

What can the historiography of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity learn from the life of Doctor William Price (1800-1893) and others yet unrecorded?

Rodney Blake Harward

2018

Dedication

To the Open University, its staff and my fellow students for making this dissertation possible.

Quotation

'The fact that an opinion has been widely held is no evidence whatsoever that it is not utterly absurd; indeed, in view of the silliness of the majority of mankind, a widespread belief is more likely to be foolish rather than sensible'

(Russell, 1929, p. 58)

Contents

Chapter 1 - The introduction	3
Chapter 2 - Narrowing down historiology's approach to nineteenth-century Welsh national identity	6
Chapter 3 - Recognising the breadth and diversity of Doctor William Price's identity and others yet unrecorded	10
Chapter 4 - Squaring the circle of historiology's approach to nineteenth-century Welsh national identity 'taking better account of the unrecorded' - An analysis	14
Chapter 5 - The conclusion	18
Bibliography - Primary and secondary sources	19

Chapter 1 – The introduction

This dissertation explores what the historiography of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity can learn from studying an individual from Wales whose long life spanned almost ninety-three years of this period along with others yet unrecorded. Historiography for this dissertation will be defined as the approaches taken by historians studying the history of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity using material from medieval to modern times (Corfield, 2008 and OED, 2018). It should not be confused with ‘historiography’ which is defined as written history or the writing of history itself (OED, 2018). Also, for the purposes of this work national identity will be defined as an identity sharing elements of a defined geographic area, culture, history, language and collective legal and or political values (Motyl, 2000). The dissertation proposes to carry out a comparative critical analysis between approaches to the study of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity and a perspective focusing on the well-documented life of Doctor William Price of Llantrisant (1800-1893) and others not yet recorded. A brief online search shows his presence threading through; contemporary primary sources (‘Ap Id Anfryn’, 1888), scholarly Welsh and national biographical sources (Davies et al, 2008) and (Gregory, 2004), general Welsh history written by a reputable historian (Jenkins, 1992), a comedy play (Big State Theatre Company, 2004) and popular modern local Welsh heritage resources (Powell, 2007 and Rhondda-Cynon-Taf Library Service, 2011). Common descriptors include; heretic, eccentric, vegetarian, schizophrenic, arch-druid, chartist, physician and cremationist. Many of these seem unlikely components of the current narrative of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity, which itself is discussed in more detail in the following sections.

This chapter continues by outlining the dissertation’s temporal, historical and geographical context. It then highlights the author’s research and source limitations. Subsequently it describes how the topic will be approached through a literature review of the relevant existing scholarship. After this it explains how incongruities identified by the literature review form the focus of and the justification for the dissertation’s subject. Finally, the chapter concludes by explaining the dissertation’s contention and how it contributes to what has already been written about nineteenth-century Welsh national identity.

Temporally the focus is nineteenth-century Welsh national identity historiography which itself has drawn on primary and secondary sources from pre-history through the medieval period to the present day. Geographically it is confined to the people and the land within the nineteenth-century geographical boundaries of Wales. Historically Wales experienced much change during the nineteenth-century. Socially, Wales' 587,000 population in 1801 (Jenkins, 1992) grew to 2,015,000 by 1901 (Jenkins 2007). The growth can be attributed in part to in-migration from other parts of the United Kingdom, British Empire and the rest of the world in response to Welsh industrialisation. This itself was fuelled by the exploitation of abundant natural resources to grow coal, steel, tinplate and slate industries. Societal change included an emerging influential middle-class and large increases in urbanised industrialised working-class numbers coupled with a declining rural population linked to reduced agricultural sector employment. For example, a 46% drop in agricultural workers between 1851 and 1911 has been estimated (Jenkins, 2007). Welsh religion saw increasing numbers of non-conformists who were judged to make up some 40% of attendees in the 1851 religious census (Davies, 1993). Welsh language usage also changed during this period. In 1850 it was estimated that 66% of the population of Wales spoke Welsh and the majority were monoglot. By the beginning of the twentieth-century (1914) whilst the overall numbers of Welsh speakers rose (attributed to population growth) only 40% of the population spoke Welsh and the majority of these (80%) had some form of English (Davis, 1993). Politically the nineteenth-century saw an increase in male suffrage coupled with a decline in the power of the gentry and aristocratic elite. This heralded the emergence of a Welsh middle-class representing liberal views in the United Kingdom parliament. Increasingly towards the end of the nineteenth-century a rising socialist and labour movement took hold, particularly amongst industrial workers (Jenkins, 2007). These changes contributed to historiography's narrative of Welsh national identity during this period. In terms of resource and source limitations the author is a non-Welsh reader so only material available in English has been used and in the spirit of A329's online delivery, most sources selected are web-based. This chapter will now continue by describing how the dissertation will be structured and approached through a literature review of the relevant existing scholarship.

The overall aim of the dissertation is to inform ways in which historians can better understand the complex nature of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity through exploring Doctor Price's remarkable life as an individual and by association generally taking better account of the unrecorded. Chapter 2 conducts a critical comparative analysis of secondary scholarship supported by primary sources to establish how historiography has approached the study of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. A wide range of material is available so, given word-count limits, the analysis will focus on secondary scholarship about pre-nineteenth-century notions of a Welsh identity partly rooted in the mythical origins of the nation, the arrival of and conversion to Christianity and the lives of the Welsh princes (Morgan, 2012). This will be followed by primary evidence from 'Letters and Essays on Wales' (Richard, 1884). It will go on to explore historiography surrounding the narrative of a nineteenth-century Welsh national identity based around working class non-conformist, industrial or agricultural workers and their families, a liberal middle-class, powerful wealthy industrialists and remote aristocratic landowning elites (Jones, 1992) and (Morgan, 1971). Chapter 3 examines secondary scholarship and primary sources that record Doctor Price's life, work and achievements during the nineteenth-century. Here the dissertation uses peer reviewed secondary scholarship which includes a study of his life (Cule, 1963 and 1983), and scholarship describing his place in the context of social change and economic development in Wales and the British Empire (Davies, 1980) and his Chartist activities (Williams, 1957). These will be supported by a selection of primary sources consisting of contemporary newspaper articles including; an extended interview with Doctor Price (Ap Id Anfryn, 1888), a court case reporting on his prosecution for cremating the body of his son (Hewitt, 1884) and Doctor Price's obituary ('Morien', 1893). By the end chapter 3 the dissertation aims to have established the key approaches to the study of history about Doctor William Price's life, work and achievements and their impact on nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. Chapter 4 takes the findings of the two previous chapters and subjects them to a rigorous investigation which reconsiders approaches to studying nineteenth-century Welsh national identity in the light of Doctor Price's remarkable life and others as yet unrecorded to inform ways in which historians can better understand and thus more accurately describe the complex nature of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. As an example, his views on religion, cremation and his lifestyle run counter to the elements of a nineteenth-century Welsh national

identity attributed to religious non-conformity. This dissertation seeks to address this and other anomalies. Chapter 5 concludes by summarising the findings. This initial chapter continues by describing how this research differs from and builds on what has already been written about Welsh national identity along with its central argument in order to justify why it is a worthwhile topic.

A329 course material has shown that cultural, economic, geographic, political, and social factors (imagined or real) have all played their part in the construction of Welsh national identity. In addition, recorders of oral and written records of events, antiquarians and historians, through their recording and interpretation of history play a key role in contributing to the national identity 'mix'. Combined, both influence the way individuals and communities have thought about themselves within Wales and how Wales and the Welsh were viewed from outside its boundaries (Open University, 2017). The justification for this study is that the preliminary literature review has identified a potential gap between existing historical representations of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity and the reality of elements of the lived life of a well-documented individual like Doctor William Price and other yet unrecorded sections of nineteenth-century Welsh society. So, this dissertation aspires to encourage historians to consider how studying individual lives and other groups can play a role in better understanding the complexity of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. This dissertation will now turn to chapter 2, the analysis of key sources to establish how historiography currently approaches the study of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity.

Chapter 2 - Narrowing down historiography's approach to nineteenth-century Welsh national identity

This chapter sets out the context of historiography's approach to the study of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. It then conducts a comparative critical analysis. This is carried out using a framework which includes; the context in which the selected material was written, the audience and its significance. Finally, it subjects it to additional scrutiny by reading against the grain to establish what aspects of Welsh national identity appear unrecorded within the sources studied. This chapter contends that in the context of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity, historiography provides a wide-ranging narrative based on constructing an

imagined Welsh identity using characteristics demonstrably held by a majority, though not all, of the inhabitants of Wales. In comparison, reading against the grain shows the almost complete absence from the narrative of the role of played by individuals and other communities who did not fit the constructed view of Welshness such as the non-religious, women, in-migrants from other parts of the United Kingdom and external migrants from Europe and the British Empire. Chapter 2 further contends that the current narrative would benefit by further study of such individuals and other communities as this would provide fresh insight into nineteenth-century Welsh national identity.

The context of historiology's approach to capturing the essence of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity manifests itself through the efforts of prominent nineteenth-century contemporary personalities and modern historians to record the Welshness of Wales against a background of increased interest in Welsh nationalism. This chapter's comparative critical analysis begins with Prys Morgan's secondary scholarship part of which traces pre-nineteenth-century notions of a Welsh identity rooted in the mythical origins of the nation, the arrival of and conversion to Christianity and the lives of the Welsh princes (Morgan, 2012). Morgan was Welsh born. He is a well-regarded Emeritus Professor of History at Swansea University. His scholarship forms part of an edited book entitled 'The invention of Tradition' (Hobsbawm and Ranger, 2012). Morgan's audience is primarily academic and its narrative takes the reader down a well-worn academic path explaining the demise of the ancient cultural practices along with their revival and in some cases, invention citing neo-Druidism, the revived Eisteddfod movement, Iolo Morganwg's Gorsedd and the reworking of old texts to substantiate his claims. He also noted the continued use and widespread survival of Welsh as a language despite inroads made by the English language. He reminds readers of the uniqueness of surviving Welsh music and of the reappearance of ancient heroes such as Owain Glyndŵr. So, what then is the significance of these revived echoes of a Welsh past to nineteenth-century Welsh national identity? Morgan argues that during the late eighteenth and nineteenth-centuries, when memories of things Welsh were fading and Wales as a principality had not achieved nation status in the same way as Scotland or Ireland, that the revival of the past provide the Welsh with elements of a recognisable identity other than English upon which to build a Welsh identity in an

ever-changing world (Morgan, 2012). His work appears to show a consensus amongst historians that nineteenth-century Welsh national identity was constructed on the reworkings of these myths and legends which provided a strong link to the past.

This chapter now examines nineteenth-century primary evidence published by Henry Richard MP in his 1884 book 'Letters and Essays on Wales'. Richard was a Welsh-born non-conformist minister and long serving Liberal MP representing Merthyr for 20 years (Cragoe, ODNB, 2004). Interpreting his work should take account of this background. The book consolidated and republished his lifetimes' writings on a variety of Welsh related matters. Richard stated that most of his writings were produced to better explain the complexities and merits of Wales and the Welsh to the English. Given this, Richard's audience appears to have been predominately English readers with an interest in Wales. It is also possible that it was written with the readership of his English reading Welsh political followers in mind to bolster his political support base. His writings include the social, religious and political state of Wales and the Welsh. For instance, he listed the inadequacies of the established Anglican church in Wales and the progressiveness and wide-spread support for the non-conformist movement along with the positive effect it had on Welsh society as a whole and its contribution to rising standards of education in particular. In the aftermath of the 'Blue Books' scandal he robustly defended the Welsh against accusations, by the Commissioners of the Royal Commission into the state of Welsh education, of lax morals attributed to high levels of monoglot Welsh speakers quoting extensive statistics and sources to set the record straight (Richard, 1884). The significance of Richard's work is that it provides primary evidence of a nineteenth-century Welsh liberal's view of how he thought Welsh national identity should be perceived by the English. In essence he identified, for the benefit of his English audience, that the Welsh were generally non-conformist, liberal and through their language and culture held a respectable and separate identity to the rest of the United Kingdom (Cragoe, ODNB, 2004). What is less clear is to what extent this opinion actually reflected the view of the majority of the Welsh themselves.

This chapter now explores the historiography surrounding the narrative of a nineteenth-century Welsh national identity using extracts of works by Jones and

Morgan. Their work should be interpreted in the light of them both being Welsh academics of great repute who have written extensively on the history of Wales and the Welsh (Merfyn Jones, 2018) and (Morgan, 2018). The works analysed here were written at a time of rising Welsh nationalism and prior to the establishment of Wales as a devolved administration. The audience for the two peer reviewed works was primarily academics of Welsh history. Both provide a narrative of changing Welsh national identity over a much broader timeframe than this dissertation's nineteenth-century focus. That said they provided a record and evidence of the popular notion of a nineteenth-century Welsh national identity based around working class non-conformist, industrial or agricultural workers and their families, a liberal middle-class, powerful wealthy industrialists and remote aristocratic landowning elites. For example, Morgan provides us with a sense of nineteenth-century rising Welsh nationalism emerging from industrialization of the Welsh steel, copper and coal mining industries. He notes the popularity and rise of the non-conformist religious movement across urban and rural Welsh society and discusses the rise of radical bodies like the Welsh Liberation society which coupled with the expansion of male suffrage provided the catalyst from which a Welsh middle-class liberal tradition and identity could be traced (Morgan,1971). Merfyn Jones's paper reiterates the homogeneity of the nineteenth-century Welsh identity themes already described. However, in an astute departure from previous historians cited here, he goes on to observe that this constructed Welsh identity excluded a range of those living and contributing to the working of Welsh society such as; migrants, English rather than Welsh speaking inhabitants, followers of religious beliefs other than non-conformity and Conservative landowners (Jones, 1992). His highlighting of these excluded groups supports in part the general theme of this dissertation and this will be developed further in a later chapter. Summarising the significance of these two works leaves the reader with a firm idea that there is a reasonable consensus amongst contemporary historians that nineteenth-century Welsh nation identity was based on Welsh language, non-conformity, liberal political leanings and a predominately urban based working class arising out of the steel, copper and coal mining industries. This is supported by the primary evidence of Richard's 'Letters and Essays on Wales'. Chapter 2 will now conclude with a comparative analysis of the way the history of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity has been studied which will include a reading against the grain analysis.

Drawing together these four studies it is possible to determine a number of similarities in the way they have approached studying nineteenth-Welsh national identity. Firstly, whilst the sources were chosen for their content rather than their authorship it is noticeable that they were all written by Welsh-born men. Secondly the general approach of each work has been to stress the separateness of Wales and the Welsh based on characteristics demonstrably held by a majority of the inhabitants of Wales across cultural, religious, linguistic, political and predominately urban populations. Reading against the grain one must question the motivation and the academic balance of this approach given the context in which they were all written. Further, emphasising 'Welshness' and separateness without at least considering or even providing arguments that reject any notion of 'togetherness' with what was at the time the rest of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Ireland, Europe and the Empire seems an unusual omission particularly by the academics' reviewed for this dissertation. Finally drawing on the observation by Merfyn Jones that the approach to studying national identity in Wales focuses on the majority who meet Welsh criteria rather than the others, the next chapter seeks to develop his theme by examining the extraordinary life of Doctor William Price and by association those yet unrecorded.

Chapter 3 - Recognising the breadth and diversity of Doctor William Price's identity along with others yet unrecorded

This chapter examines the historiography surrounding Doctor Price's life, work and achievements by investigating secondary scholarship supported by primary sources. It conducts a comparative critical review using a framework which includes; the context in which the selected historiography was written, the material selected and its significance. It subjects the selected material to additional scrutiny by reading against the grain to establish what aspects of his life impact on nineteenth-century Welsh national identity but appear unrecorded. The chapter aims to establish the key approaches to studying the history of Doctor William Price and how their contribution impacts on the understanding and complexity of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity.

Doctor John Cule wrote extensively on Doctor William Price. Cule was Welsh-born and trained to be a medical doctor at both Cambridge and in London prior to

service in the Army during World War II. After demobilising he settled as a GP in England. Subsequently he returned to Wales as a psychiatrist. Concurrently he developed his interest in medical history producing articles in a number of reputable historical and medical journals and he published three books. He became president of the Welsh Society of the History of Medicine and in 1999 president of the International Society for the History of Medicine (Blair, 2015). He is therefore uniquely qualified to write about Doctor William Price's 'eccentricities' both as a psychiatrist and historian. In addition to an unpublished thesis about Price, Cule produced two articles based on his thesis which are analysed here (Cule, 1963 and 1983). Both articles tackled the subject of Price's 'eccentricities' from a medical point of view. Cule was of the opinion that Price's father had had mental health issues and considered that Price suffered in later life from schizophrenia. His narrative of Price's life takes him from monoglot Welsh schoolchild through successfully learning English, training in London to be a qualified surgeon and apothecary before returning to Wales aged 27 to set up a successful GP practice in South Wales. Cule covers Price's involvement in the Chartist movement, his role in neo-Druidism, personal legal battles, unorthodox lifestyle choices which included; a disregard for organised religion and living with his unmarried partner and having children by her. Finally, Cule discusses the saga of Price's successful defence against an unsuccessful prosecution for attempting to cremate the remains of his late five-month old son Jesus Christ Price in 1884 and his own cremation arrangements in 1893. These events are generally regarded by historians as helping to widen the appeal of cremation as an alternative means of body disposal to burying, around the United Kingdom (Cule, 1963 and 1983). This can be supported in part by the widely reported views on his court case outside Wales. A primary source example of which is the article in the Preston Chronicle, a North of England paper, reporting on his successful defending himself against prosecution for cremating the body of his son (Hewitt, 1884). Other significant lessons that can be gleaned from reading against the grain of Cule's writings including the need to learn English and be trained in England to take forward a successful career as a GP in Wales. Also, that those in Wales needed to engage with and rely on an English legal system. From Cule's writing there is a general sense that in the case of Price his identity included aspects of both Welsh and English features given that he was the product through a learnt language and higher education process of two distinct cultures that of Wales and

England. In addition, it is clear through his non-religious belief, support for cremation and lifestyle choices such as living with an unmarried partner that he falls outside the nineteenth-century Welsh national identity stereotype. Clearly these are aspects of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity that are unrecorded and this dissertation contends that further study of history in this area is needed in order to accurately reflect its actual complexity and diversity.

This chapter now turns to work discussing Price's place in the context of social change and economic development in Wales and the British Empire (Davies, 1980). Against a background of steel strikes and rising Welsh nationalism, Davies, then a schools services officer at the Museum of Wales charts the rise of capitalist success, as Wales through coal, copper, slate, steel and tin industries supported the British Empire and other overseas markets. Subsequently he notes how Wales then suffered progressive defeats during the failed Newport riots, the 'Blue Books' treachery and progressive anglicisation of Welsh culture. He contends that this coincided with Price's growing retreat into neo-Druidism. What then is the significance of his work to this dissertation's argument? Davies summarises Price as being out of tune with the rest of the people as being attributable to his madness, but nevertheless observes that perhaps he was the only one really in tune as he continued to struggle, using his creation of Welsh neo-Druidic myths and legends, despite his illness, to defend what he held most dear, the people of his part of Wales, against the march of the capitalist class (Davies 1980, p. 92). That those who knew him appreciated his work is supported in part by the tone of the primary evidence in his obituary ('Morien', 1893). Here Price personifies an identity based on an imagined past demonstrating the complexity of lived nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. This is further evidence that individuals can demonstrate aspects of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity whilst being at odds with the same narrative. It is also a further example of the complexity of trying to capture the diversity of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity.

This chapter now turns to Price's Chartist activities. Writing during the late 1950s Professor Asa Briggs produced a book on Chartism across the United Kingdom. Professor David Williams at the University College of Wales, Aberystwyth contributed a chapter on 'Chartism in Wales'. Price is introduced as an 'eccentric'

and generally accepted as 'a fit subject for a lunatic asylum' (Williams, 1957, p. 233). Williams' narrative goes on to describe Price as a leader of the Chartists in Pontypridd. Whilst he avoided the Newport riot in 1839, sources ascribe to Price a role in procuring cannon for the uprising and of being prepared to take command in Wales. Subsequently by his own account he fled to France to avoid capture by the authorities (Ap Id Anfryn, 1888). Price reappears in Pontypridd and in the 1841 General Election is put forward as the Newport Chartist candidate, though his nomination was withdrawn as he failed to appear at the hustings (Williams, 1957). From a study of history perspective this episode of his life is significant because it lends further weight to the dissertation's contention that nineteenth-century Welsh national identity was a diverse and complex mix.

In summary this chapter has highlighted different approaches to studying the history of Doctor William Price. Doctor Cule's medical approach has highlighted his medical condition which should caution those who treat his behaviour as eccentric. At the same time, it demonstrates that history can provide examples of those assumed to have mental health conditions living meaningful lives. Brian Davies traced Price's neo-Druidic beliefs which further develop Iolo Morganwg's earlier work on rooting Welsh national identity in the myths and legends of the past. He has sought to place Price in a nineteenth-century class battle pitting him against capitalism and combating Wales' betrayal by the English. Conversely Professor Williams' has provided us with a mixed bag; Doctor Price as candidate for an asylum but still thought well enough by his peers to be put forward as a parliamentary candidate in the 1841 General Election. Analysing this provides a personal narrative that threads through areas of Welsh national identity; as a chartist leader demonstrating liberal and radical views, as a firm believer in Wales' rich imagined heritage and as a Welsh language speaker, all of which are key features of the nineteenth-century notion of Welsh national identity. On the other hand, Price also demonstrated characteristics such as non-religious belief, support for cremation and lifestyle choices all of which fall outside the nineteenth-century Welsh national identity stereotype. What then can the historiography of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity learn from the extraordinary life of Doctor William Price? It seems that the current approach to studying nineteenth-century Welsh national identity in taking a top-down view which compared to the bottom-up study of Doctor Price's

actual lived experience reveals an individual whose diverse and complex identity runs counter to a number of characteristics held up to be the norm. This leads to a further question, to what extent are there other sections of the Welsh community whose influences on nineteenth-century Welsh national identity are as yet unrecorded? Tackling this dichotomy will be the next chapter's theme.

Chapter 4 - Squaring the circle of historiology's approach to nineteenth-century Welsh national identity 'taking better account of the unrecorded' - An analysis

Chapter 4 takes the findings of the two previous chapters and subjects them to further investigation. It highlights key themes which dominate the current historical approach to studying nineteenth-century Welsh national identity with particular reference to the part played by those yet unrecorded. Then it will consider how newly emerging material and historical study may provide a fresh approach to exploring this area. Finally, it will highlight how the historiology of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity can benefit from better understanding the diverse and complex nature of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity.

A number of themes have emerged, chapter 2's analysis emphasises the separateness of the Welsh from England during the nineteenth-century without balancing or examining the possibility of unifying national identity links with the United Kingdom. In addition, it seems that the approach to studying nineteenth-century Welsh national identity focuses on the contribution of the Welsh majority in Wales who fit the narrative of a constructed nineteenth-century Welsh national identity whilst omitting the influence of others who may also have contributed to national identity within Wales (Jones, 1992). From Chapter 3 it is clear that aspects of Doctor Price's remarkable life, like his non-religious belief (Cule, 1963 and 1983), are not accounted for. Added to the omissions such as migrants, English rather than Welsh speaking inhabitants and followers of religious beliefs other than non-conformity (Jones, 1992) the evidence points towards areas not taken account of in the current methods of studying nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. These gaps will now be explored in more detail.

It is useful here to compare the scale of some the omissions with the factors already included in the current narrative of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity to highlight the need to take account of these missing areas in future work. Take the case of gender and Welsh national identity, the 1851 census of Great Britain listed the population of Wales as 1,188,890, of which females numbered 594,108 (Southall, 2009-17). This is slightly less than 50% of the population. Despite this significant percentage there is little in the current narrative of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity that acknowledges a female contribution. Spencer and Woolman when discussing the development of nationalism (of which national identity is a component), from a feminist perspective observe that this is a neglected area. They highlight the growing consensus amongst historians that nationalism has historically been gendered. For instance;

‘the role allocated to or taken by women as, variously, biological reproducers of the nation; participants in the ideological reproduction of the nation and transmitters of its culture; signifiers of national difference and symbols of the nation; reproducers of boundaries between national groups; and participants in the nationalist struggle itself’

(Spencer and Wollman, 2002, p. 52).

This dissertation contends that the narrative of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity would benefit from an ungendered study placing women in Wales on a par with their male counterparts. A similar scale of omission occurs in the area of the non-religious in Wales of which Price is but one example. Based on the religious attendance statistics gathered for the 1851 census and taking account of non-conformists and others potentially attending more than one service, in the region of 60% of the population of Wales did not attend a place of religion (Davies, 1990, p. 427). This confounds the notion of a nineteenth-century Welsh national identity grounded in non-conformism in addition to highlighting the narrative’s lack of recognition of the non-religious.

Additionally, one must not lose sight of evidence of how things really were amongst the Welsh, morally during the nineteenth-century. Despite Richard’s exhortations about the high moral standards amongst the Welsh (Richard, 1884)

Price provides us with an example of someone who lived life against the norm of married life. Davies reminds us that the imagined Welsh 'land of moral purity and perfect people' that was 'frequently proclaimed from pulpit and press' (Davies, (2012 [1996]) p. 233.) was not necessarily representative of reality either in urban or rural areas. His statistics, albeit from 1870 onwards and focused on a district of Wales, reveal high incidences of domestic violence, illegitimate child birth and prostitution. These are not elements of Welsh national identity that appear in the popular narrative but arguably should be if it is to reflect the reality of the lived life. One also needs to be mindful of the treatment of immigrants and minorities in Wales for instance note the anti-Irish riots in Tredegar in 1882 and anti-Jewish violence in Merthyr during 1898, balanced against the notion of a Welsh 'welcome in the hillsides' (Jenkins, 2007, p. 185).

A question mark also hangs over the part played through in-migration by the Irish, Scottish and English into Wales and the contribution made by migrants from mainland Europe and other parts of the world. For example, whilst the availability of comprehensive statistics across Wales is limited it has been calculated that 9.6 % of the population of south Wales in 1871 came from English counties and that this percentage had increased to 16.5% by 1891 (Jones, 1988). Given the majority of the Welsh population lived in South Wales at this time, these figures represent significant numbers of non-Welsh and it is conceivable that their influence impacted on nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. Consider also the impact of migrants from around Europe. Fieldwork on a walk down Bute street and around Cardiff bay reveals a Greek orthodox and a Norwegian Church both of which have their origins in mid-nineteenth-century Greek and Norwegian shipping and trading communities active in the Cardiff area (St Nicholas Church, 2013) and (Roese,1996). It is not inconceivable that these communities also affected nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. However, as they are as yet unrecorded influences, they have failed to feature in the Welsh national identity debate. This chapter will now consider how newly emerging material and methods of study can provide a fresh approach to studying this area with particular reference to the part played by those yet unrecorded.

A329 course materials have revealed an increasingly body of nineteenth-century primary evidence available online such as digitalised archives of regional newspapers, UK census statistics and digitalised books not previously available to or considered by contemporary historians. These have the potential to throw new light on the narrative of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity (Open University, 2017). In terms of new methods of studying history in this area, Evans' plea for taking a wider view of Wales' Victorian urban past incorporating material from a range of academic disciplines such as history, geography, sociology and anthropology (Evans, 2005) and the scoping work completed by Light examining the middle classes as urban elites in nineteenth-century South Wales (Light, 2009) could provide historians of Welsh national identity with models of how historiography could better take forward the study of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity from a bottom-up perspective. The challenge here is to identify the reality of how 'Welsh' nineteenth-century men and women actually felt and to what extent the unrecorded factors highlighted by studying Doctor William Price, like his non-religious beliefs and the almost total absence of a female perspective, impact on nineteenth-century Welsh national identity.

Finally, this chapter ends by answering the specific question - What can the historiography of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity learn from the life of Doctor William Price (1800-1893) and from others yet unrecorded? In studying approaches to history Tosh argues that to be useful to the citizen, the role of public history is to offer balanced observations supported by clear evidence. Further, to be beneficial the study of public history must ensure that the historical record is accurately portrayed. It should enable individuals, communities and governments to see the past not from contemporary perches as they would have liked it to have been, but as it actually was (Tosh, 2015). This dissertation has argued that the historiography of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity can learn to better understand and reflect the diverse and complex nature of those living in Wales during the nineteenth-century. Making the study of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity more representative would, to paraphrase Tosh's methodology, make it more useful to the contemporary Welsh citizen. This dissertation now turns to its conclusion.

Chapter 5 - The conclusion

In summary this dissertation has laid out the current narrative of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity. Through a study of the extraordinary life of Doctor William Price it has highlighted areas that fail to appear in the current narrative such as his non-religious behaviour and unorthodox lifestyle. This in turn has exposed other parts of the Welsh community such as women and in-migrants who currently remain unrecorded in the traditional narrative. The dissertation went on to argue that having compared the historiography of nineteenth-century Welsh national identity from both a top-down and a bottom-up perspective, there is evidence that the narrative would benefit from further study of those identified in this dissertation as unrecorded. The dissertation has also suggested that it is only now that historians can provide sufficient evidence through statistics, censuses and other sources of reliable primary evidence to support the notion of a nineteenth-century Welsh national identity drawing on the experiences from across the entire Welsh population. It has also offered alternative approaches to studying Welsh national identity based on work by Evans and Light as a means of taking this area of research forward. As the Welsh evidence base grows more reliable this initiative could be used to scope the identified gaps to better encompass the complexity, diversity and richness that is nineteenth-century Welsh national identity balanced against any sense of 'togetherness' with the rest of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Ireland, Europe and Empire.

Word Count: 6000 words

Bibliography:

Primary sources:

'Ap Id Anfryn'. (1888) 'Doctor Price of Llantrisant: the famous druid interviewed. Sketch of his life and adventures', *Cardiff Times and South Wales Weekly News*, 19 May–23 June 1888. [Online]. Available at <http://newspapers.library.wales/view/3424000/3424001/8/Doctor%20Price%20of%20Llantrisant> (Accessed 21 February 2018)

BBC News (2011) '*Llantrisant pioneer Dr William Price's plaque unveiled*'. [Online]. Available at <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-wales-south-east-wales-14954842> (Accessed 21 February 2018).

Russell, B. (1929) '*Marriage and Morals*' [Online]. New York, Liveright, p. 58. Available at https://archive.org/details/marriagemorals00russ_0 (Accessed 21 May 18).

Big State Theatre Company. (2004) '*Firestarter*' [Online] Available at <http://www.bigstate.co.uk/> (Accessed 24 March 2018).

Blair, J. (2015) John Hedley Cule Obituary, *BMJ* [Online]. Available at <https://www-bmj-com.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/content/350/bmj.h3100> Accessed 7 May 2018.

Business Wales. (2016) '*The Wales Identity. Sense of Place*' [Online]. Available at <https://businesswales.gov.wales/sites/business-wales> (Accessed on 10 February 2018)

Hemming, A. C. (1918) '*William Price of Llantrisant (1800-1893) MRCS, LSA, medical practitioner, in druidic costume, with goats*', Oil painting, Wellcome Collection. [Online]. Available at <https://wellcomecollection.org/works/kcyz6daj> (Accessed 19 February 2018).

Hewit, A. (Printer) (1884) 'The Welsh Cremation Case', *Preston Chronicle*, 2 February 1884. [Online] Available at <http://tinyurl.galegroup.com/tinyurl/5yTgB8> (Accessed 19 February 2018).

Marquand & Co. (1893) 'The late archdruid to be cremated', *Star [Guernsey]*, 26 Jan 1893. [Online]. Available at <http://tinyurl.galegroup.com/tinyurl/5yU222> (Accessed 19 February 2018).

Merfyn Jones R. (2018) Biography '*Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol*' [Online]. Available at <http://www.colegcymraeg.ac.uk/en/aboutus/honoraryfellows/prof-r-merfyn-jones.aspx> Accessed 3 May 2018.

'Morien' (1893) Obituary, 'Death of Dr Price of Lantrisant', *Western Mail*, 24 Jan. 1893. British Library Newspapers [Online]. Available at <http://tinyurl.galegroup.com/tinyurl/5yTK37> (Accessed 19 February 2018).

Morgan, K. (2018) Biography, 'University of Wales Press' [Online]. Available at <http://www.uwp.co.uk/author/kenneth-morgan-1214/> Accessed 3 May 2018.

Powell, D. (2007) 'Dr William Price'. Gomer Press, Ceredigion.

Rhondda-Cynon-Taf Library Service. (2011) 'Our past - Dr William Price'. [Online]. Available at <http://webapps.rhondda-cynon-taff.gov.uk/heritagetrail/english/taf/drwilliamprice.html> (Accessed on 21 February 2018).

Richard, H. (1884) 'Letters and Essays on Wales'. London, James Clarke & Co. [Online]. Available at <https://archive.org/details/lettersessaysonw00richuoft> (Accessed 24 March 2018).

Secondary sources:

Corfield, P. (2008) 'How Historiology defines History', *The Times Literary Supplement*, p. 27. [Online]. Available at http://www.penelopejcorfield.co.uk/PDF%27s/CorfieldPdf4_HowHistoriologydefinesHistory.pdf (Accessed 8 April 2018).

Cragoe, M. (2004) 'Culture, Politics and National Identity in Wales 1832–1886', Oxford, Oxford University Press [Online]. Available at <http://www.oxfordscholarship.com.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/view/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198207542.001.0001/acprof-9780198207542> (Accessed 21 February 2018).

Cragoe, M. (2004) Richard, Henry (1812–1888), politician. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* [Online]. Available at <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-23527> (Accessed 3 May 2018).

Cule, J. (1963) 'The Eccentric Dr William Price of LLantrisant' (1800-1893), *Morgannwg transactions of the Glamorgan Local History Society*, Vol 7. [Online] Available at <http://hdl.handle.net/10107/1170493> (Accessed on 19 February 2018).

Cule, J. (1982) 'Interesting GPs Of The Past: William Price Of Llantrisant: 1800-1893', *British Medical Journal (Clinical Research Edition)*, Vol. 284, No. 6314 (13 February 1982), pp. 481-4 [Online]. Available at <http://www.jstor.org/stable/29505317> (Accessed on 3 March 2018).

Dalrymple, T. (2010) 'The father of cremation' *British Medical Journal* [Online]. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.c2183> (Accessed 19 February 2018).

Davies, B. (1980) 'Empire and identity: the "case" of Doctor William Price' in Smith, D. (ed) 'A people and a proletariat: essays in the history of Wales, 1780–1980', London, Pluto Press, pp. 72–93.

Davies, J. (1993) *A History of Wales*, London, Penguin Books, p. 427.

Davies, J. Jenkins, N. Baines, M. & et al. (2008) 'Price, William (1800-93) Doctor, Chartist and cremationist', *The Welsh academy encyclopedia of Wales*. Cardiff, UK: Literature Wales [Online]. Available at http://libezproxy.open.ac.uk/login?url=https://search.credoreference.com/content/entry/waencywales/price_william_1800_93_doctor_charhist_and_cremationist/0?institutionId=292 (Accessed 19 February 2018).

Davies, R. (2012 [1996]) *Secret Sins: Sex, Violence and Society in Carmarthenshire 1870–1920*, 2nd edn, Cardiff, University of Wales Press. pp. 231-239. [Online]. Available at <https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/open/> (Accessed 20 February 2018).

Evans, N. (2004a) 'Finding a new story: the search for a usable past in Wales, 1869–1930', *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, new series, vol. 10, pp. 144–62 [Online]. Available at <https://journals.library.wales/view/1386666/1426522/165#?xywh=-797%2C-191%2C3934%2C3913> (Accessed 21 February 2018).

Evans, N. (2005) 'Rethinking urban Wales', *Urban History*, Vol 32, Issue 1, pp. 114-131 [Online]. Available at <https://www-cambridge-org.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/> (Accessed 1 February 2018).

Gregory, J. (2004) 'Price, William (1800–1893), physician, self-styled archdruid, and advocate of cremation'. *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. [Online]. Available at <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/> (Accessed 20 February 2018).

Hoffer, P. (2008) *'The Historians' Paradox: The Study of History in Our Time'*, New York University Press [Online] Available at <https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/open/detail.action?docID=866112> (Accessed 5 April 2018).

Hobsbawm, E. and Ranger, T. (eds) (2012) *'The Invention of Tradition'*, 2nd edn. [Online]. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press. Available at <https://www-cambridge-org.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/core/books/invention-of-tradition/B9973971357795DC86BE856F321C34B3> (Accessed 21 February 2018).

Jenkins, G. H. (2007) *'A Concise History of Wales'*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, p. 185.

Jenkins, P. (1992) *'A history of modern Wales 1536-1990'* London and New York, Longmans.

Jones, G. (1988) *'Wales 1880–1914'* Open University [Online] Available at http://www.open.edu/openlearn/ocw/pluginfile.php/59855/mod_oucontent/oucontent/369/c823f970/73c20f54/wales1880_1914.pdf?forcedownload=1 Accessed 11 May 2018.

Jones, R. (1992). Beyond Identity? The Reconstruction of the Welsh. *Journal of British Studies*, 31(4), pp. 330-357. [Online]. Available at

<http://www.jstor.org.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/stable/175884> (Accessed 3 March 2018).

Light, J. (2009) 'The middle classes as urban elites in nineteenth-century South Wales', *The Welsh History Review*, vol. 24, no. 3, pp. 29–55 [Online]. Available at <http://open.library.ingentaconnect.com.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/> (Accessed 12 February 2018).

Morgan, K. O. (1971) 'Welsh Nationalism: The Historical Background', *Journal of Contemporary History*, Vol. 6, No. 1, pp. 153-159+161-172. [Online]. Available at <http://www.jstor.org.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/stable/259629> (Accessed 4 March 2018).

Morgan, P. (2012) 'From a Death to a View: The Hunt for the Welsh Past in the Romantic Period' in Hobsbawm, E. and Ranger, T. (eds) '*The Invention of Tradition*', 2nd edn. [Online]. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press. Available at <https://www.cambridge-org.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/core/books/invention-of-tradition/B9973971357795DC86BE856F321C34B3> (Accessed 21 February 2018).

Motyl, A. J. (ed) (2000) National identity. *Encyclopedia of nationalism: leaders, movements, and concepts*. [Online]. Oxford. Available at http://libezproxy.open.ac.uk/login?url=https://search.credoreference.com/content/entry/estnational/national_identity/0?institutionId=292 (Accessed 30 April 2018).

The Open University. (2017) '*A329 Block 1-5 materials*' [Online]. Milton Keynes, The Open University. Available at <https://openedx.open.ac.uk/courses/course-v1:ou+A329+2017J/> (Accessed 7 October 2017 to 19 April 2018).

Oxford English Dictionary. (2018) 'Historiography' *Oxford English Dictionary* [Online]. Oxford, Oxford University Press. Available at <http://www.oed.com.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/view/historiography#eid> (Accessed 2 April 2018).

Oxford English Dictionary. (2018) 'Historiology' *Oxford English Dictionary* [Online]. Oxford, Oxford University Press. Available at <http://www.oed.com.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/view/historiology#eid> (Accessed 2 April 2018).

Roose, H. E. (1996) 'Cardiff's Norwegian heritage: a neglected theme' *Welsh History Review*, Vol.18., p. 255 [Online] Available at <http://hdl.handle.net/10107/1082967> (Accessed 11 May 2018).

Southall, H. (2009-17) '*Vision of Britain*' University of Portsmouth and others [Online] Available at <http://www.visionofbritain.org.uk/census/1851> Accessed 8 May 2018.

Spencer, P. and Wollman, H. (2002) '*Nationalism: A Critical Introduction*', [Online]. London, Sage Publications, Available at <http://dx.doi.org.libezproxy.open.ac.uk/10.4135/9781446216231.n1> (Accessed 8 May 2018, p. 52).

St.Nicholas Church. (2013) '*History*' St.Nicholas Church, Cardiff [Online]. Available at <http://greekorthodoxchurchcardiff.org.uk/> (Accessed on 11 May 2018).

Tosh, J. (2008) *Why History Matters*, Palgrave Macmillan.

Tosh, J. (2015) *The Pursuit of History*, 6th edn, Routledge.

Williams, D. (1959) 'Chartism in Wales' in Briggs, A. (ed) '*Chartist Studies*', London, Macmillan, pp. 220-248.

White, S. in Davies, D, J. & Mates L, H. (eds.) (2005) 'Price, Dr William' *Encyclopedia of Cremation*. [Online]. Surrey, Ashgate Publishing. Available at <http://libezproxy.open.ac.uk/login?url=https://search.credoreference.com/> (Accessed 19 February 2018).