms), who, after reading this book, can refuse his approbation of the new mode of travelling I introduce into the world.
The men I met coming from Jerusalem reported all sorts of contradictory impressions; and yet my own impression contradicted them all. Their impressions were doubtless as true as mine; but I describe my own because it is true, and because I think it points to a neglected truth about the real Jerusalem. I need not say I did not expect the real Jerusalem to be the New Jerusalem; a city of charity and peace, any more than a city of chrysolite and pearl.

I might more reasonably have expected an austere and ascetic place, oppressed with the weight of its destiny, with no inns except monasteries, and these sealed with the terrible silence of the Trappists; an awful city where men speak by signs in the street.

I did not need the numberless jokes about Jerusalem to-day, to warn me against expecting this; anyhow I did not expect it, and certainly I did not find it. But neither did I find what I was much more inclined to expect; something at the other extreme. There may be more of this in the place than pleases those who would idealise it. But I fancy there is much less of it than is commonly supposed in the reaction from such an ideal.
Here you see the cause of all our labours. This Jerusalem is the reflection of the heavenly Jerusalem. This city has the form of the city to which we aspire. This Jerusalem you see, which you face, prefigures and represents the heavenly city.
Then indeed I knew that what I saw was Jerusalem of the Crusaders; or at least Jerusalem of the Crusades. It was a medieval town, with walls and gates and a citadel, and built upon a hill to be defended by bowmen. The walls and gates which now stand, whatever stood before them and whatever comes after them, carry a memory of those men from the West who came here upon that wild adventure, who climbed this rock and clung to it so perilously from the victory of Godfrey to the victory of Saladin; and that is why this momentary Eastern exile reminded me so strangely of home.

When we had finished our prayer we remounted our asses, having our eyes full of tears and our cheeks wet with joy. This joy did not arise from passion, but from reason; not from the presence of an object of desire, but of a thing deserving of love because it was precious: it was not gladness which leads to licentiousness, but rather to seriousness; which moves one not to laughter, but rather to sobs; which does not shake the body, but bends the limbs; does not lead to speech, but to silence.
My impression remained primarily a thing of walls and gates; a thing which the modern world does not perhaps understand so well as the medieval world. There is involved in it all that idea of definition which those who do not like it are fond of describing as dogma. A wall is like rule; and the gates are like the exceptions that prove the rule. The man making it has to decide where his rule will run and where his exception shall stand. He cannot have a city that is all gates any more than a house that is all windows; nor is it possible to have a law that consists entirely of liberties. The ancient races and religions that contended for this city agreed with each other in this, when they differed about everything else. It was true of practically all of them that when they built a city they built a citadel. That is, whatever strange thing they may have made, they regarded it as something to be defined and to be defended.
I had thought of that moment for years, in waking and in sleeping
dreams... I stood in the road, my hand on my horse's neck, and
with my dim eyes sought to trace the outlines of the holy places
which I had long before fixed in my mind. The more I gazed, the
more I could not see.
As I have said, I had expected many things of Jerusalem, but I had not expected this. I had expected to be disappointed with it as a place utterly profaned and fallen below its mission. I had expected to be awed by it; indeed I had expected to be frightened of it, as a place dedicated and even doomed by its mission. But I had never fancied that it would be possible to be fond of it, as one might be fond of a little walled town among the orchards of Normandy or the hop-fields of Kent.

So far as I can recall them, my impressions, though aesthetically and architecturally better founded, resume what we felt seven years ago: firstly, that the faking of the sites and indignity with which even when authentic they are now misrepresented, is an irritation, an imposition, and an affront to the intelligence; secondly, that the pathos, grandeur and nobility of the ancient City of the Heart easily countervails these very real annoyances.
I can understand a man who had only seen in the distance Jerusalem sitting on the hill going no further and keeping that vision for ever. It would, of course, be said that it was absurd to come at all, and to see so little. To which I answer that in that sense it is absurd to come at all. It is no more fantastic to turn back for such a fancy than it was to come for a similar fancy. A man cannot eat the Pyramids; he cannot buy or sell the Holy City; there can be no practical aspect either of his coming or going. If he has not come for a poetic mood he has come for nothing; if he has come for such a mood, he is not a fool to obey that mood. The way to be really a fool is to try to be practical about unpractical things. It is to try to collect clouds or preserve moonshine like money. [...] It may be argued that it is just as illogical to hope to fix beforehand the elusive effects of the works of man as of the works of nature. It may be called a contradiction in terms to expect the unexpected. It may be counted mere madness to anticipate astonishment, or go in search of a surprise. To all of which there is only one answer; that such anticipation is absurd, and such realisation will be disappointing, that images will seem to be idols and idols will seem to be dolls, unless there be some rudiment of such a habit of mind as I have tried to suggest in this chapter. No great works will seem great, and no wonders of the world will seem wonderful, unless the angle from which they are seen is that of historical humility.
Forsake cities and their crowds. Live on a small patch of ground, seek Christ in solitude, pray on the mount alone with Jesus, keep near to holy places: keep out of cities, I say, and you will never lose your vocation.

All this historic or pre-historic interest may be touched on in its turn; but I am not dealing here with the historic secrets unearthed by the study of the place, but with the historic associations aroused by the sight of it. The traveller is in the position of that famous fantastic who tied his horse to a wayside cross in the snow, and afterward saw it dangling from the church-spire of what had been a buried city. I do not forget, of course, that all these visible walls and towers are but the battlements and pinnacles of a buried city, or of many buried cities. I do not forget that such buildings have foundations that are to us almost like fossils; the gigantic fossils of some other geological epoch. Something may be said later of those lost empires whose very masterpieces are to us like petrified monsters.
All the religious rubbish of the different nations, says a recent traveller, live at Jerusalem separated from each other, hostile and jealous, a nomad population [...] Jerusalem is but a place where everyone arrives to pitch his tent and where nobody remains.
A city that is set upon a hill cannot be hid; but it is more strange when the hill cannot anywhere be hid, even from the citizen in the city.
Palestine is a striped country; that is the first effect of landscape on the eye. It runs in great parallel lines wavering into vast hills and valleys, but preserving the parallel pattern; as if drawn boldly but accurately with gigantic chalks of green and grey and red and yellow. The natural explanation or (to speak less foolishly) the natural process of this is simple enough. The stripes are the strata of the rock, only they are stripped by the great rains, so that everything has to grow on ledges, repeating yet again that terraced character to be seen in the vineyards and the staircase streets of the town.

And all these coloured strata rise so high and roll so far that they might be skies rather than slopes. It is as if we looked up at a frozen sunset; or a daybreak fixed forever with its fleeting bars of cloud. And indeed the fancy is not without a symbolic suggestiveness. This is the land of eternal things; but we tend too much to forget that recurrent things are eternal things. We tend to forget that subtle tones and delicate hues, whether in the hills or the heavens, were to the primitive poets and sages as visible as they are to us. The sorrow of all Palestine is that its divisions in culture, politics and theology are like its divisions in geology. The dividing line is horizontal instead of vertical. The frontier does not run between states but between stratified layers. The Jew did not appear beside the Canaanite but on top of the Canaanite; the Greek not beside the Jew but on top of the Jew; the Moslem not beside the Christian but on top of the Christian. It is not merely a house divided against itself, but one divided across itself.
X

Left: Church of the Holy Sepulchre (ca. 12th Century), Basilica of Santo Stefano, Bologna, Italy
Right: Station IV, Sacro Monte di Crea (1889) Piemonte, Italy
Text: St Jerome letter 53 to Paulinus CA 395 AD

XI

Left: Station XIV, Sacro Monte di Orta (1583) Piemonte, Italy
Right: Temple Church of the Knights Templars (1185 AD) Inns of Court, City of London, United Kingdom

XII

Left: Tomb of Abshalom, son of King Solomon (1st Century AD) Valley of Kidron, Jerusalem
Right: The Holy Sepulchre (Round Church) of Cambridge (1284) Cambridge, England
Text: Marx, Karl, New York Tribune (New York), April, 15, 1854

XIII

Left: Mark of the Via Francigena, St. Bernard's Pass, Aosta Valley, Italy/Switzerland
Right: Station II, Via Dolorosa, Jerusalem

XIV

Left: Station V, Adam Kraft's Stations of the Cross (1490) Nuremberg, Germany
Right: Station I, Via Crucis of Tre Cunei, (date unknown) Piemonte, Italy
CHAPTER FOUR

15. Drawing of the rampart walk ca. 1910, showing the measured wound of Christ (interpreted in a world image design 1953), with a textual description of the associated indigenous right. Source: Bibliothecae Alberti I, Ms. 6639-70, in Rudy, Kathy, Images and Imagery in late Medieval English Manuscripts, London, Brill, 2017.


17. Sheler Khalifa, Yad Idris-1, Jerusalem, the Rampart walls, ca. 1910, source: American Colony (Jerusalem), Photo Department.

18. Drawing of the rampart walk, ca. 1910, source: American Colony (Jerusalem), Photo Department.


20. “At the Jewish gate, looking towards the city,” below: “the same, as suggested when the unelicated observations that hide the wall are cleared away” in Ashbee, Charles Robert, ed., Jerusalem, 1936-1950, being the record of the pro-Jerusalem council during the period of the British military administration (London: Murray, 1921), figures 44, 45.


24. Damascus gate in 2020, photo by the author.

25. Jerusalem, looking towards Jerusalem, photo by the author.


27. The original tomb in Jerusalem. Photo by the author.

28. State visit to Jerusalem of Wilhelm II of Germany, 1918–1920, being a history of the pro-Jerusalem council during the period of the British military administration (London: Murray, 1921).

29. A view inside the Old City between 1900-1914; showing the filled in site through the tunnel which was built into the rampart walk in the time of the British military administration around 1910. Source: Library of Congress / American Colony, Jerusalem.

30. A view inside the Old City between 1900-1914; showing the filled in site through the tunnel which was built into the rampart walk in the time of the British military administration around 1910. Source: Library of Congress / American Colony, Jerusalem.


32. The camp set up by Thomas Cook for the state visit of the German Emperor Wilhelm II in 1898, visiting Tomb of Kings. Source: Library of Congress.

33. Excavations on Ophel, showing rock-hewn steps and foundations of a tower in Siloam (ca. 1000 BC), American Colony Photo Department / Library of Congress.

34. Jaffa Gate ca. 1910, with the Ottoman clocktower visible, as well as other shops, stalls and carriages bringing pilgrims from the Port of Jaffa. Source: Israel Antiquities Authority.


38. Damascus gate in 2020, photo by the author.


40. Jerusalem, looking towards Jerusalem, photo by the author.


42. The original tomb in Jerusalem. Photo by the author.


44. The rampart walls, ca. 1910, source: American Colony (Jerusalem), Photo Department.

45. “Modern squatter settlement that the inclosure is clearing” below: New Plan of the Rampart Wall in Jerusalem, Charles Robert, ed., Jerusalem, 1929-1930, being the record of the pro-Jerusalem council during the period of the British military administration (London: Murray, 1921).


47. Dramatic photograph of the rampart walk in Jerusalem, photo by the author.

48. “At the Jewish gate, looking towards the city,” below: “the same, as suggested when the unelicated observations that hide the wall are cleared away” in Ashbee, Charles Robert, ed., Jerusalem, 1936-1950, being the record of the pro-Jerusalem council during the period of the British military administration (London: Murray, 1921), figures 44, 45.


50. Jerusalem, the Library of Congress.

51. Jerusalem, the Library of Congress.

52. Damascus gate in 2020, photo by the author.

53. Jerusalem, looking towards the city, photo by the author.

54. “At the Jewish gate, looking towards the city,” below: “the same, as suggested when the unelicated observations that hide the wall are cleared away” in Ashbee, Charles Robert, ed., Jerusalem, 1936-1950, being the record of the pro-Jerusalem council during the period of the British military administration (London: Murray, 1921), figures 44, 45.


57. Damascus gate in 2020, photo by the author.

58. Jerusalem, looking towards Jerusalem, photo by the author.
