TOWARDS JERUSALEM: THE ARCHITECTURE OF PILGRIMAGE

City/Architecture PhD by Design Program
Architectural Association School of Architecture
Director of Studies: Dr. Pier Vittorio Aureli | Supervisor: Dr. Maria Shéhérazade Giudici

Candidate: Gili Merin
INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER ONE

THE INVENTION OF THE HOLY LAND

PILGRIMAGE AND THE CHRISTIAN APPROPRIATION OF JERUSALEM

CHAPTER TWO

THE BASILICA AND THE ROTUNDA

THE CONCEPT OF ANALOGY AND THE RISE OF URBAN PILGRIMAGE IN MEDIEVAL EUROPE

CHAPTER THREE

STATION TO STATION

THEATRICALITY AND DISCIPLINE OF THE VIA CRUCIS IN THE SACRED MOUNTAIN OF VARALLO

CHAPTER FOUR

THE INNOCENTS ABROAD

VALORISING MONUMENTS, COMMODIFYING PILGRIMAGE

CHAPTER FIVE

THE STATIONS OF THE CROSS

PHOTOGRAPHIC TRAVELOGUE

BIBLIOGRAPHY
This dissertation would not have been possible without the continuous and unconditional support and care of my supervisors, Pier Vittorio Aureli and Maria Shéhérazade Giudici. I would like to thank my peers, Brendon Carlin and Enrica Manneli, for their companionship and constant feedback regarding my work, and to the talented Michal Sahar and Tamar Shafrir whose careful edits and design gave form to this final work. To Daniel Tchetchik and Andrew Meredith for their contribution of photographic tools and knowledge and to Beatriz Flora from the AA library who laboured to get a hold of every book I needed for this research. To my fellow-pilgrim, Diana Ibáñez López, who had joined me (both physically and virtually) on many of these journeys, and was a constant source of new sites, books, and ideas. Finally, I would like to acknowledge Zvi Efrat, whose consistent mentorship had shaped my ideas and practice.

This dissertation is dedicated to the quintessential traveller, my mother, Ora Merin.
INTRODUCTION

Suspended between heaven and earth, Jerusalem is not just a site—but an orientation. Occupying a place in the geographic subconscious of Western culture, its name is evoked in poetry and dedications of cities, its soil covers the floors of chapels, rocks collected from its ground are used as foundation stones for towns, and relics of those who lived and died there are enshrined in the world’s most visited sites. Despite this undeniable influence, this thesis strays away from such symbolic toponymy or literal displacement of fragments, and opts instead to focus on the spatial translation of Jerusalem in order to appropriate its sanctity. It considers issues of ritual, representation, topography, and memory in order to explore how the idea of Jerusalem has articulated the human relationship with the sacred. Specifically, it focuses on a particular praxis that has mobilised the aura of the Holy City for millennia—pilgrimage. Studying this phenomenon reveals that, despite its temporal characteristic, pilgrimage is a powerful vector that often destabilizes the civic, economic, and political conditions of the places that cross its path. This means that while pilgrims move with a clear sense of religious orientation, their mental- ity is often hijacked by institutions of power that wish to exploit their subjectivity for their own gain. The manipulation of spiritual will into spatial form results in the production of structures, landscapes, and representations that I refer to as the Architecture of Pilgrimage.

Before exploring the themes and case studies of this thesis, it is important to state the obvious: pilgrimage did not begin in Jerusalem; it is a phenomenon that maintains continuity from antiquity until today.1 Anthropologist Simon Coleman argues that any attempt to define pilgrimage is futile, as the conditions that influence its character—namely systems of movement and modes of spirituality—are perpetually in a state of flux.2 As such, pilgrimage spans fields of scholarship in which the discussion is often not about pilgrimage but rather about the lens through which it is understood: themes such as ritual and faith, subjectivity and identity, historical geography and archaeology, and, in this thesis, the architecture and landscape.3 Amongst the various attempts by theorists to define pilgrimage, there are several similarities and contradictions that are relevant for this discussion. The Oxford Dictionary provides a rather loose definition: pilgrimage is “a journey to a place of particular interest or significance,” while another source claims, with somewhat more precision, that “pilgrimage implies a journey by a devotee in pursuance of a primarily religious objective.” Anthropologist Matthew Dillon suggests that the pilgrim’s goal is not to visit a place of interest nor to satisfy a religious objective; rather, what is at stake in pilgrimage is the very first act of detachment, of “paying a visit to a sacred site outside the boundaries of one’s own physical environment.” Indeed, as in any ritual, a crucial aspect of the pilgrim’s journey is the disturbance caused to daily life: a break from ties of kinship and domestic labour.4 By disengaging from these structures (and replacing one ritual for another), the pilgrim enters a state of anti-structure, becoming a subject driven by a crystallised sense of purpose, intention, and orientation. This places the pilgrim as a stranger in his or her travels, true to the etymological origin of pilgrimage from the Latin proximum, or foreigner.

During this phase—defined by Victor and Edith Turner as liminal—the pilgrim develops a heightened mode of perception, as he or she becomes susceptible to new concepts and becomes acutely aware of the sensory details of their surroundings. Due to this receptive intensity during the pilgrim’s liminal stage, the thesis places particular emphasis on the envoiages written by pilgrims on their journeys. A neologism of travel and monologue, a travelogue is a form of writing that is between a survey and a diary; it implies being physically on the journey while also claiming a particular agency of personal interpretation and representation. This travelogue is written within a particular timeframe in a pilgrim’s life, what Turner defines as being out of time—beyond or outside the time which measures secular process and routine.5 In From Ritual to Theatre (1982), Turner cites Arnold van Gennep’s Rites of Passage (1908) in defining the three phases of separation, transition and incorporation. At the initial stage of separation, the pilgrim is detached from daily life while entering into “a new state or condition.”6 In the next stage, the transition, the pilgrim enters an ambiguous stage of liminal nature where new social rules and rituals can be assumed. It is during this phase, I argue, that pilgrims document their
within this anthropological framework, scriptural a poem tells of the protective god of the city of Ur, locations of human settlement. In Mesopotamia, domestic realm into foreign territory, we can because they not only expose the condition of travelogues and their topographic reading are understood as the spatial envelope of pilgrimage, urban spaces, and the rituals of those encoun- and monuments, but also of natural landscapes, tered within them: in a word, the topography of their journey. This topographic understand- ing of their journey is crucial for the thesis: it is understood as the spatial envelope of pilgrimage, found in the scale between buildings and places. Travelers and their topographic reading are thus in a key in this study of the travelogues project, because they not only exclude the condition of the pilgrim’s journey and places of worship but also continually rebuild the history of pilgrimage through their memory and local appropriation of the land by its traveler.

memory, script, and place

The history of pilgrimage is almost as fickle as the phenomenon itself. Using the criteria that pilgrimage includes a journey from one’s own domestic environment to an unknown location, we can conclude that its earliest possible origins would coincide with the establishment of sedentary locations of human settlement. In Mesopotamia, a people of the region of the city of Ur, who journeyed 500 miles to visit another god, his father Enil. Pilgrimage in the first and second millennium BC was often part of festivals that included a main event of people, such as the New Kingdom’s festival of Osiris in Abydos, or the Hittite celebrations in Anatolia, which revolved around the movement of the royal family between sanctuaries.

beginning in antiquity, anthropologists divide pilgrimage into typological categories: devotional pilgrimages, whose goal is to encounter and worship a deity, and historical pilgrimages, who hope to achieve a finite and palpable goal, such as healing; mandatory pilgrimages, who observe cyclical patterns of life events; ethnic pilgrimages, who visit shrines dedicated to pilgrims, who undergo a rite of passage in order to return to the community as transformed members. Within this anthropological framework, scriptural

pilgrimage—which is the focus of this thesis—is understood as travelling to the places mentioned in a religious text. This category includes the three aspects as icons of the book: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam.

Pilgrimage in Judaism is initiated by King Solomon, son of David, upon the erection of the Temple in 587 BC. They did not follow the annual visits to Jerusalem, each marking both a historical event of the Jewish faith and a new agricultural season. Celebrations took place in particular during the Temple’s dedication. The Torah, which was constructed as a sequence of vestibules and chambers that created a processional hierar- chy of profane and sacred enclosures. Due to its 17th dynasty and as a global shrine for the entire Israelite nation, it was attended by ordained priests (Cohen or Lev) who performed prayers and animal sacrifice. These massive gatherings may have impressed the Egyptian pharaoh on the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as

pilgrimage—this is the focus of this thesis—is understood as travelling to the places mentioned in a religious text. This category includes the three aspects as icons of the book: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam.

Pilgrimage in Judaism is initiated by King Solomon, son of David, upon the erection of the Temple in 587 BC. They did not follow the annual visits to Jerusalem, each marking both a historical event of the Jewish faith and a new agricultural season. Celebrations took place in particular during the Temple’s dedication. The Torah, which was constructed as a sequence of vestibules and chambers that created a processional hierar- chy of profane and sacred enclosures. Due to its 17th dynasty and as a global shrine for the entire Israelite nation, it was attended by ordained priests (Cohen or Lev) who performed prayers and animal sacrifice. These massive gatherings may have impressed the Egyptian pharaoh on the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as

pilgrimage—this is the focus of this thesis—is understood as travelling to the places mentioned in a religious text. This category includes the three aspects as icons of the book: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam.

Pilgrimage in Judaism is initiated by King Solomon, son of David, upon the erection of the Temple in 587 BC. They did not follow the annual visits to Jerusalem, each marking both a historical event of the Jewish faith and a new agricultural season. Celebrations took place in particular during the Temple’s dedication. The Torah, which was constructed as a sequence of vestibules and chambers that created a processional hierar- chy of profane and sacred enclosures. Due to its 17th dynasty and as a global shrine for the entire Israelite nation, it was attended by ordained priests (Cohen or Lev) who performed prayers and animal sacrifice. These massive gatherings may have impressed the Egyptian pharaoh on the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as

pilgrimage—this is the focus of this thesis—is understood as travelling to the places mentioned in a religious text. This category includes the three aspects as icons of the book: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam.

Pilgrimage in Judaism is initiated by King Solomon, son of David, upon the erection of the Temple in 587 BC. They did not follow the annual visits to Jerusalem, each marking both a historical event of the Jewish faith and a new agricultural season. Celebrations took place in particular during the Temple’s dedication. The Torah, which was constructed as a sequence of vestibules and chambers that created a processional hierar- chy of profane and sacred enclosures. Due to its 17th dynasty and as a global shrine for the entire Israelite nation, it was attended by ordained priests (Cohen or Lev) who performed prayers and animal sacrifice. These massive gatherings may have impressed the Egyptian pharaoh on the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as

pilgrimage—this is the focus of this thesis—is understood as travelling to the places mentioned in a religious text. This category includes the three aspects as icons of the book: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam.

Pilgrimage in Judaism is initiated by King Solomon, son of David, upon the erection of the Temple in 587 BC. They did not follow the annual visits to Jerusalem, each marking both a historical event of the Jewish faith and a new agricultural season. Celebrations took place in particular during the Temple’s dedication. The Torah, which was constructed as a sequence of vestibules and chambers that created a processional hierar- chy of profane and sacred enclosures. Due to its 17th dynasty and as a global shrine for the entire Israelite nation, it was attended by ordained priests (Cohen or Lev) who performed prayers and animal sacrifice. These massive gatherings may have impressed the Egyptian pharaoh on the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”, where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as

pilgrimage—this is the focus of this thesis—is understood as travelling to the places mentioned in a religious text. This category includes the three aspects as icons of the book: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam.

Pilgrimage in Judaism is initiated by King Solomon, son of David, upon the erection of the Temple in 587 BC. They did not follow the annual visits to Jerusalem, each marking both a historical event of the Jewish faith and a new agricultural season. Celebrations took place in particular during the Temple’s dedication. The Torah, which was constructed as a sequence of vestibules and chambers that created a processional hierar- chy of profane and sacred enclosures. Due to its 17th dynasty and as a global shrine for the entire Israelite nation, it was attended by ordained priests (Cohen or Lev) who performed prayers and animal sacrifice. These massive gatherings may have impressed the Egyptian pharaoh on the “House God”， where a series of rituals (known as
through tangible recollection. Collective memory and monuments thus go hand in hand: they are used by those in power in a continuous process of invention and localisation of certain symbols. This process will group the unity and continuity. Their visibility and affectivity provide proof that the past is not just a series of ordinary events occurring in nondescript places, but was meaningfully spatio-temporally organized in order to facilitate the transfer of Jerusalem's typological, structural, and topographical attributes beyond its physical boundaries and onto other Jews in Europe.

While the translation of the emblematic city was celebrated and commoditized in physical form.

Scriptural pilgrimage in Christianity can thus be defined as the travel to monuments that commemorate biblically of this narrative, to unfold collective memories. As a constellation of sacred sites, these mnemonic markers demarcate a territory that has come to be known as the Holy Land. This sacred topography is composed of biblical cities like Jerusalem, Bethlehem, and Capernaum, and natural sites such as the Jordan River, Mount Tabor, or the Valley of Elah. The land was thus made holy as an accumulation of sites invested with scriptural affiliations. This is crucial for this thesis, since shrines such as those found in Rome or Compostela, despite their religious significance for Christian memory, are products of the cults of relic and martyr veneration after centuries of the canonisation of the Bible, and are therefore excluded (in the context of this research) as sites of scriptural pilgrimage. Thus, this thesis focuses on Christian pilgrimage to Jerusalem in necessary in order to explore the connection between script, memory, and architecture. As this thesis will show, this connection has the power to disrupt the hierarchical ordering of the hierarchies by channeling the movement of people, power, and capital. As such, the thesis wishes not to study the occurrence of monuments as nodes of Christian pilgrimage but also to understand this phenomenon through a modern lens: that is, their subjugation to the cult of heritage, where the past is being continuously exploited for economic and political gain.

**IMAGE AND PILGRIMAGE**

While script plays a crucial role in the history of Jerusalem pilgrimage, it nevertheless remains subject to the regime of visual perception. Unlike the Jewish or Islamic religions, Christianity (particularly the Roman Latin Church) instrumentalised religious art as the bridge between the visible and the invisible. Catholicism’s reliance on the agency of visual representations has been both its strength and its weakness; it allowed the Church to expand its power amongst the literate crowds of pre-Reformation Europe, while after 1557 it led to recurring attacks and finally to the purge of these images as instruments of idolatrous worship. This thesis studies the use of visual representation in theological art and acknowledges its centrality to the phenomenon of pilgrimage, as it oscillates between the symbolic element that is contingent on interpretation and religious experience and an aesthetic sensibility that relates to invention and localisation in narrative. This tension will return throughout the thesis by exploring not only the iconographic and stylistic variation of images and sculptures but also the ways in which visual and ritualistic space, in order to facilitate the transfer of Jerusalem’s typological, structural, and topographical attributes beyond its physical boundaries and onto other Jews in Europe.

The chapters of this thesis unfold both in a predominantly Christian society on a city that maintained its own multi-layered religious practices for centuries. The simplification of Jerusalem’s complex religious life in favour of a single Christological order will be explored in Chapter Four. Beginning in the mid-nineteenth century, this ‘soft Crusade’ was led by two new types of pilgrims: travelers, who sought to locate the biblical truth within the ground and abstract the topography of the Holy Land through the regime of property, and tourists, who were led to consume the city’s holy sites as attractions. These new pilgrims transformed Jerusalem into an archaeological landscape where historic monuments are valorised (literally ‘enhanced’) for maximum productivity and profitability within the heritage industry. It is here that the thesis considers issues of sacred topography and pilgrimage in order to formulate a critique of collective memory.

As a counter-project to the valorisation of Jerusalem, the thesis concludes with the design project: a photographic travelogue that constructs an alternative Via Crucis. Using photographs undertaken throughout this thesis, and incredibly affective, these theatres of the Passion caused suspension amongst the critics of the Catholic Church during the Protestant Reformation, in the light of the notion of salvation, retribution, and codification of the stations into a legible path that opted for devotional clarity over theatrical narrativity. The visual oeuvre of Jerusalem into structures, spaces, and landscapes in Europe was far from innocent, it nevertheless marked an incredible moment in the history of architecture: a time when place mattered less and content meant more, and when mnemonic flexibility triumphed over site specificity. These translations were explored in chapters two and three, showcasing how other Jews in Europe captured the idea of being Towards the holy city, manifesting a topographic orientation into spatial and urban form. However, these translations could only last so long as Jerusalem itself remained a distant memorial——as long as its symbolic image was not confronted with its physical condition. Once wars were waged on its sacred territory, it became clear that “even Jerusalem is only a shadow of the heavenly Jerusalem,” in the words of Alexandaries Nagel. Since the real Jerusalem could not rival its own image, it had to be adapted to facilitate the rituals enacted in its analogous surrogates. In other city it was at that point toward the city of Jerusalem was not one-sided, but reversed direction throughout history in a series of spatial manipulations of the Holy City itself, in light of its projection back to the city of Jerusalem.

The thesis concludes on a note of caution, as this thesis has shown, this form of appropriation was inevitably violated; it superseded a spatial order developed in a predominantly Christian society on a city that maintained its own multi-layered religious practices for centuries. The simplification of Jerusalem’s complex religious life in favour of a single Christological order will be explored in Chapter Four. Beginning in the mid-nineteenth century, this ‘soft Crusade’ was led by two new types of pilgrims: travelers, who sought to locate the biblical truth within the ground and abstract the topography of the Holy Land through the regime of property, and tourists, who were led to consume the city’s holy sites as attractions. These new pilgrims transformed Jerusalem into an archaeological landscape where historic monuments are valorised (literally ‘enhanced’) for maximum productivity and profitability within the heritage industry. It is here that the thesis considers issues of sacred topography and pilgrimage in order to formulate a critique of collective memory. As a counter-project to the valorisation of Jerusalem, the thesis concludes with the design project: a photographic travelogue that constructs an alternative Via Crucis. Using photographs undertaken throughout this thesis, and incredibly affective, these theatres of the Passion caused suspension amongst the critics of the Catholic Church during the Protestant Reformation, in the light of the notion of salvation, retribution, and codification of the stations into a legible path that opted for devotional clarity over theatrical narrativity.
The photographers were Robert Adams, Lewis Baltz, Bernd and Hilla Becher, Joel Dever, Frank Gohlke, Nicholas Nixon, John Schott, and Stephen Shore, and the exhibition presented a series of black-and-white photographs that encapsulated the topographic reality of the New Topographics.

In the context of the New Topographics exhibition, Lewis Baltz presented a series of black-and-white photographs that depicted the strips of everyday American parks—floating shops, signs, and buildings—without experiencing it first-hand. This photographic approach implies a physical terrain and a mental state, where real and imaginary elements constitute the sacred topography of pilgrimage, not different from markers, paths, homes, and passers-by.

By adopting the ‘indifferent’ attitude of Baltz, Adams, and Shore, the photographers are my attempt to downplay the monumentality of Jerusalem and break through its spiritual envelope. As a result of four years of fieldwork, these images illustrate the written chapters and comprise the design project of this dissertation. Adopting the temporal and liminality of the on-the-road photographers, these photographs encapsulate both the physical terrain and a mental state, where real and imaginary elements constitute the sacred topography of my own pilgrimage. Thus, this PhD by-design considers this topographic survey as a project, following the genealogy of architect-historians such as Denise Scott Brown and François Chayou who have used photography to observe the built and devise a design methodology through image-making. The results are images that are both the illustration of the historical component of the dissertation and the photographic travelogue that concludes it. By creating this body of work, this thesis will demonstrate that topography is manipulated not only by designation, enclosure, urbanisation, and agricultural improvement, but also through the carving of religious beliefs. Pilgrims—myself amongst them—do not simply cross landscapes; they fabricate topographies through peripatetic rituals that redefine the three-dimensional surface of the earth. The pilgrim’s journey is thus directed by a topographic perception of architecture, landscapes, and representations, rewriting the contained spaces that are delineated by organised structures of power.
only a European invention of an exotic other, but also a method of asserting dominion over the East by describing it through a Western eye. Said’s view that the East is a construct, a phenomenon which includes dozens of immediate impressions of Western travellers to the Holy Land, demonstrating how travelogues reveal the connection between memory, visualisation, and architectural appropriation.

As for the transformations of Jerusalem in the British Mandate, this thesis relies on a wealth of primary sources, such as the work of UNESCO, the Pro Jerusalem Society, the diary of Governor Ronald Storrs and Charles Ashbee, and the plans (both written and drawn) published by Jerusalem architects and urbanists. While this period in the history of Jerusalem has been widely researched, what is novel to this thesis is the consideration of these plans as a landscape project, a hypothesis supported by the example of the renovation of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre.

W.J.T. Mitchell regarding the human perception and manipulation of the natural world. A pivotal figure in the study of Palestinian landscapes is Edward Said, whose book focuses on the abstraction of the Spanish nun Egeria (published in 1971 as Egeria’s Travels to the Holy Land) as an invaluable resource for the first chapter. As a priest working for the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, Egeria’s observations were published as Jesuknow II: Archology as Evidence (1978). A reconstruction of the Holy City during the first century AD composed of archaeological evidence and self-portrait drawings,另一方面, the assertion that the British abstraction of the Holy City has been used for much of the drawings produced for this dissertation.

The first-hand knowledge of Jerusalem during those years was drawn from the primary source of pilgrim’s travelogues to the Holy Land, a genre which had been dramatically revisited by Edward Said in Orientalism. This thesis is primarily concerned with the invasion of political cultures in the context of the British Mandate of Palestine, and argues that architecture serves to naturalise territorial disputes. Zvi Weizman and Ron Heifetz, among notable architects such as Zvi Efrat, Rafi Segal, and Malik Shoshan, have created frameworks through which students of the Eastern Middle East can understand the transformation of the occupation in Palestine in terms of the production of space and manipulation of the land. However, their studies extend only as far back as the period of the British Mandate and do not challenge the notion that the source of the current conflict is the Western infiltration of Palestine in the 1800s by arguing that Jerusalem has been the focus of spatial battles since its very foundation in the second millennium BC. Within this context, the current condition is both another re-configuration of the British Mandate space and power over the sacred places cherished by people of faith. Thus, in Jerusalem, we find the tension between the genuine beliefs of religious subjects and the strategic manipulations of political entities.

In other words, this thesis places today’s condition in the larger context by showing that the current conflict in Jerusalem is yet another manifestation of an idea of power— who controls the infrastructure of ritual and faith—could manipulate people’s spirituality into political gain.

A pivotal framework of this thesis is collective memory. It follows the theory put forth by Halbwachs, while attempting to bring forth a critical reading of the ways in which memory was manipulated. Studying the memorialisation of Jerusalem’s urban space reveals that the heritage project is fraught with artificial constructions, national aspirations, and a selective reading of history that writes-out the existence of those who are excluded from it. This notion is expanded upon in several other chapters by focusing on the ways in which the city itself is the collective memory of its people, arguing that collective memory is in fact a collection of people memories of places and objects within the city. As the thesis argues, collective memory is a commodity that is sold by institutions in order to foster a shared identity within a certain group. Rossi idealised the idea of collective memory as a peaceful agglomeration of cultural artefacts, when reality is that the value of the heritage commodification is built on the extraction of colonial nostalgia, which includes dozens of immediate impressions of Western travellers to the Holy Land, demonstrating how travelogues reveal the connection between memory, visualisation, and architectural appropriation.

Introduction—Towards Jerusalem

Jerusalem has been a focal point of many political conflicts since the formation of the modern Middle East. The city is situated at the crossroads of several civilizations, and has been the site of numerous battles throughout history. The current political division of Jerusalem into the Israeli and Palestinian territories has added to the complexities of the situation.

The city of Jerusalem has a long and rich history, dating back to the time of the ancient Israelites. The city has been home to various civilizations, including the Canaanites, the Philistines, the Babylonians, the Persians, the Greeks, the Romans, the Byzantines, the Crusaders, and the Ottomans. Each of these civilizations has left its mark on the city, shaping its architecture, culture, and society.

The modern history of Jerusalem began with the formation of the modern Middle East in the late 19th century. The city was captured by the Ottoman Turks in 1517, and remained under their control until 1917. During this period, Jerusalem was a major religious and cultural center for the Muslim, Christian, and Jewish communities.

In 1917, the British gained control of Jerusalem as part of their mandate in the region. The British rule was marked by political and social instability, and the city was often the site of violence and conflict. The British mandate ended in 1948, when the city was divided between Israel and Jordan.

In 1967, Israel captured East Jerusalem, leading to a new era of political and social change in the city. The Israeli government has sought to assert its control over the city, and has taken steps to promote Jewish settlement and reduce the influence of the Palestinian population.

The city of Jerusalem is a complex and diverse place, with a rich history and a complex political situation. The current political division of Jerusalem into the Israeli and Palestinian territories has added to the complexities of the situation. The city is home to a diverse population of people of different religions, cultures, and backgrounds, and the political division of the city has had a significant impact on the daily lives of its inhabitants.

In this thesis, I will explore the political and social dimensions of the city of Jerusalem, focusing on the ways in which the city has been used as a commodity by political institutions. I will examine the ways in which the city has been used to promote political agendas, and the impact of these agendas on the daily lives of its inhabitants.

The city of Jerusalem is a complex and diverse place, with a rich history and a complex political situation. The current political division of Jerusalem into the Israeli and Palestinian territories has added to the complexities of the situation. The city is home to a diverse population of people of different religions, cultures, and backgrounds, and the political division of the city has had a significant impact on the daily lives of its inhabitants.

In this thesis, I will explore the political and social dimensions of the city of Jerusalem, focusing on the ways in which the city has been used as a commodity by political institutions. I will examine the ways in which the city has been used to promote political agendas, and the impact of these agendas on the daily lives of its inhabitants.

The city of Jerusalem is a complex and diverse place, with a rich history and a complex political situation. The current political division of Jerusalem into the Israeli and Palestinian territories has added to the complexities of the situation. The city is home to a diverse population of people of different religions, cultures, and backgrounds, and the political division of the city has had a significant impact on the daily lives of its inhabitants.

In this thesis, I will explore the political and social dimensions of the city of Jerusalem, focusing on the ways in which the city has been used as a commodity by political institutions. I will examine the ways in which the city has been used to promote political agendas, and the impact of these agendas on the daily lives of its inhabitants.

The city of Jerusalem is a complex and diverse place, with a rich history and a complex political situation. The current political division of Jerusalem into the Israeli and Palestinian territories has added to the complexities of the situation. The city is home to a diverse population of people of different religions, cultures, and backgrounds, and the political division of the city has had a significant impact on the daily lives of its inhabitants.

In this thesis, I will explore the political and social dimensions of the city of Jerusalem, focusing on the ways in which the city has been used as a commodity by political institutions. I will examine the ways in which the city has been used to promote political agendas, and the impact of these agendas on the daily lives of its inhabitants.
also generating surplus value. Rossi’s book, written before the rise of UNESCO and the heritage industry, could not have predicted the ultimate commodification of what he described as “certain artefacts [that] become part of [the city’s] memory [...] in this entirely positive sense great ideas flow through the history of the city and give shape to it.” Indeed, these memories within the city have been enclosed, enhanced, and as this thesis will show - have turned into an asset under the cult of heritage which has seen exponential growth in the last three decades. This commodification distorts the phenomenon of spiritual travel and blurs the distinction between a pilgrim and a tourist; this economic aspect of collective memory will be scrutinised in this thesis for exploiting cultural and religious values for the creation and circulation of capital.

Once this legacy of corruption is confronted, the thesis will attempt to reclaim the enchantment initially found in pilgrimage by proposing alternative methods of devotion that could be enacted in flexible topographies through the combination of text, image, memory, and imagination. Using photography as a design tool to create an alternative travelogue, a new type of pilgrimage can emerge where the effect of ‘destabilising topography’ described above could be balanced by the stabilising quality of rituals, and where memory could be reclaimed in a personal, rather than collective, sense. Arguably, the effect of ‘destabilising topography’ described above can only be balanced by the stabilising quality of rituals. In the words of Antoine Saint-Exupéry, rituals are “temporal techniques of making oneself at home in the world.” Like things in space, rituals offer structure, sameness, and repetition; they allow one to create distance or even estrangement from themselves. Be they physical or mental, still or peripatetic, speaking or silent, this thesis will thus try to untangle the rituals of pilgrimage from its ties to power in order to reclaim it as an act of liberty, of movement through space and time, progressing towards a destination that may never fully arrive, but nevertheless declares an orientation to life itself.


Ibid

Quoted in Han, Byung-Chul, The Disappearance of Ritual (2009)

Fig 6: Easter Friday procession at the “New Jerusalem” in Varallo, Italy. Photo by the author, 2019
THE INVENTION OF
THE HOLY LAND

PILGRIMAGE AND THE CHRISTIAN APPROPRIATION OF JERUSALEM

The earliest traces of human settlements in Jerusalem date to 5000 BC. A Canaanite village perched on the Judean Mountains above the Gihon spring, far from any strategic trade-route, it was populated mostly by graves.\(^1\) By the nineteenth century BC, Jerusalem was a substantial city-state, its name first recorded as “Urusalim”, perhaps after Salam or Shalom (“peace” in Arabic or Hebrew).\(^2\) Over the next centuries, Jerusalem experienced recurring attacks from the New Kingdom of Egypt to the south and Assyria to the north, which encouraged Jerusalemites to build their city as a citadel of steep fortification, terraced housing, and intricate tunnels. However, it was not until King David captured the stronghold in 1000 BC that Jerusalem was established as a capital city. This was also the beginning of the city’s spiritual significance as the centre of the Hebrews, a uniquely monotheistic tribe that had arrived centuries earlier from Mesopotamia.\(^3\)

David’s son, King Solomon, built the First (Jewish) Temple on top of Mount Moriah—believed to be the biblical site where the Hebrew patriarch Abraham nearly sacrificed his only son, Isaac—thus commemorating the site as one of unconditional devotion. Built over seven years, the shrine at the centre of Temple Mount housed “The Holy of the Holies”—the wooden Ark of the Covenant. According to the Book of Exodus of the Hebrew Bible, pilgrimage to the Temple was mandatory for all Jews three times a year, corresponding to the agricultural calendar.\(^4\) This ritual came to a halt in 587 BC when the city was besieged by Nebuchadnezzar, King of Babylon, who executed King Zedekiah, burned down Solomon’s Temple, and exiled the Hebrews. In Babylon, the Israelites formulated the Biblical scriptures, solidified the religion, and awaited their redemptive day of return—and indeed, in 516 BC, the Second Temple was inaugurated on the ruins of Solomon’s first. This temple, which was modest in scale and decoration, was entirely remodelled in the first century BC by the half-Jewish, half-Arab Roman King Herod, who executed a megalomaniac construction project that continues to dominate the topography of the Old City of Jerusalem until today. Over the next century, hundreds of thousands of Jews arrived in Jerusalem to visit the new altar built upon the exposed bedrock of Mount Moriah, in the heart of Herod’s vast man-made plateau.

This fortified city, with its monumental temple, was not only the bastion of Jewish tradition—it was also the city of Christ. Born in Bethlehem, a small village on the outskirts of Jerusalem, and raised in Nazareth, Jesus attended the Passover festivities in Jerusalem every year.\(^5\) After 30 AD, Jesus triumphantly returned to Jerusalem for what were to be his final days; the city’s streets and the Jewish Temple formed the backdrop for the Passion—Christ’s trial, crucifixion, entombment, and resurrection—and thus became inseparable from any Christian ritual of recollection. This heavenly city of both the Jewish Temple and Christ presented a unity between the ideal and the real for close to a century. In 70 AD, after years of siege, the Roman Emperor Titus captured the city and destroyed the temple, demolished houses, and burned most of the city’s trees.\(^6\) In that decisive moment, Holy Jerusalem was dispatched from its earthly corollary, which now lay in ruins and chaos.

For the next six decades, Jerusalem was reduced to a camp of the tenth Roman Legion (legio X Fretensis), and Jews and Nazarenes (a minor Palestinian sect that gradually separated from Judaism) were forbidden to live on its site, under the penalty of death.\(^7\) This urban vacuum gave rise to paganism. In 135 AD, following the defeat of yet another Jewish revolt, Emperor Hadrian changed the city’s name to Aelia Capitolina, after his own last name of Aelius and the Roman god Jupiter Capitolinus.\(^8\) Hadrian’s city was smaller than the one built by the Arab-Jewish King Herod only a century earlier, and held little religious or political significance within the Roman empire.\(^9\) As a pagan emperor, Hadrian obliterated the remains of monotheism in the city by transforming the ruins of the Jewish Temple into the Capitoline by covering the supposed burial place of Christ. While the primary goal of the Jews was to return and rebuild the physical city below, the nascent Christian religion ascribed increasing religious and symbolic significance to the Jerusalem above as the city of an idea.
Contrary to the hopes of Christ’s persecutors, the crucifixion of the charismatic leader from Nazareth did not put an end to his messianic fervour. As an individual whose position within a politically troubled region endured among his followers (not to mention his proof of divinity through the many accounts of the resurrection), he managed to bring his message across the land.1 The first Christians did not see themselves as breaking with the Jewish tradition; they were merely a sect who believed in the same God and Jesus as the Jews, but also wished to move on from the terrestrial finite to celestial eternity, and were willing to undertake an individual commitment. Judaism was an inherently territorial code that set Christianity apart from its genealogical growth by sending a strong Jewish author...

While the Gospels paint a picture of Christ’s entire life in the Galilee, the reenactment of collective memories focuses on his last days in Jerusalem. The crucifixion is Christ’s heroic sacrifice (rather than his life with the disciples or his miracles) which would eventually make Jerusalem the principal site for these memories to be localized. Flowing from the new millennium, Chapter 12 of Hebrews argued that the Christian Scriptures had morphed from allegory into history, and now presented the Gospels as a literal account of events that happened to Christ as a man, who was crucified in Jerusalem on earth. According to Halbwachs, when collective memories are projected onto a physical site, it becomes a landmark.2 While this material sedimentation was not an instant process, the effect of Christ being read aloud in Sunday gatherings. Literal was thus a critical factor in the expansion of the early Church, creating an alternative channel of communication which functioned as an unconfined infrastructure for the spread of Christian theology.

In addition to the reenactment of the prophetic letters of the Apostles (and their successors, the apostolic Fathers) the writings in the Old Testament Book of Prophecies, which chronicles the conquests and defeats of the Israelites in Judaea, as well as the memories of the life, death, and resurrection of Jesus Christ in Jerusalem.23 Read in succession after week, these texts not only gave instructions to the faithful, but also made a moral argument that had fostered the founding narrative of the religion, thus forming the pool of collective memories of the Christian religion. Names of people, places, and events were associated with the Christian faith and were written down in the faithful and recalled within an intangible realm, accessible from one’s own mind. Thus, collective memories were strategically deposited in the minds of the Christian faithful. In Jerusalem, which was now used as a symbol in seers and prayers to facilitate reckoning and give a clear orientation.

In addition to the earthly Jerusalem—associated with the Jewish enslavement to a scriptural sarcophagus and geographic specificity—was deemed inferior to the possibility of unbound ritual freedom.26 Christianity’s relocation into the spiritual realm was strategic: as an illegal cult operating within a pagan Roman empire, separation from land was required for the expansion of the religion.27 Indeed, early Christianity did not grow through forced territorial conquests, nor by subjecting nations to its control (at least not at first). It was a diffused form of power that spread from the Middle East to Asia Minor, into the Roman Empire, to Europe. These were all necessary moves to make the spiritual message more accessible to a national audience. In the words of anthropologist Glenn Bowman, Christian exile was “enabling...social experience...it is a matter of how an imagined community, which manifested during prayers as an orientation to the east—towards Jerusalem.

The Earliest History of Christianity

The Invention of the Holy Land

The Invention of the Holy Land

TOWARDS JERUSALEM

CHAPTER ONE...

“AT A STONE’S THROW AWAY”

GEOGRAPHY OF THE PILGRIM FROM BORDEAUX

The earliest record of Christian pilgrimage to the Holy Land was that of a pilgrim from Bordeaux in 333 AD. 28 Traveling to Palestine only two decades after the legalisation of Christianity, he probably was the last tourist to describe the joint gesture of the dedication of Constantine’s churches and the transformation of the city into a Christian spiritual centre.29 Acknowledging that he may be the first of many travelers to the Holy Land, Wilkinson (1985) set out to create a detailed roadmap for the benefit of future Christian pilgrims.30 Travelling as an independent Roman citizen across a secular imperial infrastructure, he succeeded in engaging in what was known as the Holy City in Christian Sebba.31 The framework that he created, however, is informed by the dedication of Constantine’s churches and the transformation of the city into a Christian spiritual centre.32

The latest record of a recorded personal Christian journey in Palestine was in 652 AD by Abba, Holy Land Pilgrim, who...33

BIBLIOGRAPHY


While a literal geography can be roughly divided into two parts. The first part follows his journey across the cursus publicus, an imperial road system for Roman messengers. During Christ’s lifetime the roads were limited to the precise distances between his resting stops, where he would change horses in mutinies or enjoy overnight lodging in mansions (a metaphorical understanding of the Holy Land’s roads).34 He probably knew the names of the cities...35

The Invention of the Holy Land


While a literal geography can be roughly divided into two parts. The first part follows his journey across the cursus publicus, an imperial road system for Roman messengers. During Christ’s lifetime the roads were limited to the precise distances between his resting stops, where he would change horses in mutinies or enjoy overnight lodging in mansions (a metaphorical understanding of the Holy Land’s roads).34 He probably knew the names of the cities...35

The Invention of the Holy Land

The Itinerarium is a very specific guidebook that provides idiomatic knowledge about the Holy Land and Christian pilgrimage and its localization of memory. It chronicles no more nor less than the places where scripture and place coincide, from notable sites to seemingly mundane natural elements that are infused with theological meaning. The plane trees he saw were planted by Jacob; a rock he described in a vineyard marks the site of Judas’s betrayal of Jesus; a palm tree is the same one “from which children took branches and strewn them in Christ’s path.” Places relating to Christ’s life as a man, however, had yet to be infused with a redemptive narrative, and were therefore omitted from the journey—or from its representation. Capernaum and Nazareth, located only a day’s trip from his route, were ignored. The Itinerarium projected a system of belief that was developed outside the Holy Land and thus was concerned only with the particular events recollected in Western services.

In the Holy City, the Bordeaux Pilgrim bore witness to the invention of Christian Jerusalem. This transformation was achieved through a large-scale construction project launched in the aftermath of the Council of Nicaea in 325 AD, when Constantine summoned the Empire’s bishops to stand, he describes the residues of both Pagan and Jewish presence: “the Christian appropriation of Jerusalem in the fourth century: the Case of the Bordeaux Pilgrim.”

Less than a decade after the Council, these recently established monuments would appear in the Bordeaux Pilgrim’s increasingly elaborate descriptions. He enters Jerusalem from the East Gate and proceeds west along a walled street towards the Temple Mount, thus tracing the path of Jewish pilgrims before 70 AD. He describes the enormous labour that went into its construction, the architectural remnants of the great vaults “where Solomon used to torture demons”, and the subterranean chambers of Solomon’s former palace “where he was when he wrote of Wisdom.” When he reaches the epicentre of the Temple Mount plateau, where the shrine used to stand, he describes the residues of both Pagan and Jewish presence:

And in the sanctuary itself, where the Temple stood which Solomon built there is marble in front of the altar which has on it the blood of Zacharias—you think it had only been shed today [... there were two statues of Hadrian standing there. And, not far from there, a pierced stone which the Bordeaux Pilgrim visits several of these sites, including a basilica on Mount Olives “where the Lord went up to pray”; the rock tomb “in which laid Lazarus, whom the Lord Raised”; an “exceptionally beautiful basilica” in Abraham’s city, Tereninthe; and the Basilica in Bethlehem, where Christ was born. Many of these sites were built by Constantine’s mother, Empress Helena, who is also believed to have discovered Christ’s True Cross. Constantine’s biographer wrote that Helena’s journey to Palestine was one “to the ground which the Saviour’s feet had trodden”,...
as part of an official delegation to survey the Eastern provinces, cities, and people, with a truly imperial solicitude.22 This hybrid of religion and power portrays the gradual absorption of Christianity by the Empire, as well as the empowerment of foreign visitors to dramatically alter the conditions of prayer in Jerusalem. In the following decades, additional events were erected in and around the Holy City to commemorate a growing number of sites: the Basilica of the Apostles on Mount Zion, the Chapel of St. James on the Mount of Olives (363 AD), an octagonal church on the site of the Ascension, and a church in memory of the Agony (358 AD). But the epicentre of this wide construction project was undoubtedly the Church of the Holy Sepulchre.

The Church of the Holy Sepulchre, the most spatially complex and thematically charged site of all, was created to commemorate Christ’s crucifixion and resurrection, the dogmatic events of the Christian religion. Although these events had an ineradicable spatial dimension in religious recollection, they were not readily visible as material traces or artifacts in fourth-century Jerusalem; therefore, a site for their localisation had to be found by no other than Constantine himself.23 This is elaborated on in Eusebius’ Vita Constantini, a glorifying biography of Constantine written in the immediate aftermath of his death.24

The reappearence of Christ’s empty tomb from the depths of the earth signalled the dawn of the New Jerusalem from above.25 While the accuracy of Eusebius’ description is debatable, its political implications for Jerusalem were undeniable: the recovery of Christ’s empty tomb was tangible proof of his resurrection (and would remain unchallenged until the late nineteenth century, as will be explored in chapter four). Jerusalem was destined to become the spiritual capital of the Roman Empire, and funds began to flow into the city from all directions. In a letter to Macarius, bishop of Jerusalem, Constantine delivered precise instructions for the erection of the world’s most beautiful church, and designated infinite amounts of marble, gold, and labourers for the completion of the task.26

The Bordeaux Pilgrim visited the Church of the Holy Sepulchre two years after the Council of Nicaea (two years before the official dedication of the edifice). He describes the church’s multiple localities:

On your left is the hillycol Gethseman which was crucified, and about a stone’s throw away from it the vault where they laid his body, and he rose again on the third day. By order of Emperor Constantine there has now been built there a basilica—‘I mean a place for the lord’—

which has beside it cisterns of remarkable beauty, and beside them a baptistery where children are baptized.27

This description of the early phase of the erection of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre conveys the juxtaposition of two historical locations, coupled with liturgical vessels, such as the basilica (an architectural type that became the typical blueprint for Christian churches, as will be discussed in the following chapter) and a baptistery, where new members were initiated into the faith (The Baptism would have been erected over Christ’s tomb). Eusebius’ text describes it in great detail: from the north-south axis of Aelia’s cardo, the church’s layout extends towards the cardinal points, composed of three highly ornate, east-facing gates, designed to attract passers-by and welcome a ‘multitude’ of visitors; next, an inner courtyard, or atrium, large enough to host a great amount of pilgrims; then the Colonnade‘basilica’ (known later as the Martyrium), where congregations could gather in the central nave of 22 metres long, complete with marble floors and gilded ceiling; further on, an open-air courtyard, and surrounded by twelve columns (after the apostles), and furnished, according to Eusebius, with “gold, silver, and precious stones.” The space around Christ’s tomb was initially designed as an open-air courtyard, and remained in this form at the time of the Bordeaux Pilgrim’s visit; however, it was soon enclosed and covered by a rotunda, and renamed the Church of the Anastasis. In 335 AD, three years before the death of Constantine, the Church of the Holy Sepulchre was consecrated.28 The dedication—a hybrid manifestation of political and religious power—was attended by bishops from all over the eastern province of the Empire, travelling at the state’s expense as official leaders of the Christian empire.29 Christian pilgrimage had finally found a terrestrial destination; the gathering of the bishops from across the Roman provinces foretold what would be perpetually re-enacted in the next millennium by pilgrims from the whole world. While the only depiction of this event and its magnitude comes from Eusebius, a biased observer, the historian David Hunt argues that this historical account, as imaginative and subjective as it may be, portrays the excitement that accompanied the erection of this building, and its potential to lure future pilgrims.30 Indeed, with the erection of numerous monuments in Jerusalem, pilgrimage was about to explode in popularity. Weaving together existing locations of memory and newly established ones, a system of Christian holy sites spread across the city of Jerusalem. From the text of the Bordeaux Pilgrim, we learn that the initial movement between Golgotha and the Sepulchre at “a stone’s throw away”, extends into a wider territory of historical Jerusalem, which would soon become the stage for a public ritual invented by the local liturgy and adapted to the urban realm. The details of this intricate ritual are best described in the letters of Egeria.

“IT MAKES FAR TOO MUCH TO REMEMBER”: EGERIA’S DESCRIPTION OF THE JERUSALEM LITURGY

Fifty years after the pilgrimage of the traveller from Bordeaux, the Spanish nun Egeria arrived in Jerusalem.31 She spent three years in the city (381–384 AD) and recorded her experience in a series of enthusiastic letters addressed to her ‘sisters’, a community of Christian believers back home in Galicia.32 The original contents of her letters, as reconstructed from a damaged eleventh-century manuscript, reveal in detail the formation of a Christian calendar through the rituals performed by the Jerusalem liturgy across the city’s holy sites. As a witness of her soul’s salvation, Egeria would become a model for Jerusalem pilgrims in the centuries to come, and her comprehensive descriptions were distilled into replicable rituals that could spread across the Christian world, catalysing the diffusion of Jerusalem back to the West.33

Egeria’s letters, according to what is left of them, begin in the Sinai Desert on her way to Jerusalem. Much like the Itinerarium Burdigalense, her text can be divided into two segments: her days of private wandering in the desert, where she recorded her experiences in an affective first-person voice, and her years in Jerusalem, which are recorded as a third-person account of her participation in the local liturgies.34 Egeria’s letters reflect the changes that had taken place in the Roman Empire since its Christian conversion: whereas the Bordeaux Pilgrim travelled across an administrative infrastructure and lodged in roadside inns, Egeria was welcomed by monks in the desert, heirs to the tradition of offering hospitality to foreigners. Their welcoming generosity was a source of comfort amidst the challenges of an账户 estrangement fash- home, which was an integral component of Christian pilgrimage.35

In her search for collective memories, Egeria was not without her same holy men—either Roman citizens—cum-mons who had withdrawn from the crumbling Empire or Egyptians who had pulled away from the state—who had...
received particular knowledge through oral tradition. As Egeria explains, “I asked about it [a holy site] and the holy men replied, ‘Holy Moses was buried here...’” Our predecessors pointed this place to us, and now we point it to you. They told us that this tradition came from their predecessors. With the help of her guides and a Bible in hand, Egeria meanders across Sinai in the following biblical localities:

All the way I kept asking to see the different places mentioned in the Bible, and they were all pointed out to me by the Holy Men... some of the places were to the right and others to the left of our route, some a long way off and others close by.

Throughout the text, Egeria’s tone remains somewhat conversational and highly descriptive, often echoing lines from scripture. Like the pilgrim from Bordeaux, Egeria’s gaze hardly ever wanders beyond the biblical realm, and her representation omits any topographical details that could not be directly ascribed to scripture. This resulted in a compendium of desert locations that lacked an institutional system of commemoration, a little more than a cluster of generic features in a barren desert. However, they were made memorable by the words of her guides, who could affiliate the landscape with historical events. This becomes evident when she traces the footsteps of the Israelites during the Exodus:

Our path lay through the middle of the valley which stretched out in front of us, the valley in which, as I have told you, the children of Israel had their camp while Moses went up into the Mount of God and came down again. And all the way through the valley the holy men were showing us the different places. Right at the end of the valley, where we had spent the night and seen the Burning Bush out of which God spoke to Holy Moses, we saw also the place where Moses was standing before the Bush when God said to him “Unde the fastening of thy shoes: for the place where thou standest is holy ground” [Exodus 3:5, Acts 7:35]; they showed us where the calf had been made, where a large stone was set in the ground and still stands... they showed us where Holy Moses ordered the children of Israel to run ‘from gate to gate’ [Exodus 32:27] when he had come back from the Mount.

This lengthy (and somewhat tedious) account goes on to include, alongside the “Burning Bush” and “large stone”, additional places from the Book of Moses, such as the site of the miracle of the manna or the stream from which Moses drew water for the Israelites to drink [Exodus 32:20]. Finally, Egeria concludes:

I know it has been rather a long business writing down all these places one after the other, and it makes far too much to remember. But it may help you, loving sisters, to remember, the better to picture what happened in those places when you read the Books of Holy Moses.

This passage reveals Egeria’s candid motivation to write her letters not as a guidebook for future travelers, nor a self-interested memoir, but a visual aid for the imagination of those practicing scriptural recollections in Christian communities far from the holy places. In this passage, Egeria explains that the combination of land and text are crucial for the Christian faith because neither is legible on its own. Egeria’s pilgrim age exemplifies how text and place come together to foster an in situ recollection of Christian memories, similar to what took place in services in her home church.

We learn of this ritual from Egeria’s description of her visit to Mount Sinai, where she met with the local presbyter (“a healthy old man... in fact just the man for the place”22), and wrote:

...when the whole passage had been read to us from the Book of Moses (on the very spot!) we made the offering in the usual way and received communion. As we were coming out of the church the presbyters of the place gave us ‘Blessings’, some fruit which grows on the mountain itself... Thus the holy men were kind enough to show us everything, and there too we made the offering and prayed very earnestly, and the passages were read from the Book of Kingdoms. Indeed, whenever we arrived anywhere, I myself always wanted the Bible passages read to us.

Egeria’s remark exemplifies her affinity for reading a site’s scriptural affiliation while remaining within the familiar framework of recollection—her “usual way.” Indeed, anthropologist Glenn Bowman argues that Egeria did not invent a Holy Land, but rather inherited one from the memories of her guides and the itineraries of her predecessors. Her mode of worship, much like the sacred topography of Sinai, was imported from the tradition of a religion in exile that maintained it continuity through textual recollection of memories. However, unlike the existing practice in the West of reading a text in successive instalments in a single church, Egeria—as an observer to the “Holy Men”—introduced a new logic of dividing the Old Testament into its component verses and reading each one at the place where its narrative events transpired, thus creating a ritual path across the Sinai based on geographical progression rather than scriptural chronology. The seriality and fragmentation of the ritual in the desert, following the Exodus of the Israelites, foreshadowed what Egeria would experience in Jerusalem: the systematic stational character of the Holy City’s liturgy, this time retracing Christ’s own Passion.

Egeria arrived in Jerusalem in 381 AD. At that time, the unusually large liturgy was headed by Cyril of Jerusalem, who was ordained by Macarius (the bishop during Constantine’s conversion) and had occupied the seat of the bishop since the inauguration of the Anastasis Rotunda in 348 AD. Throughout the fourth century, Cyril was the only bishop who included pilgrims in his services, and he was most likely responsible for the formation of the city’s unique rituals. Egeria described Jerusalem’s liturgical structure in detail: the bishop was the father of the church; the presbyters read from the scriptures and preached to the crowd, prayed, and recited psalms; the deacons took part in the prayers but did not preach; and the clerics assisted with baptism. During the services, as each figure carried out their specific role while Egeria sat but a silent observer; her pilgrimage through the desert did not elevate her status in the church hierarchy, and she remained a passive participant in clerical routines, like the majority of Christian laity within the religion’s hierarchical structure.

Egeria’s letters are so exhaustively detailed that they preserve—in “like a fly in amber”, according to historian Jonathan Smith’s description of transformation that was then underway—Egeria begins her letters from Jerusalem: “Loving sisters, I am sure it will interest you to know about the daily service they have in the holy places, and I must tell you about them. She reports, in the third person, every movement, conversation, service, and location of a holy site, giving equal emphasis to important information (such as scriptural quotes or prayers) as to benign details such as a building’s smell, making the experience ever more vivid for her audience. With great attention, she lists the elements of the services: poems, sung by the boys’ choir; prayers spoken by the bishop or a presbyter; lessons and preaching, where the Bible was read and taught; and the elaborate dismissal, or mass, when the bishop blessed all participants and sealed the service.

Of special interest was the intricate daily service in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre:

Fig 5: John Wilkinson's drawing of Golgotha in the time of Egeria

Drawing by John Wilkinson

Fig 6: Constantin’s buildings on Golgotha in the time of Egeria

Drawing by John Wilkinson
The ritual would visit up to eight different locations. As Egeria shows, each of these festivities intersected with at least two of the ten holy sites in Jerusalem and its environs. They are: the Mount of Olives, where Egeria listens to the "words of the Lord, written in Matthew’s Gospel," and Golgotha, where the ritual begins on the Mount of Olives and continues to Golgotha. The two days of the Passion narrative of the stations are treated as a single sequence by the Christian calendar. And as some holy sites were intersected with at least two of the ten holy sites of Christian Jerusalem and establishes the agency of the Lord in the space of these sites, the community in a processional movement became the Feast of Dedication (or the Encaenia), in which the consecration of the churches in Jerusalem was similarly celebrated by Christians across the province. The climax of the Christian year. It begins on a Sunday, when the bishop arrives with his clergy and a crowd of the faithful. Then he comes out of the sanctuary, and everyone comes up to have his hand laid on them. He blesses them one by one, and goes out, and by the time the dissimulation takes place it is already day.

The day continues with identical services at midday and three o'clock, as Egeria describes in similar detail: he first says the morning prayer and blesses the catechumens, and then another prayer and blesses the faithful. Then he comes out [...].

The reading of the Christian liturgy in Jerusalem this was when the House of God was consecrated, that the day of Encaenia was when the emperor Constantine was crowned, and the Ascension was when the Lord rose after "the whole assembly groans and laments within". The date of Encaenia: "The date which tradition has established as Easter, and the day when the Lord ascended into heaven", where, at five o'clock, "the angels of the Lord appeared to the Virgin, and the Son of God was manifested to the shepherds, in their midst in heavenly glory". The Ascension: "The date which tradition has established as Pentecost, the feast of the coming of the Holy Spirit.

Egeria’s letters document the schedule of services not only on a daily cycle, but also throughout the Christian week and year. The framework of services is designed to evoke the events of Christ’s final days: Sunday is the day of Christ’s resurrection, and it is repeatedly recalled every week through a special service involving all members of the community and visiting pilgrims. Before sunrise, as many [people] as can get in gather in the atrium of the Holy Sepulchre. When the bishop arrives with his congregation and the people come into the Anastasis, which is already ablaze with lamps.

The systematic in situ reading of the gospel by the liturgy and the embodiment of Christ by the local bishop extended beyond the city walls. An in situ reading of the gospel by the liturgy and the embodiment of Christ by the local bishop extended beyond the city walls. An in situ reading of the gospel by the liturgy and the embodiment of Christ by the local bishop extended beyond the city walls. An in situ reading of the gospel by the liturgy and the embodiment of Christ by the local bishop extended beyond the city walls.
The sites erected in the first hundred years following Constantine's conversion would shape the development of Christian consciousness until the Islamic conquest in the seventh century. The intervening centuries were a golden age for Jerusalem pilgrims and, by extension, for the church seeking to solidify collective memories. Jerusalem was experienced locally and re-enacted from afar as a sacred topography of natural elements and monuments, where the Scriptural climax took place. Notably, the events commemorated in Jerusalem and formalised in the fourth century in the Christian annual cycle do not reflect the scripture in its entirety. Important sites in Nazareth, Mount Tabor, and Galilee, where Christ spent most of his life, are ignored, giving exclusive significance to the sites of Christ's sacrifice. This process of selection and omission is emblematic of collective memory, which is not strictly obligated to the past but shaped by the present events and conditions defining the emerging group of believers. As an institutional strategy, Christianity had to preserve and reproduce the memories of Christ's triumph over death and Constantine's defeat of Jerusalem's pagan and Jewish past.  

As the next chapter will explore, other Jerusalems proliferated across Medieval Europe, offering pilgrims alternate destinations to the Holy Land—yet these places were still oriented towards Jerusalem, similar literary technique between Egeria and the Bordeaux traveller, combining movement, text and memory.

"THE BETTER TO PICTURE WHAT HAPPENED IN THESE PLACES?": TIME, SPEECH, AND SUPPRESSION OF PLACE

The succinct Itinerarium Burdigalense and the exhausitive letters of Egeria construct a history of Jerusalem's appropriation into Christianity through the eyes of its visitors. In the first text, an anonymous traveller from Bordeaux transforms the geography of fourth-century Palestine into a sacred Christian topography, thus materialising a religion that once preached against the very notion of territorial rootedness. In the second, a Spanish nun scripted her own "Exodus" across Sinai, with the help of the monks of the desert, and appropriated both the barren landscape and the tales of the Old Testament into a resolutely Christian system of belief. The two authors, separated by fifty years, were devoted to a common Christian spatial-narrative elaboration: the Bordeaux pilgrim laid the framework of collective memories by mapping their locations onto the land, while Egeria coded the ritualisation of these locations into a systematic memorialisation of significant Christian events.

We understand these dramatic transformations through the personal writings of two travellers who both exemplify a new subject—the Bordeaux pilgrim and the Christian traveller. Leaving behind extended periods of time—the Bordeaux Pilgrim travelled for over a year, mostly on the road to and from Jerusalem, and Egeria spent three years in Jerusalem—these pilgrims moved as innate foreigners within familiar biblical lands. They were conscious of their intentions, eager to record their journeys, and motivated by spiritual goals. Their strategies thus reveal not only the changing status of Jerusalem during the Christian conversion of the Roman Empire, but also the power of travellers to project a reality upon the landscape that alters both the real and imagined city.

While this chapter links these two pilgrims through their roles in shaping Christian devotion in the Roman Empire, it must be acknowledged that they had contradictory motivations and wrote for different audiences. The Bordeaux traveller thus encourages participation in cyclical commemorative works re-enacted on sites and shared with a growing crowd. Egeria had the opposite aim. By capturing a prescriptive account of Jerusalem's liturgy to send back to the West, her detailed letters could serve as a guidebook to re-enact Jerusalem's rituals anywhere, using the chronological system standardised across the empire. By reading the text according to the dates of the year, Egeria's readers could re-enact her movements in the Holy Land, basing their confidence in her comprehensive personal account confirmed by geographic alignments with scripture. Egeria's letters facilitated a withdrawal from the geographic specificity of Jerusalem and a focus on vivid imagination of spiritual places. She emphasises time over space, commending the liturgy for fixing texts as temporal events in a daily, monthly, and yearly chronology: "What I admire and value most is that all the hymns and antiphons and readings they have, and all the prayers the bishop says, are always relevant to the day which is being observed and to the place in which they are used."  

Thanks to the letters of Egeria, a ritual born in Jerusalem could be replicated in the West with near-identical precision of time and speech. In this process, space was suppressed, giving rise to imagination, meditation, and visualisation as alternatives modes of recollection. This also allowed for new collective memories to form with more flexibility of localisation and commemoration. As the physical city of Jerusalem grew less amenable to Western visitors in the centuries to come, this relocation of the faith proved valuable. As the next chapter will explore, other Jerusalems proliferated across Medieval Europe, offering pilgrims alternate destinations to the Holy Land—yet these places were still oriented towards Jerusalem, similar literary technique between Egeria and the Bordeaux pilgrim, combining movement, text and memory.
The public form of Christian worship in Jerusalem would come to an end in the seventh century. The brief invasion by the Persians in 614 AD and the Islamic conquest of 638 AD destroyed the city’s shrines and left the Christian capital in ruins. As a result, the collective memories that were localised by Constantine and his successors were gradually lost; the rituals that maintained the possibility of recollection were suppressed. It was during those interim centuries between the fall of the city to Islam in the seventh century and its recapture by the Crusades in 1099 AD that Jerusalem’s physical unavailability was negated through the erection of alternatives in Europe. As such, the spiritual vector towards Jerusalem was inverted away from the city itself and toward the bastions of Christianity in the West, taking the shape of physical traces (such as relics, pieces of earth, and containers of specimens) and place-naming European shrines after sites in the Holy Land, which allowed recollection to occur away from the historical markers in the ancient city.

Another form in which Jerusalem was transferred outside its boundaries was through the spatial replication of architectural elements that held a mnemonic association with the Holy City. More specifically, this chapter will focus on the transfer of a spatial logic that was abstracted from Christianity’s most revered sites and transplanted into new locations. This translation will be explored through the concept of analogy in order to understand how an archetype that was born in Jerusalem was appropriated in the West for political, spiritual, and economic gain. These alternative Jerusalems—altars, churches, and landscapes—differed in scale and program, and yet they were all united by their commitment to a certain abstraction of the Holy City that can be understood through analogical thinking, an intelligence that is fundamental for both this chapter and the thesis at large, as it questions notions of territorial specificity in favour of a spatial temporality and flexible geography.

---

1 Halbwachs, On Collective Memory, 234
2 Galatians 4:26, “Jerusalem which is above is free, which is the mother of us all.”
3 1 Corinthians 6:19
4 Bitton-Ashkelony, Enquiring the Sacred: The Debate on Christian Pilgrimage in Late Antiquity (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), 5
5 Wilkinson, John, Jerusalem Pilgrimage, 1099–1185 (Milton Park: Routledge, 1988), 2

---

CHAPTER TWO

THE BASILICA AND THE ROTUNDA

THE CONCEPT OF ANALOGY AND THE RISE OF URBAN PILGRIMAGE IN MEDIEVAL EUROPE

While the idea of pilgrimage to an alternative Jerusalem became prominent in the Middle Ages, it should be understood within the political and theological framework of the fourth century. As the first chapter showed, the public worship that emerged in the urban condition of Jerusalem made Christianity visible and powerful. However, it also distanced the faith from the founding principles of its cult, established two centuries earlier. As described in the previous chapter of this dissertation, Christianity was developed as boundless, universal, and anti-world; the symbolic ownership of Jerusalem’s topography through the processional liturgy seems to contradict these notions, especially those put forth by St Paul. In his letter to the Corinthians, Paul argues that “your body is a temple of the Holy Spirit, who is in you.” His radical idea that God is found within one’s body was as strategic as it was spiritual: it allowed Christians under persecution and in exile to practice religion in solitude through contemplative prayer. It also separated Christianity from the Graeco-Roman traditions of celebratory public rituals, and thus from the sanctity of physical objects or geographical places. Within this theological framework, the journey to a divine site, with the associated physical and mental hardships, could be seen as superfluous to the faith. In the fourth century AD, as Christianity’s memories were being materialised in the Holy Land, some religious leaders voiced their opinion against the rise of Jerusalem pilgrimage. Two prominent figures were St Jerome and Gregory of Nyssa, who wrote letters to refute the rising phenomenon of spiritual travel to the Holy City. While their arguments were essentially theological, their reasoning was no doubt underpinned by political motivations, which are deeply embedded in the powerful vector that is pilgrimage.

St Jerome arrived in Jerusalem in 385 AD. He left Rome, where he was the secretary of Bishop Damasus I, with an entourage of noblewomen who intended to spend the remainder of their days in Palestine.
Among those who dwell there. But as it is, there is no form of uncleanness that is not crossed among them: fornications, adultery, thefts, idolatries, drug taking, gluttonies, and all such things. For if we went on a pilgrimage to Jerusalem, dismissed the experience by writing that his faith “was neither diminished nor increased” upon return, because, he tells us, the Devil has not left you. In other words, he says he has been living there for many years, he needed neither physical markers nor tangible proof to recollect them:

“We knew that he was made man through the Virgin—before we saw Bethlehem; we believed in his resurrection from the dead—before we saw his memorial rock; we confirmed the truth of his ascension having seen the Mount of Olives. We benefited only this much from our travelling there, that we came to know by comparison that our own places are far hoarser than those afar.”

Gregory’s last sentence is strikingly unlike: Jerome, he was not rejecting pilgrimage as such, nor was he preaching against physical journeys to sacred shrines. Claiming that Jerome, who has no advantage over other regions of the world, Gregory inquires that our own places of worship can grant an equal, if not higher, spiritual gain. Gregory does not advocate removing ourLocalization between an intimate experience with divine presence; he simply suggests that it could be found in other locations on earth. Considering Gregory’s role as the bishop of Capadocia, he was clearly concerned about the cult of saints in his region: “Really, if it is impossible to infer God’s presence from the things that appear, one might more justly consider that he dwelt in the notion of the Capadocians than in placés elsewhere!”

Hence, if one remains inclined toward physical objects and sites, it should be in a manner that does not pose a moral risk. He concludes: “Praise him in the places where you have visited, because the change of one’s place does not bring about any greater nearness to God.”

Gregory’s convincing polemic can be regarded as not only theological, but also highly political: by downplaying Jerusalem’s superi- ority and highlighting its moral degradation, Gregory could promote local pilgrimage in his native Capadocia. Alongside his bishop, Basil of Carseasa, Gregory institutionalized the cult of martyrs and promoted regional pilgrimage by hosting annual feasts and celebrations for local saints. This interest was not a momentary crux in the ongoing fight against paganism, but also strengthened the influence that Gregory and Basil exerted over the local population— who were now embracing their own pilgrimage.

Indeed, both Jerome and Gregory were aware of the latent potential in this mass movement of Christians towards tangible and spiritual pilgrimages.
In order to understand how these two types work together, it is important to trace their typological origins as separate basilicas. In that fashion, it appears that the coupling of these two spaces—a centrally planned, double-shelled structure and a strictly longitudinal basilica—created a composition that could be distilled and applied as an analogical target. It is an abstraction taken from Jerusalem, towards Jerusalem.

The context of this paper is Jerusalem’s most venerable site, the Church of the Holy Sepulchre (whose construction, consecration, and celebration was discussed in the first chapter of this dissertation), specifically its distinct architectural combination of longitudinal and transversal basilicas. In that fashion, it appears that the coupling of these two spaces—a centrally planned, double-shelled structure and a strictly longitudinal basilica—created a composition that could be distilled and applied as an analogical target. It is an abstraction taken from Jerusalem, towards Jerusalem.

In the context of this paper is Jerusalem’s most venerable site, the Church of the Holy Sepulchre (whose construction, consecration, and celebration was discussed in the first chapter of this dissertation), specifically its distinct architectural combination of longitudinal and transversal basilicas. In that fashion, it appears that the coupling of these two spaces—a centrally planned, double-shelled structure and a strictly longitudinal basilica—created a composition that could be distilled and applied as an analogical target. It is an abstraction taken from Jerusalem, towards Jerusalem.

The context of this paper is Jerusalem’s most venerable site, the Church of the Holy Sepulchre (whose construction, consecration, and celebration was discussed in the first chapter of this dissertation), specifically its distinct architectural combination of longitudinal and transversal basilicas. In that fashion, it appears that the coupling of these two spaces—a centrally planned, double-shelled structure and a strictly longitudinal basilica—created a composition that could be distilled and applied as an analogical target. It is an abstraction taken from Jerusalem, towards Jerusalem.

In the context of this paper is Jerusalem’s most venerable site, the Church of the Holy Sepulchre (whose construction, consecration, and celebration was discussed in the first chapter of this dissertation), specifically its distinct architectural combination of longitudinal and transversal basilicas. In that fashion, it appears that the coupling of these two spaces—a centrally planned, double-shelled structure and a strictly longitudinal basilica—created a composition that could be distilled and applied as an analogical target. It is an abstraction taken from Jerusalem, towards Jerusalem.
Before the erection of the rotunda, and according to the description of the pilgrim from Bordeaux, Christ’s tomb aedicule stood in the center of a semi-circular portico, open to the sky. This setting is reminiscent of the Christian Heroe, erected from as early as the second century AD to honour sites of martyrdom. In the third century, these spaces were replaced by monumental martyria, which accommodated both the grave of a martyr and space for memorial services. In Jerusalem, the Anastasis was erected as the grave of the martyr and a place to commemorate and recall the greatest martyrdom of all.

Spatially, the rotunda could accommodate a congregation throughout the tomb, while the barrel-vaulted ambulatory provided for circulation. This layout was common in Roman sepulchral architecture of the Third and fourth centuries AD meaning that Christian martyria were often indistinguishable from imperial mausolea, and thus inspired by the monumental pagen temples. This similarity, according to Krautheimer, became acceptable due to the contiguous neutral buildings, which were generally void of religious overtones due to their nature as private memorials.

The combination of a longitudinal basilica and a centrifugal rotunda provided two distinct spaces and sequence during the daily mobile service. In Jerusalem, the Anastasis was erected as the grave of the martyr and a place to accommodate a service that was mobile and could accommodate a service that was mobile and could accommodate a service that was mobile and could accommodate a service that was mobile and could accommodate a service that was mobile and could accommodate a service that was mobile. This staging activity surely produces connotative association with judicairy basilical halls and with political power, showcasing how its aisles, columns, and raised central section that is instrumentalized in space, separating the bishop and his clergy from the candidates.

The basilica was also used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“The bishop’s chair is placed in the great church, the Martyrium, and all those to be baptized the men and the women, sit around him in a circle. (...) his subject is god’s law; during the forty days he goes through the whole Bible, beginning with Genesis, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.

The basilica is used for preaching and teaching, during which “the bishop sits and preaches, while the faithful utter exclamations” which are often loud, creating a clear stage presence between the bishop and the audience. The most detailed teachings occur during Lent, when the candidates go through a complete biblical induction. Here Egeria describes a different spatial distribution:

“This unique circular configuration eliminates the usual hierarchical distribution, and it is then that students can, in turn, respond with questions on the scriptures, thus engaging in a dialogue with the bishop. According to Censorinus, and first relating the literal meaning of each passage, then interpreting its spiritual meaning.
BRANDING BOLOGNA: JERUSALEM AS THE FOUNDATION STONE OF CIVIC CONSCIOUSNESS

The most elaborate structure that maintains its analogical coherence is found in the complex of Santo Stefano in Bologna. While the dating of the complex is disputed by traditions (Fifth Century) and learned archaeologists (Twelfth Century), it seems that the earliest reference to the church as a local Jerusalem dates to 887 AD. Located on the road leading east from Bologna's old city center, the complex has both Pagan and Paleo-Christian foundations: a shrine to the Egyptian goddess Isis was in use until the Fourth Century, when, according to tradition, it was converted into a baptismery. The adjacent structure was consecrated as the Vitale and Agricolle Cathedral, where the remains of the two Bolognese martyrs (that were discovered in 393 AD) were interred.

The complex as we know it today was reconstructed sometime between 1164 and 1180 AD. Its main feature is the centrally-planned ‘Holy Sepulchre’, an irregular-octagonal structure that is covered by a dome. It is dominated by a Sepulchre, an irregular-octagonal structure housed; a Benedictine Cloister; and an additional double aisles, where the relics of the Saints are set (that is encircled by a ring of twelve supports). The central object of veneration, and an ambulatory that is surmounted by a gallery, while the central one is cruciform in plan and is also an octagonal structure replicates the one between Jerusalem, which allows a gathering of crowd by the entrance of the centrifugal structure. The replication of an architectural logic that considers a round structure’s interior and exterior spaces, a central object of veneration, and an ambulatory for circulation, set the space for a liturgical practice that originated in Jerusalem. This means that the analogical structures allows a pilgrim to enact in Bologna the ritual he or she would perform in Jerusalem; the abstraction of a spatial logic and its implementation with local materials (such as brick masonry and evangelic iconography) enables the Jerusalem worshipers and morally-risking journey. Furthermore, the addition of sacred sites within the church itself set the stage for a peripatetic worship that is at once moveable and yet bound by a religious practice. Like the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem, Santo Stefano played a role in both the local cult and as a centre for pilgrimage. During Easter Week, the stone tomb in the centre of the octagon was the focal point of the service: on Good Friday as the tomb of Christ’s imprisonment; stairs from the courtyard were referred to as the Scala Santi, leading to a room where a stone was said to be the place where Pilate had his judgment; a window called Ecce Homo, marked the arch above the location of Christ’s arrest. Similarly to the proliferation of scriptural affiliation to Jerusalem’s topography, elements within Santo Stefano were dedicated to events from the New Testament, thus forming edges to a mobile form of recollection within the church complex itself.

Fourth scholars regard Santo Stefano as a local Jerusalem due to a number of reasons. Krautheimer argues that the creator of Santo Stefano, much like other Medieval architects, “did not intend it to imitate the prototype as it looked in reality, he intended to reproduce it and figure out, as a memento of a venerated site.” What he means is that it wasn’t an exact copy, but that some elements were clearly borrowed from Jerusalem. The number of supports around the tomb, for example, corresponds both to the number of the columns in Jerusalem and to the number of the apostles, being both a literal and symbolic base. The octagonal, which was inter-changeable in the Medieval mind with a circle, evokes the figure of eight—hence of resurrection and salvation—while alluding to the form of the Anastasis Rotunda. But Santo Stefano is not just an amalgamation of memorial evidences: it also creates a structural analogy in its compositional logic. As such, the relationship between the courtyard and the octagonal structure replicates the one between the atrium and the Anastasis in Jerusalem; it even follows the slight offset of the tomb in Jerusalem, which allows a point of reference for the entrance of the centrifugal structure. The replication of an architectural logic that considers a round structure’s interior and exterior spaces, a central object of veneration, and an ambulatory for circulation, set the space for a liturgical practice that originated in Jerusalem. This means that the analogical structures allows a pilgrim to enact in Bologna the ritual he or she would perform in Jerusalem; the abstraction of a spatial logic and its implementation with local materials (such as brick masonry and evangelic iconography) enables the Jerusalem worshipers and morally-risking journey. Furthermore, the addition of sacred sites within the church itself set the stage for a peripatetic worship that is at once moveable and yet bound by a religious practice. Like the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem, Santo Stefano played a role in both the local cult and as a centre for pilgrimage. During Easter Week, the
that ties Bologna, physically and spiritually, to Jerusalem itself. The emphasis on Petronius' use of real measures obtained from Jerusalem (the description of how he "carefully measured with a rod" the shrines of Christ in Jerusalem) presents a composition that is strikingly similar to the Vita St. Petronii, which He was confined, a condition in which the Jerusalem pilgrims. On a fifth-century visit but an eleventh-century one that solidified the group around them.

LONDON'S TEMPLE: A SOURCE WITH TWO TARGETS

When the relics of a saint were rediscovered in 1199, the discovery of St. Petronius' tomb and the introduction of his cult was a significant event in the history of the Church. The tomb became a place of pilgrimage, with people flocking to it to worship and seek spiritual guidance. The sanctuary was a place where the relics of a saint were kept, and it was believed that veneration of these relics could bring about spiritual benefits.

LONDON'S TEMPLE, also known as the Temple of Solomon, was a place of pilgrimage during the Crusades. It was believed to be the site of the Temple of Solomon, which was destroyed in the eleventh century. The Temple was rebuilt in the twelfth century, and its ruins were used as a site for pilgrimage. The sanctuary was a place where people could come to worship and seek spiritual guidance.

In 1155, Bologna's popes were granted royal protection of property and freedom of trade across the kingdom; its land area grew from 23 to 100 hectares in the following century. In that process, the role of Jerusalem as the foundation of the city through the construction of an analogy was crucial; the invention of the reliquary, the rediscovery of St. Petronius' tomb, and the introduction of his cult helped shape Bologna's identity. As historian J.R. Hyde claims, during those years civic pride was expressed through a loyalty to local Church, especially through the celebrations of legend that solidified the group around them. Indeed, when St. Petronius—who had supposedly been to Jerusalem and had access to its monument—became the new patron of the city, his grave was placed in the heart of the Bolognese Jerusalem, in the cathedral bedrock that is believed to be Muhammad's rock.

In the following years, Bologna would be economically revived, the myth of Jerusalem as the foundation of the city would be crucial. Petronius' supposed journey to earthly Jerusalem created an explicit connection between the holy city and Bologna. With or without exact measures, a reimagined Jerusalem and implemented in Bologna, setting the stage for an already-existing national ritual by making it visible and physical. The invention of physical relics and a mythological story served local civic purposes by making it true Jerusalem in the Medieval Sense: not a replica but a structural analogy, distilling Jerusalem's liturgical vessels to implement its form of worship in a European setting. The invention of a collective memory that is tied to Jerusalem as an architectural guidelines. In addition to serving as a landmark for the local community, Santo Stefano could also capitalize on its identity as Jerusalem by attracting pilgrims. During the height of the Middle Ages, pilgrim revenue provided for a sole general repair of the structure, a personal exercise of faith, but an institutional practice of repenting sins. In a society ruled by the Church, an obsession with the tombs of the afterlife was constantly fed by the delicate balance between sin and punishment. While it preached for an earthly life of pious obedience, the Church also provided the possibility for salvation through the remission of sins, given in the form of a religious currency—indulgences—given to a sin in return for confession, donation, or pilgrimages. Measured in units of time, indulgences served as a get-out-of-hell free card, awarding those making a pilgrimage to Santo Stefano as a time in the fire of purgatory (the temporal place of judgement between heaven and hell). On the scale of indulgences, Jerusalem stood at the highest rank. In that sense, Bologna succeeded in becoming a substitute to Jerusalem: the monks of the Celestial Order that had taken over the complex, published the indulgences provided for those making a pilgrimage to Santo Stefano as similar to those traveling to the city itself. And yet the ultimate remission of sins, the plenary indulgence, was only granted to one act: becoming a Crusader.

In that sense, Bologna succeeded in making itself the de facto Temple of the Holy Sepulchre.

In Seventh Century Jerusalem, Temple Mount was left physically and symbolically out of the sacred topography of the city. Not only was it not a city but a ruin, the site has been left neglected as Christian pilgrimage was no longer a personal exercise but a stage for an already-existing stational ritual.

TEMPLE OF SOLOMON

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda CHAPTER TWO—

TOWARDS JERUSALEM THE ANNIHILATION AND THE BIRTH

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda

The Basilica and the Rotunda
conditions have changed in the Eleventh Century. On the one hand, the destruction of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre by the manic Caliph Hakim in 988, the prosecution of Christians, and the banning of Easter had stirred the Western accep-
tance of foreign rule in Jerusalem; at the same time, the strengthening of religious sentiment and the burden of sin have brought pilgrimage to earthly Jerusalem (and the quest for indulgences) back to popularity. Encouraged by the speech made by Pope Urban II in 1095 — who showed no reserves in advocating actual possession of the city — the first Crusade was born. Leaving the Pauline image of heavenly Jerusalem behind, the Crusaders headed for the Holy Land with faith and force.

When the Crusaders entered Jerusalem, they had to recollect Christian memories in the city by constructing holy places. When pos-
sible, they relied on existing markers that could remain, since the Constantinian project — or even the days of Christ — that could be adopted.

Thus, when the Crusaders took over the city, it was not only the Holy Sepulchre that had to be reclaimed from Islam but also the Temple Mount. The large Al Aqsa Mosque was renamed the “Temple of Solomon,” and the octagonal Dome of the Rock transformed into the “Temple of the Lord,” attempting to bypass Islamic history and claim-
ing a direct connection to the days of Solomon and the Kingdom of David.

With their new appropriated Temple, the reinstated Church in Jerusalem created a calen-
dar of festivities that reflected their power over the city. An annual service traced a line between the hills of Moriah and Golgotha in the form of a bishop-lead public procession between the Holy Sepulchre and the Templum Domini where a prayer was cited across from the former al Aqsa Mosque. With the new monuments, the cele-
bations of the liturgical year that was common in the entire Chrisinside was extended. On Palm Sunday, for example, palm and olive branches were blessed and distributed to the worship-
ners on the plateau of the Temple Mount, before they were lead to the valley of Josaphat where they met another procession bearing the Cross from Bethany; after it was brought there early in the morning from its chapel in Golgotha. The joined procession returned to the Temple Mount through the Golden Gate — which was opened only once per year on this occasion — where they encircled the ‘Temple of Solomon’ (Mosque of al Aqsa) and finally ended with prayers in the Templum Domini.

This theatrical ritual — which was greater in length and geographical scope than any pro-
cession that took place in the Fourth Century — included Scriptural references to the Old Testament. Indeed, collective memory adapts itself to the contemporary needs of the group; in twelfth century Jerusalem, it was crucial for the Christian rulers, in their efforts to eliminate Islam’s legitimacy, to establish their direct gene-
alogy from Judaism. As such, the Crusades, saw their war against Islam as analogous to the Israelites’ liberation from Egypt. The Bishop of Jerusalem at the time of the First Crusade, for example, preached to the camp from the Old Testament: “it is our duty to pray, and it is your duty to fight the Amalekites. With Moses [...] you, intrepid fighters, thrust your sword into Amaele. Their evocation of Solomon’s Temple could connect Christ to David (Solomon’s father who was not just a religious leader, but a king of the province of Judea). In that sense, Jerusalem, as the new capital of the Crusaders’ Latin Kingdom, was at once a spiritual centre, a subject of monar-
chy, and a military headquarters.

It is within this newly-appropriated space, known to the Crusades as the Temple, that Chris-
tian’s first monastic-military order was estab-
lished: the Templars. Officially called “the Poor Knights of Christ and the Temple of Solomon,” the Templars took an oath of charity and pov-
erty that was based on the Rule of St. Benedict. While monastic in character, the Order’s main duty was military: to police and protect pilgrims along the route to the Holy Land, who were perpetually harassed by robbers. The order received Papal approval in 1126 from Honorius II, and thus became an official body of warrior-monks, living by faith and force. In the Temple Mount, the

Knights converted the mosque into a basilica, an armoury, and lodging; in the Dome of the Rock they built St James’ chapel and a sanctuary for Mary; beneath the Temple Mount, an existing e
Jerusalem, 84

138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146

The Templars arrived in London, one of the West’s most powerful secular centres, in 1128. By 1144 they were given a site in Holborn, on a former Roman road, where they built their first church. In 1161, the expansion of the Order had led the Templars to move to a new location given by King Henry II (1154-1189) on the banks of the Thames, just off the bridge later known as Ludgate and Westminster. On the Thames, the Templars had both access to transportation and the prestige of the river exposure. This relocation to a new site was an exchanged gift, the construction of their first Church (the Old Temple) proves the Order’s success in acquiring funds and their desire to showcase their power. The Templars’ new site was an exalted precipice that was protected from the city by walls and gates where they built gardens, courtyards and lodging for three groups: the fully-professed knights, the non-professed armours (who were their domestic servants) and the ordained priests, who were appointed by the knights. At the center of the precinct was the Temple Church: the order’s focal point, it was a place for the celebration of mass, the conducting of business, the royal treasury, and a source of revenue from pilgrims.

Following the idea of analogy, I argue that the Temple Church became a target of a source that had now changed: it did not only refer structurally to the relationship between the basilica and rotunda in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, but also to the composition of the two shrines on Temple Mount, the former basilica and the domed-octagon. The ritualisation of these spaces will be explored below as a new analogous Jerusalem came to rise in London, appropriating not only Jerusalem’s spiritual aura, but also its economic power and political charisma.

Like in Jerusalem, the Temple Church is composed of two distinct components: a rotunda, also called the “Round”, and a rectangular choir. In the Round, an inner ring of six marble pillars, each consisting of a cluster of four columns, is encircled by a lower vaulted ambulatory. Above the central space, eight arched windows punctuated the thick mass of the drum, which is supported by exterior buttresses. The Round was consecrated in 1185, and only half a century later, with the presence of King Henry III (1216-1272), the construction of the Temple’s choir began just as Henry III decided to be buried there in 1231, when a generous grant was offered to the Order, most likely to rebuild their then-modest choir.

However, I would argue that these similarities are strictly stylistic and ignore the spatial, compositional, or analogous relationship to Jerusalem. When Jansen writes that “any dismantling to typologies in Jerusalem can be surmised” and that “the hall–church choir bears no readily comprehensible relationship to structures in Jerusalem,” she ignores the function of the two structures and the dynamic relationship between them. In fact, the ritualisation of these two spaces by the Templars, priests, and pilgrims are analogous to the ones practiced in Jerusalem. This analogy may not be a visual one (a “superficial” analogy), but its compositional similarities (a “structural” analogy) nevertheless bear a striking resemblance to the structures in Jerusalem.

Much like the Holy Sepulchre complex in Jerusalem and Santo Stefano in Bologna, the Temple Church in London served the liturgical needs of both its local population and of visiting pilgrims. As an institutionalised order, the Templars spent their time away from prayers not only by collecting alms and rent, but also by participating in Chapter meetings. These official

stone quarry was renamed the Stable of Solomon, where thousands of horses and camels were kept; and cisterns, cloisters, workshops, and gardens were erected upon the plateau they built on the Temple Mount, they nevertheless maintained a close connection to the Holy Sepulchre by safeguarding the keys to the treasure where the Holy Cross was kept.

Back in the West, the Templars played a major role in crusading efforts by providing two valuable resources: wealth and manpower. The Order acted as a depository of royal treasuries or moneylenders, collecting alms in gold, jewellery, and land. Especially, the Templars were powerful bankers: for example, they loaned monies to King Baldwin in an attempt to secure a relic of the True Cross, and in 1213 they loaned King John 1,100 marks to obtain troops by mobilising funds and goods from the West to the East, their rise to power coincided with the monetisation of Europe in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, and were contemporaries to the development of the urban realm. Indeed, the Templars recognised the economic advantage of the city and treated it as a source of income by receiving land from the Church and renting it to the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite. Between the immunity of income by receiving land from the Church and rent from the elite.
The altar at the eastern wall of the choir created focal points—the Round on the west and the basilica space of the choir, where all believers were invited to partake in service, and the Round, where only those accepted into the order could enter during a specific ritual. This is clearly analogous to the relationship in Jerusalem between the Basilica and Rotunda, replicating the spatial manifestation of the community’s hierarchy that is described by Egeria. The weeklong mass was attended not only by the brothers, but also by officials of the crown who were in the precinct to conduct business and, of course, pilgrims. The latter were frequent, as the Pope granted indulgences (the deduction of sixty days in purgatory) for those who visited the church annually. Its location between Westminster and St. Paul’s meant that the Temple Church was easily accessible on the pilgrim’s route through the city, and its display of relics from Jerusalem, such as wood from the cross and the blood of Christ, assured its popularity. Inside the church, the two distinct focal points—the Round on the west and the altar at the eastern wall of the choir—created an ambivalent hierarchy of space. As such, when the Eucharist was performed in the altar, the congregation had to turn its back on the Round. This means that the sequential quality of Jerusalem’s complex—from the propylaea through the basilica, the atrium and finally the Anastasis—did not translate coherently to London, where the entrance was on the southern edge, and those who enter the church are positioned directly facing the altar. This disorienting setting is further enhanced by the fact that the Round lacks a central element—its ring of inner piers does not surround one but several graves in the form of effigies of knights, that mark the knights’ cemetery below.

While there is a clear analogical relationship to the Church of the Holy Sepulchre in terms of the service’s hierarchy and visual similarity of the altar, there is also a space that can be drawn from the Temple Mount where the Templar Order was founded. In terms of composition, the Dome of the Rock and Al Aqsa Mosque are both placed on either side of a star platform along the same axis, but the location of the Qibla, towards the East, orients the worshippers away from the Dome. The Temple’s choir is similar to the fastidious condition created in the Temple Mount, with its uniform field of marble piers, evenly-difused light and diminished hierarchy between the naves. In that sense, the Temple Church is an analogical target with two sources, encapsulating the fluidity of memory when it comes to the recollection of Jerusalem after the Crusades. Indeed, from its very moment of foundation on the non-existing Temple of Solomon, it seems thus as if the Anastasis Rotunda and the Dome of the Rock were interchangeable, both in appearance, symbolic value, and historical tradition. The Templar’s seal, depicting a decorated dome atop an arched drum, was cited by historians as both the Holy Sepulchre and the Temple Mount; while an attempt to prove either can prove the original intentions, it seems irrelevant. Modern authors are not dissimilar; in his Architectural Illustrations and Account of the Temple Church (1838) the Nineteenth Century British architect Robert W. Billings writes of the Temple’s origins:

“The Temple Church, built and instituted by the Templars in London, was a copy (and doubts it is many of its details) from the Temple at Jerusalem, of which the purpose of their institution as a military order gave them the possession and guardianship. Of that Temple at Jerusalem, they copied the general form of Solomon supplied beyond the question the archetypical, if not material model.”

The fact that the actual Temple of Solomon was gone for over fifteen hundred years when the Crusades captured its site and the lack of physical traces to supply both “archetypical [and] material models” did not matter to Billings or to the Templars. Connecting the Templars to Solomon and thus to the dynasty of Hebrew Monarch was crucial for the narrative of Christian victory, which finally united the earthly and heavenly Jerusalem. Before the final assault on Jerusalem in 1099, the Duke of Normandy told his soldiers: “Here you see the cause of all our labours. This Jerusalem is the reflection of the heavenly Jerusalem. This city has the form of the city to which we aspire [...] this Jerusalem you see, which you face, prefigures and represents the heavenly city.”

This patrimonial and physical possession of unified Jerusalem was readily translated into the urban realm of London, where the Templars embodied their metaphor of power in London’s urban fabric, reminding locals and visitors of their privileged position both in the East, as rulers of the Holy City, and in the West, as tightly connected to the monarchy. The analogy was constructed by utilizing a stylistic framework that resonates with the Southern-England royal and noble patronage of the government, while incorporating a spatial logic that was imported from Jerusalem’s mobile and hierarchical liturgy. This transfer was not restricted to a singular monument, a sacred icon or a symbolic element, but as a complex of scriptural and contemporary references that were distinctively urban.

According to Annabel Wharton, this “inscription of an eastern presence into a western urban landscape uncannily corresponded to the Templar’s role in the West’s increasing familiarity with money and its abstraction.” Indeed, during the economic expansion of Europe’s cities, the body in charge of transferring capital from the West to the occupation of the East celebrated its victory through the image of the city of Jerusalem. The Temple then appropriated Jerusalem’s raciality through institutionalised force exploited the city’s political charisma in order to construct a house for their accumulated capital, a monument of their political power, and a vessel for their monastic faith.

The INTELLIGENCE OF ANALOGY

If we return to the definition of analogy by A Agamben, we will learn that his reading of Aristotle defines analogy not as an induction nor a deduction, but a transfer of intelligibility from one singular to another singular. Within this framework, understanding Bologna and London as analogous Jerusalem can be seen through the transfer of the specific intelligibility of Jerusalem—from its hierarchical spatial compositions within the church across the services to a city-wide distribution of monuments—into the Western urban realm, where the analogy played a crucial role in the local development of religious power, civic identity, and economy.
The spatial logic discussed in this chapter is not only analogous to specific monuments in urban Europe, but is also embodied in the life of a Christian pilgrim and the tension in the Christian religion at large. The perpetual movement between the centrifugal and the axial is embedded in every stage of the pilgrim’s journey—a directional horizontal movement versus defined points of rest, or a passive participation in a mass congregation versus an inward focus on personal meditation. This configuration also embodies the contradiction in the founding principles of the church—the university of St Paul and his followers, embodied in the egalitarian rotunda, versus the hierarchical structure of power, developed since the second century, expressed in the linear composition of the basilica. In the Renaissance, architects attempted to solve this tension by designing churches that were both centralised and axial, such as the Santissima Annunziata in Florence by Leon Battista Alberti and San Bernardino in Urbino by Francesco di Giorgio. The latter exemplifies the ultimate abstraction of the basilica and rotunda, combining a wide transept with a centralised plan, the dome supported only by four monumental columns. The plan of San Bernardino shows how, with imagination and abstraction, archetypal concepts can be resolved in an innovative design, where universality and hierarchy are not in conflict but coincide in a spatial arrangement that derives meaning from their tension. Indeed, the intelligence of analogical thinking is not confined to the transfer of spatial relations, but of a sociospatial system of rituals. As such, when this system was abstracted from its origin in Jerusalem into the metropolitan centers of urbanising Europe, it replicated not only a structural composition but a hierarchical system of Christian recollection. This geographical re-distribution of collective memories to analogous Jerusalems provided pilgrims with an easier path to recollection, while subjecting its faculty to multiple bodies of power that exploited its spiritual charisma for political and economic gain. In other words, the intelligence of analogical thinking has been utilised as a form of control over those who seek to locate their memories, who saw this spiritual desire as an opportunity for the transfer (and division) of power from one epicenter to its analogues.

While analogical thinking is not innocent, it should nevertheless be noted for its embedded potential in the field of sacred space. Behind the idea of the analogy we find an incredible imaginative capability that sees the notion of “real” as flexible and adaptable. Considering the violent wars that wage over sacred space, the value of alternative sanctuaries could not be overstated. Rather than searching for a singular site of objective authenticity, analogies allow for a proliferation of subjective truths that relieve the need for territorial specificity. Memories that were initially located in Jerusalem could then travel and multiply, creating temporalities for those seeking affective recollection, so long as the orientation of structures, landscape and rituals remains towards Jerusalem.

![Figure 16: Temple Church of the Knights Templars (1185 AD) Inns of Court, City of London. Photo by the author, 2019](image)
STATION TO STATION

THEATRICALITY AND DISCIPLINE OF THE VIA CRUCIS IN THE SACRED MOUNTAIN OF VARALLO

The Stations of the Cross, also called the Via Crucis (Way of the Cross), is one of the most common rituals in the Catholic church. It consists of a sequence of numbered stations that commemorate Christ’s Passion, encompassing the sentencing, crucifixion, and entombment of Jesus. Today, the Stations of the Cross have been standardised and conceptualised both in their appearance and in their ritual protocol. Typically, there are fourteen stations: each one is numbered, marked with a wooden cross, and arranged along a circuit at intervals of a distance relative to the scale of the site. Usually located along the aisles of Catholic churches, in monastic cloisters, or across an urban quarter, the stations must be followed as a single devotional sequence. The movement between stations is a crucial element in the ritualised re-enactment of the Passion: it heightens the recollection of events that occurred in the Holy Land by embodying their spatial dispersion across a broad sacred topography.

The underlying mechanism of the Via Crucis derives from the paradoxic nature of the station as a sign that marks a stop in order to perpetuate movement. These periodic stoppages are instrumental in unravelling the Christological narrative and dividing it into fragments that are easier to grasp as episodes. The re-enactment of the Passion, a violent event full of tragedy and drama, maintains a degree of control by choreographing the narrative as a serial progression of emotions, formulating a mode of spirituality that is inherently theatrical. Theatrical, indeed, as each station must be staged, like a scene, through time, space, and text; theatrical, as the compositional relationship on the plane of interaction (the frame of a picture, the boundaries of a stage, the edge of a bas-relief or the viewing hole of a tableau) is directed towards a captive audience, and it harbours emotional excess that is known from theater.

This theological strategy was mobilised by the Franciscan Order in the late Middle Ages, but by the sixteenth century its legitimacy was being undermined by figures of the Reformation, who saw its embedded theatricality as a risk. This gave rise to a debate around the use of images in religious representation. To explore this dispute around the employment and restriction of theatricality, this chapter will study one of the most radical renditions of the Stations of the Cross—the Sacri Monti (sacred mountains), erected as strongholds of Catholic piety in the Italian Alps during the crucial decades of Protestant reform. Specifically, it will explore the inception, destruction, and reconstruction of the first example of such religious complexes: the Sacro Monte di Varallo (1491), which became a laboratory of artistic experimentation aimed at disciplining religious representations and taming excessive affectivity. Indeed, by the end of the turbulent sixteenth century, Varallo had undergone a radical disciplinary process: its artistic program was recreated under a new visual regime that encapsulated the moral and theological reform of the Catholic church. Devout, decent, and direct, Varallo’s art modelled an abundance of restraint not only in the use of images, but also in its tolerance for imagination, physical movement, and Christian behaviour. Varallo thus became a blueprint for stational devotion: the critical purge of theatricality brought to prominence a counter-belief in legibility, which ultimately shaped the coherent Catholic ritual we know today.
Jerusalem, the Stations of the Cross are known today as the Via Dolorosa (Way of Suffering), leading from the Arch of Ecce Homo (where Christ was struck) to Calvary (where Christ was crucified). The first documented pilgrimage through this route took place at the end of the thirteenth century, though a definitive route was established only in the fourteenth century. For the precedent for this route, wrote a pilgrim in 1384, was the Virgin Mary’s own pilgrimage between “the sites of her son’s last days in Jerusalem.” “Somewhat perplexingly, this Passion route did not follow the topographical locations of Christ’s real journey in Jerusalem, but oscillated between places of veneration that were enabled by Jerusalem’s conditions. The itinerary of the Via Cruxis was neither geographically nor scripturally accurate, but derived from a geopolitical reality in Mamluk Jerusalem. Indeed, since the fall of Acre, the last Crusader’s stronghold in the Holy Land, in 1291, Christian territoriality had been suppressed in Palestine by the local regime, and the movement of Christian visitors was limited.

Yet even under Islamic rule in Palestine, Christian presence in the Holy Land was not completely eradicated, maintaining its continuity through the work of the Third Order of the Franciscans. The Order’s founder, St Francis of Assisi, died in 1226, and the 13th century saw a mission that was spiritual as well as political, aiming to create diplomatic ties by meeting with the local Sultan. A century later, in 1324, the Franciscans replaced the Crusaders’ military expeditions and became the official custodians of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. Over the next two centuries, the monastic order would gradually obtain control over additional sites in and around the Holy City from the rulers of neighbouring provinces. By establishing an earthly foothold with monasteries and convents, while also expanding existing shrines with chapels and crypts, they aimed to facilitate recollection in a way they (and future pilgrims) knew the Franciscans to be capable of conducting their limited space in imaginative ways. Using a pietistic method of emotional devotion that originated in the monastic West, the Franciscans extensified the sites of Jerusalem with vivid verbal descriptions that conjured up the backdrop of Christ’s first-century Jerusalem to reframe the contemporary locations. The Dominican friar Felix Fabri, who travelled to the Holy Land in 1480, described being led in a group by a Franciscan guide through the route where “Christ was led out of the city along that path burdened with the heavy cross.” Along this journey, they stopped at places where Jesus “fell beneath the load of the cross, or [was] assailed by some special outrage, [or] where he was scourged and crowned.” In 1506, Sir Richard Gough likewise wrote that he “visited all the long way by which our Saviour Christ was led from the house of Pilate to the place of the Crucifixion,” visiting locations where Christ “had suffered many injuries,” took a bit from the bishop’s servants, “was scorned, his face covered and bloomed,” and “most egregiously beaten.” These dramatic descriptions transformed “empty” topographic locations into a theatrical sequence of encounters, a spectacle projected on the city through affective imagination. Emotionally and physically exhausting, these organised tours were incredibly difficult for many pilgrims. Guylforde, for example, died from exhaustion six days after arriving in Jerusalem.

This ritualisation of urban movement through stops and regular intervals of movement formed the core of the canonical fourteen Stations of the Cross. Though the route had varied significantly over time in terms of arrangement, number of stations, and distances, the Via Crucis, gradually separated into a distinct geographical and spiritual entity in every pilgrim’s visit to Jerusalem. In fact, the word station (in a sense of a halting-place in a procession) first appeared in the narrative of the English pilgrim William Wey in 1462 as a spiritual exercise that was complete in itself. However tiring their journeys, the pilgrims who wrote these detailed manuscripts of Christ’s suffering in Jerusalem made no pious displays of compassion; if anything, Passion-led devotion in Jerusalem reveals little sign of emotion: the main contents include a list of places visited, distances between stations, costs of travel, and even observations on the behaviour of locals, but no affection or personal reactions felt by the pilgrim. This uniform authorial voice reflects local prohibitions on displaying such emotions along the journey. Calvary, according to a sixteenth-century pilgrim: “we had no more compassion than just to see them as we passed on our way, since it is not permitted to make any halt nor to pay veneration to them with uncovered head, nor to make any other demonstration, nor to look at them fixedly, nor to write nor take any notes in public.” Indeed, in Jerusalem itself, any form of outward compassion was forbidden, as can be seen in the pilgrimage of Margery Kempe, the only known woman in the early modern period to write such an account. In 1414, after buying her freedom from her husband and their fourteen children, Kempe embarked on a Franciscan-led journey of extreme piety. In Calvary, she cried “in a loud voice, as though she were a thousand times broken.” In Bethlem, she showed such excessive devotion through weeping and sobbing that her fellow travellers would not let her eat in their company.
Kempe’s outward reaction to her imaginative visualisation was not only unusual in Jerusalem, but also inappropriate; it reflected a pious activity that, from the Franciscans’ perspective, was a representation of truly compassionate devotion that was unthinkable in Jerusalem itself. Indeed, an immersive recollection of Christ’s route to salvation could only be carried away from the political and geographical constraints of earthly Jerusalem, making it the least plausible place to practise the Stations of the Cross.

In the Franciscan tradition of accommodating pilgrimage in Jerusalem, the Order’s labours activities and ideological tendencies in the West. The projection of the Passion onto the urban imaginary of Jerusalem by the Franciscan guides was based on the order’s central aim to bring religion into everyday reality, to stage the events of Christ’s life and death within a familiar, situated setting, a tendency that can be described as realist. In order to humanise Christ, devotional attention was focused on his pain and suffering, in parallel with a representational shift—from a stigmatic god who had triumphed death, to a vulnerable mortal being in the flesh. On the contrary, Francis himself made the outward display of pain an integral part of devotion, through his own stigmata in 1228 and the “love of the poor and compassion for the sick”. This radical shift from icon to realism was portrayed in Passion-related imagery, now focused on scenes of betrayal, flagellation, mocking, the bleeding crucifixion, and the entombment—all the events that were later commemorated in Jerusalem’s urban space by the same monastic order. In time, non-scriptural events (such as the struggle of the Franciscans to gain a greater presence in Jerusalem and the Holy Land) were added to stretch out the narrative leading up to the execution. These episodic representations attempted to induce contemplation on Christ’s humanity in order to bring personal religious experience to the events of Christ’s life. In the Franciscan tradition of accommodating pilgrimage in Jerusalem, these non-scriptural events were transformed into the Stations of the Cross by the Franciscans, and then further developed during the thirteenth century, when the stations appeared in Europe in the late fourteenth century.

The agency of the visual was promoted by the Franciscan philosopher Bonaventure (1221–1274), who wrote that the humanist overtones of humility, forgiveness, and kindness, this new real embodiment of the Franciscan mentality that culminated, one century later, with Ciotto’s Italian painting. The humanist-realist representation of the Passion had a didactic purpose to be a popular vehicle for the imitation of Christ by the laity in their own surroundings. This style was widely disseminated after the death of St Francis in 1228, when the order embarked on a large-scale project to erect permanent buildings decorated with images of the humanised Christ. In highly dramatic and brutally detailed sequential compositions, these frame-by-frame representations of the Passion fragmented an event whose violence and cruelty would otherwise be too harsh to grasp. These artworks not only addressed the desire for a realistic depiction of the Passion, but also created an episodic progression not dissimilar from the sacramental devotion in Jerusalem itself, making use of the theatricality introduced by Francis. These artworks not only stirred the pius beholder to emotional reaction, but also encouraged an identification with the moral code of Christ: a life of submission, patience, innocence, and obedience.

The agency of the visual was promoted by the Franciscan mentality that culminated, one century later, with Ciotto’s Italian painting. The humanist-realist representation of the Passion had a didactic purpose to be a popular vehicle for the imitation of Christ by the laity in their own surroundings. This style was widely disseminated after the death of St Francis in 1228, when the order embarked on a large-scale project to erect permanent buildings decorated with images of the humanised Christ. In highly dramatic and brutally detailed sequential compositions, these frame-by-frame representations of the Passion fragmented an event whose violence and cruelty would otherwise be too harsh to grasp. These artworks not only addressed the desire for a realistic depiction of the Passion, but also created an episodic progression not dissimilar from the sacramental devotion in Jerusalem itself, making use of the theatricality introduced by Francis. These artworks not only stirred the pius beholder to emotional reaction, but also encouraged an identification with the moral code of Christ: a life of submission, patience, innocence, and obedience. The agency of the visual was promoted by the Franciscan mentality that culminated, one century later, with Ciotto’s Italian painting. The humanist-realist representation of the Passion had a didactic purpose to be a popular vehicle for the imitation of Christ by the laity in their own surroundings. This style was widely disseminated after the death of St Francis in 1228, when the order embarked on a large-scale project to erect permanent buildings decorated with images of the humanised Christ. In highly dramatic and brutally detailed sequential compositions, these frame-by-frame representations of the Passion fragmented an event whose violence and cruelty would otherwise be too harsh to grasp. These artworks not only addressed the desire for a realistic depiction of the Passion, but also created an episodic progression not dissimilar from the sacramental devotion in Jerusalem itself, making use of the theatricality introduced by Francis. These artworks not only stirred the pius beholder to emotional reaction, but also encouraged an identification with the moral code of Christ: a life of submission, patience, innocence, and obedience. The agency of the visual was promoted by the Franciscan mentality that culminated, one century later, with Ciotto’s Italian painting. The humanist-realist representation of the Passion had a didactic purpose to be a popular vehicle for the imitation of Christ by the laity in their own surroundings. This style was widely disseminated after the death of St Francis in 1228, when the order embarked on a large-scale project to erect permanent buildings decorated with images of the humanised Christ. In highly dramatic and brutally detailed sequential compositions, these frame-by-frame representations of the Passion fragmented an event whose violence and cruelty would otherwise be too harsh to grasp. These artworks not only addressed the desire for a realistic depiction of the Passion, but also created an episodic progression not dissimilar from the sacramental devotion in Jerusalem itself, making use of the theatricality introduced by Francis. These artworks not only stirred the pius beholder to emotional reaction, but also encouraged an identification with the moral code of Christ: a life of submission, patience, innocence, and obedience. The agency of the visual was promoted by the Franciscan mentality that culminated, one century later, with Ciotto’s Italian painting.
looming at the end of the fifteenth century was the growing power of Eastern Orthodox Christi- 
nity—fostered by the fall of Constantinople to the Ottoman Turks in 1453—that was increasingly 
pressing the Franciscans out of their shrines and putting into question their papally-awarded 
Custodia Tera Sancta 

When Caimi returned to Italy, he embarked on a project to provide a local alternative to Jerusalem pilgrimage. Obtaining financial aid and papal permission, Caimi began the construction of a spiritual complex atop an uninhabited hillside by the Sesia river, whose topography resembled that of Jerusalem—at least in his eyes. Within this imaginary landscape, he erected three chapels and renamed some elements of the terrain: the Holy Sepulchre on the hill of “Mount Calvary”, Nazareth by “Mount Tabor,” and Bethlehem below “Mount Zion.” Caimi declared that the spatial configuration of the chapels, the corresponding location, resulting in a combination of physical and mental imagination that was never possible through meditation guidebooks, and certain in Jerusalem itself. In 1507, the ambassador to the king of France, Gerolamo Morone, visited the Sacro Monte at Varallo. He recorded his moving visit in an emotional letter to his friend, the poet Lancino Curzio: “Because of the difficulties and dangers endured by the pilgrims who visit Mount Calvary in Jerusalem, the Franciscans have built in Varallo a copy... The events of the Gospels are represented in many chapels into which I was introduced by a pious friar who has seen the place where the real body of Christ is buried.” Morone emphasized the leadership of a local friar in Varallo, who had seen the real sites and could confirm that the “dis- tances between these chapels and the structures in which the events are reproduced correspond exactly to the originals.” Precision and specificity were thus crucial to the erection of what he called a copy that was not only identical, but possibly even superior to the real one. He concludes:

“...never saw anything more pious or devout. I have never seen anything that could pierce the heart more, which could compel one to neglect everything else and follow Christ alone... I let cease henceforth those so-called Roman stations; let even the Jerusalem pilgrimage... [the] religious site surpasses all antiquity.”

Indeed, Caimi’s isolated complex was created from the dangers posed by a politically and economically charged urban entity. As a local Je- rusalem, it could be both Herodian (i.e. first cen- tury AD) and Mamluk, yet typologically entirely vernacular. It fulfilled Caimi’s desire to create a local stage for devotion in a place that was once remote and accessible.

However, the site relied on the capability of the devout to generate a mental image; in that sense, it was not much different from Jerusalem itself, requiring much imaginative labour from the believer. Considering the site’s audience—the semi-literate lay people and the unlettered clergy of vernacular origins—Caimi’s analogical Holy Land was not enough. Hence, to reach a popular audience, the order’s verbal sermons had to be translated into tangible representations using hyper-real art. This resulted in a project that would become what Rudolf Wittkower called “one of the most extraordinary enterprises in the history of Catholic devotion and religious art.”

The site’s artistic program owes its form to the Valencian artist Gaudenzio Ferrari. Born in 1476, he arrived in Varallo in 1513 as an accom- plished artisan, a painter, philosopher and math- ematician. Ferrari’s project in Varallo sought to expand Caimi’s miniature Holy Land into a stag- ing of Christ’s life and death by transforming each of the existing chapels (plus some twenty more) into a biblical tableau vivant using architecture, sculpture, relief, and paintings. With life-size terra-cotta figures, perspectival illusionism, nat- ural light, and the site’s topographic conditions, Ferrari created mini-theatres that made Christ’s Passion an immediate reality. By 1524, close to thirty chapels were built in this manner, trans- forming the religious complex from a toponomy- constellation of markers to an elaborate facsimile of the life of Christ.

In order to address the site’s audience, Ferrari’s polychrome figures were dressed in clothes made from real fabric, their heads covered with wigs, beards made from horsehair, and their eyes made of glass pebbles. Other accessories and accessories, such as chairs, ropes, buckets, and beds, were incorporated with the painted and sculpted. Finally, sand, soil, and earth covered the chapel’s floor, merging the site’s landscape with scenic murals, and the Holy Land with Varallo. The use of vernacular imagery—regional clothes, landscapes, and even facial features—mediated the distant and foreign through the familiar and homely. The use of utilitarian objects in religious art merged the sacred with the everyday, giving a realistic form to the unseen, thus aligning Varallo with the Franciscan mission of giving Christ’s humanity a palpable immedia- cy. Rooted in medieval drama, yet enhanced by Renaissance techniques, these illusionary details transformed each chapel into a comprehensible episode from the life of Christ, to be read as a scene in the drama of Calvary, enacted as a station in the theatrical ritual.

Over the next three decades, the site grew exponentially, both in scale and detail, into what Wittkower described as “an enterprise rarely matched in its successful appeal to popular imagina- tion.” It was popular, for its intention was to deliver a clear, intense, and emotional message; popular for its childlike simplicity and immedi- acy; popular for staging spirituality with extreme
Ferrari’s unidealised art was not invented in Varallo; it recapitulated a religious sentiment that stemmed from twelfth- and thirteenth-century monastic spirituality, conceived in St Francis’s nativity in Greccio. In fact, affective life-size representations had been readily used in the sculptural works of Italian artists such as Guido Mazzoni and Niccolò dell’Arca, who created compositions of life-sized polychrome figures before Ferrari brought them to Varallo. Born in Modena around 1450, Guido Mazzoni spent fifty years working as an artist, goldsmith, and sculptor, creating ultra-realistic votive tableaux for various clients. Featuring extreme facial expressions and dramatic stagings, his life-size terracotta and wax figures were created using life casts for hands and faces (often those of his patrons and commissioners), and included glass eyes and real clothing, armour, and weapons. His works were considered ‘depraved’ as the immediacy of his figures conjured up violent emotional excitement, much like church dramas in which spectators were expected to react and partake in a display of intense emotions as proof of penance.

Mazzoni’s contemporary, Niccolò dell’Arca, used similar techniques but took the attributes of theatricality even further to intensify the visual excitement and invoke the beholder’s senses. His Bewailing Group from 1463, for example, is a devastating scene of pain and emotional agony portrayed by six figures that surround Christ’s still, dead body. In this carefully composed tableau, each archetypal actor performs its precise role, inducing a whole range of emotions: from scornful hatred and wrath, to sadness and arro-gance; from generous forgiveness to heartfelt sorrow, loving sympathy, and all-consuming empathy. Placed in churches and patrons’ graves, these groups merged scriptural characters with vernacular figures, and fused Christian history with personal sorrows.

Despite the artistic similarities, the work of Mazzoni and dell’Arca differs from Ferrari’s in several ways. Their performative involvement activated the scene; standing between the two spaces at the doorway, they were witnesses to the moment of Christ’s birth, caught between the Magi, Mary, and Joseph. Ferrari’s greatest creation was the chapel of Calvary, completed in 1520 on the site of the original chapel built by Caimi. Located at the top of the complex, it is a simple monumental room, built as a continuous surface from walls to ceiling, painted with an immersive scenography of panoramic murals. In the centre, three wooden crosses (today the only wooden sculptures in the site) emerge from an artificial elevated bedrock, surrounded by the motionless bleeding Christ who bows his head, around him, twenty figures (some sculpted, some painted) contrast his static gesture with a hyperactive display of dynamic movement and intense emotions of excitement, devotion, and pain. His mother collapses into the arms of her companions, her arms outstretched with despair; Roman soldiers play a game over Christ’s garments; a grotesque tormentor reaches out to Christ with a sponge soaked in vinegar; and St John gazes at the crosses. In addition to these canonical figures, Ferrari composed sub-narratives with criminals, witnesses, mothers carrying children, wild horses, and dancing angels. This constellation of Franciscan-themed, para-scriptural occurrences echoes the fragmentation of the Passion as it was expanded in the mind, through meditation guidebooks, and physically, at new locations and markers in Jerusalem’s city space in the centuries to come.

Indeed, since the stigmatisation of St Francis himself, readers and beholders were encouraged to become not just spectators but actual actors through identification. Empathy was crucial: the power of the observer to project herself into the object of contemplation in order to fully understand it.

In the chapel of the nativity, for example, a pilgrim could take part in the events that happened in Bethlehem. Located down the hill from Varallo’s Calvary, the complex of nativity chapels was completed in 1528 by Caudenzo Ferrari. Upon entry, the pilgrim encounters the Procession of the Magi to Christ’s birth: a densely populated space filled with life-sized sculptures, surrounded by floor-to-ceiling scenographic murals, scriptural characters, and their accompanying crowd. The first magus holds a golden box in his hand, dressed in a gold tunic with blue boots; his ter-racotta face, framed by long horsehair, is painted black to represent his African origin, following literally the tradition of the Magi being from the continents of the world. Behind him another ‘black’ figure looks upward towards a sculpted horse emerging from the wall in relief, adding a sense of movement frozen in time. The second magus holds a gift for Christ the child, wearing a blue tunic and red cape. He looks towards the ‘sky’, where a carefully placed skylight sheds a ray down onto the chapel, presumably representing the star that directs their way, in this case into the next room, where Mary and Joseph cradle their newborn.

At night, guided only by the Franciscans and candles, Varallo’s pilgrims would join the procession. Passing between the characters and paintings, they would pass through a small door from the chapel into the Nativity Grotto. Their performative involvement activated the scene; standing between the two spaces at the doorway, they were witnesses to the moment of Christ’s birth, caught between the Magi, Mary, and Joseph. Ferrari’s greatest creation was the chapel of Calvary, completed in 1520 on the site of the original chapel built by Caimi. Located at the top of the complex, it is a single monumental room, built as a continuous surface from walls to ceiling, painted with an immersive scenography of panoramic murals. In the centre, three wooden crosses (today the only wooden sculptures in the site) emerge from an artificial elevated bedrock, surrounding the motionless bleeding Christ who bows his head, around him, twenty figures (some sculpted, some painted) contrast his static gesture with a hyperactive display of dynamic movement and intense emotions of excitement, devotion, and pain. His mother collapses into the arms of her companions, her arms outstretched with despair; Roman soldiers play a game over Christ’s garments; a grotesque tormentor reaches out to

Fig 9: The Procession of the Magi, the Bethlehem Complex (1518) by Gaudenzio Ferrari. Photo by the author, 2019.
The participatory theatricality in the chapels of the Nativity and Calvary demonstrate an absolute reliance on the spectator in order to complete the artwork. This condition was criticised, half a millennium later, by Michael Fried in his seminal essay “Art and Objecthood” (1967). Fried rejected the tenets of minimalist art, where the condition of theatricality mandates participation from the beholder. He criticised the condition in which the space that surrounds an artwork becomes integral to the piece itself—when objects, light, and bodies become equal components—meaning that an artwork can only be complete when a spectator is present. Instead, he claimed that the distinction between art and life should be reinstated, and an artwork should be complete in itself. For him, a condition of “stage presence,” where there was no distinction between art and life, was aggressive and obtuse, requiring “special complicity that the work extorts from the beholder”; in fact, he claims that “art degenerates as it approaches the condition of theatre.”

Before exploring Varallo’s renovation, it might be beneficial to reiterate what the Counter-Reformation put at stake in the realm of visual representation and the use of images. Following Martin Luther’s attack on Catholicism in the early sixteenth century, the Catholic Church worked to reinvent itself by responding to the Protestant accusations of its exploitation and abuse of religious power. Beyond the character of the church itself, the Refor- mers condemned its blasphemous practices, idolatrous rituals, and forms of affective piety, and attempted to reframe its dramatic rituals as merely a key to internal vision; the Augustian theological lineage that considered external vision to be simply a key to internal vision; the Augustinian condition of “stage presence,” where there was no distinction between art and life, was aggressive and obtuse, requiring “special complicity that the work extorts from the beholder”; in fact, he claims that “art degenerates as it approaches the condition of theatre.”

Michael Fried’s discussion of theatricality had no intentional connection to Varallo’s chapels, yet his critique of minimalist art sheds light on Ferrari’s project. Pilgrims, as spectator-actors, animated each scene through their participation. Whether as a member of the Magi procession or a witness in Christ’s crucifixion, each pilgrim played an active role in a drama, acting out emot- ions of puzzelement, grief, and anger amongside members of Christ’s family and his followers, thus completing the theological function of the chapels. Hence, it was the bodies of spectators, the plastic arts, the natural landscape, and the site’s ephemeral conditions, such as weather and light, that created the possibility of complete immersion. Fried criticised exactly this co-de-pendence between person, words, object, place, and themselves. At Varallo offered pilgrims complete engagement and uninterrupted meditation.

Varallo’s artistic verisimilitude joins a devotional lifelike external vision to be simply a key to internal vision; the Augustinian in seeing to order in the scene. However, Ferrari’s creation was so intensely sensory that it threatened to overwhelm a belief but an end in itself, a representation for its own performative sake. Aesthetic pleasure would divert the pilgrim from the representation’s function as a stepping stone to spiritual ascension; it would lead to the veneration of the representation rather than what it represented. By the middle of the sixteenth century, there was a clear appreciation of the risk in Varallo’s theatricality and the unquestioned Catholic obedience it would foster. As Ferrari was completing his masterpieces in Varallo—the chapels of Bethlehem and Calvary in 1521—the first waves of iconoclasm were arriving from the north, the fear of superstitious, idolatrous, and emotionally compelling images, rep- resenting the work as church officials in dispensing salvation, thus carving a direct path between the individual and God.

In this religious climate, the use of images became a crucial issue. While the extreme Reformers hoped to supress any kind of religious representation, the Counter-Reformation sought to reclaim the agency of visual art in light of the Protestant critique. Images were to be used only in a legitimate way that served a didactic religious purpose, rather than allowing superstitions to rise from the work itself. The rich variety of characters, plots, and narratives in late-medi- eval religious art would have to be redacted and replaced with a pious simplicity. Direct, austere, and emotionally compelling images, represent- ing scenes from the Old and New Testaments (preferably those of a tragic character), would be expressly portrayed with theatrical precision, leaving little room for spontaneous imagine- ing. This restraint reflected both the church’s remorse over its recent misbehaviour, but also the Catholic appropriation (and internalisation) of the Protestant assertion that discipline should come from within oneself.

Since visual representations were to serve a didactic purpose (following St Gregory’s claim
that Gospel illuminations are “the book of the unlearned”, a set of instructions had to be devised for both image-makers and the clergy. Indeed, artists were to illustrate the merits of Christian dogma in a manner that would prevent the possibility of confusion and distraction. This set of guidelines was legislated in the Council of the Catholic Church in Trent between 1545 and 1563, held in response to the Protestant Reform. 

Reforming Varallo: Shields and Fixed Itineraries

Vulnerable to a Protestant invasion from the north and largely affiliated with Catholic Milan, Varallo stood at the forefront of the Counter-Reformation. It was also an important center of pilgrimage, a devotion which often took place in the town between 1545 and 1563. In order to direct the pilgrimage images, the Council gave orders to the clergy that “great care and diligence be used herein by bishops, as that there be nothing seen that is disorderly, but that the images are sober, unconfusingly arranged and attended in a disorderly fashion. This not only caused confusion amongst pilgrims, but also distracted their minds from the solitary contemplation of the emotional clarity they needed for spiritual ascension, compassion, and recollection. However, in the second half of the sixteenth century, Varallo would retake the centre-stage with a project of reconstruction which led to the site’s revival, following an elaborately program to adjust, restrain, and discipline its theatricality by reinstating theological precision.

In their quest to delink the signified from the signifier, the church made it clear that these images were mere representations, not sacred themselves. These were “prototypes” of the divine, visual aids to imagine that which we cannot see, giving the devout observer a “great profit [...] because the miracles which God had performed by means of the saints [...] are set before the eyes of the faithful.” In order to direct the pilgrimage images, the Council gave orders to the clergy that “great care and diligence be used herein by bishops, as that there be nothing seen that is disorderly, but that the images are sober, unconfusingly arranged and attended in a disorderly fashion. This not only caused confusion amongst pilgrims, but also distracted their minds from the solitary contemplation of the emotional clarity they needed for spiritual ascension, compassion, and recollection. However, in the second half of the sixteenth century, Varallo would retake the centre-stage with a project of reconstruction which led to the site’s revival, following an elaborately program to adjust, restrain, and discipline its theatricality by reinstating theological precision.

REFORMING VARALLO: SHIELDS AND FIXED ITINERARIES

Vulnerable to a Protestant invasion from the north and largely affiliated with Catholic Milan, Varallo stood at the forefront of the Counter-Reformation. It was also an important center of pilgrimage, a devotion which often took place in the town between 1545 and 1563. In order to direct the pilgrimage images, the Council gave orders to the clergy that “great care and diligence be used herein by bishops, as that there be nothing seen that is disorderly, but that the images are sober, unconfusingly arranged and attended in a disorderly fashion. This not only caused confusion amongst pilgrims, but also distracted their minds from the solitary contemplation of the emotional clarity they needed for spiritual ascension, compassion, and recollection. However, in the second half of the sixteenth century, Varallo would retake the centre-stage with a project of reconstruction which led to the site’s revival, following an elaborately program to adjust, restrain, and discipline its theatricality by reinstating theological precision.

In their quest to delink the signified from the signifier, the church made it clear that these images were mere representations, not sacred themselves. These were “prototypes” of the divine, visual aids to imagine that which we cannot see, giving the devout observer a “great profit [...] because the miracles which God had performed by means of the saints [...] are set before the eyes of the faithful.” In order to direct the pilgrimage images, the Council gave orders to the clergy that “great care and diligence be used herein by bishops, as that there be nothing seen that is disorderly, but that the images are sober, unconfusingly arranged and attended in a disorderly fashion. This not only caused confusion amongst pilgrims, but also distracted their minds from the solitary contemplation of the emotional clarity they needed for spiritual ascension, compassion, and recollection. However, in the second half of the sixteenth century, Varallo would retake the centre-stage with a project of reconstruction which led to the site’s revival, following an elaborately program to adjust, restrain, and discipline its theatricality by reinstating theological precision.

In order to direct the pilgrimage images, the Council gave orders to the clergy that “great care and diligence be used herein by bishops, as that there be nothing seen that is disorderly, but that the images are sober, unconfusingly arranged and attended in a disorderly fashion. This not only caused confusion amongst pilgrims, but also distracted their minds from the solitary contemplation of the emotional clarity they needed for spiritual ascension, compassion, and recollection. However, in the second half of the sixteenth century, Varallo would retake the centre-stage with a project of reconstruction which led to the site’s revival, following an elaborately program to adjust, restrain, and discipline its theatricality by reinstating theological precision.
The Transfiguration Chapel is but one example of Alessi’s revision of the site’s legibility. With the grille partitions, Alessi created a design to discipline the gaze in the site’s older and future chapels, presenting each tableau as a representation—not an embodiment—of the divine. To assure complete clarity, Alessi inserted a device within a device, a viewing aperture in the Vetrate. Its particular width and placement created a condition for solitary devotion, withdrawing the pilgrim from risky engagement with a group of emotional fellow-travellers. Isolation, after Trent, was crucial; pilgrimage was to return to its eremitic origins, distanced from society in self-imposed exile, undertaking spiritual exercises in private through meditation and contemplation. The pilgrim would also be protected from what Trent referred to as confusing theological messages, preventing “dangerous errors to the uneducated” by directing the gaze precisely to particular elements of the elaborate scene. Through careful placement, the viewing holes literally framed hand gestures, extreme facial expressions, and personal encounters that were familiar to the viewer from sermons. This not only made the lesson entirely legible to the viewer, but it portrayed nothing more nor less than the ‘prototypes’ prescribed in Trent.

It is important to remember that while Varallo’s stational ritual was constructed as a sequence of lessons and Christian rites to be followed physically, the route to personal salvation was contingent on an interior journey. After Trent, remission of sins and justification through action was crucial, and Alessi’s Vetrate should be viewed in the context of this religious climate. Like prayer itself, the confession of sin was spatially ordered in Milan in the 1560s through the church confessional, a device with two separate compartments for the kneeling confessor and the seated Father. Between them, a small window was fitted with a perforated metal grille, enabling the exchange of words but not glances, preventing seduction by eliminating visual and physical contact. Not dissimilar from Alessi’s Vetrate, the confessional was widely introduced in order to regulate sensorial interactions; it fixed a spatial composition as a precondition for pious activity.

An examination of a detail from Alessi’s Library shows a pilgrim kneeling before a tableau, grasping his hands, lifting his gaze, and praying in stillness. According to scholars, it is far from the truth: in 1587, Pope Sixtus V declared the Sacro Monte di Varallo a “religious monument of extraordinary antiquity” (religioso monumento insigni), and promised that a visit to each chapel within this complex would award the pilgrim with an indulgence of 100 days, an amount matched only by Jerusalem itself.

The second major revision proposed by Alessi was to give a sense of order to the physical movement of the pilgrim through the site. At a time when the church was trying to impose order and restriction on religious spaces by standardising the reception of images and their behavioural consequences, Varallo could not afford a lack of clarity. While each chapel represented a scriptural episode and an affective response, it was essentially a singular station that was part of a larger constellation in the devotional process. This process, given the site’s topographical conditions, had to be staged as a clear roadmap to salvation.

When Alessi arrived at Varallo, the neglected Franciscan complex was in disorder, suspended between its own geography and Jerusalem’s sacred topography; its spiritual narrative was only legible with the help of a local guide who was familiar with both Varallo’s mysteries and its prototype in the Holy Land. But Varallo was not Jerusalem, nor an urban entity at all: it was an isolated religious complex unaffected by the political, social, and economic constraints of a real city. Alessi, who was employed by the libicresci rather than the Franciscan Order, could alter the site’s original layout in accordance with Trinidad concerns. Like the Vetrate, this new system had a twofold reasoning: to prescribe a fixed itinerary for the body (hence, of the mind), and to stage sufficient clarity to enable a solitary, unguided ritual.

As described earlier in this chapter, Caimi’s Varallo was constructed as a series of detached chapels, whose location supposedly corresponded to a hallowed site in the Holy Land. Visitors to Varallo who had never visited Jerusalem, and had
only encountered such events in the scriptures, must have been confused, wrote Alessi. In the prologue of the Libro, he noted:

Because of such the first founders placed the chapels with little order so that what often happens is that visitors to the mysteries find first that which they should find later, which seems to me to be a huge defect of great importance.

This “huge defect” in the order of the mysteries would harm the affective progression expected from the site’s visitors. Varallo’s winding paths, haphazard placement of chapels, and overgrown greenery had to be completely rethought. Unlike his surgical intervention in the chapels themselves, here Alessi proposed to destroy the existing paths and create a clearly marked route across the site. This path would follow Christ’s life, disregarding the impossibility of any proximity between these places and the real Holy Land. For example, he proposed that the Annunciation (in Nazareth) and the Nativity (in Bethlehem) should be juxtaposed, thus following a narrative structure as opposed to a geographic one (as the cities are distant from each other in reality). While the chapels were removed or remodelled, hills were flattened and trees planted; the original topography was erased with little order so that what often happens is that visitors to the mysteries find first that which they should find later, which seems to me to be a huge defect of great importance.

To add narrative legibility, Alessi proposed to subdivide the site into three distinct areas: first, the uneven terrain and dense green areas of Nazareth and Bethlehem, which constituted the prelude to Christ’s days as Saviour. From there, an arched path led to the ‘urbanised’ Jerusalem space, with its geometrically organised monumental buildings, connected by arcades, colonnades, and stairs, leading to an additional level. The third compound, placed below the hill’s summit, was the site’s conclusion in hell is its beginning in Heaven. To assure clarity and negate even further the pilgrim’s need for a local guide, Alessi numbered the chapels with a clear order, and used greenery, terraces, and paved paths to connect the entrance of each chapel both visually and physically to the next. Nearby chapels that were out of order were obstructed from view through the clever placement of hedges, stairs, terraces, arches, and walkways.

The complete sequencing of Varallo’s stations served the site’s role as an elaborate lesson on the importance of sin and justification. Though never completed, the pilgrim’s route was to end in the complex of stations representing the afterlife, with the chapels of Universal Judgment, Limbo, Purgatory, and Hell. The mirror image to the site’s conclusion in hell is its beginning in Heaven, or the Garden of Eden, where Adam and Eve are caught in their sinful temptation. Placed by the site’s porta principale in the new Varallo, the chapel framed the entire journey of the pilgrim through the site in the shadow of original sin. Kneeling in...
front of the Vetriate’s opening, the pilgrim’s gaze was directed (albeit with a peripheral upheaval of exotic and domesticated wildlife) towards the fatal moment of humanity’s lustful appetite, a reminder of the need for personal redemption. From there, a path to salvation was activated not only for the pilgrim but for all mankind. Hence, a ‘correct’ passage through Varallo’s devotional stations would award the visitor with not only the remission of his own sins, but the spiritual rebirth of humanity: from the flesh to the mind and back, from the first Adam to the second, Jesus Christ. 113

The reorganisation of Varallo reflected a desire to control the body and mind of the pilgrim by delimiting what their eyes could apprehend, and simultaneously to isolate them from the greater mass of spiritual movement, away from the experience of collective devotion. Notwithstanding the stylistic continuity of the tableaux, the transformation from Ferrari to Alessi pointed to a shift, as described by Annabel Wharton, “from experiential to dogmatic space.” 114 In the process of systematisation, Varallo became a blueprint for stational devotion to Christ’s Passion—from an analogous Franciscan site, meant to emulate an analogous Francesco site, meant to emulate a distant experience, to a hyper-localised device of devotional piety; from a communal activity to a solitary one; from an interactive, dramatic, and theatrical performance of the body to a disciplined, contained, and stationary meditation of the mind; from the proliferation of meanings and memories to a clear, unconfusing recollection; from an imitation of a pilgrim’s journey through urban complexity to a legible, prescribed, self-guided itinerary; from monastic spirituality to Catholic theology; from open-ended imagination to worship of archetypes; from spontaneous uncontrolled emotion to a steady progression of psychological affection. Thus, through Alessi’s removal of the spectacle from the represented, meditation was unburdened of all distractions and distilled the ritual itself from representation. This stripping of excess distractions initiated a process of systematisation that concluded with the stational ritual being reduced to mere units and the Via Crucis becoming impoverished of its initial intensity.

STATION AS UNIT, RITUAL AS ALGORITHM: THE RISE OF TECHNIC

As shown in the case of Varallo, the angst fomented by the Protestant Reformation impelled the Catholic Church to revise its position on artistic representations. The Sacred Mountains offered a comprehensive prototype—a controlled, affective environment embedded in a natural landscape—that could be replicated (with local variations) in a series of nine Sacri Monti, which acted as Catholic bastions in the Italian Alps. Addressing at once the risk from home and away, it kept the theatrical excesses of pilgrimage in check, while neutralising the threat of Protestant infiltration with Catholic compassion. 115

The network of Sacred Mountains built over the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries lay sprawled, like a line of defence, along the Swiss border. Each was composed as a sequence of chapels (whose typology varied from site to site) that featured, behind a viewing partition, episodes from the lives of the saints, represented with polychrome terra-cotta figures and scenographic frescoes. The first Sacro Monte to succeed Varallo was built in Orta in 1591. It consisted of twenty chapels laid out by a member of the Franciscan order on the hilly landscape above Lago di Orta. Inside the chapels, local artists and craftsmen created figural scenes from the life of St Francis; compared to the tableaux at Varallo, their works were less coherent, at times pairing sculptures with unrelated painted backdrops. Sacro Monte de Crea, where construction began in 1589, included twenty-three chapels illustrating the mysteries of the Rosary. Refurbished in the nineteenth century, its terra-cotta figures were replaced with plaster sculptures, also set against scenographic murals.

Among the Sacri Monti, the culmination of the developing stational order can be found in Varese. This design was initiated by Federico Borromeo, Carlo Borromeo’s nephew and successor as archbishop of Milan, and a similarly committed supporter of the Sacri Monti. Works began in 1604 by the local architect Giuseppe Bernasconi, who designed fourteen monumental chapels, each a variation on the typology of a porticoed temple. By 1623, the chapels were complete, featuring scenes from the Mysteries of the Rosary with hyper-realistic figures and elaborate paintings, created by over a dozen painters and sculptors, which could be viewed through grille partitions on the chapel’s exterior. The placement in the site no longer reflects any desire for spatial similarity to Jerusalem or topographic mnemonics; the chapels were placed at regular intervals along a two-kilometre path that ascended the mountain to the cathedral at the top. Attention was given to the path’s width, for the easy passage of processions; the occasional chapel is turned ninety-degrees, almost as a side-note to movement itself. To add rhythm, triumphant arches subdivided the ascension further into three groups: joy, grief, and glory.
Arguably, the Sacro Monte in Varese presents a crystallisation of the Stations of the Cross: the path as primary element and the chapels as mere progressive stoppages. In Varese, traces of Jerusalem or the urban as such were no longer necessary; the representation grew further from the represented, as detached from the archetype as they were removed from the viewer. Any possibility of theological confusion or disordered memories was removed, urban complexity disappeared in favour of linearity and legibility—no more nor less than the canonical fourteen stations.

Not long after the completion of Varese, the systematic order of the stations was imported back to the Holy City: penetrating through the intricate patchwork of space negotiated between the city’s diverse ethnic and religious communities, a path was finally carved, numbered, and ritualised by the Franciscans, who continue to control the Via Dolorosa today. Unlike the Sacri Monti, these stations are bereft of any distinct representation, displaying only a Roman numeral on the wall for those confirming the presence of the path. Placed in an urban void, it relies solely on its internal mechanism: a steady progression of intensifying emotions, each ignited only in relation to that which follows and precedes.

The canonication of the stations at the dawn of modernity can be ascribed to the rise of a condition known as Technic. Technic is “the spirit of absolute instrumentality, according to which everything is merely a means to an end”, writes Federico Campagna in Technic and Magic (2018). While a complete outline of Campagna’s argument is beyond the scope of this thesis, some of its notions can be applied to highlight what is at stake in this chapter and, to some extent, in the next. According to Campagna, the world, and our existential experience within it, derive from a system (or “reality-system”) of Technic, which is contrasted to that of Magic. The internal structure of Technic, which constitutes the anatomical components of our world, includes absolute language, measure, and unit. Campagna cites French philosopher Gilbert Simondon, who fertilised his analysis of technology into an original theory of individuation, when “a thing [...] is in a continuous process of actualisation of its original, overflowing potential. As the process of individuation unfolds, we witness the procession of a long series of ‘individuals’, each defined by the specific limits of its interaction with what constitutes its surroundings at that particular stage.” Considering this interpretation, we can read the rationalisation of the stations as the first signs of Technic: a new order in which the station is but a component in an algorithm condition that sees the Via Crucis as a syntactic construction. In this new order, the mystery and miracles of the medieval church—its claims to magical powers—were eradicated through an empirical understanding of religious agency. Christ’s Passion had been abstracted into units, formalised as stations. In this process, it lost its autonomy, moving from a theatrical representation of emotions—trauma, arrogance, grief, pain, sympathy, anger, hate, and love—to a reduced chapter in Trent’s archetypal narratives and fixed affective cues. The algorithm of this plot is dictated by the Catholic pedagogy and its synthesis of the Passion as the logical outcome of all past events. Confusion and curiosity, once harbingers of imaginative labour, were eradicated to prioritise a confessional contemplative introspection, replacing theatricality with control and discipline, heralding a new era of intellectual inquiry where Technic triumphs.

Fig 22: Jerusalem, plan, Giovanni Calevi’s Illustration for Ventimiglia Favi, Viaggio di Gerusalemme, 1572-1617

Fig 23: Pilgrims carrying the Cross in the Via Dolorosa, Jerusalem, 1890

![Fig 24: Tablou inside chapel IX (chapel X in reflection) Sacro Monte di Varese. Photo by the author, 2019](image)

![Fig 25: Next page: Stations IV and V, Sacro Monte di Varese. Photo by the author (2018)](image)
THE INNOCENTS ABROAD

CHAPTER FOUR

VALORISING MONUMENTS, COMMODIFYING PILGRIMAGE

Jerusalem has always benefited from its image. Located at a distance from transportation routes (both over land and sea) and with little natural resources to extract, the city had to capitalise on its symbolic value for economic survival. However, this condition arrived at a point of excess in the nineteenth century, when the influx of visitors had completely destabilised the city in terms of its civic space. This long century, from Napoleon’s invasion of Egypt in 1798 to the British occupation of Jerusalem in 1917, was the period when Christian travel to Jerusalem reached its peak. Several factors—the decline of the Ottoman Empire, a series of local and foreign reforms, and technological advancements—allowed the West to reconquer the Holy Land through different means: tourism. During this era Jerusalem was transformed by the arrival of new types of pilgrims: surveyors and tourists.

The former appropriated the subjectivity of a spiritual wanderer into that of a mission-driven military man. Steeped in religious curiosity and equipped with modern tools, the surveyors did not perform religious rituals per se, but they were occupied with authenticating the Scriptures by studying the sacred topography of the Holy Land. Thanks to the Ottoman Land Code of 1858, the possibility of ownership allowed explorers to shift their investigation from the surface of the terrain to its depth, where evidence of Christian heritage could be recovered.

The exponential growth of archaeological sites changed the landscape of Jerusalem. Under the guise of spirituality, a Christian narrative was memorialised in a series of historic monuments that were ritualised, naturalised, and commodified by a mass movement of tourists—privileged travellers hoping to locate (and, to a certain extent, to project) a particular memory in and on the land. The ritualisation of Jerusalem’s city space by tourists perpetuated the process of valorisation (enhancement or expansion), defined as increasing the value of a certain resource in order to generate surplus. The heritage project in Jerusalem proved instrumental in the valorisation of its monuments: over the twentieth century, the British mandate would entirely reshape the city by simplifying its past for the sake of familiarity, legibility, and profitability.

Jerusalem in Transformation

In the years leading to the 1830s, Jerusalem was home to a population of about 9,000 residents, mainly shopkeepers and craftsmen who lived within a walled enclosed city. At the time, Jerusalem was a spiritual home to the three Abrahamic religions, and pilgrimage was just another of the city’s industries. Things began to change in 1831 when the Egyptian ruler Muhammad Ali revolted against Constantinople and occupied the region of Syria, which included Palestine. This event began a process of loosening the region’s physical and intangible borders by showcasing religious tolerance towards non-Muslims and even non-Ottoman subjects: pilgrim tolls were abolished, shrines of all denominations could be erected, and a freedom of religious practice meant that Christians and Jews were now equal, if not privileged, citizens.

In an attempt to gain support from the West, Ali permitted diplomatic institutions to be founded in Jerusalem: the first was the British consulate in 1838, followed by the consulates of Prussia (1842), France (1843), Sardinia (1843), America (1844), and Austria-Hungary (1849). Religious organisations were likewise welcome: the Latin Patriarchate was revived in 1843 for the first time since the Crusades, the Anglo-Episcopal See was established in 1841, and the Protestant Church inaugurated its first ‘cathedral’ in 1849, thus Declaring itself an equal to the prominent Orthodox and Catholic communities in Jerusalem.

Despite his efforts to win the endorsement of the West, Ali was ultimately disarmed by the peasant revolts that erupted in Palestine, which resulted in raids, destruction, and famine. He retreated from the region in 1840, but his encouragement of ‘soft’ Western imperialism could not be reversed. European powers now had a territorial footprint in the Holy Land (a territory whose boundaries were much clearer to Westerners than to the local population) in the form of diplomatic relations and official religious institutions, allowing them to mobilise their power for its official survey. Holy Land exploration was not a new phenomenon: in 333 AD, the pilgrim from Bordeaux recorded his encounter with Biblical Palestine in great detail, and the Dominican Felix Fabri wrote a descriptive travelogue in 1483 that 

3 A letter from 1839 portrays the relative peace that was brought in by the Egyptian occupation: “let him be of whatsoever religion he may, do him justice, as the Lord of the world desired of us!” — The governor of Jerusalem, Ahmed Dundar, 1839. In Kark, Ruth, “Agricultural Land in Palestine. Letters to Sir Moses Montefiore, 1839” in Jewish Historical Studies Vol. 29 (1982-1986), 26
5 Ibid., 54
5 Ibid., 51
2 Kark and Oren-Nordheim, Jerusalem and Its Environs, 29–30

77
powers to advance not only political agendas, but also economic aspirations.

In pre-reform Palestine, agriculture engaged both urban dwellers and village farmers in the production and exchange of grain, fruit, and oil. Land was divided into numerous categories whose intricacy is beyond the scope of this paper; however, it is crucial to understand that before the 1858 Land Code, the concept of private property was unknown in Palestine: the majority of the population (about 80%) inhabited and cultivated land that was owned by the Empire (Miri) to whom they would pay tax (in kind or cash) through intermediary collectors, often the local elites. Miri land accounted for about 50% of agricultural land in the Empire, giving cultivators a durable right of use yet no possession over the land itself. In other words, a tree planted was owned by the cultivator, but the land itself belonged to the Sultan. Furthermore, the customary right to cultivate Miri land was contingent on continuous production: if left unattended for three years, the land would revert back to the state.

Other types of land that are relevant for this discussion include the freehold Ma’ali, which often consisted of urban plots for dwelling, and Waqf, or Islamic trust, which was untaxable land dedicated to services for the Muslim community (such as mosques, education, roads, and resting places for travellers). In many villages, the distribution of productive land was based on Musha tenure, where cultivators shared collective rights over land. In this self-governing model, parcels of land were redistributed amongst the village Hamulas (extended families) every five years. As all production was taxed by collectors (who were themselves pressured by the Empire), this system meant that the risks posed by the uncertainty of agricultural life would be pooled, thus preventing the impoverishment of individual farmers. However, in terms of surplus, it was also meant that there was little incentive for individual farmers to improve the land by fertilising the soil or planting trees.

Since the Land Code sought to dramatically improve the Empire’s revenue, the reform targeted two factors: the amount of land that was being cultivated and the incentive of each cultivator to increase production. The former was increased by awarding land-by-subscription to those cultivating ‘dead’ land; the latter was bolstered by allowing tenured farmers on Ardi land to assume private ownership (giving the cultivator a full right of possession and inheritable rights), in contrast to the collective Musha system. Peasant ownership of land through title deeds had two benefits for the empire: it forced cultivators to register their land and thus to subject it to regular taxation, and it allowed individual accumulation by encouraging improvement of a territory that was no longer shared. This shift from use-rights to private ownership re-ordered the land by employing the rhetoric of progress, improvement, and modernisation; in the process, it abolished existing notions of collectivist ideology in favour of speculative investment targeted at increasing the value of soil. This commodification of land into an immovable asset was the manifestation of the state’s attempt to spatialise its power under the Tanzimat reforms by ordering, regulating, and classifying economic and social activities.

Though it was not successful on all fronts, the reform effectively liberalised the land market in Palestine. The abstraction of territory through mapping and registration reshaped the land according to a regime of enclosure and exclusion. Under the new legal conditions, land could be freely alienated and sold without discrimination—even to foreigners. Though the Christian Church had held ecclesial properties in Palestine since Byzantine times, only after the reform was it allowed to expand, develop, and enclose its own missionary institutions, educational facilities, hospices and hospitals. These included the German deaconess Hospital, the Anglican hospital, the Notre dame Hospice and the Italian hospital, as well as St Joseph nursing school.

On a larger scale, the monumental Russian compound was built on a hill across from the Old City under the name “Nova Jerusalem”, with an investment of about 250,000 pounds sterling from the Russian government. These ventures were to
provide pilgrims with a home in the holy city, as well as subsidies in the form of food, lodging and medical aid, while allowing foreign powers to expand their control on the ground. Robinson's work laid the foundation for modern topographic exploration, including the accomodation of pilgrims, the mechanisms by which land was privatized, alienated and sold led to its radical transformation in the decades to come by allowing Western exploration on the surface of the land—and into its depths.

**ACT I: THE EXPLORER-SURVEYOR**

The quintessential pilgrim-explorer of Biblical Palestine was Edward Robinson. Born in 1794 in Connecticut, Robinson studied law, mathematics, and Greek, spending his early career translating the New Testament into English and publishing Hebrew-English lexicons of the Old Testament. In 1833, a year after being appointed as the first professor of biblical literature in the Theological Seminary in New York, Robinson travelled to Jerusalem, where he was then Muhammad-al-occupied Palestine. Thanks to the easing of travel restrictions, his profound knowledge of the Scriptures, and his interpreter Eli Smith, Robinson could see what he described as ‘the promised land’ unfold before his eyes. Similar to those before him, he saw the Scriptures as a guidebook of topographic details, names of towns and villages, and locations of natural elements, as well as an atlas of fauna, flora, and climate. However, unlike his predecessors, who followed well-trodden paths, recapitulated previously-written accounts, and relied on information provided by local monastic institutions, Robinson decided to question the ecclesiastical traditions of nineteenth-century Palestine by using his own methods: a measuring tape, minute observations, and a detailed system of orthography.

Thanks to his rigour, Robinson discovered hundreds of previously unknown or unrecognized sites, among them the remains of an arch that led to the Temple Mount (known today as “Robinson’s Arch”) and the Siloam tunnel that runs beneath the city into the Shiloach fountain, Jerusalem’s first water source. Robinson’s three-volume publication, Biblical Researches in Palestine (1841), was widely accepted in the West; it won him a gold medal from the Royal Geographical Society and a gold medal from the Royal Engineers to conduct an archaeological study of a given area. When encountering an ancient inscription along one of his routes, for example, he did not bother to interpret the text as the site was not on his biblical checklist; when he passed by what would later be recognized as the remains of the ancient walls of Jericho, Robinson dismissed the site as a mount of “rubbish” due to its distance from known sites. This mode of specific inquiry changed in the 1860s when European powers began to send a different kind of explorer—not the learned scholars of the Bible, but surveying military men. In that sense, it is perhaps unsurprising that the first survey was framed not by religious intentions but by a prototypical colonial motivation: improvement.

Jerusalem’s recurring breakouts of cholera and dysentery were to be solved by a donation from an English noblewoman who was eager to rebuild the city’s water system. In 1864, she provided £500 to the Royal Engineers to conduct an accurate study of the city. Led by Captain Charles Wilson, this was the first Western mission to be sent by a government body rather than merely inspired by personal curiosity and interests. This time, skilled surveyors utilized modern equipment to map the city at 1:2,500 scale, including the city walls and gates, layout of streets, and locations of important buildings and public facilities. The resulting “Ordnance Survey of Jerusalem” was the first accurate map of the city, and proved invaluable to the Empire in its eventual expansion to Palestine.

While the improvement plan for Jerusalem’s water supply was never realised, Wilson’s survey precipitated the foundation of the largest enterprize of Western biblical inquiry, the Palestine Exploration Fund. The PEF was launched in 1865 before a group of clergymen, scientists and public officials. The Archbishop of York introduced the Fund: Our object is strictly an inductive inquiry. We are not to be a religious society; we are not about to launch into any controversy; we are about to apply the rules of science, which are so well understood by us in other branches, to an investigation into the facts concerning the Holy Land.

Faced with controversies amongst Christian denominations (notably between Anglo-Catholics and Evangelicals), the Fund was able to unite men in and outside the Church by hailing the Bible not only as a religious guide but as a historical document whose merit was yet to be fully understood. They claimed that the Holy Land was “crying out for accurate investigation”.

![Fig 4: Left: Robinson's Arch (arch of the Solomonian bridge that linked Jerusalem to Samaria, discovered in 1841 and still called by the same name) projecting from the retaining walls of Temple Mount. Fig 5: Right: Restoration of Robinson’s Arch by Ernest Forrest 1900–1920.](image)

---

80 TOWARDS JERUSALEM

81 CHAPTER FOUR—

The Innocents abroad
that their publications would consist of facts, not opinions. By studying its archaeology, manners of the local population, topography, geology, and the natural resources, the PEF could settle once and for all the various speculations regarding the origin of the Christian faith.

The PEF thus encapsulated the spirit of the time: on the one hand, it employed scientific tools to produce knowledge about distant lands, a quintessential Victorian trope (in fact, Queen Victoria was one of its first patrons); on the other hand, it was religiously motivated, responding to the industrialisation and secularisation endemic to England’s academic circles and to some extent European society at large. These two parallel sentiments were imbued with a sense of patrimony that was explicit in the PEF’s opening statement: “This country of Palestine belongs to you and me, it is essentially ours [...] We mean to walk through Palestine in the breadth of it because that land has been given onto us.” In the following decades, similar organisations joined England’s colonial-religious mission, including the American Palestine Exploration Society (1870), the German Society for the Exploration of Palestine (1878) and the American School of Oriental Research (1900), although the PEF remained the wealthiest and most prolific of these institutions.

In 1878 the PEF published the ambitious “Survey of Western Palestine” (SWP) based on triangulation across the length of the territory of the so-called Holy Land. Funded by the War Office, the SWP had a clear strategic objective of achieving knowledge over the region in order to secure the Suez Canal (opened in 1869) and protect India in the Russo-Turkish War of 1877. However, the survey had an additional layer of “sentimental character” (as the Chief of the War Office described it) and thus includes biblical, early Christian, and Crusaders sites. These maps, which took seven years to complete, provided the locations of every Fr, ruin, and contemporary village in the land, more than 10,000 place-names in total (compared with Robinson’s 1,712), many of them previously unknown. Amongst the sheets were two special editions dedicated to illustrating the Old and New Testaments by mapping the Scriptures onto the terrain, including the boundaries of Israel’s twelve tribes, the borders of the ancient kingdoms of Israel and Judah, the locations of Canaanite cities and the divisions of King Solomon’s governments; the map of the New Testament also included cross-referenced biblical, Talmudic and modern names.

The SWP presents a moment in which the certainty of modernity was met with something that was imaginary, mythical, and spiritual. No longer disputed or misidentified, Robinson’s studies and the PEF’s maps were actively appropriating the land and demarcating their territory by highlighting the specificity of the Christian narrative, excluding existing traditions, and eliminating the complexity that had been shared for centuries. In Emil Nesse, Gary Fields argues that cartography is a technological way of owning the land by mapping arguments over a represented territory. As an instrument of force, he argues that maps not only shape consciousness about the land, but they “become models for and not maps of what they represent.” This rearrangement of geological strata landscape the PEF’s vision onto the ground, transforming it into what Edward Said refers to as “imagined geographies” — where groups project their own reading of a patrimonial territory before they act upon it with physical force. This particular vision was based on memories that had been constructed in the West for generations: it would soon spatialise itself in Jerusalem, both symbolically and literally, in a series of historic monuments.

Before addressing the concept of the historic monument, we should understand what constitutes a monument in Jerusalem. As this thesis shows, from as early as the fourth century AD, monuments have been erected in Jerusalem over places where biblical events took place in order to assure their emotional affectivity on the members of the group and their ability to recollect memory.
condemned Jesus to his death did not, originally, have a mnemonic intention; its significance in the present, however, is that it serves as the point of recollection of the savior’s trial. The occasions on which Christ fell under the weight of the Cross or encountered various characters (Mary, Symon of Cyrene, Veronica, or the Women of Jerusalem) have been localised in pieces of pavement, a corner of a street, or fragment of buildings in Jerusalem that have since assumed a religious meaning within the systematised recollection of Stations of the Cross. The foundation of a historical monument is not based on sentiment or scripture, but on an acquired, ‘objective’ data. This idiosyncratic recollection has developed a discipline as a second and the second half of the nineteenth century in the form of biblical exploration. Through excavation, a non-descript site could become a holy space. In this process, the underworld was declared to be the setting of the past’s truth; as Rosalind Williams argues, “the earth’s inner space may no longer be regarded as sacred, but is still a repository of spiritual value because it is assumed to hold the secrets of lost time.” In the case of Jerusalem, the sacred ground was seen as a speculative archive of biblical residues—-related to a founder of the PEF as a “treasury of truth”—where foundations of Western society could be identified and memorialised by appropriating elements of the existing city into historic monuments. In that process, the ‘deities’ of other narratives was disregarded, thus legitimising future actions of exclusion, displacement, and demolition, acting as a perverted memory. In this, we will see how archaeology was mobilized to bring invisible facts into the visible surface, and how the movement of pilgrims has fixed particular memories in space.

Fig 8: Detail, Map of Western Palestine, Special Section illustrating the old Testament (1884).

These monuments, such as the Churches of the Holy Sepulchre or the Nativity that were discussed in chapter one, were erected with an a priori commemorative purpose. They were conceived and erected as instruments of recollection, denoting sanctity, continuity, and power. In time, additional memories proliferated as localities: the place where Christ was stripped of his garments, where the apostles met after resurrection, the place where Christ was stripped of his garments, and many more. However, these symbolic memories were not monumentalised with structure—while their mnemonic associations were infused into existing places in time that often carried no previous significance. This process of turning a non-descriptive site into one that commemorates historical events is what Chosy defines as creating a historic monument. In many respects, the historic monument is antithetical to the monument: it is “constituted a posteriori” by the converging gazes of the historian and the amateur who choose it from a mass of existing edifices. In other words, structures that did not initially have a memorial purpose can be converted into a historic monument on the basis of a particular knowledge that is based on the Christian Bible as the traditions that have since evolved around it.

The Via Crucis, for example, was staged as a sequence of dramatic events designed to cyclically recollect the Passion of Christ. In chapter three we witness the construction of the Stations of the Cross with the sole purpose of staging this theatrical ritual. The room in which Pontius Pilate

Fig 9: Pilgrims carrying the cross on the Via Dolorosa Jerusalem ca. 1910.

process, the underworld was declared to be the setting of the past’s truth; as Rosalind Williams argues, “the earth’s inner space may no longer be regarded as sacred, but is still a repository of spiritual value because it is assumed to hold the secrets of lost time.” In the case of Jerusalem, the sacred ground was seen as a speculative archive of biblical residues—related to a founder of the PEF as a “treasury of truth”—where foundations of Western society could be identified and memorialised by appropriating elements of the existing city into historic monuments. In that process, the ‘deities’ of other narratives was disregarded, thus legitimising future actions of exclusion, displacement, and demolition, acting as a perverted memory. In this, we will see how archaeology was mobilized to bring invisible facts into the visible surface, and how the movement of pilgrims has fixed particular memories in space.

Fig 8: Detail, Map of Western Palestine, Special Section illustrating the old Testament (1884).

These monuments, such as the Churches of the Holy Sepulchre or the Nativity that were discussed in chapter one, were erected with an a priori commemorative purpose. They were conceived and erected as instruments of recollection, denoting sanctity, continuity, and power. In time, additional memories proliferated as localities: the place where Christ was stripped of his garments, where the apostles met after resurrection, the place where Christ was stripped of his garments, and many more. However, these symbolic memories were not monumentalised with structure—while their mnemonic associations were infused into existing places in time that often carried no previous significance. This process of turning a non-descriptive site into one that commemorates historical events is what Chosy defines as creating a historic monument. In many respects, the historic monument is antithetical to the monument: it is “constituted a posteriori” by the converging gazes of the historian and the amateur who choose it from a mass of existing edifices. In other words, structures that did not initially have a memorial purpose can be converted into a historic monument on the basis of a particular knowledge that is based on the Christian Bible as the traditions that have since evolved around it.

The Via Crucis, for example, was staged as a sequence of dramatic events designed to cyclically recollect the Passion of Christ. In chapter three we witness the construction of the Stations of the Cross with the sole purpose of staging this theatrical ritual. The room in which Pontius Pilate

Fig 9: Pilgrims carrying the cross on the Via Dolorosa Jerusalem ca. 1910.

process, the underworld was declared to be the setting of the past’s truth; as Rosalind Williams argues, “the earth’s inner space may no longer be regarded as sacred, but is still a repository of spiritual value because it is assumed to hold the secrets of lost time.” In the case of Jerusalem, the sacred ground was seen as a speculative archive of biblical residues—related to a founder of the PEF as a “treasury of truth”—where foundations of Western society could be identified and memorialised by appropriating elements of the existing city into historic monuments. In that process, the ‘deities’ of other narratives was disregarded, thus legitimising future actions of exclusion, displacement, and demolition, acting as a perverted memory. In this, we will see how archaeology was mobilized to bring invisible facts into the visible surface, and how the movement of pilgrims has fixed particular memories in space.

Fig 8: Detail, Map of Western Palestine, Special Section illustrating the old Testament (1884).

These monuments, such as the Churches of the Holy Sepulchre or the Nativity that were discussed in chapter one, were erected with an a priori commemorative purpose. They were conceived and erected as instruments of recollection, denoting sanctity, continuity, and power. In time, additional memories proliferated as localities: the place where Christ was stripped of his garments, where the apostles met after resurrection, the place where Christ was stripped of his garments, and many more. However, these symbolic memories were not monumentalised with structure—while their mnemonic associations were infused into existing places in time that often carried no previous significance. This process of turning a non-descriptive site into one that commemorates historical events is what Chosy defines as creating a historic monument. In many respects, the historic monument is antithetical to the monument: it is “constituted a posteriori” by the converging gazes of the historian and the amateur who choose it from a mass of existing edifices. In other words, structures that did not initially have a memorial purpose can be converted into a historic monument on the basis of a particular knowledge that is based on the Christian Bible as the traditions that have since evolved around it.

The Via Crucis, for example, was staged as a sequence of dramatic events designed to cyclically recollect the Passion of Christ. In chapter three we witness the construction of the Stations of the Cross with the sole purpose of staging this theatrical ritual. The room in which Pontius Pilate

Fig 9: Pilgrims carrying the cross on the Via Dolorosa Jerusalem ca. 1910.

process, the underworld was declared to be the setting of the past’s truth; as Rosalind Williams argues, “the earth’s inner space may no longer be regarded as sacred, but is still a repository of spiritual value because it is assumed to hold the secrets of lost time.” In the case of Jerusalem, the sacred ground was seen as a speculative archive of biblical residues—related to a founder of the PEF as a “treasury of truth”—where foundations of Western society could be identified and memorialised by appropriating elements of the existing city into historic monuments. In that process, the ‘deities’ of other narratives was disregarded, thus legitimising future actions of exclusion, displacement, and demolition, acting as a perverted memory. In this, we will see how archaeology was mobilized to bring invisible facts into the visible surface, and how the movement of pilgrims has fixed particular memories in space.

Fig 8: Detail, Map of Western Palestine, Special Section illustrating the old Testament (1884).

These monuments, such as the Churches of the Holy Sepulchre or the Nativity that were discussed in chapter one, were erected with an a priori commemorative purpose. They were conceived and erected as instruments of recollection, denoting sanctity, continuity, and power. In time, additional memories proliferated as localities: the place where Christ was stripped of his garments, where the apostles met after resurrection, the place where Christ was stripped of his garments, and many more. However, these symbolic memories were not monumentalised with structure—while their mnemonic associations were infused into existing places in time that often carried no previous significance. This process of turning a non-descriptive site into one that commemorates historical events is what Chosy defines as creating a historic monument. In many respects, the historic monument is antithetical to the monument: it is “constituted a posteriori” by the converging gazes of the historian and the amateur who choose it from a mass of existing edifices. In other words, structures that did not initially have a memorial purpose can be converted into a historic monument on the basis of a particular knowledge that is based on the Christian Bible as the traditions that have since evolved around it.

The Via Crucis, for example, was staged as a sequence of dramatic events designed to cyclically recollect the Passion of Christ. In chapter three we witness the construction of the Stations of the Cross with the sole purpose of staging this theatrical ritual. The room in which Pontius Pilate

Fig 9: Pilgrims carrying the cross on the Via Dolorosa Jerusalem ca. 1910.

process, the underworld was declared to be the setting of the past’s truth; as Rosalind Williams argues, “the earth’s inner space may no longer be regarded as sacred, but is still a repository of spiritual value because it is assumed to hold the secrets of lost time.” In the case of Jerusalem, the sacred ground was seen as a speculative archive of biblical residues—related to a founder of the PEF as a “treasury of truth”—where foundations of Western society could be identified and memorialised by appropriating elements of the existing city into historic monuments. In that process, the ‘deities’ of other narratives was disregarded, thus legitimising future actions of exclusion, displacement, and demolition, acting as a perverted memory. In this, we will see how archaeology was mobilized to bring invisible facts into the visible surface, and how the movement of pilgrims has fixed particular memories in space.
the Old City, “the Jerusalem of Christ will soon be reconstituted” showing the belief that all Western scholars had to do was find the ‘Bible under the cobblestones’ of modern Jerusalem. In other words, it is there that memory can be literally excavated and brought into the surface where it will be readily available for recollection. One of the recovered sites was the Sisters of Zion Convent, built on land purchased by Father Marie-Alphonse de Ratisbonne in the 1860s. Until excavations under the convent began, the convent carried no mnemonic function as it was merely in the vicinity of holy sites, such as the ruined section of a Roman arch that came to lie under the cobblestones’ of modern Jerusalem.

Recollection thus occurs based on affectivity; this ancient room gained a mnemonic function thanks to a pseudo-scientific fragment, a local figure of religious authority, and proximity to other holy sites. Following the monastery’s discovery, other holy sites proliferated nearby based on their perceived authenticity. Soon around Gabbatha were erected the Monastery of the Flagellation, where Christ was Flagellated by the Romans, and the Church of the Condemnation, where Christ picked up his cross. In addition to events related to Christ and the Via Crucis, other minute details from the Scriptures were localised. The patrimonial inflation included not only religious bodies but also national institutions. As Hanna Harris writes, the English hospital excavated under its premises to discover:

a very ancient and massive prison […] with several cells enclosed, and it is thought that very possibly it was in one of these that the Apostle Peter was imprisoned and from which he was so miraculously delivered, as described in the Acts of the Apostles. […] even if it be not the actual prison, it must be of equal antiquity, and serves to illustrate the Scripture incident most vividly.

Harris admits that even if it is not exactly a prison, nor Peter’s cell, she can still understand the Scriptures better due to its authentic character.

This was the general sentiment for many holy sites, whose authenticity was questioned but nevertheless accepted. What initially emerged as Peter’s prison has remained as such, even though other researchers have discredited the initial findings. This tendency encapsulates what Vincent Lermine calls a ‘pictorial inertia’, a condition in which a historic monument’s status, once designated, is rarely reversed.22

While the notion of a pictorial inertia is true for most of Jerusalem’s sites, it was not the case with the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, whose authenticity remained contested amongst explorers and archaeologists. While pre-modern pilgrims accepted the certainty of the site, in the nineteenth century this ambiguity was no longer tolerable.23 The first volume of the PEF’s Recovery of Jerusalem (1871) read: “There are differences of opinion […] whether the present church of the Holy Sepulchre does or does not cover the true Sepulchre of our Saviour; if not, whether the true site can yet be recovered.”24 Likewise, Lieutenant Claude Reignier Conder of the Royal Engineers writes in 1878 that “the study of the rock [the existing Calvary] drives us irresistibly to the conclusions given above, and thus forbids us to accept the traditional site of the Sepulchre as genuine.”25 The dispute surrounding the existing site’s investigations that were far beyond historical curiosity, and resulted in the invention of an alternative holy site: the Garden Tomb. The British Major-General Charles Gordon arrived in Palestine in 1881. Following a quest to find the exact location of the Garden of Eden in Seychelles,

Church of the Holy Sepulchre does or does not cover the true Sepulchre of our Saviour; if not, whether the true site can yet be recovered.24 Likewise, Lieutenant Claude Reignier Conder of the Royal Engineers writes in 1878 that “the study of the rock [the existing Calvary] drives us irresistibly to the conclusions given above, and thus forbids us to accept the traditional site of the Sepulchre as genuine.”25 The dispute surrounding the existing site’s investigations that were far beyond historical curiosity, and resulted in the invention of an alternative holy site: the Garden Tomb. The British Major-General Charles Gordon arrived in Palestine in 1881. Following a quest to find the exact location of the Garden of Eden in Seychelles,
desire […] that the garden and its tomb should be secured from disrespectful tampering or superstitution on the other.” The Association purchased the land and adjoining plots (measuring 6,640 sqm) that bordered the properties of Muslims and Christians and was built on the site of the Muslim cemetery, perchd on the so-called “Skull Hill” above. Though the land was initially considered as Muslim (freehold), in 1905 the association managed to change its designation to Wofl in order to prevent it from reverting back to the state when its heireless owners would pass away. Over the next decades, the Association refrained from erecting structures within the grounds, investing instead in a luxurious garden around the tomb, where Protestants could find secluded space for contemplation. This pious environment was radically different from the congested and contested atmosphere in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, located just a few hundred meters to the south inside the Old City walls. Despite the lack of a monument per se, the hewn rock of the tomb and its surrounding gardens was invested with a memorial function; it became a historic monument of another typology—the garden—which became a place for the recollection for English and American Protestant communities.

The invention of the Garden Tomb was as strategic as it was spiritual. Unlike other “rediscovered” holy sites in Jerusalem, the protestant Golgotha not only added an additional site to the pilgrim’s route, but also attempted to discredit another. This was a deliberate decision on the part of the Protestants—who were not recognised by the Ottomans as an autonomous confessional community, and thus did not share a piece of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre like other denominations. In fact, the Status Quo agreement from 1853 dictated: “The actual status quo will be maintained and the Jerusalem shrines, whether owned in common or exclusively by the Greek, Latin, and Armenian communities, will all remain forever in their present state.” This meant that nine sites in and around Jerusalem and Bethlehem, with their intricate and fragmentary sacred spaces, would remain in the custody of the Roman Catholics, Greek Orthodox, Armenians, Syriac Orthodox, Coptic Christians, and Ethiopians in perpetuity. Forever excluded from owning the holy places, the leaders of the Protestant community compelled to invent their own historic monuments in order to assure the group’s faculty of recollection. This was the height of Jerusalem’s patrimonial project, designed to attract Western pilgrims to the city. The proliferation of historic monuments countered the spiritual drainage endemic of industrial Europe, by providing a place of spiritual worship and affective recollection. Thanks to scientific practices, existing elements such as a rock cave or a fragment of an arch could turn into proof of one’s own history. However, the scrutiny under which the materiality of the city was studied and designated also dissolved its historicity. Despite the fact that the hewn rock was a fourth-century Golgotha, in a sense the site of the Resurrection, the lack of a monument and its face, beneath the historic Third Wall of Jerusalem, was thus made lucrative by tourist agencies and the Protestant community were compelled to invent a historic monument into an enhanced product that would appeal to visitors.

This was the height of Jerusalem’s patrimonial project, designed to attract Western pilgrims to the city. The proliferation of historic monuments countered the spiritual drainage endemic of industrial Europe, by providing a place of spiritual worship and affective recollection. Thanks to scientific practices, existing elements such as a rock cave or a fragment of an arch could turn into proof of one’s own history. However, the scrutiny under which the materiality of the city was studied and designated also dissolved its historicity. Despite the fact that the hewn rock was a fourth-century Golgotha, in a sense the site of the Resurrection, the lack of a monument and its face, beneath the historic Third Wall of Jerusalem, was thus made lucrative by tourist agencies and the Protestant community were compelled to invent a historic monument into an enhanced product that would appeal to visitors. In that sense, both Choo’s and Marx’s definition of valorisation are at play in late nineteenth-century Jerusalem. As explained below, at the same time that its monuments were adapted to appear increasingly legible and comprehensible to visiting tourists, their potential for problematic spirituality of commodified pilgrimage. With fixed itineraries, a chain of hotels, and well-trained tour guides, the tourist industry was able to capitalise on Jerusalem’s symbolic potential as a site of spiritual tourism.

The second half of the nineteenth century saw the total commodification of Jerusalem pilgrimage into tourism. While this dissertation has sought to problematise spiritual journeys across many centuries through the lens of their secular motivations—cultural curiosity, political aspirations, economic gain, and natural scenery—they objectified existing sites to pursue such magnitudes. As explained below, pilgrimage—once a solitary experience based on the moral unit of the individual—was now organised in large groups, sold as a leisure activity, and promoted as an attraction—displaying all the characteristics of modern tourism as we know it today. The process of expansion (or enhancement) of value is referred to as valorisation. Therefore, to valorise in Marxist terms means to increase the surplus-value extracted from a commodity: valorisation is what converts money into capital.

In M-C-M, when the purchased commodity is once again abstracted into money, the incremental growth of the original amount is defined as surplus. This process of expansion (or enhancement) of value is referred to as valorisation. Therefore, to valorise in Marxist terms means to increase the surplus-value extracted from a commodity: valorisation is what converts money into capital.
host Temperance Tours (helping men abstain from alcohol and nicotine) in 1841, Cook’s office expanded in 1850 to arrange tours to Paris, Italy, and the Alps. In 1851, he treated 165,000 people to the Great Exhibition in London’s Crystal Palace, providing transportation and accommodation. Conducting the tours in person, buying wholesale tickets, and targeting the expanding middle class—whose vacations were an integral part of ‘healthy work’—Cook positioned himself at the forefront of the business of leisure-making. The arrival of the steamship, improvement of railroads, and the paving of roads encouraged his entrepreneurial spirit to expand his ‘educational’ services beyond Europe. Reflecting both the era’s expansionist sensibilities and his own missionary sentiments, Cook was oriented to the East. It was there that he could combine the curiosity of the ancient world with the comfort and security of modernism; above all, it is where he could merge business with piety.

When Cook arrived in Palestine in 1864, he wanted to revolutionise the existing model of pilgrimage. Until then, visitors were responsible for planning their own routes, hiring guides, preparing food, and booking transfers and accommodations for themselves. They travelled in large caravans that were crucial for economic and security reasons, often in the company of officers of the Ottoman army. Cook offered something completely different: a packaged deal that would provide all of his client’s needs on the ground. He visited Palestine twice to make connections and study the field so that he could promise his clients:

- the best time of the year for being in Palestine—the best travelling facilities, the best hotel accommodation—the best guides that can be engaged—the best places of interest to be visited—the routes to and from England—and the cost of the whole tour for two months.

Indeed, Cook’s religious zeal and entrepreneurial spirit were perfectly aligned. By marketing and turning the Holy Land into nothing less than a resort, one London-based journalist wrote that Cook’s travellers enjoyed a “healthy mode of travelling.” The sense of excitement and pleasure of camp life, the deepest interest of its hallowed spots, the wide field it allows for exploration, and the wild beauty that lingers everywhere, combined to make Palestine a place of rest as soon as the modern facilities for travelling brought about, its shores an easy fortnight’s distance from our open road.

In the spring of 1869, Thomas Cook led thirty visitors on his first organised trip to Palestine. These pilgrim-tourists were led across the country on horseback and housed in camps that were lavish. Cook’s handbook was opened in 1881; by 1903, he already had three offices in the city, in addition to outposts in Jaffa, Cairo, Constantiopolis, Algiers, Tunis, and Khartoum. By 1897, less than fifteen years after he had set up, Cook was responsible for the escort of over two-thirds of all Holy Land travelers arriving from the West. One of the keys to his success, aside from catering to his clients’ needs for comfort and security, was the introduction of hotel coupons and circular notes. The former were pre-purchased accommodation vouchers that eliminated the need for currency exchange and price haggling, and the latter were the fore-runners of traveler’s cheques, replacing heavy gold coins with notes that could be exchanged in Cook’s agencies. This vast economic network created a near-monopoly over the tourist industries in the Holy Land, positioning Cook and his clients as privileged amongst Jerusalem’s visitors; in one recorded anecdote, he threatened to withdraw his business from a local hotelier if he “does not treat our travellers and ourselves as they and we ought to be treated.”

These lines were written in Cook’s Handbook, a guidebook that published periodically and was to accompany Western travellers on their trip to Palestine. Cook’s Handbook included practical information for travellers—preferred season, currency exchange rates, dress codes, diet, camp life, and so on—as well as detailed itineraries, maps in various scales, and descriptions of the land’s natural features, various religions and sects, and local history, as well as addresses of post office, physicians, foreign consulates, and bankers. The notion of the guidebook, Cook explains, is that it could be read “without difficulty, either on horseback or in the dim light of the tent [..] that in any moment any information may be ascertained.” Addressing a group that was literate and well versed in Evangelical theology, Cook included not only practical information but also Biblical references for all the sites on his itinerary. By combining the guidebook with the
Bible, Cook assumes authority over all the didactic content (both spiritual and practical) of the traveller’s visit—and removes everything else as excess. As Cook himself writes in the introduction, the volume—

is intended as a handbook for Tourists; it does not, therefore, attempt to embrace the tremendous multiplicity of threads of controversy woven nearly every sacred site [. . .] It points out all that is to be seen, and endeavours to provide concise information upon all subjects in which the Tourist [sic] may find interest.

Cook openly admits to reducing the complexity of the land for the benefit of the tourist. Controlling both the route and his client’s knowledge, Cook projected a single narrative and frames a view over the land as the only truth. When faced with ambiguous sites or sites, the tourist could consult with the authority of the European guidebook (of which Cook’s was only the first), where they could be reassured with familiar facts and figures. The guidebook also included detailed itineraries that are worth exploring. Day 1 on Cook’s “Ten Days Tour in Judea” is described as such: “Jerusalem to Mar Saba, Riding to Rachel’s Tomb, Solomon’s Pools, over the hills of the Wilderness of Judæa [. . .] to the Dead Sea, giving some time to bathe, and then ride across the plain to the site of Jericho and encamp near the Fountain of Elisha at foot of the Mountain of Temptation.”

Aside from the distances (measured in hours on the body” in front of the travellers).

“Jerusalem to Mar Saba, Riding to Rachel’s Tomb, Solomon’s Pools, over the hills of the Wilderness of Judæa [. . .] to the Dead Sea, giving some time to bathe, and then ride across the plain to the site of Jericho and encamp near the Fountain of Elisha at foot of the Mountain of Temptation.”


‘we pass through the famed Vale of Elah, where the Philistines, with Goliath, defined the armies of Israel, and where David gained his final victory of the giant. Process by Bethshemesh to Cath and camp there.’ This natural element thus gains a patrimonial value thanks to the authority of the guidebook. In this process of valorisation, it becomes ‘easy to imagine’, or, to put it in terms of collective memory, ‘to raise curiosity’ for the clients to engage in a free-flowing interaction with the site of origin. This travelogue reveals the depth and breadth of Cook’s pedagogy, which extended to every aspect of the journey. The intensity of sites can be seen from a diary entry written ten days after the visit to the Valley of Elah:

“We came to a large square building which contains a rock on which it is said that Jesus and His disciples ate before and after the Resurrection. Then we visited a very old church in which it is said that our Lord preached His first sermon. Then Joseph’s workshop and Mary’s well, and as it is the only water supply in the town it is quite possible that she drew water from it.”

This wonderful land is full of sacred and historic interest,” as every item seen from the saddle, and every contemporary landmark is mediated and enhanced for their familiar knowledge. Thus it becomes ‘easy to imagine’, or, to put it in terms of collective memory, support recollection, by allowing the tourists to literally ‘travel’ at its place of origin. This travelogue reveals the depth and breadth of Cook’s pedagogy, which extended to every aspect of the journey. The intensity of sites can be seen from a diary entry written ten days after the visit to the Valley of Elah:

“We came to a large square building which contains a rock on which it is said that Jesus and His disciples ate before and after the Resurrection. Then we visited a very old church in which it is said that our Lord preached His first sermon. Then Joseph’s workshop and Mary’s well, and as it is the only water supply in the town it is quite possible that she drew water from it.”

This wonderful land is full of sacred and historic interest,” as every item seen from the saddle, and every contemporary landmark is mediated and enhanced for their familiar knowledge. Thus it becomes ‘easy to imagine’, or, to put it in terms of collective memory, support recollection, by allowing the tourists to literally ‘travel’ at its place of origin. This travelogue reveals the depth and breadth of Cook’s pedagogy, which extended to every aspect of the journey. The intensity of sites can be seen from a diary entry written ten days after the visit to the Valley of Elah:

“We came to a large square building which contains a rock on which it is said that Jesus and His disciples ate before and after the Resurrection. Then we visited a very old church in which it is said that our Lord preached His first sermon. Then Joseph’s workshop and Mary’s well, and as it is the only water supply in the town it is quite possible that she drew water from it.”

This wonderful land is full of sacred and historic interest,” as every item seen from the saddle, and every contemporary landmark is mediated and enhanced for their familiar knowledge. Thus it becomes ‘easy to imagine’, or, to put it in terms of collective memory, support recollection, by allowing the tourists to literally ‘travel’ at its place of origin. This travelogue reveals the depth and breadth of Cook’s pedagogy, which extended to every aspect of the journey. The intensity of sites can be seen from a diary entry written ten days after the visit to the Valley of Elah:

“We came to a large square building which contains a rock on which it is said that Jesus and His disciples ate before and after the Resurrection. Then we visited a very old church in which it is said that our Lord preached His first sermon. Then Joseph’s workshop and Mary’s well, and as it is the only water supply in the town it is quite possible that she drew water from it.”

This wonderful land is full of sacred and historic interest,” as every item seen from the saddle, and every contemporary landmark is mediated and enhanced for their familiar knowledge. Thus it becomes ‘easy to imagine’, or, to put it in terms of collective memory, support recollection, by allowing the tourists to literally ‘travel’ at its place of origin. This travelogue reveals the depth and breadth of Cook’s pedagogy, which extended to every aspect of the journey. The intensity of sites can be seen from a diary entry written ten days after the visit to the Valley of Elah:

“we pass through the famed Vale of Elah, where the Philistines, with Goliath, defined the armies of Israel, and where David gained his final victory of the giant. Process by Bethshemesh to Cath and camp there.’ This natural element thus gains a patrimonial value thanks to the authority of the guidebook. In this process of valorisation, it becomes ‘easy to imagine’, or, to put it in terms of collective memory, support recollection, by allowing the tourists to literally ‘travel’ at its place of origin. This travelogue reveals the depth and breadth of Cook’s pedagogy, which extended to every aspect of the journey. The intensity of sites can be seen from a diary entry written ten days after the visit to the Valley of Elah:

“We came to a large square building which contains a rock on which it is said that Jesus and His disciples ate before and after the Resurrection. Then we visited a very old church in which it is said that our Lord preached His first sermon. Then Joseph’s workshop and Mary’s well, and as it is the only water supply in the town it is quite possible that she drew water from it.”

This wonderful land is full of sacred and historic interest,” as every item seen from the saddle, and every contemporary landmark is mediated and enhanced for their familiar knowledge. Thus it becomes ‘easy to imagine’, or, to put it in terms of collective memory, support recollection, by allowing the tourists to literally ‘travel’ at its place of origin. This travelogue reveals the depth and breadth of Cook’s pedagogy, which extended to every aspect of the journey. The intensity of sites can be seen from a diary entry written ten days after the visit to the Valley of Elah:

“We came to a large square building which contains a rock on which it is said that Jesus and His disciples ate before and after the Resurrection. Then we visited a very old church in which it is said that our Lord preached His first sermon. Then Joseph’s workshop and Mary’s well, and as it is the only water supply in the town it is quite possible that she drew water from it.”
to hide away everything that could obstruct the process of recollection. However, as the year 1900 approached, this reality could no longer be hidden. Jerusalem’s economy benefited tremendously from the capital brought by the religious industry, and the city was growing to unprecedented scale. At the end of the nineteenth century, the area surrounding the Jaffa Gate became a local “central station” for pilgrim-tourists, where carriages arriving from the port of Jaffa could discharge their riders at the junction of the Old City and the new, where trade, commerce, and transportation was centered. From Jaffa Gate grew the new Jaffa Road, a mile of hotels, restaurants, and tour agencies developed along the city’s only pedestrian sidewalk. In 1867, Jaffa Road was the first street to be paved in the city, leading to improved transportation to and from the port of Jaffa, a cause in habituation and property speculation outside the walls. In 1870, the offi- cial boundaries of the city extended beyond the Old City to include European compounds and independent Jewish neighbourhoods that had been sprawling since the 1858 Land Code. In 1896, municipal, judiciary, and military offices followedmediating different segments of the population.”

Indeed, the visitors to Jerusalem at the end of the nineteenth century were tourists, a term worth elaborating on in order to understand the reaction of Western travelers to the city. In The Tourist Gaze, John Urry and Jonas Larsen describe the particular way in which tourists observe the world. Tourists, they explain, are subjects who consume a pleasurable experience that differs from their daily life. They often behold the world through a lens that is socially framed by class, gender, education, culture, and religion; their vision is filtered through memories and ideologies in a way that does not reflect an actual reality. Urry and Larsen argue that the tourist gaze is not individually determined, but is constructed and directed through a cognitive work of comparison, classification, and connection; it is heavily based on visual and textual representation, which foster great anticipation from the tourist’s destination.

The gaze and the gaze are in a relationship of constant tension that is negotiated by travel guides, heritage experts, and local religious authorities. This is all the more true in the case of Jerusalem, where the city is inevitably compared to its representations in biblical literature and religious imagery spanning millennia and disseminated through Sunday school and church sermons, museum frescoes and postcards.
of what constitutes beauty of scenery, or must we regard the country through a highly coloured medium? Indeed, the gaze of these travellers over Palestine was framed by their own cultural and aesthetic expectations—heavily influenced by the exalted and chequered sunshine, the purple ant tint, no striking picturesque in shape. The valley is a desolate wilderness encrusted with a species of vegetation that has an expression about it which engages the eye; the dry bed and the sea of Galilee sleep in the midst of a vast stretch of hills and plains where the eye roves upon no pleasant sight, not liking objects, no soft picture dreaming in a purple haze or mirrored with the brightness of an azure surface. I was to this dreamland, to this empty valley of the Holy Land. It is a baleful land! Do not let this land良心.

— Twain, The Innocents Abroad

In his preface, he suggests that it is with innocent eyes that travellers must view the land, “instead of the eyes of those who traveled [sic] in those countries before him.” Surely, Twain’s Innocents Abroad was far from innocent: his gaze was framed within a particular touristic expectation. Twain did not see what was in front of his eyes, but a vision filtered through predetermined memories and shared ideologies. This bias notwithstanding, Twain’s travelogue sold over 67,000 copies in its first year and became the most widely-read travel book by an American author, propelling other travellers to share similar reactions. Contrast his imagination with reality, Eliot Warburg writes:

So long the object of eager hope and busy imagination, it stood before me at length in actual reality. [...]. A brilliant and chequered sunshine has something mournful in it, when all that it shines upon is utterly desolate and dreary.

The sense of desolation was shared by many travellers, who addressed the land’s natural features, in particular its state of productivity— or lack thereof. It was described as a “barren desert, once a well-watered plain [now reduced to] devastation” as nothing “but a barren, hard, despondent wasteland”.

Herman Melville described it as a land “full of old cheese [and] bones of rocks [...]. a land of ruins, paralysed and forsaken [...]. laying in dust and ashes”, its many “hills and valleys, stony, rugged, neglected, silent, and lifeless, succeed one another, as though the anger of God rested on this land, once flowing with milk and honey.” To put it more succintly, it was “a caked, desolate and unpicturesque desert.”

The general agreement about Palestine’s degraded physical condition was gradually transformed as the turn of the twentieth century drew near. As mass tourism shaped local infrastructure, complaints of “the filthy and uncomfortable nature of the accommodation, the want of pure water, the disagreeable smells constantly to be encountered” were heard less and less. Unsurprisingly, technological advancement first arrived to the city via the hospitality industry: the pilgrim hostel of Notre Dame was the city’s first to use electric lighting, and the Fast Hotel had running water before any private home did. This improvement of facilities also meant that Jerusalem’s appeal to tourists was eroded by the success of the industry itself; luxury privately-owned hotels and Western cafés further distanced the city from its image as a distant dream land of the past, and the improvement of infrastructure (such as the opening of the Jaffa–Jerusalem railways in 1892 and the improvement of roads) was seen as no less a desecration of the terrain. A British author commented:

The first feeling that comes to us as we stand on the platform at Jaffa and hear the bell ring and the voice of the conductor shouting “All aboard for Jerusalem” is that a great sacrilege has been committed in the very fact of building a railroad in the Holy Land.

In the same year, a reporter in the popular American magazine Scribner wrote that scrupling “is the introduction of a railroad into Palestine, with the sound of whistle and rushing train among the old and quiet hills of Judea.” Tourists wanted the comfortable Europe that they had known from the pictures and prints. It is doubtful that there were any smoking chimneys around the Old City; rather, what they saw was probably more reminiscent of industrial Europe than the city known from religious art. As the Irish Minister Josias Leslie Porter wrote, “the City of the Great King, the Holy City of the Crusaders, the picturesque City of the Saracens, has at the present time almost disappeared from the screen and concealed by the tasteless structures of modern traders and ambitious foreign devotees.” Even Cook’s own offices were disturbing, as Hanna Harris wrote: “the balloon in the sketch[.] is the American Consulate, and Cook’s Offices are just below; and very strange is it to the visitor whose mind is full of images of ancient and scriptural association, to have at every turn reminders such as these of modern life.”

It is clear that the Jerusalem of memory did not make itself available to the tourist. Many of the images of the picturesque place such as early childhood, aligning Palestine with a sense of home. The Irish traveller Eliot Warburg wrote that while his “first impressions of childhood associations were connected with travel”, the reality “is unlike anything else on earth—so blank to the eye, yet so full of meaning to the heart.” The Swiss theologian Philipp Schaff wrote, “We approach Jerusalem with reverence and awe, and are overwhelmed with the memories of the stupendous events which here took place; but we are not left to sorrow over the loss of its ancient beauty, but are to be comforted with the thought that its present aspect is probable to continue for ever to be a warning and a lesson to all ages.”

William Prince writes of his first encounter with Jerusalem:

I had thought that of that moment for years, in waking and in sleeping dreams. [...]. I stood in the road, my hand on my horse’s neck, and with my dim eyes sought to trace the outlines of the holy places which I had long before fixed in my mind, but the fast-flowing tears forbade my succeed - ing. The more I gazed, the more I could not see.

The gaze of Warburg, Schaff and Prince is conflcted between constructed memories and physical reality. Their vision was diffused across the array of signs so that, to them, Jerusalem was illegible: While they rectified their journeys, like Twain, by “verbatim[ing] their experience, fellow Westerners opted for another solution. “The curse that hangs over Palestine is the curse of unjust and unwise government” wrote Conder in 1891, before he was appointed and funded as part of my undying property.” As such, the touristic gaze was both passive and active, ready to showcase control, ownership, and agency in order to reshape Jerusalem into a legible city for those arriving at its gates.
in the world, with an appeal to the imagination that not Rome, even not Athens, could rival. His sentiments for the city were not dissimilar to those of Palestine’s late-nineteenth-century tourists, and he admittedly had little experience for the task at hand. One of his first actions as military governor was to put an end to all construction in Jerusalem: within four months of his appointment, he released a statement announcing that “No person shall demolish, erect, alter or repair any structure within 2,500 metres of the Damascus Gate of the Old City, without his permission.” Cars were to be left out of the city, and when asked about the possibility of a tram to run between Bethleheem and the Mount of Olives, he wrote that “the first rail section would be laid over the dead body of the military governor.”

As much as Storrs wanted to restore Jerusalem to its biblical past, he was advised that “there are many problems in economics, hygiene, town planning, social reconstruction, to which the sermon on the Mount and the teaching of Jesus gave us little clue.” He therefore entrusted the project to an independent committee, the Pro-Jerusalem Society, composed of the city’s mayor and the leaders of the Muslim, Jewish, Christian, and Armenian communities. This uncommon union of civic and religious concerns was bound together “by the common love for the Holy City.”

Fig 26: Jerusalem from the south (American Colony Photographers, 1869-1897)

Storrs appointed the Arts and Crafts advocate and William Morris follower C. R. Ashbee as director. Like Storrs, Ashbee believed that the urgency of their mission was a matter of not only archaeology or preservation but of beauty: “Everything that we associate with our sense of beauty is alive in danger: Landscape, the unity of streets and sites, the embodied vision of the men that set the great whole together […] all these things have to be considered practically.”

When Ashbee arrived in Jerusalem, it was in a desperate state: “It is difficult to imagine a sharper contrast than between the Jerusalem of man’s imagination […] and the actual Jerusalem left us by the Turk.” He lamented his responsibility in shaping this “city of the mind,” evoking with despair the great giants of the past, and contemplating his abundance of freedom and endless possibilities. For him, there was no logic in the condition in which “the stranger had become a native, the pilgrim the resident.” But this was indeed the case, and with the Pro-Jerusalem Society, Ashbee intended to do well with the city—and prevent others from doing ill. Within this framework, Jerusalem would become a project of two cities: a new metropolis to be regulated and an ancient city to be made legible. The first part was simple and well-known to English improvers: hundreds of kilometres or asphalt roads were to be constructed, soil erosion prevented by extensive afforestation, and terracing encouraged in order to improve the land’s fertility, making sure “the land can be made really productive.” The second part of his plan—the project of legibility—was more complicated: it did not have a blueprint, but was made up of a variety of plans, projects, and legislation drafted over several decades by prominent architects and planners. In the context of this paper—the discussion on collective memory, legibility of its urban signifiers, and the valorisation of Jerusalem as a historic monument—I have chosen to highlight the plans (both realised and unrealised) that treated Jerusalem as a project of landscape design. 1 position this hypothesis within the theoretical framework put forth by Denie Rizvi, Kishwar Obenzinger, Sandy Isenstadt, and Gary Fields, and W.J.T. Mitchell who, in Modernism and Postmodernism, posited the idea of a body of work that is “over-churched” by the immense construction of religious institutions and shrines; it was the outdoors, rather, that was perceived as more authentic, holy, and true to Jerusalem’s past. He favoured the Garden of Gethsemane, a plot of land that had been enclosed by the Latin Church in the 1870s, believed to be the scriptural site where Christ agonised before his arrest. For Storrs, “of all the places belied by the person of Christ none is more beautiful, few so authentic, as the Garden of Gethsemane.” Storrs hoped to return the garden to its state during the days of Christ, but compromised by deciding to appeal to the Pope against the decision of the Custodia Terra Sancta (the Franciscan Order’s Custody of the Holy Land) to build structures in the garden. He believed, like many other western congressmen, that the open Garden Tomb over the congested Holy Sepulchre, that open spaces are much more holy, and that while cities have changed, perhaps the mountains and the valleys have stayed the same—since the time of not only Christ, but creation itself.

That it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.

The first element of landscape design was that it is a ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.

The first element of landscape design was that it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.

The first element of landscape design was that it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.

The first element of landscape design was that it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.

The first element of landscape design was that it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.

The first element of landscape design was that it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.

The first element of landscape design was that it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.

The first element of landscape design was that it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.

The first element of landscape design was that it is an ideology, a Western construct, and that power is structured on imagined relationships with the natural world. For clarity, I have grouped these plans according to three mechanisms of landscape design: the imposition of a strong sense of the natural, the use of stone as a unifying building material, and the construction of Jerusalem into a familiar image by removing all visual obstructions. It is through the interlocking of these three elements that Jerusalem was irreversibly made into a place designed and sustained for the tourist gaze.
Jerusalem would be ever-familiar to an arriving it for the first time from afar. With the removal complexity of the city itself, but to those seeing plans were intended to appeal not to the city's streets contained a wide array of building mate - neither by a castle nor by towers, and whose rubbish further downhill [...] in this way may be laid out.\[186\] 1918–1920, Central Zionist Archives, Jerusalem.\[187\] Geddes, Jerusalem Actual and Possible, 1924.\[188\] Ashbee, Jerusalem 1918–1920, 6.\[189\] Storrs forbade the use of stucco, corrugated iron, and wood, “materials [that] were and are inappropriate”\[190\]. While this legislation was intended to preserve Jerusalem on its landscape, it effectively displaced the city's poor, whose tin homes had to be dismantled.\[191\] As Eyal Weizman argues, this “petrification” of the city, carrying a symbolic value for not only British colonists but also Israel's master planners in 1967, who likewise claimed the stone to “stimulate other sensations embedded in our collective memory, producing strong associations to the ancient holy city of Jerusalem.”\[192\]

However powerful the stone legislation was, there were still major revisions to the image of Jerusalem that had to take place. The third and final element of the design is thus the construction of a clear, unobstructed, and familiar view onto Jerusalem. This was not undertaken in one plan or legislation, but as a series of surgical interventions, recreational projects, and sketches contained in the personal notebooks of Ashbee and in the 1918 publication by the Pro-Jerusalem Society. The latter begins by boasting of “cleaning the Citadel and clearing out of the city fosse”, which included the removal of “great masses of stone debris” and, of course, a mass of Ottoman refugees.\[193\] In their camps, “there was much sickness, the misery and squallor were pitiful, and it took a long time before the relief officers were able to cope with the difficulty.”\[194\] The society found a creative way to deal with both the material and human remains of the war:

The Society then worked out a method by which the clearing and cleaning should be done by refugee labour, and such of the refugees were able-bodied were utilised, so to speak, tidy up their own house. Many hundreds of men, women, and children, organised in different working gangs, were thus used.\[195\]

The violence embedded in this efficient “method” could not be overstated. The remainder of the publications maintain similar notions of clearing and beautifying Jerusalem’s signifiers, of which the Citadel was only one. The Ramparts Walk, for example, was a fortified walking path on the ancient walls, originally used for security. Under the new plan, it was to become a promenade: “the spinal cord on which is to be built the whole series of parks, gardens, and open spaces of which the new city will be composed.”\[196\] For this project, the Society opened disused guardhouses, removed several feet of landfill, built steps, installed iron handrails, and removed around thirty “encroachments” that were built by the city's residents in order to demarcate their domestic property. The Ramparts Walk is a classic example of valorisation: it enhances the Old City’s appeal by creating a quasi-historical attraction that engages with the materiality of the ancient. While it is based on the Ottoman walls, it was hailed by Ashbee as “the largest, and perhaps the most perfect, Medieval enceinte in existence.”\[197\] Raising above the “wild

The Ramparts Walks website in 2021 notes that “the Ramparts Walk is one of the most rewarding activities in terms of history, beauty and a greater sense of the Old City as a whole.”

The idea of creating Jerusalem as a landscape is evident not only from the projects and texts undertaken by the Society, but also from the medium used to devise these plans. The design of the Jaffa Gate is presented as a juxtaposition in the informal layout of pine trees and flowers of the Green Belt, the Walk sold a biblical attraction that not only united the Old City in one perimeter, but allowed for an obstructed, dominating gaze on the sacred territory that it encloses.

Another substantial undertaking was the ‘clearing-up’ of the old city gates. First, the society removed locals (such as a bath contractor or dung-cake bakers) that appropriated St Stephen's Gate, repaired the guard-house at Herod's Gate, and designed a new monumental scheme for Damascus Gate. Jaffa Gate was to be completely remodelled: the Ottoman Clock Tower—described by Ashbee as ‘hideous’ and by the Pro-Jerusalem Society as ‘unsightly’—was dismantled. A large open space replaced the existing make-shift market stalls, which would be cleared away, along with the shops that had been erected around the gate for decades. In addition, parts of the wall that had been breached over the years would be rebuilt “again exactly as it was”, and a new flower garden would be planted around the citadel.

The Rampart walk ca. 1923 Source: American Colony Jerusalem

The idea of creating Jerusalem as a landscape is evident not only from the projects and texts undertaken by the Society, but also from the medium used to devise these plans. The design of the Jaffa Gate is presented as a juxtaposition in the ‘before-and-after’ style: above, we see a panoramic photograph taken beneath the Jaffa Gate, with the clocktower visible, as well as other shops, stalls and carriages bringing pilgrims from the Port of Jaffa. Below, we see a hand-drawn rendering of Ashbee's proposal: the medieval walls are clearly visible and intact, with the monumental tower of the citadel rising on the right. The entire scene is framed by generous pine trees and luscious greenery; it is a projected image of a productive, well-ordered world where old and new live together in harmony, encapsulating a Western vision of the beauty, the ancient, and the holy.

Below Ashbee’s rendering, the subtitle reads: “The same [the view onto Jaffa Gate] as suggested when the unsightly obstructions that hide the wall line are cleared away.” Indeed, Ashbee’s picturesque scene sees actions of displacement and demolition as nothing but the clearing of obstructions. As a case-study for Jerusalem at large, the redesign of the Jaffa Gate reveals the primacy of the distant view over the discomforts of proximity; it encapsulates the sensibilities of a landscape painter employed by the Pro-Jerusalem Society. Indeed, the particular gaze that is associated with landscape painting is that of possession and authority; it is a form of control that positions the external viewer in a paternalistic relationship with the local-insider. The latter is flattened along with all the rest of the elements within the frame—greenery, houses, natural elements, ruins, and monuments—into a picturesque composition. At the same time, the outsider is at liberty to enjoy the affectivity of the scene—and then turn their back on it.

Ashbee’s designs for Jerusalem elevates the sub-
appreciation of the whole.”

W.J.T. Mitchell argues that “the invitation to look at a specific thing, but to ignore all particulars... is an invitation not to look at a site, but at it as landscape painting is... landscapes... made all that it touches memorable and familiar, from being realistic. It was intended to serve the purpose of reflecting back to the powerful viewer, at ease in his... view”, in Cosgrove, Denis Cosgrove, ‘Nature Observed by an Eye Trained to Look’, in The Symbolic Landscape, 1980, 16-19.

In a landscape painting, the view is of landscape as “a view or prospect of natural inland scenery, such as can be taken in at a glance from one point of view.” In Cosgrove, Denis Cosgrove, ‘Nature Observed by an Eye Trained to Look’, in The Symbolic Landscape, 1980, 16-19.

Fabric, thus articulating the old and new cities by the logic of difference, the Jerusalem stone made all that it touches memorable and familiar, creating an instant signifier for the ‘city of the mind’, and the ‘removal of obstructions’ assured that Jerusalem would be instantly legible from a variety of distances. These interlocking interventions—in plan, legislation and demolition—used the medium of landscape to transform the city.

In the process, Jerusalem became increasingly similar to any other historic city. Choay argues that “the valorisation of the ancient centres tends, paradoxically, to become the instrument of a secondary form of trivialisation, as cities begin to resemble each other so closely that tourists and multinational companies feel identically at home in every one of them.” In Cosgrove, Denis Cosgrove, ‘Nature Observed by an Eye Trained to Look’, in The Symbolic Landscape, 1980, 16-19.

In the process, Jerusalem became increasingly similar to any other historic city. Choay argues that “the valorisation of the ancient centres tends, paradoxically, to become the instrument of a secondary form of trivialisation, as cities become similar, so closely that tourists and multinational companies feel identically at home in every one of them.” In Cosgrove, Denis Cosgrove, ‘Nature Observed by an Eye Trained to Look’, in The Symbolic Landscape, 1980, 16-19.

Fabric, thus articulating the old and new cities by the logic of difference, the Jerusalem stone made all that it touches memorable and familiar, creating an instant signifier for the ‘city of the mind’, and the ‘removal of obstructions’ assured that Jerusalem would be instantly legible from a variety of distances. These interlocking interventions—in plan, legislation and demolition—used the medium of landscape to transform the city.

In its use of landscape, the project was operating not only along religious sentiments but also under the rules of capitalism: indeed, the project was conceived on the principles of property, displacement, and exclusion, and it valorised Jerusalem as a consumable urban attraction, an enhanced historic monument. Its success was thus determined by the real estate market, subjecting Jerusalem to a pattern common to ancient cities across the globe, in which they are both made banal and subordinated to their symbolic value. In recent decades, the state of Israel and the renewed municipality of post-67 Jerusalem have deployed mechanisms of enhancement that exemplify both Choay’s and Marx’s interpretations of valorisation. Viewing promenades, pedestrian streets, artist colonies, and outdoor festivals align the Holy City with tropes of leisure and increase the visibility of its historic monuments. By applying a Marxist analysis of valorisation, we can view the commodification of pilgrimage as the cause for the eliminations of other industries from the Old City and its environs in the hopes of increasing its surplus value from tourism, thus resulting in a condition where the city’s economic survival may very depend on the tourist industry’s sustained success.

In the process, Jerusalem became increasingly similar to any other historic city. Choay argues that “the valorisation of the ancient centres tends, paradoxically, to become the instrument of a secondary form of trivialisation, as cities begin to resemble each other so closely that tourists and multinational companies feel identically at home in every one of them.” In Cosgrove, Denis Cosgrove, ‘Nature Observed by an Eye Trained to Look’, in The Symbolic Landscape, 1980, 16-19. From pilgrims to surveyors, archaeologists, tourists and colonizers—Jerusalem’s visitor has morphed from pilgrim to surveyor, archaeologist, and tourist—merging back to the powerful viewer, at ease in his... view”, in Cosgrove, Denis Cosgrove, ‘Nature Observed by an Eye Trained to Look’, in The Symbolic Landscape, 1980, 16-19.

Fabric, thus articulating the old and new cities by the logic of difference, the Jerusalem stone made all that it touches memorable and familiar, creating an instant signifier for the ‘city of the mind’, and the ‘removal of obstructions’ assured that Jerusalem would be instantly legible from a variety of distances. These interlocking interventions—in plan, legislation and demolition—used the medium of landscape to transform the city.

In its use of landscape, the project was operating not only along religious sentiments but also under the rules of capitalism: indeed, the project was conceived on the principles of property, displacement, and exclusion, and it valorised Jerusalem as a consumable urban attraction, an enhanced historic monument. Its success was thus determined by the real estate market, subjecting Jerusalem to a pattern common to ancient cities across the globe, in which they are both made banal and subordinated to their symbolic value. In recent decades, the state of Israel and the renewed municipality of post-67 Jerusalem have deployed mechanisms of enhancement that exemplify both Choay’s and Marx’s interpretations of valorisation. Viewing promenades, pedestrian streets, artist colonies, and outdoor festivals align the Holy City with tropes of leisure and increase the visibility of its historic monuments. By applying a Marxist analysis of valorisation, we can view the commodification of pilgrimage as the cause for the eliminations of other industries from the Old City and its environs in the hopes of increasing its surplus value from tourism, thus resulting in a condition where the city’s economic survival may very depend on the tourist industry’s sustained success.

In the process, Jerusalem became increasingly similar to any other historic city. Choay argues that “the valorisation of the ancient centres tends, paradoxically, to become the instrument of a secondary form of trivialisation, as cities begin to resemble each other so closely that tourists and multinational companies feel identically at home in every one of them.” In Cosgrove, Denis Cosgrove, ‘Nature Observed by an Eye Trained to Look’, in The Symbolic Landscape, 1980, 16-19. From pilgrims to surveyors, archaeologists, tourists and colonizers—Jerusalem’s visitor has morphed from a subject who undertakes a personal journey to a passive participant in the mass movement that generates capital. Along the way, the notion of
memory has been lost: what once carried analogical power through textual and visual interpretation, has now been fixed in space and time, only to be finally abstracted and reduced to a cyclical recollection of drained values.

The design chapter of this thesis thus proposes a counter-project to the valorisation of Jerusalem. In order to untangle the tie between pilgrimage and heritage, the project proposes a journey, bound neither by geography nor by narrativity, but sequenced according to association and analogy. Its stations have not been scrutinised for authenticity, valorised for visibility, or commodified for profitability; they cannot be ritualised into one sequence, for their devotional typology is as varied as pilgrimage itself. Instead, the stations are composed as a multiple-choice garden of forking paths that traverses the history of the Holy City in order to carve an analogical path towards Jerusalem.

Ibid
Ibid, 155
Ibid, 156
Ibid, 156

In his “Garden of the Forking Paths” (1941) Jorge Luis Borges writes: “I leave to the various futures (not to all) my garden of forking paths (...) In all fictional works, each time a man is confronted with several alternatives, he chooses one and eliminates the others; in the fiction of Ts’ui Pên, he chooses—simultaneously—all of them. He creates, in this way, diverse futures, diverse times which themselves also proliferate and fork.”
In January of 1417, Sister Truyde of the St Mary and St Agnes Convent in Diepenveen asked her fellow nun, Sister Ghertruut Huginges, to join her on a pilgrimage to Rome. If they had left the convent on time, Truyde said, they could make it to Rome by January 27—the day of the virgin martyr Agnes. But on the day of their departure, January 7, Ghertruut fell ill and stayed behind; Truyde said goodbye to her fellow sisters and departed on her own.

While she did arrive in Rome on time to join the celebrations of St Agnes’s Day, Truyde had never actually left the convent; in fact, neither she nor her fellow nun Ghertruut had ever been to the real city of Rome, and it is unlikely that they had been outside the convent at all in decades. The pilgrimage Truyde undertook in 1417 (and Ghertruut several years before her) was not a physical journey, but a mental one, conducted through a choreography of prayers, meditations, and physical actions.

This unique form of female spirituality was common in the Middle Ages amongst enclosed women who could not afford (financially or spiritually) a physical pilgrimage. It provided them with a different way to ‘travel’ to the holy sites, gain indulgences and reach spiritual ascension—all without leaving their monastic cell. A key component of this ritual was the devotional manuscript, that was based on travelogues written by real pilgrims to the Holy Land and could thus aid one’s personal imitation of Christ through compassion (from the Latin com + patior, “to suffer with”). Evolving in time and space, these manuscripts led the reader through the Christological narrative from page to page and from station to station in the actual geography of the land and within the imaginary topography of the the mind. Illustrations, descriptive text, and prescriptive prayers directed the virtual pilgrim through the sights of the journey, as it unfolded experientially in the imagination of the reader and spatially within the monastic cell.

The visual representations varied greatly in iconography and style, but maintained a consistent aim: to allow an enclosed woman to enact Christ’s last moments and thus embody his pain. The instructive manuscripts thus consisted of both figurative and symbolic motifs, from realist images of Christ’s bleeding body to measurements taken in the Holy Land such as the length of his tomb or number of steps between holy sites. These details provided the reader with the tools to reenact the exact ritual a pilgrim would undertake physically in Jerusalem, while her mind could meditate on Christ’s pain and suffering. She could, for example, climb 28 steps on her bleeding knees in the convent and walk the 232 “ells”...
names for Islamic monuments and wrote about going to the House of Veronica and Pilate's Palace, despite the entry restrictions on Christian pilgrims, not as one would see them in reality. While a physical traveller would first see Nazareth, then Jerusalem, and finally Bethlehem, his account reordered these sites to follow the narrative of Christ's Nativity, miracle-working in the north, and finally the Passion in Jerusalem. This altered itinerary removed the confusing topographical conditions and thus made the narrative coherent for a virtual traveller. Part-biblical, part-Crusader, and part-scriptural, Fabri's Jerusalem could never exist on earth, but could be readily imagined in the minds of his readers. This appropriation and authorial agency created the opportunity to trespass political, religious, and economic constraints. Distilling elements of veneration from the complexity of the real Jerusalem, virtual travel, or mental pilgrimage, offers a far less violent appropriation of the landscape added legibility and credibility to the sights without valorising the land itself or creating permanent transformations.

Similar to the medieval manuscripts, these devotional travelogues instrumentalised image-and-text to root the journey in a sacred topography, while shielding its surface from various forms of political and economic exploitation.

Following this lineage of devotional travelogues extending from the nineteenth to the thirteenth centuries, the photographic project presented below is conceptualised as a travelogue for virtual pilgrimage to Jerusalem. This journey, however, is not only the physical place in
Palestine, but the one enacted and adapted across the West as an idea and an orientation, using analogical thinking and theatrical staging. Entitled ‘The Stations of the Cross’, the project learns from the affective representational techniques explored above by juxtaposing image and text as parallel modes of representation. Rather than using illustrations or images of the Holy Land, like in the canonical Stations of the Cross that have been studied in this dissertation, it is composed of photographs of sites both in Jerusalem and outside of it. Instead of scriptural verses, prayers, instructions, or descriptions, it includes first-hand experiences of past pilgrims to Jerusalem. The text does not provide illustrative captions for the photographs or an explanation of the sightings, but the reactions, disappointments, meditations, and subjective interpretations of the journey and its topography by pilgrims. By reading these excerpts alongside the photographs of sites both in Jerusalem and outside of it, one may consider the tension between the real and imagined Jerusalem, the sign, signified, and dislocation of collective memory.

THE IMAGE AND THE CAPTION

The choice of format for this project is lead not only with the historic research on virtual pilgrim guides, but is set within the theoretical framework proposed by theorist and photographer Allan Sekula. In his polemic response to ‘The Stations of the Cross’, Sekula argued that photography cannot remain as sparsely-captioned images on the gallery wall, and that text should be used to “anchor, contradict, reinforce, subvert, complement, particularize, or go beyond the meanings offered by the images themselves.” In the context of 1970s America, when photography was gaining currency as an autonomous artistic practice, Sekula worked to reclaim the medium’s utilitarian origins and formulate an alternative practice by rethinking the relationship between image and text. His first major project, ‘Aerospace Folktales’ (1973), follows the life of a middle-class family in Southern California after the father had lost his job as an aerospace engineer at Lockheed. Sekula photographs this prototypical family in and around their Los Angeles apartment as they go about their daily lives: the children read or play, the mother is mostly in the kitchen, and the father, coping with his new status as an unemployed white-collar professional, attempts to fix household appliances while applying for new jobs. Initially composed of 142 photographs, text cards, and a sound installation, ‘Aerospace Juxtaposes signs of everyday domesticity with behind-the-scenes details of his photographic process and anecdotes from the mechanism of family life. The novelty of ‘Aerospace’ is not the subject matter per se—similar subjects had been documented by photographe rs in the 1970s, as Lewis Baltz notes: ‘While it was extremely difficult to see photo- graphers utilized as art on New York gallery walls in 1967, it was extremely difficult not to’.”

Fig 4: Allan Sekula, ‘Aerospace Folktales’ (1973)

Sekula, ‘Interweaving Modernist Documentary, 40
Sekula criticizes the fact that photographs were considered useful whose value is not only that of use, but also of exchange. That is, they become our utilitarian carriers of information, but a commodity that unites the Modernist art market. In his polemic response to ‘The Stations of the Cross’, Allan Sekula’s assertion that the photographer bears the responsibility to supplement the visual content with textual context.

Other combinations of text and image that inspired the Stations can be found in the works of artists Robert Smithson and Dan Graham. In 1967, Smithson travelled from New York City to his hometown in New Jersey with a notebook and a cheap camera. Travelling on foot, Smithson stops to photograph the entropic landscape of the Passaic River which he ironically (or perhaps poetically) construes as monuments: the pipes dumping polluted liquids into the river are enti- tled the Fountain Monument, and a floating pumping derrick is simply Monument with Pump. When Smithson asks if ‘Passaic has replaced Rome as the eternal city’, he is questioning not only the idea of monuments as sites of collective memory, but the very essence of recollection as it could arise from signs of mundane. This interpretation is made possible thanks to Smithson’s clever use of the caption, a technique not dissimilar from the annotations of the medieval pilgrim guides, where text introduces a didactic context in order to resist the autonomy of the image and offer an alternative to the regime of visual perception.

Meanwhile, in ‘Home for America’ (1966), Dan Graham used a simple Kodak camera to photogra ph tract housing in New Jersey and Levittown as beautiful works of minimalist art, which he affectionately labelled ‘his’ (Donald) Judd’s.” First presented as a slideshow, Graham’s photographs were later edited into a magazine article where the mass-produced homes were confronted with their mode of production, juxtaposing cheap-ly-printed colour photographs with developers’ offerings of plans, house models, finishing colours and furniture arrangements. Using his own photographs alongside readily made texts from advertising booklets, Graham forms a cri-tique not only of the culture of cheaply-built cookie-cutter homes, but also of the role of photography in disseminating and naturalising this domestic typology as an object of popular consumption.

The facilitation with the replicated landscape of suburbia visualised by Graham echoes that of an artist whose influence on this thesis cannot be overstated: Ed Ruscha. In 1961, Ruscha published ‘Twenty-six Gasoline Stations, a series of photographs depicting every gas station between his Los Angeles home and his parents’ house in Oklahoma in a deadpan style of detachment. It follows a serial rather than associative logic, akin to a topographical study that were discussed in the introduction as the leading method of this dissertation. Ruscha perfected his approach in his subsequent Every Building on the Sunset Strip (1966), Thirty-Four Parking Lots in Los Angeles (1967), and Nine Swimming Pools and a Broken Glass (1968), where he documented the vernacular elements...
of suburbanised Los Angeles with a mix of attraction and repulsion, compelling his audience to perceive the spatial experience of the city with a detached estrangement.³³

Despite their different approaches to text, seriality, and image sequences, these photographers were all meandering across America’s roads and cities with a camera, performing what can be described as a secular pilgrimage. The photograph, like the station, was thus an index of the ritual subject matter and more the action itself. In 1972, Ruscha said, “Sometimes the ugliest things have the most potential. I truly enjoyed the whole afternoon while I shot these pictures. It’s a great feeling to know you are looking for subjects. I went off in the car and I went down to these little towns, to Santa Ana, Downey, places like that. I was exalted at the same time that I was repulsed by the whole thing.”²³

Ruscha had a key influence on the New Topographics exhibition, whose influence on this thesis is elaborated on in the introduction. For Baltz, discovering his book was finding “photographic degree zero”—in fact, he said that “Ruscha was the presiding spirit over the whole show, because we all knew those books, and we all admired them.”²² The legacy of the photographic travelogue outlined above inspired the New Topographics of the twentieth century. From the end of the 1920s, Evans travelled across America to document the ordinary landscapes that sprawled in and around small suburban towns during the Great Depression. Intrigued by decay and austerity, Evans photographed commonplace subjects with frontal views, sharp details, and steady compositions, echoing the functional aesthetics of hard economic times in a manner that he called documentary style.²⁶ In 1938, Evans published American Photographs, a photobook that visualised his commentary on America, travel, and the role of photography within it. Comprising 87 photographs of streets, homes, and citizens of America, this travelogue was organised not chronologically or geographically, but through nuances and analogies.

Evans’s photographic journeys across America’s topographies of desolation resurrect the wandering foreigner who opts out of society in favour of a self-imposed exile.²⁷ In this open-ended form of peripatetic devotion, all stations along the journey are equally worthy of meditation, thus removing the sacro-geographic hierarchy introduced by institutions. Evans’s radical photobook thus becomes the model for The Stations of the Cross, where every photograph carries the same amount of visual information: there is no progression of emotion or topographic escalation, but a steady journey towards a destination. The composition of the frames in the Stations echoes this assertion, as each monument is approached laterally, incorporating the path and landscape as equally valuable in the spatial envelope of the station, thus blurring topographic figure and ground. Images are organized in pairs that share superficial and structural analogies, and are complemented with a parallel stream of textual descriptions from pilgrim travelogues that open a field of associations and interpretations.

As an alternative to the Via Crucis, this travelogue unfolds across a non-linear journey, without a clear geographical path, a historical lineage, or even a typological logic, but rather through nuanced associations. This mode of traveling requires no means. It costs nothing; there are no alms distributed or indulgences collected, and no concessions to political or economic exploitation. The Stations of the Cross, like the manuscripts of the medieval nuns or the photographic travelogues of the nineteenth century, have the power to reclaim not only of travel, but...
also travel writing, as a genre tainted with cultural bias and bound with colonial violence. The Stations does not attempt to demarcate a foreign territory, cast subjective judgment, or ‘write-out’ a disenchanted encounter.

One might argue that the possibilities provided by digital platforms make such projects redundant. Religious services are available on-demand, virtual experiences dissolve geographical boundaries, and the infinite stream of visual content relieves any need for mental imagination. As such, the labour that was invested in such rituals is no longer relevant. Pilgrimage ceases to disrupt one’s daily life: something which once signalled a complete break from routine disintegrates from an anti-structure back to structure. If Christ is indeed found within oneself, perhaps a retreat from the public realm and the removal of ritualistic interruption will mark not the end, but the beginning of an old-new mode of devotion that is practised with one’s own confines. However, as things stand today, this seems far from possible: the sedentary journeys of the Middle Ages were exhausting undertakings, requiring intense physical, emotional, and mental labour. The nuns who created life-size dioramas within their monastic cells performed rituals that stabilised their lives in times of uncertainty and confinement. By repeating a set of prayers and actions, they could find a fleeting detachment from themselves in favour of a greater system of order.

Today, virtual experiences that offer remote travel are mere simulations: they create visual shortcuts to cathartic endings, which fail to move us to the emotional depths once experienced in sedentary pilgrimage. While technology does offer comfort and security—negating the disturbance caused by rituals—it nonetheless erodes whatever is left of our ability to imagine. As Byung-Chul Han argues in *The Disappearance of Ritual* (2009), ‘perception is never at rest; it has lost the capacity to linger. The cultural technique of deep attention emerged precisely out of ritual and religious practices [...] Every religious practice is an exercise in attention.’ When rituals no longer require investment, distraction takes command, and they lose their stabilising power. The Stations propose an exercise of attention, setting off from within one’s room and meandering between images and text of travellers’ past, and thus constructing a topography that merges movement, sentiment, and space into a mode of analogical travel—one that does not fix the course of movement, but simply provides an orientation: towards Jerusalem. As Xavier de Maistre wrote in *Journey Around My Room*:

Read it! I have undertaken and performed a forty-two days’ journey round my room [...] The pleasure to be found in travelling round one’s room is sheltered from the restless jealousy of men, and is independent of fortune. [...] Every man of sense will, I am sure, adopt my system, whatever may be his peculiar character or temperament. Be he miserly or prodigal, rich or poor, young or old, born beneath the torrid zone or near the poles, he may travel with me. Among the immense family of men who throng the earth, there is not one, no, not one (I mean of those who inhabit rooms), who, after reading this book, can refuse his approbation of the new mode of travelling I introduce into the world.

*Fig 8: Edward Ruscha, *Twentysix Gasoline Stations* (1963)*

*Fig 9: Walker Evans, *Homes, Atlanta, Georgia* (1936)*

---

29 Han, The Disappearance of Ritual, 7-8.
30 Han, *The Disappearance of Ritual*, 7-8.
The men I met coming from Jerusalem reported all sorts of contradictory impressions; and yet my own impression contradicted them all. Their impressions were doubtless as true as mine; but I describe my own because it is true, and because I think it points to a neglected truth about the real Jerusalem. I need not say I did not expect the real Jerusalem to be the New Jerusalem; a city of charity and peace, any more than a city of chrysolite and pearl.

I might more reasonably have expected an austere and ascetic place, oppressed with the weight of its destiny, with no inns except monasteries, and these sealed with the terrible silence of the Trappists; an awful city where men speak by signs in the street.

I did not need the numberless jokes about Jerusalem to-day, to warn me against expecting this; anyhow I did not expect it, and certainly I did not find it. But neither did I find what I was much more inclined to expect; something at the other extreme. There may be more of this in the place than pleases those who would idealise it. But I fancy there is much less of it than is commonly supposed in the reaction from such an ideal.
Here you see the cause of all our labours. This Jerusalem is the reflection of the heavenly Jerusalem. This city has the form of the city to which we aspire. This Jerusalem you see, which you face, prefigures and represents the heavenly city.
Then indeed I knew that what I saw was Jerusalem of the Crusaders; or, at least Jerusalem of the Crusades. It was a medieval town, with walls and gates and a citadel, and built upon a hill to be defended by bowmen. The walls and gates which now stand, whatever stood before them and whatever comes after them, carry a memory of those men from the West who came here upon that wild adventure, who climbed this rock and clung to it so perilously from the victory of Godfrey to the victory of Saladin; and that is why this momentary Eastern exile reminded me so strangely of home.

When we had finished our prayer we remounted our asses, having our eyes full of tears and our cheeks wet with joy. This joy did not arise from passion, but from reason; not from the presence of an object of desire, but of a thing deserving of love because it was precious: it was not gladness which leads to licentiousness, but rather to seriousness, which moves one not to laughter, but rather to sobs; which does not shake the body, but bends the limbs; does not lead to speech, but to silence.
My impression remained primarily a thing of walls and gates; a thing which the modern world does not perhaps understand so well as the medieval world. There is involved in it all that idea of definition which those who do not like it are fond of describing as dogma. A wall is like rule; and the gates are like the exceptions that prove the rule. The man making it has to decide where his rule will run and where his exception shall stand. He cannot have a city that is all gates any more than a house that is all windows; nor is it possible to have a law that consists entirely of liberties. The ancient races and religions that contended for this city agreed with each other in this, when they differed about everything else. It was true of practically all of them that when they built a city they built a citadel. That is, whatever strange thing they may have made, they regarded it as something to be defined and to be defended.
I had thought of that moment for years, in waking and in sleeping dreams... I stood in the road, my hand on my horse's neck, and with my dim eyes sought to trace the outlines of the holy places which I had long before fixed in my mind. The more I gazed, the more I could not see.
As I have said, I had expected many things of Jerusalem, but I had not expected this. I had expected to be disappointed with it as a place utterly profaned (sic) and fallen below its mission. I had expected to be awed by it; indeed I had expected to be frightened of it, as a place dedicated and even doomed by its mission. But I had never fancied that it would be possible to be fond of it; as one might be fond of a little walled town among the orchards of Normandy or the hop-fields of Kent.

So far as I can recall them, my impressions, though aesthetically and architecturally better founded, resume what we felt seven years ago: firstly, that the faking of the sites and indignity with which even when authentic they are now misrepresented, is an irritation, an imposition, and an affront to the intelligence; secondly, that the pathos, grandeur and nobility of the ancient City of the Heart easily countervails these very real annoyances.
I can understand a man who had only seen in the distance Jerusalem sitting on the hill going no further and keeping that vision for ever. It would, of course, be said that it was absurd to come at all, and to see so little. To which I answer that in that sense it is absurd to come at all. It is no more fantastic to turn back for such a fancy than it was to come for a similar fancy. A man cannot eat the Pyramids; he cannot buy or sell the Holy City; there can be no practical aspect either of his coming or going. If he has not come for a poetic mood he has come for nothing; if he has come for such a mood, he is not a fool to obey that mood. The way to be really a fool is to try to be practical about unpractical things. It is to try to collect clouds or preserve moonshine like money. […] It may be argued that it is just as illogical to hope to fix beforehand the elusive effects of the works of man as of the works of nature. It may be called a contradiction in terms to expect the unexpected. It may be counted mere madness to anticipate astonishment, or go in search of a surprise. To all of which there is only one answer; that such anticipation is absurd, and such realisation will be disappointing, that images will seem to be idols and idols will seem to be dolls, unless there be some rudiment of such a habit of mind as I have tried to suggest in this chapter. No great works will seem great, and no wonders of the world will seem wonderful, unless the angle from which they are seen is that of historical humility.
Forsake cities and their crowds. live on a small patch of ground, seek Christ in solitude, pray on the mount alone with Jesus, keep near to holy places: keep out of cities, I say, and you will never lose your vocation.

All this historic or pre-historic interest may be touched on in its turn; but I am not dealing here with the historic secrets unearthed by the study of the place, but with the historic associations aroused by the sight of it. The traveller is in the position of that famous fantastic who tied his horse to a wayside cross in the snow, and afterward saw it dangling from the church-spire of what had been a buried city.

I do not forget, of course, that all these visible walls and towers are but the battlements and pinnacles of a buried city, or of many buried cities. I do not forget that such buildings have foundations that are to us almost like fossils; the gigantic fossils of some other geological epoch. Something may be said later of those lost empires whose very masterpieces are to us like petrified monsters.
All the religious rubbish of the different nations, says a recent traveller, live at Jerusalem separated from each other, hostile and jealous, a nomad population [...] Jerusalem is but a place where everyone arrives to pitch his tent and where nobody remains.
A city that is set upon a hill cannot be hid; but it is more strange when the hill cannot anywhere be hid, even from the citizen in the city.
CHAPTER FIVE—TOWARDS JERUSALEM

XIII

TOWARDS JERUSALEM

XIV

Stations of the Cross
Palestine is a striped country; that is the first effect of landscape on the eye. It runs in great parallel lines wavering into vast hills and valleys, but preserving the parallel pattern; as if drawn boldly but accurately with gigantic chalks of green and grey and red and yellow. The natural explanation or (to speak less foolishly) the natural process of this is simple enough. The stripes are the strata of the rock, only they are stripped by the great rains, so that everything has to grow on ledges, repeating yet again that terraced character to be seen in the vineyards and the staircase streets of the town.

And all these coloured strata rise so high and roll so far that they might be skies rather than slopes. It is as if we looked up at a frozen sunset; or a daybreak fixed forever with its fleeting bars of cloud. And indeed the fancy is not without a symbolic suggestiveness. This is the land of eternal things; but we tend too much to forget that recurrent things are eternal things. We tend to forget that subtle tones and delicate hues, whether in the hills or the heavens, were to the primitive poets and sages as visible as they are to us. The sorrow of all Palestine is that its divisions in culture, politics and theology are like its divisions in geology. The dividing line is horizontal instead of vertical. The frontier does not run between states but between stratified layers. The Jew did not appear beside the Canaanite but on top of the Canaanite; the Greek not beside the Jew but on top of the Jew; the Moslem not beside the Christian but on top of the Christian. It is not merely a house divided against itself, but one divided across itself.
---X---

Left: Church of the Holy Sepulchre
(ca. 12th Century), Basilica of Santo Stefano,
Bologna, Italy
Right: Station IV, Sacro Monte di Crea
(1889) Piemonte, Italy

Text: St Jerome letter 53 to Paulinus CA 395 AD

---XI---

Left: Station XIV, Sacro Monte di Orta
(1583) Piemonte, Italy
Right: Temple Church of the Knights Templars
(1185 AD) Inn of Court, City of London,
United Kingdom

Text: Chesterton, G.K., The New Jerusalem
(London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1920)

---XII---

Left: Tomb of Abishalom, son of King Solomon
(1st Century AD) Valley of Kidron, Jerusalem
Right: The Holy Sepulchre (Round Church) of
Cambridge (1284) Cambridge, England

Text: Marx, Karl, New York Tribune (New York),
April, 15, 1854

---XIII---

Left: Mark of the Via Francigena, St. Bernard’s
Pass, Aosta Valley, Italy/Switzerland
Right: Station II, Via Dolorosa, Jerusalem

Text: Chesterton, G.K., The New Jerusalem
(London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1920)

---XIV---

Left: Station V, Adam Kraft’s Stations of the
Cross (1490) Nuremberg, Germany
Right: Station I, Via Crucis of Tre Cunei,
(date unknown) Piemonte, Italy

Text: Chesterton, G.K., The New Jerusalem
(London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1920)