John Henry Newman’s idea of a Catholic academy: contributions from his life and work towards a theology of education, with reference to recent documents of the Catholic Church

Thesis

How to cite:

For guidance on citations see FAQs.

© 2001 The Author
Version: Version of Record

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online’s data policy on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.
JOHN HENRY NEWMAN'S
IDEA OF A CATHOLIC ACADEMY

Contributions From His Life and Work Towards
A Theology of Education, with Reference to
Recent Documents of the Catholic Church

David Brian Warner
B.A., Education; B.A., Theology
M.A., Theology and Christian Ministry

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of
the Open University for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy:
Ph.D., Religious Studies and Theology

March 2001

Maryvale Institute
in collaboration with
Greyfriars, University of Oxford

AUTHOR NO : P9276122
DATE OF SUBMISSION : 9 MAY 2001
DATE OF AWARD : 14 MAY 2001
ABSTRACT

This thesis critically examines and synthesizes Newman’s theological views on the nature and aims of a Catholic academy, by comparing his life and work with recent documents of the Catholic Church, including *Ex Corde Ecclesiae* (1990) and *The Catholic School on the Threshold of the Third Millennium* (1997). Its primary original contribution is the systemisation of Newman’s educational ideal based on this theological focus and intertextual method.

Part one, ‘Retrieving the Sources’, employs an historico-theological ressourcement. It seeks to rediscover sources for Catholic educational renewal from Newman and the magisterium, even as these are based on a similar return to the sources of Scripture and the classic texts of Christianity. Chapter one introduces the aims, methods, sources, and working definitions. The second and third chapters analyse Newman’s specifically educational formation, writings, and praxis, in light of theological concerns.

Part two, ‘Restoring the Foundations’ begins with an examination in chapter four of the Christian humanism Newman developed through a retrieval of the Alexandrian Fathers. His contributions to the tradition included an imaginative rearticulation of the preeminence of Christ and theology in education, and of a Christian hierarchy of educational aims. Chapters five and six consider Newman’s relevance to the contemporary concerns of school identity and climate, illustrating the type of ‘theological prescriptions’ advocated by John Paul II. Three appendices provide original syntheses of background information and unpublished material.

The concluding chapter brings the most important findings into sharp relief, while suggesting areas for further study. Newman propounded his theological convictions regarding Catholic education with passionate intensity through his literary art and his positive personal influence. They have continuing relevance, despite the differences that separate his world from ours. He offers enduring principles for study, and inspiring stories for re-imagining the Church’s mission of restoring all things in Christ, through a courageous and continual renewal of Catholic schools and universities.
CONTENTS

Abstract .................................................................. ii
Abbreviations ............................................................. vii
Preface .................................................................. xii

Part One
RETRIEVING THE SOURCES

Chapter One
'RESTORING ALL THINGS IN CHRIST':
TOWARDS A NEW SYNTHESIS .............................. 2
1. Purpose, Method, and Preview ............................ 2
  1.1 The Need and Opportunity for an Original Synthesis
  1.2 Methodological Approaches
  1.3 Preview of this Work
2. Relationship to Previous Work ......................... 19
  2.1 Primary Sources: Newman
  2.2 Primary Sources: Church Documents on Education
     Table: Chart of Correspondence for Thesis Outline .... 28
  2.3 Secondary Literature
3. Towards a Theology of Catholic Education .......... 36
  3.1 Philosophy of Education
  3.2 Theology of Education
  3.3 Theology of Catholic Education

Chapter Two
NEWMAN'S EDUCATIONAL FORMATION,
WORK, AND WRITINGS: THE ANGLICAN PERIOD .......... 47
1. Introduction ..................................................... 47
2. Son and Student ............................................. 52
  2.1 The Christian Family as 'the First School'
  2.2 Student at Ealing
  2.3 Personal Influence and Conversion
  2.4 Trinity College, Oxford
3. Oriel College Fellow and Tutor ......................... 62
  3.1 Fellows and Friends
  3.2 The Influence of John Keble
  3.3 The Oriel Tutor Row
  3.4 Research Fellow and Patristic Scholar
4. Anglican Priest: Forming 'Hearts and Intellects' ...... 73
  4.1 Pastor and Preacher
  4.2 Poet and Tractarian
  4.3 Education and Religion in The Tamworth Reading Room
Chapter Three

NEWMAN'S EDUCATIONAL FORMATION, WORK, AND WRITINGS: THE CATHOLIC PERIOD .................. 85
1. Catholic Convert ...................................... 85
   1.1 'Gaudium de Veritate'
   1.2 Newman's Catholic Educational Vocation
2. Oratorian Educator .................................. 91
   2.1 Founder of the English Oratory
   2.2 'The Fertile Intuitions of Saintly Founders'
3. University Rector ................................... 98
   3.1 Newman as Rector
   3.2 Newman's University Writings
4. School Leader ........................................ 114
   4.1 Founder and Teacher
   4.2 Oratory School Source Documents

Part Two

RESTORING THE FOUNDATIONS

INTRODUCTION TO PART TWO ............................ 130

Chapter Four

THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS
OF NEWMAN'S EDUCATIONAL IDEAL ...................... 132
1. Newman the Theologian .............................. 132
   1.1 A Theologian 'Sui Generis'
   1.2 A 'Prophetic' Theologian and Educator
2. Patristic Christian Humanism and Education ......... 137
   2.1 Newman's Debt to the Fathers
   2.2 Christ the Teacher
   2.3 The Principle of Reserve in Education
3. The Rôle of Theology in Education .................. 145
   3.1 Theology and the Circle of Knowledge
   3.2 Restoring a Christian Hierarchy of Educational Aims
   3.3 'Christianity ... the Element and Principle of all Education'
4. Integral Human Formation in Christ .................. 159
   4.1 Restoring Educational Unity in Christ
   4.2 'Intellect, the Instrument of Religious Training'
   4.3 Reuniting Intellectual and Moral Virtue
Chapter Five

IDENTITY OF A CATHOLIC ACADEMY .......................................................... 170
1. Academic Identity .................................................................................. 171
   1.1 An Academic Community
   1.2 The Priority of Teaching
   1.3 Research and Service
2. Ecclesial Identity .................................................................................. 186
   2.1 'Born from the Heart of the Church'
   2.2 Essential Characteristics of a Catholic Academy
3. Fidelity to the Christian Message ......................................................... 191
   3.1 'Duties of the Church towards Knowledge'
   3.2 Bishops and Theologians
4. A Continuing Reflection in the Light of Faith ...................................... 200
   4.1 Integration of Knowledge
   4.2 Dialogue Between Faith and Reason
   4.3 Ethical and Moral Concern

Chapter Six

CLIMATE, RÔLES, AND PERSONAL INFLUENCE
IN THE EDUCATING COMMUNITY .......................................................... 212
1. 'A Common Dedication to ... the Person and Message of Christ' .......... 213
   1.1 Theological Foundations of the Community Dimension
   1.2 Imitatio Christi: Reflections of the One Teacher
2. Rôles and Relations ............................................................................. 220
   2.1 Students and Parents
   2.2 Teachers and Administrators
3. 'Icons' of Personal Influence ............................................................... 230
   3.1 The Influence of Athanasius and Philip Neri
   3.2 Cor ad Cor Loquitur
4. Newman's Pedagogy of Personal Influence .......................................... 235
   4.1 Personal Influence in Newman's Writings
   4.2 Personal Influence in Newman's Praxis
Chapter Seven

CONCLUSION: RETRIEVAL AND RENEWAL ................ 246

1. Summary and Contributions ............................ 246
   1.1 Retrieving Newman's Educational Life and Work
   1.2 Restoring the Christological Foundations of Education
   1.3 Renewing Catholic Identity and Climate

2. Areas for Further Study ............................... 255
   2.1 Newman's Contributions to a Theology of Educational Mission
   2.2 Taxonomy of Questions for Newman's Theology of Education
   2.3 Newman's Catechetical Lecture Notes

3. Epilogue ........................................... 261

APPENDICES

Appendix One

SYNOPSIS OF THE LIFE, WORK
AND TIMES OF JOHN HENRY NEWMAN .................... 264

Appendix Two

SUMMARY TABLE OF NEWMAN'S LETTERS AND DIARIES ..... 295

Appendix Three

PUBLISHING HISTORY OF THE IDEA OF A UNIVERSITY ...... 297
3.1. Publishing History of The Idea of a University, Part 1 ...... 298
3.2. Publishing History of The Idea of a University, Part 2 ...... 300

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

Outline of Select Bibliography .......................... 303

1. PRIMARY SOURCES ........................................ 304

2. SECONDARY SOURCES ON NEWMAN ........................ 311

3. OTHER SECONDARY SOURCES .............................. 321
ABBREVIATIONS

NEWMAN'S WORKS

The abbreviations listed below for Newman's works are taken principally from the conventions used in Ian Ker's system of abbreviations in his published works, which are based, with modifications, on those used by Joseph Rickaby, S.J., and supplemented by Charles Stephen Dessain.¹ All references to these thirty-six volumes are taken from their final form as published by Longmans between 1890 and 1941, with the exception of the Oxford English Text series critical editions of Apologia pro Vita Sua, An Essay in Aid of a Grammar of Assent, and The Idea of a University, as specified below.

The 'uniform edition' titles² are distinguished in this list from the other, mostly posthumous publications, by not listing the publisher (Longmans is understood, with the above three exceptions), and by giving a special system of publication dates. Those dates in angle brackets < > indicate the years of original publication either of the whole, or of parts of the volume. Dates in round brackets () indicate the year of inclusion into the uniform


² See Bibliography introduction for a discussion of the uniform edition (UE).
edition. The final unbracketed date is, in every case, the edition (or impression) actually consulted for giving references. The bibliography contains a further discussion of Newman’s works together with more complete publishing data.


Ari. The Arians of the Fourth Century. <1833> (1873) 1890.


Call. Callista: A Tale of the Third Century. <1855> (1876) 1891.

Campaign My Campaign in Ireland, Part I: Catholic University Reports and other Papers. Edited by W. Neville Privately printed, 1896.


DA Discussions and Arguments on Various Subjects. <1836-1866> (1872) 1899.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Editor/Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LG</td>
<td>Loss and Gain: The Story of a Convert. &lt;1848&gt;</td>
<td>(1874) 1903.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mir.</td>
<td>Two Essays on Biblical and on Ecclesiastical Miracles. &lt;1826, 1842&gt;</td>
<td>(1870) 1897.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mix.</td>
<td>Discourses Addressed to Mixed Congregations. &lt;1849&gt;</td>
<td>(1871) 1897.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OS</td>
<td>Sermons Preached on Various Occasions. &lt;1857&gt;</td>
<td>(1870) 1892.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Sermons Bearing on Subjects of the Day. &lt;1843&gt; (1869) 1909.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRR</td>
<td>The Tamworth Reading Room &lt;1841&gt;. This important work by Newman on his educational ideas is highlighted in the explanatory notes with its own proper abbreviation, but citations are made to DA, where TRR was reprinted (1872) 1889.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TT</td>
<td>Tracts Theological and Ecclesiastical. &lt;1835-72&gt; (1874) 1913.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>Fifteen Sermons Preached before the University of Oxford between A.D. 1826 and 1843. &lt;1843&gt; (1872) 1909.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VV</td>
<td>Verses on Various Occasions. &lt;1818-68&gt; (1874) 1903.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHURCH DOCUMENTS**

(See the Select Bibliography for fuller publication data.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
ECE  Ex Corde Ecclesiae. 1990.


BIBLE TRANSLATIONS AND EDITIONS:

AV   Authorized Version (King James' Bible)

DR   Douay-Rheims

RSV-CE Revised Standard Version-Catholic Edition
(The RSV-CE is used for all Scripture quotations unless otherwise noted.)

OTHER ABBREVIATIONS

CUI  Catholic University of Ireland


JHN  John Henry Newman


N    Newman


UE   Uniform edition of Newman's works.

PREFACE

Motivation and Background of the Project. This study arose from two parallel interests: the theology of education and the life and thought of John Henry Newman. A concern for the renewal of Catholic education derives from having worked as a Christian educator and academic administrator for over twenty years, teaching every level from primary school to post-graduate and seminary. Since 1992 I have taught and written on the foundations of Catholic education, including courses developed for Franciscan University of Steubenville, Mary Immaculate College (Limerick, Ireland), Maryvale Institute, and the Archdiocese of Denver. Students of those courses consistently sought out illustrations and applications for the Church documents on education, giving additional impetus to this study. My interest in Newman stems from the resonance between his spiritual and intellectual journey and my own pilgrimage of faith and learning. As a former Evangelical Protestant minister and Christian school principal, I returned to the Catholic Church of my youth in 1988, there to find - like Newman - a vocation to Catholic education.

I am especially interested in the reception and application by American Catholic colleges and universities, of John Paul II's Ex Corde Ecclesiae (ECE). ¹ The Holy Father spoke of the importance of these academies three years before promulgating ECE:

¹ John Paul II, Apostolic Constitution on Catholic Universities Ex Corde Ecclesiae (1990). Hereafter cited as: ECE. Where no publishing data is given for Church documents herein, it is because they are available in approved translations world-wide. Besides being published by the Vatican and regional conferences of bishops, they are available in English from the Catholic Truth Society (London), Veritas (Dublin), and Pauline Media (Boston). See also the Vatican website, www.vatican.va, for a selection of the documents online. All references to Church documents are to paragraph or section numbers provided in the editio typica, unless otherwise indicated, to facilitate finding them in any published edition.
The United States is unique in its network of more than two hundred and thirty-five colleges and universities which identify themselves as Catholic. The number and diversity of your institutions are in fact without parallel; they exercise an influence not only within the United States but also throughout the universal Church, and they bear the responsibility for her good.

This grave responsibility which Catholic universities bear is in danger of being compromised by the very academies that should be its champions. Far from welcoming ECE with open arms, many American Catholic universities and individual academics have been holding some of its key principles and norms at arm's length. The resistance dates back symbolically to the 1967 meeting of twenty-six Catholic university leaders at Land O'Lakes, Wisconsin, and their manifesto, 'The Nature of a Contemporary Catholic University'. According to Kenneth D. Whitehead: 'This Land O'Lakes statement amounted mainly to a declaration of independence from the Church'. It comes as no surprise, therefore, that a crisis in Catholic identity is being precipitated by ECE's insistence that all Catholic teachers are to be faithful to, and all other teachers are to respect, Catholic doctrine and morals in their research and teaching. In particular, Catholic theologians, aware that they fulfill a mandate [Latin: mandatum] they received from the Church, are to be faithful to the Magisterium of the

---


3 The statement asserted a Catholic university 'must have a true autonomy and academic freedom in the face of authority of whatever kind, lay or clerical, external to the academic community itself'. Cited in Whitehead, 'The History of Ex Corde Ecclesiae', Catholic Dossier 3, no 4 (Jul-Aug 1997): 9. Whitehead's study is one of the best short introductions to the backgrounds and controversies of ECE. He demonstrates that the claim of autonomy is effectively aimed at excluding only Church control, since 'external' State regulations are not only accepted in practice, but are also used as an excuse for extremely limited roles for the Hierarchy in Catholic universities. In answer to this objection, ECE claims: 'Bishops “should be seen not as external agents but as participants in the life of the Catholic university”' (ECE 28; the internal quotation is from 'The Intimate Relationship', (op. cit.); see ECE note 27).
Monika K. Hellwig, Executive Director of the Association of Catholic Colleges and Universities (ACCU), recently wrote in reference to the U.S. Bishops' approved applications for ECE\(^3\): 'It is clear that we shall be very busy with damage control'.\(^6\) Concerning the *mandatum* required of Catholic teachers of faith and morals, she says: 'I would think the mandate is going to be an obstacle all the way. It is so contrary to the American way of doing things'.\(^7\) It is hoped that this study will make a positive contribution towards any needed 'damage control' by means of synthesising and reflecting upon the theological foundations of Catholic education summed up in the magisterial documents and forcibly articulated and modelled by Newman. Historically, Newman has had a profound influence on the foundations and ongoing inspiration of Catholic education in the States.\(^8\) I believe a

\(^4\) ECE General Norms 4.3. Note 50 of ECE makes it clear that this is an explicit application of Canon Law (CIC) 812: 'It is necessary that those who teach theological disciplines in any institute of higher studies have a mandate from the competent ecclesiastical authorities.'


\(^6\) Ibid. Part of the ACCU commitment to addressing these issues has been an ongoing series of published identity and mission statements provided by member universities and colleges, in the quarterly journal, *Current Issues in Catholic Higher Education*. These statements evince a wide range of approaches to the principles and norms of ECE.


\(^8\) For one obvious example, Newman University (founded in 1933 as Kansas Newman College) in Wichita, Kansas, is not only named after him, but points to the writings and educational example of Newman in its current literature. Their 'Mission and Vision' statement includes as one of its five main objectives: 'Develop their whole person by following Cardinal Newman who teaches that the development of the intellect and spirit along with the practical arts is intrinsic to the fulfillment of the human potential' (http://www.newman.edu/NU_MissionValue.html). Similarly, The Newman Apostolate (or 'Movement') that includes Newman Clubs and Centres on university campuses world-wide was founded in 1893 just 2 years after Newman's death, at the University of Pennsylvania. 'The name "Newman" was chosen in honor of John Henry Cardinal Newman whose deep faith and brilliance was an inspiration to Catholics throughout the world' (http://www.temple
retrieval of magisterial and Newmanian sources will promote the restoration of those foundations. Authentic Christian renewal will not be achieved through inconsistent secular appeals to 'academic freedom' or 'the American way of doing things'.

Previously Published Material. Parts of this thesis have been presented as papers at conferences and published in earlier forms. Chapter one's third section, 'Towards a Theology of Catholic Education', is adapted and expanded from passages in Foundations of Catholic Religious Education. Section four of chapter four, 'Integral Human Formation in Christ', was presented to the Foundations of Education Symposium at Washburn University, and is scheduled for publication as a journal article entitled: 'John Henry Newman and the Integration of Intellectual and Moral Virtue'. In addition to these publications, portions of chapters two and six were presented as papers read at conferences: 'Newman's Power of Personal Influence', and 'Newman as Religious Educator'.

Acknowledgements. So many debts of gratitude were compiled during this eight-year project, that one almost hesitates to mention any by name, lest the many that must go unnamed be slighted. Every aspect of the work was dependant to some degree on the


11 Presented at the annual Newman School of Catholic Thought, co-sponsored by the Gerber Institute of Catholic Studies, Kansas Newman College, and the Newman Center of Wichita State University, Kansas, November 1997.

generosity and good will of others. All of the institutes and individuals who were of assistance will long be remembered by one who knows he stood on their shoulders.

A curious twist of history has made Newman's dream of establishing a theological college at Maryvale\textsuperscript{13} a modern reality with the founding and expansion in recent years of Maryvale Institute, the 'sponsoring establishment' for this research degree programme. Maryvale is dedicated to Newman's legacy and his goal of educating clerics and the laity. Many thanks are due to all of the excellent faculty and staff of Maryvale, including: Dr. Petroc Willey, Rev. Dr. John Redford, Ruth Harding, and Sister Philomena Walsh. Without the steadfast support of the former Director, Rt. Rev. Msgr. Canon J. Daniel McHugh, it is not too much to say that this project may never have come to fruition.

On my first visit to England in 1993 I found myself 'a stranger in a strange land'. I have since found a second home in Great Britain, and in Oxford in particular. 'The City of Dreaming Spires' witnessed the formation and emergence not only of Newman and the Oxford Movement, but of other great men and women that have long filled my imagination, such as: J. R. R. Tolkien, C. S. Lewis, D. L. Sayers, John Wesley, and the Franciscan 'Greyfriars' who helped propel the University of Oxford onto the world stage during its early centuries. The present-day university hall of Greyfriars was the 'collaborating establishment' for the programme, providing a Franciscan and Oxonian context for the required residential study. Many friends were made there over the years among the Capuchin friars, college faculty, visiting scholars, and students. I wish to especially thank Rev. Dr. Thomas Weinandy, Warden (who made this collaboration possible), Fr. Paschal Burlinson and Fr. Raymund Hewlett, Guardians, and Fr. Steven Innes and Dr. Elizabeth Lowry, Senior Tutors.

\textsuperscript{13}See chapter 3.1, below.
The International Centre of Newman Friends in Littlemore (Oxford), and in Rome were also of enormous help. The consecrated sisters from Gemeinschaft 'Das Werk' who run these centres were my 'guardian angels', joyfully supplying hospitality, library access, photocopying, and intercessory support. I offer in particular my sincere personal thanks to Sister Brigitte Hoegemann, Ph.D., of the Oxford centre, for her sympathetic ear, informed counsel, and contagious enthusiasm for Newman studies. Similarly, the radiant Benedictine Nuns of the Abbey of St. Walburga in Virginia Dale, Colorado, hosted me in June 2000 for a fruitful time of retreat and writing.

My doctoral supervisors provided an effective apprenticeship in post-graduate research through their personal influence, advice, and guidance. At times of distraction and discouragement, the director of studies, Professor Emeritus V. Alan McClelland, was there to refocus and encourage me. Formerly of the University of Hull, and now Dean of Graduate Research for Maryvale, McClelland is a true Christian gentleman and scholar. Dr. Sheridan Gilley of the University of Durham has been a gracious host and a trusted second supervisor. His penetrating questions and balanced views on Newman were invaluable to this study.

I owe a great debt to the Rev. Dr. Ian Ker for his many original studies on Newman's life and thought, for his edited works from the Newman corpus, and for his time and advice as the project took shape. Michael J. Miller provided copy editing for most of the text, together with his constructive comments. Many other individual scholars and educators deserve a word of thanks for their questions and suggestions, among whom I should like to name: Dr. David Blake, Stratford Caldecott, Dr. Gregory Yuri Glazov, Rev. Dr. John T. Ford, C.S.C., Dr. John Hittinger, Brian P. Johnston, Patrick McManus, Cormac O'Duffy, Rev. Dr. James Pereiro, Dr. Paul Shrimpton, Dr. Mary Katherine Tillman, Dr. David Whalen, and Dr. Robert E. Williams.
The Oratory School founded by Newman (now located in Woodcote) welcomed me several times in the persons of Dr. Andrew and Dora Nash, school masters; Anthony J. Tinkel, archivist; and Msgr. V.F.J. Morgan, C.B.E, former school chaplain. They freely offered resources and insights relevant to the School’s history and legacy as an illustration of Newman’s idea of a Catholic academy, and provided opportunities to both interview and address their students. Mr. Tinkel read through and commented on early drafts of texts concerning the Oratory School. Fr. Gregory Winterton and Mr. Gerard Tracey (archivist) of the Birmingham Oratory offered kind and expert assistance at several points in the investigation, including access to and interpretation of unpublished archival documents.

While teaching for Franciscan University’s Austrian programme, I received welcomed encouragement and counsel from many colleagues, including: Drs. Michael Healy, John Crosby, Alan Schreck, James Fougerousse and Damian Fedoryka; the Rev. Drs. Giles Dimock, O.P. and Augustine Donegan, T.O.R.; and Prof. Elsie Luke. The example of Rev. Michael Scanlan, T.O.R. (President and now Chancellor) was a constant source of inspiration. He has led the renewal of Franciscan University since the mid-1970’s based on the proposition that Jesus Christ is the Way, the Truth, and Life, while drawing on sources such as the Franciscan tradition, Cardinal Newman, lay movements, and Ex Corde Ecclesiae.

I was generously supported personally and financially in this project by the Archdiocese of Denver while serving as Director of Catholic Adult Education (1995-99), especially by Archbishop (now Cardinal) J. Francis Stafford, Archbishop Charles J. Chaput, O.F.M. Cap., and Rev. Msgr. Samuel J. Aquila. I had the pleasure of directing the Vehr Theological Library’s staff during those years, and am grateful to Sylvia Rael, Dr. Michael Woodward, and Sharon Figlino for their help, encouragement, and liberal book-loan

allowance. Dr. Paul Young and Damon Martinez of Community Bible Study International followed the pattern of employers providing general support and a flexible work schedule, during my tenure with them as a Catholic theological consultant, 1999-2000.

My family and I were the recipients of generous practical, financial, and moral support from many friends and family members. We wish to especially thank: Jim and Meg Beckman, Jim and Kathy Cutler, Dean and Chris DeBaun, Brian and Diane Kerby, Mary Kay Lacke, Anthony and Agnes Lilles, Tom & Rosemary McCabe, Joe and Ana McGurn, Michael and Rebecca Miller, Brendan and Ellen Moran, Thomas and Joan O'Brien, Russ and Jeannine Overton, Richard and Jeannie Rencher, John and Carol Saeman, Guy and Joy Simoes, Chris and Karen Stanton, Doug and Pat Vlcheck, Annice Diane Warner, and Kevin and Cathy Warner.

My wife, Patrice, and our five children, Christopher, Rebecca, Bethany, Ben-David, and Elliott, have graciously endured long and difficult years of part-time doctoral studies, including my lengthy absences while in England. May they be rewarded abundantly for their multiple sacrifices, Christian commitments, and unconditional love. I dedicate this work to Patrice.
Part One

RETRIEVING THE SOURCES
To fulfill the mandate she has received from her divine founder of proclaiming the
mystery of salvation to all men and of restoring all things in Christ, Holy Mother
Church must be concerned with the whole of man's life, even the secular part of it
insofar as it has a bearing on his heavenly calling. . . . Hence this sacred synod
declares certain fundamental principles of Christian education especially in schools.

Second Vatican Council¹

Here, then, I conceive, is the object of the Holy See and the Catholic Church in
setting up Universities: it is to reunite things which were in the beginning joined
together by God, and have been put asunder by man. . . . I wish the same spots and
the same individuals to be at once oracles of philosophy and shrines of devotion....
I want the same roof to contain both the intellectual and the moral discipline.

— John Henry Newman²

1. Purpose, Method, and Preview

The aim of this project is to answer the question, 'What are some of the more relevant
ccontributions from Newman's life and work towards a contemporary theology of Catholic
education?' It attempts to build a synthesis between Newman and recent Church documents
calling for 'restoring all things in Christ' in the context of a 'courageous'³ and 'continuous

¹ Second Vatican Council, Declaration on Christian Education Gravissimum Educationis
(1965), Introduction; emphasis added. Hereafter cited as: GE. Although there is no cross reference
in the text, 'restoring all things in Christ' is a clear allusion to Pope Pius X's motto, 'Instaurare [to
restore, renew, sum up] omnia in Christo', which is the Vulgate reading of Eph. 1:10. His pontificate
was dedicated 'to restore all things in Christ, in order that Christ may be all in all' (see New Catholic
Encyclopedia, s.v. Pius X).

² 'Intellect, the Instrument of Religious Training' (OS 12, 13).

³ Congregation for Catholic Education, The Catholic School on the Threshold of the Third
Millennium (1997), no. 3. Hereafter cited as: CSTTM.
renewal\textsuperscript{14} of Catholic education. Three particular areas of enquiry narrow the focus of the study to questions surrounding the theological foundations, Catholic identity, and Christian climate of Catholic academies.\textsuperscript{5} Examples of both convergent and divergent emphases and frames of reference between Newman and the documents are considered.

1.1 The Need and Opportunity for an Original Synthesis

Although there is a large body of secondary literature on Newman and education, no major project to date has systematised his educational ideals with a decidedly theological focus, making explicit comparisons to recent Catholic teaching on education. Such is the primary original contribution of the present study. Newman's educational theology is drawn out and synthesized from the wide spectrum of his enormous – albeit unsystematic – literary output and life-long educational praxis. The project takes on a particular shape and relevance by placing Newman in dialogue with Ex Corde Ecclesiae (1990) and the Congregation for Catholic Education's The Catholic School on the Threshold of the Third Millennium (1997).

There are several justifications for this study's method of cross-century synthesis at the service of Catholic educational renewal. The first reason is that John Paul II has already identified Newman 'as a promoter of authentic renewal in the Catholic Church'.\textsuperscript{6} This study

\textsuperscript{4} ECE 7. See also no. 11 and the conclusion for ECE's call to renewal.

\textsuperscript{5} The words, 'academy' and 'academies', will serve as inclusive terms to refer in this work to the whole range of schools, colleges, universities, and other learning institutions that the Church documents themselves have in mind. For example, the following 3 documents address in one essay, a theology of education that is common to Catholic primary, secondary, and tertiary academies: GE; the National Conference of Catholic Bishops' corresponding document, To Teach as Jesus Did: A Pastoral Message on Catholic Education (Washington D.C.: USCC, 1972); and Principles, Practices, and Concerns: A Statement from the Bishops of England and Wales (Catholic Education Service, 1996).

therefore begins with the assumption that Newman is relevant to Catholic renewal generally, rather than seeking to prove as much. Second, Newman is the only theologian or educator — aside from magisterial sources — cited by the Pope as an authority on the nature of a Catholic university in ECE. There are three quotations, taken from all three sections of Newman’s seminal educational work, *The Idea of a University*. Each of these quotations will be examined as they present themselves topically in the argument. A third justification for this intertextual study derives from the continuous search by modern Christian educators for meaningful links to the past, and reasons for hope in the future. They seek creative applications from the principles of their two-thousand-year religious heritage to the difficult educational questions of our own day. In this quest, Newman’s thought and example already serves as a point of reference for many Catholic educators. For example, The Cardinal Newman Society for the Preservation of Catholic Higher Education (CNS), was founded in

---

7 The citations of Newman’s work are found in footnote numbers 7, 19, and 23 of ECE. Newman appears in 3 of the 54 total notes, most of which refer to papal writings, the Bible, Vatican II documents, and the *Code of Canon Law* (1983). The only theologians cited besides Newman are Ss. Augustine of Hippo, Anselm, and Thomas Aquinas, but these quotations are not addressing the specific nature of a Catholic academy. They are general reflections on man’s search for truth and understanding in the light of faith (see ECE notes 2 and 9). There is only one cross-reference to a non-ecclesial or theological source: *The Magna Carta of the European Universities*, Bologna, Italy, 18 September 1988; see ECE note 14.

8 The quotations in ECE come from each of the three parts of the *Idea*: the preface, the *Discourses*, and the *Lectures and Essays*.

9 All references to this work are to the Oxford English Texts series critical edition: *The Idea of a University Defined and Illustrated*, ed. I. T. Ker (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1976), which provides the original pagination of the Longman’s uniform edition in the margins. Hereafter cited as *Idea*. Other editions of the *Idea* will be identified by either ‘UE’ (Longman’s uniform edition) or by the editors’ names and publication data. See the bibliography and abbreviations sections of this thesis for an explanation of the publishing history of Newman’s works, and a listing of the standard abbreviations used.

10 See the bibliography sections, ‘Foundations of Christian Education’ and ‘Catholic Church Documents on Theology and Education’, for an indication of the interest and scope of this topic.
response to the 1990 publishing of ECE. Their origin and purpose is explained on the contents page of CNS’s newsletter, The Turnaround:

[CNS] was founded in 1993 to advocate the educational ideal espoused by John Henry Cardinal Newman and developed by John Paul II in his Apostolic Constitution, Ex corde Ecclesiae. The society engages in a variety of activities to help strengthen the religious identity and academic quality of Catholic colleges and universities.11

Newman’s continuing relevance to Catholic education is not, however, immediately accessible. He never directly addressed what could be called his ‘theology of education’12 in any one systematic treatise. This can be explained in part by two characteristic limitations of his literary style and legacy. First, the majority of his theological writings tend to be unsystematic in their presentation. Second, most of his works were written for particular occasions. To understand these limitations is to see at once the need for this present study and the obstacles to be encountered in creating a new synthesis. Many commentators have observed that Newman was characteristically unsystematic in his theological method, even though he made important contributions to theology.13 Walgrave attributes this lack of systematic organisation in his theological essays to the fact that Newman

is far from being systematic himself; he is, primarily, a man of intuitive vision, but capable, through strict mental discipline, of analysing his intuition from various standpoints and, by a detailed elaboration of some of its aspects, of furnishing a strict, though partial and abstract, description of the reality perceived. What he invariably does is to “take a view”, but his intuition always reminds him that these abstract considerations are only of relative

11 The Turnaround (Spring 1999): 2. CNS is based in Falls Church, Virginia; their web site is: http://www.rc.net/cardinalnewman/.


13 See, e.g., Jeremy Miller, John Henry Newman on the Idea of Church (Shepherdstown, W.Va.: Patmos Press, 1987), xix, where, in discussing his project of reconstructing Newman’s ‘theology of the Church’, he notes that ‘Newman never wrote a systematically organized text on the church. He never, in fact, wrote any systematic texts; it was not his style of “doing theology.” He preferred essays . . . ’
value, "as far as it goes" ... He finds it quite impossible to think otherwise than in continual reference to the whole. 14

Henry Tristram of the Birmingham Oratory noted that Newman 'scattered his principles broadcast through his works, and passages essential for the synthetic view are to be found in the most unlikely places'. 15 Fergal McGrath indicated the path of the present study by his own work which recognized that

the full expression of Newman's views must be sought not only in the Idea of a University, but in his other writings, and in his practical exposition in Dublin of education as an art. The Idea is a masterly exposition of a fundamental truth, but it is not a compendium of educational teaching. 16

In particular, McGrath believes 'that the stress laid in the Idea on the nature and value of mental culture has to be corrected by a survey of Newman's practical approach to the vocational aspect of education. So, with regard to the intellectual and moral issues, those who know Newman only from the Idea may be misled' into an interpretation that 'his other writings and life-work put completely out of count'. 17 Accordingly, this investigation attempts to take into account the full range of the Newman corpus, with special attention being given to his theological views relevant to education, where ever they are found.

In addition to Newman's unsystematic approach, most of his writings were 'occasional' in nature, i.e., they were typically prompted by some current controversy or


16 Here McGrath supplies a note from the final Discourse of the Idea (the original 'Disc. X, p. 335') from Newman: 'The questions I have hitherto treated are but a portion of those which enter into the general subject of University Education' (McGrath, Newman's University, 291).

17 Ibid.
project, his regular preaching and teaching duties, or in defence of some misunderstood position. He explains:

I have written according to the occasion, when there was a call on me to write; seldom have I written without call, but I have ever felt it to be an unpleasant necessity, and I have envied those who have been able to take and prosecute one line of research, one study, one science . . . 18

The great exception to this rule is his Grammar of Assent (1870), a work over which he laboured for many years. One could thus reasonably assume that Newman might have welcomed the opportunity to develop a fuller treatment of his theological prescriptions for education, but that the occasion never presented itself – the founding of the Catholic University in Dublin and the writing of The Idea of a University not excepted. On the occasion of the bicentenary of Newman’s birth,19 this study takes the opportunity to present an original synthesis of his educational theology, shaped by the concerns of Catholic Church documents issued ‘On the Threshold of the Third Millennium’.20

1.2 Methodological Approaches

A Model of Polarity. Because Newman was a man of broad horizons and universal interests, there is no small obstacle to overcome in harmonizing his many statements on education, some of which at times appear contradictory. His characteristic method of counterposing seemingly conflicting views in his theological inquiries opens the door to misunderstanding and quoting out of context. For example, the writer who is so well known for championing

---

18 Add. 186, 189-90.

19 Newman was born February 21, 1801, in London.

20 The reference is to John Paul II’s Apostolic Letter, On the Threshold of the Third Millennium (1994), which contained his five-year plan in preparation for the ‘Great Jubilee’ of A.D. 2000, and the 3rd Millennium. The spirit of this document lies behind both ECE and CSTTM; all three were written in the 1990’s, with a view towards preparing for a time of renewal in the Church.
liberal education, the study of ancient pagan literature, and 'knowledge for its own sake' in

The Idea of a University,\(^{21}\) is the same man who claimed elsewhere that

Christianity, and nothing short of it, must be made the element and principle
of all education. Where it has been laid as the first stone, and acknowledged
as the governing spirit, it will take up into itself, assimilate, and give a
character to literature and science. Where Revealed Truth has given the aim
and direction to Knowledge, Knowledge of all kinds will minister to Revealed

Truth.\(^{22}\)

One of the keys to reading Newman is understanding his propensity to argue seemingly
opposing positions with equal strength, and to hold them in tension, as the example above
indicates.\(^{23}\) Terrence Merrigan proposes a 'model of polarity' as a 'hermeneutic tool' for
interpreting the apparent inconsistencies in Newman's life and teachings.\(^{24}\) His thesis is that
to understand Newman, one must first see him as one who sought to bring comprehensibility
to the Christian vision, not by calculated dissection and analysis, not by neat syllogisms and

\[^{21}\text{Cf. Discourse Five of the Idea, 'Knowledge its Own End'.}\]

\[^{22}\text{The Tamworth Reading Room', in Discussions and Arguments on Various Occasions, 274 (hereafter cited as DA). Newman's own spelling and capitalization are retained in all quotations.}\]

\[^{23}\text{A related tendency in Newman's writings is his use of hyperbole. Ker explains how this can be 'unpalatable in a culture which tends to laud realism and deprecate idealism. The hyperbolism, therefore, which characterizes the Idea of a University is calculated to confuse and mislead the contemporary reader who take literally what Newman and the readers of his time would have seen as a kind of exaggerated "approximation" to the truth.' For examples of his use of hyperbole, see Ian Ker, The Achievement of John Henry Newman (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1990), 3-4; hereafter cited as Ker, Achievement).}\]

\[^{24}\text{Terrence Merrigan, Clear Heads and Holy Hearts: The Religious and Theological Ideal of John Henry Newman, with a foreword by Ian Ker, Louvain Theological and Pastoral Monographs, no. 7 (Louvain: Peeters Press, 1991), 23-29. He attributes the 'model of polarity' to his mentor, Jan Walgrave, who developed it 'out of the thought of Coleridge and German Romanticism' (257). Merrigan uses this model to shed light on Newman's treatment of faith and reason, and the distinctions and interplay of real and notional assent.}\]
monolithic mental constructs, but rather by means of demonstrating the mutual relations of all things in view of the whole. In Merrigan's words:

The synthesis to which Newman aspired can best be described as "polar", since it involves the bringing together of seemingly opposite, and certainly conflicting, impulses and elements. Polar unity is "unity-in-tension", dynamic unity that is always in danger of disintegrating, but characterized, where it is achieved, by the fruitful interaction of its component parts.

Walgrave and Merrigan's model of polarity is implicitly adopted in these pages as a methodological tool, because it addresses in a straightforward manner the otherwise puzzling project of making sense of Newman. The working assumption is here posited that Newman is essentially consistent albeit complex in his views, especially as he brought his theological study and practical experience to bear on educational issues in his mature Catholic years. This investigation has not therefore set out to look primarily for contradictions, but rather for complementarity; for unity in tension.

*Intertextual Studies.* A second methodological approach adopted for this investigation is that of 'intertextual studies', defined as a 'discursive and rational dialogue between literary texts'. This method arose in the field of literary criticism and is being applied to theological sources as well. A recent example is found in Warren Carter's 'Evoking Isaiah: Matthaean Soteriology and an Intertextual Reading of Isaiah 7-9 and Matthew 1:23

---

25 Newman defined philosophy, e.g., as 'the power of referring every thing to its place in the universal system,—of understanding the various aspects of each of its parts,—of comprehending the exact value of each,—of tracing each backwards to its beginning, and forward to its end,—of anticipating the separate tendencies of each, and their respective checks or counteractions ...' (OS 291).


Carter’s thesis is that the explicit short quotations from Isaiah found in Matthew evoke a larger Isaian tradition for the intended audience. The resulting ‘intertext’ of Isaiah-Matthew is larger than the sum of its parts, containing both explicit and implicit levels of understanding and application. His study introduces for us the notion of ‘intertextuality’ as ‘the connections between . . . texts which an audience creates’.

Francis Fennell employed the approach of intertextual studies in an article where Newman’s thought is compared and contrasted with three modern philosophers of higher education, in a dialogic manner; enabling us to examine the referential relationships that can exist between texts from different places and times. The assumption is that some meaning arises for example, out of a reader’s realization that Newman stands in the background to Bloom, Cheney, and Giamatti, and additional meanings arise out of the realization that these references are reversible.

The presence of three explicit quotations from Newman in John Paul II’s *Ex Corde Ecclesiae* makes it clear that Newman does indeed stand rather prominently in the background of Church teachings on education. Hence, new and deeper meanings may legitimately suggest themselves to our understanding of these texts. This approach is in keeping with Carter’s observation that the ‘larger . . . tradition that a citation evokes counters the pervasive atomistic treatment of the citations’. The assumption is that John Paul II is at least subconsciously seeking to evoke a larger ‘Newmanian’ tradition in his discussion of Catholic education.

---

28 In *Journal of Biblical Literature* 119, no. 3 (Fall 2000): 503-520.

29 Ibid., 507. Carter uses the term thus: ‘And what contribution does this intertext [i.e., Isaiah 7-9-Matt. 1 & 4] make to the presentation of Jesus’ mission and ministry in the Gospel?’

30 Ibid.


higher education, by means of his particular citations from the Idea as the only such authority cited.

It is justifiable to recognize Newman's influence in ECE, precisely because of the explicit quotation. But what of comparisons to be drawn where such references are lacking? For this challenge, the intertextual approach of John T. Ford in his paper, 'Newman and Vatican II on Education' is employed. He compares Newman's educational views with Gravissimum Educationis, where there is no explicit reference to Newman. His method is to listen for implicit citations, to search for parallels between Newman's thought and the conciliar declaration. Comparatively, one is in the position of listening to the Symphonie Fantastique of Berlioz and suddenly hearing the Dies irae: those familiar with the Dies irae will immediately recognize its presence in the symphony; those who have never heard the Dies irae will need to be alerted to its presence. . . . [Similarly], those familiar with Newman will find resonances of Newman's thought and educational experience in the text of the Declaration on Christian Education; to others, it will need to be pointed out. . . . Such an undertaking will reveal some striking parallels.

To highlight some of the more obvious examples of intertextuality discovered, two or more complementary epigraphs are provided at the beginning of chapters one through six: one from a Church document, representing the universal view, and one from Newman, as a particular illustration or amplification of it. Having thus been 'alerted' by this juxtaposition of texts to Newman's 'presence' within the mind of the Church, we will more readily enter into the 'dialogue between texts' on that chapter's theme.

Dialectic and Divergence. This dialogue is not always harmonious. There is an essential difference in outlook and approach between the writings of Newman in the


34 Ibid., 1, 2.
Restoring All Things in Christ' 12

nineteenth-century, and the modern Church documents cited. John Paul, for example, ‘hits the ground running’ in his theological analysis of, and prescriptions for a Catholic university in ECE. His concern is both magisterial and juridical, as he presents a synthesis of the Church’s theological vision of, and canonical norms for promoting integral human formation in Christ. By way of contrast, Newman had a specific, narrow purpose in the Discourses. He proceeded slowly, heaping illustration upon illustration, and in the process, he confused both his contemporaries and future readers with his ‘model of polarity’ approach. When the usual harmony between Newman and Church teachings is replaced by the sound of dissonance, a dialectic will be entered into to attempt a resolution. For example, Newman’s nuanced, time-conditioned presentation in the 1852 Discourses seems to clash at points with the magisterium’s holistic and universal writings from the 1990’s. On closer inspection, some of these can be understood to be in fact complementary, and therefore, harmonious. Where no synthesis presents itself, the differences are noted as divergent.

Extensive Quotation. The purpose of this investigation points to the obvious need for extensive quotation from Newman’s own writings. Following the lead of scholars like Selby – who recognize that ‘Newman lends himself to quotation . . . [because] he is exceptionally explicit’35 – the study makes frequent, and at times lengthy recourse to Newman’s writings. Soon after the investigation was under way, it became apparent that Newman’s contributions to educational theology would be found especially in his artful use of the English language to articulate and inspire a Christian vision of education. An early confirmation of this insight came from Principal Shairp, who highlighted Newman’s literary

power in an essay printed in *Studies in Poetry.* In his reminiscences of Newman at Oxford, Shairp was struck at how, in Newman's preaching, 'it]he local, the temporary, and the modern were ennobled by the presence of the catholic truth belonging to all ages that pervaded the whole.' He believed Newman's chief contribution to forming Christian minds and hearts lay in his expression of historic Christian truth with poetic power:

His power showed itself chiefly in the new and unlooked-for way in which he touched into life old truths, moral or spiritual, which all Christians acknowledge, but most have ceased to feel ... As he spoke, how the old truth became new! ... To call these sermons eloquent would be no word for them; high poems they rather were, as of an inspired singer, or the outpourings of a prophet, rapt yet self-possessed.

Shairp's assessment of Newman's literary power is a common impression found in the literature. Newman's reputation gave rise to a working hypothesis, which was verified as the general method of extensive quotation was employed. His poetic power and literary force is used to illustrate the themes supplied by a matrix of educational ideals synthesised from the Church documents. In this respect, part two of the thesis is a commentary on recent Church teachings on the Catholic educational ideal, as 'defined and illustrated' by the life and works of John Henry Newman.

An Examination of Newman's Educational Praxis. In addition to his writings, a study is made of Newman's actual praxis as a Christian educator, to determine the extent to which it illustrated, validated, or apparently contradicted the suggested 'intertext' synthesised from

---

36 This was excerpted in the privately printed *My Campaign in Ireland* (1896) as an appendix, 'Cardinal Newman's Preaching and Influence in Oxford'.

37 Cited in *Campaign*, in the final appendix, with separate pagination, pp. 11-12.


39 ' ... defined and illustrated ...': a reference to the full title of Newman's *The Idea of a University Defined and Illustrated: I. In Nine Discourses*, etc.
Newmanian and magisterial sources. His successes and failures are also explored for their possible applications to contemporary challenges in education. Chapters two and three therefore introduce his educational writings and praxis simultaneously, as the 'raw material' to be systematised. The emphasis is on what Newman finally came to hold as a Catholic, although the main lines of his theology of education remain remarkably constant from his Oriel tutor days until his death. This fact allows for frequent reference to sources from his Anglican years.

1.3 Preview of this Work

The two-part division of this study groups seven chapters into the two overarching themes of 'retrieving the sources' and 'restoring the foundations'. Both parts aim at reconstructing Newman's theology of education, but from different perspectives and with different methods. Chapters two and three are framed by a chronological, biographical, and literary analysis. Newman's specifically educational life and work is examined, with occasional reference to theological principles in the Church documents. Part two is a theological and thematic synthesis. The task of synthesis is wedded to the question of continuing relevance by presenting Newman's educational work and views within a framework adapted from the categories and concerns found in recent Church documents on Catholic education.

The title of part one, 'Retrieving the Sources', indicates the early chapters' project of historico-theological ressourcement. This retrieval takes its inspiration from the contemporary 'ressourcement movement' in Catholic theology which seeks 'a rediscovery of the riches of the whole of the Church's two-thousand-year tradition'. David Schindler identifies this

movement as one which itself draws ‘inspiration from earlier theologians and philosophers such as Möhler, [John Henry Cardinal] Newman, Gardeil, Rousselot, and Blondel’. He claims it ‘bore great fruit in the documents of the Second Vatican Council and has deeply influenced the work of Pope John Paul II and Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger’. The present study seeks to rediscover for our own times, theological prescriptions for education to be found in Newman and the conciliar and post-conciliar documents of the Catholic Church, even as these are themselves largely based on a similar ‘return to the sources’ of Sacred Scripture and the ‘classic texts’ (patristic-mediaeval) of ‘Christianity in its most vital moments’. Chapter one introduces the aims, methods, sources, and working definitions for the intertextual study. It includes a fresh approach to defining ‘theology of Catholic education’. The second and third chapters provide an analysis of the life and work of Newman as a Christian educator, focussing on his own educational formation and praxis. His major relevant writings are introduced in chronological order, with special attention given to theological and educational themes. Examples from his life and work are used to demonstrate educational principles set forth in magisterial documents.

41 Ibid., [ii]. Schindler further identifies some of the connecting links who are relevant to this study's interest in the influence of Newman on John Paul II. In addition to the work of men like ‘... Romano Guardini and Karl Adam’, the movement blossomed among those of ‘the French revival [which] included many of the greatest names in twentieth-century Catholic thought: Henri de Lubac, Jean Daniélou, Yves Congar, Marie-Dominique Chenu, Louis Bouyer, and, in association, Hans Urs von Balthasar’ ([ii]). A particular organ of this movement is: Communio: International Catholic Review, a federation of journals in thirteen countries founded in Europe in 1972 by Balthasar, Daniélou, de Lubac, Ratzinger, and others.

42 Ibid., [i, ii]. Newman’s ‘retrieval’ of the Church Fathers, treated in chapters two and four, below, is one instance of the ressourcement approach adopted herein. The Ressourcement Series’ subtitle, Retrieval and Renewal in Catholic Thought, also inspired the title for chapter 7 of the present thesis: ‘Conclusion: Retrieval and Renewal’. The general perspective of this research project runs parallel to the ‘aim and spirit’ of the Ressourcement Series, which includes ‘works in theology, philosophy, history, literature, and the arts [that] give renewed expression to an authentic* Catholic sensibility’ ([ii]). *See note 57, below.

43 The focus in chapter 1 is on the relevant Church documents. Introductions to Newman’s primary literature on education are provided in chapters 2 and 3.
In part two, 'Restoring the Foundations', Newman's writings and life experiences are drawn upon to systematise his theological views on education within the framework of authentic Catholic teaching.\footnote{The term 'authentic' is itself used by the Church to designate the 'official', universal teaching of the ordinary and extraordinary magisterium of the Catholic Church in her duly approved and promulgated documents, as opposed to particular opinions that may be held by one who makes claim to the Catholic tradition.} Chapter four examines the 'Theological Foundations of Newman's Educational Ideal'. His importance and relevance as a modern Catholic theologian is demonstrated, followed by a brief consideration of his theological formation and method, especially as influenced by his own retrieval and application of the Alexandrian Fathers. Newman's idea for the rôle of theology in education is then compared with ECE, together with the correspondence between his notion of uniting intellectual and moral virtue with the Church documents' ideal of 'integral human formation'.

Following the lead of numerous Church documents, as well as the concern of educators today, chapters five and six consider two words that have become central to educational philosophy and practice: identity and climate. Newman's contributions highlight the religious dimension of these contemporary concerns, while providing the type of 'theological prescriptions' for educational renewal advocated by John Paul II, but disparaged by some Christian academics. One of the contributions of chapter five is its treatment of academic identity. It offers a new way of looking at Newman's place for research and service in a Catholic university, by comparing his writings and policies at Catholic University of Ireland with Ex Corde Ecclesiae. The ensuing study of ecclesial identity offers perspectives from Newman's life and work on controversial contemporary issues such as institutional and individual fidelity to Church teaching, and the complementary rôles of bishops and theologians.
Chapter six, ‘Climate, Roles, and Personal Influence in the Educating Community’, studies one of the ‘essential characteristics’ of a Catholic academy according to ECE: ‘the Christian inspiration of the university community’. It explores Catholic theological foundations common to Newman and the documents which inform and animate the interpersonal, methodological, and administrative aspects of the school. It considers Newman’s theological understanding of the contemporary concern for establishing and maintaining a positive Christian climate (or ‘spirit’, ‘atmosphere’, or ‘ethos’) in a school or university, through the complementary roles of the students, parents, teachers, and all who make up the educating community. The chapter ends with an examination of his personalist approach to human relationships and teaching as a model of the art of Christian pedagogy, in imitation of Christ. The concluding chapter brings the most important findings of the study into sharp relief. It highlights the most important convergences discovered between the educational theology of Newman and the Church documents, and proposes areas for further study.

Appendix one, ‘A Synopsis of the Life, Work, and Times of John Henry Newman’, provides a comprehensive overview of the historical, educational, literary, and religious context in which Newman forged his educational life work. A second appendix provides a convenient tabulation of the Letters and Diaries’ volume numbers and titles, the time frame covered by each, and the editorship and publishing data. Such a compilation apparently has been unavailable in print before this time. Appendix three charts in parallel columns the complex publishing history of the educational discourses and essays collected and edited by Newman in The Idea of a University.

45 ECE 13.
A final word on the scope of this project: it is not primarily an historical investigation into the many sources and influences behind Newman's thought. To attempt such a spiritual and intellectual genealogy would be beyond the effective range of the project. The fundamental elements of Newman's theology of education are based on his affirmation of and devotion to the ancient creeds, which guided his assimilation and adaptation of the classical, patristic, medieval, and Oxbridge ideals of Christian liberal education. Newman held in common with many of his contemporaries that which David Newsome described as 'the ideal of godliness and good learning'. This was a 'manner of thinking ... natural to a large body of early Victorians who had been brought up in the atmosphere of pious homes and who had shared common experiences and enthusiasms at school and at the university'. Their 'unmistakable mintmark' was 'a combination of intellectual toughnes, moral earnestness and deep spiritual conviction'. Newman's contributions to a theology of education will therefore be discovered not so much by looking for major educational discontinuities and innovations, as by assessing his effectiveness in communicating and applying the theological and educational traditions he received. Rather than trying to conclusively prove the influence, say, of any number of Church Fathers, scholastic pedagogues, Anglican divines, and Victorian educationists, this study will concentrate on those positions that he actually held and taught, to discover his own system. Where appropriate, a critique of Newman's positions as they

---

46 There are two notable exceptions to this general rule: (1) the treatment in chapters 2, 3, and 6 of the personal influence of key individuals in Newman's life in so far as it shaped his educational method, and (2) the influence of patristic humanism on Newman's theological and educational vision and method, considered in chapter 4.

47 The phrase, 'godliness and good learning', is found in the Collect of Thanksgiving for Winchester College's founder, William of Wykeham, and is cited in Newsome's important study of the Victorian Christian educational ideal by the same title: Godliness and Good Learning: Four Studies on a Victorian Ideal (London: John Murray, 1961), 2-3.

48 Ibid., 25.
were situated within his nineteenth-century \textit{milieu} will be suggested; but a separate, focussed research project could more appropriately investigate the question of influence. Reference to the same in this study will be confined primarily to chapters two and three, and limited to the extent necessary for carrying forward the synthetic outline of his educational theology.

2. Relationship to Previous Work

2.1 Primary Sources: Newman

Most discussions of Newman’s educational views inevitably begin with reference to \textit{The Idea of a University}. This seminal work does not, however, offer of itself anything approaching a fully developed theology of education. The collection of lectures and essays first published together in 1873,\footnote{Written, delivered, edited, collected, and revised between 1852-1873. Minor revisions continued until just a year before his death in 1890. See chapter 3.3.2 and appendix 3 for a further discussion on the writing, content, and publishing history of the collection.} brilliant as it was in its defence of a liberal arts education, was quite limited in its scope. First, it took as its primary subject, an exploration into the essence of a university liberal arts education in the abstract, leaving aside many other concerns, levels, and forms of education. Secondly, the Discourses that constitute part one of the \textit{Idea} were shaped by the immediate questions related to establishing the new Catholic University of Ireland in the face of conflicting visions and political manoeuvring from both the new Queen’s Colleges, which excluded religious studies, and an Irish hierarchy lacking agreement as to the best purposes and methods for the proposed university. Thirdly, it simply was not his intention to write a sustained, orderly treatise of how Catholic theology directs education in both the abstract and the concrete. One must therefore look behind and beyond the \textit{Idea} in order to build a synthesis at once \textit{more broad} (in the sense of treating both university and pre-
university education) and more focussed (by looking for Newman's theological concerns in education).

Aside from the Idea, Newman produced a great volume of occasional writings where educational topics were taken up and discussed. The study of primary sources includes not only Newman's professedly 'educational' works per se, but also other relevant passages from his pastoral sermons, theological and philosophical treatises, historical studies, novels, poetry, polemical essays, devotional literature, and his letters and diaries. From these works a richer understanding of Newman's place for theology and religion in education will be discovered and illustrated. The most important of these writings will be introduced chronologically in the next two chapters, as they are placed in the context of Newman's formation and work as a Christian educator.

2.2 Primary Sources: Church Documents on Education

The project of synthesising Newman's theology of education in a manner relevant to contemporary concerns must limit the possible avenues of exploration. Thus the decision was made not to insert Newman's views into the entire range of conflicting voices in the debates about education in a Catholic context. It is beyond the scope of this study to attempt a

50 Most notably, The Tamworth Reading Room (TRR, reprinted in DA), Idea, Rise and Progress of Universities (in HS 3), Campaign, and select sermons.

51 We can sympathize with Alex Roger, Baptist minister and Director of the Values Education Project at the Northern College of Education, when he observes that, '[t]here is, of course, a considerable variety of views as to the proper goal(s) of Catholic education. . . .' He then lists a number of competing views and emphases from Catholic educators, and states: 'An outsider to this discussion ought not to be thought perverse in failing to have any clear and precise notion as to what it is that Roman Catholics conceive their education of the children to be aiming for.' His conclusion is that 'it is no longer possible, if ever it was, to argue confidently from "The Catholic view of, or aims for, education". For these are inescapably plural, without the prospect of any authoritative pronouncement being able to render them otherwise'. See Alex R. Roger, 'Catholic Education: Authority and Engagement', chapter 14 in Catholic Education: Inside-Out/Outside-In, ed. James C. Conroy (Dublin: Lindisfarne Books, 1999), 307-8, 352.
dialogue with all of the divergent views held by those that identify themselves as Catholic, let alone with those outside of that church. A more manageable project is undertaken here to categorize and re-present Newman’s views by way of comparison and contrast to a framework based on the existing body of officially promulgated Catholic teaching.

Two documents in particular will provide the primary categories for investigation: *Ex Corde Ecclesiae* and the Congregation for Catholic Education’s *The Catholic School on the Threshold of the Third Millennium*. These were chosen for several reasons. First, they are the most recent universal documents that present a theological overview of Catholic education. Secondly, both are calling for a ‘courageous’ and ‘continuous renewal’ in schools and universities. Thirdly, there are many points of contact between the two works, demonstrating the continuity of theological foundations and terminology underlying the Church’s idea of education for all ages, adapted for developmental stages and one’s particular vocation. A fourth reason for focusing on these two is that they limit the discussion to teaching institutions, that are concerned for the integral formation of the whole person, and teaching all of the subject areas from a Christian world view and inspiration. For example, CSTTM defines the identity of a ‘Catholic school as a place of integral education of the human person through a clear educational project of which Christ is the foundation’. The idea

Roger seems to miss the point that the mere existence of de facto plurality does not mean that the Catholic Church does not have a coherent theology of education. Whether or not one accepts it, it is found in the authentic teaching documents of the magisterium, where many of the alleged differences are woven together in a ‘both/and’ rather than an ‘either/or’ presentation. For example, the documents say Catholic education aims to make both good Catholics and good human beings; to instill both intellectual and moral virtue, etc. Dissenters from these teachings might be able to offer probing questions, illustration, and insight, but they can not speak authoritatively for the Catholic Church in any meaningful way that would require a radical break from its two thousand year tradition of Christian theology and education.

52 CSTTM 3 and ECE 7.

53 CSTTM 4; emphasis added.
of an academy as a place of universal learning coheres with Newman's answer to his own question, 'What is a University? For him, it is ' a school of knowledge of every kind, consisting of teachers and learners from every quarter . . . [who come together in] a place for the communication and circulation of thought, by means of personal intercourse . . .'. This means our primary concern will not be the more limited subjects of religious education and catechetics, *per se.* Neither is this a study of the many other forms of Christian and professional education available, for example, through the means of the family, distance learning, parish ministry, or Christian witness in non-Catholic schools.

A fifth reason for narrowing the field down to CSTTM and ECE is that, being of recent origin, they draw on all of the previous writings of the Catholic tradition, and provide their own ready synthesis of Catholic educational theology. This can be seen by studying the footnotes of both documents to discover their literary pedigree. Occasional references are made to Church documents from the Second Vatican Council, recent Popes, and Vatican congregations, to supplement ECE and CSTTM. A short overview of these documents will indicate the setting and basic content of each, and foster a better understanding of the place of ECE and CSTTM in the tradition.

The touchstone and wellspring of all recent Church documents on education is the Second Vatican Council's Declaration on Christian Education, *Gravissimum Educationis* (GE, 1965). The stated purpose of GE gives direction to the present study as a whole, by founding its theology of education in its call for 'restoring all things in Christ'. This short document (a mere twelve pages in booklet format) contains in seed form all of the major

54 ‘What is a University?’ in HS 3:6.


56 See the epigraph for this chapter for the full quotation, together with note 1.
educational themes which have been developed in successive Church instructions. Its importance derives primarily from the fact that it specifically called for further study of the general principles laid down, and for future documents to develop these ideas by 'a special post-conciliar commission' to be set up\(^{57}\) and by 'episcopal conferences' that would adapt 'the fundamental principles of Christian education' to all of the 'varying local situations' throughout the world.\(^{58}\) As the product of many drafts by various committees over the course of four years, it lacks the personal and immediate voice of some of the papal documents, and the more accessible language of documents from the 1980's and 90's.

*Gravissimum Educationis* actually broke little new ground that was not already treated in more detail in Pius XI's *On the Christian Education of Youth* (1929).\(^{59}\) Indeed, there was much debate at Vatican II as to whether anything new had to be said on this topic, since the 1929 document had proven itself as a very adequate and inspiring *magna carta* for Catholic education for the prior three decades. One need only look at the great mass of footnote references in Vatican II's *GE* to Pius XI's work to realize that the latter remains foundational to an understanding of the Catholic educational theology. The sections on co-education and

---

\(^{57}\) Which became the Congregation for Catholic Education.


\(^{59}\) Pope Pius XI, *On the Christian Education of Youth*, 1929. The Latin title is *Divini illius Magistri*. 
sex-education have been qualified and interpreted by later writings, but the underlying principles remain valid.\(^{60}\)

The Congregation for Catholic Education has issued a steady stream of instructions that build harmoniously one upon the other. Some of their more important works, listed in chronological order include: *The Catholic School* (1977),\(^{61}\) *Lay Catholics in Schools: Witnesses to Faith* (1982),\(^{62}\) *The Religious Dimension of Education in a Catholic School: Guidelines for Reflection and Renewal* (1988),\(^{63}\) and *The Catholic School on the Threshold of the Third Millennium* (1997; CSTTM).\(^{64}\)

The Congregation for the Clergy in Rome guides Catholic catechetical content and methods and, parallel to the Congregation for Catholic Education, has promulgated a number of documents inspired by *Gravissimum Educationis*. The General Catechetical Directory (1971),

---

\(^{60}\) See: GE 1, which called for a 'positive and prudent sexual education'. This phrase was clarified by the Congregation for Catholic Education in *Educational Guidance in Human Love: Outlines for Sex Education* (1983), and in the 1995 guidelines issued by the Pontifical Council for the Family: *The Truth and Meaning of Human Sexuality* (see Origins 25, no 32 (February 1, 1996, entire issue).

\(^{61}\) The origin and purpose of *The Catholic School* is made known in the introduction: 'The present document develops the idea of [GE], limiting itself to a deeper reflection on . . . [the] distinctive characteristics of a school that would present itself as Catholic'. Hence, like the present study, family and parish-based religious formation is not the focus. Within the twenty-eight footnotes of CSTTM there are five references to this document.

\(^{62}\) The rôle of the lay faithful has received much attention since Vatican II. This document asks Catholic lay people to affirm education as a holy calling, and to be willing to undertake the professional and spiritual formation necessary to be effective witnesses for Christ and the Catholic faith. For a Catholic understanding of the nature and mission of the laity, see also: John Paul II, *The Lay Members of Christ’s Faithful People* (Christifideles Laici): On the Vocation and the Mission of the Lay Faithful in the Church and the World (1988).

\(^{63}\) This document addresses the need for a genuine Catholic identity and ethos to be fostered in schools by reaffirming the missionary intent, fostering the personal and direct influence of godly teachers, and catholicising and integrating the curriculum. Much has been said in both state and religious schools recently of the need for establishing a positive school "climate" or "ethos." It speaks of proven concepts and methods of making Christ central to the school by showing how religion is not the exclusive concern of the religious education class, but rather the necessary animating principle of a Catholic school policy, activity, curriculum, and personnel concerns.

\(^{64}\) Op. cit. See chart on page 28, below, for an outline of this document.
was revised and expanded in 1997 as the *General Directory for Catechesis* (GDC), drawing heavily from John Paul II's *Catechesis in Our Time* (*Catechesi Tradendae*; 1979). The *Directory* is the universal standard for developing catechetical programmes in terms of philosophy and method. Regional episcopal groups are then invited to adapt these guidelines for the specific needs and challenges of their people. The *Directory* considers the *theoretical principles* behind religious pedagogy, whereas the *Catechism of the Catholic Church* (1992), written by a committee of bishops and theologians, and promulgated with papal authority, contains the *content* of Christian Revelation based on Sacred Scripture and Sacred Tradition, as preserved, interpreted, and transmitted by the teaching episcopal hierarchy in union with the Pope (i.e., the magisterium).

Having surveyed the landscape of modern Church documents relevant to education, we are now prepared to see ECE in a broader context. Although John Paul II was the ultimate source, final redactor, and promulgator of ECE, the document is a product of two decades of consultations and multiple drafts. It was prompted by the Vatican's concern for the trends articulated in the 1967 Land O'Lakes statement. "Beginning around 1969, the Congregation for Catholic Education began active consultations and dialogue with Catholic higher education institutions worldwide, working especially through the International

---

65 The GDC is also informed by the writings of two recent popes on the nature of, and ongoing need for evangelization: Paul VI, *On Evangelization in the Modern World* (*Evangelii Nuntiandi*, 1975); and John Paul II, *Mission of the Redeemer: On the Permanent Validity of the Missionary Mandate* (*Redemptoris Missio*, 1990). These two also form a backdrop of ECE and CSTTM in so far as Catholic education is understood as an extension of the Church's missionary mandate, received by Christ (cf. Matt. 28:18-20, GE Introduction, ECE 48, CSTTM 5). A full appreciation for the contemporary Catholic view of education can not be had apart from these works.

66 See Whitehead, *The History of Ex Corde Ecclesiae*, 8-16, which served as the primary basis for the following.

67 See the preface, above, for the importance of this watershed document.
The exchange of views over the ensuing decade made it clear that the revised 1983 Code of Canon Law should address the issue of maintaining and strengthening Catholic identity in Church academies. Canons 807 through 814 specified norms to be observed towards that end, but these were promptly rejected by prominent members of the American Catholic educational establishment as being inapplicable to the United States. In one of the first major acts of his pontificate, John Paul issued *Sapientia Christiana*, a 1979 apostolic constitution which regulates strictly ecclesiastical (or 'pontifical') universities and faculties. *Sapientia's* requirement to have a 'canonical mission' to teach in these schools was predictably resisted by many. The Pope explains that ECE was in part an extension of the principles and precedents found in *Sapientia*:

Having already dedicated the Apostolic Constitution *Sapientia Christiana* to Ecclesiastical Faculties and Universities, I then felt obliged to propose an analogous Document for Catholic Universities as a sort of 'magna carta', enriched by the long and fruitful experience of the Church in the realm of Universities and open to the promise of future achievements that will require courageous creativity and rigorous fidelity. 69

Whitehead describes how ECE is in fact simply an application of existing canon law:

The promulgation of *Ex Corde Ecclesiae* in 1990 - seven years after the Code itself - represented among other things, the Holy See's inevitable answer to the American pretension and contention that the Church's canon law did not necessarily have to be 'applied' in given instances or in a given country. The apostolic constitution makes clear that the university canons, which it effectively incorporates, do have to be applied in the United States. 70

*Ex Corde Ecclesiae* has thus had a controversial history and reception. The present study hopes to shed more light than heat on the debate, by looking to Newman as a sort of third

---

68 Whitehead, 'The History of *Ex Corde Ecclesiae*', 9.

69 ECE 8.

70 Ibid., 12, 13.
party of appeal in the disputes between contemporary Catholic dissenters and the magisterium. It is perhaps not too much to claim that such a project is in some way similar to the Irish bishops looking to the respected English and Oxonian convert Newman in the 1850's. As a foreign intermediary, they asked him to help find a path through the uncharted frontiers of creating a new Catholic university in Ireland. He sought a *via media* based on his own educational experiences and historical studies, between the conflicting desires within the Hierarchy itself and the needs and expectations of the English-speaking laity.\(^71\)

*The Catholic School on the Threshold of the Third Millennium* has been shown to be part of a continuum of documents flowing from the Congregation for Catholic Education since Vatican II. It is unnecessary for the present investigation to rehearse here the particular history and reception\(^72\) of this document directed at pre-university studies. Relevant contextual background will be presented in the following chapters as the need arises. The primary interrelationships between the content of *ECE* and *CSTTM* can be seen in the 'Chart of Correspondence for Thesis Outline' on the next page, where parts of the documents' tables of contents are placed in parallel columns, on either side of the thesis's outline. It is apparent that part two of this work is shaped especially by the organizational principles found in *ECE* and *CSTTM*. Lines drawn between sections indicate the major areas of correspondence. For example, the discussion of Newman's views in chapters five and six are framed by the questions and concerns raised in *ECE* under the rubrics of 'The Identity of a Catholic University'.

---

\(^71\) See chapter 3.3, below, for a discussion of Newman's role as the first Rector of the Catholic University of Ireland.

**Chart of Correspondence for Thesis Outline**

**Ex Corde Ecclesiae**

**Introduction** (1-11)
*(Newman: Footnote 7)*

'Catholic Universities are called to a continuous renewal, both as "Universities" and as "Catholic" requiring courageous creativity and rigorous fidelity' (7, 8).

**Part One: Identity and Mission**

A. The Identity of a Catholic University

1. Nature and Objectives (12-20)
*(Newman: Footnote 19)*

2. The University Community (21-26) *(Newman: Footnote 23)*

3. The Catholic University in the Church (27-29)

**Part Two: General Norms**

The General Norms contain six articles that prescribe specific policies for strengthening the proper identity of Catholic institutions of higher education. Articles 2-6 run parallel to the theological foundations in Part 1.

**Conclusion**

**Thesis Outline**

**Part One: Retrieving the Sources**

Chapter one introduces ECE, CSTTM, and other Church documents. Chapters two and three present selected concepts from the documents, as they are suggested by the educational formation, work, and writings of Newman.

**Part Two: Restoring the Foundations**

   1. Newman the Theologian
   2. Patristic Christian Humanism & Ed.
   3. The Role of Theology in Education
   4. Integral Human Formation in Christ

5. Identity of a Catholic Academy
   1. Academic Identity
   2. Ecclesial Identity
   3. Fidelity to the Christian Message
   4. A Continuing Reflection in the Light of Faith

6. Climate, Roles, and Personal Influence in the Educating Community
   1. 'A Common Dedication ... to Christ'
   2. Roles and Relations
   3. 'Icons' of Personal Influence
   4. Newman's Pedagogy of Personal Influence

7. Conclusion: Retrieval and Renewal
   1. Summary and Contributions
   2. Areas for Further Study
   3. Epilogue

**The Catholic School on the Threshold of the Third Millennium**

**Introduction**

Facing 'new challenges', it 'calls for courageous renewal on the part of the Catholic School' (1, 3).

**Part One: Joys & Difficulties**

**Part Two: Looking Ahead**

Describes 6 'fundamental characteristics to be strengthened' (no. 8) Cf. italicized phrases below, from no. 4. 3 of them are developed for this synthesis:

The Human Person and His or Her Education

(9-10; = 'the Catholic School as a place of integral education of the human person through a clear educational project of which Christ is the foundation')

The Catholic School at the Heart of the Church

(11-14; = 'its ecclesial and cultural identity')

Climate of the Educating Community

(18-20; = 'the traits which should characterize the educating community')

**Conclusion**
2.3 Secondary Literature

There are numerous studies on Newman and education, but no major project to date has made a theological synthesis of Newman's educational life and thought in light of recent Church documents. Many studies have explored, for example, the history and text of The Idea of a University. Important full length treatments include: Culler's The Imperial Intellect: A Study of Newman's Educational Ideal; McGrath's Newman's University: Idea and Reality, and The Consecration of Learning: Lectures on Newman's Idea of a University; and Ker's introduction and notes to the Idea. The first part of Culler's book is its strong point, tracing as it does, Newman's own educational development as a youth and at Oxford. One of the points of departure for this study was an evaluation that the second section of Culler's important work at times misrepresents the holistic vision his subtitle would suggest: Newman's Educational Ideal. By proposing an alleged 'conflict between the religious and humanistic elements in Newman's ideal', Culler tends to emphasize the aim of developing an 'Imperial

---

73 See, e.g., the bibliography section, 'Secondary Sources on Newman: Educational'.

74 Preliminary explorations into this general theme are found in John T. Ford's 'Newman and Vatican II on Education', op. cit. Discussions with Ford contributed to the questions and methods of the present study. See also Peter C. Erb, Newman and the Idea of a Catholic University, Aquinas Center of Theology Occasional Papers on the Catholic Intellectual Life, edited by Philip L. Reynolds and Stephen Glaze. No. 2 (Atlanta: Aquinas Center of Theology, Emory University: 1997). Erb's study includes a brief comparison of Newman's idea with Ex Corde Ecclesiae in pp. 13-15.


76 Culler, 272.
Intellect' (or 'philosophical habit of mind'\textsuperscript{77}), as his title and conclusion\textsuperscript{78} accurately indicate. He gives insufficient weight to Newman's other writings, his pastoral care of souls, and his praxis at CUI and the Oratory School, all of which highlight the explicitly and irreducibly theological and religious elements of 'Newman's education ideal'.\textsuperscript{79} It was a growing awareness of the breadth and depth of Newman's multi-faceted educational ideal presented in his many writings — informed and regulated as it was by his theological vision — that helped lead to the formulation of this thesis.

McGrath's Newman's University is a standard reference for the historical backdrop of Newman's involvement with the founding of the Catholic University of Ireland.\textsuperscript{80} It is a model of scholarship in its use of primary sources. His Consecration of Learning more nearly

\textsuperscript{77} 'Philosophical habit of mind': Newman's frequently used phrase in US and in the Discourses to describe 'the direct end' (Idea xxxiii) of a university education. Used synonymously with such terms as 'the enlargement of mind', the 'cultivation of the intellect', the 'imperial intellect', 'a philosophical cast of thought', etc.

\textsuperscript{78} See Culler, 269-70, where he concludes his study of 'Newman’s educational ideal' by suggesting that it is found essentially and finally in the exercise of 'Philosophy' or the 'Science of Sciences' in an ever-tentative approximation of knowledge and integration. Although he acknowledges Newman's religious perspective on p. 269, his book ends on a note of hesitancy, without reference to religious aims in education. His summary quotation from Newman makes no mention of theological concerns or of man's final end. It is simply one of Newman's several descriptions of 'an imperial intellect' (270). The present study attempts to place the goal of mental cultivation within Newman's broader perspective, viewed in its place within a 'hierarchy of Christian educational aims' (see chapter 4.3 and 4.4).

\textsuperscript{79} E.g., The Tamworth Reading Room is given only slight treatment (see 259-60), and without reference to Newman's insistence to make Christianity the 'element and principle of all education' (DA 274), as compared to the present study (see, e.g., chapters 2.4.3 and 3.3.3, below).

approximates the thrust of the present study in so far as it illuminates Newman's religious convictions on education. His chapter on 'The Restoration of Order' in education was an inspiration for the title ('Restoring the Foundations') and some of the questions treated in part two of this thesis. Ker's introduction to the critical edition of the Idea is a well documented and judicious treatment of its history and contents. His textual and editorial notes are invaluable. Other introductions written to various editions of the Idea make their own important contributions, and will be commented on where appropriate.

Other works have focussed almost exclusively on Newman's philosophical and pedagogical concerns for developing the 'philosophical habit of mind' in the pursuit of a liberal arts education with 'knowledge as its own end'. It is quite common for editors of anthologies to excerpt and thereby overemphasise certain portions of the Idea, with either the explicit purpose, or at times, the unintended effect, of making Newman into a proponent of a rather secular notion of liberal education. The Norton Anthology of English Literature, to cite

81 The book's title is taken from a quotation of Christopher Dawson, which is used as an epigraph to the book: 'In the medieval university ... the old monastic ideal of the consecration of learning to the Christian way of life was renewed and raised to a higher intellectual plane' (from The Crisis of Western Education, cited on page v; emphasis added). This thesis will make the case that Newman's educational theology was in continuity with this ideal, and raised it yet again, for his and succeeding generations.


83 See the various introductions and notes to different editions of the Idea listed in the bibliography (s.v. 'Primary Sources: Other Editions of the 36 Works'), esp. those of: O'Connell, Shuster, Svaglic, and W. Ward. Ker's chapter, 'The Educator', in Achievement, 1.34, provides one of the most readable and succinct summaries available for Newman's contributions as an educator, based primarily on the Idea alone. See also John R. Griffin's commentary, 'The Idea of a University', in A Historical Commentary on the Major Catholic Works of Cardinal Newman, 67-86 (New York: Peter Lang, 1993).

84 'Knowledge its Own End' is the title of Discourse 5 of the Idea (UE). See chapters 4.3, 4.4, and 5.4, below, for a development of this educational aim within the full context of Newman's thought.
but one example, reprints only parts of Discourse Five, ‘Knowledge its Own End’, and Discourse Seven, ‘Knowledge Viewed in Relation to Professional Skill’. In the introduction to these selections, George Ford focuses on Newman’s literary skill as a writer of controversial prose, and makes the unwarranted claim that ‘Newman’s view of a liberal education is largely independent of his religious position.’\(^8\) This selective exclusion from the Idea of most or all of the profoundly theological and religious references throughout, has the net effect on generations of readers of giving a deficient and therefore defective impression of Newman’s educational ideals.

There is a long history of editorial selections and introductions to anthologies and partial texts of Newman’s educational works which minimize his theological ideas about education, and emphasize the secular attainment of mental culture.\(^8\) An early example appears in the Harvard Classics collection, first published in 1891, where the introduction to three of Newman’s essays from Rise and Progress of Universities\(^8\) claims that ‘the essays . . . can be taken in detachment [from his system of belief] as the exposition of a view of the nature and value of culture by a man who was himself the fine flower of English university training and a master of English prose’.\(^8\) Yardley acknowledges that ‘such a selection robs the

---


\(^8\) Section One of HS 3. See Chapter 3 for a history of these essays which first appeared in the University Gazette.

Discourses of what was for Newman their primary end, and yet she does not hesitate to claim that she is 'giving us all that is of absolute value'. For her,

the account of the peculiar function of the Catholic University and of the relationship of the Church and learning has rather an historical than an absolute value for us. It affords insight into Newman's personality but not into education. 89

This persistent view will be examined throughout the study, in order to demonstrate its incompatibility with Newman's complex vision of education at the service of revealed religion. For Yardley to dismiss his theology of education as peripheral to his argument, and an accident of his personality, is to side with a position that Newman emphatically opposed throughout his life as a Christian educator. In 1879 he reflected on the issues at battle:

For thirty, forty, fifty years I have resisted to the best of my powers the spirit of liberalism in religion. . . .

Liberalism in religion is the doctrine that there is no positive truth in religion, but that one creed is as good as another, and this is the teaching which is gaining substance and force daily. It is inconsistent with any recognition of any religion, as true. It teaches that all are to be tolerated, but all are matters of opinion. Revealed religion is not a truth, but a sentiment and a taste; not an objective fact, not miraculous . . . Since, then, religion is


Even some generally sympathetic Catholic authors like Fennell (1991) nevertheless dismiss many of Newman's foundational theological assumptions: 'The Newman who can speak so confidently of theology as simply “truths we know about God put into a system,” ([Idea] 65) the Newman who evinces no hesitation about listing God's characteristics, is not a figure with whom we feel comfortable in an age more accustomed to Karl Barth than to a Thomas Aquinas. Moreover, when Newman draws from these assumptions practical conclusions about higher education, modern readers can sometimes only shake their heads'. His answer to this difficulty of 'retrieving' Newman is the same as Yardley's: 'I propose that we simply put a bracket around this Newman, . . . while we examine those areas of Newman's Idea of a University where the assumptions do not stand in our way so much . . . ' (Fennell, 'The Idea and Modern Ideas', 51-2). His reasoning is 'that in terms of higher education Newman's applied theology no longer has the relevance it may once have had, and in fact is more of an impediment than a help' (58).
By rejecting Newman's theological and religious foundations of education as being essentially personal, and therefore irrelevant, Yardley thereby misrepresents the very heart of his world view and educational ideal.

A number of significant studies have treated of Newman's place for theology in the university curriculum, but these do not present a synthesis of his educational theology per se. A favourable view of Newman's place for theology as both a legitimate branch of knowledge to be studied, and as a regulating principle in the university, is provided in a recent essay by the evangelical George Marsden, professor of church history at the University of Notre Dame. Marsden called for a renewed interest and application of Newman's ideas for our own day in 'Theology and the University: Newman's Idea and Current Realities'. His critique of the marginalization of religious belief in university discourse and practice demonstrates the negative effects – from a Christian faith perspective – of removing theology from the "circle of knowledge", as Newman had forewarned in the Idea.

---

90 Campaign, 395.


93 See Discourses 1-4 in the Idea, and chapter 4, below.
One of the distinctive features of this project is the attempt to consider not only the more obvious areas of liberal and higher education in Newman’s thought, but to investigate the questions of educational aims and means for primary and secondary schools as well. With only a few exceptions, Newman’s theory of Christian primary school education and pre-university studies has been a neglected field, especially in light of the fact that among his most notable educational accomplishments must be included the Oratory School he founded and oversaw for the last third of his long life of almost ninety years.

94 Among the more important of the few existing studies is Paul A Shrimpton’s recently completed doctoral thesis, *John Henry Newman and the Oratory School, 1857-72: The Establishment of a Catholic Public School by Converts of the Oxford Movement* (London: Institute of Education, University of London, 2000). This work made use of archival material and the other studies already in print, including these three:

(1) Willi Georg Mohnen’s *Voruniversitäre Erziehung bei John Henry Newman, dargestellt am Beispiel der Oratory School* was a dissertation presented for the degree of Doctor of Educational Studies, Pädagogische Hochschule Rheinland, March 1978. References to the text are from a photocopy of a working English translation by A. J. Tinkel, Archivist of the Oratory School, Woodcote, England, with the translated title: *Pre-University Education in the Eyes of John Henry Newman, as Represented by the Example of the Oratory School*. The shortened reference used hereafter is: Mohnen, *Pre-University Education*. References to the endnotes, bibliographies, and appendices are from photocopies of the original thesis, in German, with the shortened reference: ‘Mohnen, *Voruniversitäre Erziehung*’. It presents documentary evidence on the School’s curriculum, policies, enrollment, etc.

(2) Andrew Nash’s *Newman’s Idea of a School* was published by The Oratory School Association to mark the Centenary of the death of Cardinal Newman, founder of the School [1990]. As head teacher of English at the Oratory School, Nash had access to the School’s archives and living tradition. Combining these sources with a careful study of the LD, he presents a shorter, yet more reliable record and analysis of the rôle of Newman at the School, as compared to Mohnen.

(3) V. A. McClelland’s ‘A Catholic Eton: by Hook or by Crook? John Henry Newman and the Establishment of The Oratory School’ demonstrates that the attitudes of the hierarchy—especially that of Wiseman—towards the new school were not always favourable, and emphasises the limited scope of Newman’s idea to educate primarily the upper class sons of converts. In: *A Volume of Essays for Elizabeth Halsall*, Aspects of Education, no. 22, 3-17, compiled and edited by Colin Brock and Raymond Ryba on behalf of the University of Hull Department and Institute of Educational Studies and the British Comparative Education Society ([Kingston upon Hull]: The University of Hull Institute of Education, 1980).

Anthony Cornwell, a former classics master at the Oratory School, is making use of documentation not yet studied or fully treated, in a forthcoming history commissioned by the School, covering the first 100 years.
The initial and ongoing literature review for this investigation therefore indicated that a theological synthesis of Newman’s educational ideals in the context of contemporary Catholic teaching would indeed be a new contribution to the fields of Catholic education, practical theology, and Newman studies. It is hoped that the results will also serve as a springboard for further research into several theological issues related to Christian education.

3. Towards a Theology of Catholic Education

3.1 Philosophy of Education

Perhaps an ‘apologia’ is needed at the outset for the use of the somewhat unfamiliar phrase, ‘theology of Catholic education’. The more familiar notion of ‘philosophy of education’, will serve as a starting point. A philosophy of education addresses the fundamental principles of teaching and learning, according to a particular ‘world view’, i.e., according to how one views the world relative to one’s presuppositions and ‘fundamental convictions about the nature of reality’. Some of the many philosophies of education that have been worked out are, for example, based on the larger philosophies of: traditionalism, utilitarianism, progressiv-
ism, essentialism, existentialism, and Marxism. Each of these philosophies inevitably lead to a philosophy of education that addresses such questions as: What is man? What is the purpose of life? What is truth? How can we know the truth? And finally, how do we educate according to our answers to these questions?

In recent decades, however, there has been a trend away from metaphysical and teleological questions in educational philosophy, resulting in an ever-increasing secularisation in teacher training and school governance. Walter, et al., explain:

Modern educationalists continue to suggest that the philosophy of education prior to the 1960's was a prescriptive enterprise motivated by ideological intent; that its theories were based on little more than a priori metaphysical speculation and value-laden dogma. Educational philosophy, they point out, is neither metaphysical nor prescriptive: it is rather an empirical and value-free enterprise motivated only by a disinterested search for knowledge and understanding of education.

Newman was willing and able to address a 'philosophy of education', as in parts of the Idea, where he imposes a self-limitation in his discussion of the nature and scope of university studies in the abstract. He restricts himself at times to philosophical reflection apart from revelation; and when he does so, he refers to this as a 'philosophy of education':

---


The principles on which I would conduct the inquiry are attainable, as I have already said, by the mere experience of life. They do not come simply of theology; they imply no supernatural discernment; they have no special connexion with Revelation; they arise out of the nature of the case; they are dictated even by human prudence and wisdom, though a divine illumination be absent . . .

It is natural to expect this from the very circumstance that the \textit{philosophy of Education} is founded on truths of the natural order.\textsuperscript{100}

Thus, most of the Discourses are not concerned primarily with what we will come to call a theology of education, but rather with a natural philosophy of education, based on reason. There are notable exceptions, where Newman prescinds from this self-limitation, and makes direct appeals to Catholic theology and Church authority, for example in the Introductory Discourse, sections four through seven, and in Discourse Nine, ‘Duties of the Church Towards Knowledge’. But even when limiting himself to ‘philosophical’ reflection of education, his own world view assumed the validity of metaphysical ‘prescriptions’, as opposed to those ‘modern educationalists’ described by Walters, et al.

\subsection*{3.2 Theology of Education}

A prescriptive metaphysics is routinely bracketed out of philosophical discourse. The narrowing of philosophical enquiry and method has proceeded apace throughout the modern era, beginning with the radical split between revelation, faith, and religion on the one hand, and empirical knowledge, rationalism, and secularism on the other. But as originally understood, the ‘love of wisdom’ included two areas that we seldom equate today with philosophy: ‘natural philosophy’—corresponding to what we now treat in the natural sciences—and ‘divine philosophy’, or divine science, corresponding to natural and revealed theology. Given the more restricted understanding of philosophy as the use of human reason

\textsuperscript{100} Idea 22; emphasis added.
apart from any recourse to divine revelation, there is a need to speak of a religious or Christian philosophy which allows for the supernatural, and to affirm the task of theology itself as the philosophical penetration into revealed truth, in the context of faith.\(^1\)

Similarly, to allow for the notion of Christian revelation having something to say in answer to educational questions, one must speak either of a Christian philosophy of education\(^2\) or a Christian theology of education. The two phrases are not synonymous, but they overlap and interpenetrate in their concerns and sources. Both disciplines seek to investigate the nature, aims, and means of education, taking into account revelation’s truth claims regarding the origin and destiny of the human person. The difference between them lies in the basic orientation and approach of the investigator. In their introduction to The Education of Man: The Educational Philosophy of Jacques Maritain, Donald and Idella Gallagher make these helpful definitions and distinctions for our study:

\(^{101}\) John Paul II recently distinguished two ‘different stances of philosophy with regard to Christian faith. First, there is a philosophy completely independent of the Gospel’s Revelation: this is the stance adopted by philosophy as it took shape in history before the birth of the Redeemer and later in regions as yet untouched by the Gospel. We see here philosophy’s valid aspiration to be an autonomous enterprise, obeying its own rules and employing the powers of reason alone. A second stance adopted by philosophy is often designated as Christian philosophy. In itself, the term is valid, but it should not be misunderstood: it in no way intends to suggest that there is an official philosophy of the Church, since the faith as such is not a philosophy. The term seeks rather to indicate a Christian way of philosophizing, a philosophical speculation conceived in dynamic union with faith’ (Fides et Ratio, 1998, nos. 75-6; emphasis in the original).


\(^{102}\) One Catholic work of particular importance for its thorough handling of the subject is John D. Redden and Francis Ryan, A Catholic Philosophy of Education, rev. ed. (Milwaukee: Bruce Pub. Co., 1956). This was a widely used textbook for philosophy of education courses in American Catholic universities. Its scope and sequence was influential in the initial investigative stages of the present study, by suggesting the major areas to be addressed in a synthetic presentation of any Christian philosophy of education. The authors argue that scholastic philosophy is ‘the only complete, adequate, natural way of thought, which supplies the rational foundation for our supernatural way of life and way of thought’, because it is able to draw truths ‘from the Catholic faith as well as from natural reason’ (vii-viii).
The Christian philosophy of education is neither the equivalent of nor a substitute for a Christian theology of education. It is enriched by insights deriving from Christian wisdom yet remains truly philosophical. It is based on Christian anthropology... subordinated to Christian moral philosophy... related to the philosophy of culture... [and] supported by social and political philosophy... 

The Christian philosophy of education views the intellectual and moral education of man in the light of his nature and end in a strictly philosophical way, yet with the aid of the light shed upon these matters by theology.103

They claim that the key to understanding the difference between a philosophical and a theological approach to education is to make the distinction that 'the theologian follows what might be termed the divine order, proceeding from God to creatures; the philosopher follows the human order, proceeding from creatures to their Creator'.104 The present study takes the position that one can legitimately inquire into how and to what extent Newman began with God and his revelation as subject, and moved towards questions of man and his education as object. The resulting synthesis from such an investigation could thus appropriately be called 'Newman's theology of education'.

The admission of revelation into the discussion of educational ends and means is for Newman in no way antithetical to the most important themes found in the Idea. Ker observes that

there is no irreconcilable opposition between the intellectual and the religious, because it is ultimately a religious conviction which supports Newman's supremely confident vision of the wholeness of knowledge and truth: underlying belief in the imperial intellect is the prior belief in God as Creator.105

---


104 Ibid., 25.

If theology is the study of God and everything in relation to God, then a reconstruction of Newman's theology of education will need to make constant reference to the Christian tradition of divine revelation as he understood it. This is in keeping with the tradition of other notable Catholic treatments of educational theology, whether of the patristic humanism of the Greek Fathers, or of the scholastic synthesis that has predominated in the Western Church in modern times:

The medieval thinkers, although able to teach us much about philosophy, made no attempt to elaborate a philosophy of education as such. The educational doctrine of Augustine in On Christian Doctrine and of Hugh of St. Victor in Didascalicon is, for all the philosophy and humanistic knowledge it contains, a Christian theology of education.  

Protestant religious educators have published somewhat more than Catholics under the rubric of theology of education, but without coming to a consensus on what the term means. One approach to Newman's position can be had by contrasting it to an opposing Christian vision of theology and education. I. T. Ramsey offers such a contrast:

What is a theology of education? Let me say first what it is not. It is not a set of theological assertions which we use prescriptively to determine what education should be. It is not a theological framework to which teaching

---

106 Discussed in chapter 4.2 -4.3, below.


practice must conform. *That was the viewpoint behind, for instance, Newman's idea of a university.*

For Ramsey, theology is not, as it was for Newman, a philosophical and prayerful reflection on objective truth, divinely revealed. It is rather an investigation into subjectively perceived insights, in light of — but not necessarily judged by — one's faith tradition. He rejects Newman's understanding in favour of his own definition of theology as human explorations into our transcendent experiences of mystery. Ramsey sees himself as part of 'the theological revolution' which, in its 'existentialist approach sees religion, all religion as a man-made construction, a symbol system, rather than a God-sent revelation'. Since the language of theology is not based on the revealed word of God, it is 'never final, never sacrosanct'.

Theology can no longer be 'prescriptive and authoritarian', as Ramsey correctly claims it was for Newman. His rejection of a 'prescriptive' rôle for theology in education is follows on the heels of a similar trend already noted in modern discussions of philosophy of education as well.

### 3.3 Theology of Catholic Education

This final section will address three sub-sets of a Christian theology of education, each of them somehow modified by the word, Catholic: (a) Catholic Theology of Education, (b) Theology of Catholic Education, and (c) a Prescriptive Theology for Catholic Academies.

---

109 Ramsey, 'Towards a Theology of Education, 137; emphasis added.

110 Ibid., 140-41.

111 Ibid., 147.
Catholic Theology of Education. One could speak of at least two understandings of a Catholic theology of education – one 'prescriptive', the other, 'cosmic', both deriving from the notion of 'catholic' meaning 'universal'. Carr, et al. claim that:

A Catholic philosophy of education is not, save by inclusion, a theory of Catholic education; rather it is an understanding from what claims to be a universal standpoint of education as such. 112

In other words, by virtue of being universal in view by definition, 113 a Catholic philosophy or theology of education examines the whole range of human activity that passes for 'education', from the standpoint of a Catholic world view. A theology of Catholic education would thus refer to a theological study of why and how Catholics educate. As such, it would be one subset of a Catholic theology of education. Other sub-sets would include for example, a critique of the aims of vocational training in Marxist State schools in light of Catholic theology. A Catholic theology of education should be prescriptive, according to the vision of Thomas Aquinas, who saw the final end of man and the resulting purpose of education in theological terms:

For St Thomas we come from God and return to God. The aim or goal of education is a lifelong process of learning (and helping others) how to return to him. . . . [Thus] human learning must come to the bar of divine truth. 114

Other writers have somewhat less of a prescriptive view for a Catholic theology of education. A relevant comparison and contrast could be drawn, for example, between Newman's


113 Catholic < Latin, catholicus (universal) < Gk., kata, completely + holos (whole).

114 Ibid., 41.
educational theology and that of Denise Lardner Carmody. 115 Carmody's creative and articulate re-visioning of a theology of education is entitled Organizing a Christian Mind: A Theology of Higher Education. 116 Her study gives voice to a significant number of Catholic educators' concern to retain on the one hand, the best of the liberal arts tradition in the face of pragmatism and materialism, while on the other hand, to throw back what they see as the creeping authority of Rome into Catholic academic affairs. She proposes 'organizing a Christian mind' under the rubrics of human nature, physical nature, politics, and divinity. Her engaging prose builds up an eclectic theological vision that she describes as 'faithful to the mainstream of traditional faith, alert to the movements of the Holy Spirit in our own time, [and] controlled by the central image of the Incarnation . . . 117 The essence of a theology of education for Carmody is to ask the question, 'What difference does God make?' She is in concert with the Christian tradition when she affirms that

to admit the reality of God, and in consequence the legitimacy of theology, is to make all the difference in one's estimate of human nature and destiny, if not indeed of all creation. As the Zen proverb suggests, everything looks the same but now it carries a new meaning. 118

As the last quotation suggests, Carmody's frame of reference is largely shaped by her academic field of comparative religious studies. 119 Although she writes as the Catholic chair of the

115 Newman and Carmody are contrasted in their views on the proper rôles of bishops and theologians in chapter 5.3, below.


117 Carmody, Organizing a Christian Mind, 22.

118 Ibid., 15.

Religious Studies Department at Santa Clara University, she wants to distance herself from ‘the church to which I happen, and chose to belong, and in whose cultural pale I now find myself working’. This distancing is effected by relying on ‘a theology and anthropology . . . far more ecumenical’ and ‘common’ than her notion of traditional Catholic theology.\textsuperscript{120}

The end result is that her vision departs markedly on many points from the point of view of both Newman and the Catholic magisterium. She repeatedly calls for doctrinal, moral, and disciplinary revision within the Catholic Church.\textsuperscript{121} Her ‘theology of higher education’ reaches its climax in the conclusion, with a polemic against \textit{Ex Corde Ecclesiae}, which calls for the effective episcopal oversight of the university enterprise, and especially of Catholic theologians teaching in the name of the Church.\textsuperscript{122} To such a call, Carmody replies: ‘It is stupid, crude, and insulting all in one for people who are not trained theologians [i.e., bishops] to set themselves up as arbiters of work on the front lines’.\textsuperscript{123} Perhaps Carmody’s theology of education could be described as ‘catholic’ with a small ‘c’, in the sense that it is cosmic in its concerns, and written in a universally appealing poetic prose. But although she claims to be writing from within the Catholic ‘cultural pale’, she does so without a strict adherence to authentic Church teaching. It will be helpful to the argument of the thesis to occasionally contrast Newman’s views with those articulated by Carmody. For example, in

\begin{itemize}
  \item\textsuperscript{120} Ibid., ix, x.
  \item\textsuperscript{121} See her conclusion, esp. pp. 210-223. For example, she appeals to individual conscience over the teaching authority of the Church by denying ‘the ordination of women as a contradiction of Jesus’ will’. She repudiates Church teaching on purgatory, homosexuality, and contraception, and claims that ‘the only effective ecclesiastical influence’ that she will countenance in a Christian university is ‘encouragement, financial support, and theological backing’ (p. 212).
  \item\textsuperscript{122} Her preface states that she wrote her ‘theology of higher education’ as a personal answer to \textit{ECE}, ‘which lays out John Paul II’s view of education’ (ix).
  \item\textsuperscript{123} Ibid., 216.
\end{itemize}
Discourse Nine of the Idea, 'Duties of the Church Towards Knowledge', he argued at length that a Catholic university requires a 'direct and active jurisdiction of the Church over it and in ... lest it should become the rival of the Church'.

A Prescriptive Theology for Catholic Academies. From the outset, then, it must be recognized that Newman's theology of Catholic education is at odds with certain prevailing attitudes in contemporary Protestant and Catholic theological circles. Evidence will be examined to demonstrate that Newman's definition of theology was based on the notion of intelligible divine revelation of absolute truths, authentically interpreted by a teaching Church. Catholic theology for Newman therefore, is prescriptive in the highest sense. His view is echoed in John Paul II's unequivocal words in Ex Corde Ecclesiae's paragraph eleven:

My hope is that these prescriptions, based on the teaching of Vatican Council II and the directives of the Code of Canon Law, will enable Catholic Universities and other Institutes of higher studies to fulfil their indispensable mission in the new advent of grace that is opening up to the new Millennium.

Here we have clear reference to the Catholic self-understanding of the continuing legitimacy of a prescriptive theology of education, based on the magisterium's official summations and applications of divine revelation. The Constitution's authority derives from explicitly Catholic theological sources, which assert that Catholic education is 'indispensable' to the Church's 'mission'. The present study has for its immediate concern, a rather narrow sub-set of all that falls under the rubric, 'theology of education'. It will focus on the particular theological prescriptions that Newman propounded in the context of Catholic academies, with reference to issues addressed in recent teachings of the Roman Catholic Church.

---

124 Idea 184. Cf. Carmody's ambivalent attitude towards her university's '[Catholic] cultural pale' with Newman's strong words: 'If the Catholic Faith is true, a University cannot exist externally to the Catholic pale, for it cannot teach Universal Knowledge if it does not teach Catholic Theology' (ibid.). See chapter five, below, for a fuller discussion of this topic, including how Newman's difficulty with bishops did not dampen his commitment to the divine teaching authority of the Church in matters of faith and morals.

125 ECE, 11; emphasis added.
Chapter Two

NEWMAN'S EDUCATIONAL FORMATION, WORK, AND WRITINGS: THE ANGLICAN PERIOD

The extent to which the Christian message is transmitted through education depends to a very great extent on the teachers. The integration of culture and faith is mediated by the other integration of faith and life in the person of the teacher.

— Congregation for Catholic Education

It is a satisfaction to me to believe, that in my time, with whatever shortcomings, I have done something for the great work of Education. . . . Long before I was a Catholic Priest, I set myself to the work of making, as the School, so also the Lecture-room, Christian; and the work engages me still.

— John Henry Newman

1. Introduction

There were many formative educational and religious experiences in Newman's life that contributed to his theology of education. His long life and voluminous literary output complicate the search for the most important of these by the sheer mass of evidence to be sifted through. The exploration into his educational formation, work, and writings is divided into two chapters, in order to highlight the two distinct periods of his life. The method of these chapters is one of selecting and introducing pivotal events and periods in the life of Newman, together with some of his more important writings from those periods that touch on educational subjects. Each chapter section reflects on some aspect of Church teaching on educational foundations, as themes are suggested by Newman's life and work. These same

---

1 CS 43.

2 Add., 183.
themes are placed into, and further explored in an overall system of educational theology in part two.

The life and thought of Newman are best approached through his own autobiographical writings and correspondence. This study makes use of these primary materials, the great majority of which are now published. His Apologia pro Vita Sua, written in 1864 in response to the charge by Charles Kingsley that Catholic clergy were characteristically dishonest, and that Newman was a covert Romanist during his Tractarian period, remains one of the most important intellectual and spiritual autobiographies ever written. Newman saw Kingsley's charges as an opportunity to vindicate the integrity of his intellectual and spiritual pilgrimage, noting in a letter of 13 February 1875 that he did not 'feel any resentment against Kingsley', recognizing him as 'the instrument, in the good Providence of God, by whom I had an opportunity given me . . . of vindicating my character and conduct in the Apologia'. Martin Svaglic speculates that Newman was goading Kingsley on in their initial interchanges in the matter, so that he could give the defence of his life that

---

3 Newman himself held that 'a man's life is in his letters' (see the text of the letter to his sister, and editor's note 4 in LD 20:443).

4 He wrote the Apologia in eight weekly installments from 21 April to 16 June 1864. They were then bound together in one book, with the sub-title: Being a Reply to a Pamphlet entitled 'What, Then, Does Dr. Newman Mean? A second edition, issued as History of My Religious Opinions appeared in 1865, and the final, uniform edition came out as: Apologia pro Vita Sua: Being a History of My Religious Opinions (1873). All references to this work, unless otherwise noted, will be to the Oxford English Texts series critical edition, ed., with an introduction and notes by Martin J. Svaglic (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1967).

5 LD 27:219. See also AW 260-1.
'he had so long wanted to tell'. Vincent Ferrer Blehl describes the effects and legacy of this work, in terms of its educative and persuasive value:

It became from the beginning a classic, ranked with St Augustine's *Confessions*. Its effect not only in clearing Newman's name, and in re-establishing him in the affection of thousands of persons but also in sweeping away prejudice against Catholics can hardly be exaggerated. It was no longer believed that to be a Catholic one had either to be an naive fool or intellectually dishonest. In the eyes of many Catholics, not only in England but in the English-speaking world Newman became the champion of the Catholic Cause.  

Elsewhere however, Blehl offers a review of the contemporary reception of the *Apologia*, noting that 'those who conceded that Newman's sincerity had been vindicated generally did not agree with his doctrinal views'.

Newman's *Autobiographical Writings* were not published until 1956. This collection of his own biographical sketches, memoranda, and chronologies brought to light much material not covered in the *Apologia*, including important background information on the Oriel Tutor row. Also included are important documents for understanding Newman's

---


8 See his conclusion to 'Early Criticism of the Apologia' in Blehl and Connolly, eds., *Newman's Apologia*, 47-63.

9 *AW* was edited primarily by Fr. Henry Tristram, until his death in 1955. C. S. Dessain added the remaining editorial work, and saw it through its publication in 1956.

10 See chapter 2.3.3 below for a description of this controversy which provides a window into Newman's theological premises for education. Treated in chapter 3 of the 'Autobiographical Memoir' in *AW*.
Newman's Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Anglican Period

educational work in Ireland.¹¹ His correspondence of well over twenty thousand extant letters – prodigious even by Victorian standards – is found in The Letters and Diaries of John Henry Newman.¹² Each of the thirty-one volumes (volumes 9 and 10 are forthcoming) include a brief chronology and an abstract of the historical events covered in the respective volume. Many of the most important letters and extracts from the two remaining volumes may be found in a few previously published biographies and anthologies.¹³ There is no shortage of biographical studies for this prominent Victorian.¹⁴ Introductory studies of

¹¹ See 'Memorandum About my Connection with the Catholic University', AW 277-333.


Newman's thought and writings are also numerous.\textsuperscript{15} A. Dwight Culler's The Imperial Intellect has already treated the question of Newman's own early education at Ealing and Oxford in great detail, including even a listing of young John's school books.\textsuperscript{16}

Given the background of abundant autobiographical materials, together with the many biographical and introductory studies, the purpose of this far more limited survey is to establish an immediate context for examining Newman's theology of education. It will focus therefore, on those experiences and writings that will either set the stage for, or make a specific contribution to the study in later chapters.

Appendix one should be consulted in conjunction with chapters two and three, as it provides a schematic overview of his life and works, together with the historical and cultural background. It complements this and other chapters by providing additional detail and perspective to the limited treatment of his life and work possible in this study. Biographical information is interwoven here with a survey of relevant primary literature. Aside from his specifically autobiographical and educational writings, a number of his other works are introduced in approximate chronological sequence.

There are a number of primary 'stories' and leading principles upon which this and subsequent chapters rest. Among the many periods of Newman's life, we shall want to look more closely, for example, at the formative influence on Newman's developing thought from:

1. his studies and conversion at Ealing,
2. the Oriel Tutor Period,
3. how his study of the

\textsuperscript{15} The most relevant for this study are: Ian Ker, The Achievement of John Henry Newman (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1990); esp. chap. 1, 'The Educator' (hereafter cited as Ker, Achievement); Charles Frederick Harrold, John Henry Newman: An Expository and Critical Study of His Mind, Thought and Art (London: Longmans, Green & Co., 1945); and Griffin's Historical Commentary. See also the fuller list of biographies and introductions consulted in the thesis bibliography.

\textsuperscript{16} Culler, part 1, 'Oxford' (1-120); and the bibliographical appendix, section 2, 'Newman's School and College Texts' (275-78).
Church Fathers resulted in his leadership of the Oxford Movement and his 1845 conversion to Roman Catholicism, and his educational work at (4) the Catholic University of Ireland and (5) The Oratory School. As the major turning points and educational undertakings of Newman's life are introduced, the focus will be on trying to discover Newman's explicitly theological and religious views on education.

2. Son and Student

2.1 The Christian Family as 'the First School'

John Henry Newman's long life of almost ninety years spanned every decade of the nineteenth century. Born 21 February 1801 into a Protestant household, he died 11 August 1890, as a cardinal of the Roman Catholic Church, and one of the most respected and beloved churchmen in England. A curious fact is that his life can be neatly divided almost in half, between his Anglican and his Catholic years, since he converted in 1845. Newman's parents had six children, of whom John Henry was the first. There was nothing particularly remarkable about his early Christian formation, but it does illustrate the identification in Gravissimum Educationis of the family as 'the first school of the social virtues', where 'children should be taught from their early years to have a knowledge of God according to the faith received in Baptism, to worship Him, and to love their neighbour'.

His family were ordinary members of the Church of England. In Grammar of Assent, Newman described his household indirectly by characterizing the majority national religion of England as 'Bible Religion', consisting 'mainly in having the Bible read in Church, in the

\[GE 3.\]
family, and in private'.\textsuperscript{18} 'Reading the Bible and living a correct life' was the focus. Such religion was 'comparatively careless of creed and catechism'.\textsuperscript{19} In the Apologia, he describes his own experience: 'I was brought up from a child to take great delight in reading the Bible; but I had no formed religious convictions till I was fifteen.'\textsuperscript{20} This positive early orientation to the Sacred Scriptures was to influence his theological understanding and educational priorities. His paternal grandmother and aunt Elizabeth were his most influential teachers in the Bible and his early religious upbringing.\textsuperscript{21} As in the case of most English homes of the time, there was little emphasis on particular theological schools of thought in the family setting, although Newman does record that he 'had a perfect knowledge' of his catechism.\textsuperscript{22}

\section*{2.2 Student at Ealing}

At the age of seven, John Henry began his formal education at Great Ealing School, a private boarding school in Ealing, just west of London. He attended there for eight and a half years, from 1808 to 1816. During this formative period of his life, Newman developed as a pupil with a natural affinity for the sort of classical education that the school provided. In an autobiographical note written in 1874, he says of himself:

\begin{flushright}
\footnotesize
\textsuperscript{18} GA 56.

\textsuperscript{19} GA 57. He was 'not speaking of particular schools and parties in England, whether of the High Church or the Low, but of the mass of piously-minded and well-living people in all ranks of the community' (GA 57-8).

\textsuperscript{20} Apo 15.

\textsuperscript{21} Newman's nephew, J. B. Mozley, related to the Fathers of the Birmingham Oratory (based on his mother's testimony) that the Newman household in the early years 'was not either Calvinistic or Evangelical'. J.B. Mozley and his brother Frank recorded the reflections of John's brother, Francis, who noted their mother's influence as well: 'My mother and grandmother (Newman) taught us simple piety, the non-controversial points of Christianity on which all agreed. They would never have taught Calvinism.' Cited in Corr. 394.

\textsuperscript{22} Apo. 15.
\end{flushright}
As a child, he was of a studious turn and of a quick apprehension; and Dr Nicholas [the headmaster], to whom he became greatly attached, was accustomed to say, that no boy had run through the school, from the bottom to the top, so rapidly as John Newman. 23

He excelled academically, winning prizes for speeches, and attacking his language studies with enthusiasm. 24 A gift for verbal expression was to become one of Newman's characteristic qualities as a preacher and as a writer of many different literary genres. Another gift was his ability to organize and lead others into associations for common projects. While at Ealing he established a Spy Club, and created four separate periodicals for his friends' amusement: The Spy, The Antisy, Portfolio, and the Beholder. Gilley sees in these activities 'evidence of that power to win disciples which was to remain with him throughout his life'. 25

Other highlights of his experience at Ealing included playing the violin (a practice that was to give him great enjoyment throughout his life) and acting in Latin plays. Newman's high regard for the formative value of learning music and the Latin language led him to incorporate these two opportunities in his Oratory School in later years. He spent long hours reading books that fired his young imagination such as The Arabian Nights 26 and Sir Walter Scott's Waverley novels. 27

23 AW 29.
24 He would, for example, write letters home from Ealing in Latin and French, and as a teenager, showed a playful, yet competent facility with both his mother tongue and the romance languages. See LD 1 for letters and diary entries written during these years (1808-16), for a window into the mind of this developing writer-theologian-preacher-philosopher-educator.
25 Newman and His Age, 12.
26 'I used to wish the Arabian Tales were true: my imagination ran on unknown influences, on magical powers, and talismans ...' (Apo. 15-6).
27 At the age of seventy, Newman wrote a letter to James Hope-Scott speaking of his 'devotion ... to Walter Scott', recounting how 'as a boy, in the early summer mornings, I read Waverley and Guy Mannering in bed, when they first came out ...; and long before that, I think, when I was eight years old, I listened eagerly to the Lay of the Last Minstrel [[and to Marmion]],
Although he made little time for the typical boys games like marbles and unorganized cricket, he was a physically vigorous person who loved outdoor activities, including walking long miles, riding horseback, swimming in the river, and rowing boats. As an adult he regularly walked the six miles round trip from Oriel College to his mission parish in Littlemore. 28

At the age of fourteen his world opened up to the possibility of unbelief. He read Thomas Paine’s *Tracts Against the Old Testament*, ‘some of Hume’s *Essays*; and perhaps that on *Miracles*’, and probably some of Voltaire or the Encyclopaedists. He found an odd sort of pleasure in these, when, for example, considering a denial of the immortal soul, he wrote, ‘How dreadful, but how plausible’ 29 Echoing a familiar sentiment of the times, he recorded in his early journals:

I recollect (in 1815 I believe) thinking I should like to be virtuous but not religious. There was something in the latter idea I did not like. Nor did I see the meaning of loving God. 30

when I was eight years old, I listened eagerly to the Lay of the Last Minstrel [[and to Marmion]], which my Mother and Aunt were reading aloud’ (bracketed words as in LD 25: 329). See appendix one for the progressive publishing of these and others of Scott’s works, and p. 61, below, for his reading of *Ivanhoe* and regarding Scott’s influence on Newman’s educational method of cultivating the imagination.

28 See AW 29 and Trevor, *Newman’s Journey*, 15. Throughout Trevor’s biographies (op. cit.) she (rather defensively) argues against the notion of Newman’s supposed frailty, and even effeminate manner. His own letters and diaries give evidence of the considerable vigour he displayed well into his fifties and beyond, especially in his travels. At CUI he provided for billiards, cricket, fencing, games, and hunting (see Anne Player, ‘John Henry Newman and Education’, *The Australasian Catholic Record*, 47, no. 3 (July 1990): 305. The Oratory School which he founded in 1859 emphasized physical exercise and sports from its inception. See also the note on page 168, below, regarding Newman on the place of physical education and ‘manliness’.

29 Apo. 17, Apo. Editor’s Notes 478.

30 AW 169.
2.3 Personal Influence and Conversion

His experimentation with rationalism gave the young Newman a first hand understanding of this world view, which served him well in his life-long struggle against it. It enabled him later to enter into the mind of the sceptic and to argue the case for unbelief before offering his Christian apologetic in reply. But his sojourn through scepticism was short-lived. A major turning point in his life occurred in 1816 when, at the age of 15, he came under the Evangelical influence of Rev. Walter Mayers, his classics master, whom Newman identifies as ‘the human means of this beginning of divine faith in me’.31 Their relationship is an illustration of the teaching-learning dynamic enjoined in CSTTM:

During childhood and adolescence a student needs to experience personal relations with outstanding educators, and what is taught has greater influence on the student’s formation when placed in a context of personal involvement . . .’32 Mayer’s influence came largely in the form of a vade mecum to the world of religious literature. He gave to Newman the necessary mediation of a teacher-mentor, leading to his first religious conversion, as he explained in the Apologia:

When I was fifteen (in the autumn of 1816) a great change of thought took place in me. I fell under the influences of a definite Creed, and received into my intellect impressions of dogma ... Above and beyond the conversations and sermons of the excellent man, long dead, the Rev. Walter Mayers ... who was the human means of this beginning of divine faith in me, was the effect of the books which he put into my hands . . . 33

In his essay, ‘What is a University?’,34 Newman drives home the importance of a teacher’s personal influence in directing and evaluating a student’s reading. After noting the

31 Apo. 17.
32 CSTTM 18.
33 Apo. 17, emphasis added.
34 First published in the Catholic University Gazette (1854), collected in Office and Work of Universities [OW] (1856), and finally in HS 3, as ‘Rise and Progress of Universities’ collection (1872).
remarkable profusion of printed books, periodicals, and tracts in his age, he insists that 'whenever men are really serious about getting...“a good article”' they will 'avail themselves...of oral instruction, of present communication between man and man, of teachers instead of learning, of the personal influence of a master'. The benefit of printed matter is as 'a record of truth, and an authority of appeal, and an instrument of teaching in the hands of a teacher'. But one becomes 'exact and fully furnished in any branch of knowledge which is diversified and complicated' only by consulting 'the living man', and listening 'to his living voice'.35

There are limits and possibilities proper to each form of learning:

The general principles of any study you may learn by books at home; but the detail, the colour, the tone, the air, the life which makes it live in us, you must catch all these from those in whom it lives already... We must come to the teachers of wisdom to learn wisdom, we must repair to the fountain, and drink there.36

And then in a passage to illustrate this principle of personal instruction in a University, Newman turns to the realm of catechesis, which is even closer to our own immediate investigation of educational method in view of religious ends. He likens personal presence to the theological notion of 'Oral Tradition', saying it is 'the living voice, the breathing form, the expressive countenance, which preaches, which catechises'.37 Thus Newman, though he was a great lover of books, was first and foremost an advocate of direct and personal teacher-student interaction. In this setting, the sharing of important books by a mentor can become a mediation of knowledge and wisdom, cor ad cor.38

35 HS 3:7-8.
36 HS 3:9.
37 HS 3:14.
38 See the discussion of Newman's cardinalial motto, cor ad cor, in ch. 6.3.2, below.
Mayers directed Newman’s attention to another author that especially influenced him at this time: the Evangelical Thomas Scott. This influence would not have been realised except for the intermediacy of his personal tutor. Newman remembered Scott thus: he ‘made a deeper impression on my mind than any other, and to [him] (humanly speaking) I almost owe my soul’. Newman appropriated two maxims from Scott which he believed summed up his essential spiritual teaching: ‘Holiness rather than peace’, and ‘Growth, the only evidence of life’. These themes of holiness and growth reverberate from his first sermons to his last.

During this time Newman fell seriously ill, and from August until December 1816, he experienced a lasting conversion to a specifically religious, rather than just an ethical sense of life. He discovered the notion of a dogmatic principle upon which he felt a life can and must be built. This conviction regarding the role of revealed religion was to guide his theological and educational thought. Dessain explains how his understanding of divine revelation gave unity to his life, in a passage that also introduces some important underlying themes in his life-work of education:

The fundamental interest of Newman’s life is his devotion to the cause of Revealed Religion. He was led to accept it whole-heartedly as a boy, and to seek out its full and balanced content. This devotion gave his life its unity. It led him to become the leader in a movement to reinvigorate and supernaturalise the Church of England; it caused him to abandon it for the Roman Church; it made him try to remedy various deficiencies he found there, and to moderate excesses. In many of his efforts he failed at the time,

---

39 Apo. 18.

40 Apo. 18.

41 See the note on this on page 74 for a listing of representative sermons on these themes.

42 I.e., the ‘Oxford Movement’, treated in chapter 2.4, below.

43 His 1845 conversion and subsequent work for reform is treated in chapter 3, below.
but history has vindicated him, and the Catholic movement of reform has hailed him as a prophet. 44

During the same time of his first conversion, he made his first discovery of the early church Fathers by reading Joseph Milner’s church history. 45 He was ‘nothing short of enamoured of the long extracts from St. Augustine, St. Ambrose, and the other Fathers’ 46 that he read there, and which planted an abiding image of the undivided early Church in his mind. A fascination with the Fathers was to pervade his thinking for a lifetime. When, for example, in his mid-twenties, he found himself drifting towards a ‘cold Arminian doctrine, the first stage of Liberalism’, he claims that

the ancient Fathers saved him from the danger that threatened him. An imaginative devotion to them and to their times had been the permanent effect upon him of reading at School an account of them and extracts from their works in Joseph Milner’s Church History, and even when he now and then allowed himself as in 1825 in criticisms of them, the first centuries were his beau idéal of Christianity. 47

Thomas Newton’s Dissertations on the Prophecies on the other hand, convinced him that the Pope was the anti-Christ, leading to a deeply ingrained anti-Romanism for many years to come. 48 Newman claimed that his ‘imagination was stained by the effects of this doctrine up to the year 1843.’ 49 These many references to ‘imagination’ from his early life right through to his late Catholic writings are a key to his theological, religious, and epistemological understanding, and will thus be explored in several chapters below. Sufficient


46 Apo. 20.

47 AW 83; emphasis added.

48 Apo. Editor’s Notes, 481; Ker, Biography, 5.

49 Apo. 20; emphasis added.
for now is to notice the theme, and to observe that one of the reasons Newman thought his brother Francis could not become a Catholic was that he had a 'great defect of imagination' which prevented him from coming to that point of view.\(^{50}\)

A comparison can thus be drawn between the increasingly divergent careers of John and his brother Francis. Both profited from their traditional education, based on the classics. Latin and composition were life-long passions for both men. Both experienced evangelical conversions under the influence of Walter Mayers while at Ealing, but John's experience was more rooted in the notion of 'the dogmatic principle', whereas Francis was at first, something more of an enthusiast, but increasingly a rationalist. Both went on to graduate from Oxford, distinguishing themselves as scholars and educators in their own right. But John, whose poetic imagination complemented his defence of revealed religion and Catholic dogma, stands in sharp contrast with Francis, whose syllogistic rationalism led him to move from evangelical Anglicanism to become at first, a non-conformist, and eventually a Unitarian with increasingly secular views. The course of their lives thus illustrate two opposing religious world views.\(^{51}\)


\(^{51}\) See LD 1:339 for a brief survey of Francis's life. A most insightful study of these two brothers is found in Robbins' Newman Brothers. The above comments summarize Robbin's basic thesis that the two brothers, though sharing a common upbringing, schooling, and university, became paradigms of two opposing philosophies of life: John Henry as the traditional, yet creative orthodox Christian, and Francis, as 'the saint of rationalism' (George Eliot once referred to him as 'our blessed St Francis'—see p. xi). His study thus questions the notion of social determinism, while illustrating the power of personality and the will to shape one's world view.
2.4 Trinity College, Oxford

Newman came into residence at Trinity College, Oxford when he was sixteen, and was an undergraduate there from 1817 to 1820. He arrived as a convinced evangelical Calvinistic Anglican, and was known for his earnest Christian and academic life. Being elected to a nine-year scholarship at Trinity was an honour he cherished, and an opportunity for him to continue his studies in mathematics, Latin, ancient literature, and the natural sciences. At Trinity he had found a second home, and the favourable impressions he retained from these years coloured his image and defence of the college residence system at Oriel and the Catholic University of Ireland.\footnote{See Ch. 2.3, 'Fellow and Tutor'; Ch. 3.3.1, 'Newman as Rector'; and Ch. 6.4.2, 'Personal Influence in Newman's Praxis', below.}

In addition to his assigned readings, he was very much influenced by the writings of Sir Walter Scott,\footnote{At age 18 he read Scott's *Ivanhoe* with great relish: 'O what a poet! ... I really never recollect reading any thing which so took away my breath with admiration ... Author of *Waverly*, thou art a second Shakespeare' (letter to his mother, 21 Jan 1821, in LD 1:72). Newman attributed to Scott a major rôle in preparing the imaginations of a generation of Anglicans in directions away from 'the dry and superficial character of the religious teaching and literature of the last generation', by turning 'men's minds in the direction of the middle ages', and thus, by way of anticipation, towards the vision of the Oxford Movement (Apo. 93-4). This idea is developed in Ch 2.4, 'Anglican Priest: Forming Hearts and Intellects', below. See also note on page 54.} and of Gibbon,\footnote{Read, together with Locke, during the long vacation of 1818.} whose secular philosophy of history he disdained, despite his admiration for his literary style.\footnote{See LD 1:67 for his evaluation of Gibbon.}

When he read too widely without sufficient focus in preparation for his final examinations, he was led nearly to the point of exhaustion, earning only a lower second class honours B.A. in December 1820. His mental anxiety was no doubt compounded by the fact that he stood for these examinations while he was yet nineteen years old—two or three years below the average for that time. But more important for Newman was the relative lack of
direction he received as an undergraduate. The need he felt for experienced mentoring
significantly shaped his strong support for an active pastoral and intellectual rôle to be played
by college tutors, and by teachers of every level. He writes of having ‘had little or no guidance
in my studies ... I was obliged to teach myself, and a very sorry and unsatisfactory teaching
it was’. Though he averaged twelve hours of intense study per day while preparing for his B.A.
exams for five months, he says ‘he needed a kind friend to keep me from taking up other
pursuits at the same time’.56 Culler corroborates Newman’s judgement on this; in the 1820’s
the Schools examinations were largely ‘viva voce’, limited primarily to quick recall in a public
forum resembling a ‘gladiatorial contest. Obviously there was a special technique about
preparing for such an examination’, which, in Newman’s day was

a kind of guild secret possessed by some colleges and not by others. Their men
got the Firsts ... Oriel, Balliol, and Christ Church were within this charmed
circle but Trinity was not, and in after years Newman was aghast at what little
guidance he had received in his preparation.57

3. Oriel College Fellow and Tutor

3.1 Fellows and Friends

After deciding in early 1822 to pursue the Anglican priesthood, Newman was elected a
Fellow of Oriel College on April 12. His entrance into one of those ‘charmed circles’ came

56 AW 51-53. Newman’s remarks here are from an 1854 proposed anonymous letter to the
Catholic University Gazette that were not in fact published there, but only later in AW, for their
autobiographical worth. Emphasis in the original.

57 Culler, 21. Here Culler is summarizing the state of things as reported by one of the
examiners of this time, in Thomas Vowler Short, A Letter addressed to the very Reverend the Dean of
Christ Church on the State of the Public Examination in the University of Oxford (Oxford, 1822), 21. By
way of contrast, two of Newman’s later associates, Henry Edward Manning (Balliol) and Henry
Wilberforce (whom Newman himself had tutored at Oriel, and who became one of his closest friends)
received two of only six Firsts awarded in Greats in 1829.
Newman's Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Anglican Period

as somewhat of a surprise to many, owing to his poor showing in the Schools just over a year earlier. Adopting the third person in an autobiographical memoir, he identifies this day as:

the turning point of his life, and of all days most memorable. . . . it opened upon him a theological career, placing him on the high and broad platform of University society and intelligence, and bringing him across those various influences personal and intellectual, and the teaching of those various schools of ecclesiastical thought whereby the religious sentiment in his mind, which had been his blessing from the time he left school, was gradually developed and formed and brought on to its legitimate issue. ⁵⁸

His experience as a Fellow of Oriel College was thus Newman's introduction to what ECE identifies as that 'community of scholars representing the various branches of knowledge' ⁵⁹ which is at the heart of a university. He came to know and love 'the Universitas magistrorum et scholarium which is dedicated to research, to teaching and to the education of students who freely associate with their teachers in a common love of knowledge.' ⁶⁰

Oriel was considered the most intellectually progressive college of Oxford in the early decades of the nineteenth century. For the socially-retiring young Newman to become one of its Fellows was a credit to their ongoing search for men of true intellectual depth. Oriel's Provost at the time, Dr. Edward Copelston, wrote twenty-one years later that Newman was an example of how one who could not distinguish himself in 'the narrow and almost the technical routine of public examinations', nor as 'even a good classical scholar', could nevertheless prove himself 'in mind and powers of composition, and in taste and knowledge, . . . decidedly superior to some competitors, who were a class above him in the Schools'. ⁶¹

⁵⁸ AW 63.

⁵⁹ ECE 14.

⁶⁰ ECE 1.

⁶¹ AW 64. Copelston's praise for Newman is in fact an argument for his Oxonian educational ideal. In 1810 Copleston had vigorously defended the Oxford classical liberal arts curriculum against 'the storm [which] broke upon the University from the North', in the form of attacks by Scottish academics appearing in the Edinburgh Review (see Idea 138, and the whole of Discourse 7, 'Knowledge
In 1823, Edward Pusey was elected an Oriel Fellow, followed in 1826 by Richard Hurrell Froude, and Robert Wilberforce. Together with Newman, these men forged a close bond of friendship and collaboration in pursuing similar religious and academic goals. Another kindred spirit at Oriel was John Keble, their senior, who was much absent from the University because of his parochial duties outside of town. But during the first few years, Newman fell under the more immediate influence of Richard Whately (later Protestant Archbishop of Dublin), and Edward Hawkins, who, together with Thomas Arnold, Copleston, and other liberal minded colleagues at Oriel were dubbed by journalists as the ‘Noetics’, or ‘thinkers’. Whately in many ways was a model Newman looked to as a teacher-mentor. In the Apologia he remembered how Whately took me by the hand, and acted towards me the part of a gentle and encouraging instructor. He, emphatically, opened my mind, and taught me to think and to use my reason. Newman remembers him as ‘a man of generous and warm heart’. Despite their increasingly divergent views, Newman claims he owed much of his intellectual and religious development to him. Whately apprenticed the young scholar by making him a partner in his studies in logic, such that Newman became a collaborator in his Encyclopaedia Metropolitana article on logic, and his much reprinted textbook, Elements of Logic.

and Professional Skill). Newman explains in the first section of Discourse 1: ‘the charge brought against its [Oxford’s] studies was their remoteness from the occupations and duties of life, to which they are the formal introduction, or, in other words, their inutility’ (Idea 20; emphasis in original). Four decades later, Newman was taking up Copleston’s defense of a ‘Liberal Education’ in his Discourses when he argued that the utility of a university education can not be measured solely by a man’s acquired professional skills. Rather, a liberal education ‘prepares him to fill any post with credit, and to master any subject with facility’ (Idea 154).

62 See Apo. Editor’s Notes, 485.
63 Apo. 23.
About this time Pusey and Newman began attending lectures by Charles Lloyd, the Regius Professor of Divinity at Christ Church, whom Pusey much admired. Lloyd's theological stance was closer to Newman's growing appreciation for dogma and the Catholic principles of Christianity, as compared to that of the more liberal minded Whately. But despite their mutual respect Newman wrote that Lloyd 'was not the man to exert an intellectual influence over Mr Newman or to leave a mark upon his mind, as Whately had done'. Although his theological journey moved him closer to Lloyd's high Anglicanism, it was by means of careful reasoning, as Whately had taught him do, that Newman progressed step by step: 'he taught me to see with my own eyes and to walk with my own feet'.

Whately also helped to redirect his evangelical orientation towards some of the eventual directions of the Oxford movement:

What he did for me in point of religious opinion, was, first, to teach me the existence of the Church, as a substantive body or corporation; next to fix in me those anti-Erastian views of Church polity, which were one of the most prominent features of the Tractarian movement.

By choosing the verb 'to fix', Newman reveals the very active and personal nature of Whately's teaching, which he sums up by saying, 'His work had a gradual, but a deep effect.'

Newman was quick to give credit to men under whose influence he grew in both mental culture and religious understanding, even when he had disagreements with them. Such is the case in Newman's appreciation of Whately and Hawkins. He reminisces in the Apologia about his respect for Hawkins: 'He was the first who taught me to weigh my words,

---

65 AW 71.


67 Apo. 24, emphasis added.

68 Apo. 25.
and to be cautious in my statements'. He was 'a man of a most exact mind himself'. He also helped Newman to 'give up' his 'remaining Calvinism, and to receive the doctrine of Baptismal Regeneration'. The irony of their relationship is that because of his support of Hawkins over Keble (towards whom Newman was far more empathetic as spiritual example and leader) for the Oriel provostship in 1828, two major turning points occurred in his life: his appointment as Vicar of St. Mary the Virgin Church, and the so-called 'Oriel Tutor Row'. Hawkins had been St. Mary's Vicar: a position he had to resign to take on his new responsibilities as Provost. The now-vacant post fell to Newman. Oriel College supplied the Vicar for this parish church, and Newman was thus positioned to develop into the remarkably influential pastor and preacher who was to spearhead the Oxford Movement. His pastoral duties there spanned fifteen years, from 1828 to 1843.

3.2 The Influence of John Keble

A major inspiration and model for Newman's developing Catholic views and spirituality during his Tractarian period was John Keble, whose influence can be discerned in many of the themes that became central to his thought. For example, Keble's advice against intellectual pride anticipates a constant concern of Newman:

Christianity is not a matter of logical arrangement, or philosophical investigation; much less of rhetorical skill. Not that those things are useless, as talents. But then it should always be remembered, that they are only talents, and will, accordingly, prove worse than useless, except they be united with a rare humility.

69 Apo. 21.

70 He said of the election: 'You know we are not electing an Angel but a Provost' (LD 30:107), by which he meant, Keble was a man of deeper Christian virtue, but that practically speaking, Hawkins, who was also sincere in his faith, had the stronger administrative gifts.

71 See chapter 2.3.3, below.
Keble continues that we must keep 'our own usual mediocrity' in view so that we will be 'less likely to fall into the common error of imagining, that those who talk best about the truth really know and love it best'. Newman would say that those who talk well, but do not live well are living an unreal Christian life. Geoffrey Rowell perceives Keble's influence as one that integrated Newman's readings and intuitions into a unified reality: 'Keble's deep faith and quiet sanctity . . . revealed to Newman a spirituality in harmony with the religion of the heart he had learnt from other writers and books of devotion.' His religious and devotional life was greatly enriched by his contact with Keble, as he describes in the Apologia, beginning with his debt to Keble's landmark hymn book, The Christian Year (1827):

> When the general tone of religious literature was so nerveless and impotent, as it was at that time, Keble struck an original note and woke up in the hearts of thousands a new music . . . Nor can I pretend to analyse, in my own instance, the effect of religious teaching so deep, so pure, so beautiful.

Newman had Keble's Christian Year explicitly in mind as he and Froude began poems for the Lyra Apostolica. He wanted their poetry to evoke religious impressions that would inspire the imagination of others in the direction of what was to become the Oxford Movement.

Newman identified 'two main intellectual truths' he leaned from Keble — truths he first encountered in Butler's Analogy, but were now 'recast in the creative mind of my new

---


71 'Roots of Newman's "Scriptural Holiness"', 18.

74 Apo. 29.

75 See LD 4:109, and chapter 2.4, below.
The first set of truths that he adopted was 'the Sacramental system'. Keble opened Newman's eyes to 'the doctrine that material phenomena are both the types and the instruments of real things unseen', that gives meaning to the doctrines of 'Sacraments properly so called; but also the article of “the Communion of Saints”; and likewise the Mysteries of the faith'. 'The second intellectual principle' which he borrowed from Keble was a deeper understanding of the rôle of probability for religious belief, a life-long interest, and the theme of his philosophical *magnum opus*, the Grammar of Assent. In an early formulation of his doctrine, he speaks of Keble having shown him that

Faith and love are directed towards an Object; in the vision of that Object they live; it is that Object, received in faith and love, which renders it reasonable to take probability as sufficient for internal conviction. Thus the argument from Probability, in the matter of religion, became an argument from Personality, which in fact is one form of the argument from Authority.  

Newman found this personalist approach to the problem of religious belief helpful, but limited. He expanded the idea to illustrate how 'we are treated as sons, not servants; not subjected to a code of formal commandments, but addressed as those who love God, and wish to please Him.' But though Keble's approach to probabilities was 'beautiful and religious, . . . it did not even profess to be logical'. Without rejecting Keble's insight, he sought 'to complete it' in his later writings, where he developed his argument for the 'assemblage of
concurring and converging probabilities\textsuperscript{78} becoming sufficient for individual certitude in matters of faith.

3.3 The Oriel Tutor Row

One of the most significant ideas for this study from his years at Oriel is Newman's concept of a college tutorship in its religious, or theological dimension. Newman, Froude, and Wilberforce came to view the office of tutor (which in those years was filled almost exclusively by clergy) as a substantially religious task, and devised a system of combining academic tuition with pastoral care:

When I was Public Tutor of my College at Oxford, I maintained, even fiercely, that my employment was distinctly pastoral. I considered that, by the Statutes of the University, a Tutor's profession was of a religious nature. I never would allow that, in teaching the classics, I was absolved from carrying on, by means of them, in the minds of my pupils, an ethical training. I considered a College Tutor to have the care of souls, and before I accepted the office I wrote down a private memorandum, that, supposing I could not carry out this view of it, the question would arise whether I could continue to hold it.

To this principle I have been faithful through my life.\textsuperscript{79}

\textsuperscript{78} Apo. 31; emphasis in the original. Newman identified and described these later writings on pp. 31-32: OS, Mir., and Dev. Writing in 1864, he did not mention Grammar of Assent (1870), which brought to fruition his work on this question that had occupied him since first reading Butler's Analogy in 1825 (LD 1:238). See AW 78 and Apo. 10-11 on Butler's influence.

Newman's influence by Keble and Butler was not unique for his age. David Newsome demonstrates how during the early and mid-Victorian era, the students of Cambridge and Oxford held many 'points of similarity between them' which were 'more striking than their differences'. One similarity is that each Oxbridge student was formed by the same basic texts, including 'his Bible and his classical authors', together with 'five literary works which did more to form his ideas, quicken his emotions and inspire his motives that any other influence of a cultural or philosophic kind. The five works were Butler's Analogy, Wordsworth's poems, Sir Walter Scott's novels, Coleridge's Aids to Reflection and Keble's The Christian Year' (Godliness and Good Learning, 12). See Newsome's discussion of these 5works and their pervasive influence on pp. 12-17, which also puts Newman's devotion to Scott in perspective).

\textsuperscript{79} Add. 184.
This passage makes clear that Newman held to his views of teaching and education as a matter of religious conviction. Here is evidence that Ramsey is correct in claiming that Newman used ‘theological assertions ... prescriptively to determine what education should be’. In this passage, we find Newman arguing for: (1) the pastoral and religious nature of the tutor’s charge, (2) the religious necessity of including ethical training even in literary and other subjects, (3) the existence of man’s spiritual soul, and (4) the need to care pastorally for the souls of students as being constitutive of the tutor’s office. Newsome points out that this principle of ‘regarding a tutorship as an office primarily of pastoral care’ may well have been inspired by Keble, who ‘had commented, a clergyman had no call to abandon a cure of souls to take on such a post’. Rowell finds ‘a parallel to Newman’s concern that his Oxford tutorship should be a pastoral office in Mayer’s own anxiety that his work in teaching Classics at the school at Ealing should provide him with the opportunity for leading his pupils to a true and deep knowledge of religion’. 

Newman and his two colleagues in the experiment were eventually forced out of their Oriel tutorships over a difference with Hawkins on their pastoral approach to the rôle they held. The view of Hawkins was that giving undue attention to young men of promise, while ‘leaving the idler gentlemen-commoners very much to their own devices’ promoted an unwanted elitism. Hawkins effectively put an end to their innovations of increased

---

80 See Ramsey, ‘Towards a Theology of Education’, 137. Ramsey’s rejection of Newman’s ‘prescriptive theology’ for education is the context for this statement, as discussed below in chap. 1.3, ‘Towards a Theology of Catholic Education’.


Newman's Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Anglican Period

spiritual and academic care for particular students in June 1830, by ceasing to assign new undergraduates to them.84

3.4 Research Fellow and Patristic Scholar

In letters to his mother shortly after the Provost's decision, Newman reports that as public tutors, he, Wilberforce, and Froude would 'die off gradually with our existing pupils'. His reaction to this change was mixed: 'for the College, I think it is a miserable determination'. But for himself personally, he fairly rejoices. He finds it 'a delightful arrangement' because 'it will materially lessen my labours, and at length reduce them within bearable limits, without at once depriving me of resources which I could not but reckon upon, while they lasted.'85 He thus became effectively—in his view, by the Providence of God—a research fellow of Oriel College, with the time and resources at his disposal to pursue his theological and historical interests: 'Now that I shall have more time, I am full of projects what I shall do. The Fathers arise up again full before me.'86

84 See LD 15:239-241 for Hawkin's letter of 9 June 1830 to Newman. The correspondence between Newman, Froude, and Wilberforce and their provost was all very cordial and restrained, despite their serious differences of convictions on this matter. Hawkins writes: 'And I was 'most reluctant to allude to any other course which might have anything of the air of a threat. And I am most reluctant to do so still; but I yield to what you seem to desire, and feel bound therefore to say that, if you cannot comply with my earnest desire, I shall not feel justified in committing any other pupil to your care' (p. 241).

85 LD 2:244.

86 LD 2:245; emphasis added.
Newman had determined to read through the Fathers as early as 1826, and began in earnest in 1828. It was this careful and passionate study of patristics that led him to both read and write on the lessons from antiquity for the contemporary church. In 1866 he wrote of how he had previously loved reading the Fathers, but that if it were not for his disengagement as tutor, he doubted whether he 'should have written on such subjects. Thus the [Oxford ] movement would not have begun', he thought, 'but for the act of Hawkins'.

Christopher Dawson makes explicit the connection between his early experiences and studies at Oriel, and the trajectory of his future religious opinions and spirituality:

All the greater, then, was Newman's delight when, in 1831-32, his studies on the ecclesiastical history of the 4th century revealed to him the Church of the Fathers in all its glory. There at last he found the religious ideal that he had looked for in vain in Evangelical pietism and in the intellectualism of Whately and the 'Noetics,' a religion that was spiritual without emotionalism and intellectual without rationalism — a Church that was the temple of super-rational wisdom and supernatural holiness. Here too in the Christian Platonism of the Alexandrian and Cappadocian Fathers he found the

---

87 In a letter to his sister Jemima on 1 May 1826, Newman contemplated reading 'all the Fathers — 200 volumes at least', in order to 'trace the sources from which the corruptions of the Church, principally the Romish, have been derived' (LD 1:285).

88 The careful recording of this reading project reflects his serious commitment to and delight in his 'imaginative devotion to [the Fathers]' (AW 83). For example, in 1864, Newman wrote: 'in the Long Vacation of 1828 I set about to read [the Fathers] chronologically, beginning with St. Ignatius and St. Justin (Apo. 35). But his 1828 contemporary journal entries more accurately record that he first read through his collection of the 'Apostolic Fathers' (orthodox Christian extra-biblical writings of the late first and early second century), in the following sequence, interspersed with days of note taking and reading commentaries of the same: 'began the Patres Apostolici with Barnabas' (23 June); 'finished Barnabas' (24 June); 'looked at Hermes and began Clement Romanus' (26 June); 'finished Clemens Romanus' (27 June); he then turned to the seven epistles of St. Ignatius, from 1 to 9 July; followed by a reading of 'Polycarp's epistle with adjumenta' (10 July).

Though he complained of making 'little progress' on 4 July in his reading, 'owing to other engagements' (LD 2:80), he in fact finished this first systematic reading of the collection on 11 July: 'read Church of Smyrna epistle' [their account of Polycarp's martyrdom], and thus 'finished Patres Apostolici' (see LD 2:76-81 for the above). It was not until 18 August that he was able to take up the project again: 'read Justin Martyr ad Graecos [c. A.D. 150] and began his cohortatio' (LD 2:88), and then again on the 27th: 'continued Justin's first Apologia' (LD 2:92).

89 LD 22:218; emphasis in original.
complete justification of the mysticism which was characteristic of the early Tractarians ... 

4. Anglican Priest: Forming 'Hearts and Intellects'

Newman was ordained a deacon in June 1824 and a priest of the Church of England in 1825. The day after his diaconal ordination he reflected in his journal on the words spoken over him at the laying on of hands:

'For ever,' words never to be recalled. I have the responsibility of souls on me to the day of my death. . . . What a blessed day was yesterday. I was not sensible of it at the time – it will never come again.'

Placid Murray makes a compelling argument throughout his introductory study in Newman the Oratorian that 'Newman considered the Christian priesthood above all from a pastoral – one might almost say, a practical – standpoint as a life-long 'responsibility of souls', which coloured all of his educational activity as well. His conclusion is that:

This pastoral note is the great underlying bond of continuity and identity between his ministry before and after his conversion. In Newman's work, this care of souls became largely a care of minds, an apostolate to the intellect, recognizably the same before as after conversion. Thus his apostolic attitude to his tutorship at Oriel is in the same line as his letter about the intellectual formation of future priests a Propaganda, while his treatment of the problem of faith in his Catholic period arises directly out of his basic positions in the Oxford University Sermons.

4.1 Pastor and Preacher

Newman's first assignment as a deacon was at St. Clement's in Oxford. His ministry there as Curate included preaching, visiting the sick, home visitations of parishioners, and fund-

---


91 AW 201; emphasis added.

92 NO 121-2; emphasis added.
Newman's Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Anglican Period

raising for a new church. He was closely involved with the establishment and oversight of the educational and catechetical ministry there with the children. In his 'Autobiographical Memoir', Newman wrote in the third person of how 'at St Clement's he did a great deal of hard parish work, having in the poor school which he set to foot the valuable assistance of the daughters of the Rector . . .'. He also founded a Sunday School for religious instruction in 1825.

As the pastor assigned to St. Mary the Virgin's mission church in Littlemore, Newman took delight in giving religious instruction to children in the parish school. He also enjoyed teaching music, accompanying the singing children on his violin. His involvement with the students extended to the girls' hygiene: 'I have been reforming, or at least lecturing against, uncombed hair and dirty faces and hands; but I find I am not deep in the philosophy of school-girl tidiness'. His letters and diaries are full of references during his tenure at St. Clement's and Littlemore, to the close attention he gave to the education and pastoral care of children and their families.

Newman is remembered as much for his preaching as for any other aspect of his multifaceted career. Writing and delivering sermons was for him, an educational opportunity in the deepest sense. His homilies were aimed at the heart, while instructing the intellect to grow in truth and holiness, the twin objectives he had adopted from his reading of Thomas Scott. At the peak of his Anglican ministry in the late 1830's, five to six hundred

93 AW 72.

94 Letter to Mrs. J. Mozley (his sister Jemima), 12 March 1840; quoted in Ker, Biography, 194 [replace reference with LD vol. 7]

95 See, e.g., LD 2:76, where mention is made of teaching his regular catechetical classes on Tuesdays.

96 See, e.g., any number of sermons preached over the course of his life as both Anglican and Catholic. The pursuit of Christian holiness by the power of the indwelling Holy Spirit, and by means
Newman's power and attraction as a preacher were the same qualities that made him an admired and effective teacher and pastor; he relied not on oratorical enthusiasm, but on his intended good for parishioners and pupils, mediated by his personal influence. His distinctive preaching style has been well documented by his contemporaries. One such account by Dean Lake typifies the impressions of many who experienced his preaching and influence:

There was first the style, always simple, refined, and unpretending, and without a touch of anything which could be called rhetoric, but always marked by a depth of feeling which evidently sprang from the heart and experience of the speaker, and penetrated by a suppressed vein of the poetry which was so strong a feature in Newman's mind, and which appealed at once to the hearts and the highest feelings of his hearers. . . . the preacher seemed to enter into the very minds of his hearers, and, as it were, to reveal them to themselves, and to tell them their innermost thoughts.

The theme of doctrinal growth was the subject of one of Newman's most important theological works, *The Development of Christian Doctrine* (1845).

97 For contemporary descriptions of Newman's style and influence in the pulpit, see Church, *Oxford Movement*, 139-145; R. D. Middleton, 'The Vicar of St. Mary's', in *John Henry Newman: Centenary Essays* (London: Burns, Oats, and Washbourne, 1945): 127-138; and 'Note on Cardinal Newman's Preaching and Influence at Oxford', collected by Wm. Neville from sources by Principal Shairp, Lord Coleridge, and others, as an appendix in *Campaign*. Most accounts are favourable, as seen in these sources. An opposite view is expressed by Justin McCarthy: 'In all the arts that make a great preacher or orator, Cardinal Newman was deficient. His manner was constrained and ungraceful, and even awkward; his voice was thin and weak. [His physical appearance] rather repelled than attracted those who saw him for the first time' (Church, *Oxford Movement*, 144). Compare Matthew Arnold's very different impression of Newman 'gliding . . . through the aisles of St. Mary's', speaking 'in the most entrancing of voices' (cited in Middleton, 'The Vicar of St. Mary's', 131). Middleton collects numerous reminiscences about Newman's 'silvery voice in its wonderful clear tones': it was 'melodious', 'musical', 'thrilling'. His effective use of the silent pause is the one quality most commented on. 'His manner of speaking was the same in the pulpit as on ordinary occasions; in fact, he was not preaching but conversing . . . ' (SN vii).

98 Cited in Middleton, 132; emphasis added to highlight Lake's own experience of Newman speaking 'cor ad cor'.

undergraduates, graduates, and dons were turning out to hear his Sunday afternoon sermons at St. Mary's.
The first of his 604 Anglican sermons for which we have the text or notes was preached in 1824. The last of these, entitled 'The Parting of Friends', was preached 25 September 1843 in Littlemore, when he resigned from his pastoral duties in order to come to terms with his growing doubts about the Anglican position vis-à-vis his studies in theology and church history. Newman collected what he believed to be his most important sermons in the six volume *Parochial Sermons* (1834-42), and then in 1868 he added two more volumes, renaming the set *Plain and Parochial Sermons*, thereby inaugurating what was to become his 'uniform edition' of thirty-six collected works in all. Other collections of his Anglican sermons appeared under the titles: *Sermons Bearing on Subjects of the Day* (1843) and *Fifteen Sermons Preached before the University of Oxford between A.D. 1826 and 1843*, (1843). This latter collection explored themes that anticipated educational and philosophical topics treated in greater depth in his full length Catholic works, the *Idea* and the *Grammar of Assent*, especially the relationships between faith and reason.

---

99 All six vols. were printed in London for Rivington & Parker, Oxford.

100 The preface to vol. 1 of PS describes their history: 'The first six volumes are reprinted from the six volumes of "PAROCHIAL SERMONS;" the seventh and eighth formed the fifth volume of "PLAIN SERMONS, BY CONTRIBUTORS TO THE TRACTS FOR THE TIMES," which was the contribution of its Author to that Series' (p. v).

101 See the introduction to the bibliography for a discussion of this 'uniform edition', and appendix 1, 'Synopsis' for a listing of Newman's major published works presented in chronological order.

102 See below for an introduction the *Idea* and the *Grammar*. The following titles from the *University Sermons (US)* are suggestive of their content: 'The Philosophical Temper, First Enjoined in the Gospel'; 'The Usurpations of Reason'; 'The Nature of Faith in Relation to Reason'; 'Wisdom, as Contrasted with Faith and with Bigotry'. One of his last Anglican sermons, 'The Theory of Developments in Religious Doctrine' (US Sermon 15), reveals the cast of his mind as he soon thereafter resigned his ministry and began writing his *Development of Doctrine*. In chapter 7 we will examine the fifth of these *University Sermons*, in regard to Newman's educational method: 'Personal Influence, the Means of Propagating the Truth'.

The remaining sermons of this period are being published under the series title, *John Henry Newman: Sermons, 1824-43*. These volumes illustrate the development of Newman's thought as a young preacher and theologian, as he moves slowly towards the Catholic position without straying from his life-along commitment to revealed religion, and its demands on the hearts and minds of believers.

4.2 Poet and Tractarian

In December of 1832, Newman accompanied Richard Hurrell Froude, who was suffering from the first signs of consumption, and his father, Archdeacon Robert Froude, on a six month journey to Italy and the Mediterranean. While in Rome, Newman met two future cardinals with whom he was to share in both ecclesial cooperation and personal and political frustration in the coming decades. Nicholas Wiseman was the Rector of the English College in Rome at the time, and became the first Cardinal Archbishop of Westminster in 1850, upon the restoration of the English Roman Catholic hierarchy. He also met Paul Cullen, Rector of the Irish College, and later Archbishop of Dublin during Newman's tenure at the Catholic University of Ireland. He was both intrigued and repelled by the Roman Catholic Church and Italian culture. His confused reaction to Rome did not affect the growing conviction


104 His reaction to seeing the Pope at a Mass was revealing: 'How shall I name thee, Light of the wide west, or heinous error-seat?' (LD 3:268).
he had expressed in his parting words to Wiseman to the effect that they had ‘a work to do in England.’

On a side trip to Sicily he became dangerously ill, but on his recovery, his sense of mission increased. While his boat was becalmed in the Straits of Bonifacio, he wrote perhaps his most famous poem, ‘The Pillar of the Cloud’, known more popularly as the hymn, ‘Lead, Kindly Light’. The first verse represents the modus operandi for his continuing spiritual pilgrimage:

Lead, Kindly Light, amid the encircling gloom  
Lead Thou me on!  
The night is dark, and I am far from home—  
Lead Thou me on!  
Keep Thou my feet; I do not ask to see  
The distant scene— one step enough for me.

In the last lines, Newman prays to Christ, personified as Light, for his next step to take. It did not take him long to see this step once back on English soil. He had returned from his trip with renewed physical vigour, emotional enthusiasm, and mental focus, as evidenced by his making personal visits to many clergy, in order to ‘make a strong pull in union with all who were opposed to the principles of liberalism, whoever they might be.’

From 1833 to 1841, Newman was at the height of his Anglican ministry and influence. His pulpit and pen were seldom quiet. During these industrious years, Newman

---

105 Apo. 43; cf. his earlier memory of the conversation where he said less dramatically, ‘we had work at home’ (LD 276; AW 136).

106 VV 153.

107 Apo. 49.
wrote twenty-nine\textsuperscript{108} of the ninety Tracts for the Times.\textsuperscript{109} These were rather densely written theological pamphlets that gained a measure of influence beyond the relatively small number of copies actually printed. They were calling for a 'Restoration'\textsuperscript{110} to the catholic principles of Christianity found in antiquity. Most of them took the form of catenas,\textsuperscript{111} connecting statements largely from the Fathers and the Caroline Divines\textsuperscript{112} in support of apostolic Christianity. Newman summed up the goals of the Oxford Movement thus:

> [W]e were upholding that primitive Christianity which was delivered for all time by the early teachers of the Church, and which was registered and attested in the Anglican formularies and by the Anglican divines. That ancient religion had well nigh faded away out of the land, through the political changes of the last 150 years, and it must be restored. It would be in

\textsuperscript{108} See Blehl, Catalogue, 115-119 for a listing of the 29 he wrote alone, plus Tract no. 15 by Wm. Palmer, revised and edited by Newman. He assisted with the editing of others as well.

\textsuperscript{109} From which publications the appellation, 'Tractarian' is derived. The religious ferment and influence caused by Newman and his fellow Tractarians became known simply as 'The Oxford Movement'. The text of all 90 Tracts are online at Project Canterbury's web page, 'Tracts for the Times': http://justus.anglican.org/resources/pc. For a ready reference of all the Tracts, dates, authors, and publishing arrangement in the out-of-print collected series, see the appendix in H. P. Liddon, Life of Edward Bouverie Pusey, vol.3 (London: Longman, Green, 1894): 473-80; this appendix is also online in an adapted form: http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/tracts-list.html.

\textsuperscript{110} Apo. 154.

\textsuperscript{111} Catena, from the Latin for chain.

\textsuperscript{112} 'Caroline' refers to the reigns of Charles I (1625-49) and Charles II (1660-85). These seventeenth-century Anglican clerics – most notably, Abp. of Canterbury William Laud (1573-1645) – were opposed to the Puritanism represented by Cromwell and the Commonwealth (1649-60), and wanted to steer a path between the Puritans and the Roman Catholics (cf. Newman's Via Media approach in the following paragraphs).

One instance of Newman's typical appeal to the Caroline divines and the early Fathers was his belief, based on the 'foundation of dogma ... that there was a visible Church, with sacraments and rites which are the channels of invisible grace'. Affirming his unchanging position on this from 1833 until the time of his writing (1864), he says "I put this ecclesiastical doctrine on a broader basis, after reading Laud, [John] Bramhall [1594-1663, Bishop of Derry], and [Edward] Stillingfleet [1635-00, Bishop of Worcester] and other Anglican divines on the one hand, and after prosecuting the study of the Fathers on the other" (Apo. 55, and notes 55.13 and 55.14, on p 520).
It was also during these years that Newman developed his theory of the *Via Media*, i.e., the idea that Anglicanism was a sort of bridge between historic Catholic Christianity and the Reformation bodies, that avoided the corruptions of the former, and the important apostolical deletions of the latter.

Newman worked hard as a preacher and writer to educate both clergy and laity on the principles of his hoped for 'second Reformation'. One of the strategies he used towards this end was an *education of the imagination* that comes from reading poetry and inspirational prose. An inspiration to his approach from early childhood was Sir Walter Scott, whose works Newman felt answered 'the need that was felt both by the hearts and the intellects of the nation for a deeper philosophy'.

In an article written in 1839 for the *British Critic*, Newman assessed the 'literary influence of Walter Scott':

The general need of something deeper and more attractive than what had offered itself elsewhere, may be considered to have led to his popularity; and by means of his popularity he re-acted on his readers, stimulating their mental thirst, feeding their hopes, setting before them visions, which, when once

---

114 The *Via Media of the Anglican Church* (VM 1, 2) bring together in two volumes Newman's various writings from this time, in defence of the notion.

115 Apo. 93; emphasis added, to highlight the theme of this section. The *Lyra* and the *Tracts* can be seen as being themselves, directed to the hearts and intellects of the nation. See also note 53 on p. 61, above, for the growing and enduring influence of Scott on Newman's own imagination and educational method.

Linking the influence of Scott and S. T. Coleridge, Newman wrote in the same passage of the *Apologia*: 'While history in prose and verse was thus made the instrument of Church feelings and opinions [i.e., by Scott], a philosophical basis for the same was laid in England by a very original thinker [Coleridge], who, while he... advocated conclusions which were often heathen rather than Christian yet after all instilled a higher philosophy into inquiring minds,... and succeeded in interesting [his age] in the cause of Catholic truth' (Apo. 94).

See John Coulson's *Religion and Imagination* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981), which examines Newman's and Coleridge's understandings of the role of literature and imagination in religious asent in part one. See also note 78, p. 68, above, for the widespread influence of Scott and Coleridge on the early and mid-Victorian era.
seen, are not easily forgotten, and silently indoctrinating them with nobler ideas, which might afterwards be appealed to as first principles.\textsuperscript{116}

Newman and Froude had written poetry with these same goals in mind while on their Mediterranean vacation. The poems were 'undertaken with a view of catching people when unguarded'.\textsuperscript{117} Poetry was seen as complementary to the \textit{Tracts}, which were addressed more to the \textit{intellect} by recourse to historical texts and rational argument. The \textit{Lyra} were addressed more to the \textit{heart}.\textsuperscript{118} The plan was to publish a section of poems under the rubric of \textit{Lyra Apostolica} in each issue of the \textit{British Magazine}, as a medium of 'making an effective quasi-political [i.e., anti-Erastian] engine'; after all, he asked a correspondent, 'Do not stirring times bring out poets? Do they not give opportunity for the rhetoric of poetry, and the persuasion?\textsuperscript{119} Christopher Dawson endorsed this view of poetry's ability to inspire and inform for his own generation, by choosing to quote these poems at length in his study, \textit{The Spirit of the Oxford Movement}. He reasoned that

\begin{quote}
[i]t\textit{heology is no longer a part of English education, and consequently Newman and Pusey and Keble speak to us in a dead language}... The language of poetry, even though it be minor poetry, is more universal than the language of theological controversy, and the \textit{Lyra} expresses the spirit of the Oxford Movement even more clearly and directly than the \textit{Tracts for the Times} themselves.\textsuperscript{120}
\end{quote}

In similar fashion, this study makes frequent recourse to the poetry, fiction, and hymnody of Newman, to arrive at a better, more 'poetic' understanding of his educational views.

\begin{footnotes}
\item[116] Ess. 1:268; quoted in full in \textit{Apo.} 94.
\item[117] LD 4:109.
\item[118] Cf. Merrigan's \textit{Clear Heads and Holy Hearts} (op. cit.), which title identifies his summary of Newman's educational ideal, in agreement with this section's treatment of Newman's rôle as an Anglican clergyman, forming both intellects and hearts.
\item[119] See also Newman's correspondence in LD 119-21 for his conception of the \textit{Lyra Apostolica}.
\item[120] Dawson, \textit{The Spirit of the Oxford Movement}, xiii.
\end{footnotes}
The poetry of Newman, Froude, Keble, Wilberforce and others continued to appear in the magazine, and most of these poems were eventually collected into a book in 1836, with regular reprints over the ensuing decades, attesting to their influence on the Anglo-Catholic movement.

Also in 1833 Newman began writing a series of articles called 'Letters on the Church Fathers', which were designed to 'prepare the imaginations of men for a changed state of things, and also be precedents for our conduct in difficult circumstances'. A similar project was launched by Newman and Pusey in 1836, with the goal of reconnecting English Christians with the great figures and teachings of the ancient Church. They were convinced that such an educational undertaking was a necessary condition for building a proper foundation for the 'Restoration'. The ambitious programme called for a research and development team of translators, editors, and writers for a massive library of biographies, sermons, and theological writings, making up the Library of the Fathers. Newman himself made six major contributions to the series, including his translation of Select Treatises of S. Athanasius, and his editing of five other volumes.

4.3 Education and Religion in The Tamworth Reading Room

Perhaps the single most important educational work written by Newman during his Anglican years was a series of seven letters published in February 1841 by The Times, under the pseudonym, Catholicus, in answer to Sir Robert Peel's inaugural lecture for the new public library.

121 LD 4:24; emphasis in the original. Newman wrote twenty instalments, from 1833 to 1837, for the British Magazine. These were later published as The Church of the Fathers in 1840, and as part of HS, vols. 1 and 2 (see Blehl, Bibliographical Catalogue, 12, 81).

122 The individual volumes were published over the course of years, 1835-1885; edited by Newman, Pusey, Keble, and C. Marriott (see Blehl, Bibliographical Catalogue, 103-04).

123 Which he later edited and included in his own Uniform Edition, in 1881.
library in Tamworth.\textsuperscript{124} Newman likened Peel's ideas to those of Lord Brougham in his promotion of the non-sectarian London University in the 1820's. Both men seemed to be claiming too much for the benefits of secular knowledge in the increasingly pluralistic society of nineteenth century England.\textsuperscript{125} He paraphrased Peel's position thus:

Uneducated men live in the indulgence of their passions; or, if they are merely taught to read, they dissipate and debase their minds by trifling or vicious publications. Education is the cultivation of the intellect and heart, and Useful Knowledge is the great instrument of education. It is the parent of virtue, the nurse of religion; it exalts man to his highest perfection, and is the sufficient scope of his most earnest exertions.\textsuperscript{126}

Newman's answer to these exalted claims is that religion alone can transform the human heart in the areas that Peel, Brougham and even Jeremy Bentham's Utilitarians desiderate. The letters are even more explicitly Christian in their argumentation than one finds in the more philosophically conceived Idea of a University. For this reason, they are most important for clarifying Newman's distinctively theological ideas on education. A digest of the seven letters's separate titles\textsuperscript{127} indicates the direction of his argument: Secular knowledge is: (letter no. 1:) not religion, (2) nor is it the principle, (3) a direct means, (4) nor the antecedent of moral improvement. Neither is it a: (5) principle of social unity, nor a (6) principle of action. Far from being 'the parent of virtue' and 'nurse of religion', that which is hailed as 'useful

\textsuperscript{124} Published as: Sir Robert Peel, An Inaugural Address Delivered by the Right Hon. Sir Robert Peel, Bart, M. P., President of the Tamworth Library and Reading Room, on Tuesday, 19th January, 1841 (London: James Bain; Tamworth: J. Thompson, Bookseller, 1841). Peel's address and Newman's TRR letters are both reprinted in LD 8 as appendices.

\textsuperscript{125} The related issue of political expedience in matters of non-confessional education is explored by Gilley in Newman and His Age, 195-199. For him, 'the heart of the matter' was that 'the Church of England's loss of a monopoly of power led a realistic politician like Peel to edge towards Christian ecumenism away from Anglican confessionalism, and to abandon the old exclusive Tory commitment to the Church' (197). Newman had no immediate political answer to this new situation.

\textsuperscript{126} DA 255.

\textsuperscript{127} See the Table of Contents on p. viii of DA.
knowledge" can be in fact become (7)'a temptation to unbelief'. Here are strong words for the great proponent of liberal knowledge and the cultivation of the mind – themes he was preaching in the Oxford University Sermons during those same years. Yet he forcefully denies that 'scientific pursuits', as central as they are to a liberal education, can be 'the instrument of an ethical training'. In his final letter, he both summarized his arguments, and unknowingly anticipated several themes that would be more fully developed in the Idea and in his educational projects as a Catholic. His faith and experience lead him to believe that knowledge does but occupy, does not form the mind; that apprehension of the unseen is the only known principle capable of subduing moral evil, educating the multitude, and organizing society; and that, whereas man is born for action, action flows not from inferences, but from impressions,—not from reasonings, but from Faith.

128 DA 255

129 DA 304; emphasis in the original.


131 DA 304.
Chapter Three

NEWMAN'S EDUCATIONAL FORMATION, WORK, AND WRITINGS: THE CATHOLIC PERIOD

Beautiful indeed and of great importance is the vocation of all those who aid parents in fulfilling their duties and who, as representatives of the human community, undertake the task of education. This vocation demands special qualities of mind and heart, very careful preparation, and continuing readiness to renew and adapt.

— Second Vatican Council

Now from first to last, education, in this large sense of the word, has been my line.

— John Henry Newman

1. Catholic Convert

1.1 'Gaudium de Veritate'

Newman believed that his dedication early in life to follow the 'kindly light' of truth resulted in his eventual conversion to the Catholic Faith. In his persistent quest, continual conversion, and commitment to education, he provides a model of the very purpose of Catholic education, as described by John Paul II: 'It is the honour of a Catholic University to consecrate itself without reserve to the cause of truth', and 'it shares that gaudium de veritate, so precious to Saint Augustine, which is that joy of searching for, discovering and communicating truth.'

---

1 GE 5.
2 AW 259.
3 ECE 4.
4 ECE 1.
Newman described his conversion in terms of dying and rising again, evoking an imagery of sadness yielding to a deep but subdued joy. He begins chapter four of the Apologia with these words: 'From the end of 1841, I was on my death-bed, as regards my membership with the Anglican Church, though at the time, I became aware of it only by degrees'. His novel about an Oxford convert, Loss and Gain, also speaks in a veiled autobiographical manner, about the loss of his cherished former life, juxtaposed with the joy of gaining what he believed to be 'the Church of the Fathers'.

When Newman withdrew to living quarters adjacent to his parish mission church in Littlemore with some close friends and disciples, he was becoming increasingly doubtful that his concept of the via media was in fact tenable. They led a monastic lifestyle there, for which they were severely criticised as Romanists in disguise. He devoted himself to a life of physical austerity, prayer (they read the full Divine Office each day from the Roman Breviary), and theological study. One of his chief logistical concerns in renovating what were formerly a granary and stables into their home was the provision of a proper library space for his thousands of books; never during his life did he seriously consider abandoning the life of the mind which was embodied in his cherished collection. His parochial duties at Littlemore included the oversight of the school he founded there. Keeping his parish school children ever in mind, he gave them new frocks and bonnets as a parting gift on the day of his resigna-

---

5 Loss and Gain: The Story of a Convert (1848). Hereafter cited as: LG

6 Diff. 1:367. See also his many letters written around the date of October 9, 1845, in LD 11:3-15 which echo this phrase, but give little indication of emotional enthusiasm.

7 The housing of his library is a recurring theme, whether at his rooms at Oriel, at Littlemore, Maryvale, the several sites of the Birmingham Oratory, or their final resting place at the Oratory in Edgbaston. Here Newman personally oversaw the design and construction of his custom library, which stands today much as he left it: a memorial and index to his lifetime pursuit of scholarship and the diffusion of knowledge.
From that day, 25 September 1843, Newman was to spend two more years in anxious prayer and study.

Early in 1845 Newman began writing *An Essay on the Development of Christian Doctrine*. What became perhaps his most important theological treatise was in fact the instrument of his final conversion to Rome. In writing the *Development* he sought to discover whether the Church of Rome as it developed over the centuries in her beliefs and practices was corrupted by incompatible accretions, or if it was consistent in her organic development. The labour of writing historical theology enabled him to clarify his thinking, clearing the way for him—as he put it to Pusey and others—to be received 'into what I believe to be the one and only fold of the Redeemer'. He became convinced that the Catholic Church stood in unbroken succession with the Church of the Fathers. In *Difficulties Felt by Anglicans*, Newman explains:

> the writings of the Fathers... have been simply and solely the one intellectual cause of his having renounced the religion in which he was born and submitted himself to her. If he is asked why he became a Catholic, he can only give that answer which experience and consciousness bring home to him as the true one, viz., that he joined the Catholic Church simply because he believed it, and it only, to be the Church of the Fathers...

Newman was received into the Catholic Church on October 9, 1845, by Fr. Dominic Barberi. Writing in the *Apologia* eighteen years later, Newman reflected on how his search for the truth, wherever it led him, had resulted in a deep sense of peace since his conversion to Catholicism. Newman explained his abiding joy in words that echo Augustine's and John Paul's references to *gaudium de veritate*:

---


9 LD 11:9.

10 Diff. 1:367.
I have been in perfect peace and contentment; I never have had one doubt. 
... it was like coming into port after a rough sea; and my happiness on that 
score remains to this day without interruption.\(^ {11}\)

1.2 Newman's Catholic Educational Vocation

When it became clear that Newman and his followers could no longer reside in Oxford or 
Littlemore, Wiseman, then President of Oscott College, offered them the house at Old 
Oscott, just north of Birmingham, as new quarters.\(^ {12}\) They moved there in February 1846, and 
Newman renamed the centre 'Maryvale'. In September Newman and his closest friend, 
Ambrose St John, were sent by Wiseman to Rome to study for the Catholic priesthood, in 
preparation for the second half of his life's work. It was a time of uncertainty. In his 13 
January 1847 letter from Rome to Mrs. Bowden, he reports that ‘my future line or, as you may 
say, my vocation is not yet clear to me’.\(^ {13}\) Of course by this time he had settled the question 
of his Catholic vocation (literally, 'calling'), but what was to become his particular religious 
way of life, and principal work? Looking back in 1863, he was able to identify that his 'line' 
was his ongoing commitment to the education of the Catholic laity:

Catholics in England, from their very blindness, cannot see that they are 
blind. To aim then at improving the condition, the status of the Catholic 
body, by a careful survey of their argumentative basis, of their position 
relatively to the philosophy and the character of the day, by giving them juster 
views, by enlarging and refining their minds, in one word, by education, is (in 
their mind) more than a superfluity or a hobby, it is an insult. It implies that 
they are deficient in material points. Now from first to last, education, in this 
large sense of the word, has been my line...\(^ {14}\)

\(^ {11}\) *Apo.* 214.

\(^ {12}\) The 'Old Oscott had become vacant after the seminary had moved to the nearby 'New 
Oscott' site.

\(^ {13}\) *LD* 12:12; emphasis added.

\(^ {14}\) *AW* 259; emphasis added. The context for this passage is that Newman is defending 
himself against those who fault him for not laying more stress on making converts, as, for example, 
Manning and Faber had (pp. 257-260). See also Robbins, *The Newman Brothers*, 123 ff., for Newman's
This statement of Newman's own self-understanding makes it clear that the mental
cultivation and spiritual edification of his fellow Catholics was indeed his life's primary
vocation.

Newman's fertile imagination and practical pastoral concerns often found their point
of integration in the proposals of his educational works. He envisioned many more
possibilities than were ever brought to pass. One of his earliest suggestions for Catholic
education was to have Bishop Wiseman establish a theological college and seminary at
Maryvale, to be run by the Oxford converts. Newman wrote in response to the proposal:

[What you mention about Maryvale becoming a College and the Seminary
of the District accords most perfectly with many thoughts and many wishes
that I have had].

Newman was 'taken by surprise' and 'overpowered by the extreme kindness and confidence'
of Wiseman's letter, and yet the plan was not to materialize, partly because Newman himself
soon came to realize that his suggestion was 'rash and ambitious'. He offers several reasons
why this work may not be suited to their present situation, including the anticipated distrust

15 Newman entertained the idea from his early days at Maryvale, as he was attempting to
discern their vocation there. He wrote to his fellow-convert J. D. Dalgarns in July of 1846 that
Maryvale would be better suited as a seminary than the (new) Oscott facility, because of the
distractions of youth doing pre-seminary studies there, together with the 'tribes of women and
visitors'. His advice to Dr. Wiseman would be to 'make Oscott a boy's School and no more, and...
send the Divines down to Maryvale'. He would 'make Maryvale the Seminary and Divinity school
... for the whole of England'. His enthusiasm began to wax: 'I see nothing except that the notion of
a theological school is a great idea'. Besides preparing men for the priesthood in the seminary, it
would have presumably offered instruction for the laity, with 'the express object of propagating the
faith ... and opposing heresy - whether by teaching, preaching, controversy, catechising etc etc' (LD

16 Newman's letters of 27 Nov. and 16 Dec. 1846 are not extant, but we have excerpts of
Wiseman's reply to them, and of Newman's response in LD 12:40-44.
of the Old Catholics of England towards the convert's motives and competencies for such a

As a Catholic priest, Newman continued to use the sermon as a means of education and catechesis, though he rarely wrote out the full text as in his Anglican years. The few sermons he did prepare texts for were typically for special occasions, as, for example, his 'Second Spring' sermon preached at Oscott to the first Synod of the restored English Catholic hierarchy, or his 'Intellect, the Instrument of Religious Training' sermon, preached in the new University Church in Dublin.

Soon after returning from Ireland in 1858, Newman found himself thrust into another educational endeavour: editing *The Rambler*, a Catholic lay intellectual periodical. The English bishops had found this liberal-minded journal offensive, but rather than censure it, they asked Newman to take over as editor. They hoped that he could moderate its tone, and he agreed to the experiment. In the same passage from his journal where he speaks of the education of Catholics as his constant preoccupation since his conversion, he explains with similar wording how he became associated with *The Rambler*. The journal's purpose was in some ways parallel to his own life's mission: 'from first to last, these have been the two objects of the Rambler,—to raise the status of Catholics, first by education, secondly by a philosophical

---

17 See LD 12:42.

18 Most of his Catholic sermons for which we have a full text can be found in: *Discourses for Mixed Congregations* [Mix.] (1849), *Sermons Preached on Various Occasions* [OS] (1857), and the posthumous collection, *Catholic Sermons* [CS] (1957). A collection of rough sermon outlines, including catechetical notes, was published in 1913 as *Sermon Notes* [SN].

19 Printed in OS.

20 Printed in OS. This sermon will be examined in chapter 4 as a key text for understanding Newman's religious conception of education.

21 AW 259; '... from first to last, education ... has been my line'; i.e., from about 1845-63, and by extension, the whole of his Christian ministry.
basis of argument'. Newman was taking on more than his already questionable reputation as a convert could reasonably bear, since *The Rambler* had previously attempted these goals— in his words: ‘injudiciously, intemperately, and erroneously, at least at times, . . .’ He therefore came ‘in for the odium of all *The Rambler*'s faults, and the more because for a little while [he] was Editor’.²²

As a convert to Catholicism with provocative ideas about education and the laity, Newman was understandably mistrusted by various religious parties throughout much of the second half of his life. Pope Leo XIII dramatically affirmed Newman's teaching and example by naming him a cardinal in 1879.²³ With this one gesture of honour, Newman felt that the Pope had lifted a cloud of mistrust that had followed him since his conversion.²⁴ Although there were lingering doubts, Catholics and Protestants both turned with new interest to the study of his life and teachings.

2. Oratorian Educator

2.1 Founder of the English Oratory

One of the obstacles to Newman's idea of operating a theological college and seminary at Maryvale had to do with the question of whether the converts would become secular priests or join one of the existing religious orders. Having come to believe that they needed 'some kind of rule', Newman wondered aloud in the letter to Wiseman already cited, 'what rule is

²² AW 259.

²³ See appendix one 'Synopsis' ('1879') for the background and chronology of Newman being named a Cardinal-Deacon.

²⁴ Newman said of this honour: 'His Holiness, when he first told me what was in prospect for me, sent me word that he meant this honour to be "a public and solemn testimony" of his approbation; also that he gave it in order to give pleasure to Catholics and to my countrymen' (Add. 185).
Newman's Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Catholic Period

compatible with a College? At the time he thought such work was best suited to Jesuits or seculars. While studying for the priesthood at the Collegio di Propaganda Fide in Rome, Newman and his close friend Ambrose St. John were wrestling with their vocation as a group. Should they become Jesuits, Redemptorists, Seculars, Oratorians? Many long discussions and consultations in Rome were related back and forth to their colleagues living at Maryvale, and to other correspondents. They finally decided that the Oratorian way of life was best suited to their background, with the expressed approval of Pius IX. Newman reflected on their decision in a later memorandum:

[W]hereas the tastes of all of us were very different, the Oratory allowed greater scope for them than any other Institution; again it seemed more adapted than any other for Oxford and Cambridge men.

The Oratory's flexibility allowed for a variety of apostolic activity, patterned after the life and ministry of its founder, Philip Neri (1515-1595). Neri is known as 'the Apostle of Rome' for his tireless work among all the classes of people in that great and needy Renaissance city of the sixteenth century. The manner of religious life he founded was

25 LD 12:43.
26 See, e.g. the letters of January and February 1847, where this question is ever present (LD 12).
27 Ambrose St. John reported in a letter of 23 February 1847 to Wiseman that 'the Pope . . . had at once expressed his approbation of it [an Oratorian vocation for the converts], as a means likely to be effective in itself, and also as particularly adapted to ourselves. His Holiness wished Mr Newman to specify such alterations as he wished in the rule in order that he might take them into consideration' (LD 12:52-3; emphasis in original).
29 The full name of the Oratory is: Congregation of the Oratory of St. Philip Neri, abbreviated 'C.O.'
30 For an overview and appraisal of Neri's life and work by Newman, see 'The Mission of St. Philip Neri', Sermon 12 (pp. 199-242) in OS. As regards Neri's example for Catholic educators, see Idea, the last section of Discourse 9, 'Duties of the Church Towards Knowledge', 199-202.
neither that of the secular diocesan priest, nor that of the religious friar or monk living under a rule and vow of obedience. Writing to Mrs. Bowden from Rome, Newman observes that 'the Rule of St. Philip' has no religious vows, so that the unity and discipline of the community must rely on 'the personal religiousness and mutual love of the members, for the well-being of the body'. He envisions labouring together in an 'active work' at the service of the working classes of Birmingham,\(^{31}\) while maintaining 'time for reading and writing' and, in imitation of Neri, 'to argue, to preach, to sing, and play, and to train young people'.\(^{32}\) The complementary works of education and evangelization are ever on his mind. Right from the beginning he contemplates them labouring as 'conductors of a seminary, or as missionaries for large towns'.\(^{33}\)

Murray highlights the educational mission of the Oratorians by saying Newman's words at a sermon 'preached at the opening of St Bernard's Seminary, Olton, in 1873 reflect the very way he 'directed the apostolate of the Oratory in two major directions',

... first of the educated world, scientific, literary, political, professional, artistic – and next of the mass of the town population, the two great classes on which the fortunes of England are turning: the thinking, speaking and acting England.\(^{34}\)

When Pius IX personally established the Congregation of the Oratory in England under Newman, the founding Papal Brief included these words:

We highly approve of the intention of Newman and his companions, who, while performing all the functions of the sacred ministry in England, have at the same time this specially in mind, to aim at doing whatever they think will best promote the cause of religion in the bigger cities, and among those in the

\(^{31}\) See LD 12:45.

\(^{32}\) LD 12:45; emphasis added.

\(^{33}\) LD 12:12.

\(^{34}\) NO 122, and note 1, p. 122.
higher ranks, the more learned, and generally among the more educated. Thus they will follow with great profit to the Church, the example of St Philip Neri, who did so much for religion in Rome ...35

Placid Murray explains that 'when Newman ... received the Foundation Brief from Pius IX, he discovered one phrase in it, which he had not suggested in the letter to Cardinal Fransoni, ...—the mention of an apostolate to the upper classes.36 The interpretation of this phrase figures prominently in the history of the Oratory's two houses in Birmingham and London, together with Newman's ministry to the educated upper classes at the Catholic University of Ireland and the Oratory School.37

Once back in England, Wiseman persuaded Newman to include another Oxford convert, F. W. Faber, and his followers in the young Oratorian foundation. Faber and his followers had begun a mission at St. Wilfrid's (Cotton Hall, Staffordshire). They were provisionally admitted as a group less than two weeks after the Oratory's founding on 1 February 1848. Separate residences were maintained at first, and in October, Newman left Maryvale for St. Wilfrid's, pending the opening of a Birmingham city-centre location. Three months later they moved into temporary quarters that Newman described as 'a gloomy gin distillery' on Alcester Street, Digbeth, Birmingham.

There were multiple differences and tensions from the beginning between Newman's and Faber's communities. David Newsome points out that 'the marriage between the two

35 NO 426-7; trans. Placid Murray. The words italicised for emphasis read in the brief's original Latin: 'inter splendioris, doctioris, et honestioris ordinis ...'

36 NO 99. Newman received the Brief on 27 November 1847. He had outlined his proposals in a formal letter to Fransoni, Prefect of the Papal Congregatio di Propaganda Fide, in February 1847. See NO 151-56 and LD 12:36-40.

37 The interpretation of this phrase is introduced at the relevant historical periods below. For a fuller discussion, see Newman's letter to Faber in LD 13:49-53, Trevor 2:191, and esp. Murray's analysis in NO 95-104.
groups was never a happy one. There were acute financial problems; the lay brothers frequently flouted the Rule; [and] there were constant carpings and bickerings'. Faber accused Newman of 'being indecisive as Superior', and others accused him of 'favouritism'.

The two leaders had different orientations to their newly embraced religion and Oratorian way of life. As but one example of disagreement, Faber did not think their current ministry in industrial Birmingham was the best way in the long run to fulfill the mission of their institute to minister to the educated upper classes as specified in the Papal Brief. Both men wanted to be true to their apostolate's charism, as they understood it. Dessain comments on the background of their differences:

Faber argued that the fixing of Newman and the first English Oratory in Birmingham was accidental, and that the clause which Pius IX inserted in the foundation Brief, telling the English Oratorians to care for the 'doctior et honestior ordo' was incompatible with it, and could only be fulfilled if Newman and the Oratorians moved to London.

Newman replied, 'When the Pope added 'ordo honestior etc.', of course one wishes to obey him literally, i.e., to see that his purpose is fulfilled'. But he held a broader view on this than Faber, reasoning that the phrase 'to aim at doing whatever they think will best promote the cause of religion in the bigger cities, and [i.e., including] among those in the higher ranks,

38 Newsome, Convert Cardinals, 201.

39 Cf. the Second Vatican Council's Decree on the Up-to-Date Renewal of the Religious Life (Perfectae Caritatis), no. 8: 'In the Church there are very many institutes, clerical and lay, engaged in different kinds of apostolic work and endowed with gifts which vary according to the grace that is given to them.' The question for Faber and Newman was regarding the precise nature of their apostolic work and unique gifts (charisms).


41 LD 13:50; emphasis in original.
etc.', would include their initial work among the lower and middle classes in Birmingham. He writes, 'if there be a class in Birmingham of sharp intellects, who are the recipients of political power, and who can be made Catholics, I think we are fulfilling the Brief, not only in letter as to Birmingham, but in spirit as to the ordo honestior'. Faber insisted on his interpretation to the Brief, which would allow for a possible future house to be established in London, since it was the largest and most important of 'the bigger cities'.

'Eventually the only possible solution was agreed upon', namely, to 'split into two communities, with Faber and seven other Oratorians moving to London'. Faber became Superior of this second house until his death in 1863. The two Oratories were to become increasingly estranged, largely due to differences in personality and religious emphases between the two superiors.

2.2 'The Fertile Intuitions of Saintly Founders'

During the early years of setting up the English Oratory, Newman provided for the catechesis of the poor and working classes, laid the ground work for various educational projects, and helped to found the Catholic University of Ireland, beginning in 1851. These educational activities give expression to what CSTTM calls 'the fertile intuitions of saintly founders' of 'those Religious Institutes which, according to their proper charism or specific apostolate, have dedicated themselves generously to education'.

42 NO 426; emphasis added.

43 LD 13:50.

44 Newsome, Convert Cardinals, 201.

45 CSTTM 13. An approved prayer for Newman's canonization suggests the identification of Newman as a 'saintly founder' with 'fertile intuitions' for Catholic education. Newman has in effect been identified as 'saintly' when he was declared 'Venerable' (i.e., one who practised 'virtue to an heroic degree') by the Church in 1991. The prayer reads in part: 'As writer, preacher,
The poor Catholic population came in large numbers to the Oratorian's mission at Alcester Street, despite the effort they and their children had to make to arrive for evening religious instruction after long work days. Within two weeks of their arrival, Newman wrote of '500 or 600 in Chapel last night—a sea (as they say) of heads'. There was little prospect for a day school, as children over the age of seven went 'to work—and are engaged till 8 in the evening'. Their pastoral activity was concentrated into 'a rush of all sorts from 7 to 9 p.m.'

During these hours they would see upwards of a hundred children crowding into their catechism classes. Evening lectures for the poor working class—including many refugee Irish from the Great Famine—and religious instruction of the young thus characterised these early years of activity in Birmingham.

Their earlier relocation from St. Wilfrid's into Birmingham had left St. Wilfrid's vacant, and the Oratorians wondered what to do with the large facility. Newman envisioned using it in a number of ways which could serve to promote unity between their two houses, including the establishment of a common 'Seminary, school, noviceship or College'. He suggested to Faber in 1849 that they set up a school for boys age twelve to eighteen, drawn counsellor, and educator, as pastor, Oratorian, and servant of the poor he laboured to build up your Kingdom' (prayer card published by the Birmingham Oratory, n.d.).

The Papal Brief identified the English Oratory's 'proper charism' and 'specific apostolate'. They were to be 'a society of men, outstanding in learning and holiness', that would form 'a continuous stream of gifted men'... that would do whatever they thought would 'best promote the cause of religion in the bigger cities, and inter splendidioris, doctioris, et honestioris ordinis'. ('Papal Brief', in NO 422, 426).

46 LD 13:26. They arrived 27 January. Newman is writing on 5 February, just 3 days after the official dedication of the new Oratory on 2 February, one year to the day of the founding of the first English Oratory at Maryvale. See LD 13:15, 16.

47 LD 13:44.

48 Ker, Biography, 344.

49 LD 13:142.
from among the working class youth of 'Brummagem' (Birmingham). In Newman's view, such a school was seen as a fitting mission for the Oratorians, and as a source for vocations:

I should like to see St Wilfrid's the Eton of the Oratory - a place where Fathers would turn with warm associations of boyhood or at least youth - a place where they were to be buried...

The vision of founding a school for Birmingham youth and Oratorian novices was not to become a reality at St. Wilfrid's. It was ten more years before the seeds of Newman's 'fertile intuitions' came to fruition along a different plan, when the Oratory School opened at their new home in Edgbaston, Birmingham, in 1859. During the intervening decade, Newman divided his time between his duties as superior of the Birmingham Oratory and as the founding Rector of the Catholic University of Ireland.

3. University Rector

3.1 Newman as Rector

The history of Newman's seven-year involvement with CUI has been adequately chronicled and evaluated from different perspectives in the sources reviewed in chapter one. The focus here will not be primarily in this story, but in the writings and specific policy decisions Newman made as Rector, that were based on explicitly theological premises. For example, chapter six examines Newman's organization of the university to ensure the religious nature of education

---

50 LD 13:143 (11 May 1849). This coincided with Newman's initial ideas which included an 'attempt to get hold of those classes which at present are anything or nothing, members of clubs, mechanics-institutes etc etc' (LD 12:45). Cf. the English bishops' statement from the same time period: 'Where there is a sufficient Catholic population to warrant it, we earnestly recommend the establishment of a middle school ... in which a good commercial and general education shall be given to the children of families in a better worldly position' (1852 Synodical Letter, cited in Whitehead, 'A View from the Bridge', 219).

51 LD 13: 142-43.

52 See pp. 29 ff.
through the pastoral rôle of the College communities and their Tutors. The following brief résumé will establish a context for examining the underlying theology of Newman’s Idea of a University.

In 1845 Parliament established three ‘Queen’s Colleges’ in Belfast, Cork, and Galway. They were federated in 1850 as the Queen’s University. The plan was endorsed by Newman’s old adversary in the Tamworth Reading Room debate, Prime Minister Sir Robert Peel. The idea behind the new colleges was to provide ‘mixed education’—meaning non-denominational—for Catholics and other Irishmen who could not meet the remaining confessional requirements at Trinity College, Dublin, Ireland’s only other university. But not only were religious tests removed for entrance; religious instruction itself was excluded from the curriculum. Only a minority of the Irish hierarchy were initially open to the idea as a compromise position, while the general opinion was in agreement with an 1847 rescript from Rome that condemned the ‘godless’ colleges, as being unworthy of Catholic youths. For five years various proposals were drafted in response to the plan, and correspondence went back and forth to Rome, until at the 1850 Plenary Synod of Thurles (presided over by Cullen as papal delegate) the Irish hierarchy formerly condemned the three colleges, and proposed that in their place, ‘a sound and comprehensive system of University Education’ be set up, founded on Catholic principles. The Synod also appointed a three-member Catholic University Committee to help launch the new institution. Archbishop Paul Cullen of Armagh (translated to the see of Dublin in 1852) exercised the presidency for the group. In their 1851 report, the committee called for the establishment of a university which would make the Catholic religion the basis of a system of academical education as extensive and diversified as any to be found in the most distinguished universities of Europe, so that the youth of the country may enjoy all the
They also envisioned that the University would be ‘destined for the benefit, not merely of the Catholics of Ireland, but, for that of the Catholics of the empire’. A University for English speaking Catholics was welcomed at the time by the bishops of England and Wales. Maurice Whitehead describes their attitude and hopes towards CUI:

Though the bishops considered the creation of a Catholic university in England 'higher than we can dare', they were supportive of the enterprise then being undertaken by their brethren in Ireland in the creation of a new Catholic University in Dublin under the rectorship of Dr John Henry Newman. Their hope was that the success of the Irish venture would provide an important addition to the existing continuum of Catholic educational provision by offering the possibility of Catholic higher education to those English and Welsh students who might eventually be sufficiently qualified to avail themselves of it.

On 15 April 1851, Cullen wrote for Newman's advice regarding the proposed Catholic University of Ireland in Dublin, and to see if he 'could spare time to give us a few lectures on education'. In July Cullen paid two visits to Newman in Birmingham. Between

53 Address of the Catholic University Committee to the People of Ireland (Dublin, 1851), p. 7, in Catholic University of Ireland. Addresses Issued by the Committee during the years 1850 and 1851 (Dublin, 1852; hereafter, CUI Committee Addresses). Cited in Idea, xxiv.

54 Address of the Catholic University Committee to the Catholic Clergy and Laity of England, pp. 4-5, in CUI Committee Addresses. Cited in Idea, xxiv. In Catholics and Higher Education, McClelland makes a case that Newman was overly concerned to create a university that all English speaking men might attend (summarized in the chapter, 'Newman's Idea', 96-119), contrary to the manifest will of the Irish hierarchy's 'idea', which was 'A Catholic University for Ireland' (see chapter by this same title, 87-95.) The Irish bishops did naturally emphasize the goal of an Irish university for the Irish.

Newman was largely ignorant of the Irish, and in retrospect, he felt he 'had no call simply to labour for Irish Catholics' (LD 26:58). But he does have some backing here from the Synod's documents. See also McGrath, Newman's University, 148: 'In 1852, the [University] Committee, in its report signed by the four archbishops of Ireland, as well as by four representative bishops, had spoken of the Pope's intention that the University should provide for those parts of 'the old and new world, where the English language is spoken,' and announced that all the bishops of the English-speaking world had rallied to the Pope.' Newsome claims that: 'From this initial ambiguity, all the tensions and frustrations of the seven years of Newman's Rectorship really sprang' (Convert Cardinals, 215).

the two calls, he consulted with Manning, William Monsell, and J.R. Hope (later Hope-Scott) in London about the University, and became convinced that Newman was the right candidate to move the project forward. On his second visit, he asked Newman to be the first president, and Newman eventually accepted, being convinced by his fellow Oratorians that he would be able to sufficiently look after both the university and the Oratory.  

56 He was appointed with the title of Rector by the bishops, given confirmation by Pius IX, and installed after many delays in June 1854. For the next four years he divided his time between Dublin and Birmingham, where he maintained his headship over the Oratory on a part-time basis. By his own count, he 'crossed St. George's Channel 56 times in the service of the University'—a pace that eventually wore him down, and resulted in his diminished effectiveness on both islands. His time and attention were in constant demand by Cullen and the Oratorians.

His many accomplishments are well documented in the Letters and Diaries and summarized in McGrath's Newman's University, Ideal and Reality. He was tireless, for example, in his recruitment of faculty and students, and was intimately involved in every aspect of establishing the curriculum, residential policies, and financial dealings. Laymen were actively sought for all levels of positions, often to the chagrin of Cullen and others of the clergy. He

56 By personally adding the special mission to the ordo honestior, etc., Pope Pius IX had demonstrated his intention for Newman to minister to the educated upper classes, as a central concern of his Oratorian work. This partly explains his willingness to become Rector of the new Catholic University of Ireland at the invitation of the Irish bishops and his appointment by the Pope (Campaign xiv), even though it caused great strains on his supervision of the Birmingham Oratory during his periods of Dublin residence. Of course on another level, Newman was delighted to be attached once again to a university.

57 McGrath, Newman's University, 473.

58 He was especially keen to recruit professors who were both Catholic, to insure the Catholic identity of the University (cf. LD 15:283, and chapter 6.2.2 'Teachers and Administrators', below.), and 'men of celebrity' in their own academic fields, 'as the only secular inducement to bring students to us in preference to the government colleges' (LD 18:578).
gave special priority to the building of a University Church as the spiritual heart of the University, where it would symbolize 'the indissoluble union of philosophy and religion'.

On another level, however, David Newsome speaks for many who would judge Newman's years in Dublin 'very much more a failure than a success'. But he hastens to add that,

when one attempts to make a final assessment of Newman's seven-year struggle to achieve a great work for which he was temperamentally unsuited, and against impossible odds, a phrase of A. L. Smith, writing of the impetuous idealism of the medieval re\textit{publica Christiana}, comes to mind: 'there are some failures which are greater than success'.

Newsome looks to the writing of the \textit{Idea of a University} as Newman's most enduring achievement in Dublin, owing to its 'timeless nobility'. He agrees with G. M. Young that the \textit{Idea} represents one of the great literary contributions to civilization. Among the causes of Newman's relative 'failure', Newsome notes that: 'The Catholic schools in England failed to send him students; the government would not grant the university a charter' that would enable them to grant degrees; 'and Rome itself proved a broken reed, having originally called

---

\textit{Campaign} 290. See also pp. lxv, 291, and 305 for Newman's priorities in erecting a University Church as an sacramental presence and continual 'advertisement' to the public, for worship and large formal convocations.

\textit{Newsome}, Convert Cardinals, 217-8. The Smith quotation is from \textit{Church and State in the Middle Ages} (Oxford, 1913), 135. William Doolin emphasises the odds at work against Newman, together with Newman's own limited goal of being more of a founder than a builder: 'Was Newman's mission in Ireland the "sublime failure" which Sir Shane Leslie would have us consider it? Some there are would answer "yes--and yet no." My answer is, emphatically, \textit{No!}} With his deep knowledge of the growth and history of Europe's universities, none saw so clearly from the outset the immensity, the near-impossibility of the task that had been laid upon him by Rome. "It is enough for me if I do so much as merely begin"' ('Newman and his Medical School', \textit{Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review} (Summer 1953):168.

\textit{Newsome}, Convert Cardinals, 217.
the university in existence". He then cites portions of Newman's often quoted words which foreshadowed an increasing disappointment with the human limitations of the episcopacy and papacy. A fuller citation from the *Autobiographical Writings* reveals Newman's later state of mind in contrast with his initial enthusiasm for the Pope's mandate for a Catholic University of Ireland:

I can not help thinking in particular, that, if he had known more of the state of things in Ireland... then at least he would have abstained from decreeing a Catholic University. I was a poor innocent as regards the actual state of things in Ireland when I went there, and did not care to think about it, for I relied on the word of the Pope, but from the event I am led to think it not rash to say that I knew as much about Ireland as he did.

C. S. Dessain cites an excessive and conflicting control of the Irish hierarchy as a factor that worked against the University's success. Newman complained of Cullen's 'reign of impenetrable silence'. Cullen had a habit of not answering Newman's letters, and was unbearably slow in appointing a Vice-Rector. The difficulties he had in finding a balance between the conflicting expectations among the Irish bishops was presaged by what Ian Ker identified as 'three different points of view that Newman had encountered among the hierarchy when he commenced his series of lectures:

---


63 Cf. Discourse One, where Newman waxes eloquent defending the providential hand of God working through 'not only the Bishops of Ireland, great as their authority is, but the highest authority on earth, from the Chair of St. Peter'. The decision should therefore be 'heartily accepted and obeyed. ... it not only demands our submission, but has a claim upon our trust' (*Idea* 26).

64 AW 320.

Dr. Cullen was interested only in a strictly religious education,66 Dr. MacHale67 wanted an Irish university, and Dr. Murray, the then Archbishop of Dublin, was the leader of the minority party that had favoured accepting the Queen's Colleges.68 Somehow Newman had to satisfy all three parties.69 In truth, Newman's assignment as founding Rector was even more complicated. He was attempting to produce virtually ex nihilo, a new university drawing from the various models of Oxbridge, the upper forms of English Public schools, Roman seminaries, the newer German universities, professional training schools, and especially 'the pattern of the University of Louvain', which served as a model for CUI's constitution.70

In the end, neither his 1852 Discourses nor his actual administration of the University (1854-58) satisfied any of the bishops to the extent they might have wished. Newman resigned November 12, 1858, seven years after his initial appointment. He continued to

66 By which is meant, education that is founded in the Catholic religion, but certainly not limited to religious instruction per se. Cullen's reputation for wanting a 'seminary' education for the laity is often repeated, but not well documented. See Culler's discussion of this, including his quotation from CUI professor E. Butler: 'their [the Irish bishops] idea was a glorified seminary for the laity' (Culler, 261). The bishops were products, of course, not primarily of universities, but of seminaries. Cullen was trained in, and had spent the majority of his life, in Rome, as a student at Propaganda, then as Vice Rector and Rector of the Irish College. See McGrath's profile of Cullen in Newman's University, 93-6.

67 Archbishop MacHale of Tuam, an Irish Nationalist. He was suspicious of all non-Irish appointments, and jealous of Cullen's control of the University.

68 Queen's University seemed to be the most expeditious way to provide a university education for Irish Catholics by this faction. Catholic chaplaincies were set up in the three Colleges to offset the 'mixed' atmosphere.

69 Ker, Introduction to Idea, xxxi.

70 Campaign 58. See also Ian Ker, 'The Idea of a Catholic University', Louvain Studies 21 (1996), 204, for a discussion of how Louvain, and not Oxford, was Newman's working model for CUI. Louvain combined the Oxford college and tutorial system with the continental professorial university system. 'The fact that Louvain was a newly-reconstituted Catholic university 'was the ostensible reason why Louvain was chosen as the model for Newman's University.'
consult for the University as needed, and made contributions to The Atlantis,\textsuperscript{71} a scholarly journal he had founded to encourage the professors to publish their original research and to advertise the University.\textsuperscript{72} After Newman’s departure, the Catholic University was to survive for another twenty years in its original constitution, and then to take new life in different forms.\textsuperscript{73}

The first of these new forms was a result of the 1879 Bill which dissolved the Queen’s University, replacing it with the Royal University of Ireland. This new university was purely an examining body. For the . . . [CUII] students it meant that university degrees were now open to them. . . . [CUII] was reconstituted as ‘University College’ . . . [in 1882\textsuperscript{74}] to take advantage of the degrees and fellowships now available and placed [in 1883\textsuperscript{75}] in the hands of Jesuit Fathers.\textsuperscript{76}

University College ‘continued for twenty-three years to give effective expression to the ideals for which Newman had laboured’,\textsuperscript{77} until it became a part of the National University of

---

\textsuperscript{71} See Blehl, Catalogue, for a listing of his articles printed in The Atlantis over the course of 13 years, 1857-70.

\textsuperscript{72} See chapter 5.1.3, ‘Research and Service’, below, for a discussion of Newman’s purpose for The Atlantis, which he claimed was ‘not of a local nature, but worldwide in the most emphatic way, increasing the “celebrity” of the Professors of the University, and making them useful to the literary and scientific world, even though they had no classes of students themselves’ (see LD 18:578; the passage quoted here was first published 6 March 1858 in the fifth of six articles entitled, ‘The Catholic University’. Reprinted with a few omissions in Campaign 345.8 1, and in full in appendix one of LD 18).

\textsuperscript{73} McGrath, Newman’s University, 490. For a history of the University after Newman’s departure, see pp. 490-6.

\textsuperscript{74} McGrath, Newman’s University, 493.

\textsuperscript{75} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{76} Meenan, P. N., ‘The Medical School: The First Phase’, a reprint from UCD News (November 1980):4. A brief history by Prof. Meenan, who was then Dean, Faculty of Medicine, UCD.

\textsuperscript{77} McGrath, Newman’s University, 494.
Ireland system established in 1908-9. University College Dublin (UCD) is now an independent, non-sectarian institution. The Medical School of which Newman was so proud, 'provides a direct link between the present University College [Dublin] and the Catholic University . . . It shares this link with the Literary and Historical Society but can, in fact, claim an unbroken succession.' It stands as a testimony of Newman's care to provide for both the professional and liberal arts education of his students.79

3.2 Newman's University Writings

Newman's leading role in the Dublin experiment occasioned a small flood of writings, as he attempted to establish the philosophy, curriculum, policies, regulations, and Catholic ethos for the enterprise. Many of these writings were collected and edited by Newman in the Idea, Campaign, and Rise and Progress of Universities.80 Something of the complex writing and publishing history of these educational works can be discerned from appendices one and three.81 Extended introductory studies and commentaries already exist for the Idea.82 This introductory narrative of Newman's university texts will therefore be limited to a brief orientation to their historical background, their somewhat confusing publishing history and

---

78 Meenan, 'The Medical School', 2.

79 See Doolin, 'Newman and his Medical School', 151-168; and Meenan, 'The Medical School'.

80 Rise and Progress is now the first section of Historical Sketches, vol. 3.)

81 Appendix one, 'Synopsis of the Life, Work, and Times of John Henry Newman', traces in the third and fourth columns periods and events regarding the writing, editing, and publishing of his major works. Special attention is paid to his educational writings. The fifth column highlights contemporary educational writings and events, e.g., the founding of University College, London in 1827, and the publishing of J. Huxley's The Educational Value of the Natural Sciences in 1854. Appendix three, 'Publishing History of The Idea of a University', provides more detail for the genesis and development of all the component parts, culminating in a unified whole.

82 See, e.g., the discussion and notes in chapter one, section 2.3, 'Secondary Literature'.
Newman was pleased to accept Cullen’s invitation to ‘give [the Catholics of Dublin] a few lectures on education’, to provide a climate of dialogue and anticipation for the proposed university. He delivered the first five of the original ten Discourses between 10 May and 7 June 1852, and the remaining five were written (but never publicly delivered) between 21 July and 20 November. As soon as each one was prepared, the individual Discourses and an appendix of illustrations were published separately as pamphlets during 1852, with the title, Discourses on University Education, Addressed to the Catholics of Dublin. In February 1853, the individual discourses were bound together without separate title pages, under the new title, Discourses on the Scope and Nature of University Education. Addressed to the Catholics of Dublin. In 1859 Newman made further revisions and omissions, as he reissued the collection under the title, The Scope and Nature of University Education; or, University Teaching Considered in its Abstract Scope and Nature, Second Edition.

---

83 LD 14:257, note 2.
84 See LD 15:xiii.
85 Each pamphlet bore this series title, the Discourse number and title, and the publisher (James Duffy). Pagination was continuous.
86 It included a new title page and dedication, a thirty-page preface, and two-pages of corrigenda.
87 Published by Longman, Green, Longman, and Roberts. See Blehl, Bibliographical Catalogue, 59; Ker, Introduction to Idea, xxxvi; and appendix 3.1. This edition retained the preface, but dropped the lengthy appendix. Discourse Five was deleted as being unnecessary, and Discourses One and Two were rewritten as a new Discourse One, ‘Theology a Branch of Knowledge’. See Idea xxxii-xxxix for a detailed analysis and critique of why Discourse Five was deleted.
The Discourses present Newman handling two arguments simultaneously. He makes the case for university education to include theology as a branch of knowledge, while at the same time insisting that the new university must offer more than a seminary-like education that would focus on philosophy and theology to disadvantage of the liberal arts, natural sciences, and professional studies. He argues against Catholic participation in the Queen’s Colleges, on the basis of their exclusion of theology from the curriculum. This was his assignment from Cullen, who had written to Newman that what Ireland needed was for him to help ‘persuade the people that education should be religious’, since the ‘whole tendency’ of the ‘new systems is to make it believed that education may be so conducted as to have nothing at all to do with religion’. He chose to approach it primarily on philosophical, rather than theological grounds; i.e., on the basis of natural reason, rather than faith. Addressing himself to an unfamiliar audience with a plurality of views on education, he decided to maintain a neutral ground in the Irish setting, by appealing to his English educational experience, and of the ongoing philosophical controversies at Oxford: ‘the subject of Liberal Education, and of the principles on which it must be conducted, has ever had a hold upon my own mind’. The Discourses proceed to draw upon Newman’s reflections on his educational experience at Oxford, and his studies into the history of universities and the liberal arts tracing back to Athens. His Dublin audience gave him the occasion for a Catholic development of his Anglican writings like the Oxford University Sermons and The Tamworth Reading Room, where he had already argued so vigorously for the ‘unconditional

88 LD 14:364-5, and note 2; emphasis added. Cullen’s words were in answer to Newman’s letter of 16 September 1852 where he enquired of ‘the state of public opinion and knowledge in Ireland on the subject of education, and of [Cullen’s] own ideas what Lectures ought to be about, in order to be useful’ (LD 14:357-8; emphasis added).

89 Idea 19.
insistence on the absolute value of knowledge and education on the one hand, and on the
other hand his no less firm conviction that in themselves they are emphatically less important
than religion and religious faith'.

_Catholic University Gazette._ For a new Catholic university to take root in Irish soil,
Newman was convinced that he would need to educate not only the enrolled students, but
the general population and the hierarchy as well. Towards this end he launched the _Catholic
University Gazette_ as one of his first orders of business. His two goals were to 'indoctrinate
the Irish people in the idea of a University' and to give a public face to this fledgling
institution. The _Gazette_ ran as an eight page weekly from 1 June 1854 until 8 March 1855,
continuing as a monthly until 6 December 1855, when it was discontinued. Newman himself
was the editor for the first 31 issues, before being succeeded by Robert Ormsby, one of the
classics professors.

_Lectures and Essays on University Subjects._ In 1859 Newman brought together under
one cover eight of the lead articles from the _Gazette_, together with the text of two additional
university lectures. The purpose of this volume was to serve as a companion to the _Discourses_.
Entitled _Lectures and Essays on University Subjects_, they complement the philosophical
_Discourses_ by illustrating how particular branches of knowledge play their respective rôles
in the curriculum. Subjects like literature, medical science, and the natural sciences are
considered in terms of their distinctive methodologies, and their relations to the Christian
faith. Often overlooked in favour of the _Discourses_, the _Lectures and Essays_ are no mere

90 Ker, _Genius of Newman_, 2.

91 The first issue appeared just four days after his installation as Rector on Whitsunday, 4
June. It was back-dated 1 June (AW 332).

92 See Michael Tierney, _Introduction to University Sketches_ by John Henry Newman, text of
scattered *addenda*, but were collectively conceived by Newman as the complementary, practical illustrations of his theories presented in the *Discourses*.

**The Idea of a University.** These lectures and essays were revised, and put in a slightly different order for Newman's 1873 uniform edition of the work, where they were placed for the first time with *The Scope and Nature of University Education*, and given the new title: *The Idea of a University Defined and Illustrated. I. In Nine Discourses Delivered to the Catholics of Dublin. II. In Occasional Lectures and Essays Addressed to the Members of the Catholic Community*. Newman then provided yet two more categories for the title page of each part: 'I. University Teaching Considered in Nine Discourses', and 'II. University Subjects, Discussed in Occasional Lectures and Essays.' Occasionally these two parts are referred to by the shortened rubrics, 'University Teaching' and 'University Subjects'.

By combining the *Discourses* with the *Lectures and Essays*, Newman provided his readers with a collection that was at once more conveniently accessible and more conceptually complete and integrated. Taken together, the two parts form a complementary unity of his 'idea', providing as they do, the abstract 'definitions' of university teaching, with the admixture of practical 'illustrations' of how the theory applies to the teaching of the content subjects. This marriage of theory and practice produced what most students of the genre would consider an educational classic, and one of history's ablest treatments of

---

93 Newman himself used these shortened titles on the separate contents pages for each part of the 1873 *Idea* (pp. xxiii and 247). O'Connell (p. 17), Shuster (p. 19), and Svaglic (p. i) use them in their combined contents pages for their editions. Ker highlighted yet another recognized grouping – based on the full subtitle of the *Idea* – by referring in his combined contents page for the whole volume to: 'I. Discourses' and 'II. Lectures and Essays' (vii). He retained 'University Teaching' and 'University Subjects' on the title pages to each part, and in their separate contents pages. See appendices 3.1 and 3.2, below. See also pp. 174 ff., below, for an analysis of the importance of these titles in understanding Newman's place for teaching and research in a university.
Christian humanism. The unending stream of new editions and reprints of the Idea attest to its enduring value, whether one agrees with Newsome, that its 'timeless nobility' lies in its speaking 'of things in the past rather than things to come', or with McGrath, who argues that 'the Discourses contain very much that is extraordinarily applicable to all our present day educational problems'. Newman himself considered the collected Discourses at the time to be one of his 'two most perfect works, artistically', even though he complained in his letters that they tried him 'more than any thing [he] ever did', to the point of damaging his health. Looking back in 1869, Newman recognized the combined volume of the Idea as one of his 'five constructive books'.

**Rise and Progress of Universities.** Newman collected twenty essays that first appeared in the 1854 issues of the Gazette, into a book published in 1856, originally entitled Office and Work of Universities. When he edited this collection for inclusion to his uniform edition he renamed it 'Rise and Progress of Universities', making it part I of Historical Sketches, volume three (1872). But the publishing history does not stop here: 'They were also published in 1902 ... under the title University Sketches--then apparently given them for the first time--and with

---

94 G. M. Young, *e.g.*, considered Newman's handling of the counter claims of 'intellectual cultivation as a good in itself ... to be prized and esteemed for itself beyond all knowledge and all professional skill' as over and against its moral inadequacy and 'the need to be steadied and purified by religion', to be 'the final utterance of Christian Humanism; as if the spirit evoked by Erasmus had found its voice at last' (*Last Essays* [London, 1950]).

95 Newsome, *Convert Cardinals*, 218.

96 McGrath, *Consecration of Learning*, 295.

97 *LD* 15:226. The other work was *Lectures on the Present Position of Catholics in England* (Prespos.).

98 *LD* 15:92. In the Advertisement to the 1859 edition he admits that it 'gave him less satisfaction when written, than any of his Volumes'.

99 *LD* 24:398-9; he was writing in 1869.
Netanan's Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Catholic Period

a pleasant introduction by George Sampson. Tierney reprinted the 1856 text in 1962 under this same title, and thus these twenty essays have three different collective titles. Rise and Progress treats the history of the university idea, as it first found expression in ancient Athens, right through the cathedral schools and early universities of the Medieval Ages, to the rise of modern universities. The perceived importance of these essays is highlighted by the inclusion of three of them in the Harvard Classics collection, under the rubric of ‘The Idea of a University’, and yet no excerpts from the Idea itself are included to illustrate Newman’s educational ideals. In his own words, he aimed at a description of

the nature, the character, the work, the peculiarities of a University, the aims with which it is established, the wants it may supply, the methods it adopts, what it involves and requires, what are its relations to other institutions, and what has been its history.

Memorandum about My Connection with the Catholic University. From November 1870 to May 1873, Newman wrote and edited private memoranda concerning his university experience. Dessain remarks that these carefully researched and edited records represent 'his considered view, fifteen years after' his official resignation in 1858. They were finally published in full as the last section of Autobiographical Writings. W. Ward quotes from them

---

100 Tierney, Introduction to University Sketches, xvi.

101 Unless otherwise noted, all references to these essays will be to the uniform edition found in HS 3.


103 HS 3:4

104 AW 279.

105 AW 277-333. The introduction to the Memorandum was written by Dessain. Newman had foreseen, if not actually planned for, the Memorandum's publication as part of the university papers; see Campaign xxxv.
in his *Life of Cardinal Newman*, using a tentative title he gave them: 'Retrospective Notes'. ¹⁰⁶ McGrath more precisely calls them the 'Memoandum'. ¹⁰⁷

**My Campaign in Ireland.** Anticipating that there would be future interest in the founding and outworking of the Catholic University, Newman began preparing and collecting documentation of the same. In reference to his failed attempt to hire Orestes Brownson as a professor,¹⁰⁸ Newman observed that 'the Dublin University papers' would be helpful in evaluating their correspondence and Brownson's views. Newman's executor, Fr. William Neville of the Oratory, describes how this historical question prompted him to say that the whole collection might be called *My Campaign in Ireland*. It consists of a variety of papers—also, a brief *Narrative of Events*, and correspondence. He thought that they might be published at any time, for there was nothing compromising in them to any one.¹⁰⁹

In 1896 Neville printed for private circulation a large collection of these university documents that Newman had collected, as a first volume of at least two projected volumes. This explains the subtitle: *My Campaign in Ireland. Part I: Catholic University Reports and Other Papers*.¹¹⁰ This first part remains the only volume of the proposed series that has thus far been brought to light. Some of the other material projected by either Newman or Neville or both for inclusion in the series has since found its way into print. The *Memoandum* was published

¹⁰⁶ See, e.g., Ward 1:320 and 2:620.

¹⁰⁷ *Newman's University*, ix-x. He describes the collection as 'a manuscript memorandum of 172 quarto pages, followed by an appendix of 654 quarto pages' of letters Newman selected to illustrate the University's history. Dessain corrects the total number of these transcript selections to '657 pages' (AW 279).

¹⁰⁸ An historical and philosophical comparison between Newman and the American convert, Brownson, with regard to their developing educational views is made by Vincent Ferrer Blehl in: 'John Henry Newman and Orestes A. Brownson as Educational Philosophers', *Recusant History* 23, no. 3 (May 1997): 408-417.

¹⁰⁹ *Campaign*, xxxv.

¹¹⁰ The title page bears the following information for this posthumous work: 'Printed for private circulation only by A. King & Co., printers to the University, Aberdeen', 1896.
as a whole in Autobiographical Writings; other elements have come to light through the Letters and Diaries project and by references in secondary works.

The value of Campaign as a primary source for this study is readily apparent. This rare volume contains: the original Latin documents from Pius IX and Propaganda Fide to the bishops of Ireland 'Relating to the Erection of the University'; Newman's annual reports to the bishops; assorted university accounting reports, lists, and declarations; deleted passages from the Idea; selected correspondence to and from Newman on university matters; and a 'Note on J. H. Newman's Preaching and Influence at Oxford'. This latter piece is an appendix of twenty-eight pages which gives witness to Newman's 'pedagogy of personal influence', as experienced by his contemporaries in Oxford.

4. School Leader

4.1 Founder and Teacher

Returning home from Ireland for the last time in November 1858 must have been a bitter-sweet time for Newman. He had experienced only limited success at Dublin by anyone's measure, and was ready to throw himself back onto English soil and the work of the

111 There are well over 4,000 letters now in print in LD, having to do either directly or indirectly with the University. See McGrath, Newman's University, x, and appendix two, 'Summary Table of Newman's Letters and Diaries'. LD vols. 14-18 (Jan 1850-Dec 1858) contain the bulk of these letters. These vols. also contain his brief journal entries from the period of his initial contact with Cullen in 1851, until his official resignation in November 1858.

112 Including: Cathedra Sempiterna, which contains portions deleted by Newman from the original Discourse I, in praise of St. Peter and the Papacy. It had appeared in this excerpted form as a contribution to a book presented to Pius IX for his Jubilee: Omaggio Catholico in Varie Lingue ai Principi degli Apostoli Pietro e Paolo, ed. Fr. Valerian Cardella, S.J. (Rome: E. Linimerghhi, 1867), 82-84. As noted above, Newman had come to have a less enthusiastic outlook towards the sagacity of the Pope in matters of prudential judgement as first expressed in this extract, based on his experience in Ireland, where Newman thought the Pope's interventions at times seemed to prove premature, if not misinformed.

113 See chapter 6.4 for a development of this topic.
Oratorians in Birmingham. Beside their normal parochial duties in running a parish, the Oratory had begun working among the local poor. They 'had the care of the Birmingham workhouse served by Fr Flanagan, and Caswall had begun a poor mission at Smethwick'. There were plans for a government-aided girls' school, and an orphanage was opened in 1857. An ill-fated hospital was founded in Edgbaston by the Oratorians in 1856, with two of its first nurses dying from diseases contracted from patients. The oversight of each of these missions was assigned by the Superior to particular Oratorians. These various apostolates of the brothers are suggestive of what CSTTM calls 'the unreserved and gratuitous “gift” of self to the service of others in the spirit of their religious consecration'. Each mission had Newman's blessing and support. But 'the education of the sons of gentlemen' was the object of Newman's particular interests, and stronger personal gifts. He also desired a school that would feed into the Catholic University, which had struggled in part from its lack of enrollment and specifically English support.

It did not take long for him to take back up the idea of establishing a Catholic school for boys, as he had contemplated a decade before. Beginning in 1857, Newman had been in correspondence with his fellow Oratorians and some of the Oxford convert parents, led by Edward Bellasis, about the prospects for a school. Their joint concern was to provide an

114 Gilley, Newman and his Age, 299.
115 See LD 17:475, 492.
117 For Newman's interventions on behalf of the Oratorian hospital in Edgbaston, and of its early obstacles, see LD 17: xvii, 420, 482, 491-3, 538.
118 CSTTM 13; although not consecrated Religious in a strict sense, Oratorians do fall under the rubric in canon law of 'Religious Institutes'.
119 LD 18:244.
education for their sons that would compare with what they had received as youths in the Protestant public schools, to prepare them to make a positive impact on British society, while strengthening their Catholic faith and witness. Once established, the school had an appeal beyond this initial circle of English converts. Within a year of their founding, for example, Newman listed by name six families (among others unnamed: ‘etc.’) in Ireland who were already sending their sons to the School, in a letter to yet another Irish enquirer.

The history of the founding and growth of the school is a complex one, far beyond the scope of this brief introduction. It has been treated in the sources reviewed in chapter one. For our immediate purpose of setting the stage for later references to his work at the School for thirty years, the following observations are relevant. Newman was the founder, at times the chief administrator, and a pastor, teacher, and rôle model for the school for one third of his life. Unlike his university work which survives today only in a form largely unrecognizable from its explicitly Catholic roots, the Oratory School has grown into one of the larger and more important Catholic public schools for boys in the United Kingdom. It was first established in 1859 and housed in the Oratory complex in Edgbaston. Following two of the Newman's long-term plans for the School, it relocated to the country (Caversham Park in

120 Wiseman and the English bishops generally believed at the time that the sons of well-to-do families were already taken care of in the established independent schools run by Religious Orders at Downside, etc. They initially opposed the Oratory School, based in part on the desire not to dilute the efforts of the existing schools. They also held a priority of establishing schools for the emerging Catholic middle classes, to complement the provisions for the upper and lower classes already in place or underway. The Poor School Committee had been set up 12 years before in 1847. See McClelland, 'A Catholic Eton' (which also addresses Faber’s opposition to the school, based on his interpretation of their Oratorian mission), and Whitehead, 'A View from the Bridge', section: 'Education for All', 219.

121 LD 20:68. Letter to Miss Holmes of 22 November 1861, at the request of an Irish parent.

122 See note 107 on page 35 for a short review of the studies by Shrimpton, Mohnen, Nash, McClelland, and Cornwell.
Newman's Educational Foundation, Work, and Writings: The Catholic Period

117

1922), and in 1931 it became lay-run. In 1942 it was moved to a former country estate in Woodcote, about twenty miles south of Oxford. It is now independent from the Birmingham Oratory, although a conscious, even reverent remembrance of the School’s origins and founder is fostered through the annual Oratory School Magazine, multiple school traditions, and the chaplaincy.\(^{123}\)

A draft of the first prospectus of the School printed 21 February 1859 announced the short-lived original name: ‘Edgbaston Catholic School’. This was changed to ‘School of the Oratory, Edgbaston’ (or ‘Oratory School’ for short) within a year. The same document announced the purpose and founding of the school, with ecclesiastical approval:

> It is the intention of Father Newman, of the Birmingham Oratory, with the blessing of God, to commence on the 1 of May next\(^{124}\) a School for the education of boys, not destined to the ecclesiastical state, and not above twelve years of age on their admission.

> He takes this step at the instance of various friends, with the concurrence and countenance of a number of Catholic gentlemen whose names have been transmitted to him, and with the approbation and good will of the Right Rev. the Bishop of the Diocese.\(^{125}\)

Bishop Ullathorne’s initial reaction to the school in January 1858 was positive: ‘not only did the bishop not object, but he actually welcomed the prospect of a separation of Catholic schools from seminaries’, just as the converts had desired. But he then hesitated ‘partly perhaps because Wiseman (influenced by Faber) was against it, and partly because he was afraid the discipline would be too lax.’\(^{126}\) In the end, Ullathorne as the local Ordinary gave

\(^{123}\) Based on the author’s several visitations on campus (1994-2000), and interviews with A. J. Tinkel, school archivist; Andrew and Dora Nash, school masters; and Msgr. V. F. J. Morgan, C.B.E., former school chaplain.

\(^{124}\) Inserted in the printed draft by Newman’s hand.

\(^{125}\) Birmingham Oratory Archives.

\(^{126}\) Ker, Biography, 468-9. See note 120, above, for Wiseman’s objections.
both his blessing and approval to the 'Edgbaston Catholic School' project, but kept a watchful eye. 127

There were aspects of Newman’s school which, if not altogether novel, were nonetheless noteworthy for their emphases. He attempted to establish a system of education that would incorporate what he and the parents felt were the best features of the Protestant public schools within a Catholic framework. Like the schools at Rugby and Eton, the curriculum featured a traditional liberal arts approach, strong in grammar and mathematics. 128 Nash lists the following subjects taught, based on letters and school records: 'Latin, Greek, Mathematics, French, History and Geography, English and of course Christian Doctrine'. Sports and the performing arts (drama and music in particular) were also integral to the programme. 129

The Oratory School differed from the Protestant public schools in a number of important ways, to insure its Catholic identity, and to provide better for the personal care of the boys. He sought 'to combine the advantages of a large school with those of private tuition.' 130 Some of the most important of the School’s features which promoted a Catholic

127 Cf. Ullathorne’s rôle in the school to the Church’s norms in current Canon Law: 'No school, even if it is in fact Catholic, may bear the title 'Catholic school' except by the consent of the competent ecclesiastical authority', and CIC 806.1: 'The diocesan Bishop has the right to watch over and inspect the Catholic schools situated in his territory, even those established or directed by members of religious institutes' (CIC 803.3) Newman’s interaction with his local Ordinary is a model for today’s schools, especially when disagreements are encountered. His differences were forcefully defended, but his final stance was typically one of obedience to his bishop.

128 Cf. his earlier prescriptions for pre-university education in 'Elementary Studies', an essay in part 2 of the Idea.

129 See Nash, Newman’s Idea of a School, 3, 4, 14, 16-17.

130 LD 19:398. But note that the Oratory was never ‘a large school’ during his lifetime, when enrolment never exceeded about seventy. It did not grow significantly larger until it moved to more spacious grounds and facilities in 1922. His 26 August 1860 letter to a prospective student’s parent continued: 'It is only what the English public schools intend, I suppose, though they do not carry it out in practice. By throwing the boys into houses, we shall secure, as far as that is possible, superintendence and care both of their souls and of their bodies' (ibid.).
Newman's Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Catholic Period

identity and ethos (or 'school climate') are suggested by the following italicized phrases in paragraphs taken from the spring 1862 School prospectus:131

This School is intended to afford to Catholic Youth the advantages of the great Public Schools of England, apart from the evils which are incidental to the system therein pursued. 132 It embraces the same classes of pupils, with the same variety of destinations, as are to be found at Eton, Winchester, and Rugby.133

The School and Play Hours, the arrangement of the day, the discipline, and the books, are those of an English Public School, so far as is consistent with Catholic habits and requirements.

Especial attention is paid to the diet, health, and comfort of the boys; who are committed to the care of Ladies experienced in such duties, and are lodged either in the Oratory Building, or in houses in its immediate neighbourhood.

It should be pointed out that not all Public schools, and few if any Catholic boarding schools of his day had ladies serving as 'matrons'. McClelland notes that "Dames' Houses" were foreign institutions to Catholics and were to be adopted [by the Oratory School] at the very time that Eton was considering abandoning them. 134

The specifically Catholic doctrinal, moral, and devotional formation of the students is suggested by these excerpts from the 1861 prospectus:

The Father gives Catechetical instruction on Sunday afternoon. The head Master acts as Catechist during the week. 135

131 Birmingham Oratory Archives. See page 124, below.

132 The 1861 prospectus has a slightly different wording and emphasis: 'Its object is to afford to Catholic youth the benefit of a system of education similar to that of our great English Public Schools, as far as circumstances will admit.'

133 The reference to 'Rugby' replaced earlier prospectuses' citing of 'Harrow', beginning with the spring 1862 prospectus, perhaps partly in recognition of the School's new Classics Master, Thomas Arnold, who was educated there. See follow pages for discussion of this background.


135 This pattern was in accord with the decrees of the 1853-4 Synod of Westminster Decrees, which directed that, 'in addition to pupils' daily religious education at school, the diocesan clergy in England and Wales were instructed to provide "on every Sunday ... a public catechetical instruction in the church, in which the mysteries of the faith, and the commandments of God and the Church, and the doctrine of the sacraments, shall be explained in a plain and clear manner"' (Whitehead, 'A
Newman's Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Catholic Period

The boys say the Rosary every day before dinner. They visit the Blessed Sacrament at the conclusion of Evening School.

Two years after the School's founding, a crisis arose between the headmaster, Nicholas Darnell, and the head matron, Mrs. Frances Wootten. There was no one single cause for their differences. Wootten complained that Darnell had severely restricted the boys' access to her in addition to restricting them from approaching other Oratorian priests for confession. She offered her resignation in December 1861. Darnell had ignored an August 1861 letter from Newman calling for reforms to address the 'lack of discipline, poor academic standards, and the general religious tone in the school'. He had also made plans without consulting Newman of moving the school outside of Edgbaston.

Believing the episode was essentially a power struggle, Darnell insisted that Wootten should in fact be his 'servant', with no right of direct appeal to Newman. He accused Wootten of spying on him, and being a talebearer. He wanted more control of the school, and to model it more closely after the normal public boarding school pattern, which did not include such a prominent rôle for matrons. When Bellasis informed Darnell of his and other


136 The full story of the so-called 'Darnell Affair' is beyond the scope of this project. For more of the history, issues, and results of the controversy, see esp. LD 20, correspondence and notes for Dec 1861-Jan 1862. See also: Nash, Newman's Idea of a School, s.v. 'The Rôle of Religion: The Darnell Affair'; Ker, Biography, 503-508; Sugg, Ever Yours Affly, 250-259, McClelland, 'A Catholic Eton'; Trevor 2:248-64, Gilley, Newman and His Age, 312-4; and Shrimpton's treatment in John Henry Newman and the Oratory School, which provides additional material concerning the rôles of the parents in the crisis, esp. those of Bellasis and James Hope-Scott.

137 Newman summarizes in a memorandum of 23 Dec.: 'I had a letter from Mrs. Wootten, offering to retire from her duties in the School, on the ground that she could not fulfil them, unless Fr. Darnell respected her position more than he had lately done' (LD 20:76).

138 See Ker, Biography, 503.

139 LD 20:87.
parents' support of Wootten, Darnell wrote back forcefully, 'I at least believe myself to be going straight towards our great desideratum in the present day - a public school'.

Newman sided with Wootten, defending his position on theological and pastoral grounds to his brother priests met in General Congregation on 28 December 1861:

I was pained to find, from what Fr Nicholas said yesterday, that he considers his views of a school different from mine. I am sorry he should think so; I am slow to believe it; but I will grant it so far as this: - that I think the mode of conducting the great schools of Eton, Winchester, etc, necessarily end in subordinating religion to secular interests and principles; and that this consequence would ensue in ours, but for the presence of Matrons of a high class, and of spiritual directors.

He added that Mrs. Wootten's 'great care taken of the persons of boys, of soul and body, has, in my judgement, been the cause of the success of the school'.

In the face of Newman's clear support of Wootten, Darnell and the school masters resigned at the end of December, and she remained. Newman had to scramble to put the school back together for the January term. With the support of the parents, he found new masters and two of those who had resigned apologized and returned.

Thomas Arnold

---

140 LD 20:89.

141 Newman may have been influenced by the fierce loyalty of Wootten, who was the convert widow of his former medical doctor, and who had made many sizeable benefactions to the Oratory. Sugg reports Wootten once gave the enormous sum of £10,000 (Yours Ever Affly, 240). But see the letter to Miss Holmes in LD 20:68, where Newman claimed the very financial independence of the dames enabled them to become in effect, consecrated to the Christian ministry of caring for the boy's bodies and souls, rather than working as mere hirelings.

142 Winchester did not have a dame system. Some of the public schools, like Eton, had Dames' Houses, but the paid position of the dame was not as specifically maternal and pastoral as that conceived by Newman. See also: LD 20:86 and AW 13.

143 LD 20:91.

144 Ibid. See chapter 6.4.2, below, for a development of Newman's priority of personal care and influence at the Oratory School, including the role of the matrons.

145 'The situation was quickly retrieved. Two of the masters, James Marshall and the Abbé Rougemont, apologized and were re-employed' (Gilley, Newman and His Age, 313). See also note 147,
Newman’s Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Catholic Period

was recruited to act as ‘Head Classical Master’, Newman took the title, ‘Prefect of Studies’, and he made St. John his ‘Vice-Prefect’.\(^{147}\) As the new term began, Newman was able to boast in a letter to a parent: ‘We have met, without the loss of a single boy – and with the addition of several. The new masters were here several days beforehand. Father St. John is my Vice – and I know he will make a good one. So we must look forward not backward.’\(^{148}\)

‘Newman was sixty-one when he took full responsibility for the Oratory School.’\(^{149}\) He became intimately involved with all aspects of the teaching and administration. He corresponded with the parents, oversaw the finances, directed the annual Latin plays, conducted monthly Latin examinations for each boy, taught a variety of courses, and played violin in school quartets. He gave special homilies to the boys—appropriate to their level and below.

\(^{146}\) Thomas Arnold (1823-1900) was a Catholic convert, the youngest son of the famous headmaster and reformer of Rugby school (Thomas Arnold, 1795-1842), and the brother of Matthew Arnold (1822-88), a former disciple of Newman’s at Oxford, who became the noted poet, critic, and inspector of schools. Newman had earlier recruited the younger Thomas to teach at CUL. Another exceptional recruit for Newman was Gerard Manley Hopkins (1844-89) as English Master, for a brief tenure beginning in September 1867. Hopkins went on to become a Jesuit priest and a poet of high international acclaim. Both of these appointments speak of Newman’s care to recruit men of promise and high calibre for his academies.

\(^{147}\) St. John, Newman’s closest friend, and a supporter of his pastoral emphasis for the school, became, in effect, the new headmaster, but without the title, to avoid future misunderstandings, as in Darnell’s perception that the school was ‘his’ (cf. LD 20:90). See the prospectus for Spring 1862, which lists Arnold, Rougemont, Newman, St. John, and Neville [as Prefect of Houses] in their respective rôles (Birmingham Oratory Archives). Nash documents from St. John’s journal, repeated entries concerning the spiritual and moral life of the students, and concludes that ‘the spiritual life of the school was St John’s chief priority’ (Newman’s Idea of a School, 9). That the intensely loyal Wootten and St. John were Newman’s personal extensions in the school is suggested by Newman’s words written one month before Wootten’s death in 1876: ‘So, when she goes, it will be to us a sudden break and downfall. She and Ambrose have been the life and the making of the School’ (LD 27:390).

\(^{148}\) LD 20:141 (see also note 1 of same page). The unfortunate breech of trust and parting of the three formerly close friends was partly restored when Darnell (having left the Oratory for good) wrote a typically Victorian letter of apology three years later, admitting he had been “insufferably violent and headstrong and conceited ...” Newman wrote to restore full peace between them." (Sugg, 258-59).

\(^{149}\) Trevor 2:264.
interests—during Sunday High Mass in an adjoining chapel, and personally delivered catechetical lectures to the older boys. In the manuscript notes taken by school boys from these lectures there appear personal notes of correction and encouragement from Newman, written while he was in his seventies. Thirty years after his famous Sunday afternoon sermons in Oxford, Newman could be found in the School chapel, reading the Bible to the boys after Sunday Mass. One boy's impressions of those readings are reminiscent of the reception of Newman's influence at St. Mary's: "The silvery voice and beautiful intonation of the Father made them most touching, and I remember on one occasion after his reading the sermon on the mount, some of us were in tears."151

Newman's last public acts were to attend the School's Latin play and to distribute prizes to the boys on 23 July 1890. He died 11 August of pneumonia after receiving the last rites the day before. His life-long pursuit of the truth, where ever it led him, and a lifetime committed to the teaching of that truth he believed he discovered had come to an end. His self-chosen gravestone epitaph reads: *Ex umbris et imaginibus in veritatem* (out from shadows and images into the truth).

### 4.2 Oratory School Source Documents

The primary sources for Newman's involvement at the Oratory School are few. Besides the *Letters and Diaries*, there are miscellaneous documents in the Birmingham Oratory and Oratory School archives. The *Oratory School Magazine* and scattered remembrances of

---

150 See page 125 for a description of these, and the conclusion (chapter 7.2) for a proposed transcription, editing, and publishing project for their notebook MSS.

Newman by alumni provide additional material on Newman's involvement and legacy at the School.

_The Letters and Diaries_ are full of references to the School, even during periods when Newman was otherwise engaged with some of his more public work.¹⁵² The initial plans and ongoing governance of the school is recorded in his correspondence with parents, patrons, and bishops. There is a steady stream of letters to school parents concerning the progress and behaviour of their sons, which speaks of how he saw his duty to the school as a pastoral ministry to the boys and their families. To other correspondents he sometimes complained of not having the time to read and write,¹⁵³ because he 'was too busy teaching little boys'.¹⁵⁴

_The Birmingham Oratory Archives._ No thorough academic calendar or catalogue of the school from the early years is to be found in the archives of either the School or the Birmingham Oratory. There is no extended, official profile of what the present study is calling the theological foundations, identity, and climate of a Catholic academy. Besides a variety of financial records, minutes, and decrees from the Birmingham Oratory Congregation's archives, there does exist a collection of school prospectuses and staff lists—two to four pages in length each—for some of the earlier school terms. These list the current staff and describe the basic course of study, the care of the boy's personal needs, the holiday schedule, financial concerns, and behaviour expectations.¹⁵⁵ The first few paragraphs of each prospectus provide the closest approximation to a 'mission statement' and

---

¹⁵² For example, during the writing of the _Apologia_ and the _Grammar of Assent_, and his becoming a cardinal.

¹⁵³ See _LD_ 20:195.


¹⁵⁵ See Shrimpton's list of archival sources relevant to the Oratory School in the bibliography of his thesis (op. cit.).
description of the Catholic ethos that was published during the first decades of the School. References to these have already been made, and will resurface later in the study.

**Newman's Catechetical Lectures Notes.** The Birmingham Oratory Archives also preserve a number of composition notebooks containing the contemporary notes of school boys taken from the catechetical lectures Newman gave to the students during the 1870's.\(^{156}\)

The only explicit reference found in the literature as to the existence of these manuscripts was in a passing remark by Dessain, in an unpublished lecture, where he was discussing Newman's close involvement with the Oratory School:

> For a number of years Newman was directly responsible for [the school], tutored individual boys[,] gave religious instruction to the older boys (several of their note books and Newman's own notes are still extant) and coached them for the Latin play . . .\(^{157}\)

These manuscripts have not been seriously studied or published as of this date, which is unfortunate, as they are a unique witness to Newman's actual catechetical content and of his interaction with students. The notebooks are interspersed with Newman's handwritten notes, corrections, and encouragements. The distilled content of Newman's catechesis to secondary level school boys illustrates his mature theological convictions and educational priorities.

\(^{156}\) The notebooks are found in two tagboard boxes of about 8" x 10" x 2", labelled: "B.12.4.a" and "B.12.4.b"; "O.S. Boys' R.I. Notebooks". Additional oversized loose leaf notes are bundled together with ribbon. The collection includes some carefully copied and edited notes by Newman's executor, William Neville, perhaps in anticipation of publishing them. Nash wrote in 1990 that 'There is a frustratingly brief reference in a letter from St John to “your catechetical lectures to the boys” [see note on LD 20:249]; St John urged him to publish them--but it's not now clear what they were' (Nash, *Newman's Idea of a School*, 16). The Archives preserve notes from his catechetical lectures delivered in the 1870's, but apparently not those from the early 1860's.

Newman's Educational Formation, Work, and Writings: The Catholic Period

The Oratory School archives hold a manuscript containing the religious instruction lecture notes of Father John Norris, a priest of the Birmingham Oratory, and headmaster of the School after Ambrose St. John. Written in Norris's hand, the manuscript is relevant for its very close correspondence to Newman's catechetical lecture notes, and its witness to the ongoing tradition of systematic Catholic catechesis that was imparted at the School.

*The Oratory School Magazine.* Another valuable written source of the history and legacy of the school is the annual *Oratory School Magazine,* (1891–), founded the year after Newman's death, which records the School's annual events. It also features historical articles and follows the careers of the Old Boys (School graduates), a great number of whom distinguished themselves over the first decades of the School in many different occupational fields, but disproportionately so in the armed services, where so many Catholic youth turned for professional careers in a country still quite closed to a strong Catholic presence in society. Newman had emphasized from the first how important it was to educate the laity to prepare them to take a leading rôle in British life. By the year 1900, *The Oratory School Magazine* could already boast of four 'Old Boys' becoming members of Parliament. Nash points to 'Hilaire Belloc, who was at the school in the 1880's' during Newman's last decade, as one of their 'most outstanding' products:

The [Oratory] school magazines of the early 1900's chart his rapid rise from President of the Oxford Union to Member of Parliament and popular author and controversialist. Without belittling Belloc's own individual genius, we might well see in him the most striking expression of what Newman was trying to achieve for the laity.

---

158 Nash, Newman's Idea of a School, 19. On the same page, Nash summarizes Mohnen's limited but informative analysis of how very successful were the Old Boys that attended the School.
Newman's pastoral concern for the boys is evident in his posthumously printed collection of prayers, *Meditations and Devotions*. This was compiled and edited by Fr. Neville, who dedicated it to the boys of the Oratory School as 'a memento both of the Cardinal's constant thought of you, and of his confident assurance that, after his death, you should pray for his soul'. He had composed these meditations both for his own devotions, as well as for the edification and instruction of others, including the school boys. Here we see late in his life, evidence of Newman's convictions concerning the pastoral nature of all true education, that first found expression in his work as an Oriel tutor.

In recognition of Newman being made a Cardinal by Pope Leo XIII in 1879, a series of public events and written commendations celebrated the use of his 'gifts of a Theologian, a Philosopher, an Historian, a Preacher, and a Poet,' in the noblest of causes. Yet when the Catholic Poor School Committee of Great Britain publicly honoured the Cardinal, their highest praise was reserved for his life's work in *education*. In particular, they singled out his work at CUI and the Oratory School. The panegyric includes their idea of the proper *theological foundations and identity* for Catholic academies of all types: '[T]he purpose for which our Committee exists'... may be said to 'represent in the lowest part of the social scale

---


162 Add. 186; address from the Academia of the Catholic Religion, signed by Cardinal Manning, President, and Edward Lucas, Secretary.

163 This committee was 'the official educational mouthpiece' of the bishops of England and Wales from '1847-1905' (Whitehead, 'A View from the Bridge', op. cit., 218).
that of which your life has been the typical example in the highest, the union of Reason with Faith, of Knowledge with Religion, of Genius with Piety. . . . It is the aim of this Committee to do for the labouring classes . . . what, in these two great instances you sought to accomplish for those who, having by the gift of Providence leisure to acquire learning, ought to expend both for the good of others'. Newman replied:

I must express my especial pleasure on finding that the main view of my life, which you select for notice, is just that which I should wish you to fix upon. . . . namely, . . . the cause of Catholic Education'. . . . I have ever joined together faith and knowledge, and considered engagements in educational work a special pastoral office.164

164 Add. 182; emphasis added. See also the epigraphs to chapters 2 and 3, above.
Part Two

RESTORING THE FOUNDATIONS
INTRODUCTION TO PART TWO

Newman identified his primary vocation as that of an educator. Part one of this study demonstrated how from his early twenties until his late eighties, the Christian education of youths and adults occupied his time and talents. Examining his life and work through the lenses of theological and educational concerns revealed many suggested contributions towards a theology of Catholic education. Part two will now seek to create a more explicit synthesis between Newman's theology of a Catholic academy and some of the theological foundations held in common with the Church documents. These foundations undergird the long history of the Church's mission of 'integral human formation in Christ', beginning with its New Testament origins, through the patristic catechetical schools, the medieval universities, and the Catholic independent schools and poor schools of nineteenth-century Britain. Recent documents of the universal Church form their own synthesis of these foundations, and apply them to the contemporary world.

The project of synthesising the theological foundations of a Catholic academy is in answer to the expressed call of the Catholic Church to 'restore all things in Christ'.\footnote{GE Introduction.} Christian education is one of the means used to accomplish this restoration, and, as with any building project, one must begin with the foundations. Newman held to a 'high theological view'\footnote{Idea 26.} of a Catholic university, from which vantage point, he saw 'Catholicity' as 'the fundamental
principle', 3 or foundation, 4 of all true Christian education. The title of part two, 'Restoring the Foundations', indicates therefore, the purpose of the remaining study. It will seek to: (1) uncover the common theological foundations for Christian humanism, Catholic identity, and school climate found in the Church documents, 5 (2) define and illustrate these foundations through the life and work of Newman, and (3) suggest theological prescriptions for restoring these foundations at the service of Catholic educational renewal.

3 Idea 27.

4 Both words, 'fundamental' and 'foundation' derive from the Latin, fundus, meaning the bottom or base of a structure or idea. This study asks, 'What are some of the theological 'foundation stones' upon which every Catholic academy must be built?'

5 Newman did not use modern educational jargon such as 'Catholic identity', 'mission statement' and 'school climate' to express his views, but he did address each of these and other related ideas using related and cognate terms, as will be shown.
Chapter Four

THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS
OF NEWMAN'S EDUCATIONAL IDEAL

Theology has its legitimate place in the University alongside the other disciplines. It has proper principles and methods which define it as a branch of knowledge.¹

Theology plays a particularly important role in the search for a synthesis of knowledge . . . it serves all other disciplines in their search for meaning, . . . by bringing a perspective and an orientation not contained within their own methodologies.²

—John Paul II

In a word, Religious Truth is not only a portion, but a condition of general knowledge. To blot it out is nothing short, if I may so speak, of unravelling the web of University Teaching.³

I have insisted on the important influence, which Theology in matter of fact does and must exercise over a great variety of sciences, completing and correcting them.⁴

—John Henry Newman

1. Newman the Theologian

1.1 A Theologian ‘Sui Generis’

The importance of exploring Newman’s theological views on education derives from the twin observations that he was both a life-long educator and one of the most important theologians of the modern era.⁵ It should be noted, however, that he often denied being a theologian

¹ ECE 29.
² ECE 19.
³ Idea 71.
⁴ Idea 92.
⁵ As but one example of his perceived importance, Gilley called him ‘the greatest of English theologians’ (Newman and His Age, 3).
The LIQLiral Foundations of Newman's Educational Ideal during his Catholic period. In the advertisement to his *Sermons Preached on Various Occasions* for example, he explained that at the time of his 1845 conversion, 'it was, if not his intention', then 'at least his expectation, that he should never write again on any doctrinal subject'. He thought it would be 'incongruous that one, who had so freely taught and published error in a Protestant communion, should put himself forward as a dogmatic teacher in the Catholic Church'. Perhaps more important, he observed that he 'had not the opportunity of going through the regular scholastic course'; neither did he find the vocation of a theologian to be the normal calling for an Oratorian. He knew that the typical Catholic theologian of his day was steeped in the Schoolmen of the medieval ages, and in the manuals of dogmatic and moral theology. In a draft of a 2 March 1853 letter to Archbishop Cullen, he claimed: 'To say I am not a thorough theologian and that I know nothing of Canon law, is obvious'. He rightly considered theology as it was then practised as an essentially systematic, deductive science, whereas his own approach anticipated much of the inductive and personalist strands of modern theologies. Again in an 1869 letter to Maria Giberne, who

6 OS, v.

7 AW 299.

8 For the best introduction, not to the content of Newman's theology, but to his unique method, see Thomas J. Norris, *Newman and His Theological Method*, (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1977). In a summary of his own study, Norris claims that Newman's contributions to theological method as a 'Novum Organon' were in at least six broad areas. First, he 'made a dynamic synthesis of classical deductive and modern inductive methodologies,' supplying 'theology with foundations that are at once interior, personal, religious and philosophical'; his notion of 'the illative sense . . . provided a tool eminently adapted' for this synthesis. Second, Newman was 'able to critically ground a doctrinal Christianity as the only authentic form of Revelation in virtue of his self-appropriation of the act of judgement.' Third, 'his method of disclosing the beautifully rich meaning of the Christian mysteries has both reinstated into the mainstream of Catholic theology the Patristic and Alexandrian style of theology, and has anticipated the insight of the First and Second Vatican Councils into the methods of dogmatic theology'. Fifth, he has indicated 'a method of dialectic, whereby counterpositions can be reduced to their presuppositions with a view to promoting reconciliation between clashing parties, and to leading people into new worlds of meaning.' This last point is further developed by Merrigan in *Clear Heads and Holy Hearts*, op. cit. 'Finally, Newman saw that theology was being influenced in the fields of history, philosophy and science. In reply, he developed Christianity to meet an age of historical mindedness, scientific achievement, and philosophical sophistication' (p. xx). In addition
had expressed regret over his decision not to attend the First Vatican Council as a guest theologian, he claims:

really and truly I am not a theologian. A theologian is one who has mastered theology—who can say how many opinions there are on every point, what authors have taken which, and which is the best . . . This is it to be a theologian—this and a hundred things besides. And this I am not, and never shall be.  

Despite these disclaimers, most modern appraisers of Newman’s thought would agree with Johannes Artz that ‘it is still permissible to call him a theologian. He is a theologian ‘sui generis’ who, in his own words, “liked going his own way”’. In the judgement of Mark Schoof, Newman represents a new departure in Catholic theology. His ‘independent mind naturally forced a distinctive form on everything that he assimilated. In a word, his work never gives the impression of being secondhand’. 

1.2 A ‘Prophetic’ Theologian and Educator

Not only is there a general recognition of Newman’s status as a creative theologian. There is also a widespread appraisal of Newman as a sort of ‘prophetic voice’ for Christian believers. C. S. Dessain reviewed the evidence for this prophetic attribution by drawing together the opinions of many respected scholars, including Erich Przywara, the German scholastic philosopher, who called Newman ‘the peculiar and unique Augustinus redivivus of modern

---

9 LD 24:212-3.

10 Johannes Artz, preface to Norris, Newman and His Method, xi.

times'. Bede Jarrett compared Newman to Augustine and Thomas Aquinas, because for him, 'Newman now indeed seems to be of that band and of that stature. The Fathers of the Church were the companions of his musings until he became one with them in fellowship'.

Dessain amplified these opinions: 'It has been claimed that as St. Augustine was the representative prophet of antiquity and St. Thomas Aquinas of medieval times, so Newman is the prophet of the modern age.' These appraisals could be dismissed as unrelated, isolated examples of enthusiasm. But they are taken seriously in these carefully measured words from the Catholic Church's official decree that named Newman 'venerable' in 1991:

The depth and weightiness of the theological thought of John Henry Newman are such that, in the opinion of many scholars, he seems to resemble the greatest Fathers of the Church.

Many have noted Newman's indirect but very real influence on Vatican Council II, and they cited specific examples in their studies. During the post-conciliar period there is

12 'Cardinal Newman Considered as a Prophet', Concilium: Church History no. 4 (Sep 1968): 41-50.
15 I.e., that he had practised the cardinal and theological virtues to an heroic degree, and is now rightly called 'Venerable John Henry Newman', the first step towards canonization.
unequivocal evidence for Newman's continuing relevance in Catholic theology and education. Three recent Church documents quote him, for example, as an authentic witness to the received tradition in the areas of Catholic theology and education. The 1992 *Catechism of the Catholic Church* quotes Newman four times, and he is the only non-canonized figure of the modern era so cited. The Vatican-sponsored International Theological Commission's document, *On the Interpretation of Dogmas*, includes an excursus entitled 'Seven Criteria of John Henry Newman', which explains and endorses Newman's approach to discerning authentic doctrinal development in one of his most important theological works, *The Development of Doctrine* (1845). Writing the *Development* while he was still an Anglican was for Newman an exercise in the sort of 'courageous creativity' that John Paul II enjoins in *Ex Corde Ecclesiae*, where he explains his reason for writing the constitution 'as a sort of 'magna carta'', enriched by the long and fruitful experience of the Church in the realm of Universities and open to the promise of future achievements that will require courageous creativity and rigorous fidelity. John Paul no doubt included Newman in his reference to the 'experience of the Church in the realm of Universities', since he endorsed and borrowed from Newman's thought on higher education three times in *ECE*.


18 For a discussion of the content and importance of these four Newmanian citations, see 2 articles in *Newmaniana*: 'Newman en el Catecismo de la Iglesia Católica', by P. Fernando M. Cavaller, Año 3, n. 7 (Abril 1993), 4-8, and 'Algo más sobre Newman y el catecismo universal' Año 3, n. 8 (Julio 1993), editorial.


20 *ECE* 8.

21 See note 20, on page 4, above, and accompanying text.
The Pope claims that part of Newman's continuing relevance is the fact that:

Above all, Newman is a magnificent guide for all those who perceive that the key, the focal point and the goal of all human history is to be found in Christ (cf. Gaudium et Spes, 10) and in union with him in that community of faith, hope and charity, which is his holy Church, through which he communicates truth and grace to all (cf. Lumen Gentium, 8). 22

The discovery of this letter was an impetus to explore ways in which Newman is a guide to perceiving the centrality of Christ in the Church's mission of communicating 'truth and grace' (the subject and power of Catholic education). Each of the chapters in part two considers different aspects of this christological 'key'.

2. Patristic Christian Humanism and Education

2.1 Newman's Debt to the Fathers

One of the formative elements of Newman's theological vision was his 'imaginative devotion' 23 to the early Church Fathers. 24 Ian Ker describes how his approach to doing theology was itself an indication of a patristic mind set:

Far less a professional theologian than a Christian thinker, practically everything he wrote is of theological significance. It is not surprising that his


23 AW 83.

unsystematic, richly varied work has often suggested that he belongs more to the world of patristic than to that of modern theology.\(^{25}\)

Chapter two described how Newman, as a result of the Oriel tutor row in the late 1820’s, was able to immerse himself in the writings of the ancient Greek (or Eastern) Fathers and their compelling, formative theological vision. It was through his patristic studies that Newman had avoided what he observed to be ‘the danger’ of taking ‘refuge in the flats’ of liberal Arminianism or Latitudinarian Christianity, having already moved away from classical Protestantism—which he described in retrospect as the ‘crags and precipices of Luther and Calvin’.\(^{26}\) Newman came to admire the Fathers as pastors and teachers; they were men of action—not just of abstract thought—after whom he was to pattern his theological work and educational ministry. Through the Fathers, he discovered the interplay of theology and education, and from then on, his theological and educational careers were interwoven in his own system of neo-patristic humanism.

He wrote in the Apologia of how ‘the broad philosophy of Clement and Origen carried [him] away’, observing that ‘some portions of their teaching, magnificent in themselves, came like music to [his] inward ear’.\(^{27}\) Newman’s own developing ideas on revelation found expression in their writings, which

---

\(^{25}\) Ian Ker, ed., Newman the Theologian: A Reader (London: Collins, 1990), 64; emphasis added. The Congregation for Catholic Education identified four ‘attitudes or points’ which characterised the Fathers’ theological approach: a) a constant recourse to Sacred Scripture and the meaning of Tradition; b) awareness of Christian originality while recognizing the truths of pagan culture; c) defence of the faith as the supreme good and continuously deepening understanding of the content of Revelation; d) the sense of mystery and the experience of the divine.’ (Instruction on the Study of the Fathers of the Church in the Formation of Priests, Rome, 1989, no. 26). Aspects of Newman’s theological orientation in harmony with these four points have already been identified in part one (e.g., his recourse to Scripture, his sense of the divine in his sermons, the deepening of Revelation through the ‘development of doctrine, etc), and will continue to suggest themselves in part two (see e.g., the next section, ‘Christ the Teacher’).

\(^{26}\) AW 83.

\(^{27}\) Apo. 36.
were based on the sacramental principle, and spoke of the various Economics or Dispensations of the Eternal. I understood these passages to mean that the exterior world, physical and historical, was but the manifestation to our senses of realities greater than itself. Nature was a parable; Scripture was an allegory: pagan literature, philosophy, and mythology, properly understood, were but a preparation for the Gospel.28

Among the aspects of Newman's theological orientation most clearly adapted from the patristic world is his Christian humanism approach to liberal arts education. His educational views were rooted in his experience as a student and fellow at Oxford, strengthened and deepened as he studied the Fathers, and given a broader footing as he embraced the Catholic world view. He explained to his Dublin audience in 1852 during his introductory Discourse: 'Many changes has my mind gone through', but on the matter of Christian liberal arts, 'it has known no variation or vacillation of opinion'. Those principles, which he was now proposing 'under the sanction of the Catholic Church', were, in substance, his profession during his earlier Evangelical years, 'when religion was to me more a matter of feeling and experience than faith.' But then, they took 'a greater hold on me, as I was introduced to the records of Christian Antiquity, and approached in sentiment and desire to Catholicism'. Thus, his deeply held convictions grew into his 'whole system of thought'.29

2.2 Christ the Teacher

A key element of what makes Newman's theology of education Christian is the preeminence he assigns to Christ as the Master Teacher: he who is 'the Way, the Truth, and the Life'.30 This christocentricity is evident throughout his educational works. He received this

28 Ibid. Re.: 'sacramental principle', see also Dev. 93-4 'The Incarnation is the antecedent of the doctrine of Mediation, and the archetype ... of the Sacramental principle'.

29 Idea 21. By 'system of thought' here, he does not mean an organized outline of systematic theology, but rather the whole of his integrated world view.

perspective from his intimate knowledge and acceptance of Sacred Scripture and the Fathers. His Evangelical conversion at age 15, and subsequent training—steeped in the language and ethos of Sacred Scripture—had made him a Christian devoted to Christ and his revealed truth. But it was his study of the Eastern Fathers that led him inexorably in his search for the fullness of Christian revelation to the Catholic Church. Newman claimed, ‘The Fathers made me a Catholic’. So how did his reading of the Fathers directly and permanently shape his Catholic educational approach?

Especially influential for Newman were the writings of Clement of Alexandria, Origen, and Athanasius. Early on in his patristic readings, he discovered Clement of Alexandria (AD 150 - c. 215). One of Clement’s most famous works he read with great interest: Paedagogus (‘The Teacher’). Clement’s thesis was, Unus magister Christus: We have ‘one teacher, the Christ’. As a pioneering Christian humanist, Clement contended (as Justin Martyr before him did in the mid-second century) that the Incarnate Word, the Logos, was the source and teacher of all truth, however imperfectly perceived by the Hebrews, Greek philosophers, and the valid insights of other ancient faiths before the Christian economy, or dispensation. Newman knew Christ from Scripture as ‘the true light that enlightens every man’. In Clement he discovered a synthesis that did justice to the high philosophy of the Greeks and to the incremental, provisional revelation God gave to the Hebrew people:

31 Diff. 2:24.

32 Alternatively translated as the ‘Tutor’, ‘Educator’, or ‘Instructor’. Part of his trilogy which included Protrepticus (‘Exhortation to the Greeks’) and Stromateis (‘Miscellanies’).

33 Cf. this section to chapters 4.4.1, ‘Restoring Educational Unity in Christ’, and 6.1.2: ‘Imitatio Christi’, re.: the centrality of Christ in Newman’s educational ideal.

34 John 1:9.
In the fulness of time both Judaism and Paganism had come to nought; the outward framework, which concealed yet suggested the Living Truth, had never been intended to last, and it was dissolving under the beams of the Sun of Justice which shone behind it and through it.\(^\text{35}\)

The synthesis is found in the Incarnate Word—'the Living Truth' and 'Sun of Justice'—who established a teaching Church to reveal the fullness of truth over time to all peoples. Newman's reputation as a Christian humanist stems largely from these views on the universality of revelation,\(^\text{36}\) and the corresponding notion of the complementarity of faith and reason. These views were developed in works such as his *Oxford University Sermons*, *The Idea of a University*, and even in his catechetical lectures at the Oratory School.\(^\text{37}\)

Vincent Blehl has outlined the educational influence on Newman of the two Alexandrian Fathers, Clement and Origen, noting that by 1832, Newman's

\(^{35}\text{Apo. 36-7.}\)

\(^{36}\text{For a fuller treatment of Newman's teaching on how Christ 'enlightens every man', see the study by Francis McGrath,* John Henry Newman: Universal Revelation*, with a foreword by Gerard Tracey (Turnbridge Wells, Kent: Burns and Oates; Mulgrave, Victoria, Australia: John Garratt Publishing, 1997).}\)

\(^{37}\text{Chapter 3.4.2 introduced the notebooks that contain 'Dr. Newman's Religious Instruction' taken by the school boys, and preserved in the Birmingham Oratory Archives. In a manuscript by J. H. Pollen (Jr.) we find the following notes, which, when compared to other pupils' notes of the same lecture, appear to be very nearly Newman's actual words: 'The Church of God must be visible, that it may be known to come from God by having a recognized Revelation from God, for heathens had also a revelation though not an open one from God, for God undoubtedly revealed certain truths to the Philosophers of old, <*> who taught many truths that they could never have evolved from their inner minds, and philosophy had thus some truths, but they were not openly revealed and were therefore doubted.' (Pollen's first notebook, p. 21). As an example of this universal revelation, the superscript in the text <*> directs us to the facing left page which reads: 'Thus Buddhism teaches Trinity in Unity, and is in many respects so like Christianity that it has been said that Christianity was derived from it. It is also exceedingly remarkable, that a tradition of a virgin and Child runs through all Classical Mythology.' Newman wrote the query, 'Hinduism?' above the word Buddhism in pencil (Ibid., verso).}\)
mind had become saturated with Alexandrian thought. Stimulated by his research in patristics, he wrote several of his Oxford University Sermons . . . [including] ‘Personal Influence, the Means of Propagating the Truth’. 38

The arguments and illustrations Newman uses in some of these university sermons are drawn heavily from the Greek Fathers. Newman shared Clement of Alexandria’s concern to link philosophy, faith, and life in a unified whole. For both of them, the unifying and animating principle of this link was the person of Jesus Christ, the Incarnate God.

The source of unity here again is the Incarnate Logos as Educator, Christos Logos paidagogos. In his Paedagogus Clement presents Christ as the divine and human exemplar and teacher of life and living.39

This view of Christ the Teacher and Logos, is precisely the foundation upon which John Paul II builds his theology of higher education in ECE. Having just quoted Newman on how the Church has ‘an intimate conviction that truth is [its] real ally . . . and that knowledge and reason are sure ministers to Faith’, 40 he then restates the ancient patristic synthesis:

By means of a kind of universal humanism a Catholic University is completely dedicated to the research of all aspects of truth in their essential connection with the supreme Truth, who is God. It does this without fear but rather with enthusiasm, dedicating itself to every path of knowledge, aware of being preceded by him who is “the Way, the Truth, and the Life, the Logos, whose Spirit of intelligence and love enables the human person with his or her own intelligence to find the ultimate reality of which he is the source and end and who alone is capable of giving fully that Wisdom without which the future of the world would be in danger. 41

38 ‘Newman and the Fathers’, 198. The ‘Personal Influence . . . ’ sermon is examined in chapter six, below, as evidence for Newman’s pedagogical approach.


40 ECE 4; he is quoting Newman in the preface to the Idea, p. xi (= Idea 6, Ker, ed.).

41 ECE 4.
2.3 The Principle of Reserve in Education

Blehl summarizes Clement’s teaching on Christ the Teacher, suggesting some implications for a Christian pedagogy:

The Logos is the Educator par excellence. He is the true master of men, who gathers about Him His disciples and leads them by successive stages in progressive knowledge of Himself. . . . He stands in readiness to accommodate Himself to all human needs, to vary His method of teaching according to time, place and person. . . . It is to Him alone that the Father has committed the administration of the universe.42

The Christian tradition sees the Logos as the unique self-expression of the Godhead. As the ‘speech’ or revelation of God, he is both image and teacher. As Creator, the Logos is in fact the master of all, the rightful universal King, and yet, in the great condescension, he reveals himself and his plan for us in ways that we can understand. The reference to method here is striking. By accommodating his teaching to our developmental needs and abilities, Christ is himself the model of a teacher who practises a method of temporarily withholding some knowledge and teaching by stages.43 This method is the topic of an original and illuminating work by Robin Selby, The Principle of Reserve in the Writings of John Henry Newman. He writes in the introduction concerning the patristic notion of economies that the reader of Newman ‘will find that the phenomena of withholding and gradual dispensation confront him on every side; this is the principle of reserve, a principle not of concealment, but of sensitivity’. It is a principle that ‘links up all that is of the first importance in Newman’s life and ideas’.44

In a chapter important for this present study entitled ‘The Communication of Religious Truth’, Selby shows how Newman applied the principle of reserve to the spreading

42 ‘Newman and the Fathers’, 201; emphasis added.

43 Cf. CCC 54-64: ‘The Stages of Revelation’, summarized in no. 69: ‘God has revealed himself to man by gradually communicating his own mystery in deeds and in words.’

44 Selby, Reserve, 1.
of religious truth. During his Anglican years, he used it especially to heighten the reverence to be accorded the sacred, as well as to prevent misunderstanding, scandal or heresy, by not teaching truths hard to receive until the necessary groundwork is first laid. The proper disposition for receiving Christian doctrine was a prayerful one. He noted that in 'the Primitive Church, . . . the more Sacred Truths [were taught] ordinarily by rites and ceremonies', partly because the very atmosphere and posture of worship promoted reverence towards these holy mysteries. 'In this way, Christians receive the Gospel literally on their knees, and in a temper altogether different from that critical and argumentative spirit which sitting and listening engender.'

In his first major historical and theological treatise, *Arians of the Fourth Century*, Newman describes the Alexandrian Church's method in teaching. He cites Athanasius's use of the economical method of teaching in his 'arguing with the Gentiles for the Divinity and incarnation of the Word', by using philosophical notions familiar to them. He eschewed argument strictly from authority or revelation, as he bore in mind the necessity of favourably disposing the minds of the Gentiles to listen to his teaching; and he was aware that it was one thing to lay the rudiments of the faith in an ignorant or heathen mind, and another to defend the faith against heretics, or to teach it dogmatically.

Newman thus borrowed this patristic notion of economy, which accommodates 'the feelings and prejudices of the hearer, in leading him to the reception of a novel or unacceptable

---

45 LD 5:46.

46 Published 1833. See esp. section 3 of chapter 1, where Newman studies the Alexandrian school's catechetical and theological approaches, including the *disciplina arcana* (secret teaching), the allegorical method, and the notion of economy.

47 *Art.* 71-72.
The idea of reserve finds its home in any educational system so far as it accommodates the presentation of knowledge to a pupil's stages of learning and prior knowledge. This basic insight or method has been reapplied in modern educational development theories, as in the works of Jean Piaget, and in the theories of religious educators like James W. Fowler.50

3. The Rôle of Theology in Education

3.1 Theology and the Circle of Knowledge

Many philosophers of education seek an overarching, architectonic view of the branches of knowledge and their relations one to another. For the Christian educator, the development of a Christian philosophy (or theology) of education is additionally motivated by the desire to create such an integrated world view of knowledge in light of God's revealed nature and will. Newman approached this problem in the Discourses by invoking the imagery of a 'circle

48 Ari. 72.

49 Ari. 73-74. See Galatians 5:2-6.

of knowledge'. There he argued for several related ideas, to illustrate his defence for including theology as both an indispensable branch of knowledge to be studied, and as a regulating principle in Christian education.

At the end of Discourse Four he summarized the argument he had presented thus far. First, theology, as a branch of learning with a definite subject and object should not be excluded from the course of studies, since 'it is the very profession of a University to teach all sciences', and therefore, to eliminate theology from the syllabus would be 'untrue to its profession'. Secondly, Newman claimed that there is an inescapable interconnectedness between theology and all of the other disciplines, even though each one is studied using the methods and principles proper to itself. It is therefore 'impossible to teach them all thoroughly, unless they all are taken into account', including theology. A third proposition raises the stakes for the inclusion of theology in the venture of education:

Moreover, I have insisted on the important influence, which Theology in matter of fact does and must exercise over a great variety of sciences, completing and correcting them; so that, granting it to be a real science occupied upon truth, it cannot be omitted without great prejudice to the teaching of the rest.

When theology is removed from the curriculum based on secular or non-sectarian principles, it can not 'defend its own boundaries ... to hinder the encroachment' of the secular sciences. ‘[I]f Theology is not allowed to occupy its own territory, adjacent sciences,

---

51 See especially Discourses 1-4, 8, 9.

52 See Idea 92-94 for this summary.

53 Idea 92. See also Idea 50: 'Religious doctrine is knowledge, in as full a sense as Newton’s doctrine is knowledge. University Teaching without Theology is simply unphilosophical. Theology has at least as good a right to claim a place there as Astronomy.'

54 Idea 92-3.
nay, sciences which are quite foreign to Theology, will take possession of it.\textsuperscript{55} Other disciplines inevitably attempt to rush in to provide the missing link in this circular chain of knowledge, doing an injustice to the truth. Ethics, or politics, or sociology, or psychology usurps the place of theology. Newman’s fourth proposition is thus a warning that the damage done is not a matter of defect alone, but of deformation. Theology’s province will not simply be neglected, but will be actually usurped by other sciences, which will teach, without warrant, conclusions of their own in a subject-matter which needs its own proper principles for its due formation and disposition.\textsuperscript{56}

Having briefly considered Newman’s view of the place of theology in the circle of knowledge and the curriculum, we find ourselves – as John Ford puts it – ‘alerted’ to the presence of Newman in the background of John Paul II’s treatment of the same subject in ECE. To begin with, the Pope’s starting point is similar: ‘Theology’, he writes, ‘has its legitimate place in the University alongside the other disciplines.’ In words that echo those of Newman in the Discourses, he goes on to say that theology ‘has proper principles and methods which define it as a branch of knowledge’. Parallel to Newman’s reasoning that it is at once one of the branches as well as the highest branch, he mandates that, ‘because of its specific importance among the academic disciplines [based on a hierarchical view], every Catholic University should have a faculty, or at least a chair, of theology’.\textsuperscript{57} Again with Newman, he insists that theology has a place outside of the theology department as well. It ‘plays a particularly important role in the dialogue between faith and reason’. It also:

\textsuperscript{55} Idea 91.

\textsuperscript{56} Idea 93. This fourth proposition was anticipated twenty years earlier (1831) in his Oxford University sermon, ‘The Usurpations of Reason’ (Sermon 4, US 54-74).

\textsuperscript{57} ECE 19. CUI had a faculty of theology, overseen by the bishops.
serves all other disciplines in their search for meaning, not only by helping them to investigate how their discoveries will affect individuals and society but also by bringing a perspective and an orientation not contained within their own methodologies.  

3.2 Restoring a Christian Hierarchy of Educational Aims

Newman stopped short of defining his architectonic model of the branches of knowledge in terms of an absolute vertical hierarchy of subjects, but he did argue forcefully that by reason of its source and content, theology enjoys a certain divine preeminence among all of the disciplines. He speaks of it as a branch of knowledge 'of philosophical structure, of unutterable importance, and of supreme influence'. Indeed, 'Religious Truth is not only a portion' of the circle, on the same level of astronomy or music, but is in fact 'a condition of general knowledge.' And therefore, 'to blot it out is nothing short ... of unravelling the web of University Teaching'. To omit it would be like taking 'the Spring from out of the year', or vainly trying to represent a 'drama with the omission of its principal part'. The term hierarchy is never directly employed in the Idea to describe theology's relationship to the other disciplines; nor does Newman allude directly to theology as the 'Queen of Sciences' in that work. But both notions are implied; and if we look to his other writings, it becomes clear that he does indeed exalt faith and theology to the deepest, widest, and highest levels of knowledge. Michael Tierney asserts that Newman sought to 'reestablish the claim of theology

---

58 ECE 19.

59 In Catholic tradition, hierarchy denotes literally, rule by priests, but it also includes the connotation of seeing reality in terms of a 'sacred order'; i.e., all of creation viewed in right relationship to the Creator.

60 Idea 71; emphasis added.
to be the queen of sciences’. Culler repeats the assertion, adding his opinion that Newman did not attempt to reconcile the two models of a circle and a hierarchy. For him, the circle image represents the classical notion that theology is but ‘one segment of a circle which is presided over by the Science of Sciences’ [i.e., philosophy], but the latter [hierarchy model], which is of medieval origin, implies that [theology] is the queen of sciences’, which rules ‘all the rest’. Which science rules—philosophy or theology? Ker’s answer is that first of all, Culler is creating a false dichotomy of equality versus hierarchy. He points out that the word hierarchy is never used in the Discourses, although in the original Discourse Five Newman did call theology the ‘highest and widest’ of all the branches of knowledge. But the question Newman is treating in the Idea, he insists, is not a question of which science rules the others, but of how the many branches ‘impinge upon’ each other. ‘The image of the circle is intended to imply interdependence not equality. Thus there is no reason why one science should not be chief of the sciences, in the sense of being first among equals rather than sovereign over the others’.

John Coulson provides an important clue for harmonizing the apparent contradictions in Newman’s presentation, by observing that his emphases vary depending on his line of argument and intended audience. Thus for the context of increasingly secular Oxford, he rightly lays stress on the priority of faith and theology in the face of the ‘usurpations of reason’, while before his Catholic Dublin audience, where ‘this priority was not in question,

---

62 Culler, 258.
63 Idea 428.
64 Ker, Editor’s Introduction, Idea, lxi-lxii; emphasis in the original.
the [circle] model was appropriate, in order that reason might be given its due and rightful place in the development of the whole man'\textsuperscript{65}. Merrigan finds this insight helpful, but not altogether accurate, because Newman used 'both models in the Idea, and both are present, as Culler rightly observes'\textsuperscript{66}.

One might be confused still further by Newman’s strong claims for the rôle of classical literature within the circle of knowledge.\textsuperscript{67} But here again, the interpretive key is context. In his consideration of the unique mission of a university, Newman is emphasising the singular task of forming the intellectual habits of its students. His 1854 inaugural lecture to the School of Philosophy and Letters proposes that 'the simple question to be considered is, how best to strengthen, refine, and enrich the intellectual powers'. In answer to this question, he offers the proven record of classical studies over the centuries, as opposed to the, as yet, unknown and unproven results of replacing the liberal arts with the newer ‘experimental sciences’. He insists that neither theology nor the experimental sciences are the best means for cultivating the intellect. Without denying the many benefits of the emerging sciences and technology, nor disclaiming the ultimate importance of faith and theology, he reminds us that ‘the question is not what department of study contains the more wonderful facts, or promises


\textsuperscript{66} Merrigan, Clear Heads and Holy Hearts, 164-5. Merrigan situates the whole question of ‘The Place of Theology in the Corpus Scientiarum’ (chapter 5.1, pp. 162-178) within the larger context of how the science of theology operates according to its own principles, but analogously with the methods of the other sciences, building on Newman's polarity model of ‘real’ and ‘notional’ apprehension.

\textsuperscript{67} For a discussion of Newman’s prominent place for literature in education, see: Inés de Cassagne, ‘Newman y la literatura en la universidad católica’, Newmanniana no. 31 (Noviembre 2000): 10 - 23.
the more brilliant discoveries, and which is in the higher and which in an inferior rank'.

Instead he asks:

which out of all provinces [is] the most robust and invigorating discipline for
the unformed mind. [And he conceives] it is as little disrespectful to Lord
Bacon to prefer the Classics in this point of view to the sciences which have
grown out of his philosophy as it would be disrespectful to St. Thomas in the
middle ages to have hindered the study of the Summa from doing prejudice
to the Faculty of Arts.

His conclusion is that despite the separate claims of theology and the other sciences, 'still,
it will not avail in the event, to detrude classical literature and the studies connected with it
from the place which they have held in all ages in education'.

A number of difficulties arise when one tries to synthesize a hierarchy of educational
aims from the writings of Newman together with modern Church documents. Different terms
and categories are used at times without definition, or with several layers of meaning, or with
apparently contradictory correspondences. Such couplets as: proximate and remote, primary
and ultimate, direct and indirect, higher and lower, initial and final, etc., all have their value
in a particular passage or argument, but they cannot be easily harmonized with other passages
and vocabulary. The key to interpreting and comparing these passages is to read them in
context, and not to attribute an absolute hierarchical rank or sequential order to every

---

68 Idea 221-2.

69 Idea 222.

70 J. M. Roberts identifies Newman's 'literature' with what modern universities call the
'humanities', and claims Newman's elevation of the humanities as superior to the sciences in
promoting imaginative power and mental cultivation gives 'grounds for misgiving'. Recognizing
Newman's own education that was strong in mathematics, as well as his place for scientific research
and teaching at the Dublin university, still, Roberts insists that with 'this educational priority to
[humanities] ... many of us can no longer agree'. He then cites Newman's 'reserved' but 'confident'
qualification: '... that the study of the experimental sciences will do the like [i.e. form the mind as
well as the humanities] is proved to us as yet by no experience whatsoever' (Idea 222). See Roberts,
'The Idea of a University Revisited' (op. cit), 213-6.

71 Idea 222.
possible educational aim. For example, Newman had no problem speaking of theology as both the 'highest and widest' of all the branches of knowledge.\textsuperscript{72} Similarly, intellectual cultivation is called both 'the direct end', the 'direct scope', of a university, although the terms, 'end' and 'scope' are not interchangeable. When read in context, one finds a reasonable internal consistency within particular passages of Newman's works, while recognizing an certain lack of precision and consistency between separate works written at different times for various occasions.

Perhaps the best resolution of the question of a hierarchy of knowledge and educational aims in Newman's thought can be found in a comparison of his views with those of his Alexandrian mentors, Clement and Origen. We already saw how Clement provided Newman with the integrating principle of unity of knowledge through the person of the Paedagogus. As one of the earliest and most prolific writers of early Christian humanism, Origen articulated and practised an integrating notion of a Christian hierarchy in the expanded curriculum of the Alexandrian catechetical school which he called the encyc\textit{li}a grammata. For him, the study of the whole circle of the sciences found its culmination in the study of the sacra pagina. The classical seven liberal arts which he inherited from Athens through Clement and Philo were surmounted by the study of philosophy, and finally, of theology—which consisted primarily in the examination of Sacred Scripture.\textsuperscript{73} His prescription for the order and priorities of education could be summarized by an upwardly spiralling image, which begins with faith, and continually spirals to higher levels of faith and communion with God, as new learning and intellectual tools are applied to the content of

\textsuperscript{72} Idea 428.

\textsuperscript{73} Cf. Second Vatican Council, \textit{Dei Verbum}, 24: 'The Sacred Scriptures ... are truly the Word of God. Therefore, "the study of the sacred page" should be the very soul of sacred theology'.
faith: faith - knowledge - philosophy - theology - faith - knowledge, etc. Blehl explains it this way:

Origen's general education was related to a higher purpose. It aimed at the development of intelligence so that it might receive a deeper understanding of religious truths than mere catechetical instruction provided. Origen's plan was first to lay a solid foundation in the knowledge of Christian faith [catechesis], then to go on to the study of secular subjects purged of the errors of paganism and ordered to the study of philosophy, which in turn served the scientific examination the Scriptures.74

Origen's hierarchy of knowledge thus begins with Christian faith nurtured through catechetical instruction. This provided the most fundamental, non-optional ingredient of a truly human education, because it was ordered to man's final end. For those who were able to pursue further studies, next came the liberal arts, beginning with the trivium of grammar, rhetoric, and logic as the (literally) 'three ways' or 'tools of learning'.75 The trivium were then applied to the content of the arts and sciences, which in turn became the subject matter of philosophical reflection. Philosophy was seen not as the summit of learning and wisdom—as it was for the Greeks—but as the servant of theology, the highest of studies. Blehl situates the question of hierarchy of knowledge in the wider context of Newman's influence by patristic humanism, and of education more broadly conceived than the limited exclusive ends of a university education in the abstract. 'The hierarchy in Origen's and Clement's scheme of education is reflected in Newman's plan as outlined in [The Tamworth Reading Room].'76

74 Blehl, 'Newman and the Fathers', 206. Blehl's well-documented article is the primary resource for the following discussion, esp. pp. 205-10.


There he argued for the ultimate preeminence of faith, religion, and theology as the root and end of all true education. In the face of secular proposals for education at the new reading room and nondenominational colleges like University College, London, Newman asserts that not all branches of knowledge can 'be first', because each has its own proper place, 'and the problem is to find it. It is at least not a lighter mistake to make what is secondary first, than to leave it out altogether'. And now we have the context for the famous quotation that begins with 'Christianity, and nothing short of it ... ', which was cited earlier in chapter one as being representative of his distinctly Christian conception of education:

Here then it is that the Knowledge Society, Gower Street College, Tamworth Reading-room, Lord Brougham and Sir Robert Peel, are all so deplorably mistaken. Christianity and nothing short of it must be made the element and principle of all education. Where it is laid as the first stone, and acknowledged as the governing spirit, it will take up into itself, assimilate, and give a character to literature and science. Where Revealed Truth has given the aim and direction to Knowledge, Knowledge of all kinds will minister to Revealed Truth.\(^7\)

This passage suggests an architectural image for a Christian educational hierarchy complementary to the image of a spiral. If conceived as a pyramid, the base, or 'first stone' for both Origen and Newman would be the apprehension of basic Christian faith and practice. Upon that bedrock is built a superstructure assembled from the whole 'circle of knowledge', followed by the upper-story levels of learning: philosophy, the integration of knowledge, and vocational training. At the apex of this pyramid representing integral human development, we return to faith, now seeking a 'higher theological view' of, and union with, God. This life-

\(^7\) DA 274. A similar idea is put forth by Newman in the passage already quoted from Idea 6, and cited in ECE 4, as footnote no. 7 (= p. xi in UE). The full quotation and context is: 'He [the Pope] rejoices in the widest and most philosophical systems of intellectual education, from an intimate conviction that Truth is his real ally, as it is his profession; and that Knowledge and Reason are sure ministers to Faith.' ECE thus endorses Newman's view regarding the mutual relations, complementarity, and hierarchical nature of all knowledge in its consideration of 'the cause of truth' (ECE 4).
long search orders all knowledge and professional training towards the service of revealed truth in the science of theology.

The classical Christian approach to human development at the service of man’s final end does not contradict Newman’s theory of the circle of knowledge and the dangers of mutual encroachments by the branches of knowledge. Perhaps he anticipated this objection, when he provided his own commentary on the text from The Tamworth Reading Room in his uniform edition of Discussions and Arguments: ‘Of the supremacy of each science in its own field of thought, and the encroachments upon it of other sciences, vide the author’s “University Education,” Disc. 3, 2nd ed., and “University Subjects,” Nos. 6, 7, and 10.’ But he does not retract the force and clear meaning of this passage written in 1841 as an Anglican, by anything he said or avoided in the 1852 Discourses as a Catholic educator. The same distinction is made in ECE, together with the assertion that the branches of knowledge must operate within theologically prescribed limits: ‘The legitimate autonomy of human culture and the sciences, recognizes the academic freedom of scholars in each discipline in accordance with its own principles and proper methods, and within the confines of the truth and the common good’. As a magisterial document, the context and meaning of ‘within the confines of truth and the common good’ must be theologically interpreted.

3.3 ‘Christianity . . . the Element and Principle of all Education’

The passage from The Tamworth Reading Room quoted in the last section contains uncompromising and even sobering prescriptions and warnings for education. Newman is

78 DA 275.

79 This passage, which includes an internal quotation from Gaudium et Spes, is further analysed in chapter 5.4.2, below.
not speaking about an abstract notion of teaching some sort of natural theology in a hypothetical university; rather, he explicitly asserts that the concrete religion of ‘Christianity, and nothing short of it must be made the element and principle of all education’. Here is a bold claim indeed, when one considers that Christianity as conceived by Newman involved all of the various ingredients of natural theology, special revelation to the Hebrew and Christian peoples handed on through Sacred Scripture and Tradition, a dogmatic and moral system based on that revealed truth, supernatural faith, divine grace, apostolic succession, the sacraments, – in short, an entire world view and way of life that combined specific, personal knowledge of the triune God with man’s religious duty and way of salvation. All of these elements combined, Newman says, are the sine qua non of true [i.e. Christian] education. He does not argue merely for the inclusion of ‘comparative religious studies’ in the curriculum, or of a consideration of ‘values’ in education as is popular in some modern programmes of State education. He rather insists on the centrality of Christianity and all that entails, as the only really adequate foundation, rule, and goal for education. He illustrates this centrality by warning against the inadequacies and perversions that result by substituting religion with its would-be usurpers:

---

80 But note that any definitions of ‘element’ and ‘principle’ are tentative and evocative in nature only. Newman is not insisting on one and only one strictly prescriptive definition of his terms. He speaks more as the poet than the physicist in this and other like passages, appealing more to the religious imagination than to an empirical or analytical faculty. His claim for Christianity as the element and principle of education is strengthened in Discourse 1 where his ‘high theological view’ of education specified ‘Catholicity’ as ‘the fundamental principle’ of a Catholic university (Idea 26-7).

81 Newman highlights the inescapable dogmatic and controversial points of Christianity as well, saying these too must be treated in education, and not brushed aside as Peel proposed: ‘Christianity is faith, faith implies a doctrine; a doctrine propositions; propositions yes or no, yes or no differences. Differences, then, are the natural attendants on Christianity, and you can not have Christianity and not have differences. When, then, Sir Robert Peel calls such differences points of “party feeling”, what is this but to insult Christianity?’ Peel dislikes differences, for they militate against ‘the national machine’ (DA 284).
If in education we begin with nature before grace, with evidences before faith, with science before conscience, with poetry before practice, we shall be doing much the same as if we were to indulge the appetites and passions, and turn a deaf ear to the reason. In each case we misplace what in its place is a divine gift. If we attempt to effect a moral improvement by means of poetry, we shall but mature into a mawkish, frivolous, and fastidious sentimentalism; —if by means of argument, into a dry, unamiable longheadedness; —if by good society, into a polished outside, with hollowness within, in which vice has lost its grossness, and perhaps increased its malignity; —if by experimental science, into an uppish, supercilious temper, much inclined to scepticism. 82

These are precisely the substitutions enjoined on the readers of Sir Robert Peel’s inaugural address. 83 The Tory leader could hardly have anticipated such a flourish of sarcastic disdain for his well-intentioned ideals. Gilley offers him his half-hearted sympathy—‘Poor Peel: he had haplessly strayed into a rather simple-minded refutation of Newman’s whole philosophy, in his assumption that reason or rational knowledge alone is the highway to Christian truth’. 84

This was not the last time that Peel was to provide Newman with an opportunity to enunciate his educational ideals, for it was during his watch as Prime Minister that the ‘godless’ Queen’s Colleges were established in Ireland, resulting in the counter-establishment of the Catholic University in Dublin, and the writing of Newman’s Idea. Newman re-engaged Peel in the debate from afar: ‘Knowledge is one thing, virtue is another; good sense is not conscience, refinement is not humility, nor is largeness and justness of view faith.’ Newman does not deprecate these attendants of the cultured man; he merely is putting them in their place by showing how powerless they are to substitute for true religion. ‘Philosophy, however enlightened, however profound, gives no command over the passions, no influential motives, no vivifying principles’. The making of a gentleman was for Newman one of the

82 DA 274-5.
83 See the introduction and discussion of TRR in chapter 2.4.2, ‘Education and Religion in The Tamworth Reading Room’
84 Gilley, Newman and His Age, 196.
many natural 'objects of a university'. But a 'noble and courteous bearing in the conduct of life' and the other 'connatural qualities of a large knowledge' are wholly inadequate to effect the salvation and sanctification of fallen man. 'Liberal Education makes not the Christian, not the Catholic, but the gentleman.' In a passage reminiscent of the Anglican writer's *Tamworth Reading Room*, the Catholic Newman drives home his point with startling imagery:

> Quarry the granite rock with razors, or moor the vessel with a thread of silk, then may you hope with such keen and delicate instruments as human knowledge and human reason to contend against those giants, the passion and the pride of man.

Newman's remedy for what he believed were the inevitable distortions of Peel's system was to 'reverse the order of things: put Faith first and Knowledge second'. Here again are direct echoes of Origen. The proper order of things is: evangelization to faith, catechesis in the faith, liberal education, philosophy, theology. 'Let the University minister to the Church, and then classical poetry becomes the type of Gospel truth, and physical science a comment on Genesis or Job, and Aristotle changes to Butler, and Arcesilas into Berkeley.' Theology thus serves as a regulating principle for properly understanding the fundamental principles of each branch, by orienting them to God.

---

85 Idea 110.

86 Idea 111.

87 DA 275. Newman here is speaking poetically, not scientifically, to evoke an imaginative response to the project of integrating faith and learning within a Catholic worldview. He is not proposing how in fact these areas can be realised in the concrete. See chapter 5.4, below: 'A Continuing Reflection in the Light of Faith' for a further discussion on the matter of integrating the Christian message with literature and the natural sciences.
4. Integral Human Formation in Christ

4.1 Restoring Educational Unity in Christ

Christian education is, by definition, directed towards the priority of transcendent goals such as salvation in Christ, restoration of the divine image, and eternal life with God. At the service of 'ultimate objectives', CSTTM speaks of the Catholic academy's ability to attend 'not only to "how", but also to' the questions of "why"' in education. Founded on a 'definite concept of man and life', based on Christian revelation, it overcomes any misunderstanding as regards the [false] claim of neutrality in [secular] education, restoring to the educational process the unity which saves it from dispersion amid the meandering of knowledge and acquired facts, and focuses on the human person in his or her integral, transcendent, historical identity.\(^8\)

Such a project is based on the premise that if the Catholic faith is true, then 'the whole truth about . . . man' as discussed in ECE 4 is discovered in its fullness only in a Christian context that is guided by its 'conviction that "it is only in the mystery of the Word made flesh that the mystery of man truly becomes clear"'.\(^8\)

The key to 'restoring all things in Christ'\(^9\) is to see the centrality and preeminence of Jesus Christ, the 'living' and 'chief cornerstone',\(^9\) and final end in the Christian vision:

No other Foundation can any one lay than that which is laid, which is Jesus Christ.\(^9\)

For in him all things were created, in heaven and in earth, visible and invisible, whether thrones or dominions or principalities or authorities—all

\(^8\) CSTTM 10; emphasis added.

\(^9\) Ibid. The internal quotation is from Gaudium et Spes, no. 22, and is one of John Paul II’s recurring themes in many of his writings.

\(^9\) GE introduction.


\(^9\) 1 Corinthians 3:11.
things were created through him and for him. He is before all things, and in him all things hold together.93

For he [God the Father] has made known to us in all wisdom and insight the mystery of his will, according to his purpose which he set forth in Christ as a plan for the fullness of time, to unite all things in him, things in heaven and things on earth.94

The Catholic answer to the fragmentation of knowledge and the quest for meaning in human existence is founded on these articles of faith. Without the incarnate Christ at the centre of life, civilization, and, indeed, education, things do not – because they cannot – ‘hold together’. This is the insight of W. B. Yeats in his poem, ‘The Second Coming’:

Turning and turning in the widening gyre
The falcon cannot hear the falconer;
Things fall apart; the centre cannot hold;
Mere anarchy is loosed upon the world,
The blood-dimmed tide is loosed, and everywhere
The ceremony of innocence is drowned;
The best lack all conviction, while the worst
Are full of passionate intensity.95

There are many layers of meaning in the poem, but most critics see the falcon somehow representing modern civilization, which is increasingly losing touch with the ‘Falconer’, Jesus Christ.96 In the Christian vision, Christ is the glue that unites the celestial spheres, the

93 Colossians 1:16-17; emphasis added.

94 Vulgate: instaurare: to renew, restore, sum up. See note 1 of chapter 1 for Pius X’s adoption of ‘instaurare omnia in Christo’ (to restore all things in Christ) as his pontifical motto. Cf.: AV: ‘gather together into one all things in Christ’.

95 Ephesians 1:9, 10.


97 See, e.g., the commentary on this poem in Yeats’s Poems, p. 574, which makes these identifications, together with ‘mere anarchy’ as the fruit of the Russian Revolution.
branches of knowledge, the faculties of the human person, and the communities of man. To fly away from his presence is to invite disunity and anarchy.

Given the centrality of Christ in Catholic education, a theology of the academy explores how the many objectives and priorities of education hold together in Christ, replacing anarchy with hierarchy, or 'sacred order'. We may distinguish, but must not separate the identifiable spheres of human development. Examples of such spheres would include the spiritual, moral, intellectual, ecclesial, emotional, social, physical, and vocational aspects of human formation. Newman argued for the importance of each sphere, but gave priority, in the long view of eternity, to the spiritual and moral goals of education, because, 'time is short, eternity is long'.

Thus, as we saw in his pastoral care of souls and in his sermons, he gave first priority to salvation and the pursuit of holiness. Following Origen's pattern of Christian humanism, he began with evangelization to faith, followed by catechesis. Only within this context, for example, does the programme of grammar, a classical education, and philosophy find their fertile soil for integral human development. One tends to forget these priorities because of the attention paid to Newman's theory of liberal higher education. But it should be recalled how his work as both an Anglican and Catholic priest was ever concerned for the essential parochial duty of orienting all Christians of every class and age towards the long view of eternity, and of man's final end.

Once a 'Catholic vision' of educational priorities is established, Newman would have us focus on intellectual culture, but always at the service of revealed truth. For example, the

---

98 These are Newman's final words written in Development of Doctrine, before he quotes the Nunc Dimittis (Dev. 445). Cf. his prescription for the spiritual priorities of a Christian minister: 'All that he does is intended to remind men that time is short, death is certain, and eternity long' (PS 8:147).

99 See note 96, on page 74.
mental aims of gaining knowledge as its own end and developing the distinct mental faculties of memory, analysis, synthesis, imagination, and the philosophical habit of mind, are the proximate, or direct aims of the academy. Similarly, such various objectives as: physical health and athletic skill, incorporation into the local Church’s sacramental life, and building family loyalty, if properly ordered to God, may all serve the ultimate aims of salvation, sanctification, and communion with the Godhead in all eternity. Orienting all of life and learning to Christ and eternity is the key to integral human formation for both Newman and the magisterium.

4.2 "Intellect, the Instrument of Religious Training"

One of the concrete ways that Newman provided for restoring unity with Christ at the centre of the concentric priorities of education at CUI was in the building of a University church on St. Stephen’s Green in Dublin. In a memorandum to Archbishop Cullen, he insisted that the ‘Unity of the University’ which might be spread throughout the city of Dublin, ‘will consist in the Unity of the Catholic dogma and spirit’ and embodied in a ‘University Church’, where the ‘indissoluble union of philosophy and religion’ would become incarnate. Here sermons and sacred liturgy would inculcate ‘a loyal and generous devotion to the Church in the breasts of the young’. Newman also calls these mental aims the ‘direct scope’ of a university, ‘in its bare idea, before we view it as an instrument of the Church’ (Idea 114). See chapter 5.4.1, ‘Integration of Knowledge’, below, for a study of Newman’s mental aims for cultivating the intellect.

100 Newman also calls these mental aims the ‘direct scope’ of a university, ‘in its bare idea, before we view it as an instrument of the Church’ (Idea 114). See chapter 5.4.1, ‘Integration of Knowledge’, below, for a study of Newman’s mental aims for cultivating the intellect.

101 Dated May 24, 1854; cited in LD 16:560 and Campaign 97. Newman’s priorities for a university church expressed a common mid-Victorian Christian educational ideal illustrated by an anecdote referred to by David Newsome: “What is a college without a chapel?” Bishop Christopher Wordsworth once asked a friend... “An angel without wings,” was the prompt reply. The Bishop went on his way rejoicing. We need not wonder at his pleasure. His friend had expressed in a single phrase the ideal of “godliness and good learning” (see Godliness and Good Learning, p. 1 and note 1).
of Newman's most important sermons for an understanding of his educational theology. Once again, such a deeper (foundational) and higher (theological) view is found in a source apart from the Idea. The sermon was preached at High Mass in the University Church, the Sunday after the Assumption, on the feast day of St. Monica, mother of St. Augustine of Hippo. Newman used this occasion to illustrate the nature of a Catholic academy in terms of its maternal concern and activity on behalf of her young. 'Intellect, the Instrument of Religious Training'\(^{102}\) was in fact Newman's chosen vehicle to open the 1856-7 academical year. Here he insists on the need to integrate theology and philosophy, faith and life; and he did so with compelling force and creativity. An analysis of the main points of the sermon's text will bring together many of the strands that have been identified separately thus far in the course of this study, while deepening our understanding of Newman's holistic vision of Christian education.

The gospel reading for the day was: 'And when [Jesus] came nigh to the gate of the city, behold, a dead man was carried out, the only son of his mother: and she was a widow.'\(^{103}\)

Newman follows the Church's lead in the Gospel reading prescribed for the feast day, by imagining the widow of this verse as a prototype of St. Monica. She too is a widow, and is following after her son who is being led off by the '[pall] bearers' of 'ignorance, pride, appetite, and ambition.' He begins the sermon by painting a vivid portrait of St. Monica, following her wayward son from city to city, 'seeking' and finally 'gaining by her penances the conversion.

\(^{102}\) Newman selected this sermon to open his collection of written Catholic sermons found in *Sermons Preached on Various Occasions* <1857> (1870 UE) 1892. Hereafter cited as OS. Pages 1-14.

\(^{103}\) Luke 7:12.
Theoloical Foundations of Newman's Educational Ideal

of her son’. Newman contrasts her with ‘many a mother who is anxious for her son’s bodily welfare’ while neglecting ‘his soul’. But not so with Monica. Augustine was already ‘accomplished, eloquent, able, and distinguished;’ but ‘all this was nothing to her while he was dead in God’s sight, while he was the slave of sin, while he was the prey of heresy’. Newman speaks as a pastor to his academic community, pointing out that the condition of Augustine before his conversion is very much like their own; one that is found as ‘age goes after age’, with succeeding generations of Augustines rushing ‘forth again and again’, ruled by their ‘young ambition’, ‘intellectual energy’, and ‘turbulent appetites’. Newman is a master of pastoral psychology in many of his sermons, as he demonstrates here: the secrets of his listeners’ hearts, the outward signs of their inward lack of integration are all laid bare before them. Perhaps they see in themselves reflections of Augustine: one who was ‘educated, yet untaught ... unenlightened and untrained’. Such is the bad news that Newman brings. The good news is that importunate widows are assisted in their prayers for their children by Holy Mother Church, who, through her schools and universities, receives those ‘whom father and mother can keep no longer’. The university’s special mission is to be a mother, or Alma Mater, that sees to the integral human development of her children.

---

104 OS 1.

105 OS 2. We learn from his Confessions that Augustine waged a turbulent inward battle against lust, and had fallen into the heresy of Manichaeanism

106 Cf. GE Introduction: ‘To fulfill the mandate ... of restoring all things in Christ, Holy Mother the Church must be concerned with the whole of man’s life ...’

107 OS 5.

108 Newman’s references in this sermon to the university as Alma Mater are treated in context in the next section, and further expanded in comparison to ECE 1, in chapter 5.2.1, ‘Born from the Heart of the Church’, below.
4.3 Reuniting Intellectual and Moral Virtue

Newman continues: 'The human mind... may be regarded from two principal points of view, as intellectual and moral. As intellectual, it apprehends truth; as moral, it apprehends duty. The perfection of the intellect is called ability and talent; the perfection of our moral nature is virtue'.\(^{109}\) The problem that a university seeks to address is that 'as things are found in the world, the two are separated, and independent of each other'; all too often we find great 'power of intellect' divorced from 'moral greatness'.\(^{110}\) The reason for this disjunction is found in the Christian doctrine of original sin:

It was not so in the beginning; not that our nature is essentially different from what it was when first created; but that the Creator, upon its creation, raised it above itself by a supernatural grace, which blended together all its faculties, and made them conspire into one whole, and act in common towards one end; so that, had the race continued in that blessed state of privilege, there never would have been distance, rivalry, hostility between one faculty and another. It is otherwise now; so much the worse for us;—the grace is gone; the soul can not hold together; it falls to pieces.\(^{111}\)

We have already spoken of this tendency towards disintegration, and here Newman reveals the *theological root* of the problem. The doctrines of original sin and the absolute necessity for re-supplying supernatural grace for true educational transformation in Christ to occur are forcefully insisted upon by Pius XI in his encyclical letter, *Divini illius Magistri*:

*Every form of pedagogic naturalism which in any way excludes or weakens supernatural Christian formation in the teaching of youth, is therefore false. Every method of education founded, wholly or in part, on the denial or*

---

\(^{109}\) OS 5. In the *Idea*, Newman calls mental culture 'the perfection or virtue of the intellect' (*Idea* 114). This section therefore refers to 'reuniting intellectual and moral virtue' as a matter of stylistic symmetry, although Newman does not appear to use this exact phrase.

\(^{110}\) OS 5-6.

\(^{111}\) OS 6. Cf. the effects of original sin ('the grace is gone; the soul cannot hold together; it falls to pieces'), to the discussion of Colossians 1 and Yeats's 'The Second Coming', on page 159 ff., above.
forgetfulness of original sin and of grace, and which relies on the sole powers
of human nature, is unsound.\textsuperscript{112}

Newman thus stands squarely within the tradition of Christian revelation in his assessment
of the human person both in terms of the root problem, and the divine solution. These are
presented in Discourse Eight of the Idea, ‘Knowledge and Religious Duty’, as the first
principles of ‘Revealed Truth’. Grace alone is able to address the ‘ruined state of man; his
utter inability to gain Heaven by any thing he can do himself; [and] the moral certainty of
his losing his soul if left to himself . . . [N]o one gains Heaven except by the free grace of
God, or without a regeneration of nature . . . no one can please Him without faith’. The
‘ordinary instrument of salvation’ is ‘incorporation into the Catholic Church’.\textsuperscript{113} The effects
of grace and this incorporation include the restoration of the original divine likeness, which
overcomes the separation implicit in the common perception that ‘duty cannot be pleasant,
virtue cannot be intellectual, that goodness cannot be great, that conscientiousness cannot
be heroic’. Newman grants ‘that there is a separation’, but he denied its continued
‘necessity’,\textsuperscript{114} especially in the light of the grace and formation available in a Catholic
academy where students are recognized as ‘not only moral’ beings, but ‘intellectual beings’
as well; the separation is one of historical contingency, and not of original design: ‘ever since
the fall of man, religion is here, and philosophy is there’.\textsuperscript{115}

Newman now has the attention of his listeners. They see the effects of original sin in
terms of the inward disunity they find within themselves. They have come to the opening

\textsuperscript{112} Papal Teachings: Education, 228.

\textsuperscript{113} Idea 158-9.

\textsuperscript{114} OS 7-8.

\textsuperscript{115} OS 12.
mass of the school year to reflect on their common mission together. The Rector is about to present the solution which a university as Alma Mater rightfully applies:

Here, then, I conceive, is the object of the Holy See and the Catholic Church in setting up Universities; it is to reunite things which were in the beginning joined together by God, and have been put asunder by man. . . . I wish the same spots and the same individuals to be at once oracles of philosophy and shrines of devotion. ¹¹⁶

He compares this vision of university education with that of his unnamed adversaries in the nineteenth century debate over the place of theology and religion in higher education—men like Peel, Brougham and Bentham: 'It will not satisfy me, what satisfies so many, to have two independent systems, intellectual and religious, going at once side by side, by a sort of division of labour, and only accidentally brought together.' He has taken a stand, and will not shift. His repetition and development enforce the point: 'It will not satisfy me, if religion is here, and science there, and young men converse with science all day, and lodge with religion in the evening. . . . I want the same roof to contain both the intellectual and moral discipline'. Morality, devotion, and religion are no mere niceties to put 'a sort of finish to the sciences; nor is science a sort of feather in the cap, . . . an ornament and set-off to devotion'. They are constitutive of the fully integrated person. And now he urges his view upon them, hoping they will adopt his own desire: 'I want the intellectual laymen to be religious, and the devout ecclesiastic to be intellectual.' ¹¹⁷

Here is Newman's theological prescription for university education. It is not a question of developing intellectual versus moral virtue. Both qualities can and should become manifest in the same person. The unique contribution of a Catholic university is to use the occasion of intellectual development during the brief years of study as an opportunity for the parallel

¹¹⁶ OS 12-13.
¹¹⁷ OS 13.
and interwoven goals of religious understanding, devotion, and morality. And while he acknowledges that 'sanctity' has its influence which is greater in 'the long run', nevertheless, 'the influence of the intellect is greater' during the university years. 'Therefore, in the case of the young, whose education lasts a few years, where the intellect is, there is the influence. Their literary, their scientific teachers, really have the forming of them.'

The temptations to avoid moral virtue and religion are aggravated in young men to whom 'the Evil One' whispers that 'religious people are commonly either very dull or very tiresome: nay, that religion itself after all is more suitable to women and children, who live at home, than to men.' In answer to this temptation, Newman insists to his audience of young undergraduates and their mentors, that 'youths need a masculine religion, if it is to carry captive their restless imaginations, and their wild intellects, as well as to touch their susceptible hearts'.

118 I.e., religious observance and devotional practice in a university setting.
119 OS 14; emphasis in original.
120 OS 8.
121 OS 14; emphasis added. 'Manliness', or, in its stronger form, 'muscular Christianity' was a common educational aim for physical vigour and general Christian character development in Victorian England. See David Newsome's study of 'Godliness and Manliness' in Godliness and Good Learning, (op. cit.), chapter 4, which includes the observation that Kingsley and others saw the Anglican Newman and the Oxford Movement after his departure generally, as opposed to this ideal, trending towards sentimentalism, ritualism, and even effeminacy (pp. 207-8). Newman evidently embraced the basic goal of 'manliness', as testified by his comment here that 'youths need a masculine religion'. See also letter to the Duchess of Norfolk about her son becoming 'more manly', discussed on p. 226, below.

Cf. the comment of a CUI student regarding W. G. Penny, an Oxford convert who joined the Oratorians from the first at Maryvale, and who held several posts at the University under Newman: 'Rev. William Penny, most muscular of Christians, profound connoisseur of pipes, and kindliest of beings' (cited in McGrath, Newman's University, p. 215, note 2; emphasis added).
The sermon concludes with a petition to St. Monica that is itself instructive of what Newman believed to be the supernatural presence and power that enabled his integrative vision, as well as the ultimate goals of education:

Gain for us, first, that we may intensely feel that God's grace is all in all, and that we are nothing; next, that, for His greater glory, and for the honour of Holy Church, and for the good of man, we may be "zealous for all the better gifts," and may excel in intellect as we excel in virtue.\textsuperscript{122}

Thus for Newman, Catholic university education—and by reasonable extension, all of Catholic education—is entirely dependent on God's grace. The holistic educational goal of a Catholic academy consists of integral human formation in Christ, reuniting intellectual and moral virtue. This is done by means of, and for the honour of the Church, our alma mater, but always with the ultimate aim of glorifying God.

\textsuperscript{122} OS 14.
IDENTITY OF A CATHOLIC ACADEMY

Besides the teaching, research, and services common to all Universities, a Catholic University, by institutional commitment, brings to its task the inspiration and light of the Christian message. In a Catholic University, therefore, Catholic ideals, attitudes and principles penetrate and inform university activities in accordance with the proper nature and autonomy of these activities.

— John Paul II

[A Catholic University] does DIRECTLY teach and inculcate ... ‘Catholic expression, Catholic feeling, Catholic fact – ’ and ‘all instruction is leavened with Catholicism.’ This I hold, as strongly as words can express it.

— John Henry Newman

Both Ex Corde Ecclesiae and the Idea of a University address the question of a Catholic university's institutional identity by reflecting on the separate meanings of the terms, 'university' and 'Catholic'. In so far as it is a university, it has a fundamental academic identity not unlike any other true university. It is 'dedicated to research, to teaching and to the education of students who freely associate with their teachers in a common love of knowledge'. In so far as it is Catholic, it must be founded on and shaped by an intrinsic ecclesial identity, which includes a commitment to Christian revelation and mission, as interpreted by the Church's magisterium. This chapter focusses on comparing Newman with ECE's vision of Catholic

1 ECE 14; emphasis in original.

2 LD 15:136; capitalization in the original. Newman is writing in 1852 about his university Discourses to Dr. (later Bishop) David Moriarty. The words within quotation marks signal Newman's use of Moriarty's own words in an earlier letter.

3 ECE 1.
higher education. But an approach similar to that of ECE is also taken in Church documents addressing the identity and mission of Catholic primary and secondary schools. In *The Catholic School* we read: 'To understand fully the specific mission of the Catholic school it is essential to keep in mind the basic concept of what a school is; that which does not reproduce the characteristic features of a school can not be a Catholic school.' Here a school is defined as 'a place of integral formation by means of a systematic and critical assimilation of culture'. After its treatment of a Catholic school *qua* school, the document then claims 'we can now examine its Catholic quality, namely, its reference to a Christian concept of life centred on Jesus Christ.' In words that strengthen the argument of the last chapter on theological foundations, it continues: 'Christ is the foundation of the whole educational enterprise in a Catholic school.'

1. **Academic Identity**

1.1 **An Academic Community**

*Ex Corde Ecclesiae* proposes that every university is, by its very nature, an academic community with three distinct objectives:

A Catholic University, like every university, is a community of scholars representing various branches of human knowledge. It is dedicated to research, to teaching, and to various kinds of service in accordance with its cultural mission.

---

4 CS 25.

5 CS 26.

6 CS 33.

7 CS 34.

8 ECE General Norms 2.1.
Newman also conceived of the nature of the academy in terms of an academic community. His pastoral priority of creating a Catholic community atmosphere animated by close interpersonal relations, and fostered especially by a system of Colleges and tutors, is explored in chapter six. But 'a Studium Generale or “School of Universal Learning”' was, 'in its simple and rudimentary form' (apart from theological considerations), 'a school of knowledge of every kind, consisting of teachers and learners from every quarter.' His conception of a 'school' here connotes a center or place where intellectual and social interaction creates a sort of community from people of disparate interests and backgrounds. This is what 'a University seems to be in its essence, a place for the communication and circulation of thought, by means of personal intercourse . . .' His description of the 'atmosphere' of an academic community in Discourse Five is consonant in this regard with the definition from ECE just cited. A University is

a seat of universal learning, considered as a place of education. An assemblage of learned men, zealous for their own sciences, and rival of each other are brought, by familiar intercourse and for the sake of intellectual peace, to adjust together the claims and relations of their respective subjects of investigation. They learn to respect, to consult, to aid each other. Thus is created a pure and clear atmosphere of thought which the student also breathes, though in his own case he only pursues a few sciences out of the multitude'.

1.2 The Priority of Teaching

For those familiar with the Idea, a university's three-fold objective of teaching, research, and service as identified in ECE may seem at odds with Newman's opening statements in the preface. There it appears that his vision is limited to the objective of teaching: 'The view

\______

\hspace{0.5em}^9\text{HS}\ 3:6.
\hspace{0.5em}^10\text{Idea}\ 95.
taken of a University in these Discourses is the following:—that it is a place of teaching universal knowledge.\footnote{Idea 5; emphasis in original.} The impression is strengthened by his claims that 'to discover and to teach are distinct functions; they are also distinct gifts, and are not 'commonly found united in the same person'\footnote{Idea 8.} and that a university exists for 'the diffusion and extension of knowledge rather than the advancement'.\footnote{Idea 5.} For Newman, the end of advancing knowledge through research and exploration was more proper to research institutions like the French Academy and the Royal Society of Science.\footnote{Culler, 311, note 37. The explosion of research and new technologies Newman witnessed in the nineteenth century was not centred in the universities.} His view was in keeping with his academic peers of the 1850's. 'The conception of the university as a research institution arose in Germany in the 18th century but was not generally accepted in England until the 1870's.'\footnote{See his discussion in Idea 5-8.}

The apparent contradiction between Newman's focus on teaching, contrasted with ECE's three-fold objective for a university deserves critical attention here. If Newman had no place for research and service in his university, then his relevance for today's Catholic academies would seem to be greatly diminished. However, there does exist considerable evidence that Newman contemplated and promoted both research and service in harmony with the document's concerns. This evidence will be presented in terms of the following interrelated elements: (1) the purpose, title, and content of part one of the Idea, 'University Teaching', (2) Newman's characteristic use of 'polar opposites in tension' when describing the ends of education, including (3) his use of the terms, \textit{direct end}, \textit{practical end}, and \textit{indirect effects}, of a university, (4) an understanding of how the term, 'research', is narrowly defined
in Discourse One by Newman, as compared to three levels of meanings found in Church documents, and (5) the demonstrable fact that the University of Ireland did conceive of, provide for, and promote in various ways, the objectives of research and service.

'University Teaching'. The first step of this intertextual study is to recall and reflect on the separate historical and literary contexts of the literature under investigation. The Church documents are assuming the entire patrimony of divine revelation and the history of Christian education. Their arguments are not concerned — as the Discourses were — to construct an abstract picture of a university, beginning with an appeal to natural reason. These documents usually take the 'high theological view'\(^{16}\) from their opening paragraphs (q.v.). For example, the ecclesial dimension of a Catholic academy and its project of integrating faith with life and learning are taken as axiomatic in ECE and CSTTM. \(^{17}\) But Newman has a very different starting point in Discourse One of the Idea, because of his different purpose and audience. A preliminary clue regarding the difference is found in the title of the Discourses. In the first collected edition of 1853 they were called The Scope and Nature of University Education. When they were published as part one of the Idea, the Discourses were even more precisely identified by the new title, 'University Teaching'.\(^{18}\)


\(^{17}\) See chapter 5.2, 'Ecclesial Identity', below.

\(^{18}\) 'Education' and 'Teaching' underlined for emphasis. For a fuller discussion of the writing and publishing history of these texts, see chapter 3.3.2, 'Newman's University Writings'; appendix 1 'Synopsis', years 1851-9, 1873; and appendix 3.1: 'Publishing History of the Idea of a University, Part I'.


Newman is not speaking in his introductory lecture about any sort of holistic ideal for a university's identity. He clearly states that he is adopting a limited perspective for a particular time and audience. He is limiting himself to the educational or teaching aspect of a university's identity, i.e., the teaching of students—or more precisely, the nature and scope of undergraduate liberal arts education. In part two of the *Idea* and elsewhere, he elaborates on his idea of a Catholic academy's identity and mission, including such elements as religious and moral formation, professional training, graduate education, research, and service to society.

**A Model of Polarity.** Chapter one's discussion of methodology observed that Newman often used overstatement, stark contrast, and even hyperbole to make his point. It has been shown, for example, that Newman positively insisted on a moral and religious formation in his prescriptions for a Catholic university. So how does one understand his claim that a university's object is 'intellectual and not moral', and then again, 'if [the object is] religious training, I do not see how it can be the seat of literature and science'? Newman's complex thought is perhaps best approached here by an appeal to a hermeneutic, or model, of 'polarity', to discover what ideas he is trying to hold in tension as apparent polar opposites. A study of his sermons and other educational writings make it clear that he does

---

19 'The view taken of a University in these Discourses is the following . . .' (*Idea* 5).

20 See note 36 on p. 8, above.

21 See chapter 4.4, 'Integral Human Formation in Christ', above.

22 *Idea* 5.

23 Refer to p. 8 ff. for an explanation of the 'model of polarity'.

not believe education must be either intellectual or religious. He argues rather for it to be
both intellectual and religious.24

Direct End, Practical End, and Indirect Effects. One way in which Newman proposes
a 'unity in tension' is by distinguishing between a number of separate but inter-related ends
and effects of a university education. The 'direct end' is 'cultivation of mind', the 'indirect
effects' are 'religious' (i.e., promoting 'the mental culture of an immortal being')25, and the
'practical end' is 'training good members of society'.26 In his self-limiting consideration of a
university in the abstract, he explores what a university does that no other institution does
for its direct end. By focusing on teaching in the Discourses, he is insisting that in an
undergraduate setting, the primary purpose of the institution is teaching and mentoring young
students in the context of an academic community. He illustrates this point by comparing

24 See OS 13 and chapter 4.4, above.

25 Idea xxxiii; emphasis in original.

26 Idea 154. The direct end of every university is teaching and integrating universal knowledge. But it also has the 'practical end' (Idea 154) of being of service to society, by preparing students to take
their place in the world. See p. 185, below, for a development of Newman's idea of the practical ends
of a university in terms of the academy's mission of service.

Newman's summary of the first 8 Discourses describes the direct and practical ends in this way:
'I have accordingly laid down first, that all branches of knowledge are, at least implicitly, the subject-
matter of its teaching; that these branches are not isolated and independent one of another, but form
together a whole or system; that they run into each other, and complete each other, and that, in
proportion to our view of them as a whole, is the exactness and trustworthiness of the knowledge
which they separately convey; that the process of imparting knowledge to the intellect in this
philosophical way is its true culture; that such culture is a good in itself; that the knowledge which
is both its instrument and result is called Liberal Knowledge; that such culture, together with the
knowledge which effects it, may fitly be sought for its own sake; that it is, however, in addition, of great
secular utility, as constituting the best and highest formation of the intellect for social and political life' (Ibid.;
emphasis added).

After this summary of the direct and practical ends of a university qua university, Discourse 9
then describes the indirect effects or religious ends of a Catholic university in 'Duties of the Church
towards Knowledge'. See the next section on 'Ecclesial Identity' for an analysis of Discourse 9 in this
regard.
a university to a hospital, which has as its direct end, 'bodily health', and yet 'the Church uses Hospitals religiously' for similar 'indirect effects': 'the bodily health of an immortal being'.

It should be noted that the direct end of mental cultivation which he is so strongly defending in the Discourses was primarily designed for youths typically between sixteen and eighteen years of age. The actual course of study consisted of a two-year liberal arts curriculum, designed to cultivate students' intellectual powers, and culminating in the degree of 'Scholar'. Some, but not all of these graduates would go on to specialize in a major field of study or professional training for an additional two years, leading to the Bachelor of Arts degree at about the age of twenty. Still fewer would pursue graduate studies. The full range of courses and activities at CUI included many elements besides what Newman sometimes calls a university's direct end. To not recognize this fact is to misunderstand his place for religious, scientific, vocational, and the many other 'ends' and 'effects' of a Catholic university.

1.3 Research and Service

Yet another interpretive clue for the question of Newman's place for research in the academy is that the very term, 'research', carries several different meanings in the Church documents with which a comparison is being sought. In order to see whether Newman converges or diverges from the documents' three-fold objective that includes research, the first step must be to define the term according to the documents themselves. These sources propose at least three separate but inter-related purposes for activities characterized as research: (a) searching

---

27 Idea xxxiii; emphasis in original.

28 See Campaign 99, LD 15:561, and McGrath, Consecration of Learning, 208, for a summary of CUI's course of studies. This basic pattern finds a contemporary parallel in the American university setting where the first two years are devoted to a core curriculum of 'general studies', sometimes leading to an 'Associate of Arts' degree, with a further concentration in a major field of two years leading to the B.A. or B.Sc.
for truth and integration, (b) promoting scientific advancement, and (c) applying a theological perspective to all areas of research. The following discussion will consider each of these three aspects or levels of research, to demonstrate the close coherence of Newman and the Church documents on the matter.

(a) The Search for Truth and Integration. The Church documents on education often speak of a primary goal of an academy being the search for and discovery of truth, even at the level of pre-university studies: ‘The various school subjects do not present only knowledge to be attained, but also values to be acquired and truths to be discovered. All of which demands an atmosphere characterized by the search for truth’. References to search and discovery elevate the project of both teaching and learning to a level beyond mere information transfer between teachers, textbooks, and students. Individual students and teachers must re-discover for themselves knowledge and relationships that others have discovered in their own ‘personal conquest of truth’. In a paragraph devoted to the definition of research, ECE claims that ‘in a Catholic University, research necessarily includes ... the search for an integration of knowledge’; it is a ‘place of research, where ... each individual discipline is studied in a systematic manner; moreover, the various disciplines are brought into dialogue for their mutual enhancement. Defined at this most basic level, therefore, research can mean the continuous process of systematic analysis, synthesis, and reflection, in the search for truth.

---

29 CSTTM 14.

30 An echo of A. J. Boekraad’s study of Newman’s epistemology in The Personal Conquest of Truth According to J. H. Newman (Louvain: Editions Nauwelaerts, 1955), where he explores how to safeguard ‘universal truth, and at the same time, allow for personal characteristics in the method of acquiring and of possessing it’ (p. 11).

31 ECE 15.

32 Ibid. The notions of systematic study, scientific advancement, integration of knowledge, and the ‘continuing quest for truth’ are combined in this paragraph under the rubric of ‘research’. 
In an essay that first appeared in the Gazette, Newman expands on the university's purpose in promoting research in the sense of both professors and students searching for, discovering, and integrating knowledge. Education is a process of continually moving towards a more thorough mastery of one's field and integrating one's discoveries with other knowledge: 'It is a place where inquiry is pushed forward, and discoveries verified and perfected, and rashness rendered innocuous, and error exposed, by the collision of mind with mind, and knowledge with knowledge.' This view was in fact a reality at CUI, where the priority of student formation—far from excluding research as defined in the documents—actually required it. For example, Newman stipulated that 'a professor is not to be overburdened with lectures so that he may have time for the steady pursuit and thorough mastery of the department of science or learning which he has undertaken'. University regulations further mandated that professors 'are bound to give themselves to the study of it [their science or department], to extend its cultivation to the best of their power, [and] to be alive to its interests'.

This form of 'research' for the mastery, extension, and integration of a subject is what ECE is speaking of when it says "University teachers should seek to improve their competence and endeavour to set the content, objectives, methods, and results of research in an individual discipline within the framework of a coherent world vision." A 1994 report by members of the Senior Management Teams of the United Kingdom's Catholic Colleges

---

33 First published as 'The Prima Facie Idea of a University', in the second issue of the Gazette. Later published as 'What is a University?' in HS 3.

34 HS 3:16.

35 Campaign 110; see also pp. 96-7, 111.

36 Campaign 103.

37 ECE 22; emphasis in original.
Partnership supplies a regional application of this same understanding: ‘Academic staff members are expected to be committed to the pursuit of knowledge through research’; this pursuit includes ‘the updating of their own particular specialist knowledge’. Further, ‘all colleges must include, within their research work, areas which are related to their distinctive purpose and status.’ The report is not speaking of the scientific advancement proper to a modern graduate research university – it is addressing the identity of Catholic colleges formerly dedicated almost exclusively to Catholic teacher training. Newman’s university idea and the Church’s contemporary understanding of research thus converge on the notion of the continual pursuit of knowledge, subject mastery, and relevance.

(b) Scientific Advancement. Another level of research at a university enjoined by ECE is the advancement of scientific knowledge fostered as a good in itself. ‘A Catholic university, therefore, is a place of research, where scholars scrutinize reality with the methods proper to each academic discipline, and so contribute to the treasury of human knowledge.’ By so doing, ‘this research provides an effective witness, especially necessary today, to the Church’s belief in the intrinsic value of knowledge and research’.

---

38 ‘The Purpose and Value of Contemporary Catholic Colleges of Higher Education in the United Kingdom’. Included as ‘Appendix C’ in The Presence of the Church in the University Culture of England and Wales, prepared and published originally by the Department of Catholic Education of the Bishops’ Conference of England and Wales; reprinted in Current Issues in Catholic Higher Education (pp. 91-7), 18 no. 2 (Spring 1998): 95, 97.

39 The Catholic College Partnership in 1994 included six Catholic colleges of England and Wales, plus the colleges of St. Mary’s, Belfast, and St. Andrew’s, Glasgow (which merged with University of Glasgow in 1998-9, as part of its Faculty of Education). See ‘Purpose and Value’, p. 91.

40 ECE 15; emphasis in the original.
McGrath demonstrates several ways in which Newman also encouraged scientific advancement through the work of university professors for its own 'intrinsic value'. Included in his evidence is Newman's memorandum to a synod of Irish Bishops in 1854, where he reported on the progress of the University. In section four of the memorandum, titled 'Institutions of Intrinsic Value', Newman argues that 'We must commence by bringing into position and shape various large departments of knowledge; by founding institutions which will have their value intrinsically, whether students are present or not.' Beyond the advancement of knowledge for its own sake, Newman claims the presence of scientists and scholars would also be of service to the larger society:

Astronomical observers, professors of medical science, the decipherers and editors of ancient writings, chemists and geologists, would in various ways subserve the social interests of Ireland, even though their lecture-rooms at first were but partially filled.

As a practical means of promoting and disseminating original research, Newman founded the university's academic journal, The Atlantis, serving as both an editor and contributor. Its full title gives an indication of its purpose for publishing scholarly research:

The Atlantis: A Register of Literature and Science Conducted by the Members of the Catholic Academy

---

41 See McGrath, Consecration of Learning, 204-09.

42 McGrath, Consecration of Learning, 206.

43 See note 184 of this chapter for the full content of this memorandum.

44 Campaign 96.

45 Campaign 97. Cf. Newman's article in the Weekly Register, 6 Feb 1958, where he describes the work of the natural science departments and the Medical School. He claims the chemical laboratory is 'especially deserving of notice. It is fitted up on the plan of those established in connection with certain German Universities, and, besides answering the purposes of the medical student, is designed to meet the wants both of those who pursue chemistry for purely scientific objects, and again, those who wish to apply it to manufactures' (from 'The six leading articles Newman wrote for the Weekly Register', reprinted as 'Appendix One: The Catholic University' in LD 18:565-83). See p. 572; emphasis added.
University of Ireland. He hoped the project would serve the twin purposes of better advertising the university, and of publishing original research in the arts and sciences, especially from the work of the university's own professors. It was a scholarly research journal according to the standards of that time, containing research results, scientific book and article reviews, occasional syllabi of University lectures, indexes to international journals and topics of literature and science, and lists of journal exchange agreements between CUI and the great universities and research institutes of Europe and the Americas. Volume one, dated January-July 1858, contained three articles of literary study, including Newman's 'The Mission of the Benedictine Order'. The 'Scientific Researches' section carried five articles by CUI professors. The University's chemistry professor, W. K. Sullivan, submitted the results from two experiments he conducted, including: 'Observations on some of the products of the Putrefaction of Vegetable and Animal Substances, and their relation to Pathology'.

Newman appointed Eugene (Eoin) O’Curry to become 'the first Professor in Europe of prehistoric archaeology' concentrating on Celtic archaeology. Curry's translations of Celtic manuscripts in The Atlantis were significant contributions to the field, including

46 Newman wrote about these aims to a potential donor for The Atlantis: 'It will not be like any existing Catholic periodical—not being a magazine or review—but simply a place for depositing professorial work, and to advertise the University' (LD 17:543; emphasis in the original). See also his letter of 30 March 1857 to J. M. Capes: 'We are contemplating here a University "Scientific and Literary Register — " but it will be strictly Professional, and not interfere with the Rambler' (Capes was then editor of the Rambler). He listed six proposed research topics for publication such as: '(1) On the existence of peripheral Neuro-Dynamic Foci' (LD 17:551). Newman was very proud of The Atlantis, predicting to J. H. Pollen that the second issue would 'be a prodigy' (LD 18:386).

47 Volumes 1-4, held at the Bodleian Library, Oxford, were analysed for this section on The Atlantis. Vol. 5, no. 9 (Feb 1870) included an article by Newman: 'The ordo de tempore in the Roman breviary'.

translations and editings of many old sagas and legends of Gaelic literature'. Representative of this work is the series of translations of "'Tri Thruaighe na Scélaigheachta", (i.e., the "Three Most Sorrowful Tales"), of Erinn', in volumes three and four.

(c) A Theological Perspective. According to the notion of a hierarchy of Christian educational aims developed in chapter four, one could speak of a third level of research at a Catholic university as that which contributes to a theological, or a 'higher' understanding of reality. Both Newman and ECE speak of this sort of 'research of all aspects of truth in their essential connection with the supreme Truth, who is God'. The 'theological perspective' of research is developed in section four of this chapter, below. The important distinction to be made here however, is that the term 'research' is not limited strictly to an empirical or mechanistic world-view, devoid of theological considerations, in either the magisterial documents or in Newman's ideal.

Service in Accordance with its Cultural Mission. According to ECE, the third objective of a university in addition to teaching and research is 'service in accordance with its cultural mission'. A consideration of a Catholic academy's mission in this sense of service to Church and society is beyond the scope of a detailed synthesis for the present study. It is suggested for

49 Ibid., 364.
50 ECE 4.
51 ECE 15.
52 See David L. Schindler, 'Catholicism and the Liberal Model of the Academy in America: Theodore Hesburgh's Idea of a Catholic University', Catholic International 11, no. 2 (May 2000): 179-180, excerpted from Schindler, Heart of the World, Center of the Church (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1996). Schindler argues on theological grounds that 'Catholics must challenge the mechanistic-subjectivistic worldview in all of its analogous forms down through all of the disciplines'. They must examine 'modernity's founding conception of science and knowledge, with its implied world view of mechanism and subjectivism'. It is such a world view that prevents some readers of Church documents and Newman's works from granting a legitimate rôle for theology in university research.

53 ECE General Norms 2.1.
a future study that would build on the synthesis begun here on the issues of theological foundations, identity, and school climate.\textsuperscript{54} Such an investigation might include an analysis of the correspondences and differences between ECE Part II, B: 'Mission of Service to Church and Society', and Newman's list of objectives for the Catholic University of Ireland.\textsuperscript{55} The list was included in a 'Memorandum on the Objects of the University and the means for attaining them', for presentation at the May 1854 Synodal meeting of the Irish bishops. Cullen approved the original draft of 29 April 1854, with two suggested changes that Newman included in this final draft.\textsuperscript{56} The value of reproducing the 'Memorandum' in the

54 See chapter 7.2.1, 'Newman’s Contributions to a Theology of Educational Mission'.

55 The ten objectives were printed in Campaign 93-94, and reprinted in LD 16:557-8. They comprise the whole of §1 of the Memorandum:

'Their object, I conceive, in setting up this their University, is to provide for Catholic Education (in a large sense of the word "education") in various respects, in which at present we have to depend upon Protestant institutions and Protestant writings. For instance, it is proposed: –

1. To provide means of finishing the education of young men of rank, fortune, or expectations, with a view of putting them on a level with Protestants of the same description.
2. To provide a professional education for students of law and medicine, and a liberal education for youths destined to mercantile and similar pursuits, as far as their time will admit it.
3. To develop the talents of promising youths in the lower classes of the community.
4. To form a school of theology and canon law suited to the needs of a class of students who may be required to carry on those sciences beyond the point of attainment ordinarily sufficient for parochial duty.
5. To provide a series of sound and philosophical defences of Catholicity and Revelation, in answer to the infidel tracts and arguments which threaten to be our most serious opponents in the era now commencing.
6. To create a national Catholic literature.
7. To provide school books, and generally books of instruction, for the Catholics of the United Kingdom, and of the British Empire, and of the United States.
8. To raise the standard, and systematize the teaching, and encourage the efforts, of the schools already so ably and zealously conducted throughout the country.
9. To give a Catholic tone to society in the great towns.
10. To respond to the growing importance of Ireland . . .'

Objective number ten contained sanguine projections about the future glories of both Ireland and the new English-speaking university which proved in time to be considerably off the mark.

56 LD 16:557, note 1. The synod minutes record that the 'Memorandum' was read aloud, but apparently no comment was issued: 'Lecta est relatio Rev. D. Newman, Univeritatis Rectoris designati, de modo quo Universitas contutui debeat.' (Ex Actis conventus Epp. Hibern. Hab. Dublini
footnotes here is to introduce the fact that Newman’s initial plans for the University very clearly included the objective ‘of service according to its cultural mission’. 57

Besides this document, another major source for Newman’s views on the academy’s service to society is found in Discourse Seven, ‘Knowledge Viewed in Relation to Professional Skill’. In the conclusion of this Discourse, he writes:

To-day I have confined myself to saying that that training of the intellect, which is best for the individual himself, best enables him to discharge his duties to society. . . . If then a practical end must be assigned to a University course, I say it is that of training good members of society. Its art is the art of social life, and its end is fitness for the world.

The training envisioned here is still preparatory in nature, as we saw in his proposed curriculum for undergraduates. ‘It prepares him to fill any post with credit, and to master any subject with facility.’ The ideal product of a liberal arts education can thus go on to specialize in any of the professions, and be a even more social utility in the long run, because ‘the art which tends to make a man all this is in the object which it pursues as useful as the art of wealth [business] or the art of health [medicine], though it is less susceptible of method, and less tangible, less certain, less complete in its result’. 58

In addition to indirect and practical arguments, Newman also appealed to specifically theological reasons for including the objective of service to Church and society within the Catholic cultural context of CUI. Newman compared military with university training to

die Maii 18, an. 1854, in Campaign 91. No mention of discussion nor a vote for approval is made. McGrath argues ‘that it found favour’, however, ‘since most of its provisions were afterwards put into effect’ (Consecration of Learning, 205).

57 As noted in chapters 1 and 2, McClelland demonstrates that several of the emphases in these ten points were not the actual priorities of the Irish prelates, especially Newman’s emphasis on objective number 1, and on creating an ‘Imperial University’ for ‘Catholics . . . of other countries which speak the English tongue’. See McClelland, Catholics and Higher Education, pp. 87-172, and chapter 3.3, above.

58 Idea 154-5.
illustrate how service was a counterbalance to the objective of *growing in knowledge for its own sake* (the subject of Discourse Five and of 'scientific advancement'). Just as military training is based not on 'any abstract devotion to the military standard of height or age, but for the purposes of war', and on the formation of 'living and breathing men', so too the Church aims at the practical outcome of a university education of living and breathing students:

She is not cherishing talent, genius, or knowledge, for their own sake, but for the sake of her children, with a view to their spiritual welfare and their religious influence and usefulness, with the object of training them to fill their respective posts in life better, and of making them more intelligent, capable, active members of society.\(^5^9\)

A preliminary conclusion can be drawn at this point, and it will be made more explicit in the concluding chapter, after additional evidence is considered in the remaining study. Newman's writings and praxis can in fact be harmonized with the identity of a Catholic university described in ECE, at least in their respective general outlines. An important qualification of this position is that a number of distinctions must be made, based on the provenance of the writings being compared.

2. **Ecclesial Identity**

2.1 *'Born from the Heart of the Church'\(^6^0\)*

The foregoing remarks focused primarily on the nature of a Catholic university *qua* university, or, more broadly speaking, the *academic identity* of a Catholic university. The discussion centred on higher education, especially with regard to the rôle of research, which is not proper to pre-university studies in the sense of scientific advancement. Research does

\(^{5^9}\) Idea 7.

\(^{6^0}\) ECE 1.
however, take the shape of integrative and theological reflection 'in light of the Christian
message as it comes to us from the Church' even in the lower forms of schooling. The
question of ecclesial identity is explicitly theological. As such, it is more broadly applicable
to a theology of Catholic academies of every level.

Both ECE and CSTTM appeal to an image of the heart to express the relationship
of the academy to the Church. The very title, Ex Corde Ecclesiae ('from the heart of the
Church'), comes from the opening sentence of the Constitution which reads in full: 'Born
from the heart of the Church, a Catholic University is located in that course of tradition
which may be traced back to the very origin of the University as an institution.\textsuperscript{61} The phrase,
'born from the heart of the Church', has a maternal aspect. It is the Church as \textit{Mother} who
gives birth to Catholic academies; it therefore follows that her schools are not extrinsic to the
nature and mission of the Church herself.\textsuperscript{62} Pius XI spoke of this maternal identity of the
Church as one of the two supernatural titles (i.e., 'Teacher' and 'Mother') that ground the
superior claims of the Church's right and duty to educate over and against 'any title in the
natural order' (e.g., parent or State). The title of 'Teacher' derives from Christ's commission
to the Apostles: 'All power is given to Me in Heaven and on earth. Go ye therefore and teach
all nations...'\textsuperscript{63} The Catholic academy is one instrument by which our supernatural Mother
becomes our Teacher:

The second title is that of supernatural motherhood, in virtue of which the
Church, spotless spouse of Christ, generates, nurtures and educates souls in
the divine life of grace, through her sacraments and her doctrine. With good

\textsuperscript{61} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{62} See chapter 4.4.2, above, for a discussion of Newman's theological links between Mother
Church, St. Monica, and a university as \textit{Alma Mater}.

reason then does St. Augustine maintain: “He has not God for Father who refuses to have the Church as mother”.

In illustration of the idea of the Church as Mother and Teacher, Newman emphasised and expanded on the traditional title of a university as Alma Mater – the mother of one’s very soul – an image that is pregnant with meaning for a theology of education: “Thus, while professing all sciences, and speaking by the mouths of philosophers and sages, a University delights in the well-known appellation of ‘Alma Mater.’” Drawing from the ‘Litany of Loreto’, he then ascribes certain of Mary’s titles to the Alma Mater:

She is a mother who, after the pattern of that greatest and most heavenly of mothers, is, on the one hand, ‘Mater Amabilis’, and ‘Causa nostræ Ixtitix’, and on the other, ‘Sedes Sapientiae’ also.

At the conclusion of his essay, ‘What is a University’, he created his own ‘litany’ for a university: ‘It is a seat of wisdom, a light of the world, a minister of the faith, an Alma Mater of the rising generation.’

Appealing to another aspect of the image of a heart, the section on ecclesial identity in CSTTM – entitled, ‘The Catholic School at the Heart of the Church’ – speaks of how the ecclesial nature of the Catholic school ... is written in the very heart of its identity as a teaching institution. It is a true and proper ecclesial entity by reason of its educational activity, “in which faith, culture and life are brought into harmony”. Thus it must be strongly emphasized that this ecclesial dimension is not a mere adjunct, but is a proper and specific attribute, a distinctive characteristic which penetrates and informs every moment of its

---

64 Ibid.

65 OS 5. Newman is piling up images of the Catholic university’s maternal rôles: ‘mother of the soul, loving mother, cause of our joy, seat of wisdom’. Newman had a special devotion to this litany, as evidenced by his published ‘Meditations on the Litany of Loreto, for the Month of May’, in Meditations and Devotions (MD), part one.

66 HS 3:16.

67 The inserted quotation is from Religious Dimension of the Catholic School, no. 34.
educational activity, a fundamental part of its very identity and the focus of its mission. 68

Newman explains why the ecclesial dimension is fundamental to a Catholic academy's identity. The result of the Church's rôle of to bring 'into harmony' the elements of 'faith, culture and life' is an attribute he calls 'integrity'. In the Idea's preface, he claims that 'in its essence' a university 'is a place of teaching universal knowledge', however, practically speaking, it cannot fulfil its object duly, such as I have described it, without the Church's assistance; or, to use the theological term, the Church is necessary for its integrity. Not that its main characters are changed by this incorporation: it still has the office of intellectual education; but the Church steadies it in the performance of that office'. 69

Despite Newman's attempt to define the bare idea of a non-confessional university in the abstract, it is clear that his real educational ideal requires an essential rôle for the Church in a Catholic university.

2.2 Essential Characteristics of a Catholic Academy

In the ninth and final Discourse of the Idea, Newman provides a summary of his first eight discourses, before introducing his last theme, 'The Duties of the Church towards Knowledge'. Here in his concluding remarks is found an approximation to what could be called Newman's theology of the ecclesial identity of a Catholic academy. The Discourse begins with a reminder to his readers:

68 CSTTM 11.

69 Idea 5; emphasis in the original. See also his discussion in HS 3, chapter 15, 'Professors and Tutors', (treated in chapter six, below) for one way Newman proposed to make concrete this presence of the Church based on a system of 'Colleges and College Tutors'. He believed this system could be a 'safeguard of a University from the evils to which it is liable if left to itself'; 'integrity' was achieved by attending to the student's 'personal interests, both moral and intellectual' (180-2). 'By the "integrity" of anything is meant a gift superadded to its nature' (180) which, in this case, makes the work of a university more easily attainable. The Church thus functions in various ways to integrate (lit., 'bring and hold together in unity') all aspects of the university: the project of 'integral' human formation, the members of the community themselves, and all of the disparate elements that make up its identity, mission, climate, etc. See also Chap. 4.4, 'Integral Human Formation in Christ', for the Church's rôle in 'restoring educational unity in Christ'.
I have spoken of the arduousness of my 'immediate' undertaking, because what I have been attempting has been of a preliminary nature, not contemplating the duties of the Church towards a University, nor the characteristics of a University which is Catholic, but inquiring what a University is, what is its aim, what its nature, what its bearings. Answering to Newman's assertion that there do exist 'characteristics of a University which are Catholic', both CSTTM and ECE identify specific 'characteristics' which must be present to make an academy authentically 'Catholic'. CSTTM claims that 'it is opportune to devote careful attention to certain fundamental characteristics of the Catholic school which are of great importance if its educational activity is to be effectual in the Church and in society', listing six themes. ECE combines these into four 'essential characteristics', which are reproduced here in full, to frame the remaining discussion:

Since the objective of a Catholic University is to assure in an institutional manner a Christian presence in the university confronting the great problems of society and culture, every Catholic University as Catholic must have the following essential characteristics:

1. a Christian inspiration not only of individuals but of the university community as such;

2. a continuing reflection in the light of the Catholic faith upon the growing treasury of human knowledge, to which it seeks to contribute by its own research;

3. fidelity to the Christian message as it comes to us through the Church;

4. an institutional commitment to the service of the people of God and of the human family in their pilgrimage to the transcendent goal which gives meaning to life'.

---

70 Idea 183; emphasis added.

71 CSTTM 4; emphasis added. See the chart placed after the preface to see how CSTTM's six 'fundamental characteristics' and ECE's four 'essential characteristics' are used to build a synthesis in part two of this thesis.

72 The introductory sentence and the four 'essential characteristics' are quoted from ECE 13. The English translation provided here of the four characteristics themselves is taken directly from the proceedings of a conference held by the International Federation of Catholic Universities (IFCU): L'Université Catolique dans le monde moderne. Document final du 2e Congrès des Délégués des Universités.
The first characteristic regarding the 'Christian inspiration' of the 'university community' is the subject of chapter six, below. The present chapter deals with the issue of Catholic identity raised by characteristics two and three. The fourth element of mission of service has already been introduced as one that builds upon the more foundational discussion of identity. It is proposed as a separate, future study, in the conclusion.73

3. Fidelity to the Christian Message

3.1 ‘Duties of the Church towards Knowledge’

John Paul II insists that a Catholic academy must maintain an ‘institutional commitment’ to the ‘Christian message’, such that ‘Catholic ideals, attitudes and principles penetrate and inform university activities in accordance with the proper nature and autonomy of these activities’.74 A major ‘consequence of its essential institutional fidelity of the University to the Christian message includes a recognition of and adherence to the teaching authority of the Church in matters of faith and morals’.75 How did Newman view the need for institutional fidelity in the academy, and how did he insure its presence?


73 See chapter 7.2.1, below.

74 ECE 14; emphasis in the original. See the first epigraph to this chapter for a more complete quotation of this passage.

75 ECE 27; emphasis in the original.
In the first eight Discourses, Newman had been 'treating [university teaching] as a philosophical and practical, rather than a theological question'. Such an approach was 'deprived of the light and supports' which a consideration of the 'Catholic grounds' or theological foundation — of the 'duties of the Church towards it' would have provided. As he brings the Discourses to a close, he wishes to impress on his reader's understanding the unqualified necessity of a living presence of the visible Church in the academy, if it is to serve the human person's ultimate end and the glory of God. By placing these remarks here at the end, he emphasises their importance. His argument is that the very liberal education he has been defining and illustrating has a tendency towards a sort of proud 'Intellectualism' which, even in a Catholic academy may come 'into collision [first] with precept, then with doctrine, then with the very principle of dogmatism; — a perception of the Beautiful becomes the substitute for faith'. All of this leads, in a non-Catholic country, to 'scepticism or infidelity; but even within the pale of the Church, and with the most unqualified profession of her Creed, it acts, if left to itself, as an element of corruption and debility'. If left unchecked by Church authority, 'first indifference, then laxity of belief, then even heresy will be the successive results'.

Earlier in the same Discourse, he claimed that 'considered in a religious aspect, it [Liberal Knowledge] concurs with Christianity a certain way, and then diverges from it; and consequently proves in the event, sometimes its serviceable ally, sometimes, from its very resemblance to it, an insidious and dangerous foe'. It is clear from these comments that

---

75 Idea 182, in Discourse Nine: 'Duties of the Church towards Knowledge'.

76 Idea 184.

77 Idea 186-7.

78 Idea 183.
Newman was quite concerned for the possible usurpations of reason upon the truth claims of the 'Christian message'\textsuperscript{79} and the 'teaching authority of the Church in matters of faith and morals'\textsuperscript{80} mentioned in ECE.

### 3.2 Bishops and Theologians

**Bishops.** Although 'the responsibility for maintaining and strengthening the Catholic identity of the University rests primarily with the University itself',\textsuperscript{81} in addition, 'each Bishop has... the right and duty to watch over the preservation and strengthening of their Catholic character'.\textsuperscript{82} The General Norms for ECE make explicit the direct and active nature of this superintendency:

> If problems should arise concerning this Catholic character, the local Bishop is to take the initiatives necessary to resolve the matter, working with the competent university authorities in accordance with established procedures and, if necessary, with the help of the Holy See.\textsuperscript{83}

In Discourse Nine, Newman insisted that a 'direct and active jurisdiction of the Church over the university 'and in it is necessary, lest it should become the rival of the Church.'\textsuperscript{84} To illustrate his point, he uses the rather shocking example of the State-run Spanish Inquisition, which, though professing to be Catholic, and having the assistance of Catholic theologians, effectively engaged in 'warfare against the Holy See'. In words that anticipate the 'General Norms' just cited, he then builds a case for ecclesial oversight:

\textsuperscript{79} ECE 14.

\textsuperscript{80} ECE 27.

\textsuperscript{81} ECE General Norms 4.1.

\textsuperscript{82} ECE General Norms 5.2

\textsuperscript{83} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{84} Idea 184.
And in like manner, it is no sufficient security for the Catholicity of a University, even that the whole of Catholic theology should be professed in it, unless the Church breathes her own pure and unearthly spirit into it, and fashions and moulds its organization, and watches over its teaching and knits together its pupils, and superintends its action.85

This sort of 'direct and active' superintendence of Catholic academies by the Church is an unwanted intervention for some Catholic academics today, as we saw in the first chapter. Carmody speaks for many when she writes, for example, that:

it should not be the concern of present-day church leaders to snoop into nooks and crannies of our Christian colleges, as though they knew better what the details of our curricula or our liturgies or our policies for hiring and firing ought to be than do we who work there every day'.86

She applauds those bishops who have taken 'some Roman flak' and 'Vatican grief' for 'not intruding themselves into higher education and supporting it with few strings attached'.87 Bishops are not welcome except on the following terms: 'The only effective ecclesiastical influence, shaping, or guidance of higher education is one that offers encouragement, financial support, and theological backing'.88

It is not uncommon for Catholic educators to try to invoke Newman in their defense against what they see as Roman assaults on their academic freedom.89 They do so by making vague appeals to, and using partial quotations from his disagreements with the hierarchy over matters of policy as well as doctrinal matters not yet infallibly defined. But such appeals often

85 Idea 184-5; emphasis added to highlight the 'direct and active' nature of these verbs.
86 Carmody, Organizing a Christian Mind, 213.
87 Ibid.
88 Ibid., 212.
89 On several occasions for example, this author has heard professors and administrators of Catholic universities react initially to the thesis topic with a comment to the effect that they assumed Newman would be fighting against the 'creeping infallibility' of John Paul II in Ex Corde Ecclesiae and elsewhere.
ignore the complexity of Newman's thought and his consistent faith-perspective on the Church's charism of truth. ECE's directives for bishops to 'promote and assist in the preservation and strengthening of . . . Catholic identity', and for them to be seen not 'as external agents but as participants in the life of the Catholic University', are clearly supported on theological grounds by Newman in his Discourse on 'The Duties of the Church Towards Knowledge'. Of course Newman did have his differences with bishops and the Pope, and recorded his deep frustrations in his letters and journals. But his private misgivings about his superiors' natural wisdom and difficult personalities yielded to his position of faith that Christ had established a teaching Church precisely to safeguard and promote the truth

---

90 Considered in chapter 3, e.g., regarding the practical wisdom of the Pope establishing CUI, the goals, content, and editorship of The Rambler, his 'Consulting the Faithful' essay, and his 'inopportunist' position in the infallibility debates. Such appeals usually misrepresent the very carefully nuanced arguments of Newman on complex subjects, by using simplistic summaries which create a misunderstanding of his total system.

See for example, the rather misleading wording on the book jacket of Conscience, Consensus, and the Development of Doctrine: Revolutionary Texts by John Henry Newman. This anthology contains relatively balanced and scholarly introductions, but here we read: 'Newman . . . debunks a few Catholic Myths: . . . Myth # 1: The teaching of the Catholic Church on faith and morals has never changed and never will change. . . . Myth # 3: It's the bishops who teach, the laity who follow. Newman turns this notion upside down: The laity, he says, are the source and final seal of the church's teaching; thus the bishops must listen to them.' There are elements of truth in both characterizations, but it is doubtful that a prospective reader would receive the impression from this 'list of myths' that Newman would have wanted to convey in his own advertisement. Compare the face value of 'Myth #3', e.g., with Newman's words quoted below on page 199.

91 ECE 28.

92 See P. J. Fitzpatrick, 'Newman and Kingsley' in David Nicholls and Ferguss Kerr, O.P., eds., John Henry Newman: Reason, Rhetoric and Romanticism, 88-108 (Bristol: The Bristol Press, 1991). Fitzpatrick documents Newman's conflicting attitudes towards the practical wisdom and governance of the hierarchy in his writings. His personal frustrations (or 'uneasiness', p. 100) should be distinguished from his belief that the Holy Spirit preserves the Church from teaching error in matters of faith and morals. Publicly, in his 'General answer to Mr. Kingsley', he rejoiced 'to have so clear a direction [i.e., from Church authority] in a matter of difficulty' (cited on p. 104). While privately in his letters, he bemoaned the 'extreme centralisation' (p. 106) of Propaganda Fide at the time, and he complained of the pressure of trying to appease whatever 'particular school in the Church which is dominant [saying] . . . I cannot fight under the lash, as the Persian slaves' (p. 107; cf. LD 21:48).
of the Gospel. Dessain summarizes Newman’s posture towards both his Anglican and Catholic bishops by saying that throughout his many difficulties,

he had been obedient. He stopped the *Tracts for the Times* at a word from his Anglican bishop. He resigned the *Rambler* at Ullathorne’s wish. . . . he twice dropped the plan of founding an Oratory at Oxford, to which he had been invited by his bishop, at the request of higher authority.93

**Theologians.** Complementary to the Bishop’s rôle in preserving and extending the Christian message is the indispensable ecclesial rôle of the Catholic theologian. Theologians ‘seek to understand better, further develop and more effectively communicate the meaning of Christian Revelation as transmitted in Scripture and Tradition and in the Church’s Magisterium.94 ECE explains that ‘Bishops should encourage the creative work of theologians’ who ‘serve the Church through research done in a way that respects theological method’. The Church ‘recognizes the academic freedom of scholars in each discipline in accordance with its own proper principles and methods, and within the confines of the truth and the common good’.95 This final qualifying phrase puts into context the current objections to ECE based on an appeal to ‘academic freedom’.96 The Church’s theological vision requires doctrinal and moral boundaries, based on the notion of revealed religion, to be recognized in the exercise freedom. Without these boundaries, freedom of legitimate enquiry may become a *license to dissent* from authentic Church teaching, resulting in an attack on the common good of the Church. Therefore, ‘it is intrinsic to the principles and methods of their research and teaching in their academic discipline that theologians respect the authority of

---


94 ECE 29.

95 ECE 29.

96 Represented by Carmody’s *Organizing a Christian Mind*, and the documentation in Whitehead’s ‘History of *Ex Corde Ecclesiae*’, both discussed in chapter one.
Bishops, and assent to Catholic doctrine according to the degree of authority with which it is taught. A Catholic theologian is thus free to speculate about creative ways to explain defined truths, and to propose arguments in favour of one tolerated opinion over against another within the degrees of certitude of a theological proposition. Far from operating from the motive of a remote, autocratic, imperial power, the Church in fact invites the Catholic academy 'to the promise of future achievements that will require courageous creativity and rigorous fidelity'.

Newman, who was by all accounts a 'creative' theologian, did not believe that a teaching Church destroyed academic freedom. In his 'General Answer to Kingsley' he wrote:

"Our question ... simply is, whether the belief in an Infallible authority destroys the independence of the mind; and I consider that the whole history of the Church ... gives a negative to the accusation."

His advice in the sermon, 'Intellect, the Instrument of Religious Training' is just as clear on this point: 'Some persons will say that I am thinking of confining, distorting, and stunting the growth of the intellect by ecclesiastical supervision. I have no such thought.' For those who would say that academic freedom demands an impartial, scientific enquiry in matters of faith, unfettered by the magisterium and dogma that shape the Catholic religion, Newman's words concerning the search for truth in all disciplines are relevant: 'Nor have I any thought of a compromise, as if religion must give up something, and science something. I wish the...

---

97 ECE 29; emphasis added.

99 For definitions of the extraordinary and ordinary forms of the magisterium, and of degrees of assent proper to different levels of teachings, see CCC 84-100: 'The Interpretation of the Heritage of Faith', and 888-892, 'The Teaching Office'.

99 ECE 8.

100 Cited in Fitzpatrick, 'Newman and Kingsley', 105, as part of his discussion of the complexity of Newman's attitude towards Church authority.
intellect to range with utmost freedom, and religion to enjoy an equal freedom; but what I am stipulating for is, that they should be found in one and the same place, and exemplified in the same person.' Admitting that this is no easy course to follow, still he insists on a university ideal: 'I want the intellectual layman to be religious, and the devout ecclesiastic to be intellectual'.

Newman made careful distinctions between the rôle of catechesis and speculative theology, and gave prescriptions for the proper methods and venues of communication for the latter. Mark Pattison records a remarkable conversation on a train in 1861, when Newman spoke with him about both the value and dangers of 'creative theology' being imprudently disseminated.

[Newman] blamed severely the throwing of such speculations broadcast upon the general public. I was, he said, unsettling their faith without giving them anything else to rest upon. But he had no word of censure for the latitude of theological speculation assumed by the essay [written by Pattison], provided it had been addressed ad clerum, or put out, not as a public appeal, but as a scholastic dissertation addressed to learned theologians.'

What would Newman think about the current objection to Canon Law 812 which requires 'those who teach theological disciplines in any institute of higher studies [to] have a mandate [mandatum] from the competent ecclesiastical authority'? Linked to the mandatum is the issue of Canon 833.7's requirement of making a 'Profession of Faith' and

---

101 OS 13.

102 LD 19:477-8, note 3.

103 Cited in ECE, note 50.
'Oath of Fidelity'. Such norms are seen as oppressive and too juridical for example, to the historical and political context of an American Catholic university.

In the Apologia, Newman makes clear his own 'oath of fidelity', six years before the 1870 definition of papal infallibility. Here Newman voluntarily submits to the teaching authority of the Church in both the ordinary and extraordinary exercise of this charism. Having described the divine gift of the power of Infallibility—a 'power viewed in its fulness, ... as tremendous as the giant evil which has called for it'—he then professes his 'own absolute submission to its claim':

I believe the whole revealed dogma as taught by the Apostles, as committed by the Apostles to the Church, and as declared by the Church to me. I receive it, as it is infallibly interpreted by the authority to whom it is thus committed, and (implicitly) as it shall be, in like manner, further interpreted by that same authority till the end of time. I submit, moreover, to the universally received traditions of the Church, in which lies the matter of those new dogmatic definitions which are from time to time made, and which in all times are the clothing and illustration of the Catholic dogmas as already defined. And I submit myself to those other decisions of the Holy See, theological or not, through the organs which it has itself appointed, which, waiving the question

---

103 The Profession of Faith contains the Nicene-Constantinopolitan Creed, together with three additional paragraphs that identify the levels of theological propositions and their required assent. In 1989 the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith (CDF) extended the obligation previously reserved solely for bishops, to take an Oath of Fidelity on Assuming an Office to Be Exercised in the Name of the Church to the categories of offices listed in Canon 833, nos. 5-8, which includes no. 7, 'those who in any universities teach subjects which deal with faith or morals, at the beginning of their term of office'. The Oath includes the wording: 'In carrying out my charge, which is committed to me in the name of the Church, I shall preserve the Deposit of Faith in its entirety, hand it on faithfully and make it shine forth. As a result, whatsoever teachings are contrary, I shall shun'. See Profession of Faith and Oath of Fidelity (9 Jan 1989): AAS 81 (1989), 105. The Profession and Oath are included as appendices to John Paul II's Apostolic Letter Moto Proprio Ad Tuendam Fidem, together with the CDF's Explanatory Note on Moto Proprio Ad Tuendam Fidem: Doctrinal Commentary on the Concluding Formula of the Professio fidei, in a convenient reference booklet (Oxford: Family Publications, 1998). The 1998 Moto Proprio and Explanatory Note added clarifications and canonical penalties to canon law for those who exercise authority in the name of the Church, or who teach faith and morals in Catholic higher education, vis-a-vis Catholic truths specified in the final 3 paragraphs of the Profession: (1) those 'divinely revealed' (par 1: e.g., the divinity of Christ), or (2) 'definitively proposed' (par. 2: e.g., the Church’s teachings on euthanasia), or (3) other authentic teachings of the universal magisterium, 'even if they do not intend to proclaim these teachings by a definitive act' (par. 3: see CDF, Explanatory Note, no. 11 for more examples of each of these categories).
of their infallibility, on the lowest ground come to me with a claim to be accepted and obeyed.\textsuperscript{106}

Newman thus supported an active role for the teaching Church to combat the 'great evil' of heresy and the lesser evil of unsettling the faith of the less educated. And his fidelity extended beyond infallible definitions even to those common teachings of the ordinary magisterium which came to him 'on the lowest ground'. His wording here anticipates the last paragraph of the 'Profession of Faith' which is so hotly contested today:

What is more, I adhere with religious submission of will and intellect to the teachings which either the Roman Pontiff or the college of bishops enunciate when they exercise the authentic Magisterium even if they proclaim those teaching in an act that is not definitive.\textsuperscript{107}

The evidence strongly suggests that Newman would welcome and defend the relevant norms contained in ECE, including: 'Catholic theologians, aware that they fulfil a mandate received from the Church, are to be faithful to the Magisterium of the Church as the authentic interpreter of Sacred Scripture and Sacred Tradition'.\textsuperscript{108} Furthermore, they 'should respect the authority of Bishops, and assent to Catholic doctrine according to the degree of authority with which it is taught.'\textsuperscript{109}

4. A Continuing Reflection in the Light of Faith

The creative contributions of Catholic theologians are particularly needed to pursue ECE's second 'essential characteristic' of a Catholic University: 'a continuing reflection in the light of the Catholic faith upon the growing treasury of human knowledge, to which it seeks to

\textsuperscript{106} Apo. 250-1.

\textsuperscript{107} AAS 81 (1989), 105.

\textsuperscript{108} ECE General Norms, 4.3.

\textsuperscript{109} ECE 29.
contribute by its own research'. The nature of this characteristic is developed in terms of four 'qualities' of research and teaching in a Catholic academy:

'In a Catholic University, research necessarily includes:

(a) an integration of knowledge,
(b) a dialogue between faith and reason,
(c) an ethical concern, and
(d) a theological perspective.'

The first three qualities flow from the aim and method of the fourth quality, that of 'a theological perspective'. This perspective is achieved in two ways. First, 'Catholic theology must be taught in the academy in a manner faithful to Scripture, Tradition, and the Church's Magisterium' with 'courses in Catholic doctrine made available to all students'. This necessitates theology's presence within its own department, and securely set within the 'circle of knowledge'. Second, theology makes its own unique contribution 'in the search for a synthesis of knowledge as well as in the dialogue between faith and reason'. By means of theological reflection, it examines the 'moral implications that are present in every discipline', complementing their own proper methods of discovery.

4.1 Integration of Knowledge

A Catholic academy claims to reverse the tendency towards fragmentation and disintegration of knowledge by contributing 'a higher synthesis of knowledge' which the Church alone can

---

110 See ECE 15-20.
111 ECE 16.
112 Cf. the following discussion of 'a theological perspective' with chapter 4.3's treatment of 'The Rôle of Theology', where this theme was already shown to be central to Newman's educational thought. The present section thus centres on the first 3 'qualities' of research.
113 ECE 20.
114 ECE General Norms 4.5.
115 'Because of its specific importance among the academic disciplines, every Catholic University should have a faculty, or at least a chair, of theology' (ECE 19).
116 ECE 20.
provide, 'aided by the specific contributions of philosophy and theology'. ECE identifies the integration of knowledge as 'a process, one which will always remain incomplete', especially given the 'explosion of knowledge in recent decades'. A Catholic university attempts to 'determine the relative place and meaning of each of the various disciplines within the context of a vision of the human person and the world that is enlightened by the Gospel'.

The language John Paul II uses here is evocative of Newman, and it could be recognized as such even without the explicit quotation from him in the immediately preceding footnote number nineteen of the Constitution, where he invokes Newman a second time:

Cardinal Newman observes that a University "professes to assign to each study which it receives, its proper place and its just boundaries; to define the rights, to establish the mutual relations and to effect the intercommunion of one and all".

The quotation is from Newman's 'Christianity and Scientific Investigation: A Lecture Written for the School of Science' of the Catholic University. Here he compares the integrating function of a university to the governing role of an empire: 'What an empire is in political history, such is a University in the sphere of philosophy and research'. Alluding to the functions and duties of a political power, he speaks of how a university 'maps out the territory of the intellect, and sees that the boundaries of each province are religiously respected, and that there is neither encroachment nor surrender on any side'. He extends this metaphor by naming the direct object of a university education as 'the philosophy of an

---

116 ECE 15.
117 ECE 16.
118 Ibid. The internal quotation is referenced to Idea 457 (= Ker, ed., Idea, p. 369).
119 Idea 370.
imperial intellect', by which he means an approach to knowledge that 'acts as umpire between truth and truth, taking into account the nature and importance of each,' and assigning 'to all their due order of precedence.'

The rôle of philosophy to arbitrate between the seemingly disparate claims of truth emanating from the many branches of knowledge represented in a university is a theme that preoccupied Newman's thoughts going back at least thirty years before this lecture. As early as 1826, for example, he preached the university sermon, 'The Philosophical Temper, first Enjoined by the Gospel' which defends, largely by historical illustration, the proposition that Christianity, far from being hostile to the 'philosophical temper', has in fact been the great proponent and developer of sound philosophy and scientific inquiry throughout the ages. His most important contributions to this dialogue during his Anglican period are found in Sermons Preached before the University of Oxford, between 1826 and 1843. Sermon number fourteen of this collection anticipates his fuller, Catholic treatment of these themes in the Idea: 'Wisdom, as Contrasted with Faith and with Bigotry'.

In this sermon, Newman verbally creates a multi-faceted image of the 'philosophical temper'. Focusing on the goal of acquiring 'insight into the mutual relations of things' he uses multiplied metaphors and synonyms: 'true enlargement of mind, or the philosophical cast of thought, or wisdom in conduct or policy' are each in turn added to the suggested catalogue

---

120 Idea 371.
121 Idea 370.
122 Sermon 1 in Sermons Preached before the University of Oxford (US), preached July 2, 1826.
124 Sermon 14 in US, Preached Whit-Tuesday, 1841.
125 US 287.
of 'a philosophical habit of mind'. According to its varied nuances and aspects, one can
approach this notion with the phrases: 'cultivation of the reasoning faculty',\textsuperscript{126} the power of
referring every thing to its true place in the universal system', and 'knowledge . . . of things
in their relations to one another'.\textsuperscript{127} Returning to his later work in the \textit{Idea}, he says: 'In
default of a recognized term, I have called the perfection or virtue of the intellect by the name
of philosophy, philosophical knowledge, enlargement of mind, or illumination . . . or
intellectual culture' which is the 'direct scope' of a university education.\textsuperscript{128} He also describes
what true philosophy is not: 'It never views any part of the extended subject-matter of
knowledge, without recollecting that it is but a part'. He disparages the mere acquisition of
unconnected knowledge as the enemy of that form of mature Christian philosophy he calls
'Wisdom': 'a great memory is never synonymous with Wisdom, any more than a dictionary
would be called a treatise' Those 'who are satisfied with . . . extensive information' alone
'have no claim to be called philosophers'.\textsuperscript{129}

4.2 \textit{Dialogue Between Faith and Reason}

As important as mental cultivation and enlargement is, a still higher faculty of perception and
understanding is 'the perfecting gift of the Holy Spirit'. This 'intellectual habit', assisted by
grace, involves the 'exercise of Reason', which may be 'examined and defined as any other
power of the mind'.\textsuperscript{130} This 'perfecting gift' is called by Newman, 'Christian Wisdom', and in

\textsuperscript{126} US 280.
\textsuperscript{127} US 291.
\textsuperscript{128} \textit{Idea} 114.
\textsuperscript{129} US 288.
\textsuperscript{130} US 281.
its apprehension, we come to see the higher purpose and power of Catholic education to integrate knowledge in the light of faith. This Wisdom is distinct from, but built upon faith in revealed truth. It is 'the clear, calm, accurate vision, and comprehension of the whole course, the whole work of God'.\textsuperscript{131} Such a vision is more easily inculcated in a Catholic academy, where faith, grace, and the work of the Holy Spirit are not only recognized, but earnestly sought after.

\textit{Ex Corde Ecclesiae} recognizes and promotes this 'perfecting gift of Christian Wisdom,' calling for Catholic universities to include 'a continuing reflection in the light of the Catholic faith upon the growing treasury of human knowledge, to which it seeks to contribute by its own research'. The 'specific part of a Catholic university's task'\textsuperscript{132} in the quest for the integration of knowledge 'is to promote \textit{dialogue between faith and reason}, so that it can be seen more profoundly how faith and reason bear harmonious witness to all truth'.\textsuperscript{133} John Paul II then repeats the theological proposition from the Second Vatican Council's Pastoral Constitution on the Church in the Modern World (\textit{Gaudium et Spes}) that 'methodological research within every branch of learning, when carried out in a truly scientific manner and in accord with moral norms, can never truly conflict with faith. For the things of the earth and the concerns of faith derive from the same God'.\textsuperscript{134} These words appear almost as a paraphrase of Newman's treatment of the same point in Discourse Nine: 'As to Physical

\textsuperscript{131} US 293.

\textsuperscript{132} ECE 13.

\textsuperscript{133} ECE 17.

\textsuperscript{134} Cited in ECE 17, from \textit{Gaudium et Spes}, no. 36: AAS 58 (1966), p. 1054. The same footnote reference includes these explanatory words from the pope: 'To a group of scientists I pointed out that "while reason and faith surely represent two distinct orders of knowledge, each autonomous with regard to its own methods, the two must finally converge in the discovery of a single reality which has its origin in God"'. See ECE, note 20.
Science, of course there can be no real collision between it and Catholicism. Nature and Grace, Reason and Revelation come from the same Divine Author, whose works cannot contradict each other.¹³⁵

This same theological premise is asserted in the introduction to ECE, where John Paul II claims that 'the honour and responsibility of a Catholic University [is] to consecrate itself without reserve to the cause of truth.'¹³⁶ And once again, it is to Newman that he turns, this time to give expression to the idea that 'the Church . . . has “an intimate conviction that truth is [its] real ally . . . and that knowledge and reason are sure ministers to faith”.'¹³⁷ There is no contradiction in the two ways of coming to know; 'intelligence and faith' engage in a 'united endeavour' in the Catholic academy. Quoting now from St. Augustine, John Paul expresses the paradox involved in the dialogue of faith and reason: 'Intellege ut credas; crede ut intellegas.'¹³⁸ Remaining open to theological belief distinguishes the Catholic University's 'free search for the whole truth about nature, man, and God', enabling it to proclaim 'the

¹³⁵ Idea 187. Newman's words here on faith and the physical sciences are suggestive of the qualities he looked for in professors, who could impart such an integrating vision. Cf. ECE 46: 'An area that particularly interests a Catholic University is the dialogue between Christian thought and the modern sciences. This task requires persons particularly well versed in the individual disciplines and who are at the same time adequately prepared theologically, and who are capable of confronting epistemological questions at the level of the relationship between faith and reason.'

¹³⁶ ECE 4. This point is elaborated in ECE 1: A Catholic University's privileged task is to 'unite existentially by intellectual effort two orders of reality that too frequently tend to be placed in opposition as though they were antithetical: the search for truth, and the certainty of already knowing the fount of truth'.

¹³⁷ ECE 4; emphasis added. The context of the partial quotation of Newman here by the pope is that he is speaking in the preface of the Idea about the motives of the current pope, Pius IX, in his 'recommending just now to the Irish Hierarchy the establishment of a Catholic University'. The actual subject of the sentence is not 'the Church', but the 'Supreme Pontiff. A more complete quotation, including the original wording and capitalization follows: Whatever he does, claims Newman, 'it is for the sake of Religion. He rejoices in the widest and most philosophical systems of intellectual formation, from an intimate conviction that Truth is its real ally, as it is his profession; and that Knowledge and Reason are sure ministers to Faith' (p. 6).

¹³⁸ Cited in ECE 5, from Augustine's Sermon 43, 9: PL 38, 258.
'meaning of truth', and to research ‘all aspects of truth in their essential connection with the supreme Truth, who is God’. In Newman’s words, secular education is unable to arrive at this ‘whole truth’, because it ignores ‘Theological Truth altogether, under the pretence of not recognising differences of religious opinion’. But the ‘three great subjects on which Human Reason employs itself: – God, Nature, and Man’ must have recourse to theological as well as philosophical reasoning if they are to accurately perceive the true nature and interconnectedness of all reality in the person of the one ‘Divine Author’ of ‘Reason and Revelation’.141

In his inaugural lecture to CUL’s School of Philosophy and Letters in 1854, Newman illustrates the dialogue of faith and reason in the Catholic academy by offering a creative theological reflection on the educational ideals and legacy of ancient Athens, Jerusalem, and Rome. In Athens he sees the ‘source and school of intellectual culture’,142 which is the direct object of a liberal education at any university.143 As the great seat of ancient philosophy and letters, Athens embodies the ideal of that ‘philosophical habit of mind’ which Newman is at such pains to describe in the Discourses.144 The mental culture and intellectual virtue of Athens must, however, ‘bow before a more glorious luminary, and a more sacred oracle of truth, and the source of another sort of knowledge, high and supernatural’, represented by Jerusalem, ‘the fountain-head of religious knowledge, as Athens is of secular’.

140 ECE 4; emphasis in the original.

141 Idea 187.

142 Idea 222.

143 See Idea xxxiii.

144 Idea 57 et passim.
These 'two centres of illumination' had no 'promise of convergence' until '[t]he grace of Jerusalem and the gifts which radiate from Athens, [were] made over and concentrated' in that third great centre of Rome. It was there on the Tiber that those two great streams of reason and revelation, of philosophy and theology, converged. Newman's point is that the Roman Church, which built that synthesis, is thus best equipped to provide for the total education of the human person in her schools and universities. As the educational 'offspring' of Mother Church, the Catholic academy is a privileged place of integrating sacred and profane learning, superintended by a teaching authority which is of itself of divine institution. This Church 'fears no knowledge, but she purifies all; she represses no element of our nature, but cultivates the whole'. Within the compass of her divine mission and competence, 'her principle is one and the same' as she integrates the contributions of science and literature, or of the study of nature and man: 'not to prohibit truth of any kind, but to see that no doctrines pass under the name of Truth but those which claim it rightfully'.

4.3 Ethical and Moral Concern

A final 'research quality' required in a Catholic academy is identified as 'ethical concern':

Because knowledge is meant to serve the human person, research in a Catholic University is always carried out with a concern for ethical and moral implications both of its methods and of its discoveries, especially 'in the areas of science and technology'.

---

144 Idea 222-3.
146 See ECE 20.
147 ECE 13.
148 ECE 18; emphasis in original.
John Paul II addressed the following words to UNESCO in 1980, giving expression to the theological concerns that should shape these fields in particular: 'It is essential that we be convinced of the priority of the ethical over the technical, of the primacy of the person over things, of the superiority of the spirit over matter. The cause of the human person will only be served if knowledge is joined to conscience.\footnote{150}

The priorities of ethics, human persons, and spiritual reality must also guide the teaching of a Catholic academy. Paragraph twenty of ECE insists that the same 'qualities of research' just described must be present in a university's teaching. It highlights the need to teach and study from a perspective of 'interdisciplinary studies' (integrating knowledge through philosophy and theology) and a proper dialogue between faith and reason. In addition, 'the moral implications that are present in each discipline are examined as an integral part of the teaching of that discipline so that the entire educative process be directed towards the whole development of the person'.\footnote{151}

Newman developed this same concern for applying the light of faith to ethical questions in literature and science, particularly in the second part of the Idea, Lectures and Essays. Two examples will suffice to demonstrate Newman's theological agreement on the matter. Regarding an ethical concern when teaching the classics, he said, 'I never would allow that, in teaching the classics [at Oxford], I was absolved from carrying on, by means of them, in the minds of my pupils, an ethical training.'\footnote{152} In his Lecture, 'Christianity and Medical Science', he addresses the ever increasing ethical dilemmas surrounding research and technology developments in modern medicine. Speaking to medical students, Newman set

\footnote{150} Cited in ECE 18.

\footnote{151} ECE 20; emphasis in original.

\footnote{152} Add. 184.
his topic as 'the exact relation in which your noble profession stands towards the Catholic University itself, and towards Catholicism generally'. He begins by reaffirming his vision of the Catholic University of Ireland, 'and its Faculty of Medicine inclusively', speaking of 'the highest and most special religious interests' which, for him, 'were bound up in its establishment and success'. He asks of them the indulgence to speak to them 'from the pulpit' rather than from 'the Rector's chair', in order to focus on 'the special duty of the Medical Profession towards Religion'.

His argument proceeds along the lines developed in this study under the rubrics of 'a high theological view of education' and 'restoring a Christian hierarchy of educational aims', together with the John Paul II's assertions of the priorities of ethics, human persons, and the spirit. Several times he appeals to the notion of 'a higher science with higher objects', a superior science, and 'a higher system' while making his case that,

'bodily health is not the only end of man, and the medical science is not the highest science of which he is the subject. Man has a moral and a religious nature, as well as a physical. He has a mind and a soul; and the mind and soul have a legitimate sovereignty over the body, and the sciences relating to them have in consequence the precedence of those sciences which relate to the body.'

John Paul II calls on Catholic educators to have the 'courage to speak uncomfortable truths which do not please public opinion, but which are necessary to safeguard the authentic good of society'. Obvious examples would include human life and medical issues surrounding

---

153 Idea 407.
154 Idea 409.
155 Idea 411.
156 Idea 408-9.
157 ECE
abortion, euthanasia, and emerging reproductive technologies. To all such questions, Newman reminds his students, technological ability must bow before revealed religion and moral law:

And so what is true in medical science might in all cases be carried out, were man a mere animal or brute without a soul; but since he is a rational, responsible being, a thing may be ever so true in medicine, yet may be unlawful in fact, in consequence of the higher law of morals and religion having come to some different conclusion. ¹⁵⁸

Newman's treatment of the 'higher sciences' speaking to the moral issues of medicine is itself an example of how his life and work as a Catholic educator is a useful source for defining and illustrating educational principles found in ECE and CSTTM. There is wide agreement between Newman and the Church documents on the academic and ecclesial identities of a Catholic academy, despite the contingencies of time and place that separate Newman's world from the concerns of Catholic educators today. Catholic schools and universities in their fundamental idea, were in his day, as in ours, dedicated to the 'the ardent search for truth and its unselfish transmission to youth and to all those learning to think rigorously, so as to act rightly and to serve humanity better'. ¹⁵⁹

¹⁵⁸ Idea 409-10; emphasis in original.

¹⁵⁹ ECE 2.
Chapter Six

CLIMATE, RÔLES, AND PERSONAL INFLUENCE IN THE EDUCATING COMMUNITY

[The] community dimension in the Catholic School is not a merely sociological category; it has a theological foundation as well. The educating community, taken as a whole, is thus called to further the objective of a school as a place of complete formation through interpersonal relations.

— Congregation for Catholic Education¹

[The propagation of the truth] has been upheld in the world not as a system, not by books, not by argument, nor by temporal power, but by the personal influence of such men... who are at once the teachers and the patterns of it.

— John Henry Newman²

The Religious Dimension of Education in a Catholic School: Guidelines for Reflection and Renewal,³ provides a good working definition and ideal type for the notion of a ‘Christian school climate’, the subject of this final chapter:

In pedagogical circles, today as in the past, great stress is put on the climate of a school: the sum total of the different components at work in the school which interact with one another in such a way as to create favourable conditions for the formation process...

From the first moment that a student sets foot in a Catholic school, he or she ought to have the impression of entering a new environment, one illumined by the light of faith, and having its own unique characteristics.⁴

¹ CSTTM 18.
² US 91-2.
³ Congregation for Catholic Education, 1988; hereafter, ‘RD’.
⁴ RD 24.
1. 'A Common Dedication to . . . the Person and Message of Christ'

1.1 Theological Foundations of the Community Dimension

Newman did not write any extended work on how to foster an educational climate that addressed such pedagogical concerns as those listed in Religious Dimension: 'persons, space, time, relationships, teaching, study, and various other activities'. It is possible, however, to trace the basic contours of his thought on these matters from his occasional writings and educational praxis. The sources typically include subtle distinctions coupled with strong assertions once the necessary qualifications are addressed. For example, the following passage, taken from an early introduction to the first few Discourses, shows how the priority of teaching in a Catholic academy is done within a climate created and animated by the spirit of Catholicism:

1. [I am] treating here of the object of a University in the abstract and in its idea; 2 . . . as such, its object is knowledge as such; 3 . . . but a Catholic University will, in all its regulations, appointments, and in its routine, distinctly recognize Catholicism . . .

Newman attempted to apply his educational theology of mental culture and personal holiness as the complementary aims of education through concrete educational programmes oriented to the truth revealed about God and man. A future study could profitably explore Newman's views on the science of teacher education and educational administration. He had much to say, for example, about: the proper formation of the intellect; the incremental stages through

---

5 RD 24.

6 Three key elements of a school climate are introduced here by Newman. Those elements in italics within the brackets are taken from the list in RD 24, for a suggestive comparison: (a) 'regulations' ('teaching, study', policies and procedures, entrance examinations, course content, discipline); (b) 'appointments' ('persons', 'relationships', hiring, training, and firing); and (c) routine ('space, time, scheduling, events, 'and various other activities'), etc.

7 Idea, xxxiii-iv, note 1; emphasis in original.
which one must proceed to gain a mastery of language, mathematics, or any other subject; and the most beneficial canon of literature to develop mental culture and an historical perspective. But most of these passages are based on a natural philosophy of education, and can be argued without reference to revelation.

This chapter on school climate and pedagogical foundations limits itself to the more theological concerns of what Newman considered to be: (1) the divine blueprint for building an educational community "animated by the Gospel spirit of freedom and charity" (i.e., a genuine Catholic ethos), (2) the imitation of Christ as the basis for the vocation, character, and ministry of the Christian teacher, and (3) the importance and effects of positive interpersonal relationships between the different roles within a Catholic academic community as defined in the preceding chapter.

One of the four 'essential characteristics' of a Catholic university prescribed by ECE is 'a Christian inspiration not only of individuals but of the university community as such'. The climate and rôle of the educating community is also treated in the final section of CSTTM; its position there draws attention to the fact that the identity and mission of a Catholic school thus far treated in the document are impossible to effect outside of a theological context of proper 'interpersonal relations'. The document insists, following the teaching of *Gravissimum Educationis*, that this community dimension to the Catholic school

---

8 See, e.g., 'Elementary Studies' in part two of the *Idea*, which includes a rational, sequential methodology for the teaching of grammar, composition, and Latin writing.

9 GE 8.

10 ECE 13.

11 CSTTM 18.

12 Ibid.
is not primarily a sociological category; it has a *theological foundation* as well". In the words of ECE, a Catholic academy

pursues its objectives through its formation of an authentic human community animated by the spirit of Christ. The source of its unity springs from a *common dedication* to the truth, a common vision of the dignity of the human person and, *ultimately*, the *person and message of Christ* which gives the Institution its distinctive character.\(^{14}\)

The implications of these theological foundations include an ethos of 'freedom and charity' which 'is characterised by mutual respect, sincere dialogue, and protection of the rights of individuals', and where 'each one' makes his or her own contribution 'towards maintaining and strengthening the distinctive Catholic character of the Institution'.\(^{15}\) These beliefs coincide with Newman's own theological points of reference for contending that the teaching and learning dynamic is best fostered in the context of a community of peers and mentors pursuing together both moral and intellectual excellence. Such an approach is more an art form that must be experienced and learned by impartation, than it is a scientific pedagogical method that can be measured and analysed. What he desired was the extension of *personal influence* throughout every aspect of the academy, towards the end of establishing and nurturing a Catholic *institutional influence*. This incarnation of the influence was embodied, for example, in the university church he built in Dublin as one of his first priorities.\(^{16}\)

\(^{13}\) Ibid., emphasis added. Section 18 refers the reader to GE 8 in a footnote, which expands on this theological foundation. Besides creating 'an atmosphere animated by the Gospel' as already observed, 'the proper function' of a Catholic school is 'to help youth grow according to the new creatures they were made through baptism as they develop their own personalities, and finally to order the whole of human culture to the news of salvation so that ... all knowledge ... is illumined by faith'.

\(^{14}\) ECE 21; emphasis added to highlight the words of this section's title.

\(^{15}\) Ibid.

\(^{16}\) Campaign 290. See also note on page 102, above.
1.2 Imitatio Christi: Reflections of the One Teacher

The Catholic School at the Threshold of the Third Millennium insists that the lofty goals of Catholic education can be achieved only within 'an atmosphere characterized by the search for truth, in which competent, convinced, and coherent educators, teachers of learning and of life, may be a reflection, albeit imperfect but still valid, of the one Teacher'.\textsuperscript{17} A Catholic theology of education holds these truths as foundational:

The integration of culture and faith is mediated by the other integration of faith and life in the person of the teacher. The nobility of the task to which teachers are called demands that, in imitation of Christ, the only Teacher, they reveal the Christian message not only by word but also by every gesture of their behaviour.\textsuperscript{18}

This demand for a Catholic ethos and a pedagogy mediated by teachers in imitation of Christ is likewise foundational to Newman's own personalist approach to education. His theological prescription was founded on the Christian premise that continues to surface in this study, that Christ is the Master Teacher and Exemplar of human life.\textsuperscript{19} It therefore followed for Newman, that the character and ministry of a Christian teacher must conform to the example of the Master, as a necessary theological conclusion.

Newman may well have been influenced in his approach here by the spiritual classic, The Imitation of Christ by Thomas à Kempis. The possible connection appears to be a

\textsuperscript{17} CSTTM 14; emphasis added.

\textsuperscript{18} Congregation for Catholic Education, The Catholic School (1977), 43; emphasis added, to anticipate themes forthcoming in this chapter.

\textsuperscript{19} See, e.g., John 13:12-16. Cf. the discussion of Newman's christocentricity in education, appropriated in part from Clement of Alexandria's notion of Unus magister Christus, in his Paedagogus. See also chapter 4.2.2, 'Christ the Teacher'; and 4.4.1, 'Restoring Educational Unity in Christ', above, for the christological premises thus far presented.
neglected area in Newman studies thus far. An initial investigation has yielded the following evidence in support of the hypothesis. He read it in the Latin original, *Imitatio Christi*, as evidenced by the fact that he thought he had come across the phrase, *cor ad cor loquitur* somewhere 'in the Vulgate or in A Kempis'. It was read aloud at meal times in the refectories of the English Oratories. He quoted from it as a spiritual guide, as when he referred to the famous dictum, 'I'd rather feel compunction than know its definition', in a remark to his brothers about the Oratorian ideal. He promoted the idea of a new translation or edition of the *Imitatio* as part of his program to inspire his contemporaries' religious imaginations during his Tractarian Period. The *Letters and Diaries* record at least eight positive recommendations of the classic to his correspondents and those seeking spiritual direction, over a course of thirty-two years (1832-64). For example, in a letter to Mary Holmes in May 1840, he recommended 'the study of A Kempis...' as part of her

---

20 The project's literature review did not discover any extended consideration of the following observations and tentative conclusion, in works covering either Newman's spirituality or educational theory.

21 See a discussion of the context of this statement and its importance beginning on page 233 ff., below.

22 See LD 13:358.

23 LD 17:47.

24 Henry Wilberforce was keen to have a new translation, and Newman wrote to him in 1837: 'Your idea about the book is excellent' (LD 6:125; a footnote to the sentence explains that 'a new edition of an earlier translation was published in Oxford in 1841'). See also LD 7:341 and LD 7:199, where Newman is recommending the new edition to W. F. Hook along with another 'very good book'.

25 As a young Anglican pastor in 1832, he asked his mother to purchase for him 'some book ... like Thomas à Kempis' as a gift for a Mrs. Copely (LD 3:123). Thirty-two years later as a Catholic priest, he is strongly admonishing Robert Edmund Froude (the 18 years-old son of his friend William Froude, and who had been studying at the Oratory School) to be very careful in his spiritual reading—to avoid a certain class of spiritual books, and to 'keep to the New Testament, the Imitation of X, the Spiritual Combat, and some book of meditations' (LD 21: 170-3. See also note 1, p. 173 and LD 17:47.
It would seem reasonable therefore to assume that the actual teaching of this guide to the spiritual life would be echoed in Newman's writings. Consider the resonance of the opening paragraph of the *Imitation* with selected passages from Newman that follow.

He that followeth me, walketh not in darkness, saith the Lord. These are the words of Christ, by which we are taught to imitate His life and manners, if we would be truly enlightened and be delivered from all blindness of heart. Let therefore our chief study be to meditate upon the life of Jesus Christ. The notions of meditating on Christ, being enlightened by Christ the Light, following Christ, and imitating Christ, are not uncommon in Scripture and therefore in Christian spiritual writings generally. But the *Imitatio* is a classic text which concentrates these few ideas into one source from which we know Newman regularly drew. These ideas permeate his own prayers, as in the 1832 poem, 'Lead, Kindly Light'. These in turn demonstrate his personal commitment to meditate on, and imitate the life of Christ. He encouraged those in his spiritual care to do the same. In his posthumously published *Meditations and Devotions*, many of the prayers consist of meditations on the life, suffering, death, and resurrection of Jesus Christ, together with various Christ-centred litanies. In one of his two sets of meditations on the Stations of the Cross he speaks of the desire to be perfectly conformed to Christ: '[The image of Christ] must ever be impressed on all our hearts. . . . we must ever meditate upon His death and

---


27 LD 7:341.

28 *The Imitation of Christ* (New York: Macmillan Co., 1932), 1; emphasis added.

29 See page 78 for the first stanza of this poem, also known as 'The Pillar of the Cloud'.
resurrection, we must ever imitate His divine excellence, according to our measure'.

Newman believed that his influence was positive only in proportion to his surrender to the light and love and will of Christ his Saviour. In a meditation prayer entitled 'Jesus the Light of the Soul', Newman gives expression to his heart's conversation with the heart of Jesus:

Stay with me, and then I shall begin to shine as Thou shinest: so to shine as to be a light to others. The light, O Jesus, will be all from Thee. None of it will be mine. No merit to me. It will be Thou who shinest through me upon others. O let me thus praise Thee, in the way which Thou dost love best, by shining on all those around me. Give light to them as well as to me; light them with me, through me. Teach me to show forth Thy praise, Thy truth, Thy will. Make me preach Thee without preaching – not by words, but by my example, and by the catching force, the sympathetic influence, of what I do – by my visible resemblance to Thy saints, and the evident fullness of the love which my heart bears to Thee.

If we can assume that Newman's prayer is sincere, and that he is not excluding his educational influence from its petitions, then we have here an important clue to the theological and religious motivation for his pedagogical approach. The evidence that Newman consciously held 'theologically prescribed' convictions about the essential christological foundations of education seems unmistakable even if the specific influence of the Imitatio on his educational ideal deserves further study.

Newman's 'Stay with Me' prayer anticipates the remaining discussion which will attempt to demonstrate how and why he believed in creating a Catholic school climate, with reference to the concerns and vocabulary of recent Church teaching. Such a climate is the proper ethos or environment for promoting integral human formation (a higher aim of education), and is characterized by the interrelationships of those committed to Christian witness and personal influence in imitation of Christ the Teacher (the method), made possible

30 MD 35; emphasis added.

31 MD 500-01.

32 Such a study is proposed in the conclusion.
by the personal indwelling of Christ's Spirit (the power), for the praise and glory of God (the ultimate aim).

2. Rôles and Relations

The 'climate and role of the educating community', according to CSTTM, is directed by a theological vision of 'the interaction and collaboration' of the various agents or authors of education, in the context of a concrete place dedicated to Catholic education. The document then identifies the following 'components' of that community: 'students, parents, teachers, directors and non-teaching staff'. In higher education the rôles of bishops and theologians are likewise crucial for the community's integrity, as explained in ECE.  

2.1 Students and Parents

Students. In a Catholic academy students are not merely passive agents. They are 'challenged to pursue an education that combines excellence in humanistic and cultural development with specialized professional training ... [and] the search for truth and for

The terms 'agents' and 'authors' are variously used in the English translations of Church documents, to speak of the rôles of what are called 'components' in the next line of CSTTM. See GE 3, which discusses the three primary 'authors' of education: 'the family', 'civil society', and 'the Church'. The focus here is on the mutual rôles and relations which contribute to a Catholic ethos. Cf. also GE 4, which speaks of auxiliary 'aids' or 'instruments' of education such as catechetical classes, youth associations, and the media.

CSTTM 18; cf. the last two groups with ECE 24: 'directors', 'administrators' and 'non-academic staff'. ECE also addresses the rôles of Bishops and theologians (see section 2.3, below), Religious Congregations, and the laity. In the conclusion it is suggested that a separate study could explore a theology of Religious and lay involvement in education, in dialogue with Newman's teaching and praxis.

See ECE 28, 29, and the 'General Norms'.

See ECE 28, 29, and the 'General Norms'.

See ECE 28, 29, and the 'General Norms'.
meaning'. This description of the student's responsibility is the occasion for the third and final quotation from Newman's *Idea* by John Paul II in his Apostolic Constitution. Here the words of *Gaudium et Spes* are juxtaposed to Newman's definition of a student's ideal, in a manner not unlike what the present thesis attempts. The Second Vatican Council's statement reads: 'The human spirit must be cultivated in such a way that there results a growth in its ability to wonder, to understand, to contemplate, to make personal judgments, and to develop a religious, moral, and social sense'. In footnote twenty-three of the ECE, the Pope compares these magisterial words with Newman's view:

Cardinal Newman describes the ideal to be sought in this way: 'A habit of mind is formed which lasts through life, of which the attributes are freedom, equitableness, calmness, moderation and wisdom. In the original, this sentence continues to identify these 'attributes' as what he 'ventured to call' in an earlier lecture, 'a philosophical habit'. ECE then reminds students of their 'responsibility' in engaging in the necessary training to become "leaders" of tomorrow, of being witnesses to Christ in whatever place they may exercise their profession'.

Newman believed that the educational project was best promoted in a community of scholars, partly because of his experience of the limits of 'self-education' during his undergraduate days at Trinity College. A student needs that 'collision of mind with mind' which occurs in a place of learning, to perfect his intellectual powers. Such a collision speaks

36 ECE 23.
37 *Gaudium et Spes*, no. 59, quoted in ECE 23.
38 ECE 23, quoting from 'Idea, Uniform Edition' 101-102' (= Ker, ed., *Idea* 96. The original includes commas after the words 'are' and 'moderation'.)
39 *Idea* 96.
40 ECE 23.
41 HS 3:16.
of the active, even combative nature of a truly enlarging education that is the product of the university ideal.

An interesting historical contrast can be drawn here between the religious expectations of students at CUI in its early years, and the norms spelled out in ECE. It was assumed from the beginning that prospective students for the Catholic University of Ireland would either be practising Catholics, or at least knowledgeable and respectful of the Catholic faith. Non-Catholics were allowed admittance, but the 'Scheme of Rules and Regulations' written by Newman in 1856 required all applicants to pass entrance examinations which included 'the elements of Revealed Religion'. The examination consisted of 'the main facts and doctrines on which Christianity is established' as found in 'the Gospel according to St. Matthew, and of any approved [Catholic] catechism'. Such an examination, using 'authorized catechisms of the Church [where] we are furnished with infallible information as to the great mysteries to which His life and mission were directed' was considered 'not much to ask of the Candidate for admission into a Catholic school of learning'. There was a faculty of Theology and a Catechism professor, to help prepare students for a 'Second Examination, viz., for the Scholarship' (i.e. a first degree at age eighteen) which required that the 'Candidate must be prepared with an exact knowledge of the matters contained in some longer Catechism and in the four Gospels'. The examination for a licentiate (or 'B.A.') also covered 'Christian Knowledge' as one of four subjects tested.

---

42 See Campaign lxxi and Culler 261 with endnote 49.

43 Campaign 134-5.

44 Campaign 130.

45 See, e.g., Newman's university report of 11 November 1858 listing the faculty divisions and their professors, reproduced in LD 18:584.
The modern idea of a Catholic university as expressed in ECE does not necessarily require examinations on Catholic dogma either for entrance or graduation. But the General Norms do specify that ‘all students are to recognize and respect the distinctive Catholic identity of the University’. Likewise, their education should ‘combine academic and professional development with formation in moral and religious principles’.46 And whereas individual universities may require theology courses for graduation, ECE’s minimum standard is that ‘courses in Catholic doctrine are to be made available to all students’.47

Parents. Church documents situate the active participation of a student within the context of two families: one natural, one supernatural. Chapters four and five discussed how an Alma Mater provides a sort of second mother and family for the student. But the natural family is by nature, ‘the first school’48 of every person. ‘Parents have a particularly important part to play in the educating community, since it is to them that primary and natural responsibility for their children’s education belongs.’ Two dangers threaten this primary duty. On the one hand, ‘there is a widespread tendency to delegate this unique rôle’.49 In answer to this challenge, CSTTM calls for ‘initiatives’ on the part of the school ‘to foster commitment’ on the part of the parents.50 On the other hand, a second tendency at times results in the school effectively usurping the rights and duties of the family in education. A misdirected professionalism makes the teacher or school administrator think he or she knows what is best for a child, despite the parents’ knowledge, convictions, and concerns. In the

46 ECE General Norms 4.5.

47 ECE General Norms 4.5 (emphasis added), see also Code of Canon Law 811.2.

45 GE 3.

49 CSTTM 20.

50 Ibid.
modern context of widespread divorce and of broken, dysfunctional, and even abusive family situations, the Church and State must, at times, protect the prior rights and welfare of the individual students. But the assistance that even a Catholic school provides a family in their support never means taking from parents or diminishing their formative right and duty, because they remain “original and primary,” “irreplaceable and inalienable.” Therefore the role that others can carry out in helping parents is always (a) subsidiary, because the formative role of the family is always preferable, and (2) subordinate, that is, subject to the parents’ attentive guidance and control.

The tendencies of both the abdication by parents and the usurpations of Church and State militate against parents fulfilling their God-ordained duties in education. ‘The constant aim of the school’ must therefore be ‘contact and dialogue with the pupil’s families,... promotion of parents’ associations,... and a ‘personalized approach’ to the ‘indispensable cooperation’ of school and home.’ ECE does not directly address the rôle of the family in higher education, presumably because of the student’s own responsibility as an adult.

What insights might Newman have to offer on this delicate balance of the complementary educational rôles between the family and the academy? The Oratory School was essentially a boarding school which became a second home for most of the boys during

---

51 It is proper, e.g., according to GE, for ‘civil society’ to ‘aid’ parents, ‘according to the principle of subsidiarity, when the endeavours of parents and other societies are lacking, to carry out the work of education in accordance with the wishes of the parents; and, moreover, as the common good demands, to build schools and institutions’ (3). But GE argues that the rights and duties of parents (based on natural law) and the Church (based on Christian theology) remain primary in principle.

52 Pontifical Council for the Family, The Truth and Meaning of Human Sexuality: Guidelines for Education within the Family (Rome, 1995), no. 145; emphasis in the original. The context has to do with sexual education, but it applies to the entire educational question. The reader is referred by a note after the word “inalienable” to: Cf. Familias Consortio, 36 and 40; Letter to Families (Gratissimmam Sane), 16.

53 See CSTTM 20.
term. But Newman did attempt to provide for the close collaboration called for in CSTTM. The School was founded in answer to the wishes of a number of well-to-do families. All seven boys present on opening day were sons of educated converts like Newman, and they trusted him to understand their own particular backgrounds and concerns. They saw him and the Oratory as natural allies in their goal of raising up their sons to take a more prominent place in English society than was possible for the majority of Catholic youth in that day. Newman summarized the two main concerns of the parents for founding a new Catholic school:

When we began to speak of a school, a friend put down upon paper what it was that parents wanted in a new school, which they had not in the existing Catholic Colleges. He wrote what I summed up as resulting in two desiderata — 1. that boys should have their private needs, as boys, attended to — by which I understood the care of their persons, their cleanliness, health, and the superintendence of their childish weaknesses and troubles, and 2. secondly that they should be well grounded in their books and have a really liberal education. I considered that Mrs Wotten would simply supply the one, and Fr Nicholas the other...  

The parents' desires coincided with Newman's long-held desideratum of establishing a sort of 'Eton of the Oratory'. It also provided another concrete way for him to fulfill the Papal Brief that specified a particular call for the English Oratory to minister to the 'doctior et honestior ordo'. The founding of the Oratory School could thus be seen in part as an illustration of the Church's long-held position, often repeated in her education and social teaching documents, and codified in Canon Law, that Catholic 'parents are to send their

---

54 From Newman's paper read to the Fathers of the General Congregation, 28 December 1861, in LD 20:90.

55 See LD 13:142-3.

56 Cf. LD 12: 239, note 1. See also note 56 on page 101, above.
children to those schools which will provide for their catholic education\textsuperscript{57} and that they 'have a real freedom in their choice of schools.'\textsuperscript{58}

Whatever else may be said of the motives, views, and politics of the Oratorians, parents, and bishops behind the founding of the Oratory School,\textsuperscript{59} one point at least is clear. There was a close collaboration between Newman and the parents to provide what the parents believed would be the best Catholic education for their sons. The Letters and Diaries contain remnants of the steady stream of correspondence that flowed back and forth between Newman and the boys' parents, from before the School's opening until his last years. In these letters he solicits their advise about their sons and for the school itself, and gives regular, personalized reports which he himself prepared for each boy. As but one example from this body of correspondence, a letter to the Duchess of Norfolk shows his easy style with the parents and his watchful care of the boys on their behalf. After asking her advice for setting up riding lessons for the boys, he reports that he thinks her son 'Henry is certainly improving. His want of briskness and punctuality in rising in the morning is still a fault – but I really think he is better here too[.] As time goes on, he will get more and more manly.'\textsuperscript{60}

\subsection*{2.2 Teachers and Administrators}

Newman's theological orientation towards the rôles of teachers and administrators was informed by his overarching view of an explicitly evangelistic priority for all Christian

\textsuperscript{57} CIC 798.

\textsuperscript{58} CIC 797.

\textsuperscript{59} The complex history of the Oratory School's founding has already been identified as beyond the scope of this project. It is treated in summary form in chapter three with its notes and references to other studies, together with appendix one, below.

\textsuperscript{60} LD 20:162. For the reference to 'manly' see note 121 on page 168, regarding Newman on the notion of a 'masculine religion'.
ministry, including that of education. In an early Anglican sermon entitled 'On the Object and Effects of Preaching', he set the course of his life-long approach to 'doing the work of an evangelist' by claiming that:

*All education is a kind of preaching* - all catechizing - all private conversation - all writing. In all things and at all times is a Christian minister preaching in the Scriptural sense of the word - He preaches in his life even more than in his words ... and in all matters and pursuits of this world as truly, though not so directly, as when engaged in religious subjects.62

Ex Corde Ecclesiae speaks of this evangelistic dimension of education as well. 'Christians among the teachers are called to be witnesses and educators of authentic Christian life, which evidences an attained integration between faith and life, and between professional competence and Christian wisdom'.63 Likewise, even the non-teaching staff are called to a 'leadership of service ... dedication and [Christian] witness'.64

ECE also mentions the rôle of 'members of other Churches, ecclesial communities and religions, and also those who profess no religious belief at all'. These people are able to contribute to the larger mission of the school by virtue of 'their training and experience in furthering the various academic disciplines and other university tasks'.65 The General Norms in part two direct however, that all of these 'are to recognize and respect the distinctive Catholic identity of the University' (as is the case with 'all students').66 A specific proviso is attached to this norm: 'In order not to endanger' this identity, 'the number of non-Catholic

---

61 Newman is quoting here from 2 Tim 4:5.

62 *Sermons* 1:25; emphasis added.

63 *ECE* 22.

64 *ECE* 24.

65 *ECE* 26.

66 *ECE General Norms*, 4.4.
teachers should not be allowed to constitute a majority within the Institution, which is and must remain Catholic. 67

In Newman's time, few if any non-Catholics had positions of importance within the Catholic University of Ireland or the Oratory School. The very purpose of the Pope and the Irish bishops in erecting the University was in opposition to the 'mixed education' of the Queen's Colleges, and to the English Universities which up until 1854 had denied entrance to Catholics. 68 Newman observed in 1853, 'I feel sure the Holy See would never agree to any plan which mixes up Catholic youth with Protestants, let alone the Professors.' In addition he believed on philosophical grounds that 'while you have professors of different religions, you never can have a genius loci; and the place is no longer a genuine University'. 69 Thus, in the University regulations he submitted to the Irish Bishops in 1856, it was specified that all professors 'will ever recollect in all they say and write, to keep in view the glory of Almighty God and the honour and edification of His Church'. 70

In our own day of ecumenism, blurred denominational distinctives, religious plurality, and aggressive secularism, the prospect of compromising Catholic school identity is heightened in those schools which find they have hired and retained a majority of non-Catholic personnel. This is so precisely because of the theological principle of personal

67 Ibid.

68 See Campaign xliv-xlv re.: the 1854 Act which began a set of reforms enabling Catholics to attend certain colleges of Oxford, and Rome's 1865 ban forbidding the same. See also appendix one for some key dates in the history of Catholic presence at the Protestant universities being at different times forbidden, tolerated, or allowed by university statutes, together with the evolving position of Rome and the episcopate to the same issues, including the question of Newman's possible presence in Oxford in some capacity at an Oratorian mission for Catholic students.

69 LD 15:283.

70 Campaign 103.
influence and impartation. Newman would say, you cannot impart that which you are not. If it is the Catholic vision and way of life you are seeking to impart to a student, you must do so through the medium of 'such men ... who are at once the teachers and patterns of it'.

A particular and not uncommon situation does exist, however, when a school finds some of its more devoutly Christian faculty and staff members hailing from non-Catholic denominations, while some of those who are numbered as 'Catholic' may be only nominally adhering to Catholic faith and morals. There is the additional challenge of a shortage of teachers who have been formed in a Catholic educational philosophy and pedagogy proper to their ecclesial vocation. In America, for example, most Catholic school teachers are trained in State and other non-Catholic schools. In such situations, ECE reminds us that 'the responsibility for maintaining and strengthening the Catholic identity of the University rests primarily with the University [community] itself'. The local educational community should therefore do everything in its power to foster a 'common dedication to the truth, a common vision of the dignity of the human person, and, ultimately, the person and message of Christ' given the strengths and weaknesses of the existing personnel, while always striving, compassionately yet strategically through its hiring and training practices, towards the principles and norms of the Church documents. ECE, for example, 'calls for the

---

71 This principle of personal influence, already introduced at several points in the study, will be developed in the next sections of this chapter.

72 US 91-2; see also the epigraphs to this chapter.

73 ECE General Norms 4.1.

74 ECE 21.
recruitment of adequate university personnel, especially teachers and administrators who are both willing and able to promote that identity.\textsuperscript{75}

3. \textit{Icons} of Personal Influence

Central to a Catholic theology of school climate is the need for the personal influence of competent and spiritually mature teachers. This is so because

\begin{quote}
[t]eaching has an extraordinary moral depth and is one of man's most excellent and creative activities, for the teacher does not write on inanimate material, but on the very spirits of human beings. The personal relations between the teacher and the students, therefore, assume an enormous importance and are not limited simply to giving and taking.\textsuperscript{76}
\end{quote}

This section considers Newman's theological understanding of this interpersonal dimension of school climate by examining (1) the influence upon Newman by his own academic and spiritual mentors, (2) selections from Newman's writings and (3) his praxis as an educator at Oxford, the Catholic University of Ireland, and the Oratory School. Newman both taught and exemplified the principle of personal influence, based largely on his own experience of it as a young man and throughout his life. Chapter two explored the direct, personal, and powerful influence of men such as Walter Mayers, Richard Whately, and John Keble on Newman. Their influence was not merely a matter of motivation or good example; one could almost speak of these men as having planted mental and spiritual seeds into Newman's mind and heart—seeds that germinated and came to fruition during the course of his life.

\begin{table}
\caption{Table Title}
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline
Column 1 & Column 2 \\
\hline
Data 1 & Data 2 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

\textsuperscript{75} ECE General Norms, 4.1.

\textsuperscript{76} CSTTM 18.
3.1 The Influence of Athanasius and Philip Neri

In addition to those contemporaries of Newman already considered, two great figures loomed large in Newman's imagination, and to each he owed a measure of debt for his educational approach: Athanasius (c. 295-373) and Philip Neri (1515-1595).

_Athanasius._ In Newman's personal study at the Birmingham Oratory — preserved largely as it stood on the day of his death — there are many pictures of his favourite saints and earthly friends displayed about the walls. Above his _prie-dieu_ there hangs an icon of St. Athanasius. From the perspective of his Catholic understanding of the communion of saints, one could consider the personal influence that even these figures had on Newman from across the centuries, through the mediation of books and tradition, as well as through the living presence he claimed to experience in prayer with them. The icon served as a reminder of one of his conscious companions and rôle models as he prayed, studied, and wrote.

Newman highly esteemed Athanasius, Patriarch of Alexandria, as the champion of Nicene orthodoxy in the face of the Arian heresy.\(^77\) He referred often to the positive influence of one such person standing against the tide of popular opinion based on convictions on the side of truth. No doubt he considered himself in such a place on many occasions. He said of Athanasius that he had 'impressed an image on the Church, which, through God's mercy, shall not be effaced while time lasts.'\(^78\) There were times during the fourth century when the majority of bishops had embraced Arianism, and it took great resolution and faith for Athanasius to stand alone. In his own day, Newman fought an often lonely battle against religious liberalism on the one hand, and what he perceived to be an excessive clericalism on

\(^77\) Athanasius was at the center of two of his major theological works: _The Arians of the Fourth Century_ (1833), and the two volume _Select Treatises of St. Athanasius in Controversy with the Arians_, Freely Translated, with an Appendix (vol. 1, 1842; vol. 2: 1844).

\(^78\) US 97.
the other. The image that captivated and inspired Newman was that of 'Athanasius contra mundum'.

In his sermon on 'Personal Influence', Newman claims that men such as Athanasius, though few, 'are enough to carry on God's noiseless work.' He believed it was difficult 'to estimate the moral power which a single individual, trained to practise what he teaches, may acquire in his own circle, in the course of years'. Newman was convinced that the power of such individuals lay especially in 'the attraction, exerted by unconscious holiness'. The inner, moral authority which such people hold

is of an urgent and irresistible nature; it persuades the weak, the timid, the wavering, and the inquiring; it draws forth the affection and loyalty of all who are in a measure like-minded; and over the thoughtless or perverse multitude it exercises a sovereign compulsory sway, bidding them fear and keep silence, on the ground of its own right divine to rule them...

**Philip Neri.** As Superior of an Oratorian community, Newman attempted to follow the example and legacy of Philip Neri, the sixteenth-century founder of the Congregation of the Oratory. In a paper addressed to his young community in 1848, Newman described the Oratorian ideal by way of contrast with regular Religious life, understood as a life lived in community according to a *regula* (Rule), and characterized by the taking of vows and obedience to a superior, as in the case of the Jesuits.
Newman insists that the prominent principle for the Oratorian is not obedience, but personal influence:

Influence then may be said to do for the Oratorian, what Rules do for the Jesuit; and if we wish for an example, we cannot have one more apposite than that of St Philip himself, of whom personal anecdotes abound whether in books or in the traditions of Rome . . .

One such anecdote captures the personal and disarmingly direct approach of this saint. Ronald Knox paints a scene for us not unlike the stories of Socrates wandering about Athens seeking wisdom from others:

[Neri] would hobble about Rome, buttonholing people as he went, like a bee that flits from one flower to the next and dives deep to bring up the honey that lurks there, still hoping for some reaction to his embarrassing question, 'When are we going to start loving God?' He didn't write books; his message was written in the hearts of those innumerable penitents who lived by his counsels, and could not die without the comfort of his presence.

In a comparison of the Apostle Paul and Philip Neri, Newman wrote that they put 'aside forms as far as was right to do so', replacing influence for authority. In this way, they were able to draw 'souls to them by their interior beauty, and hold them captive by the regenerate affections of human nature'. Newman's conclusion is that the Oratory 'exercises, not power but influence; it dislikes whatever savours of pomp, pretence, or violence'.

3.2 Cor ad Cor Loquitur

Given the great weight that Newman attached to the receiving and giving of personal influence, it comes as no surprise that he chose to underscore this notion in the motto

---

84 NO 215-16.


87 NO 216.
inscribed on his cardinalial coat of arms. When he was about to be named a Cardinal Deacon of the Catholic Church in 1879, his challenge was to reduce to a short quotation, or aphorism, or declaration of principle that which would characterize his deepest convictions and ecclesial ministry. It was common to elect a Latin phrase from a scriptural, liturgical, or hagiographic source. The phrase that echoed in his mind as he travelled to Rome was 'Cor ad cor loquitur', heart speaks to heart.

In a letter from Rome to Arthur Hutton, Newman asks, 'Do you recollect in the Vulgate or in A Kempis, the words "Cor ad cor <cordi> loquitur?"'. What he had forgotten is that he had come across it in St. Francis de Sales, and had used it many years before in a letter to Bishop David Moriarty, where he gave counsel as to the object and means of preaching 'in the name of a University to University men'. De Sales's admonition is to have a clear object always in mind when preaching, namely the spiritual good of the listener. Newman quotes from a Latin translation of a letter by St. Francis, concluding with these words:

Inflammata sint verba, non clamoribus gesticulationibusve immodicis, sed interiore affectione. De corde plus quàm de ore proficiscantur. Quantumvis ore dixerimus, sanè cor cordi loquitur, lingua non nisi aures pulsât.

88 LD 29:108.

89 Idea 328. The letter was written on 21 Feb 1855, and first published in the 8 March 1855 issue of the Catholic University Gazette, as: 'Letter of the Rector to the Right Rev. D. Moriarty, D.D., Bishop of Antigonia, Coadjutor-bishop of Kerry, on the Subject of University Preaching' (pp. 394-400). It was then combined with his article, 'Preaching with or Without a Book' (Gazette, 3 Apr 1855, pp. 416-19) and further revised for the 1859 collection, Lectures and Essays on University Subjects, where it appeared as: 'University Preaching', (and so in the Idea, 328-345). See Blehl, Bibliographical Catalogue, 91; and LD 16:385.

90 Idea 332. Ker provides this English translation in Idea 654-55, note 332.9: 'Let your words be fired, not by extravagant cries or gesticulations, but by inner feeling. Let them proceed more from the heart than the lips. However much we may have spoken with our lips, it is of course the heart that speaks to the heart, while the tongue only strikes the ears' (emphasis added). For a fuller discussion of Newman's use of this passage, and of de Sales's advice, see LD 29:108, and Geoffrey Rowell, "Cor ad Cor Loquitur": Newman's Choice of his Cardinalial Motto as a Pointer to his Understanding of Christian Faith and its Communication', in John Henry Newman: The Significance of His Promotion to
The French original of the phrase in question reads: 'le coeur parle au coeur'.

Newman had come to understand and practise this notion of cor ad cor loquitur as a foundational principle not only of Christian preaching, but of all true education. Preaching should echo the call of the Great Lover to his beloved. The aimed for response in the listeners should be an answer from the heart—our innermost being—expressing the desire and resolve to receive God’s love, and to grow in holiness. And the most effective manner of communicating God and his love to others is likewise from heart to heart. By placing the motto, cor ad cor loquitur on his coat of arms, he was providing himself and others with an ‘icon’ of his ‘pedagogy of personal influence’.

4. Newman’s Pedagogy of Personal Influence

4.1 Personal Influence in Newman’s Writings

An early example of Newman’s life-long ‘prescription’ for teaching from and to the heart is found in his 1832 sermon, ‘Personal Influence, the Means of Propagating the Truth’. Dessain considered this sermon to be the ‘real beginning of the doctrinal and spiritual revival in the Church of England, the Oxford Movement’. He sees in this sermon the first principles and the very spirit of the movement expressed in seminal form. It called for the
recovery of revealed religion as delivered from the apostles and their successors, noting especially the rôle and power of personal influence in spreading the faith.

Newman himself chose to date the start of the movement from the first Sunday he returned from his Mediterranean trip, on 14 July 1833: 'Keble preached the Assize Sermon in the University Pulpit. It was published under the title of "National Apostasy". I have ever considered and kept the day, as the start of the religious movement of 1833.'

Tristram explains the conflicting views:

Thus Newman, without a thought of self, resigned the credit to another. But by others an earlier date has been assigned [the 1832 sermon] ... These two views are not irreconcilable with each other: Newman's sermon was an appeal for volunteers in the spiritual combat; Keble's a call to action in the political crisis that seemed to menace the Church of England.

The Assize Sermon, by challenging creeping State control of the English Church, gave impetus to scattered opposition by various committees. But it was Newman who observed that 'Living movements do not come of committees', and so he took the lead in pioneering and editing the Tracts together with men like Keble and Froude who shared the necessary

---

94 Apo. 43. In his 'Autobiographical Memoir' he claimed that the 'Oxford theological movement ... dates its origin from his and Hurrell Froude's premature separation from the office of College Tutor' (AW86). He thus identifies and differentiates what he personally felt were the remote origins and a proximate impetus of the movement.

In his biographical study, John Henry Newman: With a Set of Unpublished Letters (London: Philip Allan, 1933), Frank Leslie Cross addresses this question of origins in appendix 4: 'The Myth of July 4, 1833' (pp. 162-163). His well supported thesis is that Newman alone is responsible for the notion that Keble's sermon was the start of the Oxford Movement, by this reference in the Apo., written thirty years after the fact. All other major relevant contemporary chroniclers (with a possible exception of J. B. Mozley, an earnest disciple of Newman's, who was not there) seemed to ignore it, including William Palmer, Frederick Oakeley, Isaac Williams, Hurrell Froude, Gladstone, Pusey, and Thomas Mozley. This appendix is one of the strong points of an otherwise problematic biography. See Blehl's review of Cross in: 'Annotated and Critical Bibliography of Biographies of Newman', in Cause of Canonization of the Servant of God, John Henry Newman (1801-1890) Founder of the English Oratories. Positio Super Virtutibus, vol. 2, pp. 303-304 (Birmingham, England: Vincent Ferrer Blehl, S.J., for the Congregation for the Causes of the Saints, Rome, 1989). Gilley sees the reputation of the 'myth' as 'a singular instance of Newman's ability to give a heightened quality to events in a drama in which his was one of the principal rôles' (Newman and His Age, 111).

95 AW 119.
antecedents of 'a unity of place' [Oxford], a common history, common memories, an intercourse of mind with mind in the past, and a progress and increase in that intercourse in the present'; in short, a mutual personal influence.¹⁷

Newman’s primary concern in the sermon on ‘Personal Influence’ is to understand how the truth of the Christian religion has been effectively passed on from generation to generation, from the teaching of Christ and the apostles until his own day. After dismissing several inadequate explanations for Christianity’s longevity and continuity in the face of natural and supernatural impediments, he introduces his topic of educational means by acknowledging first the providence of God, and our dependence on his grace. But then he asks us to consider ‘the human means by which His Providence acts in the world, in order to ... understand our duty in particulars’. He then describes what he conceived ‘to be the real method by which the influence of spiritual principles is maintained in this carnal world’. This ‘real method’ consists in ‘the personal influence, direct and indirect, of those who are commissioned to teach it’.⁹⁹

The reference to ‘real method’ here is one of Newman’s favourite themes, i.e., to contrast the unreal with the real. In a letter to a friend who had asked counsel of Newman in 1831 regarding town-preacherships, the young Anglican pastor already sees such ministry as potentially unreal:

96 Apo. 46-48.

97 For more on the personal origins of the Oxford Movement, see R. W. Church, The Oxford Movement (1891; reprint London: Macmillan, 1900); and Christopher Dawson, The Spirit of the Oxford Movement (London: Sheed and Ward, 1933), 12-84. Church summarizes well the personal synergism of the movement’s key players: ‘Keble had given the inspiration, Froude had given the impulse; then Newman took up the work, and the impulse henceforward, and the direction, were his’ (p. 32. See also: 33, 92-95).

98 US 76-7.

99 US 79-80; emphasis in original. See also epigraph, chapter 6.
They seem dangerous to the holder, as corrupting the minister into the orator. The realities of our profession are in parochial and such-like engagements—the sickbed, the schoolroom, the accidental intercourse of the week—but a pulpit makes one unreal, rhetorical—conceited—it hardens the heart, while it effeminates it.99

These are remarkable words from one who had already earned a reputation as an exceptional preacher in the pulpit of St. Mary the Virgin.100 But they are consistent with his actual practice as a priest, pastor, preacher, and educator. He prescribed the real method for effective religious and moral formation in The Tamworth Reading Room:

The heart is commonly reached, not through the reason, but through the imagination, by means of direct impressions, by the testimony of facts and events, by history, by description. Persons influence us, voices melt us, looks subdue us, deeds inflame us. Many a man will live and die upon a dogma: no man will be a martyr for a conclusion.101

Newman is not disparaging the use of reason, but rather seeks to put it in right context. Conclusions logically arrived at have their necessary place, but man is more than a mere rational animal. The human heart is most deeply touched by another heart—either divine or human—and this fact speaks of the integral wholeness and mysterious depths of the human person, as created in the image of God. He is affirming the mystery of personhood with its capacity for personal intercommunion. Through personal contact, we are able to see into the soul of another through their subtleties of vocal intonation, facial and bodily gestures, and


100 See the treatment of Newman's preaching style and influence during his Anglican period in chapter 2.4, above.

101 DA 293; emphasis added. Newman was not alone in prescribing 'personal influence'; but here again we see the poetic force with which he described educational ideals. A similar contemporary call for positive influence on the part of the teacher comes from Abp. Manning: 'The conscious influence is that which comes directly from his acts and words; the unconscious streams from him unawares, at all times, by words, acts, gestures, tones of voice, by a thousand suggestions and transparent signs.... They may talk all day long about humility, and faith and piety; but their pupils will become what they are, and not what they say' (from a pastoral letter of 1872 cited in Whitehead, 'A View from the Bridge', 224).
the example of their good deeds. His insistence on this point in his controversy with Sir Robert Peel concerning *The Tamworth Reading Room* stems from his explicitly Christian theology of God, truth, man, and education, as discussed in earlier chapters.

4.2 Personal Influence in Newman's Praxis

Two examples from his Catholic period will further illustrate Newman's consistency in emphasising personal influence as a key to Christian education: his teaching on the rôle of a college and its tutors at the Catholic University of Ireland, and his leadership at the Oratory School.

**College Tutors.** For the Irish University Newman wanted to supply a tutorial system that would eliminate the lack of guidance he had received while an undergraduate at Trinity, modelled after the Oriel system he had developed: a model of close spiritual and academic guidance, based on trusting personal relationships.

There are many passages where Newman asserts and defends the pedagogy of personal influence for the University in the *Idea*, but a less accessible source on his university ideal is to be found in the privately printed book, *My Campaign in Ireland*. This contains a set of 'Rules and Regulations' submitted to the Council for approval in 1856 by Newman in his capacity as Rector. 'In proposing rules', Newman says his recommendations are based on the principle 'that the young for the most part cannot be driven, but, on the other hand, are open to persuasion, and to the influence of kindness and personal attachment'.

After listing the officials of the university and their rôles, he comes to the resident tutor, whose 'duty is

---

102 Campaign 36.
certainly the moral, but more directly the intellectual care of his pupils'. Influence is valued over a mere rule of law, consistent with his Oratorian way of life. Newman observes that all this involves a real occupation on the part of the Tutor... The way to a young man's heart lies through his studies... From the books which lie before them [the student and the Tutor] are led into conversation, speculation, discussion: there is the intercourse of mind with mind... Obscurities of thought, difficulties in philosophy, perplexities of faith are confidentially brought out, sifted, and solved; and a pagan poet or theorist may thus become the occasion of Christian advancement. Thus the Tutor forms the pupil's opinions, and is the friend, perhaps the guide, of his after life.104

A similar description of personal influence, friendship, and guidance is found in Gravissimum Educationis, where Catholic school teachers are encouraged to 'do all they can to stimulate their students to act for themselves and even after graduation to continue to assist them with advice, friendship and by establishing special associations imbued with the true spirit of the Church'.105

For Newman, a close pastoral care for a pupil's mental and spiritual advancement is the means by which a tutor properly discharges his duty of steering others through the maze of corrupting ideas and practices, and into the light and certainty of truth. This guidance requires an interchange of ideas and a mutual, personal trust. Newman is ever keeping in view the end of all education, namely a life of growth here on earth that prepares one for the after life. He then summarizes his ideal:

In this idea of a College Tutor, we see that union of intellectual and moral influence, the separation of which is the evil of the age. Men are accustomed to go to the Church for religious training, but to the world for the

103 Campaign 117.


105 GE 8.
cultivation both of their hard reason and their susceptible imagination. A Catholic University will but half remedy this evil, if it aims only at professorial, not at private teaching. Where is the private teaching, there will be the real influence.\textsuperscript{106}

Newman also stipulates that college halls should remain small, to allow for a more easily maintained discipline, since 'personal influence requires personal acquaintance'.\textsuperscript{107} The other reason for small colleges was to provide a second home to students, who need the discipline and mutual support that a community of peers and mentors can provide in this setting. Here morals are protected through cooperative observance of the college's ideals, and minds are sharpened by the ongoing debate and dialogue that inevitably takes place.

He also hopes that 'Professors will without effort, and almost spontaneously, draw around them such young men as, from a turn for a particular study, or in other ways, are open to their influence'.\textsuperscript{108} He thus hoped (and really expected) that professors would be of good influence, but he demanded this from the tutors. As university rector, he acknowledged the strengths of both the professor-dominated systems of the medieval ages and in contemporary Germany, as well as the college-tutor systems of Oxford and Cambridge. He wrote in the \textit{Gazette} that he saw the two systems as necessary complements in an ideal university:

\ldots I am for both views at once, and think neither of them complete without the other. I admire the Professor, I venerate the College. The Professorial system fulfils the strict idea of a University, and is sufficient for its being, but it is not sufficient for its well-being. Colleges constitute the integrity of a University.\textsuperscript{109}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{106} \textit{Campaign} 120, emphasis added.
\textsuperscript{107} \textit{Campaign} 39.
\textsuperscript{108} \textit{Campaign} 42.
\textsuperscript{109} HS 3:182. The essay, 'Professors and Tutors', was originally published in the \textit{Catholic University Gazette}, 3 Aug 1854; collected in \textit{OW} (1856) and finally in \textit{HS} (1872).
\end{flushleft}
He saw in the college tutor system, the 'safeguard of a University', i.e., that principle which supplies the integrity of the institution. And this integrity is superadded and guaranteed by the Church's assistance: 'Colleges are the direct and special instruments, which the Church uses in a University, for the attainment of her sacred objects.' In a typically Newmanian rhetorical flourish, he employs evocative hyperbole to summarize his point:

With influence there is life, without it there is none . . . An academical system without the personal influence of teachers upon pupils, is an arctic winter; it will create an ice-bound, petrified, cast-iron University and nothing else.

The Oratory School. A final illustration of Newman's priorities in establishing a Christian school climate comes from his work at the Oratory School. Here he provided for personnel, structures, and policies that supported his theological convictions regarding pastoral care and personal influence. This commitment was one important aspect of his backing of Mrs. Wootten over Darnell. Newman tried to build a family-like atmosphere in the school, which included giving a stronger emphasis than usual for the times, to the rôle of a school matron as a sort of surrogate mother. This was in contrast with the rather seminary-like atmosphere that prevailed at most of the other Catholic alternatives to the public schools, such as those run by the Jesuits at Stonyhurst, and by the Benedictines at Ampleforth. Newman and the parents had a different conception of school discipline and personal care for the Catholic youth that would come to their school. When asked to

\[110\] HS 3:180.
\[111\] HS 3:183.
\[112\] HS 3:74.
\[113\] See the brief discussion of this in chapter 3.4.1, above.
compare the new School with the existing Catholic schools, he summarized what he felt were the similarities and differences:

It differs from Oscott, as any one school differs from another – Oscott has a finer situation and building – it has venerable traditions – it has nearly twice the number of boys. We have not above 60 – we are new – we have more little boys. Some people like what is new, others what is old – some a large school – other a more select one. If we have one point, which we lay stress on, more than other schools, it is in the quality of our matrons. They are ladies, who do not make a livelihood by their places, but have means of their own – and they take peculiar care of the boys. Need I say more than this?

Newman's priority of personal care and influence also motivated his involvement in all aspects of the School during the last three decades of his life, as far as his health and other duties would allow. This all took place when he was in his sixties, seventies, and eighties, even after being named a cardinal. His motivation for such involvement was due largely to a conscious obedience to his belief in personal influence as the means of propagating the truth. Although he could have found every excuse for a more detached approach to this fledgling boys school, he saw in it not a distraction from greater work, but rather, a practical and necessary outworking of his commitments as a Christian pastor of souls, and life-long educator.

Excerpts taken from the memoirs of two former students give further evidence of his close personal involvement with and influence on the pupils. William Sparrow records:

I went myself to the Oratory in 1863, and for eleven years enjoyed the privilege and blessing of the Cardinal's training. In those early days of the school we saw more of the Father (as we called him) than was possible for the students to have done in later years, owing to his age and physical weakness. Every month, in my time, each form went up to the Father's room and was examined by him *vivâ voce* in the work done during the preceding month, a trying ordeal for those who were nervous or idle, notwithstanding the

114 LD 20:68 (emphasis added); a letter of 22 November 1861 to Miss Holmes, during their third year of operation.
kindness and gentleness of the Father, who was one of the most considerate and sympathetic of examiners.\textsuperscript{115}

Newman's concern for the boy's progress was not limited to their academic studies, for which 'he was always most particular to urge upon the boys a higher standard of honour, and never would tolerate anything mean or shabby.' Sparrow relates how the Prefect of Studies' care was concretely expressed 'at the end of each term', when 'every boy went to the Father for what we called his "character," that is, the Father spoke to him privately as to his progress and behaviour during the past term'.\textsuperscript{116} Arthur Pollen, who first arrived at the School in 1878,\textsuperscript{117} wrote of the continuing, although limited influence of Newman, fifteen years after the period described by Sparrow. Newman's genuine capacity for friendship, noted throughout this work, is one of the traits that most impressed Pollen:

At the Oratory we saw a good deal of the Cardinal; and, although he took no active share in the administration of the school, his interest in it was always great. Nothing pleased him more than making friends with the boys, and the many opportunities we had of personal contact with him made the friendship a real one. Of course, to us he was the greatest of heroes.\textsuperscript{118}

This is not to suggest that everyone Newman encountered came to know him as a friend or hero. Likewise, even though the Vatican has declared that he practised the virtues to an

\textsuperscript{115} Cited in John Oldcastle, \textit{Cardinal Newman: A Monograph} (October 1890 issue of \textit{Merry England}, 47). Oldcastle identifies the writer simply as 'another "Old Boy," Dr. Sparrow'. The index of LD 20 describes Sparrow as both a student and tutor. William John Sparrow (1850-1914) was 'at the Oratory School, 1863-7, and returned as tutor, 1869-74. He went to London University, and was called to the Bar, Lincoln's Inn, 1878. He practised in Liverpool, and was a member of the Liverpool School Board, and of the Catholic Education Council' (p. 607). Sparrow's reflections thus represent those of a student and co-worker with Newman. He serves as one example of those many who fulfilled the parents' and Newman's desire of preparing young Catholic laymen to take leadership roles in Church and society.

\textsuperscript{116} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{117} See the 'Universal Roll-Call' in Mohnen, "Voruniversitäre Erziehung", Anhang I, 'Schüler der Oratory School von 1839-1929, p. 319.

\textsuperscript{118} Oldcastle, \textit{Cardinal Newman}, 46. Like Sparrow, Arthur Pollen was called to the Bar, at Lincoln's Inn (1893). 'He became a journalist and a writer on naval affairs, also director of several companies, including B.S.A, and Daimler' (LD 30: 484).
heroic degree, Newman himself admitted to having a 'morbidly sensitive skin'. This accurate self-knowledge corroborates his well-documented defensiveness, a tendency towards an aloof attitude, and his passionate differences and prickly debates with men like Peel, Faber, Manning, and Talbot. Nevertheless, the relevance of his theological convictions to this study regarding Catholic education are not blunted by his inevitable human weaknesses. On balance, his personal influence upon those who were under his pastoral and educational care was positive and constructive, as witnessed by these and many other like quotations that survive in the literature from his contemporaries at Oxford, Dublin, and Birmingham. Despite Newman's struggles against his fallen but redeemed humanity, his heart, intellect, and educational ideal were clearly inspired by the *imitatio Christi*. 

119 LD 30:356.
Chapter Seven

CONCLUSION: RETRIEVAL AND RENEWAL

The memory of the great Cardinal's noble life and his copious writings seem to touch the minds and hearts of many people today with a freshness and relevance that his scarcely faded with the passing of a century. ... To all searching minds in this present historical context, Newman's voice speaks with a timely message.

— John Paul II

1. Summary and Contributions

This study has enquired into the content and continuing relevance of John Henry Newman's educational ideals in so far as they were guided by his theological approach and religious convictions. Because he stood very self-consciously in the mainstream of the Christian educational tradition, Newman's contribution to the search for educational renewal is generally in harmony with recent Church documents. At times, however, his views or praxis would have to be considered somewhat out of step with contemporary Church experience, concerns, or insights. An overarching conclusion is that Newman's educational theology is, on balance, relevant to and supportive of the Second Vatican Council's call for 'restoring all things in Christ' in the context of a 'courageous' and 'continual renewal' of Catholic education. It is hoped that this study will open up new areas of investigation into a renewed

---

1 The title of this chapter is suggested by the sub-title of the 'Ressourcement Series: Retrieval and Renewal in Catholic Thought', David L. Schindler, gen. ed. (op. cit.).

2 John Paul's Letter on Newman', [to Abp. M. Couve de Murville] in L'Osservatore Romano, n. 29 (16 July 1990), 1. See also his conclusion on p, 3: 'It is my fervent hope that the present Centenary year will occasion in the minds of many people who thirst for truth and genuine freedom, a renewed awareness of the lessons to be gained from the life and writings of this outstanding Englishman, priest and cardinal' (emphasis in original).

3 GE Introduction.

4 CSTTM 3.

5 ECE 7.
theology of education, together with a recognition of Newman's possible contributions towards that renewal.

1.1 Retrieving Newman's Educational Life and Work

Part one explored the literary, historical, and theological background needed to build a synthesis of Newman's theological ideals for education in light of recent Church documents. Taken together with chapters two and three, appendix one, 'Synopsis of the Life, Work, and Times of John Henry Newman' offers a useful tool for the interdisciplinary fields of Newman studies and nineteenth-century Western religious and cultural history. Its selective matter from the life of Newman, juxtaposed to the general historical context should be of service to scholars who chose to build upon the pattern of historical analysis leading to theological synthesis in Newman studies, following the example of this study.

An examination of Newman's educational formation, life, and work demonstrated the continuity of his commitment and vision in the task of Christian education. He founded poor schools and Sunday schools at St. Clement's and Littlemore. His pastoral view of the Oriel Tutor's office informed all of his future teaching. He devoted his Anglican priesthood to forming 'hearts and intellects' through his pulpit, pen, and pastoral care.

After his Catholic conversion, he discerned that the Oratorian way of life was well-suited to the backgrounds of himself and his followers. He was faced with challenging opportunities as he attempted to baptise a nineteenth-century Oxonian ethos into Catholic Christianity. As Father Superior of the Birmingham Oratory he supported apostolates of education and catechesis among the poor and middle classes. Newman's work at CUI and

---

6 Following the example found in Newman's 'imaginative devotion' to such varied sources as Sir Walter Scott, the Church Fathers, and the evangelical maxims of Thomas Scott. (see chapter 2, above)
the Oratory School was in part a fulfilment of the foundational Papal Brief for the English Congregation of the Oratory, which specified a special call to work with the ‘doctior et honestior ordo’ of England. It has been argued, however, that Newman had certain ‘blind spots’, including ‘his comparative indifference to poverty and social injustice’, despite his indirect work for the poor through the various apostolates of the Oratory. ‘The education of the sons of gentlemen’ was Newman’s perception of his particular educational calling, and he made no apology for this. His educational praxis is thus helpful but limited in the illustration of modern universal principles of Catholic education, since most of his direct experience of institutional education as a student and educator was of an elitist form designed for upper-class boys and young men.

The study of Newman’s educational work and writing verified the notion that his holistic educational ideal is not to be found by reading The Idea of a University in isolation. Perhaps one of its most succinct and forceful presentations is found in his CUL sermon, ‘Intellect, the Instrument of Religious Training’. Here he makes clear the genius of a Catholic academy in its project of integral human formation in Christ. We thus come full-circle to a passage that served as an epigraph to the first chapter:

Here, then, I conceive, is the object of the Holy See and the Catholic Church in setting up Universities: it is to reunite things which were in the beginning joined together by God, and have been put asunder by man. . . . I wish the same spots and the same individuals to be at once oracles of philosophy and shrines of devotion. . . . I want the same roof to contain both the intellectual and the moral discipline.

Many other examples could be cited from part one’s survey of the various literary genres within the Newman corpus. The Lyra Apostolica give insight into the poetic imagination

---

7 Newsome, Convert Cardinals, 371. This study would agree with this judgement, if Newman’s specific achievements were compared to, for example, the work and writings of Cardinal Manning during the same time period.

8 LD 18:244.
behind his educational vision, and of his educational method of reserve. His letters written in 1841 to the editor of The Times, known collectively as The Tamworth Reading Room, contain his unequivocal manifesto: 'Christianity, and nothing short of it, must be made the element and principle of all education'. The privately-printed memoranda in My Campaign in Ireland describe Newman's educational policies and curriculum which actualized his religious priorities. One way to picture the search for Newman's educational theology amidst this diverse literature is to imagine oneself following the course of two streams converging in a single river. One tributary represents his pastoral sermons, devotional literature, letters, and poetry addressed primarily to the heart. The other symbolises those writings on university education and mental culture addressed more to the intellect. The two streams converged for Newman in the person and message of Christ; and from this confluence flowed his Catholic ministry of forming hearts and intellects at CUI and the Oratory School.

Newman's life work as a Christian educator can be seen as a model for 'the unreserved and gratuitous “gift” of self to the service of others' in education. He exemplifies the dignity and worth of the vocation to Christian education in an age when some of the Church's best minds are often siphoned off towards works of 'professional utility' that offer more financial gain. Studying his life could cause a new generation of Catholics to reconsider the call of spending their lives for the edification and education of others.

1.2 Restoring the Christological Foundations of Education

Part two of this study was a preliminary attempt to systematise Newman's theological foundations of education, as seen through the lens of select themes presented in ECE and

9 DA 274.
10 CSTTM 13.
CSTTM. The purpose of the intertextual study was to begin a new synthesis to serve the restoration of the theological foundations of Catholic education. It was interested not so much in what Newman argued from natural reason, but rather to discover what he considered to be some of the theological imperatives for establishing and strengthening the Catholic identity and climate of an academy. Subject development included: Newman’s Christian humanism, the rôle of theology in education, christocentricity, integral human formation, and the fostering of an authentically Christian identity, climate, and personal influence in a Catholic academy.\footnote{See the organizational chart on page 28}

The similarities between Newman and the Church documents were seen as the result of his standing within, and promoting for his own time, a received tradition of Catholic education. The differences between the express wording of the two sources spring from a number of factors, including differences in the chronological, cultural, and geographical milieu between Newman’s nineteenth-century educational concerns in England and Ireland, as compared to this past decade’s universal and contemporary context for ECE and CSTTM. The contrasts are further heightened by Newman’s particular concern in the early Discourses to define a university ‘in the abstract, and in its idea’\footnote{Idea xxxiii.} with carefully nuanced distinctions and illustrations, as compared to the magisterium’s holistic, theological approach.

The perspective of part two differed markedly from Culler’s study, The Imperial Intellect: A Study of Newman’s Educational Ideal. His focus was precisely on ‘the Imperial Intellect’, or the University’s unique rôle in forming a ‘philosophical habit of mind.’ Culler was emphasising certain philosophical foundations of Newman’s liberal arts ideal, whereas this study focused on the theological foundations of Newman’s idea of a Catholic academy. The
two studies are thus complementary in their emphases and findings. Catholic educators concerned with restoring the ecclesial and evangelistic dimensions of their academies will likely find this study to be a corrective to Culler's overemphasis on one aspect of Newman's educational ideal.

A major theme that emerged from the study of Newman's theology of education was the centrality of the person and message of Christ for the foundations, identity, and climate of Catholic education. This discovery coincides with John Paul II's claim that: 'Above all, Newman is a magnificent guide for all those who perceive that the key, the focal point and the goal of all human history is to be found in Christ'.\(^\text{13}\) Jesus Christ is "the Way, the Truth, and the Life", the Logos, whose Spirit of intelligence and love enables the human person with his or her own intelligence to find the ultimate reality of which he is the source and end'.\(^\text{14}\) Christ is the One who 'holds all things together' in answer to today's fragmentation of knowledge and educational schemes. It is he who provides a hierarchy or 'sacred order' to the otherwise disparate claims of educational spheres and aims. Christian educators have traditionally taken Christ the Master Teacher as their model, and Newman adopted this ideal. His prayers and other writings demonstrate how he prescribed the imitation of Christ as the basis for the vocation, ministry, and character of the Christian teacher. He believed that the teaching method most appropriate to Christian education was one inspired and animated by Christ, reliant on personal influence, and centred on the impartation of a teacher's heart to a student's heart.

Newman's contributions to a theology of education were shown in chapter four to include a development of Christian humanism inspired by his patristic studies. He left his

\(^{13}\) Pope John Paul's Letter on Newman, op. cit.

\(^{14}\) ECE 4.
mark on the Christian liberal arts tradition primarily through his rearticulation of the question of theology's place in the curriculum, the preeminence of Christ the Paedagogus, and the integration of intellectual and moral excellence. The ultimate goal for restoring the foundations and unity of education is, for Newman, as for the whole Catholic tradition, instaurare omnia in Christo.

1.3 Renewing Catholic Identity and Climate

An extended investigation into the apparent contradictions between Newman and ECE on the issue of a Catholic university's academic identity was made in chapter five. Each of the other chapters contributed additional evidence leading to the following three conclusions: First, although the Idea at times gives the impression that teaching universal knowledge is the sole purpose of a university, upon closer inspection of Newman's writings and practice, it would be more accurate to say that he placed a priority on teaching undergraduates, promoting that 'cultivation of mind' that is unique and proper to a university training as such. Second, he also promoted research on three different levels, according to the usage of the term in recent Church documents. These levels were examined under the categories of: (a) searching for truth and integration, (b) promoting scientific advancement, and (c) applying a theological perspective to all areas of research. A third conclusion regarding Newman's place for research and service is that he argued on practical, philosophical, and theological grounds, that a direct end (as opposed to the indirect religious effects related to man's ultimate end) of a university education is to form students intellectually, for the practical end of service to Church and society.
The ecclesial identity of a Catholic academy derives from its being 'born from the heart of the Church'. Catholic schools and universities are in no way extrinsic to the nature and mission of the Church. Newman held to a 'high theological view' of the academy that called for an intimate relationship between the Church and the academy. Fidelity to the Christian message requires the entire academic community to maintain and strengthen its Catholic identity. Bishops have a particular role in caring for the ecclesial integrity of an academy. Newman insisted on a 'direct and active jurisdiction' by the Church hierarchy over Catholic academies, contrary to those who are currently opposing the spirit and letter of certain juridical norms in ECE.

This thesis has argued that Newman would support the currently controversial norms for Catholic theologians to have a mandatum from the competent Church authority to teach matters of faith and morals in a Catholic university, in addition to taking the 'Profession of Faith' and the 'Oath of Fidelity'. Newman's way was not one of obsequious obedience, however. He held to a strong role for conscience in the Christian life, while modelling an inductive and personalist theology. The study thus proposes that which John Paul II intimates — Newman was an exemplar of that 'courageous creativity and rigorous fidelity' called for in ECE.

Since Newman is a recognized model for Catholic educators, then the parallel passage in CSTTM which calls for a 'courageous renewal on the part of the Catholic school' may rightly look to him for insight and inspiration in achieving this goal. But the retrieval of Newman's educational theology and praxis cannot be adopted wholesale from his context to ours. CSTTM goes on to say:
The precious heritage of the experience gained over the centuries reveals its vitality precisely in the capacity for prudent innovation. And so, now as in the past, the Catholic school must be able to speak for itself effectively and convincingly. It is not merely a question of adaptation, but of missionary thrust, the fundamental duty to evangelize, to go towards men and women wherever they are, so that they may receive the gift of salvation.  

Newman's theological perspective for the integration of knowledge is part of that 'precious heritage' from which the Church draws. His articulation of the dialogue between faith and reason, and the need for bringing an ethical and moral concern to all of research and teaching illustrates the teaching of ECE. He is a forceful and eloquent spokesman for the integration of faith and learning at the service of evangelization, as was seen from the extensive quotations in part two. A 'prudent innovation' for present day Catholic educators would be to regularly assign readings in Newman followed by student essays and debates on his contemporary relevance to the 'missionary thrust' of teaching, research, and service.

Chapter six developed a contemporary framework for understanding Newman's ideas on cultivating a genuine Catholic ethos or climate in the academy. It offers preliminary answers to the question, 'How do we foster a school climate that builds genuine human community pervaded by Gospel values?' ECE claims the ultimate key to realizing a genuine Catholic school climate is 'a common dedication ... to the person and message of Christ' by all members of the educating community. Here again, the thoroughly Christ-centred nature of Newman's theological vision for education spoke in harmony with the Church documents. It was demonstrated that the spiritual classic, *Imitatio Christi* was very probably a major formative influence in his own spirituality, in his spiritual direction, and in his pedagogical approach. A future study could further explore this influence.

---

15 CSTTM 4.
16 ECE 21.
In imitation of St. Philip Neri, Newman's praxis at CUI and the Oratory School make clear his priorities of pastoral care and personal influence. He championed the pastoral, religious, and familial roles of his college tutors, spiritual directors and confessors, and school matrons, as being essential for maintaining a proper school identity and climate. He worked closely with the parents of the Oratory School to insure that the natural and supernatural order of parental rights in education was observed in the pursuit of a particular expression of Catholic education for their sons.

2. Areas for Further Study

This investigation has expanded the borders of a field of study which now invite further exploration. The project of comparing Newman's life and work to recent Church documents on education may be carried forward in many areas. Future studies can build upon the initial contributions of the present work, using a similar set of methodological approaches. The methods used here should be further defined and sharpened. A more precise definition of 'intertextual studies', and the fuller historical context of this methodology and of its reception in theological studies should be advanced. Merrigan's 'model of polarity' hermeneutic and his study, Clear Heads and Holy Hearts: The Religious and Theological Ideal of John Henry Newman could be explored for more of their relevance to Newman's educational ideal as compared to Church teaching, especially in the area of religious epistemology.

2.1 Newman's Contributions to a Theology of Educational Mission

The Church documents address far more issues than could be treated in one project of limited scope and size. Having now prepared a method and context in part one and the appendices for exploring Newman studies and Catholic education, the author intends to continue this line of
inquiry in several other areas. Perhaps the next most important cluster of complementary concepts to study would be those surrounding the notion of mission. Identity and mission are often discussed together, with mission flowing out of identity. Part two considered several themes that fall under the rubric of 'identity' in Part 1.A. of ECE. A study of similar length could profitably attempt a synthesis of Newman’s life and work with the Church documents on the various areas of educational mission. A proposal for such a study would be to make the outline to the section on mission in ECE a framework upon which the synthesis could be built:

**ECE Part I: Identity and Mission**

A. Identity [= Corresponds to Part II of this thesis]

B. Mission of Service of a Catholic University

1. Service to Church and Society
   [the essence of the academy's mission is service, with a missionary intent to build God's Kingdom and to transform society]

2. Pastoral Ministry
   [ministry to the academy's community members]

3. Cultural Dialogue
   [faith and science, ethics, ecumenism, inter-religious dialogue, etc.]

4. Evangelization
   [the essential mission of the Church, to which Catholic academies make their own specific contributions, 'bringing the Good News into all the strata of humanity' (ECE 48)].

These areas of mission could be compared to Newman’s ‘Ten Objectives’ list reproduced in chapter five, above, together with his other educational writings and praxis.
In addition to a study of educational mission, other studies could be pursued, based on a comparison of Newman with Church documents in several cognate areas. Possible research topics would include Newman's theological insights into such contemporary issues as: the roles of Religious and the laity in education, campus ministry on non-Catholic campuses, educating for commitment in a pluralist society, distance learning, emerging educational technologies, home schooling, and the educational implications of John Paul II's call for a 'new evangelization'. Newman's contributions towards a theology of catechesis could be explored, comparing his work with the 1997 *Catechetical Directory for Catechesis* in a manner similar to this thesis. Other studies could enquire into Newman's relevance to some modern controversies over the definitions, roles, and relationships of theology, evangelization, apologetics, catechesis, and religious education.

2.2 *Taxonomy of Questions for Newman's Theology of Education*

The project of engaging Newman in a dialogue with contemporary theological and educational questions would be profited by considering other means of systemisation and synthesis. One such system is that of John Hull, a leading British theorist in Christian education. His essay, 'What is Theology of Education?' proposes a 'Taxonomy of Problems in the Theology of Education'. Hull's contribution to the field lies in his systematic method: 'The right order for theology of education is . . . first, to draw up a list and of possible a taxonomy of problems, then to distinguish the methods appropriate to the resolution of the various problems, and finally to marshal the resources for the task'. His eight-page list can be summarized by the following abbreviated main headings:

Part I: Problems of Formal Principles

Part IA. Problems Arising for the Formal Principles of Education
IA1 Philosophy of Education
IA2 Psychology of Education
IA3 Sociology of Education
IA4 History of Education

Part IB. Problems Arising from the Formal Principles of Theology
IB1 Systematic Theology
IB2 Biblical and Historical Theology
IB3 Confessional Theology
IB4 Contemporary Theology
IB5 Practical Theology

Part II: Problems of Material Principles

[i.e., questions having to do with a theological critique of content in all of the subjects. Hull does not detail the subdivisions of Parts II and III, as he did for Part I]18

Part III: Problems of Pedagogical Method

'The theological consequences or implications of method' (p. 29)

Part I thus has to do with questions of educational foundations (Hull calls these 'principles' or 'concepts', Part II with educational content, and Part III with educational method. From each subsection of Hull's taxonomy, questions for investigation could be posed for better understanding Newman's theology of education. For example, 'problems arising from systematic theology', include questions concerning sub-section IB1a: 'God'. Hull claims that 'If education is founded upon ideas about man and if theology holds man to be made in the image of God, then theology must be concerned with the foundations of education'. Given this premise, he then asks: 'What might flow from the concept of God in the thought of [for

---

18 Hull explains: 'For the sake of brevity, I have compressed this second main part of the taxonomy, but probably as much has been written in Britain under this Part II as under the whole of Part I' (pp. 28-9).
our example, Newman] for education? What are the implications of the doctrine of the trinity [as understood by Newman] for education?"\(^{19}\)

A complementary framework for synthesising Newman's educational theology would be the 'Analytical Index' to the *Papal Teachings on Education* anthology.\(^{20}\) This detailed outline provides a ready reference to most of the major concerns of an educational theology. Newman's thought could be examined in light of this outline as a means of illustrating the theological principles of Catholic education.

### 2.3 *Newman's Catechetical Lecture Notes*

Another research project to be considered is the production of a transcribed and synthesised critical edition of Newman's Catechetical lecture notes, taken by Oratory School boys. The students labelled their manuscript notebooks: 'Religious Instruction from Dr. Newman'. Gerard Tracey, archivist of the Birmingham Oratory Archives, confirmed that they have not yet been seriously studied or published. Upon examination of the notebooks, their value as a unique witness to Newman's actual catechetical content and of his interaction with students became readily apparent. There is often a very close correspondence in the wording, suggesting a lecture style of near-dictation. A textual criticism methodology would be able to reconstruct Newman's probable wording in many cases.

The aim of transcribing and editing the religious instruction notebooks would be three-fold: First, it would make accessible to a wide range of scholars in the fields of Newman studies, theology, catechesis, Catholic education, and Victorian studies, a set of manuscripts which fill in some of the gaps for each discipline, by offering an initial scholarly

---

\(^{19}\) Ibid., 25-6.

edition for further study. Second, the distilled content of Newman's catechesis to secondary level school boys would illustrate his mature theological convictions and educational priorities. Third, this content could then be studied for its continuing relevance.

Four editorial objectives would serve these goals: First, the edition would provide an accurate and readable transcription and synthesis of the notebooks and Newman's marginal comments, using standard textual editing methods and conventions. It would do this while retaining the flavour of a schoolboy's notes, which were never intended for publication. Second, it would explain allusions or other readings that may be unclear or difficult to the average reader. Third, it would furnish explanatory notes as part of the thesis text, that would set Newman's catechesis in its historical, literary, and theological contexts. It could discuss points of contact with some of his published works, and with Fr. John Norris's (head of the school after Ambrose St John) religious instruction lecture notes in the Oratory School archives. Fourth, it would be desirable to print it in a convenient and readable format, so as to highlight Newman's actual teaching, and to minimize editorial intrusion.

An introductory essay to the manuscripts could contain these elements: historical and archival background, a system of identifying the separate students and their respective notebooks, a few photocopied pages from the manuscripts themselves, and a summary and analysis of the basic content of the lectures. Comparative studies between the lecture notes and Newman's published works would be facilitated by cross references and editor's notes.

3. Epilogue

In every age, the falcon (or civilization) of Yeats's poem is tempted to flee from the presence of Christ, such that it 'cannot hear the falconer'. When it heeds the varied voices of the Anti-Christ, the result is a crisis of radical disintegration and confusion:

Things fall apart; the centre cannot hold;
Mere anarchy is loosed upon the world, . . .

The best lack all conviction, while the worst
Are full of passionate intensity. 22

For believing Christians, the answer to this crisis is to fly back to the falconer and to abide with him 23 with renewed conviction and passionate intensity, resulting in a restoration of unity and sacred order. One of the leaders of the modern ressourcement movement in theology, Henri de Lubac, claims that 'the renewal of Christian vitality is linked at least partially to a renewed exploration of the periods and of the works where the Christian tradition is expressed with particular intensity'. 24 This study has argued that Newman is a particularly intense spokesman and model for the renewal of Christian vitality in Catholic education. His life and work offer many contributions towards a theology of education in harmony with the Church's past, while anticipating her contemporary teachings. The evidence speaks in unison with the judgement of Fergal McGrath:

[W]e are not claiming any exclusive credit for Newman as an exponent of the truths he propounds. Many of them are simply commonplaces of Christianity. They are to be found in the writings of the Fathers of the Church and of the great scholastics, and they largely determined the constitution of the mediaeval universities. They figure in any modern Catholic textbook of education, indeed they inspired the writings of all Christian educationists of

---

22 'The Second Coming', op. cit.
24 Cited in David L. Schindler, Introduction to Ressourcement Series, [ii]; emphasis added.
other denominations up to quite recent times, and inspire many of them still. Newman's great virtue was that he propounded them so forcibly, and related them so clearly to the problems of his day, which are largely the problems of ours. 25

Newman propounded his convictions on the theological foundations, Catholic identity, and Christian climate of a Catholic academy 'forcibly', and with 'passionate intensity'. His contributions towards a theology of education and personal influence have continuing relevance, despite the differences of time and place that separate his world from ours. John Henry Cardinal Newman thus offers Catholic schools and universities of today enduring principles for study, and inspiring stories for re-imagining the Church's mission of 'restoring all things in Christ'.

25 McGrath, Consecration of Learning, 272; emphasis added.
APPENDICES
Appendix One

SYNOPSIS OF THE LIFE, WORK
AND TIMES OF JOHN HENRY NEWMAN

Purpose, Procedure, and Structure

The following synopsis presents in table form, a comparative chronology of the contemporary historical, biographical, educational, literary, cultural, and religious background to Newman's theological and educational work. It is a critical compilation based on shorter, existing published chronologies,¹ together with the autobiographical² biographical, and historical³ sources listed in the bibliography. Creating the synopsis provided a much needed understructure of research and documentation for the investigation, without burdening the text with undue historical focus and footnotes. The end result is a convenient reference tool for Newman studies in general, and a source of suggestive illustrations, insights, and comparisons for the findings and conclusions of the present work in particular. The originality of the synopsis lies in its thoroughness in comparison to similar works upon which it is based, and in its selection of material to support a better contextualized understanding of Newman's educational foundations. The author is not aware of any similar study yet published in terms of length and breadth of material covered in parallel column format.

¹ See 'Published Chronological Tables and Standard Reference Works', immediately following the endnotes of this appendix.

² The primary autobiographical sources used were: Apo., AW, Campaign, and LD. Each vol. of the Letters and Diaries has a chronological listing of key dates and events treated in that volume. See, e.g., LD 1:xvii-xviii.

³ See 'Secondary Sources on Newman: Other Newman Studies' in the select bibliography.
Selections (and corrections to published data, where necessary) were based on the following criteria: (1) agreement of a majority of the sources, (2) more weight being given to the autobiographical sources, and to Ker's biography, and (3) relative importance to the life, work, and times of Newman, especially with reference to his educational, personal, and literary influences and work.

The shorter chronological tables and lists were consulted first, to get a sense for the most important highlights that should be included. The biographical and historical works listed in the thesis bibliography were used to supplement and correct the data compiled from existing published chronologies. Once again, the shorter works were read first, and noted for their major events and dates. This was followed by a close reading of Ker's Biography and the other full-volume studies, together with the autobiographical material. Normally, at least two sources were consulted for each datum before inclusion.

Endnotes are used sparingly, since the majority of this information can be verified by any number of the above mentioned sources. Short phrases are occasionally taken directly from a consulted work, without giving a reference note, because of its brevity of expression, where the facts are widely documented. The endnotes are thus reserved mainly for these cases: (1) where less well known, or controversial points are included, (2) for direct quotations of longer phrases and sentences of special interest, (3) for facts found in only one source, and (4) where an explanatory note seemed appropriate.

Within each quadrant (or 'cell') of the table, no sequential order is intended unless a date is included. For example, the precise sequence of birth dates within a single year in the far right column is not to be implied by the order presented.
Abbreviations Used in the Synopsis and its Endnotes

This Synopsis employs the same abbreviations as the body of the thesis, supplemented by these additional ones:

- **Abp**: Archbishop
- **BC**: British Critic
- **Bp**: Bishop
- **JHN**: John Henry Newman
- **N**: Newman
- **UE**: Uniform edition of Newman's works.
- **>**: 'later republished in'. Example: 1854: *The Office and Work of Universities* > 'Rise and Progress of Universities', in *HS 3* (1872 UE) means that *The Office* was republished as a section with a new title in *Historical Sketches*, vol. 3, uniform edition of 1872.
# Appendix One: Synopsis of the Life, Work, and Times of John Henry Newman

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1803</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Moved to 17 Southampton St, Bloomsbury. Harriet Elizabeth Newman (sister) born.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Napoleon Wars begin</td>
<td></td>
<td>Harriet Newman (1803-1852)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1804</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Immanuel Kant d. 1804 Ludwig Feuerbach (1804-1872) James Prince Lee (1804-1869)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1806</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1808</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Feb: Family returns to Southampton St, Bloomsbury, London. May 1: Begins at Great Ealing School, a private boarding school in Ealing, just west of London. Rev. Dr. George Nicholas, Headmaster. 7-15 Attends Ealing School for 8 1/2 yrs., 1808-16. Highlights at Ealing: Excels academically; refrains from typical boy's games like marbles and unorganised cricket, but loved outdoor activities like riding and walking; plays violin; acts in Latin plays; wins prizes for speeches; edits periodicals; reads the Arabian Nights; etc.</td>
<td>Scott: <em>Marmion</em></td>
<td></td>
<td>Henry Edward Manning (1808-1892)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1810</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Copies a Bible verse onto its own page in one of his pocket books: &quot;Train up a child in the way he should go, and when he is old, he will not depart from it&quot; [Prov 22:6, AV]. J. Newman, presented to him by his kind Mama. A.D. 1810.&quot;</td>
<td>Jun 6: Newman begins keeping a diary, beginning with a summary of key events. Jan-May 1810.</td>
<td>Dr. Copleston defended Oxford against the attacks of the Edinburgh Review. Scott: <em>The Lady of the Lake</em></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ppe Leo XIII (1810-1903)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1811 | 10  | Feb 11: Draws a picture of a rosary in his Latin verse book.² |                                                                      | George (IV), Prince of Wales becomes Regent when father, George III goes mad. Period known as 'The Regency' (1811-1820) |                                               | Abp Archibald C. Tait 1811-1852  
Frederic Regens  
Lord Blanchford 1811-1889 |
| 1812 | 11  | Speaking of himself, Newman records: 'Though in no respect a precocious boy, he attempted original compositions in prose and verse from the age of eleven, and in prose showed a great sensibility and took much pains in matters of style. He devoted to such literary exercises and to such books as came in his way, a good portion of his play-time ... '⁶ |                                                                      | Brods. Grimm: Fairy Tales (1812-1822) |                                               | James Hope-Scott 1812-1873 |
| 1813 | 12  | Composed a 'little opera'⁶ |                                                                      |                                               |                                               | Kierkegaard 1813-1855  
Richard Wagner 1813-1883  
Augustus W. N. Pugin 1813-1852 |
| 1814 | 13  | Reads Waverly Novels by Sir Walter Scott sometime between the pub. of Waverly, 1814, and mid-1817⁷ | Sometime during his Ealing years, he experiments with imitating the writing style of Gibbon & Johnson.⁸ | Wordsworth: The Excursion  
Byron: The Corsair  
Scott: Waverly |                                               | Frederick Wm. Faber 1814-1863 |
| 1815 | 14  | Reading Thomas Paine's Tracts Against the Old Testament, '...some of Hume's Essays; and perhaps that on Miracles'. and perhaps some of Voltaire or the Encyclopaedists. Enjoys reading objections to Christianity.⁹ Wants to be 'virtuous but not religious'.¹¹ | Coleridge: Kubla Khan  
Scott: Guy Mannering |                                               |                                               | Ambrose St. John 1815-1875  
Battle of Waterloo.  
Corn Law.  
Congress of Vienna restores Papal States. |
| 1816 | 15  | Mar 8: Father's bank is closed; he begins managing a brewery. He had by this time come under the Evangelical influence of Rev. Walter Mayers, his classics master, whom Newman identifies as 'the human means of this beginning of divine faith in me'.¹² He gave Newman many doctrinal and devotional works, all from the Calvinistic school, including the works of Romaine, and Thomas Scott of Aston Sandford, who made a deeper impression on my mind than any other, and to whom (humanly speaking) I almost owe my soul...¹³ Scott's spiritual autobiography, The Force of Truth was probably influential in his writing of Development of Christian Doctrine, and the Apologia.¹⁴ |                                               |                                               |                                               | |

Aug 1-Dec 21: JHN regarded this period as a turning point of his life.


Considers monastic work.

Reads Thomas Newton's (1704-1731) Dissertations on the Prophecies (1759), which convince him that the Pope is Anti-Christ; deeply ingrained anti-Romanist.¹⁵

Dec 21: Travels to Oxford with father, offered place at Trinity as a commoner.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>John D. Dalton (1818-1876)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>James Anthony Froude (1818-1894)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Karl Marx (1818-1883)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>John D. Dalton (1818-1876)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>James Anthony Froude (1818-1894)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1819</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Reads Gibbon, Ivanhoe, Aeschylus' Prometheus, Crabbe's Tales of the Hall.</td>
<td>Scott: Ivanhoe</td>
<td>Keats: Ode to a Nightingale</td>
<td>Queen Victoria (1819-1901)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>John Ruskin (1819-1900)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Charles Kingsley (1819-1875)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1820</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Overworks himself in preparation for exams, reading too widely; takes only a third-class honour (lower 2nd class) B. A. Degree (Dec 5).</td>
<td>James Mill: Elements of Political Economy</td>
<td>Accession of George IV (1820-1830). Cato St. Conspiracy.</td>
<td>George III d. 1820</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Herbert Spencer (1820-1903)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1821</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Nov 1: Newman's father is declared bankrupt.</td>
<td>May: 'On the Analogous Nature of the Difficulties in Mathematics and those of Religion', a letter to the editor of the British Critic (henceforth, 'BC')</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Napoleon d. 1821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>John Keats d. 1821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Thomas Scott d. 1821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1822</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Jan 11: Decides to pursue ordination in the Church of England. Apr 12: Elected a Fellow of Oriel College, Oxford. Remembered as 'the turning point of his life, and of all days most memorable.'¹⁷ Oriel was the most intellectually progressive college at Oxford. Comes under the influence of Richard Whately (later Abp. of Dublin), who, together with Thomas Arnold, Edward Hawkins, and their other liberal minded colleagues at Oriel are branded by journalists by 1830 as the 'Noetics', or 'Thinkers'. Whately teaches him to think for himself. Hawkins helps him to shake off his Calvinism and to see the need for Sacred Tradition.¹⁹</td>
<td>Jul 1: 'Whately gets Newman to assist him in preparing his articles on Logic for the Encyclopaedia Metropolitana'.¹⁷ 'Hints to Religious Students at College', Christian Observer.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Shelley (Percy Bysshe) d. 1822</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Matthew Arnold (1822-1888)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Louis Pasteur (1822-1895)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1824 | 23  | Jun 13: Ordained a deacon in Christ Church, Oxford, on Trinity Sunday.  
Jul 3: Enquiries in London about foreign missionary work.  
Jul 4: Starts pastoral work as Curate for St. Clement's, Oxford, at Pusey's suggestion. As acting Pastor, he did extensive home and sick visitations; founded a day school and raised money for a new Church.  
| 1825 | 24  | Feb 25: Begins a Sunday School at St. Clement's.  
Mar 26: Becomes Vice-Principal of Alban Hall, Oxford, under Whately.  
May 29: Ordained priest of the Church of England in Christ Church, Oxford, on Whit Sunday.  
Reads Butler's Analogy, a major influence throughout his life. Discovers there the seed ideas for Development and Grammar. | Aug 15: Starts his article, 'Essay on Scripture Miracles'.  
Sep 9: Starts his article, 'Life of Appollonius'. |  |  | B. F. Westcott 1825-1901  
Thomas Huxley 1825-1895 |
| 1826 | 25  | Feb 21: On his 25th birthday, he resigns as Curate of St. Clement's and Vice-Principal of St. Alban's in order to start as Tutor of Oriel College.  
Mar 26: Last duty at St. Clements.  
Mar 31: (Richard) Hurrel Froude (former pupil of Keble) and Robert Wilberforce (one of 4 sons of the reformer, William W., all of whom JHIN knew) are elected Fellows of Oriel College, and become his friends.  
May: Newman's opposition to Dr. Hampden.  
May 1: Decides to read the Fathers of the Church systematically (see 1828). | Mar 24: Finishes 'Appollonius'.  
Apr 29: Finishes article on miracles.  
Jul 2: His first University sermon: 'The Philosopical Temper first Enjoined by the Gospel'. |  | University College, London founded (opens in 1828)  
No chair of theology leads to N's opposition. | Thomas Jefferson d. 1826. |
| 1827 | 26  | Aug 2-Sep 19: Henry Wilberforce and C.P. Colightly his private pupils at Hampstead.  
Oct: Receives a misc. collection of the Fathers, purchased by Fusey in Germany.  
Nov 26: Collapses while examining in Schools. | LD 2: Tutor of Oriel.  
Jan 1827 to Dec 1831.  
Beethoven d. 1827  
William Blake d. 1827 |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1832</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>Opposed to the 1832 Reform Bill, which included provisions to suppress various dioceses in the UK by the State: seen as creeping Erastianism.</td>
<td>LD 3: New Bearings, Jan 1832 to Dec 1834.</td>
<td>'The Victorian Age's Roughly coinciding with Queen Victoria's reign, 1837-1901, it more broadly spans from 1832, The First Great Reform Bill, to the death of Victoria's son, King Edward VII (1901-1910) or the start of WWI in 1914. Gentility, respectability, propriety, industry. Marked by great achievements in literature and science, and evolving relations between the C of E and the RCC. British Empire reaches its greatest extent and influence. University of Durham, England's 3rd oldest university, founded.</td>
<td>Jun 7: The Great Reform Act: The first of Britain's 3 19th cent. Reform Bills (1832, 1867, 1884), which extended suffrage to ever widening circles of middle and lower classes, Catholics, Dissidents, and Jews, increasing citizens' representation in the House of Commons. See 3rd column for Newman's opposition to slavery abolished in British Empire (cp. 1807, above). Morse invents telegraph</td>
<td>Sir Walter Scott d. 1832 Jeremy Bentham d. 1832 Goethe d. 1832 Horatio Alger 1832-1899</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dec 8: Begins a 6 mos. journey to Italy and the Mediterranean with R.H. Froude (who is suffering from 1st signs of consumption) and his father, Archdeacon Froude. Is both intrigued and repelled by the 'Roman Catholic System' and the Italian culture he encounters. Dec 25: Christmas at Malta</td>
<td>Jan 22: Preaches sermon, 'Personal Influence the Means of Propagating the Truth.' (...the real beginning of the Oxford Movement.) Jul 31: Concludes work on his 1st book, Arians of the Fourth Century. 'Memorials of the Past' While on his 1832-33 journey, writes most of Lyra Apostolica, and sends it off to England from Rome.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Newman’s Life</td>
<td>Newman’s Letters, Diaries, Sermons, Lectures, Writings, &amp; Publications</td>
<td>Cultural, Educational, Religious &amp; Literary Context</td>
<td>Political, Economic &amp; Technological Context</td>
<td>Newman’s Contemporaries, Chief Colleagues &amp; Correspondents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1853</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>Jan 31: New trial for Achilli case denied. N is fined 100 GBP plus costs (14,000 GBP), which is provided by generous contributors, who are acknowledged in the dedication to his Discourses. Nov 22: The Oratory Church in Birmingham opened.</td>
<td>Feb 2: Published in one volume his ten 1852 university lectures and appendix as: <em>Discourses on the Scope and Nature of University Education. Addressed to the Catholics of Dublin.</em> (Title page mistakenly records 1852 as pub. date.) &gt; Idea. Part 1 (1873 UE).</td>
<td>Matthew Arnold: <em>The Scholar Gypsy</em>. Poems. Hunt: 'The Light of the World' (painting)</td>
<td>Photographic Society est.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1854</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Feb 2: Arrives in Ireland to begin university work. Feb: Makes a tour of Ireland, visiting 6 bishops during severe winter. Jun 4: (Whit Sunday) Takes oath as Rector of the Catholic University of Ireland, serving in Dublin from 1854-58. Jun 8: Catholic University Gazette begins. N. is the editor, and writes articles for it, including 'illustrations of the idea of a University' (see next column, 1854 &amp; 1856), and first publishes there a number of his lectures given as rector, which later appear in bound volumes as listed in next column. Nov 3: School of Philosophy and Letters opened.</td>
<td>LD 16: Founding of a University, Jan 1854 to Sep 1855. Articles in The Catholic University Gazette, many of which are printed in two later collections: &gt; OW (1856) &gt; HS 3 (1872 UE); and in Lectures and Essays on Univ. Subjects (1859) &gt; Idea, Part 2 (1873 UE).</td>
<td>Pius IX defines doctrine of Immaculate Conception. Dickens: Hard Times. The Working Men's College founded. J. Huxley: The Educational Value of the Natural Sciences. George Eliot (Marian Evans) trans. L. Feurbach's The Essence of Christianity.</td>
<td>Daily Telegraph founded. Crimean War (1854-56)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>Oct 4: Leaves Ireland, never to return. He feels 'under a cloud' for next few years. Nov 12: His resignation from the CUI takes official effect on the 7th anniversary of having been formally invited to become its 1st Rector.</td>
<td>London University opens its degrees to all students, internal and external, by examination only (except medicine).</td>
<td>Discovery of 'Neanderthal Man' in Germany.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1860</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>Newman involved for nearly 30 yrs in the 'academic, disciplinary, cultural, and spiritual' details of the Oratory School, including: teaching, finances, writing parent reports, playing violin in quartets, directing Latin plays, sacramental ministry, personal intellectual and spiritual influence.</td>
<td>Last contributions to the Rambler include article on Seminary Education. Begins writing on faith and certainty.</td>
<td>Wilkie Collins: Women in White. Dickens: Great Expectations. Ruskin: Unto This Last. Essays and Reviews.</td>
<td>Unification of Italy. Loss of most Papal States. Discovery of source of Nile.</td>
<td>Duke of Norfolk d. 1860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1861</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Newman in poor health most of this year. Mar: Decision to build new Oratory School building. Dec: 5: Newman learns of Darnell's attempt to assume full control of the School. Differences between Newman (backed by the parents; Mrs. Wootten, the 'Dame'; Edward Bellasis; and James Hope-Scott) and Fr. Nicholas Darnell, the Oratory School Headmaster, over the role of religion and the pastoral nature and practices of the School, leading to Darnell's resignation (together with the masters on Dec 27), and Newman's taking more personal responsibility for the School.</td>
<td>LD 20: Standing Firm Amid Trials, Jul 1861 to Dec 1863. Apr: Begins to write his 'Inspiration Papers'.</td>
<td>George Eliot: Silas Marner. Hughes: Tom Brown at Oxford</td>
<td>Death of Prince Albert American Civil War (1861-65) Farsday: Six Lectures on the Chemical History of a Candle</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Newman's Life</td>
<td>Newmam's Letters, Diaries, Sermons, Lectures, Writings, &amp; Publications</td>
<td>Cultural, Educational, Religious &amp; Literary Context</td>
<td>Political, Economic &amp; Technological Context</td>
<td>Newman's Contemporaries, Chief Colleagues &amp; Correspondents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1864</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>Newmam sees Kingsley's charges as opportunity to vindicate the intemity of his intellectual and spiritual pilgrimage, by writing the Apologia in instalments, which is read and received with great interest and admiration throughout England, restoring him to favour with both Anglicans and Catholics. Aug 1: Newman offered 5 acre site in Oxford. Aug 13: Bp. Ullathome asks Newman to take over the Catholic mission at Oxford. He accepts following month. Oct 24: Buys the 5 acres in Oxford as an agent the for possible future sale to, or use by, Catholics there. Ullathome encourages him to raise money for a church there. End of Dec: Sells land in Oxford, in view of the English bishops' and Rome's opposition to Catholics attending Protestant universities.</td>
<td>LD 211: The Apologia. Jan 1864 to Jun 1865. Apr 21-Jun 16: Apo. published in 8 weekly parts or pamphlets, then bound together in one book, with the sub-title: Being a reply to a Pamphlet entitled 'What, Then, Does Dr. Newman Mean?</td>
<td>Tolstoy: War and Peace. Trollope: Small House in Allington. Dec: Pius IX: Syllabus of Errors. Dec 13: English Bishops at Extraordinary synod write unanimous recommendation to Rome: '1. that the establishment of Catholic Colleges at the Universities could in no way be approved; and 2. that parents were by all means to be dissuaded from sending their sons to the Universities'. No absolute prohibition was requested, as most bishops felt it would lead in some cases to unwanted crises of conscience and disobedience. Pasteur invents pasteurization. Spencer: Principles of Biology</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>Jan: Newman accepts the Oxford mission project after Rome gives approval, and begins to raise money for a new Oratory, but the plan is opposed by Manning and Grant in England, and Msgr. Talbot and H. Vaughan in Rome. Newman begins sending circulars to raise money for the new Oratory. Mar: Cardinal Barnabò accuses Newman of disobedience, assuming he is purposefully preparing boys at the Oratory School for the University of Oxford. Apr-May: At the urging of Ullathorne, Newman sends Ambrose St. John to Rome to clear his name of Barnabò's charge and the continuing cloud from Ultramontanist distrust of Newman, and the mishandling of the Rambler delation. Apr 6: Article in the Weekly Register accuses Newman of heretical inclinations, proposing these as the reason for his restriction from residing in Oxford—a fact learned from their Roman correspondent. Ullathorne is thus forced to reveal to Newman this secret clause on the same day. Jun 23-Jul 21: Birmingham Oratorians temporarily serve the Oxford mission at Ullathorne's request. Aug-Sep: Newman relinquishes all plans for a house in Oxford. Sep 10: Gerard Manley Hopkins, recently down from Oxford with a first in Greek, arrives in Birmingham, having been recruited to teach at the Oratory School by Newman, who had been influential in his conversion. There for 2 terms. 8</td>
<td>LD 23: Defeat at Oxford. Defence at Rome, Jan 1867 to Dec 1867. Cathedra Semptiensa (pp. 82-84 of Omaggio cattolico in varie lingue ai principi degli apostoli Pietro e Paolo nel XVIII secolare del loro martirio). This was Newman's contribution to a commemorative volume for Pius IX. It is an edited version of parts of N's original Discourse 1 of Discourses on the Scope and Nature of University Education (1859) &gt; Campaign, 211-14.</td>
<td>Mars: Das Kapital, Vol. 1 F. W. Farrar: Essays on a Liberal Education. Jun: Vatican I Council formally announced. Aug: Propaganda instructs all UK bishops to issue separate pastoral letters against attendance at Protestant Universities, to protect faith and morals. Oct 20: Bp. Ullathorne's pastoral against Catholics attending Protestant universities (referred to as 'essentially anti-Catholic') read out in churches. Ban remained in effect until 1896, when, with approval from Rome, attendance was henceforth tolerated, provided serious safeguards to the faith were in place. 9</td>
<td>Second Great Reform Bill doubles number of voters, extending suffrage to all male rate payers, incl. small farmers and city workers.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Newman’s Life</td>
<td>Newman’s Letters, Diaries, Sermons, Lectures, Writings, &amp; Publications</td>
<td>Cultural, Educational, Religious &amp; Literary Context</td>
<td>Political, Economic &amp; Technological Context</td>
<td>Newman’s Contemporaries, Chief Colleagues &amp; Correspondents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1869 | 66  | Nov 10: Declines invitation of Bp. Dupanloup to attend First Vatican Council as a penitent. |                                                                          | Matthew Arnold: *Culture and Anarchy; Collected Poems*  
J.S. Mill: *On the Subjection of Women.*  
Abolition of debtors prisons.  
Suez Canal opens.  
Per. Table of Elements | James Prince Lee d. 25 Dec 1869                                               |
| 1870 | 69  | Newman opposed some of the more extreme ultramontane positions during this period, and considered the prospect of a definition of papal infallibility as inopportune, but he fully supported the definition once promulgated by Vatican Council I. | LD 25: *The Vatican Council  
Jan 1870 to Dec 1871.*  
Mar 15: GA (UE)  
Oct: Mir. (UE) | Israel: *Lothair.*  
First Vatican Council.  
Sep 20: Italians take Rome; end of Pope’s temporal power.  
Pius IX becomes a ‘prisoner of the Vatican’.  
Education Act lays foundation for compulsory education | Charles Dickens d. 1870  
V. I. Lenin 1870-1924                                                        |
| 1871 | 70  | 1871-74: Very active revising and republishing his works in a uniform edition. | Ess. 1, 2 (UE) (<essays dating back to his Anglican days.) | George Eliot: *Middlemarch*  
(1871-72)  
Religious tests abolished at Oxford & Cambridge | Trade Unions legalised  
New German Empire proclaimed. |                                                          |
| 1872 | 71  | Fr. John Norris succeeds Ambrose St. John as head of Oratory School, serving there for 39 yrs. | LD 26: *Aftermaths,  
Jan 1872 to Dec 1873.*  
Hardy: *Under the Greenwood Tree* | Edison perfects electric telegraph. | John Mozley d. Oct 23  
Ludwig Feuerbach d. 1872  
Bertrand Russell 1872-1970                                                  |
Orig. title of Apo. restored in the UE w/ subtitle: *Beng a History of My Religious Opinions.* | Tolstoy: *Anna Karenina*  
(1873-78)  
M. Arnold: *Literature and Dogma* | Clerk Maxwell: *Electricity and Magnetism* | Henry Wilberforce d. Apr 23  
James Hope-Scott d. Apr 29  
John Walker d. Jun 23  
Samuel Wilberforce d. Jul 19  
George Fabian Evans d. Aug 31                                                |
| 1874 | 73  | Continuing the work of preparing volumes for the UE, and ‘burning or preserving’ his early papers.  
Oct-Dec: Writing drafts of responses to Gladstone’s Vatican Decrees. | LD 27: *The Controversy with Gladstone,  
Jan 1874 to Dec 1875.* | Gladstone: *The Vatican Decrees and their Bearing on Civil Allegiance.*  
Yorkshire College of Science, Leeds, founded.  
Moody & Shankey Revivals | Factory Act | C.K. Chesterton 1874-1936  
Winston Churchill 1874-1965                                                  |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1879 | 78  | Jan 31: Receives news via Manning and Ullathorne of Pope Leo XIII's offer of the Cardinalate. He accepts, provided he can stay in Birmingham. Manning spread the idea that N has refused. Much correspondence and confusion ensues, but is finally clarified.  
Mar 15: The Cardinal Secretary of State sends Newman the official offer of the Cardinalate. He accepts in Mar 20 reply.  
Apr 16: Starts his journey to Rome.  
Apr 27: His first audience with Leo XIII.  
May 12: "Recieves the "Biglietto" of the Cardinal Secretary of State in which it is announced to him that same morning, during a secret consistory, he had been elevated to the Cardinalate. Newman answers giving his "Biglietto" speech.  
Denounces 'liberalism' in his speech.  
May 13: Receives Cardinal's bicretta (red hat) from Pope in the Vatican.  
May 15: Receives bicretta in public consistory together with other newly nominated Cardinals, officially becoming Cardinal-Deacon of the title of San Giorgio in Velabro.  
Cardinalatial motto: 'Cor ad cor loquitur' (Heart speaks to heart).  
Jun 2: 2nd audience with Leo XIII.  
Jul 1: Returns to Birmingham.  
Jul 20-21: Oratory School presentations.  
Aug 15: 5 addresses presented from UK Catholics (see Add.).  
Nov 3: Visits Oxford | LD 29: The Cardinalate, Jan 1879 to Sep 1881. | Queen's University renamed the Royal University of Ireland, and empowered to conduct examinations and grant degrees which Roman Catholics could take.  
Ibsen: The Doll's House.  
Aug 4: Leo XII: Aeterni Patris, on the philosophy of St. Thos. Aquinas, very favourably received by N.  
Gilbert & Sullivan: Pirates of Penzance | Electric bulb invented  
Afghan and Zulu wars | William Palmer d. Apr 5  
William Froude d. May 4  
Joseph Stalin 1879-1953  
Leon Trotsky 1879-1940  
Albert Einstein 1879-1955 |
| 1880 | 79  | Jan 25: Falls and breaks a rib.  
Feb 19: Falls again, breaking 2 ribs.  
Autumn: Working on Select Treatises of St. Athanasius | St. Aloysius Church sermons published for private circulation. | Owens College becomes Victoria University, and is soon federated with the provincial colleges in Leeds and Liverpool.  
Dostoevsky: The Brothers Karamazov | George Eliot d. 1880  
Lyttton Strachey 1880-1937 |
| 1881 | 80  | Feb: Completes his 36 volume UE, with Ath. 1, 2.  
Jun 26: Preaches at the London Oratory.  
Feb: Ath. (2nd ed, UE). | Stevenson: Treasure Island  
Wilde: Poems | First Anglo-Poet War  
Thomas Carlyle d. 1881 |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1883</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>Jan: Begins work on ‘On the Inspiration of Scripture’.</td>
<td>3rd ed. of VM. Note added to vol. 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Richard Wagner d. 1883 Karl Marx d. 1883</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>Works closely with Anne Morley as she edits material for <em>Letters and Correspondence of John Henry Newman</em> (1891). Gradually transferring all of his UE vols. to Longmans, as other publishers release them. Sep: Strength begins to fail after an illness.</td>
<td>Mar: Newman circulates a reply to Fairbairn privately, which is reprinted in SE (1890) and &gt; <em>TP 1</em> (1976). Nietzsche: Beyond Good and Evil</td>
<td><em>Repeal of Contagious Diseases Acts</em> Trafalgar Square Riots</td>
<td>Karl Barth 1856-1966</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Matthew Arnold d. Apr 15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1889</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>Nov: Successfully intervenes with the Quaker employers at Cadbury chocolate works for their Catholic women workers, who were required to attend their daily prayer meeting. Nov: His dear friend Frederic Rogers, Lord Blanchford, from his Oriel days, dies. Dec 25: Celebrates Holy Mass for the last time. Memorizes the Mass of the B. Virgin and Mass of the Dead, in hopes of being able to say Mass again if his health improves.</td>
<td>C. Booth: Labour and Life of the People</td>
<td>International Congress of Psychology, Paris.</td>
<td>T. S. Eliot 1888-1965</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX ONE NOTES

Shortened title references in this appendix (usually to the author's name alone) refer to this separate endnotes section, where the full publishing data is provided in the first instance.


3 This and other standard abbreviations of Newman's works are used throughout. See the abbreviations section of thesis. From 1865-1881 Newman worked on the revising, editing, and publishing of an authoritative uniform edition (UE) of his works. Where republished works are mentioned in the Synopsis, followed by 'UE', this signifies the fact that this previously published work had by now reached its final form, with only minor future changes, if any (Newman continued to make small changes in some works up to the time of his death in 1890).

4 LD 25:329.

5 Apo. 16-17.

6 AW 29.


8 Barry, 795.

9 Ibid.

10 Apo. 17, Apo. Editor's Notes 478.

11 AW 169.

12 Apo. 17.

13 Apo. 18.

14 Apo. Editor's Notes 481.

Appendix One Notes

16 Ker, Biography, 12.
17 AW 63.
18 Apo. 21, 22.
20 Ker, Biography, 21.
23 LD 1:238
26 Charles Stephen Dessain, ‘John Henry Newman: A Short Biographical Sketch,’ *Newman Studien vol. 10*, ed. Heinrich Fries and Werner Becker, (Heroldsberg Bei Nuernberg: Glock und Lutz, 1978), 22. See also the discussion and notes in chapter 6.3 regarding Dessain and Tristram’s view that this sermon by Newman was instrumental in setting into motion the Oxford Movement: ‘Newman’s sermon was an appeal for volunteers in the spiritual combat’ (Tristram, AW 119).
28 Apo. 43.
30 The following memorandum was attached to a bundle of Newman’s letters:

March 1836 is a cardinal point of time. It gathers about it, more or less closely, the following events:
1. Froude’s death.
2. My Mother’s death and my Sister’s marriage.
3. My knowing and using the Breviary.
4. First connexion with the British Critic.
5. The tracts become treatises.
7. Theological Society.
8. My writing against the Church of Rome.
9. Littlemore Chapel

He summarizes the events of Spring 1836 by saying, 'A new scene gradually opened.' See LD 5:246-7 and Maisie Ward, Young Mr. Newman, (London: Sheed and Ward, 1948), 298.

31 Foister, 31.
32 Ker, 137, 145, 147.
33 Ker, 331.
34 Ker, 337; Ward 1:202
35 Ward, 1:214, 216.
36 LD 12: 363-4
37 Ker, 342.
38 Foister, 54.
39 Ward 1: 221-223.
40 AW 13.
41 LD 17:510.
42 Strolz, 185.
43 LD 19:120, note 1, reports that the school was opened with seven boys. The ‘Summary of Events . . .’ in LD 20:xvi gives May 2 as the opening day. Newman may well have attributed special significance to this second date as the Feast of St. Athanasius, one of his adopted patron saints, although his diary records that the ‘New School began’ on ‘1May’ (LD 19:120). Within three years, Newman reports: ‘I have the charge of a school of seventy boys, sons of Catholic gentlemen up and down England and Ireland’. See also LD 20:201.

45 Nash, 5-7
46 Foister, 165.

Nash, 10

See McClelland, Part 5, 'The Removal of the Ban and the Colonization of the English Universities', 369-426, for a full discussion of the history of the removal of the ban and the implementation of new norms.

Ibid., 710.

Strolz, 187.

Nash, 18.


Ker, 744.

Ibid.
This list highlights particular parts of larger works that were helpful in the compilation of the synopsis. See the bibliography for the most important works consulted in addition to the references listed below.


Appendix Two

SUMMARY TABLE OF NEWMAN'S LETTERS AND DIARIES
### Appendix Two

**SUMMARY TABLE OF NEWMAN’S LETTERS AND DIARIES**

This appendix provides a ready reference of the entire series, including a detailing of each volume’s title, editor(s) and publishing date. No similar one-page, detailed summary is available in the text and dust jackets of the actual volumes. Neither has one been discovered in any secondary literature. The volume titles serve as an excellent overview of Newman’s life and work.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vol. #</th>
<th>Volume Title</th>
<th>Dates</th>
<th>Pub. Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ealing, Trinity, Oriel</td>
<td>Feb 1801 to Dec 1826</td>
<td>1978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Tutor of Oriel</td>
<td>Jan 1827 to Dec 1831</td>
<td>1979</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>New Bearings</td>
<td>Jan 1832 to Jun 1833</td>
<td>1979</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Oxford Movement</td>
<td>Jul 1833 to Dec 1834</td>
<td>1980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Liberalism in Oxford</td>
<td>Jan 1835 to Dec 1836</td>
<td>1981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The Via Media and Froude’s Remains</td>
<td>Jan 1837 to Dec 1838</td>
<td>1984</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Editing the British Critic</td>
<td>Jan 1839 to Dec 1840</td>
<td>1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Tract 90 and the Jerusalem Bishopric</td>
<td>Jan 1841 to Apr 1842</td>
<td>1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Littlemore</td>
<td>May 1842 to Oct 1843</td>
<td>[Forthcoming]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>The Parting of Friends</td>
<td>Nov 1843 to Oct 1845</td>
<td>[Forthcoming]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Littlemore to Rome</td>
<td>Oct 1845 to Dec 1846</td>
<td>1961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Rome to Birmingham</td>
<td>Jan 1847 to Dec 1848</td>
<td>1962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Birmingham and London</td>
<td>Jan 1849 to Jun 1850</td>
<td>1963</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Papal Aggression</td>
<td>Jul 1850 to Dec 1851</td>
<td>1963</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>The Achilli Trial</td>
<td>Jan 1852 to Dec 1853</td>
<td>1964</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Founding a University</td>
<td>Jan 1854 to Sep 1855</td>
<td>1965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Opposition in Dublin and London</td>
<td>Oct 1855 to Mar 1857</td>
<td>1967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>New Beginnings in England</td>
<td>Apr 1857 to Dec 1858</td>
<td>1968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Consulting the Laity</td>
<td>Jan 1859 to Jun 1861</td>
<td>1969</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Standing firm amid Trials</td>
<td>Jul 1861 to Dec 1863</td>
<td>1970</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>The Apologia</td>
<td>Jan 1864 to Jun 1865</td>
<td>1971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Between Pusey and the Extremists</td>
<td>Jul 1865 to Dec 1866</td>
<td>1972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Defeat at Oxford. Defence at Rome</td>
<td>Jan 1867 to Dec 1867</td>
<td>1973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>A Grammar of Assent</td>
<td>Jan 1868 to Dec 1869</td>
<td>1973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>The Vatican Council</td>
<td>Jan 1870 to Dec 1871</td>
<td>1973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Aftermaths</td>
<td>Jan 1872 to Dec 1873</td>
<td>1974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>The Controversy with Gladstone</td>
<td>Jan 1874 to Dec 1875</td>
<td>1975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Fellow of Trinity</td>
<td>Jan 1876 to Dec 1878</td>
<td>1975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>The Cardinalate</td>
<td>Jan 1879 to Sep 1881</td>
<td>1976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>A Cardinal’s Apostolate</td>
<td>Oct 1881 to Dec 1884</td>
<td>1976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>The Last Years (w/ a suppl. to vv. 11-31)</td>
<td>Jan 1885 to Aug 1890</td>
<td>1977</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix Three

PUBLISHING HISTORY OF THE IDEA OF A UNIVERSITY
## Appendix 3.1. Publishing History of The Idea of a University, Part 1 (University Teaching)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The individual discourses and appendix were published separately as pamphlets during 1852, with the above title, pub., and disc. no. &amp; title on the cover. Pagination was continuous. Only the first 5 were publicly delivered. Discourse numbers (orig. = rom. numerals) and original titles listed below</td>
<td>Individual discourses without separate title pages were bound together with a new reworded title page, dedication, and preface (xxx pp.) &amp; corrigenda (2 pp.).</td>
<td>Disc. 5 and the 1852 Appendix were dropped, and nos. 1 and 2 were rewritten as Disc. 1, resulting in just 8 discourses. The term, 'Philosophical Knowledge' was replaced by 'Liberal Knowledge'.</td>
<td>Newman reverted to the first edition text with some changes in Discourses 1 &amp; II. Discourse 5 &amp; appendix not restored. Part I's separate title p.: 'I. University Teaching Considered in Nine Discourses'.</td>
<td>Uses the 1889 uniform edition as basic text, together with its minor revisions Newman added through several editions. The Textual Appendix notes all major variants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>[same as UE]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introductory</td>
<td>same title</td>
<td>1 Theology a Branch of Knowledge</td>
<td>1 Introductory</td>
<td>[same as UE]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Theology a Branch of Knowledge</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>2 Theology a Branch of Knowledge</td>
<td>[same as UE]</td>
<td>[same as UE]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Bearing of Theology on other Branches of Knowledge</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>2 Bearing of Theology on Other Branches of Knowledge</td>
<td>3 Bearing of Theology on Other Knowledge</td>
<td>[same as UE]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Bearing of other Branches of Knowledge on Theology</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>3 Bearing of Other Branches of Knowledge on Theology</td>
<td>4 Bearing of Other Knowledge on Theology</td>
<td>[same as UE]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 General Knowledge Viewed as One Philosophy</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>[deleted]</td>
<td>[still deleted]</td>
<td>Original Discourse 5 included as an appendix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Philosophical Knowledge its Own End</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>4 Liberal Knowledge its Own End</td>
<td>5 Knowledge its Own End</td>
<td>[same as UE']</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Philosophical Knowledge Viewed in Relation to Mental Acquirements</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>5 Liberal Knowledge Viewed in Relation to Learning</td>
<td>6 Knowledge Viewed in Relation to Learning</td>
<td>[same as UE]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Philosophical Knowledge Viewed in Relation to Professional</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>6 Liberal Knowledge Viewed in Relation to Professional Skill</td>
<td>7 Knowledge Viewed in Relation to Professional Skill</td>
<td>[same as UE]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Duties of the Church towards Philosophy</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>8 Duties of the Church towards Liberal Knowledge</td>
<td>9 Duties of the Church towards Knowledge</td>
<td>[same as UE]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix to Discourses . . . 1853</td>
<td>same</td>
<td>[deleted]</td>
<td>[still deleted]</td>
<td>1852 Appendix re-appended</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 3.1 NOTES

1 See Ker, Editor's Introduction to *Idea*, xvii. This first, fully bound edition of the original ten discourses is dated 1852 on the title page and the dedication bears the date of 21 November 1852, but in fact it was not published until 2 February 1853, as a note in Newman's hand states in a copy preserved at the Oratory.

2 *Idea*, xxxvi.

3 UE = 'uniform edition' of Newman's works; collected, edited, revised, and republished during Newman's lifetime. See thesis bibliography for more information on this uniform edition.

4 All such letter-number references are to Blehl's *Bibliographical Catalogue* of Newman's writings and editions.

5 Discourse titles supplied in Ker's Editor's Introduction to *Idea*, xxxviii.

6 Also published in *The Tablet* (15 May 1852).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original Publication Information for the Lectures and Essays</th>
<th>Lectures and Essays on University Subjects, 1859 (LUS)</th>
<th>The Idea of a University, Part II (1873 UE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

1. Christianity and Letters. A Lecture read in the School of Philosophy and Letters, November, 1854

2. Literature. A Lecture read in the School of Philosophy and Letters, November, 1858

3. Catholic Literature in the English Tongue, 1854-58
   - §1. in relation to Religious Literature
   - §2. to Science
   - §3. to Classical English
   - §4. to Literature of the Day

4. Elementary Studies.
   - §1. Grammar in Elementary Subjects
   - §2. Composition
   - §3. Latin Writing
   - §4. General Knowledge

5. A Form of Infidelity of the Day
   - 1. Its sentiments
   - 2. Its policy

6. University Preaching, 1855

7. Christianity and Physical Science

8. Christianity and Scientific Investigation. A Lecture for the School of Science, 1855

9. Discipline of Mind
   - An Address to the Evening Classes, November, 1858

10. Christianity and Medical Science. An Address delivered to the Students of Medicine, November, 1858

---

'Catholic Literature in the English Tongue'. A Lecture delivered before the faculty of letters, in the Catholic University, published at the request of the faculty. Dublin: Printed by John F. Fowler, 1858. 40 pp. [A56a]. Delivered 3 Nov 58.

'Lectures and Essays on University Subjects' (reported in CUG 16 Nov 54). Inaugural lecture of 9 Nov 54.


'On the Formation of a Catholic Literature in the English Tongue'. Pub. in two parts: $\S 1$ and $\S 2$ of the revised LUS version were orig. pub. in CUG I (31 Aug '54 as 'no. 1'.

$\S 3$ orig. pub. in CUG I (7 Sep'54) as 'no. 2'. $\S 4$ not formerly published.

'The Examination at Entrance' (1 Jun'54) and 'The Entrance Examination: A Trial of Accuracy' (22 Jun'54) > 'Lectures and Essays on University Subjects' (CUG 8 Mar 55); and 'Examining with or without a Book' (CUG, 5 Apr 55). Originally delivered on 10 or 17 Dec 55. Orig. pub. as 'On the Examination at Entrance' (1 Jun'54) and 'On the Entrance Examination: A Trial of Accuracy' (22 Jun'54) > 'Lectures and Essays on University Subjects' (CUG 8 Mar 55); and 'Examining with or without a Book' (CUG, 5 Apr 55).

'On the Nascent Infidelity of the Day', pub. in two parts in the CUG: 1st part pub. 21 Dec'54 > $\S 1$ in Idea, 2nd part pub. 28 Dec'54 > $\S 2$ in Idea, Orig. pub. as 'On the General Relations between Theology and Physical Science' (CUG, 8 Mar 55); and 'Examining with or without a Book' (CUG, 5 Apr 55)

'Letter of the Rector to the Right Rev. D. Moriarty, D.D., Bishop of Antigonia, Co-adjutor-Bishop of Kerry, On the Subject of University Preaching' (CUG, 8 Mar 55); and 'University Preaching, 1855'.

Based on a 2 Nov 58 lecture. Orig. pub. in part as 'Public Lectures of the University. [A Letter] to the Editor of the University Gazette' (CUG 3 Apr 1855). Repr. as app. in LD 16:568-71.

Relations between Medical Science and Theology. Address delivered to the students in the faculty of medicine of the Catholic University (4 Nov 58). Pub. at the request of the faculty. Dublin: Printed by John F. Fowler, 1858. 40 pp.

Subtitled in Idea as 'A Lecture for the School of Science', but this was not delivered, and not published before Lectures and Essays.
APPENDIX 3.2 NOTES


2 "A Form of Infidelity of the Day' was placed no. VIII rather than V (presumably to fit it into the right chronological order with the pieces that follow the first three on literature), and its two sections were not given titles" (Idea xli, note 3).

3 See Idea, 626, Editor's Notes no. 209.20 for a discussion of the different dates, including Newman's earlier intention to deliver the lecture on 6 Dec 55.

4 Newman wrote this lecture in November 1854, but it was 'plucked' (LD 17:71, 79), as reported by Ward (relying on Pollen), by 'excellent theologians' who found it 'entirely orthodox', yet 'inexpedient in view of the prevailing temper on matters theological, and the views of Dr. Cullen: and the lecture, though subsequently published, was not delivered' (Ward 1:408-409).

5 LD 18:501.

6 Ibid.

7 Idea, xli, note 3.
SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY
OUTLINE OF SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

The sources listed here represent about one third of the more than 800 works actually consulted and catalogued for the research project. The selection includes works cited in the footnotes, together with a sampling of some of the more important studies that informed the final composition.

1. Primary Sources
   A. Newman's Uniform Edition of 36 Volumes
   B. Newman's Posthumous Publications
   C. Catholic Church Documents on Theology & Education

2. Secondary Sources on Newman
   (Including introductions and notes to editions of Newman's works).
   A. Newman and Education
   B. Other Newman Studies

3. Other Secondary Sources
   A. Foundations of Christian Education
   B. Other Contextual Studies and Miscellaneous Sources
   C. Unpublished Manuscripts
   D. Internet Documents
1. PRIMARY SOURCES

The primary sources for this intertextual study are those written by Newman, together with official documents of the Catholic Church. For those by Newman, see also the abbreviations section for a discussion of works and editions, and for a combined alphabetical listing of his most important works published both before and after his death in 1890. The listing here of the 'uniform edition' is by topical arrangement.

A. NEWMAN'S UNIFORM EDITION OF 36 VOLUMES

Newman collected, revised, and republished what he considered his most important works in a uniform edition of thirty-six volumes, beginning with the Parochial and Plain Sermons in 1868 (W. J. Copeland, editor), and concluding with Select Treatises of St. Athanasius in 1881. Until his death in 1890 he continued making minor textual changes in reprints of individual volumes in this edition, although the pagination usually remained the same, with a few important exceptions. Allenson reports that 'by 1891, Longmans, Green, & Co. had acquired the publishing rights for all volumes and produced the 'authorised standard edition'. After Newman's death in 1890, Longmans continued to reprint a 'new edition'.
impression' as needed until stock and plates were destroyed 'in the bombings of 1940-41'.

Therefore, all references to these thirty-six volumes are taken from their final form as published by Longmans between 1890 and 1941, with the exception of the Oxford English Texts series critical editions of Apologia pro Vita Sua, An Essay in Aid of a Grammar of Assent, and The Idea of a University.

All uniform edition titles are presented with additional publication date information. Dates in angled brackets < > indicate the years of original publication either of the whole, or of parts of the volume. Dates in round brackets () indicate the year of inclusion into the uniform edition. The final unbracketed date is, in every case, the edition (or impression) I actually consulted for giving references.

Most of the uniform edition works were republished by Christian Classics of Westminster, Maryland (1966-73), using a photographic-offset process, and are thus identical to the Longmans editions of 1891-1941 in their pagination. The thirty-six books were listed, with some variations, in the following seven categories and sequential order by Newman's publishers during his lifetime and beyond:

---

Longmans published all thirty-six from 1886 on.

A study of Blehl's Bibliographical Catalogue, Allenson's Register of Editions and of the actual title pages and advertisements dating from the period proves otherwise. For example, Longmans' 1890 edition of The Arians of the Fourth Century contains an advertisement for all of the thirty-six uniform edition volumes, yet they report that four of them are published not by themselves, but rather by Burns and Oates (Mix., OS, TT, and LG). Clearly the dates of 1868 and 1881 refer not to the Longman's editions, but to the span of years when Newman was establishing his uniform edition corpus through several publishers. From 1886 on, Newman was actively transferring the publishing rights of all uniform edition titles to Longmans. See also LD 31:242 and 263, note 1.

5 Allenson, Register of Editions, 1.
1. Sermons

Parochial and Plain Sermons. 8 vols. <1834-43> (1868). Rivingtons, 1868-78.

Sermons Bearing on Subjects of the Day. <1843> (1869) 1909.

Fifteen Sermons Preached before the University of Oxford between A.D. 1826 and 1843. <1843> (1872) 1909.

Discourses Addressed to Mixed Congregations. <1849> (1871) 1897.

Sermons Preached on Various Occasions. <1857> (1870) 1892.

2. Treatises

Lectures on the Doctrine of Justification. <1838> (1874) Rivingtons, 1890.


3. Essays

Two Essays on Biblical and on Ecclesiastical Miracles. <1826, 1842> (1870) 1897.

Discussions and Arguments on Various Subjects. <1836-1866> (1872) 1899.


4. Historical

5. Theological

The Arians of the Fourth Century. <1833> (1873) 1890.


Tracts Theological and Ecclesiastical. <1835-72> (1874) 1913.

6. Polemical


Lectures on the Present Position of Catholics in England Addressed to the Brothers of the Oratory in the Summer of 1851. <1851> (1872) 1899.


7. Literary

Verses on Various Occasions. <written 1818-65: published 1868> (1874) 1903.

Loss and Gain: The Story of a Convert. <1848> (1874) 1903.

Callista: A Tale of the Third Century. <1855> (1876) 1891.
B. NEWMAN'S POSTHUMOUS PUBLICATIONS


Primary Sources: Catholic Church Documents on Theology & Education


C. CATHOLIC CHURCH DOCUMENTS ON THEOLOGY & EDUCATION

Where no publishing data is given for Church documents in this section, it is because they are available in approved translations world-wide. Besides being published by the Vatican and regional conferences of bishops, they are available in English from the Catholic Truth Society (London), Veritas (Dublin), and Pauline Media (Boston). See also the Vatican website, http://www.vatican.va, for a selection of the documents online.


- *Catechesis in Our Time (Catechesi Tradendae;* 1979).


Pius XI. *Christian Education of Youth (Divini Illius Magistri)* Boston: St. Paul Editions. 1929.


- *Dogmatic Constitution on Divine Revelation (Dei Verbum).* 1965.


2. SECONDARY SOURCES ON NEWMAN

A. NEWMAN AND EDUCATION


Blehl, Vincent Ferrer. 'Newman, the Fathers, and Education'. Thought: Fordham University Quarterly 45, no. 177 (Summer 1970): 196-212.


Cavaller, Fernando Maria. 'Newman en la universidad'. Neumariana (Buenos Aires) no. 30 (Septiembre 2000): 12-23.


Morales, José P. 'Discursos sobre el fin y la naturaleza de la educaci6n universitaria: Traducci6n, Introducci6n, y notas'. Newmaniana (Buenos Aires). Presented in installments of 2 discourses of the Idea per issue, running continuously from issue no. 17 through no. 21 (May 1996- August 1997).


Rowell, Geoffrey. "Cor ad Cor Loquitur": Newman's Choice of His Cardinalial Motto as a Pointer to His Understanding of Christian Faith and its Communication'. In John Henry Newman: The Significance of His Promotion to the Cardinalate. Studia Urbaniana
Secondary Sources on Newman: Newman & Education


B. OTHER NEWMAN STUDIES


Secondary Sources on Newman: Other Neuman Studies


3. OTHER SECONDARY SOURCES

A. FOUNDATIONS OF CHRISTIAN EDUCATION


Schindler, David L. 'Catholicism and the Liberal Model of the Academy in America: Theodore Hesburgh's Idea of a Catholic University', Catholic International 11, no. 2


B. OTHER CONTEXTUAL STUDIES AND MISCELLANEOUS SOURCES


Peel, Sir Robert. An Inaugural Address Delivered by the Right Hon. Sir Robert Peel, Bart, M. P., President of the Tamworth Library and Reading Room, on Tuesday, 19th January, 1841. London: James Bain; Tamworth: J. Thompson, Bookseller, 1841.


C. **UNPUBLISHED MANUSCRIPTS**

The Birmingham Oratory Archives (Edgbaston, Birmingham, England).

Gerard Tracey, Archivist

* Student notebooks containing notes from Newman’s religious instruction to boys of the Oratory School in the mid-1870's.

* School Prospectuses from the Oratory School’s early years.

The Oratory School Archives (Woodcote, England).

Anthony J. Tinkel, Archivist.

A notebook of lecture outlines and notes on religious instruction by Fr. John Norris, head of the School after Ambrose St. John, beginning in 1872. His lectures correspond very closely to those delivered by Newman in the mid-1870's, suggesting a continuity of content, scope, and sequence.

D. **INTERNET DOCUMENTS**

Cardinal Newman Society, based in Falls Church, Virginia:


Newman University’s Mission and Value Statement:


‘Newman Apostolate’ (or ‘Movement’): see:

