Cymru am Byth - By exploring the demand for a Welsh regiment of footguards and the nature of the regiment until 1918, to what extent was the formation of the Welsh Guards in 1915 a manifestation of Welsh national identity?

Student Dissertation

How to cite:

Skinner, Mark (2019). Cymru am Byth - By exploring the demand for a Welsh regiment of footguards and the nature of the regiment until 1918, to what extent was the formation of the Welsh Guards in 1915 a manifestation of Welsh national identity? Student dissertation for The Open University module A329 The making of Welsh history.

For guidance on citations see FAQs.

© 2019 The Author

Version: Redacted Version of Record

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online’s data policy on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.
Mark Skinner

EMA for A329: The Making of Welsh History

Dissertation

Cymru am Byth\(^1\) – By exploring the demand for a Welsh regiment of footguards and the nature of the regiment until 1918, to what extent was the formation of the Welsh Guards in 1915 a manifestation of Welsh national identity?

May 2019

Word Count = 6598

\(^1\) Cymru am Byth, the motto of the Welsh Guards translates as *Wales Forever*
# Contents

Chapter 1 – Introduction.......................................................................................................................... 3

Chapter 2 - “If there are to be Irish, why not Welsh or Cymric Guards?” – The demand for a Welsh regiment of footguards .......................................................................................................................... 7

Chapter 3 - “If you do not like to do it someone else will” – The immediate factors surrounding the formation of the Welsh Guards .............................................................................................................. 11

Chapter 4 - “A Welsh family regiment” – The national identity of the Welsh Guards during the Great War ........................................................................................................................................... 16

Conclusion.................................................................................................................................................. 22

Appendix 1 – Illustrations .......................................................................................................................... 24

Appendix 2 - Tables.................................................................................................................................. 26

Appendix 3 - Abbreviations ...................................................................................................................... 27

Bibliography of Primary Sources ......................................................................................................... 28

Bibliography of Secondary Sources ....................................................................................................... 35
Chapter 1 – Introduction

In February 1915, Major General Francis Lloyd was tasked by Lord Kitchener with forming a regiment of Welsh Guards as part of the family of regiments who, in addition to their infantry role, would hold responsibility for guarding the monarch, assuming duties at Buckingham Palace on St David’s Day 1915. The Welsh nation were the last British nation to be given this honour and although this dissertation does not seek to answer why this was, it will explore why the regiment came into being when it did, and what this discloses about its relationship to Welsh national identity.

The formation of the Irish Guards in 1900 is often cited as the genesis of the idea for the establishment of the Welsh Guards—“with the formation of the Irish Guards in 1900, the claim of Wales for a similar distinction became obvious.” However, these early demands were not acted on for a further 15 years, once the country was engaged in the Great War, as the initial rush of volunteers for the army was starting to slow, and before conscription began in 1916. The reasons for this delay will be analysed, as will the specific circumstances leading to the actual formation.

Wales had a reputation for being less enthusiastic for providing recruits for the British Army, partly as a result of its strong liberal, non-conformist culture where “pacifism and peace were the true characteristics of the Welsh.” While the reasons behind forming the regiment can inform discussion on Welsh national identity during the War, so can the national ethos set by the officers and men of the regiment.

Since the formation of the Welsh Guards there have been several histories written about it and the advantage of the regiment’s youth is that the facts around the early years are well recorded.

---

4 Russell Davies, People, places and passions: A Social History of Wales and the Welsh 1870-1940 Volume 1, (Cardiff, 2015) p.279
The first recorded source is C.H. Dudley Ward’s *History of the Welsh Guards*\(^5\) published in 1920, which could almost be considered a primary source. It has the advantage of being written close to the events in question but is also clearly influenced by the motivation to portray the regiment (and the Welsh nation) positively. In fact, with many of the secondary sources on the subject, the authors have close links to the regiment, so their writing may be biased to an extent. In the context of my dissertation this means that the authors may wish to over-emphasise links with national identity and any positive effects of the creation of the regiment. This emphasis on national identity is also seen in other works, such as an article by J. Graham Jones who claimed that “Welsh nationhood seemed to be recognised by the formation of the Welsh Guards”\(^6\). While the purpose of this dissertation is not necessarily to significantly dispute any of these works, it will serve to provide a nuanced look at the subject in the specific context of Welsh national identity.

Secondary scholarship which will help frame this dissertation within a wider context are Colin Hughes’ book *Mametz*\(^7\) and Beckett and Simpson’s social study, *A Nation in Arms*\(^8\) which give discussion and statistical analysis of some factors relating to recruitment in Wales. Richard Morris’s book, *The Man Who Ran London During the Great War,*\(^9\) about Francis Lloyd, also provides useful discussion on the views of the key figures involved in the creation of the regiment.

Trevor Royle is one of the most significant authors on the subject, having written both *Anatomy of a Regiment*\(^10\) and the more recent, *Bearskins, Bullets and Bayonets*\(^11\), these works are comprehensive in their accounts and are less susceptible to the whiggish tendencies of Dudley Ward\(^12\) and Retallack\(^13\) for whom there is a certain inevitability about the creation of the Welsh Guards from 1900 onwards. Royle is enthusiastic about the Welsh Guards as being part of an army which is “the

---

\(^5\) Dudley Ward, *History of the Welsh Guards*


\(^7\) Colin Hughes, *Mametz* (Gerrards Cross, 1985)


\(^12\) Dudley Ward, *History of the Welsh Guards*

\(^13\) John Retallack, *The Welsh Guards*
nation in uniform” and “a family”\textsuperscript{14} However, he does acknowledge that senior officers “play(ed) up the Welshness of the regiment”\textsuperscript{15} and this triggers interesting discussions on how and why this may have been.

This paper will take a broadly chronological approach when exploring its research, and the different time periods considered conveniently link with particular themes. Chapter 2 will explore the demand for the regiment’s creation between 1900 and the start of the Great War. This will include the demand from the Welsh people as well as the support and opposition from the British government and military figures. This chapter will investigate the general perception that the formation of the Irish Guards made a subsequent Welsh Guards regiment inevitable. It will examine any differences between pressure from the Welsh people and the responses of the British political and military authorities. This chapter will make significant use of newspaper records, in addition to recorded opinions of key figures. The reasons why the regiment was not formed sooner are likely to show evidence relating to Welsh national identity and character during the period as well as attitudes towards the Welsh nation from central government. This may challenge the perception of Wales as being less enthusiastic about military service.\textsuperscript{16}

The actual formation of the Welsh Guards in 1915 came to fruition quickly, from an initial suggestion in the letter’s pages of several newspapers after the outbreak of war\textsuperscript{17}, and progressing through orders from the King and Lord Kitchener to bring the regiment into existence. Although the manpower demands the war had made on the country had resulted in the formation of an unprecedented number of ‘service’ battalions as part of Kitchener’s ‘new’ armies, the Welsh Guards were not part of this recruiting surge, since they were part of the regular army. This raises questions (considered in chapter 3) over what the most significant reason for their formation was and allows exploration of whether it was triggered by a change in Welsh national identity and attitudes, or was deliberately calculated by the British Government to alter these attitudes.

\textsuperscript{14} Trevor Royle, \textit{Anatomy of a Regiment; Ceremony & Soldiering in the Welsh Guards}, p84
\textsuperscript{15} Trevor Royle, \textit{Anatomy of a Regiment; Ceremony & Soldiering in the Welsh Guards}, p106
\textsuperscript{16} Trevor Royle, \textit{Anatomy of a Regiment; Ceremony & Soldiering in the Welsh Guards}, p26
\textsuperscript{17} Trevor Royle, \textit{Bearskins, Bayonets & Body Armour, Welsh Guards 1915-2015}, pp14-15
Chapter 4 will look at the ethos that was created within the Welsh Guards from its formation until the end of the Great War, and the perception of the regiment from within Wales. There is much evidence that measures were taken to create a distinctly Welsh identity within the regiment, yet it was headquartered and initially stationed in London, which raises questions of how strong its links to Wales were and how much it was representative of the Welsh nation. Cartoons and newspaper reports concerning the early exploits of the regiment will provide the evidence to examine this issue as well as showing whether it contributed to a change in the mindset of the Welsh nation.

By examining all these issues, it will be possible to challenge any preconceptions concerning the subject matter and show the extent to which the formation of the Welsh Guards was a manifestation of Welsh National identity.
Chapter 2 - “If there are to be Irish, why not Welsh or Cymric Guards?”

Most secondary sources point to the 1900 formation of the Irish Guards - as ‘reward’ for service in South Africa – as the start of demand for a similar regiment of Welsh Guards. How much was this the case, and if so, why were these demands not acted upon sooner? What can this tell us about contemporary perceptions of the Welsh and their national identity? Dudley Ward asserts that “the claim of Wales became obvious with the formation of the Irish Guards.” However, was this only evident to the regiment’s supporters and/or after its creation?

Newspapers of the era provide evidence of the support from Wales in the period and appear to show conscious efforts linking praise of Welsh regiments’ actions and the formation of the Irish Guards to the idea for a Welsh regiment of footguards; “on several occasions the Welsh regiments had been mentioned in dispatches, and it would be a compliment only too well deserved to the prowess of Welsh arms in South Africa. if a regiment of Welsh Guards were formed in Wales, in the same way as a regiment of Irish Guards.” The proposal had the support of the Cymmrodorion society which helped bring the matter into the media with support from the “Western Mail and Daily News” who supported the proposal as “it would be an incentive (if any such were needed) to the patriotic ardour of Welshmen.” This support appears to have been based upon a grudging acceptance of the need for the South African war and consequent reward for Wales for its support. However, there is little available evidence of demand from ordinary Welsh people for a regiment since the focus of the campaign was from “the Welsh landed gentry and from a clutch of historians and antiquarians” This would fit in with the ideals of these people to progress Welsh nationalism and the status of the Welsh nation within the United Kingdom as well as a “culmination of trends

---

19 Dudley Ward, History of the Welsh Guards, p.3.
21 Royle, Anatomy of a Regiment, p.25.
22 Anon, ‘Reception at the Town Hall’, p.4.
23 Royle, Anatomy of a Regiment, p.25.
towards greater British national unity and self-identification as ‘British.’”

By lobbying for the creation of a regiment which would give Wales a place the fabric of the British nation, they were hoping to increasing Wales’ national standing.

This campaign within Wales doesn’t appear to have been wholly without support from within the British establishment since there appear to have been tentative enquiries, asking the Royal Welsh Fusiliers “if they might consider transferring to the Brigade of Guards,” and Royle cites the Household Brigade Magazine as writing that “Wales is entitled to similar recognition (as Ireland).” Validation was given to the argument for a regiment in 1910 by the use of the Welsh Regiment and South Wales Borderers “doing Guards’ duty at the Royal Palaces in London.” The author of an article discussing this development, uses this as an example of the King’s support for Wales, as well as citing the standard argument that since all the other home nations were represented within the Brigade of Guards, why should Wales not. Interestingly, this author has also explored a counter argument, that recruiting might prove difficult since the “Welsh Regular Battalions are Welsh in name only. The proportion of Welshmen in them is very small.” It could conversely be inferred that the author believes the prestige of a Guards regiment could help recruiting in Wales; “if only the pick of the Welsh Regiments were allowed to pass into the suggested Welsh Regiment of Guards what an incentive it would be?”

Despite the campaign lobbying for the creation of the regiment, one can infer from its lack of success that there was at least passive – if not active - opposition. In most histories written about the regiment the consensus of why the regiment was not formed earlier is the rather whiggish view that until 1900, the Brigade of Guards bore less distinctive national tags. Therefore, when the creation of the Irish Guards changed this, it was simply a case of waiting for the time to be right for a regiment to be founded. Dudley Ward makes this very point (paragraph 7, footnote 19), adding that

25 Royle, Anatomy of a Regiment, p.25.
26 Royle, Anatomy of a Regiment, p.25.
“at the time however, it was not easy to increase the army.” 30 Retallack makes a similar claim that 
“times were not ripe for any expansion of the army.” 31 This argument is not wholly sufficient, 
considering the event which prompted proposals for a regiment was the creation of another 
regiment. The argument that the nature of the Brigade of Guards (relating to national identities) 
had been changed by the creation of the Irish Guards is valid since prior to then “only the Scots 
Guards had a national affiliation.” 32 Therefore, if this fundamental change to the Brigade of Guards 
was so widely recognised and ‘obvious’ why did campaigners for a regiment ‘miss the boat’ with the 
opportunity to press for a regiment before reductions in the army made any new regiment 
impossible?

One of the clearest reasons, is the sheer numbers of Irishmen in the British Army in relation to 
Welshmen. The point was made in 1910 that “the Irish Guards were raised because Pat forms the 
bulk of our troops. He is a born soldier and it would be easier to raise another battalion of Irish than 
of Welsh Guards.” 33 This is an example of the perception (real or imagined) that the Welsh people 
were reluctant to join the army due to the liberal non-conformist culture which appeared to define 
the nation. Also, it seems that some felt that if Welsh Liberal M.P.s were to lend support to the 
proposals “it was almost bound at once to have a political complexion” 34 which would damage the 
cause, while others berated their lack of interest. 35 Therefore, it is unsurprising that the view that 
Wales would be unable to recruit enough for a new regiment was difficult to shift.

However, why were proposals to repurpose a battalion of Welsh line infantry not pressed home 
successfully? There appears to have been some opposition to the concept from within the army. 
Dudley Ward highlights that within the Brigade of Guards anything new would be “subjected to 
searching and frequently irrational criticism from the older and more experienced formations” 36 and

30 Dudley Ward, History of the Welsh Guards, p.3.
31 Retallack, The Welsh Guards, pp.1-2
32 Retallack, The Welsh Guards, p.11.
34 Anon, ‘Welsh Guards’, The County Echo, (20 Jun 1901), p.4. Available at 
35 Anon, ‘Where are the Welsh M.P.s’, Western Mail, (15 March 1900), Available at 
this could partly explain why the Welsh Regiment “politely declined” the proposal.\textsuperscript{37} There do appear to also have been more fundamental arguments against a Welsh regiment of guards. Even in 1915, the CO of 1st Battalion Grenadier Guards wrote of his opposition to the impending creation, stating that “we shan’t be able to keep up the Brigade in any sort of fashion”, “the Guards Club will become a horrible place in everyway” and “Welshmen will be nearly all socialists I fear.”\textsuperscript{38} These kind of attitudes may have been influenced by the political landscape in Wales and events such as the Tonypandy riots in which the army had been used to intervene, but also, representative of a possible snobbishness about the Welsh from amongst Guards officers drawn from the upper echelons of society.

Another example of this prejudice which may seem petty by modern standards but would have been significant in the period concerned, is the ‘theory of bigness’ which Benbough-Jackson argues affected the nation’s self-image. He argues that in relation to height standards for Guards’ regiments, the argument that “there were not enough tall men in Wales (was) a ‘stock answer’ that concealed the underlying reason ‘that the English mind had not yet become familiar with the doctrine of Welsh nationality.’”\textsuperscript{39} This provides a neat explanation for why the regiment was not created in the years prior to the Great War, and although it shouldn’t be overstated, it fits with the idea that the army and government did not feel that the demand from the Welsh was strong enough to overturn their prejudices against Welshmen in the army and to feel the need to endow Wales with a status requiring representation in the Guards. A letter writer berated the “Westminster Gazette” for a “regrettable incident, in which your waste paper basket perhaps played a leading part”\textsuperscript{40} for not publishing his earlier letter in support of the regiment. While this kind of letter may feature often on many subjects, it is perhaps indicative of a British establishment which believed the issue commanded little enough support that it was able to ignore it, despite a growing view in Wales that the other British nations were the “favoured elder sister of ‘gallant little Wales.’”\textsuperscript{41}

\textsuperscript{37} Royle, Anatomy of a Regiment, p.25.  
\textsuperscript{41} F. Pellatt Elkington, cited in Anon, ‘Welsh Guards’ The Cardiff Times (15 Dec 1900).
Chapter 3 - “If you do not like to do it someone else will”42 – The immediate factors surrounding the formation of the Welsh Guards

In 1914 Britain was thrown into the unprecedented experience of total war, with its associated manpower demands to feed rapid expansion of the army. Against this backdrop, the decision to create the Welsh Guards was finally taken, in February 1915. The chain of events which triggered the immediate formation are well (and consistently) documented within secondary scholarship. However, emphasis on the importance of the assorted driving factors varies and there is scope to examine and challenge the importance placed on different factors using primary sources. How the formation was portrayed at the time gives insight into how it relates back to Welsh national identity.

If the contraction of the army between the Anglo-Boer War and the Great War is considered a major reason (or excuse) why the regiment was not formed sooner, then the sudden expansion of the army and requirement for recruits must surely have been considered when the regiment was proposed. A letter to the Times on 3 February 1915 advocated that the response of recruits to a regiment would be “immediate and overwhelming and it would probably be quite easy to raise several such battalions.”43 Although the author is clearly enthusiastic about Wales’ contribution to the War and there is no evidence that he holds any particular military knowledge, this point of view seems to have been widely held among similar letter writers from the era. However, how did the military and government authorities perceive this situation? February 1915 was “the first occasion since the outbreak of the war in which the monthly [recruiting] return fell below 100000”44 and Simkins argues that “as the recruiting figures slumped, the government explored every possible method of raising new formations and of stirring up public enthusiasm.”45 In this context, the creation of the Welsh Guards appears to fit neatly into a narrative of being created to attract new recruits, inspired by the opportunity to join an elite regiment linked to their nation.

45 Simkins, Kitchener’s Army, p119
However, it is far from definite that the Welsh Guards were formed to attract the masses. Indeed, its initial drive to obtain the men required to create an operational battalion was from within the army, predominately Welshmen from other Guards regiments, particularly in the Grenadier Guards, which had till that point recruited from Wales.\textsuperscript{46} This was a necessity created by the need to form the core of a battalion from experienced Officers, N.C.O.s and men, in order to maintain the high standards expected of a Guards regiment. Retallack points out\textsuperscript{47} that later, the Welsh Guards shifted their recruiting to men not already serving in the army and evidences this with the first recruiting poster used by the regiment.\textsuperscript{48} Notably though, the regiment only ever had a single operational battalion in comparison to the previously existing Welsh regiments which had created many ‘service’ battalions to accommodate recruits who wished to serve for the duration of the war\textsuperscript{49}.

If the purpose of the regiment was not to attract the numbers of recruits attracted by regiments of the Welsh Army Corps, it seems peculiar that in a time when “administrative difficulties ... were caused by the sudden expansion of the army”\textsuperscript{50} an entirely new regiment was formed. The evidence appears to point to both reward and inspiration as motivating factors. The former certainly appeared to feature heavily in the immediate demands for a regiment and later reaction in the media. The North Wales Chronicle regarded the presentation of colours to the regiment as a “tribute to loyal and gallant Wales”\textsuperscript{51} while a letter to the Times advocates the formation as “a high tribute to their nation’s valour and loyalty” as it had already “nobly responded to the Empire’s call.”\textsuperscript{52} Hughes has argued that Wales, by proportion, had over provided for Kitchener’s new armies\textsuperscript{53} despite a perception that the Welsh were reticent to join the armed forces.\textsuperscript{54} Much credit for inspiring this support has been given to Lloyd George and particularly his speech of September 1914 where he called for a Welsh Army Corps to be created.\textsuperscript{55} While the Welsh Guards were never

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{46} Trevor Royle, \textit{Bearskins, Bayonets & Body Armour, Welsh Guards 1915-2015}, p.16.
\item \textsuperscript{47} John Retallack, \textit{The Welsh Guards}, p.3
\item \textsuperscript{48} Retallack, \textit{The Welsh Guards}, p.i.x.
\item \textsuperscript{49} Chris Williams, ‘Taffs in the Trenches: Welsh National Identity and Military Service 1914-1918’ in \textit{Wales and War}, Matthew Cragoe and Chris Williams eds. (Cardiff, 2007), pp126-142
\item \textsuperscript{52} Eynon, ‘A Regiment of Welsh Guards; Letters to the Editor’, p.21
\item \textsuperscript{53} Colin Hughes, \textit{Mametz} (Norfolk, 1990), p.23
\item \textsuperscript{54} Trevor Royle, \textit{Anatomy of a Regiment; Ceremony & Soldiering in the Welsh Guards}, p.26.
\end{itemize}
part of this formation, their creation can be seen as both a product of the Welsh enthusiasm for it (by way of reward) and also a continuation of the methods of inspiring Welsh support for the war. The concept of reward for service strikes a chord with the earlier creation of the Irish Guards, while the continuing theme of inspiring Welsh support is shown in a Western Mail cartoon where the Welsh Guards are depicted fighting alongside New Army formations with the support of St David and Britannia. (Fig.1)\textsuperscript{56}

Linking with the theme of reward was the sentiment that by showing its loyalty to the British nation’s war effort, Wales had earned an improved status amongst the nationalities of the United Kingdom. The North Wales chronicle cites that “the Principality has been recognised by Royalty in its military character, as on a par, and entitled to equal honour, with the other three sister nationalities in the United Kingdom” while the theme of reward is shown in a Western Mail cartoon(Fig. 2)\textsuperscript{57} where the King is portrayed as having rewarded Wales with the creation of a regiment, which the \textit{Cartooning the First World War} commentator cites as a “significant act of recognition of the distinctive claims of Wales on the part of the British state.”\textsuperscript{58}

There is of course a certain causality dilemma concerning national sentiment over this issue. It seems likely that once the proposal for a regiment resurfaced in early 1915, the opportunity was taken by those who wished to enhance Wales’ status within the United Kingdom to back the campaign. This included an enthusiastic media, numerous politicians, and “an influential deputation, partly military and partly civilian ... with evidence of the strong national feeling that Wales should be recognized as a definite unit in the Household troops.”\textsuperscript{59} The fact that at this point the proposal was acted on so quickly by the British authorities, shows that the opportunity to nurture and prolong the positive response of the Welsh nation to the war effort was also quickly identified and acted upon. This is represented in another cartoon where ’Dame Wales’ is shown watering her young plant (the


\textsuperscript{57} JMS, ‘An Honour for Wales’, \textit{Western Mail} (13 Feb 1915), Available at \url{http://www.cartoonww1.org/image.htm?id=166}, Accessed 11 May 2019

\textsuperscript{58} Anon, ‘An Honour for Wales’.

Welsh Guards) amongst a garden of more established regiments, under the sun of “Welsh Nationalism.” (Fig.3)\(^60\)

The King was frequently attributed with being the driving force behind the creation of the regiment. It is widely recorded that the genesis of the regiment started in a meeting between Lord Kitchener and the King in late January or early February 1915, resulting in Kitchener’s order to Sir Francis Lloyd on 6 Feb, to raise the regiment.\(^61\) Although Dudley Ward claims that the King “never signed a document with greater pleasure” than the one authorising the formation\(^62\), there is evidence only shortly before this of “grave doubts” from the King over the enterprise.\(^63\) Whether or not the King was wholeheartedly behind the undertaking, the fact that amongst the Welsh media and people he was given credit, is evidence of the esteem he was held in, within Wales. The North Wales Chronicle cited the belief that the King had already shown his recognition of the “Principality” by the “investiture of the Prince [of Wales]”\(^64\) and that the proposed regiment would further this recognition of national spirit.

The other individual given credit for the formation was Lord Kitchener, which is understandable given the speed in which he acted upon the King’s suggestion. It is widely noted that Kitchener “invariably viewed proposals for national and semi national formations with a great deal of caution”\(^65\) which had led to disagreements with Lloyd George where he “failed to understand either the strength of his opponent’s position or his passionate mixture of Welsh nationalism and religious nonconformity.”\(^66\) It is clear from his later actions that any doubt had been reversed and this has been attributed to his admiration for the Guards which led to his aspiration to create a Guards Division.\(^67\) In a quest for it to be characteristic of Britain he “could not tolerate any exclusion of


\(^{62}\) Charles Dudley Ward, History of the Welsh Guards, p.3.

\(^{63}\) Royle, Bearskins, Bayonets & Body Armour, Welsh Guards 1915-2015, p.16.


\(^{65}\) Simkins, Kitchener’s Army, p97

\(^{66}\) Trevor Royle, The Kitchener Enigma, (London, 1985)

\(^{67}\) Retallack, The Welsh Guards p.2
Wales.” Therefore, this change of heart seems to be due to his belief that “they would fit into the established framework of the army.”

Therefore, although there were several factors which influenced the chain of events leading to the formation of the Welsh Guards in 1915, no single factor drove the creation. Elements such as the recruiting need and the positive attitudes and actions of key figures such as the King and Kitchener were necessary for the creation but would not in themselves have led to the regiment’s conception without the positive reaction of the Welsh people to the war effort and the sense of Welsh national pride which this induced and which the British authorities were happy to foster.

---

69 Simkins, *Kitchener’s Army*, p97
Chapter 4 - “A Welsh family regiment”\textsuperscript{70} – The national identity of the Welsh Guards during the Great War.

The creation of the Welsh Guards was significant as it gave the Welsh a recognised place within the British Monarch’s Household Troops. Early historians of the regiment and supporters of Welsh nationalism pointed to the national composition of Henry VII’s Yeoman of the Guard as a precedent for Welsh Household Troops, though they had not been identified as Welsh due to the political situation.\textsuperscript{71} Therefore, it is appropriate to consider the Welsh Guards as an entirely original facet of military life, so examining how characteristic they were of Wales, and how the Welsh nation accepted them, is beneficial. While this symbiotic relationship continues to this day, this chapter will only deal with the relationship in the early years until the end of the Great War.

It's unsurprising that the establishment of national identity within an organisation originates from the top and the initiators of the organisation. Despite his earlier doubts over the reliability of all-Welsh units, Kitchener’s decision of tasking the creation of the regiment to Maj. Gen. Sir Francis Lloyd was significant. Though he was an obvious candidate as the GOC commanding London District\textsuperscript{72} at the time, it is noteworthy that he was a “well-known Welshman.”\textsuperscript{73} Therefore, despite any reservations he expressed to Kitchener about forming the regiment, it is unsurprising that he was thereafter keen to hurry through the formation of the regiment so that they might first mount King’s Guard on the significant date of St David’s Day 1915.\textsuperscript{74} Tasked with this responsibility, it is clear that Lloyd felt strongly about upholding the standards of the Guards whilst creating a “characteristically Welsh regiment”\textsuperscript{75} He is cited as saying “what we have to do is to get Welsh soldiers for the Guards ... It is going to be a Guards regiment for the King, not merely a regiment of Welshmen.”\textsuperscript{76} This attitude must have influenced his decisions and transmitted to officers and men under his influence.

\textsuperscript{70} Royle, Bearskins, Bayonets & Body Armour, p16
\textsuperscript{71} Dudley Ward, History of the Welsh Guards, p.2
\textsuperscript{72} The GOC commanding London District held/holds responsibility for all units within London, as well as responsibility for State Ceremonial and the Guarding of the Monarch
\textsuperscript{73} Royle, Anatomy of a Regiment; Ceremony & Soldiering in the Welsh Guards, p.29
\textsuperscript{74} Retallack, The Welsh Guards, p.1.
\textsuperscript{76} Maj. Gen. Sir Francis Lloyd, cited in Simon Doughty, The Guards Came Through, p.87
The choice of C.O.\textsuperscript{77} was an example of these two desires. Lt. Col. Murray-Threipland is widely noted as having been selected for the role by merit; yet despite being Scottish, he had a Welsh wife and had served in the Grenadier Guards where many Welshman had originally served. This shows how the need to maintain Guards standards was balanced with the requirement for an officer who had Welsh connections. The appointment of Lord Harlech\textsuperscript{78} as Regimental Lieutenant-Colonel\textsuperscript{79} was another example of balancing the need for experienced Guards officers, with utilising an important Welsh landowner’s influence within Wales.

The selection of the remaining officers was balanced similarly with a mixture of experienced men from across the army placed in key positions where they could mentor newly commissioned officers. It seems to be at the middle ranking officer level where the most compromises were made over Welsh nationality/connections\textsuperscript{80} and this partially validates the point raised in objection to forming the regiment that suitable officers would not be able to be found.\textsuperscript{81} 2/Lieut Fox-Pitt noted in letters home that some of the others were “not exactly Welsh”\textsuperscript{82} and although this shows that not all the officers had Welsh connections, the fact that this was noteworthy shows that having Welsh officers must have been an aspiration. He also notes a number of liberals among his fellow officers, reflecting the political nature of Wales at the time.\textsuperscript{83} The quest to find suitable officers was not helped by opposition from figures in other regiments. The C.O. of 1\textsuperscript{st} Battalion Grenadier Guards was so opposed to the venture that he wrote that “I wouldn’t let any of my officers go to it”\textsuperscript{84} and when one tried, stated that “he would send a nil return.”\textsuperscript{85} Despite this opposition, the fact that the regiment was ready for active service within a few months shows that sufficient officers were found and notably a number of officers from Welsh line regiments transferred in\textsuperscript{86}, despite the Guards custom of officers from elsewhere losing rank to join a Guards regiment.

\textsuperscript{77} See Appendix 3 - Abbreviations
\textsuperscript{78} Dudley Ward, \textit{History of the Welsh Guards}, pp.11-12
\textsuperscript{79} An honorary appointment within the R.H.Q. as opposed to the operational battalion
\textsuperscript{80} Dudley Ward, \textit{History of the Welsh Guards}
\textsuperscript{81} Trevor Royle, \textit{Bearskins, Bayonets & Body Armour, Welsh Guards 1915-2015}, p16
\textsuperscript{86} Dudley Ward, \textit{History of the Welsh Guards}, pp.9-10
When it came to recruiting\textsuperscript{87}, the regiment looked to Welshmen from across the army (particularly Welshmen already serving in the Grenadier Guards) before they started recruiting men from civilian life. In either strand of recruiting, the decision was made that volunteers must “be of Welsh parentage on one side at least or be domiciled in Wales or Monmouthshire and must possess Welsh surnames”\textsuperscript{88} and Lord Harlech specified Welsh language as an alternative to Welsh parentage.\textsuperscript{89} These were relatively strict requirements compared to other Welsh battalions which often found their Welsh nature diluted by drafts from England.\textsuperscript{90} Recruiting posters appeared to use the attraction of the Guards as much as any Welsh national sentiment. The first recruiting poster features the words “Welsh Guards” underneath a picture of the King and the regimental motto, before listing the nationality qualifications. All the text then repeated in the Welsh language below.\textsuperscript{91} Another poster features no Welsh language and a scene in Home Service Clothing\textsuperscript{92} at St James’ Palace.\textsuperscript{93} There is no overt appeal to Welsh national identity other than the regiment’s title and cap-badge and therefore these two posters support a narrative where the appeal is attracting Welshmen who may already want to join the army, or to attract men with the status of a guards regiment rather than through a direct appeal to their Welsh identity.

However men were recruited, the most objective way available to analyse the ‘Welshness’ of the regiment is to analyse its actual national composition. There are several ways of doing this but the available records from the time mean that the most reliable method is by examining the birthplaces of men killed during the Great War.\textsuperscript{94} Although this does not capture data for the whole regiment, it’s reasonable to assume that birthplace did not have a disproportinate effect on a man’s likelihood of death. Therefore, when considering the percentage of men born in Wales, the figure of

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{87} See chapter 3
\item \textsuperscript{88} Trevor Royle, \textit{Bearskins, Bayonets & Body Armour, Welsh Guards 1915-2015}, p17
\item \textsuperscript{90} Dudley Ward, \textit{History of the 53\textsuperscript{rd} Welsh Division}, (Uckfield, 1927)
\item \textsuperscript{91} First recruiting poster, shown in Retallack, \textit{The Welsh Guards}, p.ix.
\item \textsuperscript{92} Home Service Clothing is the distinctive Scarlet Tunic and Bearskin cap worn by Guards regiments when on public duties guarding the monarch
\item \textsuperscript{94} Table 6.6, cited in Chris Williams, Taffs in the trenches: Welsh national identity and military service 1914-1918, in \textit{Wales and War}, Matthew Cragoe and Chris Williams eds. (Cardiff, 2007), p140.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
almost 60%\textsuperscript{95} compares favourably with all the other Welsh regiments.\textsuperscript{96} When looking at the
statistics relating to birthplace by Welsh county,\textsuperscript{97} although the Welsh Guards appear to have
recruited predominantly from Glamorgan and Monmouthshire, their composition includes a greater
proportion of men from North Wales than all but the Royal Welsh Fusiliers, possibly indicating a
greater appeal across the whole nation. While these statistics cannot account for men of Welsh
heritage who were born elsewhere yet still considered themselves Welsh; when considered in
tandem with the qualifications advertised on recruiting posters, and the attitudes of the regiment’s
leaders it is clear that there was a distinct wish for the regiment to be as Welsh in composition as
possible.

Creating a regiment of predominantly Welsh men is one thing; creating a distinctly Welsh ethos is an
entirely separate matter. When examining relevant secondary sources, one must remember that
many are regimental histories which may have been written by authors who (with the best
intentions) are prone to playing up the ‘Welshness’ of the regiment. Therefore, it is important to
examine the tangible evidence. Morris points to Welsh language as a feature of recruiting\textsuperscript{98} and
Welsh is used in the first recruiting poster, albeit subordinate to English.\textsuperscript{99} The regiment’s motto and
all the company mottoes\textsuperscript{100} are written in the Welsh language,\textsuperscript{101} showing another way of linking the
regiment’s identity with Welsh national heritage. However, aside from this it is difficult to find
evidence of the Welsh language being used in any official capacity or of its use being encouraged
informally, like in the Welsh Army Corps.\textsuperscript{102} This being so, it is appropriate to assume that the Welsh
language was primarily used as a way of verifying the regiment’s heritage rather than as a significant
means of communication.

\textsuperscript{95} Table 6.6, cited in Chris Williams, Taffs in the trenches: Welsh national identity and military service 1914-
1918, in Wales and War, Matthew Cragoe and Chris Williams eds. (Cardiff, 2007), p140.
\textsuperscript{96} With the exception of the single battalion Monmouthshire Regiment which had a very specific recruiting
area
\textsuperscript{97} Table 6.7, cited in Chris Williams, Taffs in the trenches: Welsh national identity and military service 1914-
1918, in Wales and War, Matthew Cragoe and Chris Williams eds. (Cardiff, 2007), p141.
\textsuperscript{98} Richard Morris, The Man Who Ran London During the Great War, (Barnsley, 2009), pp83-84.
\textsuperscript{99} First recruiting poster, shown in Retallack, The Welsh Guards, p.ix.
\textsuperscript{100} Dudley Ward, History of the Welsh Guards, pp495-498
\textsuperscript{101} As opposed to the more usual Latin for other regiments in the British Army
\textsuperscript{102} Ray Westlake, Kitchener’s Army, (Gloucestershire, 1989), p.149.
The aforementioned mottos feature on the company colours, all of which bear the heraldic arms of an ancient King or medieval Prince of Wales. Their choice seems significant, since many of these rulers would at some point have been in opposition to the English crown which the regiment was now intrinsically linked with. Even the Prince of Wales’ Company displayed the arms of Griffith ap Cynan rather than the modern Prince of Wales. Despite this, the naming of this leading company after the Prince of Wales showed the King’s desire to show further approval and capitalise upon the good feeling to the royal family created by the 1911 investiture. Much thought appears to have gone into other regimental emblems, particularly with a desire to connect with the past rather than more recent trends. For example, the use of white and green as the colour of the regiment’s plume was linked to the Tudor colours; a nod to the connection between Wales and the monarchy. This connection was also made by the media in relation to the use of the red dragon on the King’s Colour which revived “a standard which figured in the forefront of the Battle of Bosworth.” The use of the leek as the regiment’s cap-badge appears to have been the subject of much discussion and while there is evidence that within the regiment “people all seem to wish it had been a daffodil” the use of “St. David’s humbler but more historic badge” seems to have been well received in the Welsh media. These choices all appear to be a conscious effort to link the regiment to earlier Welsh heritage and gain support from the Welsh nation.

The regiment also participated in other elements of Welsh culture. “A lot of rugby football was played in the Reserve Battalion” and the Welsh Guards were involved in “a military international” which led to “the enlistment of 183 guardsmen ... and helped cement the link between the Welsh Guards and the game of rugby union.” Dudley Ward cites the sporting achievements of the Welsh nation when extolling the virtues of the Welsh nation which the regiment taps into. Musically, there are records of Welsh music being at the forefront of the important ceremonies in the regiment’s life from the very first guard-mount at Buckingham Palace when “the Scots Guards Band

104 Dudley Ward, History of the Welsh Guards, p495.  
106 Retallack, The Welsh Guards, p.3.  
played Men of Harlech and Land of Our Fathers”\textsuperscript{112} and “the march Cambria,” which was “based on an old Welsh air” and appears to have been specially composed.\textsuperscript{113} At the presentation of colours before the battalion deployed to France, much was made in the media of “the Welsh National Anthem ... and a Welsh glee, ”Ton y Botel,” sung by 150 trained men of the regiment.”\textsuperscript{114} Dudley Ward devotes a whole chapter of his early history of the regiment to the several choirs within the regiment\textsuperscript{115} showing the importance with which they were held. There is evidence of their use for recruiting\textsuperscript{116} and their appearance at the 1918 National Eisteddfod appears to have been significant due to their inclusion in the Ceremony of the Gorsedd, and their second-place finish in the competition.\textsuperscript{117}

The reception at the Eisteddfod is evidence of the regiment’s acceptance by the Welsh nation as its representative within the household troops of the British Army. Lloyd George’s praise of the regiment at the 1915 Eisteddfod is reported as receiving vocal support\textsuperscript{118} while at the same gathering, a resolution was passed praising the King for “instituting a Battalion of Welsh Guards” and associating “with them the gallant Prince of Wales.”\textsuperscript{119} The city of Cardiff also seems keen to have associated themselves with the regiment, with postcards celebrating a ceremony where a captured German gun was presented to the city\textsuperscript{120} and providing the funds to purchase the first instruments for the regimental band.\textsuperscript{121} While one must remember that the media and civic institutions were generally supportive of the war and the army in this period, this evidence shows definite support from within Wales.

\textsuperscript{115} Dudley Ward, History of the Welsh Guards, pp.311-316.

\textsuperscript{117} Dudley Ward, History of the Welsh Guards, pp.314.
\textsuperscript{119} Anon, ‘Mr Lloyd George at the Eisteddfod’, p.6.
\textsuperscript{120} ‘Presentation to the City of Cardiff of a German Gun captured at Loos by the Welsh Guards’, (18 November 1915), Available at https://www.peoplescollection.wales/items/434100, Accessed 16 May 2019.
Conclusion

This dissertation has explored the formation of the Welsh Guards within the context of Welsh national identity at the start of the twentieth century. Taking the formation of the Irish Guards as a starting point, it has explored why the regiment was not formed sooner, the specific reasons for its formation in 1915, and the early national characteristics of the regiment, and has been able to uncover a growing sense of Welsh national identity which helped to provide the impetus to form the Welsh Guards.

Many histories have portrayed a certain inevitability of the formation of the regiment with the founding of the Irish Guards changing the nature of the Brigade of Guards to one more focused on national labels. However, it has been shown that despite support from various organisations and individuals within Wales, their campaign was held back by prejudices against the physical and social nature of the Welsh, perceptions of the Welsh as being averse to military service, and above all, apathy from within the British Army and government, including older Welsh regiments. It seems unlikely then that without the specific circumstances created by the Great War, the Welsh people would have been emphatic enough in support of the cause to pressurise the British establishment into forming a regiment, even had the army not been contracting in size at the time.

However, the eventual formation in 1915 was not simply a result of the sudden need for greater numbers of recruits to fight in the war - this need was being met in the service battalions of the Welsh Army Corps. The Welsh Guards served more as a status symbol for a Welsh nation which had responded to Lloyd George’s call to arms. The idea of the creation of the Welsh Guards was reignited by the War and key figures such as the King and Kitchener were able to see the value of harnessing the opportunity to give the Welsh nation recognition within an iconic British institution, as a means of rewarding Wales for its support, and encouraging further backing. The Welsh media, and supporters of Welsh nationalism appear to have readily supported this prestige, providing an example of Welsh national identity being recognised as an independent and valid facet of the greater British whole.

Given the significance placed upon the establishment of the regiment, its national characteristics bear closer examination. As a newly formed regiment which drew on the traditions of the Brigade of
Guards it would have been easy to pay lip service to Welsh heritage. Especially since London was the base for its RHQ and the 1st Battalion before it embarked for the front. However, there is much evidence to show that its national composition was indeed more Welsh than other Welsh regiments, even considering compromises which had to be made to ensure it had enough experience to function effectively. A great deal of consideration appears to have been made to ensure that its heritage drew on Welsh traditions and its cultural life had a Welsh nature, not least to capitalise on attention from the Welsh media.

Therefore, the creation of the Welsh Guards represented an acceptance by the British establishment that Wales was deserving of recognition as an important part of Britain and its war effort, as well as an example of Welsh national identity that could operate (and was recognised) within an overarching sense of Britishness. Davies stated that by serving alongside soldiers of other British identities, “the Taffs became part of a new brotherhood.”

Likewise, through the creation of the Welsh Guards, Wales had willingly accepted increased status as a recognised yet distinct part of the British military ‘brotherhood.’

---

Appendix 1 – Illustrations

*Image Removed for Copyright Reasons*

Fig 1 – For Honour and Justice\textsuperscript{123}

*Image Removed for Copyright Reasons*

Fig 2 – An Honour for Wales\textsuperscript{124}


*Image Removed for Copyright Reasons*

Fig 3 – Making Growth

Appendix 2 – Tables

Table 1 Birthplaces by regiment, Welsh regiments (percentages in brackets)\textsuperscript{126}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regiment</th>
<th>Born in Wales</th>
<th>Born in England</th>
<th>Born Elsewhere in the UK</th>
<th>Born Overseas</th>
<th>Total given</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Welsh Guards</td>
<td>478 (59.5)</td>
<td>313 (39.0)</td>
<td>11 (1.4)</td>
<td>1 (0.1)</td>
<td>808 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Royal Welsh Fusiliers</td>
<td>4170 (48.7)</td>
<td>4234 (49.5)</td>
<td>127 (1.5)</td>
<td>29 (0.3)</td>
<td>8560 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Wales Borderers</td>
<td>2152 (41.1)</td>
<td>2922 (55.8)</td>
<td>137 (2.6)</td>
<td>29 (0.6)</td>
<td>5240 (99.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh Regiment</td>
<td>3964 (57.3)</td>
<td>2773 (40.1)</td>
<td>154 (2.2)</td>
<td>32 (0.5)</td>
<td>6923 (100.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monmouthshire Regiment</td>
<td>773 (62.9)</td>
<td>437 (35.6)</td>
<td>12 (1.0)</td>
<td>7 (0.6)</td>
<td>1229 (100.1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 Soldiers born in Welsh counties (percentages) Welsh regiments, extract\textsuperscript{127}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Welsh County</th>
<th>Welsh Guards</th>
<th>Royal Welsh Fusiliers</th>
<th>South Wales Borderers</th>
<th>Welsh Regiment</th>
<th>Monmouthshire Regiment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anglesey</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breconshire</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caernarfonshire</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardiganshire</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carmarthenshire</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denbighshire</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>18.1</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flintshire</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glamorgan</td>
<td>46.4</td>
<td>22.1</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>62.6</td>
<td>17.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merioneth</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monmouthshire</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>43.1</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>73.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montgomeryshire</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pembrokeshire</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radnorshire</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>99.9</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100.1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{126} Table 6.6 Birthplaces by regiment, Welsh regiments, cited in Chris Williams, Taffs in the trenches: Welsh national identity and military service 1914-1918, in Wales and War, Matthew Cragoe and Chris Williams eds. (Cardiff, 2007), p140.

\textsuperscript{127} Table 6.7 Soldiers born in Welsh counties (percentages) Welsh regiments, extract, cited in Chris Williams, Taffs in the trenches: Welsh national identity and military service 1914-1918, in Wales and War, Matthew Cragoe and Chris Williams eds. (Cardiff, 2007), p141.
Appendix 3 - Abbreviations

Brig. Gen. – Brigadier General
C.O. – Commanding Officer
G.O.C. – General Officer Commanding
Maj. Gen. – Major General
N.C.O. – Non-Commissioned Officer
R.H.Q. – Regimental Headquarters
2/Lieut – Second Lieutenant
Bibliography of primary sources


Anon, ‘Children as recruiting-sergeants, utilising the services of the youngsters to obtain new men for the Welsh Guards’, Bridgeman Images, [Online]. Available at https://www.bridgemaneducation.com.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/en/asset/962590/summary?context=%7B%22route%22%3A%22assets_search%22%2C%22routeParameters%22%3A%7B%22_format%22%3A%22html%22%2C%22_locale%22%3A%22en%22%2C%22filter_text%22%3A%22children+recruiting+sergeants%22%7D%7D, Accessed 12 March 19.


Anon, ‘Where are the Welsh M.P.s’, *Western Mail*, (15 March 1900), Available at [https://hdl.handle.net/10107/4340619](https://hdl.handle.net/10107/4340619), Accessed 5 Mar 19.
Caradoc, ‘Royal Welsh Guards’, *Western Mail* (5 December 1900), Available at https://hdl.handle.net/10107/4337071, Accessed 5 March 19.


Hansard, ‘Welsh Guards’ Hansard (18 February 2015) Available at
https://parlipapers-

JMS, ‘For Honour and Justice’, Western Mail (1 Mar 1915) Available at

JMS, ‘An Honour for Wales’, Western Mail (13 Feb 1915), Available at
1 JMS, ‘Making Growth’, *Western Mail (18 Feb 1915)*, Available at


Bibliography of Secondary Sources


Davies, Russell, *People, places and passions: A Social History of Wales and the Welsh 1870-1940 Volume 1*, (Cardiff, 2015)


Ellis, L., *Welsh Guards – An Informal Account of the First Fifty Years* (Devonport, 1965)

Available at [http://hdl.handle.net/10107/1422911](http://hdl.handle.net/10107/1422911) (Accessed 12 March 2019)

Headlam, Cuthbert, *The Guards Division in the Great War*, (Uckfield, 1924)

Hughes, Colin, *Mametz* (Gerrards Cross, 1985)


Royle, Trevor, *The Kitchener Enigma* (Stroud, 2016)

Simkins, Peter, *Kitchener’s Army* (London, 1985)

Ray Westlake, *Kitchener’s Army*, (Gloucestershire, 1989)