Exploring the Use of Fictional Film as a Trigger to Enquiry Based Learning

Thesis

How to cite:


For guidance on citations see FAQs.

© 2017 The Author

Version: Version of Record
Exploring the use of fictional film as a trigger to Enquiry Based Learning

Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment for the Doctorate in Education

Open University

31/01/2017
Exploring the use of fictional film as a trigger to Enquiry Based Learning

Abstract

This research explored the use of fictional film as a trigger to Enquiry Based Learning (EBL) within a pre-registration adult nursing programme. This qualitative research used an open and interpretive approach. An in-depth consideration of the experiential learning of the nursing students using creative pedagogy within EBL alongside practice was the primary focus. This research sought to contribute to knowledge related to the application of narrative pedagogy and creative media within nurse education, considering what this new approach could contribute to the learning experience of nursing students to increase their perception of the value of EBL.

A critical review of the literature, encompassing databases related to healthcare, education and media studies, concentrated on topics including reflective practice, narrative pedagogy, narrative learning, teaching as enchantment and Cinemeducation. This important stage also informed the development of the research approach, enabling a clearer theoretical and practical rationale and design for the study.

Participants included two groups of adult nursing third year undergraduate students, completing their final practice placements and attending EBL alongside this. Data were collected using semi-structured, open-ended individual interviews, guided group discussions and EBL facilitator observation, further evidenced and documented through the compilation of research diaries. Ethical approval was granted by the ethics committees within both Universities involved. All students consented to participate in the guided group discussions, and twelve students agreed to be interviewed. As a nurse educator within the programme, and the group facilitator for both groups, I was able to maintain participant observation through every EBL session over a two-year period.

The data were transcribed and thematically analysed, synchronously with the data collection phase. Themes included memorability, relevance, authenticity, emotional engagement and exploration of the safe boundaries related to the use of fictional film within professional education. Findings indicated that the incorporation of carefully selected fictional film into EBL is both popular and effective, facilitating debate regarding essential learning outcomes and therefore impacting positively on the student learning experience. As such this research supports the assertion that the use of fictional film should be included within UK adult nurse education.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank both of my supervisors Professor Judith Lathlean and Professor Jan Draper for their enduring, patient support and much valued advice.

I would also like to thank my husband Alex and my son Cameron for their patience and support throughout all of my studies.
# Contents

Chapter One: .......................................................................................................................... 6

Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 6

1.0 Introducing the thesis ......................................................................................................... 6

1.1 The context of pre-registration nursing education .......................................................... 8

1.2 Enquiry Based Learning .................................................................................................. 12

1.3 The rationale for the research .......................................................................................... 15

1.4 The structure of the thesis ............................................................................................... 17

Chapter Two ............................................................................................................................ 19

Literature Review .................................................................................................................... 19

2.0 Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 19

2.1 Search strategy ................................................................................................................ 19

2.2 Themes arising from the literature review ...................................................................... 22

2.2.1 The creative use of fictional film within educational settings .................................. 22

2.2.1.i Empirical research ..................................................................................................... 22

2.2.1.ii Non-empirical studies ............................................................................................... 25

2.2.2 Narrative pedagogy ...................................................................................................... 29

2.2.2i Narrative Learning ....................................................................................................... 35

2.2.3 The use of fiction .......................................................................................................... 37

2.2.4 Teaching as a form of enchantment .............................................................................. 38

2.2.5 Reflection ..................................................................................................................... 42

2.3 Broader pedagogical considerations arising from the literature ................................. 45

2.3.1 Learning styles ............................................................................................................. 46

2.3.2 Concentration spans .................................................................................................... 47

2.4 Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 48

Chapter Three ......................................................................................................................... 51

Methodology .......................................................................................................................... 51

3.0 Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 51

3.1 Research paradigm .......................................................................................................... 52

3.2 Research questions .......................................................................................................... 52

3.3 Methodological decisions ............................................................................................... 53

3.4 The rationale for taking a qualitative approach ............................................................. 55

3.5 Research design .............................................................................................................. 55

Figure 1: The Research Process ............................................................................................ 56

3.6 Sample ............................................................................................................................. 57

3.6.1 Sample recruitment ..................................................................................................... 57
5.8.1 Emotional preparedness ....................................................... 133
5.9 Reflexivity ........................................................................... 134
5.10 Summary ............................................................................. 136
Chapter Six .................................................................................. 139
Conclusions ................................................................................ 139
6.0 Introduction ........................................................................... 139
  6.0.1 What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer educationally to the students' learning experience? ................................................................. 140
  6.0.2 What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer aesthetically to the students' learning experience? ................................................................. 141
  6.0.3 What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer emotionally to the students' learning experience? ................................................................. 142
6.1 Key conclusions ..................................................................... 143
6.2 Implications for nurse education ............................................. 145
  6.2.1 Implications for educational practice .................................. 149
6.3 Reflections on the research process ......................................... 150
  6.3.1 Strengths within the research design ................................ 150
  6.3.2 Limitations within the research design ............................... 152
6.4 Reflection on my own development ......................................... 153
6.5 Future plans .......................................................................... 154
References .................................................................................... 156
Appendix I: The Participant Information Pack ............................. 178
Appendix II: Examples of Interview Transcripts .......................... 182
Appendix III: .................................................................................. 193
  Example of Guided Group Discussion Notes: .......................... 193
Appendix IV: .................................................................................. 196
  Example of Observation notes: ................................................. 196
Appendix V: .................................................................................... 198
  Teaching Plan: SoLD EBL with fictional film ............................. 198
Chapter One:  
Introduction

1.0 Introducing the thesis

This qualitative research has explored the use of fictional film as a new trigger to learning within the education of pre-registration undergraduate adult nursing students. The use of this relatively new trigger or stimulus to learning within UK nurse education was explored within two Enquiry Based Learning (EBL) groups. EBL is an open and flexible approach to learning which extends the philosophical shift from an open pedagogy which is student centred, to one which actively seeks to be student-led. In this context EBL is student led, which should be an empowering process, yet nevertheless must connect to specific learning outcomes driven within the fora of professional education. This research was conducted within a Department of Nursing with one UK University, with third year adult nursing students who were in the final phase of their pre-registration nursing programme. This application of fictional film as a new stimulus to critically reflective guided group discussions was being explored within a familiar learning context embedded through their curricula, but with an alternative trigger as distinct from the conventional range of established learning prompts previously used.

Underpinning the overall aim of the research to explore the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL, there were specific research questions identified:

1. *What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer educationally to the students’ learning experience?*

2. *What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer aesthetically to the students’ learning experience?*
3. What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer emotionally to the students’ learning experience?

The research aimed to explore whether the use of fictional film could trigger effective student led learning within the practice focused EBL group sessions, alongside considering whether this learning was positively experienced by the nursing students involved. As the trigger was new but the context in which it was used was familiar, the impact of this alternative prompt on the group learning experiences could then be compared with previous learning experiences.

Established learning triggers (stimuli or catalysts to learning conversations) included anonymised client case scenarios or ‘pen pictures’, extracts from official publications from national organisations like the Department of Health, fictionalised accounts of healthcare experiences, documentaries, poetry and photographs. Having previously worked with examples of all of these resources and more recently biographical non-fiction film, it was proposed that there was not only further scope to explore the use of such triggers, but also the opportunities to add new resources. This study explores an approach that offers a safe, yet creative and engaging way to work with students to achieve optimal reflection on their practice learning outcomes.

Within this introductory chapter, the context within which the research was conducted and the characteristics of EBL will be briefly considered. This background is important in terms of setting out some of the major changes surrounding and underpinning this research. The context of nursing education is subject to significant change, amplified by the considerable changes in student expectations and learning needs. EBL is proposed to be one of the pedagogical solutions to meet enhanced student learning needs and expectations within this context of significant change. Therefore, the following sections will consider some of the most significant elements of these influencing factors. Thereafter the structure of the thesis will be set out.
1.1 The context of pre-registration nursing education

It is important to consider this research in the context of the rapid social, economic and political change affecting higher education, focusing attention on the quality of educational delivery and student evaluation of this provision. This entails heightened prioritisation on employability being amplified within professional undergraduate programmes including nursing. Pre-registration nursing curricula are also expected to comply with the national regulatory standards as set out by the Nursing and Midwifery Council (NMC) in 2010. The NMC set the standards for nurse education (NMC, 2010) which influence the structure of pre-registration nursing curricula, as well as intermittently auditing the content. A very full curriculum, dominated by the NMC competencies for entry to the register, include a focus on four domains. These domains direct attention to professional values, interpersonal skills, the nursing process as well as management and leadership.

As the landscape of healthcare provision changes and modes as well as locations of delivery transform, the preparation of nurses must also evolve to meet these demands. The change of emphasis from primarily acute care to increasing diversity of care in the community influences placement capacity and types of experiential learning available. The need to increase nurse educator support for nursing students when they are in placement has influenced curricula design as well.

It is a national requirement that within three years, undergraduate nursing students must complete 4,600 hours of verified learning, equally divided between theory and practice (NMC, 2010). The practice hours are shared across several clinical placements, usually between two and three per year, advancing from formative to summative assessment as the student reaches each annual progression point. Nursing students often anticipate that clinical placements will be their preferred site of learning, which is usually the case. Students know that they have to attend theory modules as well, at different parts of each year, but
can find it challenging to attend campus based sessions alongside clinical placements.

Within the University nursing department hosting this research, one of the prominent features of this curriculum involved the ongoing development of a type of EBL, which was originally called work-based learning days (WBL) and is currently entitled supervision of learning days (SoLD). These sessions are usually consistently held once a fortnight alongside the span of clinical placements. SoLD sessions are always attended within personal tutor groups, which conventionally comprise thirty students in total. These groups of students are facilitated to establish effective learning relationships, which are supported throughout all three years, in which they are expected to reflect on their progression through their clinical practice experiences (for a detailed session plan see Appendix V). The three-year undergraduate pre-registration nursing curriculum is a highly pressured and demanding experience, particularly when the students are completing clinical placements. Acknowledging the pressures placed upon the students was fully appreciated within this research. The EBL days are an opportunity not only to reflect on learning within practice but also to diffuse that pressure through skilled facilitation, developing peer support.

Whilst recognising the specific educational requirements mandated by the NMC standards for pre-registration nurse education (NMC, 2010), this necessarily focuses attention on the learning outcomes set within every module contributing to the nursing programme. To maintain confidence in meeting these learning outcomes, careful planning was needed to ensure that the innovative new approach taken within this study was compatible with those goals. Within higher education, student expectations of educational quality are high and increasing. Evidence of this is exemplified in the many opportunities afforded to them to evaluate their studies including both internal student experience surveys and engagement with the National Student Survey (www.thestudentsurvey.com). This politically driven, consumer-led phenomenon is increasingly of both local and national importance and is analogous to the client centred approach now conventional within healthcare delivery (Department of Health, 2012). Pre-registration nurse education should be responsive as well as responsible in terms
of being able to develop nurses who are safe, resilient, knowledgeable and competent for professional practice as registered practitioners, all of which must be achieved within set time constraints. The curriculum should include key transferable skills, relevant underpinning theory, and wide-ranging clinical skills (NMC, 2010). The pre-registration nursing curricula should ultimately support the students to develop a safe scope of practice to engage with the registered nurse role upon qualification (NMC, 2015; NMC, 2010). The programme includes theoretical underpinning knowledge, reflexivity and engagement with evidence based practice (EBP) (NMC, 2008a). EBP requires information literacy skills and critical appraisal skills, as well as the capacity to integrate theory with effective practical outcomes. Developing all of these skills can challenge students because they are difficult to learn and this therefore requires careful facilitation by nurse educators. The extent of set learning outcomes presents a significant workload for the students. The scale of learning can feel particularly pressurised by the students whilst in the midst of practice placements, which they are expected to critically reflect on in the EBL sessions. In the midst of all this pressure it is imperative that the EBL sessions are seen as valuable and effective by the students (Whowell, 2006).

Although the EBL is included in practice hours, the students are usually at their most exhausted at this time as they are attending placements full time. Even taking into consideration the restrictions that professional programmes place upon the curricula, Santo (2011) argued that it was possible to use creative pedagogies, including narrative pedagogy to deliver on these essential learning outcomes. This research aspired to introduce more creative, challenging and potentially exciting ways to initiate and sustain enthused learning within the EBL groups.

There are numerous occasions within EBL where students need facilitator encouragement to motivate them to fully engage with discussing the complexity of real practice in ways that can enable reflexivity and critical thinking. This can involve critically debating ethical issues, reflecting on personal development and complex problem solving (Alexander et al. 2012). The students can lead these discussions regarding professional issues encountered in their practice
placements, which requires skilled facilitation from an experienced nurse educator. EBL facilitation involves role modelling, coaching and storytelling, all of which can be helpful to assist students to achieve professional insight and think more broadly (Scheckel & Ironside, 2006). Complex connections between theory and practice need to be fully explored, in order to develop student awareness of how to develop a well-rounded flexible and professional approach, which delivers clinically effective evidence based care in practice (Davis, 2011).

The students are being prepared to work in a very fast paced, clinically demanding and ever-changing healthcare environment. The use of conventional resources such as clinical evidence, published theory and clinical guidelines are all essential elements to inform practice and are integral within the curricula. The nurse educator is required to facilitate a comprehensive, relevant, yet also engaging learning experience. The selected pedagogy should be sensitive to current needs, preparing students to become adaptable, resilient practitioners. Nursing education tends still to be dominated by conventional pedagogies in terms of traditional lecture, then seminar delivery formats. The use of a didactic approach is now becoming increasingly challenged in the light of more progressive pedagogical alternatives emerging (Ironside, 2006). For example, Santo (2011) suggested that narrative pedagogy had a significant contribution to make in advancing creative learning spaces within seminars,

“Nursing students are primarily being taught using conventional pedagogies. Conventional pedagogies are those that are outcome-focused and have been criticized for focusing on teaching versus learning. Critics claim that these pedagogies create an academic-practice gap” (Santo, 2011, p.2)

In the context of widening access to higher education, technological change and rising working pressures placed upon the nursing profession, there is a very real need for emerging pedagogies to build a more flexible and resilient workforce (Santo, 2011; Davis, 2011). These new pedagogical approaches can strengthen educational provision that needs to develop sustainability, interpersonal skills, ethical awareness and empathy (Alexander, et al. 2012). Consideration of all applicable learning outcomes must be uppermost in the mind of the EBL
facilitator, who needs to be adaptable to the current priorities set by the students themselves, as well as emanating from the demands of the curriculum (Gough, 2008). The reality of professional practice in the twenty-first century amplifies the need to be creative where opportunities to do so arise within the programme (Santo, 2011). Innovative pedagogies offer contrasting learning experiences and the chance to explore more complex and emotional issues, which are more difficult to consider using conventional approaches (Alexander, 2005). Using an EBL approach can be considered as a foundation on which to build innovative pedagogies (Kahn & O’Rourke, 2005).

EBL sessions provide premium opportunities for students to reflect together and share their stories of practice experiences with their peers. These experiences ranged from positive affirmations of their clinical skills development through to disclosures of clinical incidents that they feel the need to explore and debate in depth. These are opportunities to engage in critical reflection, importantly involving integrating theory with practice. Skilled facilitation will draw out and extend consideration of the essential dialogue between theory and practice because effective clinical practice only develops within the presence of both. One of the challenges for the nurse educator is to highlight the connections between theory and practice, as an ongoing process, to reinforce the necessity of both to practice development. EBL is an ideal platform in which to reinforce this essential message. Recognising the necessary dialogue between theory and practice is essential in order to promote well-rounded and fully skilled behaviour. Theory and practice are and indeed need to be essentially intertwined. Expertise is only really achieved therefore when both of these elements are cultivated (Dreyfus, 2004). Regardless of any implicit or explicit awareness of what might be termed learning preferences, the students have to achieve specific learning outcomes within set time limits.

1.2 Enquiry Based Learning

In order to set the context for this research, the background and nature of Enquiry Based Learning (EBL) are now described. Within this research the EBL sessions
are a prime opportunity to add in new and creative pedagogy as they are flexible, adaptable, student centred and potentially student led.

EBL has been described as a ‘broad umbrella term’ (Kahn & O'Rourke, 2005), referring to approaches to learning that are driven by the process of enquiry. It is an approach that is concordant with respect for the nature of the classroom in higher education, appreciating the different skills, expectations and learning styles that adults may bring with them to any learning situation; as extolled in Social Learning Theory (Bandura, 1977). The ‘teacher’ in this context can establish the tasks or foci, but thereafter stands back to allow the students to take the lead in driving the direction of the sessions (Kahn & O'Rourke, 2005). The tutor therefore becomes a facilitator, not ‘teacher’ within this context (Whowell, 2006). The student led learning within EBL involves the students all working together, including forming smaller sub- groups (3-6 students) to take on specific group activities. This usually leads to the whole group achieving more as ‘tasks’ can be divided equitably between the group, so that all of the students are sharing the responsibility for the quantity and quality of the ensuing discussion and learning achieved, as well as finding evidence to inform their contributions to the group effort (Gough, 2008; Hutchings, 2007; Hutchings, 2006).

Kahn and O'Rourke (2004) suggested that some of the aspects of EBL include open ended engagement with complex scenarios that is amenable to a range of solutions, student led enquiry and alternative approaches, as well as facilitation of recognition of experiential learning. The students need to be encouraged to become self-aware of their own learning needs. EBL activities can be usefully employed to ignite student curiosity, encouraging students to actively explore and find new evidence. The primary responsibility for the learning rests with the student to analyse and present relevant evidence in appropriate ways, concordant with their individual responses to the issues being considered.

Seminars are integral to both higher education and the pre-registration nursing curriculum, so the students are very familiar with that format. In contrast EBL can be viewed as a more open, enabling and student led approach, wherein the students can be far more directive towards as well as participative in their
learning. EBL sessions alongside clinical placements are an established element of the current curricula represented within this research, so the students quickly acclimatise to this alternative format. However, attendance at EBL can be low and inconsistent. Indeed, the student attendees can be challenging to convince as to the absolute necessity and educational value of the EBL approach. This may be amplified by the situating of this EBL during practice placements, which the students tend to prefer to theory input. There is therefore pressure on the nurse educator/ EBL facilitator to identify innovative solutions to this with the ongoing establishment of stimulating and creative learning opportunities.

Through refining ways of working effectively with their peers, the students can find that the EBL sessions reinforce their capacity to learn effectively from each other and engage in shared reflection, as they also learn to work with each other more actively (Gough, 2008; Hutchings, 2007; Hutchings, 2006). The openness of the approach can feel uncertain to some students who prefer a didactic approach (Hutchings, 2007). Recognising the need to respond effectively to such concerns reinforces how important it is that experienced educators, well able to facilitate, are employed to encourage full student engagement with the sessions. Therefore, the facilitation should stimulate the learning rather than dominate it (Gough, 2008). Facilitation within EBL can be viewed as a form of empowerment of the students, which can reap multiple benefits from embracing this approach to their learning (Kahn and O'Rourke, 2004).

All learning time is precious in the context of professional education and this research has explored how the new trigger could create an enhanced learning experience for the students, which reinforces how the impact of the EBL could be optimised. All adult nursing students also need to complete an extensive list of learning outcomes throughout the undergraduate programme. This can often be experienced by the students as a very pressurised and challenging time particularly in the third and final year. The EBL sessions are an opportunity for the students to critically consider many of the learning outcomes in a synthesised and evaluative manner. Full awareness of the extent of the learning outcomes has been an influential factor in determining which fictional film titles were
selected to better enable focused consideration of those issues. An important example of this connects with the NMC mandated European Union requirements involving specific learning objectives related to mental health, maternal health and care of the child. The capacity for either the NHS or the independent sector to offer clinical placements in paediatric, maternal health or mental health settings for adult nursing students has been eroded due to finite placement capacity. The EBL sessions have therefore now become the alternative scenario to enable the achievement and assessment of the EU requirements as a necessary response to placement shortages. The priority attached to these learning outcomes would influence some of the topic choices within the EBL sessions and therefore fictional film titles that were selected.

The students need to feel encouraged and motivated to recognise the importance and relevance of the EBL to their learning, whilst also being facilitated to be more reflexive and share their opinions within a supportive environment. (Gough, 2008; Hutchings, 2007; Hutchings, 2006). As adult learners, especially when preparing to become health and social care professionals, students need to be prepared to be more independent learners. This process involves the building up of both resilience and confidence, in order to contribute toward the preparation of students who once ready to be registered as nurses can cope with the demands of the role. There is also the need to prepare students for a future wherein they can to engage in continuous professional development throughout their professional careers.

1.3 The rationale for the research

The rationale for this research hinged on exploring creative ways to motivate students to engage more with the learning opportunities offered within the EBL sessions included within that curriculum. One of the motivations for undertaking this research was therefore the intention to enhance the quality of the group discussions within EBL, which had previously been quite a struggle to achieve on occasion. The facilitator going in to the EBL classroom should have a broad, extensive and varied repertoire of resources to draw upon. This research has
enabled the addition of evidence based and effective resources to my repertoire of teaching 'tools', both real and virtual.

EBL in the context of this research is referred to as Supervision of Learning Days (SoLD). This approach is analogous to a new concept called the ‘flipped classroom’ (Smith, 2017). There is enhanced emphasis on preparation for the sessions, student-led in-class activities, with the facilitator as resource. Constructivist learning theory has acted as a source influencing the development of student-centred approaches. The methods can be described as student-activating, powerful learning environments, in which the learning should be collaborative and cooperative (Baeten, et al. 2010). Whilst the term student-centred is not always clear or uncontested, the many permutations of method connect in aspiring to foster deep learning and understanding. It can be argued that student-led learning pedagogically, philosophically and politically extends the aspiration to work in a student-centred way. Deep learning can be interpreted as meaningful learning, contextualised and connected, argued to lead to enhanced student performance (Chotitham, et al. 2014). Although it is recognised that none of these concepts are uncontested, this does combine to offer persuasive evidence regarding the pedagogical and philosophical importance of supporting learning collaboratively and non-hierarchically with students.

This research offered opportunities for both educational and practitioner development. I was able to enhance the impact of the EBL as well as develop as a facilitator. This was therefore an important study in terms of my development as a nurse educator, focusing on the inclusion of creative pedagogies.

It is also critically important that there are opportunities developed enabling students to step outside of the placement experiences and reflect on their experiences with their peers; from a ‘safe’ distance. I wanted to explore how creative pedagogy could support and enable that. Learning within clinical placements is often described by students as being more interesting learning for them compared with classroom based sessions, such as lectures, seminars and EBL. However learning in practice is also often described by students as being physically and emotionally demanding.
Students should also gain enjoyment from their learning and have some ‘fun’ within it (Alexander, 2005). The students need to optimise all learning opportunities, encompassing both theory and practice in order to critically reflect upon these experiences with their peers (Santo, 2011). This learning can be enhanced by creating and integrating diverse learning opportunities that stimulate interest. Whilst endeavouring to keep the curriculum ‘alive’ and vibrant, the use of multimedia resources (applied within Copyright constraints), as applied within this research demonstrates how fictional film can make an important contribution (Santo, 2011; Simons and Hicks, 2006). This study has sought to add to that evidence base in the future.

1.4 The structure of the thesis

This thesis adopts a conventional structure for reporting qualitative research. Chapter One provided the background to the research, the context for EBL and an indication of how novel pedagogies can enhance learning within this.

Chapter Two presents an overview of the literature search. Upon commencing this research, there was a representative range of published literature identified as relevant to the use of fictional film being applied within non UK healthcare curricula. A comprehensive literature review was conducted. The gaps in the knowledge within the literature raised the challenge as to why this was lacking within adult nursing curricula, particularly within the UK. This reinforced the need for this research. Literature revealed that fictional film is more usually applied within medical education internationally (notably within psychiatry), as well as within mental health nurse education in the US. There were some key and well-presented papers, including research that promoted the worth of exploring how the use of fictional film could contribute additional valuable triggers. This understanding can be situated within a broader consideration of the social and cultural importance of storytelling, which can be harnessed within narrative pedagogy and ‘Cinemeducation’.
Chapter Three reviews the philosophical stance taken within the research, considers the methodology applied, charts how the research design enabled the research questions to be addressed, provides detail of the selected data collection methods and outlines the analytical approach. Participant observation, guided group discussions and open-ended semi-structured interviews, were used to collect data.

Chapter Four presents the findings and considers the five emergent themes arising from this process. These themes were: authenticity; memorability; relevance to learning outcomes; emotional engagement; and maintaining a safe, yet creative learning space.

The findings are discussed in Chapter Five and structured in terms of re-considering the data in terms of Cinemeducation, Narrative pedagogy, the social and cultural importance of story-telling, as well the nature of fiction, memorability, relevance to learning outcomes and emotional preparedness. This chapter draws together a synthesised understanding of how this exploration of the use of fictional film within EBL can be further applied within nurse education.

Finally, Chapter Six concludes the thesis considering the implications for nurse education and educational practice, as well as the contribution of the research, leading to recommendations that this approach should be further explored and advanced in the future. This chapter importantly includes reflection on my development as a nurse educator. In a context where student experience and their feedback is highly politicised, there are compelling reasons to consider the importance of educational research like this study which seeks to make an innovative contribution to learning.
Chapter Two
Literature Review

2.0 Introduction

This chapter reviews the literature that informed this research and identifies gaps in current knowledge. Gray (2014) argued that a literature search can be defined by already established research questions or facilitate the refinement of research questions. The latter approach was used in this study. Evidence relevant to emerging sub-questions, including philosophical underpinnings and methodological good practice, was also reviewed. It was particularly important to consider the types of sources emergent across subject disciplines. This enabled the identification of sources of expertise and patterns of research collaboration, including key authors who work together on relevant topics, for example, Diekelmann and Ironside, who were both influential with regards to the work of Santo (2011). The chapter first considers the overall search strategy prior to discussing the main themes arising from the review. The penultimate section critically considers wider pedagogical issues, before making concluding comments regarding the range of relevant evidence identified.

2.1 Search strategy

This research was concerned with an exploration of the impact of using fictional film in adult nursing education. Three main areas were therefore considered in the literature search – healthcare education, pedagogy and the use of creative media. A broad and overarching review of the literature commenced in 2010, which was incrementally advanced through to 2015. This process started within health and social care online databases, followed by searches within the subject areas of education, media studies and the creative arts. The first broad approach taken was an overarching review, which facilitated synchronous searches of multiple disparate content sources with one query or set of search terms. Therefore, multiple databases were included, thereafter arranging and keeping
records of the results from the various databases. The initial federated searches revealed large numbers of ‘hits’ which included a significant number of extraneous articles, which needed to be filtered out. Databases included CINAHL, BNI (with their focus on nursing) and Medline. The approach taken was replicated in the education and media studies databases including ERIC and BEI. Both published and grey literature was identified, including thesis collections. This process continued with online databases, offering most papers in full text format. Inclusion and exclusion criteria were established related to relevance, currency, authenticity and credibility of evidence. The most recent evidence was reviewed first to establish currency, including older seminal work as it emerged as significant to several topic areas. There was therefore no prescriptive cut off point in terms of publication date. The origins of the papers were reviewed to identify areas of expertise, collaboration and ongoing research. Primary studies were prioritised in order to establish an appreciation of the breadth of research evidence, as well as gaps in knowledge. In addition, several theoretical and practice-focused papers and book chapters were identified.

An exploration of Enquiry Based Learning, practice focused learning and problem based learning in healthcare education was undertaken in order to refine an understanding regarding how this pedagogy might be facilitated. This was necessary in terms of ascertaining the experiences of theorists and researchers working in similar educational areas. This part of the process helped to shape the plans for the data collection that started in 2012. Keywords included ‘film’ and relevant synonyms (for example, ‘cinema’ or ‘movie’) combined with the word ‘fiction’ but not ‘non-fiction’. This revealed two further search terms, ‘feature films’ and ‘Cinemeducation’, the latter being a neologism introduced by Alexander et al. in 1994. ‘Cinemeducation’, incorporating elements of cinema, medicine and education, refers to the pedagogical use of movies to help teach (Lunlertgul, et al. 2009) and, thereafter, it became an essential additional search term that led to an enhanced number of useful sources. Truncation was helpful in initially keeping the early searches broad as words tend to alter mid- or end-stem as they become plural or singular or with a change of tense. Porter (2009) referred to this strategy as the start of the construction of the funnel shaped search. The technique of
Boolean logic was used to refine the electronic search. In this, the use of ‘and’ was very important because the focus was on ‘fiction’ and ‘film’, as well as including terms such as cinema and media. Boolean logic was applied to the combination ‘film’ and ‘teaching’, to which can be appended, ‘not’ and ‘non-fiction’. Following this search, literature from the fields of medicine (Alexander et al., 2012; Subodh and Tandon, 2011; Lunlertgul, et al. 2009), pharmacology (Persson and Persson, 2008), clinical psychology (Edwards, 2010), public health (Lenehan, 2009) and business management (Huczynski and Buchanan, 2004) as well as nursing (Santo, 2011; Raingruber, 2003) was examined. Literature specifically relating to the pedagogical use of fictional film was sought. This search also found no apparent published research within UK adult nursing education regarding the pedagogical use of fictional film. A review of the methods employed within the reviewed papers informed the design of this research.

The Critical Appraisal Skills Programme (CASP) (online) tool offers a structured yet flexible approach which focuses appraisal of the research methodology, facilitating examination of the fit of research design with stated aims. The CASP tool provides an appropriate range of critiquing questions that can be adapted to apply to a range of research and secondary sources. The abstracts were initially examined to establish whether there was clear articulation of research aims and appropriate methodology, as advocated within CASP, prior to making a decision as to whether the literature was of a satisfactory quality to proceed to full review. Once this had been established, the full appraisal was conducted, critiquing the main elements of research design. The review was further strengthened by screening the reference lists of the key sources, sometimes referred to as ‘snowball searching’.

In order to identify unpublished research, general internet searches were also conducted. This enabled searches for theses to be made within the University library of the research setting, The Open University library and the British Library. This identified one thesis exploring the creative use of narrative pedagogy within
adult nursing education (Santo, 2011) which, although relevant, did not exclusively focus on the use of fictional film.

2.2 Themes arising from the literature review

This section considers the themes identified in the review: the creative use of fictional film within educational settings, narrative pedagogy including narrative learning, teaching as a form of enchantment, story-telling, reflective practice and the EBL approach.

2.2.1 The creative use of fictional film within educational settings

The search identified thirty-one papers specifically related to the use of fictional film, written from the perspective of medical and allied healthcare education. Of these only four were empirical research (Lumlertgul, et al. 2009; Masters, 2005; Alexander, 2005; Raingruber, 2003). Sixteen papers presented broader professional discussions related to educational practice and nine presented specific pedagogical experiences of using specific films that focused on the potential of enhanced learning experiences, again sharing practical experience (Bhatnagar, 2009; Hanlon, 2009; Hesse, 2009; Keltner, 2006; Magos, 2009; Parry, 2009; Powell, 2009; Segal, 2009; Weidi, 2009). Two further papers discussed the emotive impact of fictional film (Golstein, 2009; Yahnke, 2005). Their literature reviews indicated further sources to follow up (e.g. Subodh and Tandon, 2011; Alexander, et al. 2004).

2.2.1.i Empirical research

Although the use of fictional film as a trigger to student-led discussions is gaining incremental attention within educational practice, the research available to support this innovation is very sparse as evidenced by the identification of only four empirical studies. Having innovated the term and approach,
‘Cinemeducation’ in 1994, Alexander (2005) reported on a mixed method survey he conducted with graduate students to evaluate this method through analysis of previous students’ learning experiences. Masters (2005) ascertained the perceptions of two Bachelor of Science pre-registration nursing classes who were viewing fictional films as an alternative to some of their clinical placement hours in a psychiatric mental-health nursing course. Masters asserted that fictional films had previously been successfully employed in other educational settings to teach both undergraduate and post-graduate students, noting that this approach was applied far less within nursing. Masters (2005) and Raingruber (2003) conducted their research with students in real and virtual classrooms, exploring the advantages and disadvantages of using fictional film in these settings. Masters’ (2005) questionnaire appears to have been mixed method whereas Raingruber’s (2003) study was phenomenological. Lumlertgul et al. (2009) conducted a pilot study to explore the impact of Cinemeducation on the development of professionalism within the medical classroom.

All four studies (Lungertgul, et al. 2009; Masters, 2005; Alexander, 2005; Raingruber, 2003) included small samples of students, carefully analysing the participants’ verbal and online feedback and acknowledging the educational responsibility to engage the students’ interests as well as the potential emotional impact. Alexander (2005) sent a postal questionnaire to 64 graduate students, including both closed and open questions, using a Likert-type scale, achieving just over 60% (n= 39) response rate. Of these eight responses were disqualified due to lack of detail and recall, evident from the data of the earliest cohorts. Although the response rate was understandable for a study of this kind, Alexander (2005) expressed disappointment that more students did not reply and that seven of those who did attend had apparently forgotten their experience of Cinemeducation.

Similarly, Masters (2005) used a 12-item, seven-point Likert-type scale to capture students’ beliefs about the value of films to their learning experiences within two different classes. Raingruber (2003) reviewed the conventional use of literature to
engage student interest and proposed the use of fictional film as the next logical step to innovate within her teaching, which was then investigated within her study. Raingruber's (2003) research was integrated into the online learning in which the students were engaged, so data collection was also conducted online. Conducting a phenomenological investigation, Raingruber (2003) recruited ten female students and one male student and invited them to watch four out of seven proposed film titles. The students could therefore choose the films, which was followed by online discussion, structured by the use of focused reflective questions. The students could then comment on the advantages and disadvantages of the approach within that online forum. Lumlertgul et al. (2009) also offered the students the option of five films, which were made available within five sequential seminars, thereafter followed by student-led discussion, structured by the use of focused reflective questions. The film titles were also subsequently made available to students in class in order for the students to continue to engage with the suggested resources. All four studies used a thematic approach to data analysis, conventional and concordant with the predominantly qualitative research designs.

All four studies presented results that were compelling enough to justify recommendation of the Cinemeducation approach. Alexander (2005) reported that most respondents found the use of fictional film useful, memorable and they described positive learning experiences when this approach was included in their course. In Raingruber's (2003) study, student responses revealed that fictional films were considered to be effective overall as part of a teaching approach but also they had certain limitations, some of which she briefly reviewed. The students suggested that the use of entire films could be time-consuming. There was the need to be carefully selective of the titles chosen. However the students were clear that the approach promoted reflection within classroom discussions, enabling the development of empathy. The students considered that this was an effective way to introduce ethical issues; to them it felt safe because the experience viewed was ‘one step removed’. There were similar findings in the Lumlertgul et al. (2009) and Alexander (2005) studies.
The impact of watching the films was felt by the students to be engaging, interesting and often emotional. Lumlertgul et al. (2009) also found that the students involved considered that the process increased their capacity to engage with critical thinking and moral reasoning, whilst the Alexander (2005) study indicated that the development of empathy was better enabled. Masters (2005) had identified that the students in her classes had found the approach to be entertaining, useful and, therefore, they highly rated the experience. Masters (2005) concluded that using films to teach aspects of nursing was a creative way to engage students in learning.

All of these studies were clearly presented, supported by relevant literature and demonstrated predominantly positive findings related to the educational potential of the approach. This evidence indicates that the use of fictional film can make a valuable contribution to professional education, though currently being far more established within medical education than other fields of healthcare provision. However the small number of studies, small sample sizes and lack of any studies related to adult nursing education is a limitation. Caution is therefore needed in the consideration of this evidence base, which is indicative rather than generalisable.

2.2.1.ii Non-empirical studies

The references in the four key papers considered in the previous section provided further sources of expertise in this area of practice. For example, Raingruber (2003) identified ten further references that were followed up to gain a wider understanding regarding exploration of this particular pedagogy. Snowball searching in this way revealed further literature, such as Shapiro (2005), Rosenstock (2003) and McKee and McLerran (1995). Although these were older sources, this process facilitated a historical perspective on the topic.
Whilst this literature was not empirical, it represented significant professional discourse on educational practice development, revealed innovation in the use of creative pedagogy and media, as well as presenting critical thinking related to practical experiences it presented. Persson and Persson (2008) considered pharmacology education, and the potential for fictional film to enhance the pedagogy, describing the experiences of searching for creative ways to enable the teaching of social and cultural issues. Their intention was to combine the ‘ancient art’ of story-telling with a modern scientific way of teaching. Reviewing this in the context of wider literature, built on established academic interests in the potential of stories as a medium of social and cultural teaching, I interpret resonance in these assertions relevant to the seminal work of Warner (1994b) on the sociological significance of storytelling. My reading of this part of the literature review was pivotal in reinforcing my pedagogical interest in narratives as initiators and anchors for learning. Persson and Persson (2008) further discussed that many commercial films have what could be termed ‘moral fables’ embedded within them, an issue recurrently discussed by Warner (2006) in her book ‘Phantasmagoria’. The social and cultural importance of storytelling is an important theme within this thesis because learning is a social phenomenon in itself.

Lenahan (2009), a main protagonist of Cinemeducation, presented, in this expert opinion article, the practical experiences of using fictional film to prompt discussion on the topic of intimate partner violence. Lenahan (2009) had worked extensively on the topic with Alexander (2005; 2012) and contributed to the Cinemeducation volumes. Lenahan (2009) suggested a broad and extensive range of film titles ranging from classic titles like ‘Gone with the Wind’ through to the use of Disney animations, for example ‘Beauty and the Beast’ and, for this reason, the paper was helpful in the early stages of my research. The paper articulately and persuasively presented the approach of using fictional film to draw out exemplars of human behaviour directly relevant to real practice. It concluded that “intimate partner violence is a pervasive public health problem that affects individuals, families and communities” (Lenahan 2009, p. 196). As this is a safeguarding issue, this connects with an essential learning outcome in
the adult nursing curriculum and, therefore, Lenahan’s work influenced the specific choice of safeguarding as one of the priority issues considered within the EBL sessions discussed later in this thesis.

Edwards (2010) presented a specific practical, educative approach taken when teaching psychoanalysis, considering the potential of using fictional film to develop personal self-awareness of the impact of self in the development of therapeutic dialogue with clients. This expert opinion/professional practice paper described the practical experiences of teaching psychoanalysis whilst using the film ‘Morvern Callar’, and examined how students were taught about counter transference, which involves the analyst’s emotional reaction to the subject contribution or alternatively the redirection of therapist’s feelings toward a client. Within ‘Morvern Callar’ there is a specific example of that facet of human experience portrayed by the central character within the film. Edwards (2010) considered the challenges in using a fictional film resource, which in this case involves considerable plot complexity, describing how skilful facilitation is required to reinforce the precise trigger from within the fictional film source in order to meet both learner expectations and the learning outcomes. This example highlights how this approach is a creative rather than easy option. Edwards (2010) described how the use of fictional film could convey key messages, including in verbal and pre-verbal ways, providing a bridge to practice. This connected strongly with the motivations for this research, revealing evidence of why using film has impact in an educational context. Fictional film constitutes a powerful medium, facilitative of communicating intense emotional and preverbal states, helpful in enabling students to better understand certain key psychoanalytic concepts through direct emotional experience (Edwards, 2010).

As the originator of the term ‘Cinemeducation’, Alexander et al. (1994; 2005; 2012) have demonstrated a long-standing interest in this approach and prolifically discussed using fictional film within medical education. Two edited volumes relating to the practical application of Cinemeducation have been published (Alexander et al., 2005; Alexander et al. 2012) and proved to be the most
important non-empirical research influencing my study. The first Cinemeducation volume (Alexander, et al. 2005) included a brief overview of Alexander’s research, amongst a much greater emphasis on practical advice and examples of suggested structured teaching plans. A flexible seminar structure is advocated, better enabled by extensive lists of ‘approved’ films that are appropriate to this pedagogy. It is argued that cinema fundamentally brings its audience into the world it has created and presented to them (Alexander, et al. 2005). The second Cinemeducation volume is a far more expanded volume, including further practitioner reviews of using fictional film to facilitate learning related to emotional, ethical and sociological issues, considering intimate relationships and emotional disorders, amidst a very wide range of practice-related topics. In this second volume, Alexander et al. (2012), considered how fictional films can contain stereotypical portrayals of complicated human scenarios and complex human reactions, yet all of this can be ‘harnessed’ effectively with educational settings. It is the student analysis of various perspectives that enables new insights (Alexander et al., 2012). Both Cinemeducation volumes were highly influential during the lifespan of this research and will continue to be so during the implementation of the findings (Alexander et al., 2005; Alexander et al. 2012).

Authenticity was an issue similarly considered by Bhugra (2003), who discussed using film for cultural competence training within psychiatric professional education. Byrne (2003) reviewed Bhugra’s (2003) contribution, critiquing this paper regarding the use of multiple rather than one exemplar fictional film which could be employed to prompt students to consider issues such as psychosis. Byrne (2003) suggested that there was a risk inherent in using only film to explore cultural complexities, where caricature and stereotypes might be exemplified. The inauthenticity of fiction is critically considered as a risk that can be managed (Byrne, 2003).

The range of pedagogical application within professional healthcare higher education presented in the non-empirical literature was clustered around medical education, particularly psychiatry and this could have implications for
transferability. However on a smaller scale there are also examples of research and non-empirical literature in mental health nursing such as Raingruber, (2003) and with regard to professions working alongside medicine (Edwards, 2010; Alexander, 2005) which enhances confidence in the transferability of the approach. The practical, structured advice regarding the pedagogical use of fictional film illustrated was an influence on the approach taken within this research. These sources promoted the advantages of using fictional film to prompt students to critically consider human factor issues and client centred, ethical care, whilst openly presenting some of the challenges.

2.2.2 Narrative pedagogy

One of the major components of fictional film is the story presented within the film. Therefore using fictional film in EBL is a form of using stories pedagogically. It was appropriate to look more broadly at the theoretical positioning regarding the pedagogical use of stories. Narrative pedagogy involves using stories as effective triggers or learning prompts for educational purpose, harnessing the power of these narratives to engage and enhance student discussions. Narrative pedagogy differs significantly from traditional teaching methods in its open, creative and reflective nature (Ironside, 2006), which is flexible and student centred. More traditional pedagogies can involve the teacher transmitting propositional knowledge to the students didactically, which is deemed to be less relevant in current higher education. It is contentious how much education is or can be retained when it is teacher-driven (Rogers, 1969).

Narrative pedagogy has been described as a:

“research-based interpretive phenomenological pedagogy that gathers teachers and students into converging conversations wherein new possibilities for practice and education can be envisioned” (Ironside, 2006, p.479).

Whilst Ironside’s (2006) specific claim regarding her selected research approach may be debated, the pedagogy fits with social constructivism, which links well with the philosophy of EBL. This helps to reinforce an impression of how all of
these elements ‘fit’ together to contribute a compelling case for the use of creative approaches.

The seminal contribution of Diekelmann (1993) on narrative pedagogy has been influential over a long period. Diekelmann has recurrently advocated that narrative pedagogy develops explicitly within the collective experiential learning between practitioners who share their stories openly and honestly together. It is both an approach and a way of thinking. Much of Diekelmann’s (1993, 2003) work was based on Heideggerian hermeneutic interpretive phenomenology which respected and drew upon the experiential learning of both teachers and students who contributed to developing this approach. Narrative pedagogy in this respect views humans as self-interpreting and perpetually creating, striving for the meanings in every situation, which fits well with reflexive EBL. Diekelmann (2003) recognised the critical need for transformative dialogical learning between teachers and students, arguing for an empowering curriculum revolution. Narrative pedagogy presupposes a mutually beneficial teaching-learning process between students and teachers, a true partnership approach, concordant with EBL, although not necessarily as student-led. The concepts of teaching and learning are very different processes; however it is important also to evaluate their inter-dependence as well as their complexities (Vandermause and Townsend, 2010). Thinking and working phenomenologically, the primary concern within narrative pedagogy is the communication of meanings between people, past, present and future (Vandermause and Townsend, 2010; Ironside, 2006). Dahlberg et al., (2003), Scheckel and Ironside (2006), Vandermause and Townsend (2010) as well as Santo (2011) are primary proponents of narrative pedagogy. Santo (2011) linked this with scenario-based learning that could be successfully used within lectures and seminars as well as simulated practice learning situations (Santo, 2011). These authors vividly describe the use of real or constructed stories, incorporating narrative pedagogy into their vision of how education should be, predominantly situating this within EBL approach.
Within narrative pedagogy there is both implicit and explicit acknowledgement of the value of experience, challenge and the potential for transformation within any encounter between people. This further connects with reflective ways of thinking and stimulates questioning regarding how reflexivity is provoked, a further strand which will be explored later in this chapter. The educational imperative surfaced through this literature, and of equal concern to this research, is how to effectively develop mindful and critically reflective practitioners, reinforcing the need to progress professional practice in a holistic, reflexive manner. Narrative pedagogy differs significantly from more traditional didactic approaches. It focuses on the ‘lived experience’ (a phenomenological intention), is facilitative of affective learning, recognising how much this is highly relevant within professional education that aims to empower compassionate client-centred care.

The importance of the context, complexity and the emotional connection to learning is recognised and reinforced by the impactful presentation of stories (Alexander, et al. 2012). As one of the original motivators for this research was an exploration of how to increase the impact of the EBL sessions, this is all critically important. Scheckel and Ironside (2006) recognised the necessity to enable students to develop critical thinking skills, but challenged whether traditional educational approaches had the ability to deliver that. Scheckel and Ironside (2006) argued that narrative pedagogy offers enhanced opportunities for critical thinking, which they described as cultivating interpretive thinking. They conducted phenomenological research, involving forty-eight educators and eleven students via open-ended audio-recorded interviews, either face-to-face or via telephone conversations. The researchers were able to inquire into the motivation of the participant educators to be work in creative ways within their own classrooms, a similar process to Santo (2011). The research questions were designed to maintain an effective dialogue between interviewers and interviewees. The recording, transcription and overall data management were conventional and data thereafter were subject to interpretive phenomenological analysis (IPA). The analytical process considered recurring themes and paradigmatic cases. Indeed the study found that students reported that they had developed increased analytic and reflective knowledge and understanding,
embracing intuitive thinking. Exploring the evidence for a defensible qualitative research design, Ironside (2006) proposed that narrative pedagogy addressed limitations within conventional pedagogy, albeit exemplified by relatively small scale research. The open, flexible and enabling style of narrative pedagogy allows for creativity in a wide variety of ways.

Swenson and Sims (2003) have also written extensively on this topic, arguing that narrative pedagogy is an efficient way to reconcile the twin aspirations of incorporating scientific and aesthetic concerns within nursing curricula. Narrative pedagogy is considered to be both ‘multiparadigmatic’ and ‘multiperspectival’, explicitly embracing the complexity of harnessing complex story-telling within an educational approach, using the integrated nature of stories in ways that are conducive to facilitating insight into complex human experience (Ironside, 2006). Gazarian (2010) proposed that pedagogies incorporating the influence of multiple theories and diverse perspectives are essential within contemporary healthcare education, where the complexity of work and pace of change is unrelenting. This practice-focused paper was supported by a review of relevant literature, some of which is listed above and was followed by a more extensive literature review in 2014. Santo (2011), in her doctoral thesis, advocated that nurse educators need to acknowledge all of these complex aspects of learning. This can initiate significant learning, exploring ethics, theory-practice connections and dissonance. Thus this literature offers a theoretical foundation that further develops understanding of why the use of stories is well received and are impactful.

Gazarian (2010) suggested a variety of ways in which multidimensional stories might be conveyed through narrative pedagogy. The creativity can take the form of imagery, text, narration, music and film, all of which can be effectively used within EBL within higher education. Gazarian (2010) proposed that the context and relevance of the stories are critically important. Stories must be seen to be embedded in and directly relevant to the curriculum. Carefully selected fictional film can offer complete stories, which is very engaging to the senses. In 2014,
Gazarian followed this work with a study, as well as a more extensive literature review evaluating the effectiveness of a new narrative pedagogy assignment that sought to advance ethical awareness and capacity to engage with advocacy. Forty-four nursing students participated in this quasi-experimental non-randomised study. The results were significant in demonstrating an enhanced perception of student advocacy following achievement of the new narrative pedagogy assignment.

Within nursing education, the main goal of narrative pedagogy is achieving an understanding of the complexities of the caring sciences, processes of care delivery and the rationales for action, along the way to becoming a nurse (Diekelmann, 2003). Diekelmann (1993) stated that what mattered most within nurse education was not merely emphasis on learning outcomes (although they are important), but rather making the time to talk to students in ways that encourage their critical thinking about wider issues and specific practice. The problem potentially embedded within a focus on the didactic delivery of set curricula is that traditional methods of teaching can achieve and sustain the very inequalities which the educational process seeks to address, an aspect that Santo (2011) also reflects on at length.

Professional education, including nursing education, is potentially more meaningfully delivered in an open and questioning manner rather than in a didactic way (Enikő, 2013), which can be linked back to the work of Socrates. This leads into a compelling argument regarding the need for what Diekelmann (2003) referred to as a caring dialogue, really listening to what students say they want to learn about rather than just telling them what teachers think they need to learn, a further justification for the EBL approach. As the students' progress beyond the first year, embracing a student led approach in seminars can gain momentum and impetus, as demonstrated in the Supervision of Learning Day (SoLD) sessions.
Thinking more broadly and historically, narrative pedagogy encapsulates several philosophical frameworks including pragmatism and social constructivism. Pragmatism is grounded in the work of Dewey (1938), wherein the educational experiences must be in accord with the best interests of the learner in order for the learning to be meaningful to them and therefore used to construct and reconstruct experiences of the past, present and future. Again links to a social constructivist approach can be highlighted. The narrative is a root metaphor that hypothesizes that people often think in narratives, a ‘hook’ that can be harnessed for positive educational effect (Warner, 1994b). Therefore, formulating education to make judicious use of stories helps people to make sense of the world. Anecdotes, critical incidents and case studies have all been longitudinally used within nurse education and the use of narratives logically follows (Santo, 2011).

As narrative plays such a pivotal role in socialisation and culture, shared stories are engaging (Mott, et al. 1999), thereby contributing effectively to the student learning experience. Hobbs and Davis (2013) reviewed previous studies, aiming to achieve greater insight into the impact of the narrative approach. Hobbs and Davis (2013) proposed that:

“Narrative-based pedagogies have the potential to evoke a personal response in the learner, a response that is aesthetic in nature, meaning that a value-judgement is placed on the experience by the learner” (p.1290).

One of the challenges considered within this research and evident within the literature review has been considering the use of fictional stories and whether they have resonance with realistic scenarios. Developing insight into fictional representations of human experience might be considered a safer option because they are not real. This has led to opportunities to consider contentious, complex and challenging scenarios, with a view to linking this to current and future clinical practice experience (Alexander, et al. 2012). The open and student centred facets of EBL consolidate the environmental conditions in which narrative
pedagogy can flourish (Ironside, 2006). Learning with and from narratives can be viewed as an approach which is explicitly important within practice based education because of the necessity of considering complex client scenarios and problem solve a range of appropriate professional solutions. Therefore, narrative pedagogy has been presented here as a flexible, responsive and creative means to frame dialogues within the classroom, enabling critically important learning conversations (Gazarian 2010; Vandermause & Townsend, 2010 Ironside, 2006). This well-crafted and persuasively defended approach was significant in influencing the direction of this study, as well as reinforcing the philosophical position.

2.2.2i Narrative Learning

Goodson (2010) suggested that narrative learning is impactful because of its capacity to be creative. Whilst life might often be future focused, it is better understood when situated within the context of past and present (Taylor, 2006), again connecting with a social constructivist position. Learning from ‘complete’ stories encompasses what has gone before in order to better prepare for the future (Goodson et al. 2010). These authors, influenced by Kierkegaard, concur that stories are fundamental and intrinsic to human experience, which connects also with the work of Warner (1994a; 1994b; 2006; 2014). It is argued that many aspects of human life can be understood more fully through fictional narratives, which are resonant of, yet transcend human experience. Of course the narrative approach can include personal stories, as well as people’s stories, which can be understood and explored alone or compared with similar experiences embracing of diverse experience. Personal stories can be situated within the learning as a foundation from which important ideas are shared in what may feel like a very ‘natural way’. This is because stories are delivered in a familiar way; they have a pattern, context and complexity. Later in this thesis, it will be evident how all of these threads are pulled through in the EBL sessions. Narrative cognition can be defined as thinking in a scenario based way; Bruner (1990) argued that people have two modes of thought or types of cognition, paradigmatic cognition (related to theoretical and propositional knowledge) and narrative cognition. He proposed
that narrative can be asserted as a distinct and very human way of thinking about the world, which sets the foundation of understanding why this approach can work educationally.

Goodson (2001, p.8) defined narrative cognition in the following way:

“Narrative cognition is a process through which we can understand the temporal and structural coherence of an individual situated story”.

By understanding the structure and context, as well as the function of narratives, the sociological and psychological importance of storytelling is reinforced (Goodson, 2001). This further indicates a reason why stories can ‘hook’ the audience in and this is therefore a further strand of importance to this research. Clark and Rossiter (2008) proposed that stories better surface meaning from experiences. Learning in this way in adulthood is a multifaceted process, integrated with past and present life experience, as well as context. Stories are argued by to be powerful, specifically because they engage learners on a personally meaningful level. When stories are presented through film they are sensed and perceived in a different way. The immediate sensory impact reinforces the meaning and memorability (Clark and Rossiter, 2008). Within their research that sought to explore the educative use of film, this matters as it helps to explain the nature of the impact.

“The hearing of stories implies reception; the stories come from outside the learner and must be received and interpreted by the learner.” (Clark & Rossiter, 2008, p.65).

Narrative learning connects with narrative pedagogy in reinforcing the impact of story, contextualising the complexity of the experience and delivery of education. Approaches that better meet the learning preferences of students and are meaningful to them are particularly good choices for EBL within professional education (Kirwin and Adams, 2009). Within nursing curricula that prioritise both service user and carer involvement, methods aiming to develop sensitivity to the complex inter-relationships and life histories of people is worth exploring because it offers impact on so many levels. The literature on ‘Cinemeducation' provided a particularly strong theme which connects narrative pedagogy with the impact of multimedia resources.
2.2.3 The use of fiction

Considering the appropriateness of using fictional film for educational purpose should include critical evaluation of authenticity, relevance and the challenges posed by unrealistic portrayals. Professional education is important in terms of knowledge exchange, as a forum for socialisation between peers, and to raise an awareness of ethical issues through the use of reflection. Films can serve as representations of history with traces of authenticity, but whilst there may be elements of past realities rather than faithful translation, careful review of the material is essential to evaluate the extent of artistic licence being presented. This is one of the main issues that this research explored. Lenahan (2012) offered expert opinion regarding the use of ‘Reality TV’, springing from a consideration of using the film, ‘The Truman Show’, which she described as rising in popularity through audience identification with the main characters portrayed. The spontaneity and immediacy of human experience conveyed in ‘fly on the wall’ ‘reality’ drama may be explicable as entertaining to a social media saturated generation who are used to such recurrent streams of trivial information. However, the authenticity of at least some of these programmes can also be questioned in as much as the storylines appear to be extreme and could be staged, ultimately comprising constructed fantasy amplified for entertainment purposes.

The review of professional practice experience in the Alexander et al. (2012; 2005) Cinemeducation books revealed an extensive range of fictional film titles, including science fiction, animation and children’s films, all of which had been successfully used in an educational context. Many of these titles are not explicitly resonant of real life, though specific suggested lesson plans are shared that provide a clear and detailed rationale for each title. Amidst this wide diversity of titles the relevance of every film was considered by Alexander et al. (2012) in enough detail for the purpose of sharing these pedagogical experiences in an accessible form. This collection of work therefore provides a useful teaching resource which can be utilised within professional healthcare education, and translated into curricula which embrace creative methodologies. However where
this evidence falls short is the lack of empirical evidence apart from the Alexander (2005) survey. This collection of evidence was therefore of more practical than empirical value to the research in terms of informing the design of the EBL using fictional film.

The stories that fictional films convey can exemplify blurred boundaries between the real and imagined. This is a potential threat to authenticity. Alternatively this can be viewed positively as an opportunity to harness this new creative pedagogy within the classroom, refining new ways of learning, teaching and, through doing so, re-imagining practice.

Subodh and Tandon (2011) stated that: “portrayals are often larger than life ….they can convey and reinforce misconception” (p.302). However these authors found that such extreme and unrealistic ‘images’ could in fact generate vibrant discussion and critical thinking, which would also be explored within the data collection phases of this research. In order to further explore the reasons for the engaging nature of stories within an educational context, the concept of teaching as a performance also emerged as a discussion point in the earlier stages of this research.

2.2.4 Teaching as a form of enchantment

Teaching has been argued to be performance (Pineau, 1994):

“As a colloquial expression, the performance metaphor is readily acknowledged by seasoned educators who recognize that effective teaching often relies upon "theatrical" techniques of rehearsal, scripting, improvisation, characterization, timing, stage presence, and critical reviews” (p 4).
Advancing this assertion, teaching can be presented as a form of entertainment or enchantment, a trigger to development because it should engage and hold student interest effectively. Bettelheim (1976) and Warner (1994a) have contributed seminal exploration of the use of stories in both informal and formal education, a body of expert opinion which delivered a conceptual turn in the development of this research. This emphasis on the social and cultural significance of storytelling is useful in a consideration of, as well contributing partial explanation for, the use of stories within the classroom. The influence of Bettelheim (1991; 1976) on the intellectual review of the impact of myths, fables and fairy tales connects strongly with a reconsideration of the sociological and psychological significance of story-telling. Bettelheim’s (1976) view accords with the perspective of the poet Schiller, that deeper meaning resides in the telling of fairy tales as a forum in which moral teaching can be interwoven and be easier to be recognise. It is the status of story as a feature of social and cultural teaching that connects this research with the assertions of Cinemeducation as conduit to consider ethical issues, as well as considering multimedia styles of presentation that support storytelling.

The human desire to be entertained can be harnessed for educational purposes (Cairns, *et al.* 2003). There are many significant examples of messages being presented in entertaining ways to better persuade in wider social and cultural landscapes within and beyond the classroom (Warner, 1994a). The use of propaganda and media advertising are arguably examples of strategies being used to use multimedia to engage attention (Rutherford, 1994). Both Bettelheim (1976) and Warner (1994a) present analogous views regarding the variable functions of storytelling, including moral teaching, for example via the re-telling of fairy stories (indeed whether fairies appear within them or not). Both authors suggested that reality might be better understood by children through the prism of fiction and fantasy; future research can explore whether this translates to adult education. This would advance empirical evidence to support the assertions made within the Cinemeducation literature that this phenomenon is translatable to adult education (Alexander, *et. al.* 2012; Alexander, *et al.* 2005).
The enduring popularity of myths, fables and fairy tales is testament to the wide cultural impact, with mass appeal. Warner (1994b) draws on the assertions of Wallace Stevens, an American poet, who stated that visualising the actual world might become more visible to us through the contemplation of the fantastical, which offers further dimensions to consider in this study. In one of her seminal texts, Warner (1994b) argued that fairy tales are not passive or active, as their offering is ‘optative’, thereby opening up further opportunities of what might be, and perhaps mapping out the volatile nature of experience. The significance of storytelling connects with shared mores, morals and informal teaching, extensively reviewed more recently by Warner in her recent book ‘Once Upon a Time’ (2014). All of these forms of story-telling can raise moral dilemmas, surface both general and individual concerns and, in doing so, stimulate reflection.

Warner’s (1994a, 2006) work presents significant consideration of the story as the vehicle for socialisation, cultural and moral teaching. In this context, it is important to hold on to the idea of professional socialisation being analogous to other socialisation processes. A significant implicit facet of this approach is that stories are presented in ways which are ‘audience friendly’ and therefore easier to absorb, understand and to retain. Fundamentally, in subtle ways, such stories imply causes and consequences from certain courses of action. Warner’s significant contribution to understanding the importance of story-telling has been influential on my research, and building on these insights I have sought to explore how the informal capacity for stories to facilitate learning can be transferred into formal teaching.

It is relevant in an educational context to extend this consideration (Warner, 1994b; 2006; 2014) and draw this theorising into the world of fictional story telling more broadly, exploring how film media has harnessed story telling in its own distinct form of art which can then be utilised for educational purposes. The films used in this research were pithy insights into real life, yet with key messages regarding morality interwoven throughout them. The research sought to explore how these approaches can be effectively threaded through professional education. Fictional accounts translated into film media have made such forms of storytelling even more accessible, further raising the challenge of
the variable importance of authentic and inauthentic accounts (Alexander et al. 2005; Alexander et al. 2012). Filmmakers have taken on the mantel of modern day storytellers and narratives have moved into a different and exciting phase wherein the use of enchantment is extremely powerful, full of curiosity, wonder and potential (Warner, 1994b; 2006; 2014).

Warner (2006) extended the debate regarding the social and cultural impact of stories to consider the use of film as an art form that is capable of explicit insight into its capacity as a medium to shape and influence human experience. As part of the audience, the individual may react to fictional film on many levels. The characters involved are fictitious and yet often appear authentic, even when caricatured. Ken Loach films, for example ‘Kes’, ‘Carla’s Song’ and ‘Raining Stones’, have a reputation for including ‘gritty’ political commentary on social issues of great concern. This can be interpreted as a modern equivalent of moral teaching through the use of story. Warner (2006) compared the messages inherent in more modern stories with stories in antiquity, including recurrent themes such as conflict across gender, racial, political and religious boundaries, which can be traced in Loach’s work. Mass media communications have become a dominant theme through which the world is represented in visually engaging immediate ways. Hence film is one of the vehicles that drives this phenomenon.

There is therefore a discreet collection of international academic research, as well as expert opinion, which suggests the position of storytelling as an explicit and implicit medium of socialisation, facets of which can be harnessed for education impact with narrative pedagogy. In the context of Higher Education, where meeting student expectations and holding their interest has never mattered more, this is clearly worthy of further exploration. This research has sought to add further empirical evidence to contribute to this important debate.
2.2.5 Reflection

Reflection is an important element of EBL, which can be drawn out through storytelling, both real and imagined. This was another main theme emerging from the literature review. Whilst an extensive professional commentary on reflection it is not the focus of this review key elements of how this fits with EBL are considered here. An expectation of reflection as a form of continuing professional development permeates through nurse education. This is mandated by the NMC (2015) as a feature of nurse education. Reflection as a form of cognitive ‘post-mortem’ is also an essential feature of EBL, enhanced with story-telling. Strong stories ignite the reflective approach (Santo, 2011).

Davis (2011) suggested that reflection should be an ongoing, dynamic process, in which the reflector can frequently engage with formal and informal educational opportunities. This must progress beyond incident recall and be challenging. Reflection can help the learner to identify areas of development, for example practice evaluation within the classroom can be a positive experience and is an essential element of EBL. There are opportunities to think about how the student can share this development with practice. Peers can learn from each other as they explore issues within the classroom, a form of non-hierarchical peer supported learning which can be referred to as group supervision or action learning. Whatever the preferred learning style of the learner, the student needs to encompass reflection into their practice because it forms an essential component of professional nursing practice (NMC, 2015). Meaningful and regular engagement with reflection enables double loop or transformative learning through contemplative self-evaluation (Davis, 2011). Critical reflection is therefore far more than ‘navel-gazing’ but is rather a mechanism to generate in depth knowledge and insight into the context of care (Taylor, 2006). Reflection can be an internal process through which students can reconsider how they acted and, through doing so, achieve an enhanced awareness of what informs and influences their practice (Schön, 1987). Reflection often starts with an uncomfortable feeling that a situation might not be quite right (Davis, 2011) and contemplation and a description of what happened. This can subsequently be
carefully reviewed in order for the individual to contemplate potential future challenge and opportunities for practice development. Reflection can be contemporary (reflection-in-action), retrospective (reflection-on-action) or proactive (reflection-for-action), as considered in detail by Taylor (2006). Individuals can make a choice as to which reflective approach to employ, depending on their current circumstances and individual learning preferences. However the process can be fluid and intuitive as an alternative to a structured review of practice experiences. Critical incidents can be shared by students, reviewed openly and critiqued in depth within EBL sessions linked to practice, which is an ideal environment for reflection. This approach encourages group involvement and reflective learning as there is time, skilled facilitation, as well as energy within the room informed by the practical experiences students want to share through their stories from clinical placements. Exploration of exemplar and memorable stories from and connected to practice can challenge and alter an understanding of a particular area of practice.

Students can share their stories from practice, including critical incidents. These shared narratives can be reviewed openly and critiqued in depth. EBL sessions linked to practice are an ideal environment for shared group reflection. The EBL approach encourages group involvement and reflective learning through skilled facilitation. As well as having sufficient time within these sessions to engage in critical reflection, there should be enthusiasm to learn and creative energy within the room. Focused on their practical experiences, students often want to share these through recounting their stories from clinical placements. Exploration of exemplars and memorable stories both from and connected to practice can challenge transform understanding of various critical incidents.

Within EBL students can be encouraged and supported to be fully involved in the planning, managing and evaluation of their learning, thereby furnishing their curriculum with experiential learning. This non-hierarchical pedagogy focuses on the needs, interests and talents of the learners, aiming to sustain their engagement in the sessions. There are numerous approaches to facilitate
effective reflection, including models to structure reflection (Johns, 2006; Atkins and Murphy, 1993; Gibbs, 1988). Reflection involves a self-questioning approach (Davis, 2011), often making a cognitive shift from recalling events through to contemplating moving forward to developing in the future. Within narrative pedagogy shared reflection can involve a 'listening dialogue' (Diekelmann and Diekelmann, 2009) within group situations, wherein important connections can be made between thinking through and vocalizing change.

Taylor (2006) discussed the enduring rationale for reflection within nurse education and its contribution in developing emancipated and critically reflective nurses who can proactively learn from their experiences. For students to be creative and autonomous in practice, strategies need to be in place to ensure that the fundamentals of nursing provide a foundation to support future development. Students need to feel supported and empowered to explore a range of safe and effective practices and EBL is a sound platform to enable this. Shared reflection can be an uncomfortable experience as it is often associated with problem solving, decision-making and emotions. This is another trigger to emotional responses that needs to be managed by the EBL facilitator. Issues such as occupational socialisation, which students encounter in clinical placements, can occasionally mitigate against evidence based practice and cause associated distress when correct policies and procedures are not followed (Kneafsey, 2000). Cathartic learning conversation can support the development of resilience amidst these challenges. Fictional stories can be employed as an effective strategy to start these challenging conversations. Therefore, reflective group exploration of narratives within nurse education can be used to uncover the complexities of clinical experience. A range of practice problems including rituals and challenging behaviour can be more fully explored and critiqued using this approach.

Occupational socialisation is a phenomenon which students encounter in clinical placements (Melia, 1987). This social phenomenon can occasionally constrain the progress of evidence based practice and cause associated distress for students when correct policies and procedures are circumvented (Kneafsey,
Cathartic learning conversation effectively facilitated within EBL can support the development of resilience amidst these challenges (Santo, 2011). Fictional stories can be employed as an effective strategy to start these challenging conversations (Alexander et al. 2012; Santo, 2011; Raingruber, 2003). Therefore, reflective group exploration of narratives within nurse education can be used to uncover the complexities of clinical experience. A range of practice problems including rituals and challenging behaviour can be more fully explored and critiqued within creative well facilitated EBL.

The advantages of using stories within reflection include the almost limitless scenarios that can be subject to shared cognitive review, considering links between theory and practice. This approach also facilitates the development of the novice through to expert over time (Benner, et al. 2009). Reflection can further facilitate the creation of caring communities and caring practice within an educational setting (Gazarian, 2010), which the EBL described within this research sought to achieve.

Primarily this research focused on the process of using fictional film, but it is also important to consider that this process occurs more broadly within an adult education context. Therefore fully appreciating this application of EBL, the next section includes some broader pedagogical considerations which will be briefly discussed.

2.3 Broader pedagogical considerations arising from the literature

This research was situated within a wider theoretical context that grounds it in relevant educational theory advocating for student centred learning, which contextualises the philosophical position of EBL. In an EBL scenario, learning and teaching can be viewed as co-occurring, where the learning is considered to be mutually beneficial to students and facilitators (Diekelmann and Diekelmann, 2009). There is now of course increasing political and professional pressure on
teachers to adapt to learner expectations, amongst recurrent assertions that their interests should be taken into account (Kandiko, 2013).

2.3.1 Learning styles

There are several theories regarding the existence of learning styles and/or learning preferences, although this is not uncontroversial. A seminal example, still in current use in education, is Honey and Mumford (1982), who suggested that there were four distinct learning styles or natural learning preferences. These included the Activist (the current, open minded active learner), the Theorist (the problem-solver), the Pragmatist (the experimenter) and the Reflector (the deep thinker). It is therefore theorised that the learner needs to understand their learning preferences and thereafter use this insight to capitalise upon them and seek out learning opportunities that match (Honey and Mumford, 1982). It would, however, be too prescriptive to imagine that, even if influential learning preferences exist in reality, they are fixed. Later reconsideration of learning styles has suggested that these different preferences may exist but deliberates how those predispositions may change over time, depending on the context of learning, and can adjust with learner experience (Coffield et al. 2004). Coffield et al. (2004) suggested that educators need to develop clear insight into how their students prefer to learn in order to better facilitate their learning. Through encouraging students to become self-aware of their own learning preferences, the educator can facilitate opportunities to share the responsibility to capitalise on it. Students may then seek out learning opportunities that match their preferred style of learning. This can require sustained study skills support within seminars and EBL.

This literature presents compelling opinions that enquiry based learning, including problem based learning, collectively informing a strong pedagogical foundation within the professional education of nurses. Alongside EBL, narrative pedagogy can enable multiple strands of critically evaluative deeper learning, better enabling impactful reflection (Santo, 2011). At point of entry to the undergraduate
nursing programme, many students believe themselves to be activists and indeed
tend to self-disclose a preference for learning in practice. Due to NMC
requirements, the skills of the reflection also need to be blended into this profile
as part of ongoing professional development (NMC, 2015; NMC, 2010). Every
individual student enters the classroom with their own context, based on their
background, past experiences, expectations and preferences (Coffield, 2004).
For each of them their progress through their studies will be a unique experience
(Davis, 2011). The classroom needs to be a valuable and engaging place to be,
offering a diverse set of opportunities to meet a variety of learning needs.

2.3.2 Concentration spans

Professional education, including nursing, occurs within a higher education
environment where students are rarely compelled to attend sessions on campus.
As discussed earlier in this chapter, it is therefore essential to encourage student
engagement through the provision of interesting educational opportunities. There
are variable estimates regarding the adult attention span in a learning situation,
which may well be mediated through specific circumstances and individual
differences (Wilson and Korn, 2007). Chaney (2005) argued, on the basis of
significant practical teaching experience, that attention spans may wane after
twenty minutes, an estimate that may vary for several key reasons including topic
relevance and style of presentation.

Chaney’s solution was to:

“interrupt each session at exactly the top of the hour to show a two-to
three- minute video clip, to conduct a short hands-on activity, to show
tangible items, to chat…” (Chaney, 2005, p.1).

It has been argued within this research that multimedia resources such as film
can extend that attention span through the use of a resource that is appealing to
the senses. The use of fictional film can be regarded as a way to engage, to
entertain and to stimulate attention. Regarding the accessibility of knowledge in
the twenty-first century it is debateable how much a didactic pedagogy can be as
impactful when information is so readily available online. Newman (2010)
considered a complex scenario in which he offered his expert opinion regarding the impact of the advancing use of media. He described a debate that considers the impact of new media, including television, which it has been proposed may intermittently encourage or truncate the human attention span. Newman (2010) presents a case which is critically evaluative of the latter perspective, considering the case of young children. There have been a significant number of children’s programmes made that are designed to ‘fit in’ with the (alleged) shorter attention span of children, but it is proposed that ironically this media might contribute to this phenomenon over time. The use of multimedia resources may indeed encourage and sustain attention at any age and the popularity of fictional film, which may span 2-3 hours, is testimony to this. Chan et al. (2010) stated that, traditionally, paper cases are used as ‘triggers’ to initiate learning in problem-based learning (PBL). However, the use of fictional film is suggested to be an optimal medium which, although unreal, can convey authentic representations of almost limitless examples of life complexities, proven to enhance the student experience through research (Alexander, 2005).

2.4 Conclusion

The extensive literature review progressed during most of the lifespan of this research, informed both the research aim and development of the research design. The literature also contextualised the study by considering broader issues related to nurse education, such as the requirement to critically reflect on practice. The literature reinforced a dominant impression that EBL is fertile ground in which to innovate professional learning. EBL can be appropriately incorporated within nurse education as it is inclusive of the cognitive and affective domains of learning. As discussed in this chapter there are many examples of approaches taken where fictional film facilitated effective, engaging learning conversations related to many issues including culture (Figge, 1977), behaviour (Persson & Persson, 2008), safeguarding (Lenahan, 2009) and mental wellbeing (Edwards, 2010). A common thread promoted in the empirical evidence and professional opinions shared in the literature, encouraged the use of fictional film
as a prompt to share stories and critical reflections in which students can collectively rehearse their responses to a variety of challenging scenarios.

Moving from a consideration of storytelling in a wider sense, which may be grounded in real experiences, this research explored the specific use of fictional narratives. Narrative pedagogy was asserted as one of the core concepts within this research as it can support exploration of a broad range of nursing learning outcomes in a critically reflective way, importantly including reviewing the evidence base that underpins clinical practice. This often involves unpacking the complexity of human experience through the sharing, understanding and exploring of the stories (Ironside, 2006; Diekelmann, 1993). As a result of the literature review as it developed over time, the capacity for fictional film to engage and enthuse creative learning and critical reflection became a dominant theme. The social and cultural significance of storytelling has been considered, as has the evidence advocating the use of fictional film, exemplified in the research and development of Cinemeducation, and further broadened by a review of narrative pedagogy and learning. This body of evidence identified an established, well supported presentation of considered expert opinion and research, particularly well presented by Alexander et al. (2012; 2005). Most films also have soundtracks which can enhance the emotive nature of watching them, an aspect of the film viewing experience connected to the emotional impact of music. This was theorised to connect with dual learning theory or dual coding theories (Paivio and Csapo, 1973), which argues that humans process information, both verbally and visually, and the use of visual images, including video, can therefore enhance the impact of teaching presentations.

However there were limitations as the research was predominantly located in mental health nursing and medical education. The literature search did not identify any UK research that specifically explored the use of fictional film as a trigger to enquiry based learning within the field of adult nursing education. Thus significant gaps in the literature were revealed, particularly within the area of nurse education in the UK, reinforcing the opportunity for this research to
contribute new knowledge. This research is concerned with using creative resources to stimulate learning that is not only relevant and interesting, but also memorable. There is a relative lack of empirical evidence on this topic compared with levels of expert opinion. As primary/empirical research is conventionally regarded as the most significant evidence to develop and inform innovation in practice, this study aims to contribute to what is currently a small evidence base. Within the next chapter the methodology that was used within the study is explicated.
Chapter Three
Methodology

3.0 Introduction

This chapter presents the study aims, research questions, sampling approach, methods of data collection and mode of analysis. This research focused on one broad aim, to explore whether the use of fictional film could trigger effective Enquiry Based Learning (EBL) within undergraduate pre-registration adult nursing seminars. The research gathered data from two groups of third year nursing students regarding their experiences of the use of fictional film as a new trigger to their EBL, with a potential sample size of sixty participants. Through careful consideration and following the completion of a pilot study, I identified that taking a qualitative approach was as an appropriate design choice for this study. This chapter also explores ethical considerations including trustworthiness and confidentiality, alongside my role as practitioner researching within their own classrooms. Having completed a small initial pilot study in preparation for the main research, the overall design was refined to develop the research.

Throughout the research a qualitative approach influenced by phenomenology was maintained regarding how the research was being developed, including considering the specific questions to be asked (Maggetti, et al., 2013). Groenewald (2004) suggested that as well as transparent articulation of the focus of the research it was also important to consider the research paradigm relating to the researcher’s ‘worldview’. These are some of the key theoretical influences upon the research. A well informed awareness of this theoretical background influenced the development of the research approach, enabling a clearer strategic vision.
3.1 Research paradigm

Influenced by an interpretivist paradigm, this research has been developed taking on board a relativist ontological perspective. The research progressed with an explicit recognition that reality is subjectively experienced by those participants involved in social learning situations including educational settings. The researcher’s world view needs to be clearly acknowledged and the paradigm ‘adopted’ therefore influences both the methodology and methods. It is the choice of paradigm that contextualises the intent, motivation and expectations for the research. An open, inclusive and flexible qualitative approach is explorative. Maggetti, et al. (2013) considered challenges in terms of identifying and labelling research approaches, in a context where descriptions of design choices can be fluid as the landscape of qualitative research evolves. The research aimed to achieve an accurate representation of the whole process, which was not constrained by any specific expectations of outcomes.

The research therefore aimed to openly explore precisely how the fictional film impacted on the subjective learning experiences of the participating adult nursing students. The overall research aim was to explore the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL. There is a gap in knowledge in relation to the use of creative pedagogies with adult nursing education in the UK, which this research has sought to contribute towards.

3.2 Research questions

Underpinning the overall research aim to explore the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL, there were specific research questions. The appropriate research design is related to the nature of the research question itself, alongside epistemological and ontological concerns. There are many issues to consider when formulating a research question (Gray, 2014). These issues include patency, currency, credibility, relevance and interconnectedness between questions and sub-questions. The research questions in this study were feasible to explore because there was access to a range of student perceptions regarding the use of fictional film as a trigger to enquiry based learning. The research
questions led to specific considerations including whether this new trigger was positively received by the participants, viewed as relevant by them and how that learning experience might be emotive due the nature of the media. It was essential to maintain a ‘safe learning environment’, so within the familiar context of EBL, the creative and new elements of the new trigger was carefully planned and managed.

Therefore the following specific research questions were identified:

1. What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer educationally to the students’ learning experience?

2. What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer aesthetically to the students’ learning experience?

3. What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer emotionally to the students’ learning experience?

3.3 Methodological decisions

The research aim lent itself to a qualitative approach in order to explore in-depth the students’ learning experiences. This kind of approach is often chosen when the social, cultural and educational processes involved are important to understand. It is particularly useful when questions about the ‘how’ and ‘why’ of a particular phenomenon are being considered; therefore, adopting a broad explorative qualitative design was judged to be appropriate for the research.

Silverman (2013) recommended conducting research into subjects that matter on a personal or professional level, capitalising on the enthusiasm generated by genuine interest, and this was the case with this research. The research has explored and, through doing so, refined the use of a new creative pedagogy, exploring the impact of carefully selected fictional media films on the EBL that progressed through the data collection phases. In doing so, this process involved problematizing the unfamiliar. This was crucial as I was researching my own
personal professional practice, so familiar territory was being explored. This needed to be reviewed with a fresh perspective and an open mind. The experience of the teacher as researcher can lead to a complex profile of creative output, developing the practitioner in a variety of ways. A fundamental aspect of my development as a researcher was harnessing intellectual curiosity and looking far more closely at the phenomenon with a specific purpose in mind.

The research questions helped to set realistic boundaries, contributing to facilitating focus, structure and direction for the research. Once plans for the specific qualitative approach had been refined, with the progress of a pilot study, the methods of data collection were then considered. Conducting semi-structured open ended individual interviews was a clear choice for this research. Early into the formation of the research design, employing both observation and group discussions was also considered to be valuable.

The literature review had indicated several considerations regarding the use of fictional film in an educational context and cited many recommended film titles, with clear practical rationales for choosing them. There was therefore both theoretical and practical evidence within the literature which influenced the research design. For example, Alexander (2012) had stated that the use of fictional film could increase the strength of student observations and enable enhanced debates through the critiquing of both authentic and inauthentic accounts viewed. To manage the process for the use of fictional film within EBL facilitation I distilled some ‘good practice guidance’ from within the evidence. From the literature review there were some key elements of practical advice regarding fictional film selection (Alexander, et al. 2012; 2005), preparedness (Lumgertlul, et al. 2009), student support (Edwards, 2010) and facilitator responsibilities (Santo, 2011). All of these issues were considered and fully addressed throughout the research. Essentially taking a structured approach refines the research process and this has strengthened the study.
3.4 The rationale for taking a qualitative approach

Distinct from the researcher who believes that human experience can be described in objective terms, the constructivist or ‘interpretivist’ researcher asserts that to understand the world and the meanings inherent within it, the researcher must inevitably make interpretations. Critical within this approach is a fundamental respect for the uniqueness of all individual experiences and inquiry in this context needs to be recognise that. The qualitative researcher appreciates the individuality of “first-person, subjective experience” (Schwandt, 1998, p.223). Achieving insight into the individual experience is a goal.

Within this research, the subjective nature of student learning experiences has been recognised as a feature of the student participation. This inquiry has explored their individual and collective learning experiences, as described by them and through doing so captured their individual perspectives. The depth and detail related to the participant experiences and the meanings they attach to those experiences are of critical importance.

3.5 Research design

Creswell (2008) identified three main components within research design: paradigm, approach and methods of data collection. The paradigm in the case of this research is social constructivist. This philosophical worldview is appropriate in terms of seeking understanding of the place of work and learning, exploring participants lived experiences and exploring meaning within them. There is also the selected strategy of inquiry, in this case broad qualitative exploration, which then directs choices of methods of data collection. This research has been developed around an exploratory and interpretivist approach, inquiring into the potential for creative pedagogies to enhance EBL. The main stages of the research process are represented in Figure 1:
Figure 1: The Research Process

The five (5) steps in the research process:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step 1</th>
<th>Step 2</th>
<th>Step 3</th>
<th>Step 4</th>
<th>Step 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Locating and Defining Issues or Problems</td>
<td>Designing the Research Project</td>
<td>Collecting Data</td>
<td>Interpreting Research Data</td>
<td>Reporting Research Findings</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Higher Education Provider</th>
<th>Qualitative</th>
<th>Guided Group Discussions</th>
<th>Track change commentary annotating all interview transcripts</th>
<th>Thematic description and discussion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Need for curriculum innovation</td>
<td>Interpretive Observation</td>
<td>Thematic data analysis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploration of creative pedagogies</td>
<td>Sample selection Semi-structured open ended interviews (fully transcribed)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need to advance reflexive learning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The research design was influenced by the specific subject of inquiry, alongside appropriate rationale and evidence emergent from relevant literature. This
process led to selection of three methods: observation, guided group discussions and semi-structured open ended interviewing.

The primary focus of this study was an in depth exploration of one innovative new type of ‘trigger’, embracing creative pedagogy. This new approach was introduced within the practice focused EBL of two groups of third year undergraduate nursing students, within a University. As an academic delivering professional education, I have an interest in the quality of the EBL embedded in pre-registration nursing curricula and, in particular, the learning experiences of pre-registration adult nursing students within the enquiry based learning (EBL) environment. Although these EBL sessions occur on campus, they are nevertheless part of the practice focused part of the programme, which is why the data collection was undertaken in the classroom.

3.6 Sample

3.6.1 Sample recruitment

The EBL sessions were run alongside every clinical placement within every practice module throughout the undergraduate nursing programme. The students are expected to attend all of these sessions; however whilst their attendance is monitored there is no specific sanction applied for non-attendance at the EBL. Attendance can therefore be partial. The students were approached during the first EBL session of the year for each of the two third year groups (one group in the September 2011 cohort and one in the January 2012 cohort). It was fully discussed with the groups how their participation within the research would involve them being fully involved selecting relevant film titles from the titles available in the University library and watching the films they chose in full. It was presented to them that this would be a process that would be observed by myself, and would thereafter involve them participating in guided group discussions afterwards. The groups were assured that there would be facilitator support offered throughout. The students were all informed that they would also be invited to take part in subsequent individual interviews. It was reinforced that their contribution to the study was voluntary throughout and would be valuable
throughout the process, whether or not they engaged in the individual interviews. Notification of the proposal to conduct this research in the first session enabled two weeks’ notice of commencement of the study, as the EBL sessions were held fortnightly, giving the groups the opportunity to consider their participation. This was considered to be an acceptable period of notice, allowing the students time to read the participant information pack that was given to them on that first day and then make a fully informed decision as to whether they wished to be involved, albeit in the knowledge that they could withdraw from the study at any time. It was essential that all students within the groups were prepared to participate in the use of the new trigger, observation and guided group discussions for the research to be conducted within their EBL as the sessions were set within their timetable. Both groups, including all of the students, were happy to participate. If any of the students had declined the EBL would have progressed using conventional triggers and different groups would have been invited to participate in the research. Twelve students agreed to be individually interviewed, one-to-one, subsequent to the group discussions.

3.6.2 Sample characteristics

The plan had always been to aim for two EBL groups to participate in the research, with the rationale to include more than one EBL group to enable comparison across the two groups. There are normally 15-30 students in an EBL groups in this setting, all of whom needed to consent for the research to go ahead within their group. As I facilitated at least two different EBL groups every year, even if one group had decided not to participate, the research could still have proceeded because another group could have been approached at a later date.

In the event two different groups of third year adult nursing undergraduate students, the first two groups approached, did agree to participate in the research. There were 25 in Group 1 and 24 in Group 2. The groups were a mix of ages, ranging from 20-35 years of age. Both groups included male and female students, though predominantly the latter, in line with the norm for nursing students on adult programmes. All were completing their final year practice
placements and attending EBL alongside this throughout the year. Group 1 were from the September 2011 cohort and Group 2 were from the January 2012 cohort. All students consented to participate in the new learning experience of watching the new fictional film triggers within their EBL and to be part of the guided group discussions. However not all students volunteered to be interviewed individually and this was fully respected. I had anticipated the potential that a smaller sub-group of participants would be able attend interviews due to timetable constraints due to the students being out in practice for that period of time. In the event, twelve of the students agreed to be interviewed, eleven females and one male.

3.7 Preparation for data collection

Building on the information sharing, reinforced by the participant information pack, the students were all fully prepared for the data collection phase by discussions held at the start of the first EBL session (the participant information pack is included in Appendix I). Group expectations and ground rules were negotiated, drafted and applied as was usual for this type of EBL. Throughout data collection I regularly emphasised the voluntary nature of their participation and sought their feedback as to how they felt that the research was working out.

The EBL sessions always commence between 9.00-9.30, as negotiated with the students. Apart from the timetabled room, there should be choice facilitated at every stage and participation in the research was designed to support that sense of choice. Apart from the first session, each session should be part planned through preparation as arranged with the students in the previous session. This helps to offer the students choice in what topics they want to focus on and how. In EBL the students select the learning outcomes/topics that they want to prioritise for every session, so setting this agenda also formed part of the preparation for the research. The students are invited to conduct ‘round robin’ group reflections on clinical practice experiences for the first hour. Thereafter the focus on the learning outcomes is the ‘anchor’ which grounds the creative work which can weave around this to engage the students. The students were aware that offering the option of watching fictional film was attempting to expand that
choice for them. The students were invited to select from several fictional film titles, which in itself stimulated a lively discussion. The rationale for the research was explained and we reflected on the use of non-fictional media in the past, which had worked well. A detailed teaching plan is included in Appendix V. I viewed myself as a resource, offering an expanded choice of educational opportunities, with just as much to learn from this experience.

3.7.1 Selecting the film titles

The literature review prior to the data collection phase had helped to identify guidance regarding the diverse array of film titles that could be used to support this type of educational experience. I was very familiar with all of the film resources selected and could therefore prepare the students for what they were about to watch. I also asked the students to keep in mind the questions included within their participant information pack and make notes during the time that they were watching the episode, wherever convenient. I was therefore myself prepared for the use of any of the film titles that the students selected. The fictional film titles were made available through the University library in order to enable the resources to be used within the group learning scenario (in recognition of Copyright Laws). The extensive catalogue of fictional film made available by the library for this research provided a rich resource to stimulate discussions regarding all of the learning outcomes relevant to the practice module, including professional accountability, inter-professional working, safeguarding and ethics.

The same fictional film resources were available for both EBL groups and these were therefore offered to both groups. All selected titles linked up with the learning outcomes relevant to the year three practice module. The students within the first EBL group elected to watch some of the episodes from the ‘Bodies’ series, and in the second EBL group, they chose the ‘Ladybird, Ladybird’ film, as well as the ‘Bodies’ series. ‘Ladybird, Ladybird’, directed by Ken Loach, is a gritty, realistic drama that considers important social issues including domestic violence, safeguarding the vulnerable and child abuse. It is explicitly violent in places and makes for challenging viewing throughout the film and this could
initiate quite emotive responses from a range of students (perhaps influenced by their own histories and life or work experiences). The use of such a title therefore needed to be carefully considered. Safeguarding vulnerable adults and children, considering the nursing role in supporting those individuals who experience domestic abuse, are essential learning outcomes for nursing students to achieve. The students were clear as to the rationale for selecting this title, which they justified in terms of considering the registered nurse’s responsibility regarding ‘safeguarding’. I spent some considerable time preparing them for the experience of watching this film.

‘Bodies’ is arguably one of the most authentic fictional accounts of healthcare represented as drama and as such also constituted an appropriate choice. This film is an award winning medical drama, which was created by Hat Trick Productions. The writer, Jed Mercurio, loosely based the series’ content on the book by the same name that was published in 2004. ‘Bodies’ was screened on national television in 2006 and thereafter made available on DVD. The two series comprise 16 (60 minute) episodes and one 90 minute finale. For the purposes of this research this is a significant resource, offering a broadly realistic insight into the world of clinical obstetrics and gynaecology. The students need to address learning outcomes related to maternity in the European Union Requirements. There were also very authentic representations of professional judgement and decision making exemplified throughout the episodes, from which core narratives and many transferable issues can be raised.

As the experience of watching the films was part of the research process, I negotiated with students regarding whether to play the films in part or in full, during which they would be observed by myself. There was sufficient time to facilitate either way as the students were timetabled to the practice module EBL days for between 3-7 hours per session. The film runs for 102 minutes and the series spans two seasons, with a finale, so students were given the option of watching specific one hour episodes. The students were clear that any one of them could leave the room at any time and that there were resources on hand to support them should they feel upset and need to debrief after the event.
3.8 Methods of data collection

Having negotiated access to both groups of third year undergraduate nursing students through the relevant staff within my organisation and with dual ethical approval granted from both universities involved, data collection could commence. I had to counterbalance the roles of EBL facilitator, teacher and researcher, an important issue that is discussed in more detail later in the chapter. Each role brings with it specific responsibilities, in terms of meeting the student learning needs and risk managing the educational process.

The methods were semi-structured open-ended interviews, guided group discussions and observation. Alongside, and to support these methods of data collection, I made research notes. The use of multiple methods over an extended period of time helped to reveal patterns, consistencies and inconsistencies within the data. Diagram I, as represented below, outlines the linear process involved in the data collection phases.

**Diagram I: Data collection phases**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group One</th>
<th>Group Two</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>September Cohort</strong>&lt;br&gt;(25 students)&lt;br&gt;(Year 3) – 11 months EBL&lt;br&gt;11 months</td>
<td><strong>January Cohort</strong>&lt;br&gt;(24 students)&lt;br&gt;(Year 3) – 11 months EBL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Select Film Titles&lt;br&gt;Watch Film Titles&lt;br&gt;(Observed) – repeated twice = 4 EBL days</td>
<td>Select Film Titles&lt;br&gt;Watch Film Titles&lt;br&gt;(Observed) – repeated twice = 4 EBL days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guided Group Discussions involving all students in the classroom, with flip chart notes collated&lt;br&gt;= 4 EBL days</td>
<td>Guided Group Discussions involving all students in the classroom, with flip chart notes collated&lt;br&gt;= 4 EBL days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semi-structured open-ended interviews&lt;br&gt;(12 students)</td>
<td>Following the EBL and guided group discussions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.8.1 Observation

Observation was the first method used within this research, and therefore it is the first discussed. Within qualitative research, particularly where the researcher seeks to achieve direct exploration of the phenomena under investigation, observation is a recommended method to augment interviewing, further capitalising on the advantages facilitated by methodological triangulation (Holtzhausen, 2001). Such an approach can be additionally informative as non-verbal cues and actions are not always congruent with verbal responses and it was useful to observe for dissonance (Silverman, 2013).

Observation is an important method to achieve depth of insight into participant experience, although it is time-consuming (Gill, et al. 2008). Variations in levels of engagement with the method can be situated on a spectrum from full participation through to unobtrusive non-participant observation (Silverman, 2013). Precise placement on the spectrum of observation is influenced by the aims of the research, role of the researcher and potential level of access to the area under investigation, as well as the nature of the relationship with the participants. The researcher needs to examine taken for granted assumptions, aiming towards a fuller understanding of the social world under investigation.

I considered that open observation was a legitimate method to use within this qualitative research as it was located within the classroom where there is shared observation embedded within the group dynamic. Documenting observations can be problematic including what is specifically recorded, as well as who holds the power in that process. One of the major challenges with this method of data collection is how to capture the data, via digital audio or video-recording, or alternatively making observations notes. One solution is to film the whole interaction in real time. However this would have required the full documented consent of every participant within the EBL, even if they did not want to progress to being fully involved in the other data collection within the research thereafter. Rugg and Petre (2007) suggested that the use of a systematic activity log can be helpful. Making notes in this way I found that recurrent patterns of behaviour could be identified.
I was a participant in these learning experiences, as well as being the EBL facilitator. My role within this process was different from all of the participants. The individual student learning experiences were also unique. All of the students volunteered to be part of the process of watching the films, knowing that they would be observed whilst doing so. The method of observation can be potentially problematic in terms of influencing the process, and therefore this required careful consideration. I had previously familiarised myself with all of the fictional film titles. Within this study I wanted to blend in unobtrusively, observe the non-verbal cues of the groups as they watched the selected films. Once the ground rules for the groups had been established, the observation progressed from film viewing to subsequent group discussions. The advantage of familiarity with the groups was that I could establish an effective working relationship with them. It was important however to acknowledge the impact of observer effect, combined with the requirements of observing a group whilst they were watching a film, albeit in a darkened room to allow for clarity of the film projection. This required preparation and careful management. The observation was very valuable in contributing insight into the way in which the students engaged with the fictional film and how emotive the experience was.

I did consider asking the participants to keep learning diaries throughout the data collection phases. However the third year of undergraduate nursing studies is the most challenging, pressured part of the course, where a dissertation is being constructed alongside two very lengthy clinical placements. Therefore giving the students additional work to do in their own time would not have been a particularly considerate action to take.

3.8.2 Guided group discussions

Guided group discussions were also used effectively within the research. There is far less written on the method of group discussion in contrast to the specific method of focus groups and therefore there is not an extensive literature to provide guidance. However, Tuckett and Stewart (2004) considered the use of group discussions more broadly within nursing research, critiquing the strengths and limitations of the method. Key considerations include the conduct of the
researcher/observer, facilitation of dialogue, documentation of the process (including journal keeping) and careful recording of the process. There are parallels between the good practice applicable with group interviews and the EBL guided group discussions conducted within this research. These guided group discussions allowed for the collection of data with all of the participants together, including the times where smaller sub-groups were formed who were given the resources to record their collective responses immediately following the observed film viewing.

Gaining the voluntary consent of every participant involved was essential, as even those students who were not attending individual interviews were part of the groups watching the films and therefore taking part in the group discussions. All of the students in both of the groups verbally consented to discuss their experiences of watching the film immediately afterwards. This discussion method stimulated creative conversations about the fictional films that the students had just watched. One major challenge was to ensure that the discussion remained focused, which was then recorded as faithfully as possible within the field notes taken during the process. The students were often encouraged to ‘break out’ into smaller groups and to make their own notes, whilst facilitator notes were being made as well. The students collected together some of their thoughts and key words rapidly on flip chart paper to capture those data as quickly as possible. This was helpful in terms of completeness of data capture and these notes were also kept secure for future analyses.

All group discussions (24-25 participants per group) were conducted immediately following the viewing of the selected films. Following the full screening of the episode or film, the students had a short refreshment break and then returned to contribute to an hour working in 4-5 sub-groups of up to 6 participants, with A2 card, flip chart paper and flip chart pens made available for them to record their small group discussion (15 minutes duration) prior to contributing to the whole group discussion. (45 minutes duration). Several of the students volunteered to scribe these small group notes in order to allow me to continue to focus on facilitating the whole group. I did not have a set agenda or a series of pre-set prompts or questions for this particular phase of the research. Making notes on
the flip chart paper, the students were guided by the open prompts listed in their participant packs, asking them to consider whether the resource was memorable, recalling the film content and describing whether viewing it had been useful. The students commented on the appropriateness of the resource, their feelings about it, what they had learnt and whether the approach could be improved in the future.

3.8.3 Semi-structured open-ended interviews

Semi-structured open-ended interviewing is frequently regarded as the method of choice for qualitative research (Porter, 2008). This is due to its flexible approach, allied with appropriate boundary setting to focus both parties on the subject matter being discussed. Rugg and Petre (2007) described the interview as a ‘conversation with a purpose’, involving several core concepts. Interviews are interactive, involving a dialogue between the researcher/interviewer and the participant/interviewee. However most of the detailed conversation should be originating from the interviewee. Semi-structured open ended interviews involve a conversation that can last a considerable period of time and so there is the opportunity for both parties to engage with and relate to the other. It is therefore essential for the researcher to be able to manage their own verbal and non-verbal cues effectively as well as to carefully observe those of the participant, which may add context and complexity to the discussion. Silverman (2013) argued that individuals can attach contextualised meaning to their experiences within this method. I interpreted from these views and from later experience that researcher notes made alongside this process add enhanced context and layers of complexity to the discussion. It was also important that these interviews were conducted reasonably quickly after the group discussions, to maintain currency of data. Kvale (2006) considers key power dynamics and suggests that the interviewer only directs the structure of the process, through asking the questions. Then the interviewee should feel empowered to contribute all that they wish to say.

The plans for this stage as well as the prompt questions had been made explicit in the participant information pack. Twelve students (eleven female, one male)
consented, attended and were therefore interviewed. The semi-structured open-ended interview as applied within this research enabled open dialogue with all of these participants, which enabled a more in-depth exploration of their individual experiences of the new learning trigger. The individual interviews with the interviewees who volunteered from both EBL groups were undertaken a few days after the guided group discussions. Small meeting rooms or classrooms were booked specifically for the purpose of conducting these interviews privately and without distraction. Participants were given time to familiarise themselves with the equipment that would digitally audio-record everything that both interviewer and interviewee said within the thirty minutes span of the interview. The participants confirmed that they were comfortable with the audio-recording and recognised that the data would be kept secure.

This research was concerned with the exploration of subjective meanings, aspiring to achieve in depth insight into the individual perceptions of the participants. It was therefore important to ask questions of participants in a way that facilitates shared understanding, expansive and authentic responses. The students were very open to the dialogue facilitated by the interviews, providing responses that were concordant with data emergent from the other methods. The interviews allowed the time for expansive and detailed responses that explored the detail of the individual student experiences. This is certainly how the interviews felt, the prompts used had proved to be helpful in directing the discussions. The students appeared to be very enthusiastic to feedback on their learning experiences. These interviews were helpful in building on the other two methods, which were enhanced by having been generated from within a foundation of effective learning and working relationships throughout the data collection phases.

3.8.4 The interview questions

This research focused on the students’ experiences of employing the new learning trigger used within their EBL. The prompt questions needed to facilitate in depth consideration of those experiences, including exploring what happened
educationally, emotionally and ethically within the groups, specifically focusing on the impact on the learning.

The specific prompt questions used were:

*Describe the film that you viewed in your group…*
*Do you think that the film clip selected was appropriate to your learning?*
*How did the selected film clip make you feel?*
*In what ways did the use of fictional film impact on your learning experience?*
*What factors could have improved / made the experience more meaningful for you? Is there anything that you would like to add?*

These specific prompt questions were used to structure the interviews and enable a foundation of consistency across each of the individual interviews, whilst not constraining the flow of the discussion. This semi-structured process initiated and sustained the interviews, but in no way discouraged the interviewee from expanding on their answers.

There are clear ethical advantages to developing rapport and sustaining close personal working relationships to support the research process and ensure that all participants feel comfortable to contribute. Having taken an open, supportive and collegiate approach the research was strengthened by the retention of all participants through the observation and guided group discussions.

3.8.5 Triangulation of method

The observations conducted within the classroom enabled insight into the non-verbal cues emergent when the students were watching the fictional films. I could make notes on what their reactions were to the fictional film, as well as commenting on the structure of the process and whether this appeared to be working in the context of the EBL sessions. Data collected through the observations took the form of notes that I had made and therefore are my representation of what occurred. The guided group discussions were the first opportunity to gain insight into the perspectives of all of the participants within
both groups, as they all enthusiastically shared immediately following the film viewing. The notes that the students recorded through those group discussions were initially hand recorded by them, which I later transcribed in full. These were broad spectrum notes, often represented as ‘bullet point’ responses. The interviews then captured far more expansive responses, affording insight into detailed data contributed by the students who consented to participate in this final method of data collection. Each additional method led to more specific insights.

Triangulation of method within qualitative research is important in terms of enabling a fuller view of the phenomenon under investigation and enabling more complex, synthesised exploration. Triangulation in this context involved using multiple methods of data collection within a study with a view to produce enhanced understanding. This multi-dimensional approach could be viewed as a method for validation or verification of data. Alternatively triangulation of method can be employed to ensure that the data are detailed, robust, comprehensive and well-developed (Casey and Murphy, 2009).

3.9 Rigour

In qualitative research there can be no claim made to statistical generalisability. Alternatively the goal is theoretical generalisation, with findings that are transferable. The sample size used within this research was appropriate for a qualitative study. The use of two full EBL groups enabled data comparison between the groups, as well as data saturation, in terms of achieving sufficient participant responses to identify recurring patterns within the data. Qualitative research can therefore achieve trustworthiness and authenticity through successfully addressing the original research aim. An effective research design enables clear, thorough data collection, revealing a process that is underpinned with both integrity and veracity. Arguably this research was strengthened through being conducted within the classroom, which was a familiar setting to the participants. As this is the usual place of learning throughout the EBL, with groups staying together through the course, often with the same facilitator, this becomes a ‘naturally occurring’ learning environment.
3.10 Ethical Issues and research governance

Alongside compiling the ethical approval applications, prior to commencing the research I sought out Departmental approval to conduct research within the EBL sessions that I was scheduled to facilitate at that time. As an experienced academic, who was familiar to all of the students, I challenged myself regarding whether it was possible or indeed necessary to bracket off from all prior EBL experiences and engage in a distinct research process. It was important to faithfully observe, discuss and record and report on participant responses of their unique individual and collective experiences, in addition to my conventional facilitator responsibilities. However my positioning as researcher/educator also needed to be carefully counterbalanced.

Research ethics focuses primarily on the rights of the research participants, with responsibilities placed upon the researcher to conduct legitimate data collection in a thoughtful and secure manner. Following full applications submitted to the ethics committees within both higher education institutions involved, the research achieved full ethical approval from the University in which the data were collected and the Open University. This was viewed very positively as an important opportunity to consider and refine the plans for participant recruitment, consent, confidentiality and data protection.

The consent form was fully amended in line with the advice of the Chair of the Ethics committee within the host University and a copy of this was attached to the participant information packs. These packs were explicit regarding participant voluntariness, consent and confidentiality. Once ethical approval was granted, data collection within the research could commence. The participation of two EBL groups was carefully negotiated, progressing with two groups wherein all students consented to be involved in the group EBL, including the observation and guided group discussions. An information pack, as reproduced in Appendix I, was given to every participant two weeks prior to the commencement of the research. The participants were informed both verbally and in writing that they were free to withdraw from the study at any time. The processes for data capture, data transcription and data protection were made explicit from the very beginning.
and throughout the research process. The consent forms, once signed, were kept securely in a locked filing cabinet, within a locked office. The data were kept secure on password protected drives on the host University IT system.

Within educational research, where the teacher is also researching, it is important to carefully and recurrently consider the researcher position in the ‘insider/outsider’ dimension. Being reflexive throughout the process is therefore paramount. Reflexivity enables the review of ‘taken-for-granted’ values and the consideration of the impact on both practice and research (Pellatt, 2003). Reflexivity refers to “having an ongoing conversation about experience while simultaneously living the moment” (Coffey, 1999). It is necessary to reflect on how the researcher affects the research and vice versa. There is also the need to avoid over-identification. I initiated this research with prior knowledge and understanding, yet with the intention to question my practice at every stage. Researching within one’s own area of work involves counter-balancing both the familiar and the new. I was an insider as a teacher within the classroom but also an outsider as a researcher because this was a new role that I was bringing into the room. The researcher may find that participants expect that the research will produce knowledge that improves the lives of their group (Kanuha, 2000). Of course one of the motivations for this research did include an aspiration to improve the quality of the educational experience in this type of EBL as lower attendance and levels of engagement had been an issue. However I also had to bracket off from previous experiences of this type of EBL in order to engage with this research from a fresh perspective. There is a dual responsibility here, to carefully tune in to the individual experiences of participants whilst also ‘bracketing off’ from personal experiences (Maykut & Morehouse, 1994, p. 123).

In the spirit of here was an explicit responsibility to put safeguards in place to protect the student participants. Within the guided group discussions there was the need to consider a different approach to maintaining confidentiality, as well as anticipating that interviewees may disclose more in a one-to-one conversation. When the researcher is present within the research this affects the social dynamic and participants may feel judged. A further potential complication can be
that the researcher can over-identify too much with the participants and this can affect their judgment.

There is the need to carefully and recurrently reflect on whether the researcher in their own classroom is perceived by participants to be in a powerful position, because ignoring that could lead to unconscious abuse of position. Therefore the researcher in this context has to carefully present themselves in an enabling rather than influential manner, which also involves care with the language used during the entire process. There is also the responsibility to faithfully represent the views of all participants and present marginalised voices. Reflexive consideration of the power relationships between researcher and participants is a means to mitigate the risks of bias. The researcher must reflect on the capacity for explicit bias to impinge upon the research and maintain an open mind. There is also the need to explore any pre-conceived ideas. However these challenges are approached, it is critically important for both insiders and outsiders within research to ensure that participants are carefully consulted and kept well informed regarding the progress of the research, including how their data feed into that. For example participants can be offered the opportunity to receive a summary of the findings and the option to comment on the analysis so that they are explicitly aware of how they could remain involved throughout the research. (Hayfield and Huxley, 2015).

### 3.11 Data analysis

Creswell (2002) acknowledged specific variations in the application of analytical procedures, and presented a series of generic steps involved in the analysis of qualitative data. Data analysis includes the thorough review, deconstruction and reconstruction of data. This process aims to transform understanding of what the data are revealing through carefully reviewing and ‘breaking down’ elements of the data. Accurate description of all data is the first stage of this essential process and lays the basis for careful analysis. There should be detailed review of all contributions from the research participants, although comparable views need not
all be necessarily quoted to avoid unnecessary repetition. It is essential to consider exactly what the data reveal and the context in which they emerged. Thick description pays attention to contextual detail. Within interpretive qualitative research, data analysis must extend beyond description of data to consider context, concepts and the interconnections between them. Silverman (2013) advocated extending beyond the identification of individual units or themes to envisioning the connections between the units and therefore to considering how they fit together. Data analysis can commence as soon as data start to be collected and continues throughout the data collection phases. The depth and detail inherent within qualitative data requires an analytical process that carefully extracts the most pertinent and informative elements from within the data. This can be done by filtering through the data, allowing the most pertinent elements or patterns of the data to surface. This can be termed ‘fracturing out themes’ which exemplify those core elements.

The data collected within this research emerged from the three methods and was illustrative of participant views, both individually and collectively. As an essential part of this research process I needed to be integrally involved at every stage of collecting and considering the data. The observation method was recorded through my notes based on the observations. This commentary created a foundation on which to reflect on both the process of using the new trigger and whether the prompt questions would be appropriate. The guided group discussions included hand recorded data that I transcribed as statements and conceptual maps using Word software. The interviews were audio recorded in full and transcribed. Transcription in itself can be viewed as a potentially subjective process, one of the key early stages within analysis and worthy of tracking through a careful audit (Markle, et al. 2011). All data were reviewed in full several times, as well as being annotated as the data were analysed thematically. All interview transcriptions were annotated using track change comments, again using Word software. Each step in the analytic process helped to explore details, surface patterns, reinforce emergent themes and achieve data saturation. Data saturation was deemed to have occurred when data revealed recurrent words, phrases and other elements, such as non-verbal responses.
These structured steps were incorporated into the specific approach to the data analysis within this research. I completed all transcription of data personally. Interview recordings were reviewed in full several times before, during and after transcription. Once I had transcribed the data I thoroughly read through each transcript on several occasions to take on board the entirety of participant responses. Manual data analysis was a clear choice for this qualitative research. This process extended beyond full transcription of the data, noting any additional non-verbal or verbal cues within the margins of the data transcripts. It was particularly helpful to have the whole digital audio recordings kept available to enable listening to the interview conversations more than once, even after the data had been fully transcribed. Digitally recorded audio data enables the absorption of the entire conversation, inclusive of some of the complexity of interpersonal communication, for example, tone of voice, some verbal cues and pauses. All of these constituents of the process facilitate a sense of the ‘whole data’.

The context in which the data were collected was regarded as highly important, so this background was reflected on as the data were reviewed. The data were analysed with awareness maintained of the organisation involved, the time frame in which the study had progressed, the social context and the network of relationships involved. Through each step of the data analysis, additional meaning was emerged. Meanings were not always immediately explicit within data and therefore recurrent engagement with the data was required to identify the themes across all of the data emerging from within the three methods. In order to achieve a satisfactory outcome in the data analysis, the three facets of description, context and intention have been regarded as integral and co-dependent. It was essential therefore to concurrently and recurrently engage with the detail of the data, as well as background in which it was collected as well as relating this back to the specific aims of the research.

3.11.1 Thematic data analysis

In line with the research approach and type of data collected, I used a thematic approach to the data analysis. The influence of Creswell’s (2003) six steps of
data analysis, as considered in the previous section, is recognised. The data analysis progressed to achieve a detailed appreciation of the content and context of the data, whilst delineating specific elements of meaning relevant to the research aim and questions. After extracting initial key examples of data in full, the analytic process was refined to progress toward the establishment and verification of units of meaning, moving through key words, key phrases, looking for patterns in the data. Redundant or extraneous data were discounted if they distracted from the research aim and questions. The notes made during the guided group discussions and observations were also subject to careful review, highlighting key words and phrases. This process had been strengthened by the participant engagement in producing data, so the participants’ notes on the flip chart paper following the film viewings could be referred back to. Therefore it could be argued that this enabled a further layer of cognitive engagement with what they had thought and what they wanted to say.

Clustering of relevant meanings involved exploring links within the data, determining themes from clusters of meaning, which was visualised and represented in thematic maps. This was a particularly helpful part of the approach to analysing the group discussion data. Thereafter key words can be identified. The most pertinent sections from the data were highlighted in colours, coded for each theme. These sections were then developed through coding, through to themes, again highlighting what was most meaningful. The research identified and entitled themes based on the language used by the participants. In effecting these steps I was able to identify general and unique themes for all data. Each method had built on the last, with increasing levels of detail. The interviews contributed particularly rich data and one of the interviews, revealing the style of colour coding, is included in Appendix II. The transcripts were all also annotated by hand.

3.12 Participant verification

I offered all interviewees the opportunity to review the transcripts from their individual interview, for a period of six months following this part of the data
collection. This constituted an opportunity for them to verify their responses should they want to. The main motivation was to ensure that all participants could check the accuracy of their contribution. I acknowledge that this is potentially problematic since this could be considered to generate ‘second level’ data and might have led to amendments to their responses having to be recorded, which could risk ‘hindsight bias’. Although the students responded that they appreciated the offer, none of the interviewees requested a copy of the transcript.

3.13 Conclusion

This chapter has presented the overall research process that progressed from the implementation of the exploration of the new fictional film trigger within the EBL, taking a broad exploratory qualitative approach. This has involved considering issues such as the research paradigm as well as the specific elements of the research design. Ethical issues such as participant information, consent, confidentiality and data protection have been highlighted. Theoretical and practical considerations of the three methods of data collection have also been considered, and the processes involved in the data analysis. The location of the data collection and the nature of the practical learning of the participants was also recognised as a means of situating what had been happening in the research in terms of pedagogical importance. Full transcription of the whole recordings of the interviews represented the entirety of interviewee responses, conducive to well-considered thematic analysis. The accumulation of several methods of data collection and the immediate follow up of guided group interviews all contributes to creating a robust data set. All three methods of data collection contributed data which enabled consideration of key elements such as authenticity within the use of fiction, memorability of the stories presented through film, educational relevance to learning outcomes, emotional engagement, whilst exploring the potency of the new triggers. The student responses revealed the potential of fictional film as trigger to stimulate effective shared critical reflection and enhanced learning opportunities, which will be discussed in the next two chapters.
Chapter Four
Findings

4.0 Introduction

This chapter presents the findings as synthesised from the three methods of data collection. Forty-nine students participated in at least two of the three methods of data collection, which were observation, guided group discussions and semi-structured open-ended interviews. Whenever the films were used I observed two highly engaged groups watching this material within the EBL sessions and significant group reactions to the shared experiences of watching such drama together. All data were analysed thematically, leading to the identification of five emergent themes: authenticity; memorability; relevance to learning outcomes; emotional engagement; and maintaining a safe, yet creative learning space.

The findings are presented in terms of these five themes, and exemplified by quotes from the data. The quotes were primarily from the interviews, with some additional supporting statements from the guided group discussions. These quotes are identified afterwards by participant number and the group the student was in. Thus Phase 1 [Ph.1] was the September cohort and Phase 2 [Ph.2] the January cohort. An example of one of the interviews transcripts, illustrating the thematic analysis process, is located in Appendix II. Each theme is now explored in detail.

4.1 Authenticity

A key prompt used in all three methods of data collection asked the students whether they felt that the fictional film needed to be authentic or realistic in order for it to be a valuable educational tool for them. The aim here was to explore whether the extent of realism within the drama was an issue for them at all. Fictional film offers an immediate, multi-dimensional insight into a range of scenarios, but also needs to resonate with the students practical experiences, in
order to connect with the practice learning outcomes set out in the curricula. Therefore, it was essential to gain a perspective from the students regarding whether they felt that the material was authentic, useful and credible even though the filmmakers had used ‘artistic license’ in the portrayal of their story. The critical issue here was whether the material needed to be realistic or whether there were key transferable issues that could be drawn out from even the most fictionalised accounts. A potential challenge to the use of fictional film within EBL might be an unrealistic level of dramatic representation, which could render the impact of using this resource too distracting within an educational context. However, such dramatization might not be regarded by either group as too removed from reality, and therefore not a barrier to practice focused group reflection.

Having been fully prepared for this approach, the students understood the nature of the material being used and described a high tolerance for the use of artistic license in the fictional stories within the guided group discussions. The film titles were selected by them with the explicit purpose to prompt discussion regarding the key transferable skills and professional considerations students needed to debate, for example, safeguarding the vulnerable and the issue of professional power. Some of the students responded in the guided group discussions that they considered certain specific examples of the dramatic performances to be ‘shocking’, for example the portrayal of domestic violence in the Ken Loach film had been very graphic and hard for them to watch. A consistent response from both groups was that the nurses portrayed in the series ‘Bodies’ should have been more supportive of both their colleagues and the patients within the stories as they played out. Similarly other professional groups’ actions in this drama caused concern to the students because they felt that all healthcare workers should be more proactive and less judgemental (‘Ladybird, Ladybird’) and the medics were considered to be working in a dysfunctional manner (‘Bodies’). These were dominant issues for the students within Group 2. The films had shown to the students the stark consequences of poor professional judgements. Both groups felt that they had seen accurate dramatic representation of how quickly clients can physically deteriorate within clinical practice in the films, which matched their real experiences. Thus, the lack of resources within clinical
practice and associated consequences of human and material resources were familiar.

The legal and professional issues raised by the ‘Bodies’ series were described by the students as ‘raw’, ‘real’ and emotive triggers, stimulating some long and complex reflective discussions. This was typified by the following comment (P= participant number, Ph. = relates to whether it was Phase/ Group 1 or Phase/ Group 2):

“Watching that film was very different than sitting in lectures because if I was just sitting in a lecture and someone was to talk to me, sorry to keep mentioning it but about the [recurrent and intrusive] involvement of social services [it wouldn’t have been the same]. Well it was quite blasé wasn’t it, but having watched the actual film and seeing it. This gives you that further insight doesn’t it into what goes on [in practice] as to how…some services are… completely…[dysfunctional], well it just is not right, is it?” (P.1., Ph.2).

The students described how they were able to see past the dramatic embellishment, draw effective analogies and critically reflect. Before commencing participation in the research, some of the students had verbalised scepticism regarding the use of fictional media, yet after viewing the resources they were all now convinced that this was ‘real enough’ or ‘useful enough’ to be meaningfully employed within their EBL sessions. There was a consensus amongst both groups that fictional media was a useful approach to initiate group reflection and discussion. The capacity for analogies to be made to practice and cross-referencing to personal experiences stimulated enthused reflective discussion regarding issues such as challenging poor practice, considering the impact of personal attitudes and dealing with ethical dilemmas, and they were able to compare this with examples of their own experiences.

The student responses indicated that they recognised the importance of considering the distinction between accounts in the film that resonated with real
practice (authentic) and those that did not (inauthentic) but which, despite being unrealistic, still connected to transferable issues. Both groups confirmed they could relate to various practice learning outcomes from both authentic and inauthentic elements of the fictional film used. The students were further asked if they could identify any resonance in the fictional film they had watched with the practice-focused learning outcomes specific to the module they were studying. This was very important because it was essential to their learning for there to be some foundation of authenticity or real resonance within the material being used in order to connect to the practice issues they were facing in their placements. The students were therefore prompted to consider whether there was sufficient material grounded within the films to stimulate discussion of specific learning outcomes. One of the most common participant responses was that the use of the media of fictional film offered an alternative, more immediate and enhanced stimulus to their group discussions and they could thereafter reflect on real issues that connected to the learning outcomes, so, in their words, it all ‘joined up’. Key transferable skills, such as inter-personal relations and inter-professional working, were often identified from the fictional media used. It was particularly interesting that Group 2 presented their small group discussion notes as ‘Mind Maps’ (Appendix III), an unprompted decision, which I interpreted as their conscious approach to surface these connections. Key topics, such as safeguarding, assessment and professional accountability, which all linked to learning outcomes, were also drawn out from the drama in the films and can be seen in these group notes.

The students were open and enthusiastic to debate the occasional dissonance between scenes they viewed within the films and experiences encountered in practice. This dissonance appeared to offer an additional stimulus to their learning rather than being a barrier to it, because they enjoyed discussing the contrasts. For example it would be unlikely in real practice that some of the extremes of clinical malpractice exemplified in ‘Bodies’ would be left unchallenged subsequent to the full implementation of Clinical Governance (which emphasises the individual and organisational responsibility to deliver standardised, high quality evidence based practice). This would be likely to be picked up in internal or external audit of clinical performance, especially now in
terms of professional responses to the Francis report, which highlighted how badly some acute services had failed (Francis, 2013). Some of the students were quite clear that there was occasional significant aesthetic latitude being used in the fictional stories that they had seen, particularly within one of the films (‘Ladybird, Ladybird’). The less realistic representations were noted, but there was still much that was relevant within the narratives that related to intimate partner violence and child neglect. For example there was a dominant theme of sympathy towards the main character who was a victim but yet had also neglected her children. However the competing safeguarding perspectives were left largely unexplored within the film itself, which left very fertile ground for subsequent group discussions. Even though the film did not present a balanced portrayal, it nevertheless provided a powerful and emotive cue that initiated impassioned student responses on the issue of safeguarding. One participant expressed a view that was shared in other interviews and in both guided group discussions:

“I thought it was very biased…, taking it from the mother’s point of view. They were just showing a biased side of social services and they did not show you how they had come up with the decisions that they had made… [I] thought it was quite unrealistic in parts when they [Social Services] just waltzed in and said they were taking the children, with no explanation, with no talking…but then that might have been how it was in the 90s. I certainly don’t think that that is how it is nowadays really…or whether it’s like that at all… but then again that may be because it is a film, so you get unrealistic scenes don’t you?” (P.2., Ph.1).

However, whilst many of the participants agreed that there was educational value in the use of inauthentic or less realistic fictional narratives, there was further consideration as to whether the stories were more helpful within EBL when they were more authentic because this could stimulate practice focused conversations on the real issues that the students encountered. Yet this snippet from the Group 1 discussions reveals their capacity to debate this:
“Initial impressions: Interesting the journalist who is ‘back to nursing’ but in deeper colour uniform [sister’s uniform] and at [attending] case review! Acts different considering that she is Agency [staff]. Tape recorder in the pocket- conflict of interest? NMC view? This happened in the ‘Panorama’ programme”, (Group 1 discussion notes).

The participants in the guided group discussions often debated whether the fictional representations needed to be predominantly ‘real’ or believable and often discussed what was ‘absent’ in the drama. For example Group 2 highlighted that in the Bodies series the clinical staff:

“Didn’t show team-work or a pleasant working environment”, Group 2 discussion notes)

The dissonance between the drama and real practice was also an issue that was further explored in the interviews. It appeared that although the realistic accounts were considered by the students to be very useful in this context, it was also felt by them to be possible that an inauthentic account employing aesthetic and dramatic latitude could still, nevertheless, ignite alternative conversation. This finding was well illustrated by the following participant:

“….[the film] triggered discussion, it made you think….we were obviously aware that it was dramatized but there was a lot that you could take from it…into a real life situation. It wasn’t ridiculously fanciful, it was like much closer to real practice than being ridiculously fantastical like say Hollyoaks. It was stuff that was relevant to today like you see things like that today anyway. You shouldn’t, but you do - which is another reason that it is relevant and you have to keep your eye out…” (P.1., Ph.2).
Indeed several of the students suggested that there was sufficient authenticity represented within the selected films to enable reflection on many of the real issues embedded within these fictional stories and made a list of some of these issues:

- “Whistle-blowing – possible/ safe or not
- The need to question your own practice
- Who was the victim?
- Wary of cliques and hierarchies in practice- so Doctors stick together? Closed shop
- It makes you question practice and that has to be a good thing
- The unhelpful scanner- it can be hard to get a scan
- Why is bad practice or attitudes tolerated?
- Useful to see the Consultants’ perspectives
- Guilty feelings related to whistle-blowing” (Group 1 discussion notes)

These issues stimulated lively participant group discussion, enabling the groups to reflect meaningfully on their real clinical experiences and professional decision-making skills:

“It makes you think about how you might deal with similar situations”, (Group 1 discussion notes)

Within both sets of guided group discussions, the students discussed that there was a significant breadth of latitude possible in the degree of realism acceptable within the film whilst retaining the capacity to stimulate learning conversations, which could then be used to reflect on real practice:

“The drama is sensationalised but still based in reality” (Group 1 discussion notes)
From the discussions ensuing from watching the films, the students could see connections with what they experienced and contrasts with how practice was developing, as exemplified by the following response:

“It makes it a real life experience because that is what life is like. It is not necessarily plain sailing. Yeah and it did make you think because if the healthcare nowadays was like that I think that I would really question it because they were making decisions based on no evidence at all and I think that it can't be like that.” (P.3., Ph.1)

It emerged across the different data sets that there was a high degree of consistency across the participant responses that both real and resonant issues were embedded within the fictional stories. The group discussions often involved consideration of critically important issues such as dealing with violence and aggression in the workplace.

It can be concluded from the observations of the groups that where dramatic representations were less authentic the discussion was nevertheless just as animated, as they were also contrasting what they had seen with what they had experienced in clinical practice. In the observations notes (see also Appendix IV for a longer extract) I recorded that:

“The students are having very animated discussions regarding the comparisons and contrasts with their practice, this is almost like a game…what is similar and what is [not] the same… (Observation notes, Group 2).

The students within both groups agreed that both realistic and less realistic drama had indeed initiated in-depth discussion as to ‘how it really was’ in practice and why the students would ‘do things differently’ themselves. Thus the inauthentic accounts were regarded by them as equally useful because the students could enthusiastically sustain in-depth discussion. Situating this in a
context where this type of EBL is designed to achieve exactly this outcome, the use of fictional media in this context was asserted by the groups to be valuable.

4.2 Impact and recall

Within both the individual interviews and both sets of guided group discussions the students were asked if they could recall any of the detail of the stories embedded within the films they had watched together. It was noted that when the students were able to recognise the enhanced level of recall of the content, it amplified their level of enthusiasm for this particular learning experience because they felt there was a significant impact on their learning. This was evident within the observations, reinforced by the vibrancy of the group discussions, showing detailed shared recall of the stories and sustained interest within the groups. This perception of enhanced impact amongst the students was therefore found to be a dominant and enduring experience for the students in both groups.

The data consistently revealed a heightened level of detailed recall amongst all participants. Participants, collectively and within individual interviews, described a level of recall that indicated the learning experience, facilitated through the use of the films, had been more memorable for them in contrast to their experiences of more conventional pedagogies, as exemplified by the following comments:

“The film that I have just watched is about a woman who has multiple kids through…-…multiple relationships…. she has the kids taken away from her by social services and is constantly trying to fight to get her kids back, whilst maintaining a relationship with her new husband”. (P.1. Ph.1).[reinforcing the presentation of detailed recall of the story and thereafter adding to this]

“I can remember it vividly in my head. If I had read a book, I would have had to have read it three or four times to have that same vivid recall.”[level of detail] (P.3, Ph.2).
All of the interviewees could remember both the film title and the broad plot, with a high degree of accuracy. Every participant interviewed could paraphrase and relay back a broadly accurate and succinct summary of the stories involved, even if the interview was several days or weeks after the EBL sessions. Once the prompt question had raised the issue, this level of recall both surprised and felt significant to them, in contrast to many other learning experiences, as shown by the following quote:

“Before today I was thinking... how am I going to remember what it [the film] was all about? I am actually really surprised at how much I can remember about it, which shows that it was a really useful way of learning.” (P.4., Ph.2)

The stories were specifically recalled in terms of the characters involved, their histories, the human experiences, and the sequence of events within them. The students often remembered the finer details of the harrowing scenes within the drama, for example of clinical negligence, domestic violence and child abuse, as well as the incrementally intrusive social services and management responses, usually in the plot order that they had occurred. The following quote shows the typical amount of detail that could be brought to mind and was frequently a feature of the interviews:

“Then the doctor, who had been suspended or expelled, got given his job back. And then 'it' [the plot] started talking about the risk of this doctor committing malpractice again....and the good doctor was getting more and more paranoid because he was worried that he was going to do it again. And then he got to a point where his wife went into labour and the 'bad' doctor was covering out of hours (needed a CS [Caesarean Section]) and he was about to 'do it', was about to perform the operation on her. .....ended up manipulating the situation to make it worse, to make it look like the doctor was about to perform malpractice” (P.6., Ph.2).

The scenes involving nursing personnel were focused upon and considered with particular interest. The group responses to the dramatizations that the students
had viewed initiated long and complex conversations within both sets of group discussions. These discussions progressed to considerations of patient support, the need for both health and social care professionals to apply non-judgemental positive regard and the power imbalances exemplified within the stories, which demonstrated how easily situations could become problematic. The students enthused that there was much to learn from these films about the human condition and how nursing might respond. Even months after the viewing, the students would refer back to the earlier EBL sessions that included the fictional film and recalled complete stories. They felt that this reinforced the value of the approach, because they could return to issues again and develop them, seeing the connections between as well as relevance of all of the learning outcomes.

The groups particularly wanted to discuss the role of the nurse with these films:

“Because there was no advocate for this lady and she was as I say verbally aggressive to the healthcare professionals...which wasn’t helping her case...but this did not make her evil and it did not make her love her children any less...but it was the judgement that [the nurses] were making on her because of the way that she was handling things. But if she had had an advocate [which nurses are expected to be], which she should have had but it wasn’t...well she might have been able to deal with it a little bit better.

Yes...and it makes you realise that when you are nursing somebody...you might be nursing a child and they are your main priority but you have still got to take their mothers’ feelings and emotions into account as well...and the family and everybody else as well. Because you don’t really know what is going on in their lives and you might instantly judge them as not very nice people but then when you get to the bottom of it there is always a reason isn’t there?...why they are acting in the manner that they are....”(P.9.,Ph.2.)

The dramatic representations of human experience that the films exemplified initiated conversations between the students, wherein scenes were described by them as ‘eye opening’, occasionally frightening and shocking, yet also resonant
with many of the students’ more challenging experiences encountered within clinical placements. The students would then develop the discussion to consider comparable experiences of bad practice they had seen. Through this process, lack of effective leadership, the influence of team dynamics and entrenched power imbalances within health and social care practice were reflected on and debated with sustained interest, as captured in some very visually engaging ‘mind maps’ (Appendix III):

“Fictional- is this common? **Appropriate?** YES?- shows effect on patients/ staff what bad practice can lead to…….” (Group 2 discussion notes).

Watching the ‘whole stories’ in terms of full films and episodes, enabling insight into the whole story, was a popular strategy with all of the participants. This facilitated a broader and deeper vision of the bigger picture, considering the complexities of the multiple perspectives involved. I made a record in my observation notes:

“The students are actually asking for these sessions to be longer- I have never encountered this before in SoLD” (Observation notes, Group 2).

### 4.3 Relevance to the learning outcomes

As the achievement of the practice focused learning outcomes was an essential element of the EBL, all of the selected fictional films need to be in some way explicitly relevant to learning as perceived by the students. It was therefore important to achieve a broad measure of the students’ individual and collective perceptions regarding the appropriateness of the use of the new triggers. Within both the interviews and guided group discussions, the students were asked if they could comment as to whether the fictional stories shown were, in their opinion, relevant to their learning and whether this material resonated with the practice-focused learning outcomes that they were all working towards. Both groups collectively, and all interviewees, described appreciating a clear
connection between the nature of the stories, what they had viewed and the rationale for using this material, for example to initiate discussions regarding safeguarding, inter-professional working, accountability and clinical governance. Many of the students in both groups felt that watching the fictional media had made them consider the learning outcomes in new and different ways that were more flexible and reflexive than before. They had relaxed into the learning and absorbed more information than they had anticipated.

The following quotes exemplify the positive feedback regarding relevance to their learning:

“I think so, I think it was a completely different style of learning that I have experienced, well I probably have experienced [something similar] before but probably not taken that much notice of… it was quite refreshing to have something different than just reading and research all the time…and I think it was appropriate” (P.3., Ph.1)

“I think…it did trigger a lot of response…aside from being comical, the comedy bits and the ‘gross out factor’ (clinical term) [joking- referring to colloquial banter rather than clinical terminology]…[the film that was used] did trigger a lot of discussion about whistle-blowing. …about the need to understand what the nurse’s responsibility is…when needing to raise a complaint [e.g.] challenging the ‘doctor’s boys club’ [referring to a medical closed shop]” (P.6., Ph.2)

Fictional film presents stories in ways which are complex, fast paced and full of dramatic impact, which totally absorbed the students during viewing:

“The students are concentrating on watching the film, they are not acknowledging me in the room: that is good, my presence is not intruding into this experience”, (Observation notes, Group 2).
I observed how different facets of the stories were revisited by the students as they considered various learning outcomes at different times throughout the EBL, so the material was useful during and after specific days when the films were shown, as evidenced through many subsequent EBL sessions following the data collection phases. Within the group discussions, the patients’ and service users’ perspectives were carefully considered as the students felt that the consumers of health and social care were often portrayed as helpless, powerless and vulnerable. Many of the staff were recalled as being emotionally disengaged, pressurised and stressed, leading to discussions regarding relevant theory including ‘compassion fatigue’ (Figley, 1995). The treatment and care delivered within the films often did not appear to be well coordinated and the students reflected on how frequently they found that this happened in real practice too:

“it was frightening that in reality there are also cover ups, [which was] morally challenging- real ethical dilemmas, this was an opportunity for reflection…” (Group 1 discussion notes).

There was a distinct lack of empathy displayed in the stories, either for the clients or between staff. This was described by them as being most evident within the ‘Bodies’ series, where there were also examples of nepotism, incompetent practice and a lack of patient-centred care. The overall impression conveyed within this series was bleak, but nevertheless the drama was described as gripping. Both groups were very clear that once the film had started they wished to see it through. “Don’t switch the DVD player off!” was a recurrent phrase used. There was far more in the drama that exemplified bad practice rather than best practice as exemplified in one of the small group discussion ‘mind maps’:

“Learning

- Importance of communication
- Loss of empowerment
- What not to do…
- Lack of consequences and staff [in the drama]
- How not to talk to patients” (Group 2 discussion notes).
Yet the ‘Bodies’ series was described by the participants as more realistic than other fictional films focusing on similar topics. For both groups the selected fictional media used was highly resonant of many of the real issues they encountered in placements and there was therefore consensus across both groups regarding the acknowledged positive impact of all of the selected triggers. The students considered the material within the fictional film to be more effective in triggering group discussions than the conventional triggers they were familiar with from previous EBL. There were increasingly complex, inter-connected issues that could be identified by the groups from within the stories. These were ‘emotionally charged’ learning conversations, enabling critical engagement with the practice learning outcomes in a judicious way:

“I think it challenged your thinking…of looking at things from the bigger picture and judgement…not be judgemental…because there was a lot of that going in in the film”. (P.2., Ph.1).

“…and it makes you think: ‘am I strong enough to do it?’… I mean I thought it…am I strong enough to stand up to consultants and the entire management?” (P.6., Ph.2).

All of the participants confirmed that they felt that the films selected for the EBL sessions were both relevant and appropriate to their learning, although one participant in the second group was rather vocal in their distaste about seeing media portrayals of birth. This respondent would have known that developing knowledge of the intrapartum process and emergency birth was an essential element of the pre-registration adult nursing curriculum, but felt that the dramatic portrayal of birth had nevertheless been ‘a little too real’.

Recognised by both groups of students as ‘a completely different style of learning’, the stories displayed within the fictional media stimulated discussion regarding health and social care related incidences. I interpreted the vibrancy of the Group 2 discussions as being particularly exemplified by the unprompted choice that all of the small groups made to present their notes visually, with
colour, pictures and ‘buzzwords’; examples of these are presented in Appendix III. All of these learning experiences were being critically reflected on and this could therefore be used to develop their practice in the future, achieving a further learning outcome of reflexivity. The experience was also described by three of the interviewees as appealing to their practice focused, visual and reflective styles of learning:

“Ok- well I’m a visual learner, so to watch a film or for someone to demonstrate something to me is the way that I take things in, remember it and learn it. So watching that film is going to stick, remembering that film is going to make me remember social services, going to remind me of, well not that I need reminding of how domestic relationships [are], what goes on behind closed door which we are not aware of.” (P.3., Ph.2).

“I think it just made me stop and made me think… it has made me realise that I do need to address issues like this. Whether I am able to ….well I realise that I need to be aware….it has motivated me to try and act better in practice” (P.6., Ph.2).

“I do think that this film was appropriate to my learning … what can I say…it made us a bit [tearful], yes it made myself and other members of the group become aware of other services that are provided to people, so in this circumstance, obviously the social services - something that we [do not] have a lot to do with, whilst doing our training. So to see things from that sort of perspective, was very enlightening. To see how it affects the family involved.” (P.1., Ph.1).

However several participants suggested that these experiences would have been further enhanced by the inclusion of specific additional prompt questions to focus attention on key parts of the film, facilitating a more structured de-brief. The students had been given participant information packs at the beginning of the EBL but they had some positive suggestions about how the preparatory material could be enhanced further in order to both structure and support the learning
experience even more. Both groups were very keen for this approach to be continued for themselves and for future EBL sessions.

One of the sub-groups within Group 2 suggested that the ‘Bodies’ drama reinforced the public perception of what healthcare was like ‘behind the scenes’:

“Use of Fiction-Highlights our learning-? [is this the ] Public perception [of what healthcare professionals are like]?” (Group 2 discussion notes).

However both groups were clear that at least in the case of the ‘Bodies’ drama the content was more realistic than most other comparable healthcare related dramas. This had triggered discussion regarding working within a safe scope of practice and the consequences of not doing so were clear; in this episode a patient had died in very traumatic circumstances when treated by novice staff. There were indeed several issues within the ‘Bodies’ drama that stimulated impassioned group discussions regarding ethical dilemmas and moral challenges inherent within professional health and social care practice:

“…lack of communication………no SBAR (structured handover)………?

Unrealistic

- Cold
- No patient centred care
- Miserable
- Didn’t prioritise care/ patients
- Nepotism- no Whistleblowing
- Nurse refused to give more morphine!
- Bad practice
- Lack of empathy” (Group 2 Discussion notes).

The use of the ‘Bodies’ series had illustrated how it could be an unacceptable feature of practice that clinical errors were made. It was challenging to both groups to consider that any practitioner from any healthcare profession might
attempt to ‘cover up their mistakes’ afterwards, as had been represented within the ‘Bodies’ drama, particularly in the case of the Consultant Gynaecologist with high mortality rates. The students considered this to be alarming, but acknowledged that it could and sometimes did happen in real practice. This prompted a discussion of well-publicised accounts of failures in clinical practice. There was increasing awareness amongst the students of NMC views on whistle-blowing, amid ongoing concerns regarding the role of commissioning, supervisory and regulatory bodies in light of the emerging revelations regarding for example the Mid Staffordshire Foundation NHS Trust between January 2005 and March 2009. Later the Francis report (Francis, 2013) would draw together and amplify such concerns.

The group discussed the issue of whistle-blowing and escalating concerns in practice and whether it was possible to do this in a way that did not incorporate risk for the individual practitioner disclosing the issue. The drama indicated that it was not a risk free process, but the students were aware of a lot of professional nursing debate, including the NMC, that explicitly encouraged escalating concerns when adverse events and bad practice were encountered:

“Appropriate?: Relevant to placement, [yes]- Thinking about NMC Requirements [to speak up when bad practice was discovered] - how policies weren’t followed” (Group 2 Discussion notes).

Explicit permission to ‘whistle-blow’ is now explicitly enshrined within the new NMC Code (NMC, 2015). Group 2 debated questions such as whether there were impenetrable boundaries between some professionals groups, which was described by the students as a medical ‘closed shop’? They also asked themselves whether there were cliques both within and between professional groups, exacerbated by perceptions of hierarchies. Whatever the answers to these questions, there were, for the students, clear examples of bad practice and poor professional attitudes exemplified within the drama, which had very real resonance for them because they had encountered similar real experiences.
The use of the ‘Bodies’ series was particularly helpful in stimulating vibrant discussions. During one of the group discussions I asked the whole group to offer one word or phrase that captured the essence of their experience of watching the film ‘Ladybird, Ladybird’, as exemplified in the following list:

“One/Phrase word reactions….

- Thought-provoking
- Tense
- Emotive
- Challenging
- Educational
- Exhausting
- Yuck factor
- Insight
- Infuriating
- Frustrating
- Relevant
- Frightening- reality- cover ups
- Opportunity for reflection (Group 1 Discussion notes).

Many of these word and phrases are powerful and emotive, representing key elements of engagement with the drama. Both groups were intrigued by the development of the characters and the progress of their individual narratives within these larger stories. Some careers progressed, some deviated and some characters had ‘lost their way’. Both groups were especially interested in the character of the Senior Nurse in ‘Bodies’ who, by the series finale, had ‘got her degree’, trained to be a journalist and was turning up at the new hospital doing agency work (but with a Dictaphone in her pocket to support her journalistic endeavours):

“Tape recorder in the pocket- conflict of interest? NMC view? This happened in the ‘Panorama’ programme [for which the RN was then held to account by the NMC in a conduct hearing- and was struck off]”. Group 1 Discussion notes.
This character seemed to be attempting to recreate her senior status, even despite the temporary nature of her work now, which was described by Group 2 as inappropriate as she was working for a nursing agency. They felt that this would cause offence to established staff in real practice and they went on to recount similar examples they had encountered in real practice which were discussed at length, because these real experiences had irritated so many of the students. The use of the Dictaphone was a big issue for them. The Nursing and Midwifery Council had previously cautioned some Registered Nurses regarding similar issues. The use of recording equipment was legally problematic and a breach of confidentiality (the ultimate sanction for which would be deregistration). The groups knew this and debated the issues with passion, which meant that some key ethical and professional issues could be critically considered with full student engagement.

Viewing the fictional film had stimulated the group to consider professionalism in both broad and complex ways, including discussing the importance of demonstrating compassion, and supporting dignity in the workplace. The necessity to question poor clinical decision-making, to involve all key stakeholders and maintain effective communication were also stressed, as well as the need to establish effective inter-professional working:

“To always look at the bigger picture… …don’t just listen to one person’s point of view. You need to listen to everybody’s point of view and make sure you know all the facts before you charge in and make a decision…and also you need to be the advocate of the patient don’t you? …and I think of her as the patient and nobody was speaking up for her, nobody was fighting her corner and if she was a little old lady in hospital and nobody was fighting her corner…she would just be left to rot in the corner and I think that that probably does tend to happen in some places but that is what it made me think of” (P.1., Ph.2).
One of the responses to the question considering the appropriateness of using fictional film within EBL was an unexpected reaction from the student concerned:

“It feels to me like a clever way of teaching because you think you are just watching a film but then when you think about it afterwards...it was quite remarkable really”. (P2., Ph.1).

This phrase, ‘a clever way to teach’, was to re-emerge within subsequent conversations with both groups and in some of the interviews. They had not expected to learn at the same time as being entertained.

4.4 Emotional engagement

The students were prompted within the guided group discussions to consider how the experience had impacted on them emotionally. Being part of a group learning situation where the trigger material used was challenging. This was further explored within the interviews. The findings across all of the data collected suggested that this was a more emotional learning experience for the participants than their previous experiences of EBL. The specific film titles chosen by the students were suggested to them on the basis of recommendations identified through the literature review and evaluated by them to be effective drama to use. Both the ‘Bodies’ series and ‘Ladybird, Ladybird’ are rated for viewers of 18 or over. Whilst the selected narratives were potentially challenging in terms of their content and visual representations, the films were not judged by the students themselves to be unnecessarily gratuitous or explicit. This was an important consideration in terms of preparing for and sustaining the selection process for the films, as some of the titles did make for more demanding viewing, which needed to be risk managed. It was anticipated that there would be emotive content and responses (within reasonable boundaries) which were not too challenging as a specific prompt to stimulate reflective group discussions. In this respect, all of the identified film titles were described by the groups as having worked as an effective trigger to the EBL. The students were very open in discussing the emotional impact of what they were watching and remained enthused that this was an effective strategy to initiate critical reflection.
Several of the interviewees said that watching the film had been akin to an ‘emotional rollercoaster’, a key term that also emerged within the guided group discussions. The students described a range of emotional reactions to the films including frustration, anger and sadness. These reactions were particularly forcefully articulated by many of the students in Group 2. The complex way in which the stories had unfolded over time and with recurrent viewings had affected the students in a more emotionally engaged way than any other triggers that had been brought into the EBL sessions before. They identified with some of the characters and some of the plot lines within the stories. This emotional ‘gut reaction’ was accepted and justified by them in recognition that these triggers connected to essential learning outcomes they all had to complete, for example learning how to deal with trauma and child abuse:

“There were scenes in it that … really pulled at the heart strings… like the scene with the fire and her children in there…which made me feel like…well that was a really stupid act for her to do but then equally upon reflection after thinking that… it was really well portrayed…showing [really] well actually what other alternative did she have… so… it made me feel really mixed emotions about it and I think the storyline was really well developed” (P.1, Ph.2)

“For me it was like an emotional rollercoaster because one minute you were just tearing your hair out with sadness and frustration and then it was happy and then it was sad again and there was anger. Every emotion that you could possibly think of you were hit with it. It was very thought provoking I thought”. (P.3, Ph.2)

“it made me [feel] anger and … gave me a [feeling of a] mix of emotions. It really made me think deeper” (P.2., Ph. 2).

“I can watch films and cry at the drop of a hat but it not necessarily affecting me internally it is just a release of ‘oh my god’!” (P.6., Ph.1).

Within both sets of guided group discussions the students recurrently responded that they felt either sympathy or empathy for the characters portrayed within the
drama and this helped them to engage more fully with the stories because they started to care about the characters involved. The students were drawn into the stories with some of the main characters, who had suffered many pressures, challenges, abuses and misfortunes. On both a personal and a professional level they could identify with the human experiences they were watching and they described how this helped to draw in and sustain their interest:

“It certainly makes you think and it certainly makes you stop and start considering things and I think that when you're told something in a story it affects you deeper you know… it actually sticks with you… so if you were lectured to the same degree then yes you would take it on board… [But] it does not have an emotional effect on you and therefore it does not inform the way that you develop your practice yourself… because you are more robotic about it but when you have seen something first hand and experienced it. And it has given you emotional feelings you are going to be aware of that when you practice yourself.” (P.3., Ph. 2).

These learning experiences were often being described in the guided group discussions as thought provoking, challenging and emotionally demanding. All of the drama used during data collection had worked as a powerful trigger for personal and group reflection within the EBL sessions. Some scenes were described by participants within the groups as having ignited their interest by ‘pulling on their heart strings’. The completeness of the dramatic representations was a catalyst to holistic discussions thereafter, in which it was clear that the impression of the ‘whole’ stories had really made the groups think about what was going on:

“Enables [us] to ‘see’ the whole picture, rather than snap shots, think about relatives’ feelings… makes the experience more meaningful” (Group 2 Discussion notes).

The complex and interrelated stories prompted discussions of how the students felt they might respond professionally in the situations they had viewed,
recognising how the characters behaved, respecting service user personal perspectives, offering psychological support and proceeding ethically within these specific narratives. The visual and dramatic representations had been powerful and well portrayed with key issues being showcased with a significant realism. This reality made the learning experiences more resonant for the students who were in clinical practice alongside these EBL sessions and could therefore identify with the issues. These were predominantly not easy, light-hearted or happy stories, but the drama was ‘attention grabbing’ to watch, nevertheless, as the plot unfolded. The emotional impact was described as being greater if the issues did have personal resonance for the student, in terms of their personal and working experience. The following quote exemplifies the way a fictional story can ‘touch a nerve’ when the plots could be found to be mirrored within their personal lives:

“Watching the film brought about quite a lot of emotions in myself… having witnessed domestic discord [in practice] - it was quite emotional. It was pretty upsetting. Obviously that is from my perspective because as I said I have been a witness to that before…” (P.1.,Ph.2)

One of the key issues to consider in risk managing the learning process was the potential collateral damage of the emotional engagement with the issues raised by the film and how that might manifest itself within the classroom. The fictional film trigger could be creative and challenging, but it needed to be presented within a classroom that was primarily a ‘safe learning space’. I therefore asked both groups and all of the interviewees how it felt to be sitting in a group learning situation where some of their peers were visually upset whilst watching the film alongside them, for example, ‘crying in the classroom’. The issues of experiencing crying in front of their peers and considering examples of empathy as distinct from sympathy were dominant in the interviews.

Some of the students had described how they ‘tuned out’ from an awareness of some of their peers displaying emotion whilst watching the films. Most noteworthy was the response in the fourth interview with a member of Group 2 who did not feel that it was her role to deal with her colleagues’ emotions. This participant
specifically recalled that they had bracketed out any perception of the other student responses during the film viewing. However two of the other respondents interviewed considered this to be an important element of their learning whilst they prepared to become a professional nurse and had contemplated comforting their peers at the time when they had seen them getting upset:

“One of girls was crying in front of me who I know very well and you just want to give a hug or if you know a pat on the shoulder or something or a little squeeze but I think that they weren’t necessarily upset for their own personal reasons. I think it was just being drawn into the emotion of the film because some people just cry at the drop of a hat when they are watching films because they are being completely sucked into it, not necessarily because it is affecting them on a personal level. It is not necessarily evoking memories from childhood or anything like that – it is just that they are emotional people”. (P.3., Ph.2).

The emotional reactions described had ranged from frustration, sadness, and discomfort through to happiness, relief, and surprise. As well as describing feeling a wide range of emotional responses when watching the selected fictional film triggers, the students reflected on a variety of reasons why the stories might be upsetting and discussed appropriate responses. Considering emotions such as anger at bad practice, frustration when things went wrong at work and anxiety regarding lack of effective team working, the groups were then invited to debate potential solutions to these issues.

4.5 Maintaining a safe, yet creative learning space

Whilst affirming the emotional impact described in the previous section, student responses consistently stated that this new approach still nevertheless felt safe and secure for them. Both groups therefore evaluated the experience as an effective and enjoyable approach to take. In terms of staying within comfortable boundaries, even if the film content was occasionally challenging, the groups again responded positively:
“It makes you question practice and that has to be a good thing… it was a useful thing to do in the time… would like to see it [the approach/ triggers-used] again” (Group 1 discussion notes).

The students recognised that using creative and visual media was enhancing the impact of the learning and yet was still firmly located within their comfort zone. As educators working within higher education have the responsibility to risk assess the learning planned for their classrooms, it was important to explore with the participants whether the use of dramatic, emotive and occasionally visually challenging fictional film felt ‘safe’ and secure to them. As described in the previous section, several of the students had used the analogy of the ‘emotional rollercoaster’ to describe this particular learning experience, employing this comparison to describe the complex and turbulent range of emotions ignited by the dramatic stories within the fictional films.

One of the sub-groups within Group 2 discussed how they felt very sad and emotionally drained watching the first ‘Bodies’ episode because so much of the drama resonated with real practice. This was ‘edge of the seat’ drama, helping them to identify and prioritise issues, whilst reflecting on the narratives in a safe environment. Parts of the films they had watched were described as ‘horrifying’ and ‘traumatic’ to view because of the gravity of the mistakes that were being displayed within the drama. The fact that the stories were fictional made this process feel easier to them than contemplating real case scenarios, whilst nevertheless enabling critical consideration of the issues raised.

The previous section discussed some of the students’ emotional responses which appeared to be directly related to what had been specifically happening within the stories. The visual immediacy of the fictional film is at least in part explicitly designed to be emotive. However the learning process was nevertheless consistently described by both groups in very positive terms:

“So I think… learning experience… …I think not only watching the film was a learning experience in seeing the storyline going on but also a learning
experience to watch something like that alongside everyone else. …and…I think it was a really beneficial learning experience… …I really enjoyed it…. …and I think it was a really appropriate film as well because, although at times it did not really seem like it was that related to the course we are doing… I think it is because a lot of today’s society experience similar issues and you need to have an awareness of it so… I think it was a really good way of portraying… reality for some people really”. (P.4., Ph.2).

The students were asked both in their groups and during interviews to comment on whether the approach felt comfortable, risky or personally challenging, situating this in a context that acknowledged the group experience:

“If I had watched the film alone it would have been a totally different experience to watching it in a group, because I felt like at times there were almost moments that I thought…oh gosh…I am going to well up in a minute, but I tried to control it whereas if I had been on my own it’s a bit natural to let it go…” (P.4., P1).

The students described predominantly how these learning experiences did not feel risky to them. This approach to the EBL was described as an ‘exciting’ use of their time, which they recognised as cathartic and justifiable in terms of building resilience to ‘upsetting issues’. This felt appropriate to all of the participants, considering the context in which they were learning, because the classroom was a more secure space in which to reflect on challenging issues:

“I think it just made me stop and made me think…. it has made me realise that I do need to [address issues like this] whether I am able to …. well I realise that I need to be aware…..it has motivated me to try and act better in practice” (P.1., Ph.2).

“It makes it a real life experience because that is what life is like. It is not necessarily you know plain sailing. Yeah and it did make you think
because if the healthcare nowadays was like that I think that I would really question it because they were making decisions based on no evidence at all and I think that it can’t be like that” (P.3., Ph.2).

When asked the question regarding the security of the approach, all but one of the participants responded that they felt that the new approach did feel secure. This participant contrasted ‘safety’ with reality:

“It doesn't necessarily make it safe but it makes it realistic, it makes it a real life experience because that is what life is like”. (P.3., Ph.1).

Nevertheless the students did still acknowledge the extent of the emotional impact and the need to manage this sensitively. There had been clear evidence from the observation and the group experiences that some students had reacted emotionally whilst watching the 'Ladybird, Ladybird' film in Group 2:

“During one of the very violent scenes there are gasps from some of the students (the main character in the film is being physically assaulted by her partner). Some of the students are crying when the same character goes to visit her injured children in hospital (they have been badly burnt in a fire). There are also clear signs of emotional engagement when the woman’s new baby is taken from her by social workers slightly after the birth. There is some dabbing of eyes and other obvious signs of sadness” (Observation Notes, Group 2).

The amount of violence in the film was noted and commented upon by the students and they responded that it was important to prepare the groups for this challenging material, which had included scenes of child abuse:

“Definitely…definitely because obviously you made us aware that this was quite a graphic film and there... there was scenes of violence and .. we needed to [know] that we could leave the room. So I think that there was pretty much preparation and you handed the DVDs around for
people to look at. We all had a read around what it was based on and what kind of...how it can affect the kids as well because the kids as well... it was quite upsetting the way that that boy got burned....(P.1.,Ph.1).

There was shared group understanding demonstrated by the participants regarding the rationale for taking this approach. The participant information packs were designed to support full understanding of the research aims and focus the students on specific aspects of the films as they also evaluated the impact of the new triggers. The approach taken was not described by any of the participants as feeling threatening to them, so the level of risk appeared well contained.

Thus both groups positively responded that the use of the fictional film resources had instigated enhanced critically reflective group discussions, including more impassioned dialogue about their own clinical experiences. This new learning experience was described as feeling like ‘a safe learning space’ in which to share both their own stories and debate the issues raised within the fictional film resources. Feelings initiated by watching this drama had included anger, fear, worry and frustration, but within comfortable boundaries and, importantly, reflected on at a safe distance from the clinical environment.

4.6 Conclusion

All of the students had appeared to be proactively supportive of each other during the guided group discussions, where the extent of their learning was evidenced and documented in the notes recorded by the groups. The research indicated that this EBL approach contributed to this by getting the students to work proactively together, forming effective teams in the discussion, critically reflecting and considering how they could transform this learning into effective professional practice in the future.

Overall the students offered positive responses in their evaluation of the use of fictional film within their EBL. There was an enduring level of recall of the stories
used and the learning from the group discussions confirmed as significant by the participants themselves. The students in both groups indicated that they wanted to continue viewing the rest of the ‘Bodies’ series, which they would be able to do at a later date, as the titles had been made available within the University library. The students were especially keen to focus on gaps in the dramatic representations, which they were concerned about. For example, they discussed how there had been an absence of effective team work within and beyond professional groups and very little proactive engagement with service users. This viewing experience had reminded them about the imperatives of inter-professional working and for advocacy, amidst an environment where the client is vulnerable, disempowered by the circumstances. However whilst none of these fictional film resources had been written from a nursing perspective, both groups felt that they provided a significant learning opportunity to consider the impact of discord within nursing clinical practice.

The authentic and inauthentic aspects of the film were useful in stimulating discussions, as the students were able to consider both with equal interest. The feedback from both group discussions reinforced a strong impression of shared acknowledgement of the emotional impact of the use of fictional film to trigger effective group discussions. The use of the fictional media was also regarded as a more memorable approach, and therefore perhaps having a longer-term impact on their development. There was a range of emotions, including mild frustration at the inauthentic fictional accounts, enthusiasm regarding how much of the learning was remembered and anger at the representations of bad practice. Whilst considering these strong emotions within the safe learning space of the classroom, the students were sharing ideas regarding coping strategies, rehearsing their reactions to future challenges and, through this work, working towards building their resilience. Their shared awareness of the clear connection between the new triggers and their practice learning outcomes was critically important in justifying the approach, reinforced by their emotional reaction to the films. The students could identify specific learning outcomes and topics they could highlight and draw upon to initiate group discussion after watching the drama. Safeguarding, decision-making, prioritising, delegation, whistle-blowing
and the need to take responsibility were singled out as topics of particular interest and relevant to the year three practice learning outcomes for adult nursing. There were good discussions regarding the need for effective communication with all key stakeholders within clinical practice, including maintaining timely, accurate documentation. The need for professional and timely critical incident reporting was also stressed.

Both groups responded positively to the opportunity to watch whole episodes because they wanted to ‘see the whole picture’ and take in the full story line, rather than only experiencing a ‘snap shot’ of the stories. The students frequently requested more time to discuss the issues arising from using this type of EBL approach, a level of engagement and enthusiasm which was in itself a positive development, and the length of EBL sessions enabled this attention to detail. The students also responded that they would like to include more of this type of approach within their EBL in the future and that this had suited their style of learning. Some of the students declared that they intended to acquire the film titles and watch the whole ‘Bodies’ series. There had been some changes in terminology over time, but they could follow the stories. The clinical representations had been broadly realistic, although the inaccuracies had led to even more impassioned discussion. The students also considered that even greater preparation than they received prior to watching the films would have been even more beneficial and made some helpful suggestions regarding how that might be effected.

Within this research, across all three methods of data collection, five central themes have emerged through the data and have been presented in this chapter. The five emergent themes are relevant to an exploration of creative pedagogy, connecting fictional storytelling with real learning. They, therefore, revealed how the specific educational approach developed within this research can impact upon the student experience of EBL in pre-registration adult nursing. Although presented as individual themes they are connected and inter-dependent. However, exploration of the themes individually was useful in focusing on specific concepts relevant to the research. The observations indicated the ease with
which the new triggers led to critically reflective discussions in both groups, where student experiences from practice were thoughtfully discussed. This shared group reflection, an important link connecting the themes, involved both comparisons and contrasts to be made between what had been viewed in the films and what the students had experienced in practice. Both groups frequently responded that they had enjoyed the opportunity to do something new within their EBL and had felt that they were part of a creative process, which was exciting and motivating. When asked how this experience could be developed further, the groups had many suggestions as to how the approach could be an enabler of critical reflection, which could be challenging but was essential within professional practice.
Chapter 5
Discussion

5.0 Introduction

This chapter will discuss the findings of this research in the light of existing knowledge. In doing so it draws together an understanding of how this exploration of the use of fictional film within EBL can be further applied within nurse education. This chapter returns to the themes identified in the literature review in chapter Two and discusses the findings in relation to ‘Cinemeducation’, narrative pedagogy, expanding an understanding of the importance of storytelling within education, reflective practice, and reconsiders EBL specifically.

The aim of the research was to explore the educational impact of using fictional films to trigger EBL. The literature review had identified ways in which there was extensive learning to be achieved through storytelling, explored through narrative pedagogy, reinforcing student led learning and enabling of critical reflection on practice. The potential for learning from fictional narratives was further established within the data collection process. Films often explore universal experiences and emotions of importance to an understanding of human experience. The data collection revealed a very positive student response to the triggers used, and highlighted that, from the perspective of the students, such a method had enhanced their learning. This was evidenced throughout all of the methods of data collection. I had observed full engagement with the triggers as recorded in my observation notes (Appendix III), as responded in the interviews (see Appendix II for one on the transcripts) and visually represented in the Group 2 discussion notes (Appendix IV). The triggers used had resulted in useful discussions, for example, those that considered the emotive nature of the reality of clinical practice.

The literature review identified a trend of increasing interest in the pedagogical use of fictional film in professional education, especially medicine and mental
health, which has been articulated using the term ‘Cinemeducation’. This is now considered in the light of the study’s findings.

5.1 Cinemeducation

Alexander (2012) conducted research exploring the use of fictional film as an approach to help medical students to learn about what it meant to be human, consider the development of empathy and practice effectively as ethically sensitive practitioners. Alexander (2012), building on work undertaken more than a decade earlier (Alexander, 1994), suggested that in his view, in terms of impact, cinema was the greatest art form of the current era. His prolific and persuasive work in this area of educational practice indicating the significant level of impact that he considered this approach to have had on medical education in the intervening period. The term ‘Cinemeducation’ used by Alexander (2012) is a neologism of his creation, and it became important in my research as it expanded the body of literature that was identified as relevant to my topic. This body of work is significant in articulating the range of this type of narrative approach, revealing evidence of developing practitioner interest in this area. The Alexander et al. (2012; 2005) work has contributed significant evidence of the impact of applying a narrative approach using fictional film to healthcare education, far in excess of the other authors cited. However, although the approach taken in this current research is analogous to the process of ‘Cinemeducation’, and the process has clearly been influenced by it, the learning outcomes and professional perspective are different within nursing education as distinct from other healthcare professionals, which takes an even more holistic, longitudinal view of healthcare. Because ‘Cinemeducation’ is a hybrid term, encompassing Cinema +medicine+ education, that specific label is not entirely appropriate to describe the approach taken within this research because the research involved nurse education. However it is still recognised that broadly the process was analogous in terms of educational aspirations, purpose and some specific learning outcomes. The Cinemeducation literature has been highly significant in influencing this research, advocating for the educational use of fictional film but using the neologism (‘Cinemeducation’) is not easily translatable to nurse education because this
does not involve teaching medicine. The issue here is a semantic one, with subtle philosophical implications, as I would not lay claim to any involvement in medical education. Beyond this the body of literature has been and continues to be invaluable to be, if occasionally lacking in detail.

Within this research the impact of using fictional film was positive and well received by students who were enthusiastic to learn in this way. This enthusiasm was a consistent feature of respondent evaluations in similar research. Alexander (2012) considered the emotive nature of film, describing the two dominant facets of film making as the content and the process, both of which combine to deliver their messages in a visually engaging manner that stimulates the senses. This connects to and resonates with the findings of the current study which evidenced how well received the new approach was by all participants. Healthcare professionals need to be able to deliver sensitive and compassionate care, fully aware of ethical principles (NMC, 2015). However, as Alexander (2012) suggested, these professional behaviours are not easy to learn. This research adds a further voice to the argument that this form of aesthetically focused education can help to facilitate important learning.

Recommendations for good practice, as identified within the literature, had indicated that the films chosen should be good quality titles, facilitating meaningful real world insights and encompassing fresh perspectives. The use of film was found to be both visually attractive and effective within the literature and within both groups involved in the data collection within this research. The student as viewer has the opportunity to take on the role of focused observer, and reflect in detail on the complex inter-related lives of others in a way that real life might not necessarily reveal. This is in line with Alexander’s (2012) suggestion that:

“We break through the masks that humans wear and ever so briefly inhabit another’s life (Alexander, 2012, p.13).
The application of fictional film as a trigger to EBL, which has been recognised in sources such as ‘Cinemeducation’, can also be found in the literature, referred to in a variety of alternative ways such as ‘Tele-education’ and ‘Medicinema’ (Alexander, 2004). It is evident that there are many topics, resources and interpretations to support the learning experience of students using these innovative and creative ways to stimulate group discussion. Alexander (2012) described how Cinemeducation can trigger effective and vibrant group discussion, anchor teaching points, form a basis for role play, as well as motivate and inspire effective group discussions. Alexander (2012) posed the question as to why films can be so emotive. Cinemeducation can be described as a creative innovative means to learn in a new way about what it means to be essentially human:

“I consider cinema to be the great art form of our era and that as a humanities based teaching tool it is without peer” (Alexander et al. 2012, p.11).

Lumlertgul et al. (2009) recommended the use of fictional film wherein central characters were healthcare professionals. This was the case in one of the main fictional film titles selected within this research, i.e. the ‘Bodies’ series. Alexander et al. (2012) suggested a far broader list of fictional film titles. Wilson et al. (2013) recommended that the film selections should be used in this educational context that facilitated meaningful real world insights into human experiences and encompassed fresh perspectives. The use of film is both visually attractive and time efficient, both of which make this a useful resource within the higher education classroom. The viewer has the opportunity to take on the role of observer and look carefully into the lives of others, an important strategy facilitative of the development of empathy.

The current research has explored whether fictional film is a useful or indeed more powerful trigger compared with more conventional approaches to stimulate student discussion on professional practice issues within EBL. Consistently, a
positive response was gained from all participants, both regarding the choice of
the films shown and to their effectiveness to act as triggers for their learning. This
is encouraging and appears to indicate that the approach translates across
professional fields of practice. The impact of using this type of media may well
relate to its capacity to entertain, whilst also giving important messages to the
audience. The presentation of ‘realistic’ portrayals within fictional film is unique in
that it appears to be authentic and three-dimensional, even though it is in fact
neither. It has two main elements, the process (how the film is made) and the
content (what the film is about). It is the latter that is more important in this
research, because this connects to the use of story.

The findings from this research detailed the views of the students on the impact
of using fictional film to trigger appropriate learning and also shed light on how
this approach had worked, particularly for them. The emergent themes frequently
connected to the concept of narrative as representation of human experience and
as a tool of cultural communication. The importance of storytelling can be traced
throughout history and maintained via socialisation. It is proposed that humans
have learnt to employ stories for many critically important reasons, making social
connections through the use of narratives, considering the nature of human
relationships (Warner, 2014; 1994a; 1994b). These considerations include
reflecting on the impact of certain behaviours, as well as the consequences of
actions, which links with morality and personal development (Bettelheim, 1976).
Storytelling through fictional film may be perceived as more immediately
engaging than in print, in terms of the complex and complicated representations
of the characters, including a wide range of interpersonal elements (Frey, 2011;
Alexander, 2005). Indeed the refining representation of non-verbal cues can
enhance the impact of films, a feature remarked upon by many of the
respondents who had found opportunities to reconsider the complex ways in
which people communicate.

There are layers of synergistic storytelling, involving strong psychological and
emotional resonance which is appealing to the viewer. The interplay of words,
imagery, geography, music and photography can all contribute to this synergy.
Alexander et al. (2012), in the second Cinemeducation volume, suggested that in
depth insight into human experiences can be achieved through close attention to the visual detail. My research suggests that this type of learning experience is not only more enjoyable, but also easier to remember more fully in terms of connected issues represented through the pattern of stories. It is proposed that the positive experiences of the use of Cinemeducation, as portrayed by Alexander (2012), can be further understood, and expanded upon, in terms of a broader conceptualisation of the approach, articulated in terms of narrative pedagogy.

5.2. Narrative pedagogy

In the context of the current research, the concept of narrative pedagogy situates the use of stories within teaching and explicitly within the sphere of educational learning and development. Narrative pedagogy, or using stories within an educational context, also needs to be understood within an appreciation of the broad social and cultural significance of storytelling. This research was conducted within EBL, which intentionally embeds critically reflective review of practice experiences throughout the sessions. The EBL sessions frequently included opportunities for shared reflection within the student discussions which was facilitated to include both personal and professional development. It proved to be advantageous to use such opportunities to encourage cathartic emotional release, which would not necessarily be possible within clinical placements.

Pre-registration nursing curricula are required to include learning outcomes that connect to psychomotor, affective and cognitive domains, which should be strengthened through the incorporation of reflection (NMC, 2010). Established learning priorities within nursing curricula include interpersonal skills, ethical awareness, leadership and patient-centred care. This research sought to explore how a new trigger could be employed that better enabled these more ‘difficult to teach’ aspects of the curriculum like the development of empathy, as also described by Alexander et al. (2012). Santo (2011), building on the work of Ironside (2006) and Diekelmann (1993), argued that narrative pedagogy facilitated the achievement of nursing programme learning outcomes in an enhanced and more enjoyable way, converging and transcending conventional
pedagogies. The traditional lecture followed by seminar format is well established and has its place in nurse education, but student attendance and satisfaction increases when the curricula have more to offer (Santo, 2011). As the nursing programme is so pressurised with respect to high levels of prescribed content, it is important that there are alternative, creative and enjoyable learning opportunities included into the curricula to offer a diverse and also balanced approach. This current research also demonstrated the positive impact of taking such a creative approach as part of an emerging evidence base that reveals how stories delivered through fiction film have educational value within professional healthcare courses, as linked to critical reflection. Santo (2011) claimed that her research demonstrated that nursing education which incorporates narrative pedagogy achieves better outcomes, especially in terms of considering the interpersonal features of effective practice. An aim of EBL is the consideration of links between theory and practice, which can be facilitated by student centred discussion. These links can also be facilitated by the effective use of narrative pedagogy, and tracking enhanced student engagement with the new triggers, which appeared to lead to more energised and reflective conversations. Reflection enables interpretive and multiperspectival thinking, which is inherently developmental through enhanced self-awareness (Taylor, 2006). This can and often does involve challenging taken for granted assumptions and leads to better decision making. Narrative pedagogy is facilitative of interpretive thinking, enabling meta-cognition (awareness as well as understanding of personal thought processes). It is essential within professional practice to be able to envisage ‘big pictures thinking’, anticipate alternative courses of action and develop a menu of variable responses tailored to unique situations. Meta-cognition incorporates consideration of personal knowledge, learning and ways to evaluate performance, which also connects with reflection (Bostrom & Lassen, 2006).

Developing the affective domain, the manner in which individuals deal with situations emotionally, incorporating feelings, values, appreciation, motivations, and attitudes should form an essential part of the curricula (Bloom, 1994). Development within this domain is just as valuable to learning the psychomotor
skills and competencies to perform in the role of nurse. Therefore explicitly considering the nature of caring, morality, advocacy, empathy and cultural sensitivity should form part of the nursing curricula, however hard it is to facilitate that learning (Diekelmann, 1993). Narrative pedagogy can make an important contribution to achieving this learning and the skills development enabling the ‘softer side’ of practice, alongside more conventional pedagogies. Emphasizing the affective and emotive elements of developing towards the registered nurse role is an important facet of what nurse educators need to do. Santo (2011) also found the use of narrative pedagogy to be more humanistic and experiential, supportive of emotional development occurring within the classroom, including crying and laughing. The classroom is arguably a safer place in which to allow for cathartic emotional exploration of feelings than would be appropriate within clinical practice where the care of the service user takes precedence. Narratives delivered through fictional film are potentially very powerful triggers to an emotive response, as students can empathise with the characters, as they are drawn into the viewing experience. Indeed in this research it was a significant finding how much the students did respond emotionally, which stimulated and sustained their engagement with the learning. It was also shown that this approach can enhance the development of listening skills, increasing attention spans and attentiveness.

The pressurised demands upon professional education increase the requirement for all of the curriculum to be efficiently delivered, to be effective and to explicitly connect to learning outcomes. Recognition of this was a significant stimulus to this research. Professional education should be memorable and key elements of this relate to the use of stories. Within this research, the students acknowledged that the time used to ‘try out’ the new trigger was ‘well spent’ because it improved their experience of EBL. Narrative pedagogy is argued to be an effective approach to promote impactful educational input (Walsh, 2011) because stories are engaging by design and therefore able to meet the learning needs of adult learners on professional programmes.
5.3 The social and cultural importance of storytelling

Warner (2014) has written prolifically about the social and cultural significance of storytelling including fairy tales in all of their vibrant and fantastical variations. The sharing of stories can be defined as a genre and evaluated as a literary form that changes and develops through both time and history. Warner’s contribution offers a persuasive case for the importance of storytelling to human learning, often represented as moral fable, as a crucial element of human understanding and culture. Both fictional and non-fictional stories can have an impact on learning. In the context of this research the use of fiction is specifically of interest and features of amplified, inauthentic ‘unreal’ stories have been explored. This is important because the potentially unrealistic nature of fictional film could have been a threat to the effectiveness of the new triggers. However this did not turn out to be the case within this research.

Within the literature review, stories were considered as having shape, pattern and potentially completeness. Stories have a structure, a start, middle and an end. They can ‘hook you in’ (Alexander, et al. 2012). Warner (1995) stated that stories wait to be discovered and rediscovered, promising creative enchantments, in terms of both characters and plotlines. Stories offer ‘magical metamorphoses’ to those who open the door, passing through, and enter the world that the storyteller brings. Within the literature review this phenomenon was also discussed in terms of teaching as a form of enchantment, including the explicit motivation to entertain (Bettelheim, 1991). Indeed the student responses within the data collection showed exactly that. The use of the fictional films drew in and held the students’ interest, it increased their enthusiasm to learn and to contribute. The subsequent discussions were more energised. The recall of the content of the sessions increased.

5.4 Using fiction within the classroom

Many of the students had been initially sceptical but were all eventually positive about the use of fictional film in the classroom setting:
“Initial scepticism but now [we] can see the relevance…It was a useful thing to do in the time [during SoLD]” (Group 1 Discussion notes)

From the literature, it was suggested that the students should be offered a choice of film titles and this proved to be appropriate because then the students had ‘ownership’ of that selection. The students were clear that there were both authentic and inauthentic elements to all of the dramatic representations shown, which could be anticipated in fictional stories. The students had been able to read summaries of the film choices before they made a selection. In the future, I would consider also playing the film trailers to assist in title selection.

One issue was whether the students could identify learning opportunities from within the materials used, so the films had to be grounded in some realism. I had factored in checking out all of these issues within the planning for these sessions. Whilst levels of realism within the fictional accounts might have been the initial concern, the data showed that relevance to learning experiences and resonance to clinical experiences were of greater importance. The students recognised the differences between the fictional films and their real experiences and enjoyed debating the contrasts, demonstrating that the trigger was effective in stimulating discussion. When the dramatic portrayal had appeared to be authentic, this had resulted in a discussion that compared the examples from within the drama to their own experiences. Nevertheless where the fictional presentations were not regarded as authentic because that part of the drama had appeared to be ‘unrealistic’ the discussion was equally vibrant because this provided a platform from which the students could contrast these elements of the stories with their real working experiences. Thus the sheer contrast proved effective as a point of debate.

Significant learning centred on discussing the plotlines, characters and their personal stories. These discussions included trying to unpack the issues, many of which were highly transferable to their practice. This affirmed that the fictional film triggers were useful and revealed how variable that impact could be depending on the nature of the stories. This could be reflected on in the light of literature that
had indicated the extraordinary range of various fictional film that could be used. This range included animation, blockbusters and science fiction. It is debateable whether some of the titles, particularly animations, may at first appear to be less appropriate to use within the context of professional education. However many Disney films contain moral fables and have been successfully used in educational contexts, although this has been predominantly in compulsory education (www.teachingwithmovies.org).

Many of the issues emerging within the fictional film stories were built upon powerful archetypes, some of which can be traced to deep roots within the human psyche like inner thoughts, feelings and motivations, so the narratives were highly resonant with the students’ lived experience. Humans are ‘taught’ through stories from early childhood and become familiar with this approach. The story as representation of social and cultural mores is relevant in informal and formal educational settings. Archetypes are elemental and universal ideas related to human experience are recognised in both image and emotion (Alexander, et al. 2012). The impact of fictional film can be considered within a context that recognises the significance of storytelling, presented in an optimal visually attractive and immediately engaging format.

Moral principles can be shared through the telling of myths and fables (Bettelheim, 1976; Warner, 1994), wherein characters can be constructed upon fundamental archetypes. These archetypes can connect with the collective consciousness of dominant imagery and themes. The findings of this research show that fictional films are an appropriate genre for exploring archetypal themes, due to the three dimensional imagery, with the capacity to appeal to multiple senses synchronously. The film viewing appealed to several senses at once, particularly sight and sound, but also the interplay between them. This collectively created a more emotive learning experience. The students were focused and engaged with the learning in a way that exceeded previous experiences of EBL using a variety of alternative triggers, which I noted as I taught both groups on several other modules throughout their course:
“I offer the students the option of a comfort break 1 hour into the viewing, which they decline. They all want to carry on watching the film. This is also unusual- SOLD sessions usually have ‘natural’ rest periods built into them after each hour. The students are ‘gripped’ by what they are watching, they want to know how this story ends. This is the first time that I have seen such focus amongst all members of the group all at the same time” (Observation Notes, Group 2).

The dynamic nature of film appeared to contribute to these experiences. The students described feelings of empathy and connections towards some of the fictional characters, which energised the consequent discussions. Even though the students were very clear that the representations were fictional, they often described caring about what happened to some of the characters.

In this way the narrative, real or fictional, can be transformative as it reaches into a deeper level of consciousness (Green, 2004). This phenomenon perhaps helps to explain the impact on student learning. Therefore many of the issues within stories are transferable, translatable and transformational, meaning that they can be generalised from, compared and contrasted. The learning inherent within stories can bring challenge and change to those who encounter them.

Archetypes represent typical examples of human qualities and commonplace experiences. The ‘magic’ of the archetype presented within fictional film involves the communication of hidden knowledge otherwise unknown, facets of which can be seen within the roles of the performers. Some of the context, inner dialogues and history can be explicit in a way that is unachievable in reality. This potential completeness of storytelling is capitalised on by film makers for dramatic effect. This creative mode of delivery and technology arguably felt more comfortable, contributing to it being appropriate in this particular context where the material needed to be particularly engaging. As suggested by Alexander:
“By portraying the realized and shadow aspects of archetypes, movies and of course literature help us reflect upon and learn from the successes and mistakes of the characters (Alexander, 2012, p.18).

The findings within this research reinforced the proposal that fictional film representations do not necessarily have to be realistic. Indeed the extremes of plot, story and character portrayed for dramatic effect can still lead to important and memorable learning. Both groups were intrigued by the development of some of the characters and the changes of the direction of their stories. Within the films that the groups had watched they were able to follow the plots and consider how some lives had progressed, some had struggled, others had stalled. Showing the complete films was helpful to facilitating reflection on complete stories.

Group 1 had been particularly interested in one character, an experienced nurse who was portrayed as having a problematic personal life, facets of which they knew would constitute a breach of the NMC Code (NMC, 2015). There had been scenes of drug taking and infidelity in the Doctors’ residences, as well as verbal conflict displayed within her ward, all of which called her professionalism into question. Later this nurse seemed to be attempting to recreate her senior status whilst in a temporary role when returning to practice as an Agency nurse, which the group felt would not be appropriate. The students were aware of many issues connected to the use of Agency staff in terms of contracted staff not generally feeling well supported by these temporary workers, whose partial contribution could leave them feeling resentful. However some of the students had witnessed examples of role conflict within real practice where team working within and beyond professional groups had ‘broken down’ and this had stimulated impassioned ethical debate regarding attitudes displayed at work.

These similar examples from real practice were discussed at length and in detail, a process which felt cathartic and diffused frustration with a healthcare system that did not always appear to be coping well under pressure. This was later reflected on by the first group in terms of their awareness that the professional
nursing regulator (NMC) had indeed cautioned some Registered Nurses regarding professional misconduct, including breaches of confidentiality. The students had reflected on the use of recording equipment in a clinical area, which this character engaged in as she had become a journalist as well as continuing to practice. This was presented as unusual within the ‘Bodies’ series but had also happened in reality. The real case of Margaret Haywood (http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/england/sussex/8002559.stm) had been legally as well as professionally challenging, and was deemed a serious breach of confidentiality, leading to the nurse being stuck off the NMC register. This was one of many discussions where the fictional accounts had led to comparisons with real cases and the consequent discussion was energised. Even more significant this debate was well remembered and revisited in later EBL, extending the impression of significant impact. The news regarding a local healthcare scandal involving the abusive behaviour of paid carers at Winterbourne View (Department of Health, 2012) was contemporary and it was timely to carefully reflect on implications for accountability, responsibilities, ‘whistle-blowing’ and standards of ethical practice (NMC, 2010).

5.5 The memorable nature of stories

The level of recall of the content of the fictional films was explored to consider whether the fictional films were memorable and indeed the enhanced level of detailed recall was affirmed by the students. The fictional film titles that the students had selected were described by the groups as challenging, ‘gritty’, ‘eye opening’ and easier to remember more fully in contrast to conventional prompts and content within seminars. Key examples of poor clinical practice were reflected on, with the students engaging in sustained and specific problem solving to identify how they would have dealt with each issue differently. Both groups had stated that they were reminded of the influence of many clinical issues within health and social care practice. Watching the episodes of the films had facilitated their insight into the stories, enabling the students to see the entire picture and draw out many complex strands for discussion. This finding was more analogous with the application of the approach taken by Lumlertgul, et al. (2009)
as opposed to the Cinemeducation volumes that frequently present the use of specific scenes (Alexander, et al. 2005; 2012). The groups were very positive about making time to view the complete films and responded that the completeness of the stories helped to make the trigger more memorable. Higher levels of recall over time had enabled the trigger to work beyond the initial EBL session in which the films had been shown, which extended the effectiveness of the approach. This compared favourably with the results of Alexander’s graduate survey, which similarly showed enhanced recall of detail even after some months (Alexander, 2005).

The selected films were fast paced and full of dramatic impact, with an emotive content that many of the respondents referred to in the interviews. Within a social, professional and political context wherein students need to develop resilience, this approach offers a positive and popular approach to learning resilience. Whilst the content was described by some as being depressing and miserable at times, due mainly to the scenes of social deprivation and poor clinical practice, the value of the stories to the learning process was never called into question. This approach could be viewed as a potential contribution towards preparedness for practice, as well as a springboard into in-depth critical reflection, both of which are essential (Davis, 2011; NMC, 2010).

The complex stories within the films were memorable, with multi-layered three-dimensional characters with whom the students often identified and empathised. There were some stark representations of victims who were portrayed as helpless and vulnerable, with consequent discussions considering how nurses could respond in terms of addressing areas of vulnerability. A number of the clinical staff had been portrayed as cold, authoritarian and stressed, which led to particularly important learning within the groups about interpersonal style, compassion fatigue and role boundaries. Within the group discussion it was possible to use this experience to connect into considerations of theory such as Figley’s (1993) views on compassion fatigue, which then led on to discussions related to Phillip Zimbardo’s Stanford prison experiments, which he re-visited in his more recent book, the Lucifer effect (Zimbardo, 2007). These theories were
compared with real accounts of working with ‘bad mentors’ in clinical placements, which both groups reflected on in detail.

The fictional accounts of certain aspects of client care particularly exemplified in the ‘Bodies’ drama did not always appear to be well coordinated, which again had resonance with the students’ lived experience because the representation of a highly pressurised and struggling health service was accurate. This led to very detailed discussions regarding how to manage the demands of clinical work effectively within practice, meet high consumer expectations and thereby avoid complaints. In the ‘Bodies’ series there had often been a distinct lack of empathy displayed either for the clients or between staff, which the students could relate to. There were examples of nepotism, bad practice and a lack of individualised care, many of which would constitute a breach of the code of conduct (NMC, 2015). The impression conveyed in the ‘Bodies’ drama was often bleak, which only compared with some rather than all of the students lived experiences. However there was considerable material within this drama that enabled effective discussions and reflections on how to counter bad practice, achieve evidence based practice and create a better environment in which to work. These fictional accounts were just the first layer on which to build vibrant, detailed and synthesised discussions. These discussions encompassed far better exemplars of shared group reflections than I had encountered in previous EBL.

There is theoretical underpinning which helps to explain the impact of fictional film. Discussing Dual Coding Theory, Clark and Pairio (1991) proposed that enhanced recall of educational material could be achieved when using both visual and auditory stimuli. Within film the use of imagery and sound is presented synchronously to learners. It is therefore proposed that the practical use of imagery, with language, more effectively mirrors the structure of real life experiences. Film is a medium that, by design, appeals to both the visual and auditory senses, often involving the use of music, so it effectively does appeal to more than one sense at the same time. This again adds to the emotive impact, at least partially through the use of music that reinforces the theatrical build-up of a scene, and amplifies the drama. A further important consideration is the ‘pictorial
superiority effect’, wherein the memory is enhanced through the use of pictures. The use of visual cues for illustrated effect is well established within education but is often exemplified in the use of photographs and artwork (Sieber and Hatcher, 2012). The use of film is far more dynamic and integrated than still pictures. Consideration of the ‘pictorial superiority effect’, which has been proposed to extend levels of recall, possibly through associative recognition, can also be typified by the Chinese proverb that ‘a picture is worth a thousand words’ (Nelson, et al. 1976). To extend this further the ‘moving picture’ offers more in that it presents complete stories in a dynamic way.

Bearing in mind the theoretical standpoint asserting the memorable impact of using pictures as previously discussed, as well as the impact of using narratives in all their forms (Warner, 2014; Santo, 2011; Diekelmann, 2003), but especially using fictional film (Alexander, et al. 2012; 2005), this all helps to explain the impact of fictional film, not just as a tool for entertainment but also for learning. It was important to explore the exact application of the use of fictional film within this research to see what specifically had been memorable and in what way. The level of recall demonstrated by the students within the interviews was a revelation to them and contrasted with how much they could remember from other EBL sessions delivered to them within the nursing programme. It can be suggested that the students expected the films to entertain them, but did not realise how much effective learning could also be subtly conveyed through the appropriate use of film in the EBL. Postman (1983), in his book ‘Amusing ourselves to death’, stated that by its very nature, television and film do not require prior knowledge in order to entertain. Designed to entertain rather than to educate, fictional film is nevertheless usually compelling, visually engaging and attention-grabbing. The data from this research indicates, however, that preparedness for the use of fictional film does enhance the educational impact of using fictional film as a trigger to learning. The use of fictional film is enhanced when the storylines are realistic, but clinical inaccuracies can also be utilised to stimulate vibrant discussion too. It is helpful to risk-assess the process by employing caution with the presentation of stereotypes in film, but this can be used as a foundation for the exploration of realities, possibilities and challenges to bias. Discussing the
incrementally more significant application of Cinemeducation, Frey (2012) stated that the strong visual components would demonstrate verbal components in the future education of future healthcare professionals, possibly offering further support for dual learning theory.

5.6 The relevance of fictional film to learning

Within the guided group discussions the students had been able to connect specific practice focused learning outcomes with issues distilled from watching the fictional films. This is important in terms of reinforcing the specific contribution that the fictional film can make to learning, so that it is not just an entertaining distraction. The students requested to see entire films, which they did, rather than using ‘exemplar scenes’ (which was one of the pedagogical alternatives). So in watching the entire film and seeing the ‘completeness’ of the stories delivered through the films, it was possible to link aspects of the fictional scenarios to all of the module learning outcomes at various times amidst the group discussions. This approach allowed for the students to make choices about which learning outcomes they wanted to explore, which is concordant with EBL. As this EBL runs alongside clinical practice it was crucial that the students could focus on aspects that connected with their current practice experiences. Taking this approach therefore increased student satisfaction with the EBL.

Learning outcomes that were especially prioritised by students within those group discussions included the development of leadership skills, professional judgement and decision-making, delegation, whistle-blowing, as well as the reality of accountability. The need for empathy and effective interpersonal communication including documentation, especially critical incident reporting, was also considered. These are important learning outcomes that are particularly challenging to teach (Alexander et al. 2012). There are many complex elements to consider, all of which required extensive discussion. The trigger provides the starting point. One of the sub-groups in Group 2 suggested that they felt that the ‘Bodies’ drama reinforced the public perception of what healthcare was like
'behind the scenes’, which caused them some concern. However in this case it was far more realistic than most other comparable dramas, even it was still slightly embellished for dramatic effect. The need to adhere to working within a safe scope of practice had been reinforced by mistakes the students had witnessed within the drama and the consequences of clinical errors were clear (in this episode, early in Series 1, a patient had died in very traumatic circumstances). The students had reflected on what the professional nursing responsibilities would have been toward the client and their family. There was also the need to consider the informal carers, including family, which was a really helpful lead in to considering service user and carer involvement within the group discussions. The discussions were not only sustained, detailed and relevant, they were synthesised and well evaluated. There was a lot of energy in the room and I would argue that this impacted positively on the student attention span.

There were several issues within the selected films that stimulated in-depth discussion regarding for example, ethical dilemmas, including consideration of the moral challenges inherent within professional healthcare practice. The work of Alexander et al. (2012) and Lenahan (2012) had indicated that effective translation of the human aspect of practice could be a positive effect of employing ‘Cinemeducation’. The stories within the films, including complex characterisations, had had an effect on the students. They cared enough about the stories to have impassioned discussions. The issue of how to deal with bad practice was quite dominant. Having worked with the Alaszewski (2003) paper when I first started facilitating this type of EBL in 2003, the concept of Clinical Governance was still very much to the forefront of the learning agenda.

Both groups had discussed the issue of whistle-blowing and how challenging that still was in practice. Despite explicit encouragement regarding the disclosure of poor practice in the NMC Code of Professional Conduct (NMC, 2015) the students remained concerned about how safe it was do so. This concern was amplified by awareness of scenarios where ‘whistle-blowing’ had not been well supported or the complainant protected from any repercussions. All of the students considered this to be alarming, but acknowledged that it could and
sometimes did happen. There had been well publicised cases of misconduct portrayed within the media. So sometimes the ‘whistle-blowing’ had effective follow up. Several students were aware of whistle blowers who had suffered for speaking out and questioned whether indeed it was possible to raise issues of concern in a safe way that did not reverberate back on the complainant. The drama indicated that whistle blowing was not safe and the students were inclined to agree with this portrayal from their own experiences in practice. There were still impressions of a medical ‘closed shop’, both within the fiction and reality where there still were cliques, hierarchies and ‘glass ceilings’. There were examples of bad practice and poor attitudes shown within the ‘Bodies’ drama, which had real resonance for the students and they felt that the EBL sessions provided a safe, confidential environment in which they could discuss this issues. When this led to discussions regarding poor practice that the participating students had witnessed this needed skilful facilitation to reassure those involved, either maintaining confidentiality or working through appropriate follow up. The key point here is that the students were doing most of the talking. This experience had felt like a ‘true’ representation of what EBL should be. I had found a way to enable the students to take the lead in their learning in an unobtrusive way.

5.7 Enquiry Based Learning

Educators are responsible for facilitating an environment which is consistently fit for purpose, whilst meeting the learning needs of a diverse population of students. Within the context of professional higher education, students are also responsible for their learning. There is therefore the need for active learning and acknowledgement of shared contribution to the effectiveness of the process.

“Learning is optimised when students develop meta-cognitive strategies (thinking about thinking)…Educators need to be mindful that effective learning is associated with three types of memory: working, sensory, and long term…” (Wilson et al. 2013, p.239).
The findings of this research reveal how interactive, engaged and memorable this EBL can be. Analogous to the ethos of narrative pedagogy, EBL should be student centred, creating opportunities for in-depth dialogue within which to achieve the learning outcomes through problem solving. Within this research it was observed how much more engaged the students were throughout the experience, reinforced by the extent to which the students themselves reiterated how positive the experience had been.

However it is important to highlight that this EBL approach requires the educator to be experienced and confident enough in their practice to work in new and potentially more demanding ways (Hutchings, 2007). This type of open, discursive and reflexive pedagogy is particularly relevant within the context of the now enhanced expectations of the professional regulator regarding reflective practice within nursing (NMC, 2015). Amidst a Higher Education environment that prioritises the student experience, pedagogies that do impact positively on the student experience are both timely and helpful (Gough, 2008). It was very encouraging how positive the students were in their evaluation of the new trigger, what has started out as a purely pedagogical aspiration had developed over time to witness political aspirations that also discussed teaching excellence, although with less educational explication from the Government.

For the purposes of this research it was important that the students were familiar with a conventional presentation of EBL, the style of facilitation used in EBL and the specific detail of the learning outcomes relevant to their practice modules. This baseline of expectations set a clear foundation and context from which to collectively evaluate the application of the new trigger (the use of fictional film) with the students. Thus the impact of the new trigger within this familiar EBL environment should suggest any changes are attributable to the innovation. As this was the students’ final year of undergraduate studies all of them were experienced learners, with a diverse range of clinical experiences on which to critically reflect within their EBL groups. The use of a familiar context was
therefore considered to be a strength in this research, as the student responses
to the new trigger (the new element) could be meaningfully and specifically
reflected upon.

5.7.1 Achieving a creative learning space

The students in both groups confirmed that they felt positive regarding the
appropriateness, effectiveness and relevance of the fictional film triggers used.
The guided group discussions had led to impassioned discussions about the
need to maintain non-judgemental positive regard towards clients, particularly
vulnerable people, who may well find it difficult to advocate for themselves.
Advocacy, adult protection and client empowerment connect with nursing roles.
The fictional film triggers were acting as catalysts to effective shared group
reflection, linked to essential practice focussed learning outcomes. There was
therefore consensus within both EBL groups that the selected fictional films were
appropriate to be used in this adult educational context.

Viewing the ‘Bodies’ series had very effectively stimulated both groups to
consider professionalism, the importance of compassion, and dignity in the
workplace. The importance of questioning decisions where challenge was
required and the appropriate use of language was also stressed, as well as the
need to establish effective therapeutic boundaries. The students within both
groups remained fully convinced that this approach was entirely appropriate to
their learning in this type of EBL within a practice orientated module. Whilst the
feedback was consistently positive, there were viable suggestions as to how the
approach could be developed still further. A consideration of the quality
assurance of the pedagogy was also relevant. Achievement of the learning
experiences as demonstrated within this research accords with the experiences
of Santo (2011) and Ironside (1999) who both stated that specific and
measurable evaluation of learning experiences was equally possible within
narrative pedagogy, as it was within more conventional teaching approaches.
The groups positively responded that the use of the films had initiated critical reflection about their own personal learning journeys and experiences. All students were consistently able to consider how meaningful the fictional film portrayals were, how they were resonant of clinical practice and that therefore this experience was providing an opportunity for in-depth constructive reflection. Arguably there could be future educational challenges to the use of creative arts including fictional media within professional education. The current context of resurgent stakeholder interest in standardised input, competency driven and clinical skills based nurse education could be viewed as a potential conservative restraint on innovation. However it was deduced from the data that the link to practice focused learning outcomes can be equally transparent and embedded within creative pedagogies. Therefore the findings emergent within this research support the use of fictional film. The fictional film triggers were part of a useful learning strategy to engage in because there was the need for discussion that enabled consideration of the more complex, more challenging and upsetting areas of practice. The now increasing evidence base regarding Cinemeducation advocates that this approach can effectively enable reflection on personal attitudes, ethical dilemmas and person centred care (Alexander, 2012). This research further supports that assertion.

5.8 Building resilience

Considering the necessity of incorporating the affective domain within nursing education, it could be argued that cathartic emotional release within the classroom is an entirely legitimate part of the preparation for practice and important to help the student to build resilience (Davis, 2011; Alterio & McDrury, 2003). Within the ‘safe’ learning space of the classroom, students can rehearse their development into emotional maturity, including sensitivity to a range of ethical, psycho-social and cultural diversity issues (Alexander, 2011). The learning experiences within this research were described by the students as at times tense, emotionally challenging, exhausting and at times both infuriating and frustrating. They had considered so many of the strong stories within the drama
and found themselves contemplating how anyone could become vulnerable. The positive impact on the student experience was recurrently fed back in response to the learning experiences.

Both groups gave positive evaluations of the enhanced emotional engagement with and impact of using fictional film to trigger relevant discussions. There was recognition of the ease with which the stories led to debate wherein other stories unfolded from the group reflections. This shared reflection involved both comparisons and contrasts to be made between what had been viewed in the films and what had been experienced in practice. The discussions led to consideration of how the students adapted to working in clinical practice, building resilience to meet the demands they encountered there. The authentic and inauthentic aspects of the film had been equally useful in stimulating discussions, as the students were able to consider both with equal interest, partly because they had a growing archive of their own strong stories with which to contextualise their opinions of practice issues. There was therefore a range of emotions acknowledged, including frustration at some of the stereotypical accounts of healthcare professionals within the drama and anger at the representations of bad practice. In considering these strong emotions within the safe learning space of the classroom, the students were sharing ideas, rehearsing arguments and ultimately developing themselves in preparation for the increasing demands of practice. Lumlertgul et al. (2009) were clear that the use of relevant fictional film could introduce students to scenarios not previously encountered, so this was a legitimate alternative approach to more conventional delivery.

Building resilience should not be confused with desensitisation which might lead to emotionally blunted practice or compassion fatigue (Figley, 1993) and the types of brutal cruelty reported by Zimbardo (2007). As Santo (2011) discussed, within narrative pedagogy this is an opportunity to rehearse how to approach difficult situations, with the students taking the lead in problem solving, underscoring the educational philosophy of EBL wherein the capacity for practice and personal development is discussed. Being aware of the potential for
problems like compassion fatigue is important in helping students to contemplate how to build the emotional integrity and resilience to avoid getting ‘burnt out’. It is equally essential to situate this within a social and political climate of rapid change, wherein there is every need to sustain a commitment to lifelong learning (Taylor, 2010).

5.8.1 Emotional preparedness

Many of the key authors considered within the literature review such as (Santo, 2011; Ironside, 2006; Alexander, 2005; Diekelmann, 2003) referred to the emotional significance of the presentation of narratives. This could be particularly explicit with the use of fictional film. The viewing of these fictional films could be interpreted as being an emotional catalyst, a trigger to considering empathy, and an opportunity to contemplate a range of competing perspectives amongst the characters within the stories.

The students reflected openly on their emotional response to watching the selected fictional films. As a prompt to stimulate the group discussions the use of film worked very well because of, rather than despite, the emotive content. The students were very open in discussing the emotional impact on them of the material that they were watching and remained enthused that this was an effective strategy to ignite their interest and initiate critical reflection. Following careful consultation with colleagues, alongside the suggestions in the literature review (Alexander et al. 2012, Edwards, 2010; Alexander et al. 2005; Raingruber, 2003), appropriate film titles were used as part of a strategy to challenge but also to risk manage the research process and proceed ethically.

Part of the rationale for the learning approach taken was identifying pedagogical strategies that could enhance the development of empathy, interpersonal awareness as well as sensitivity to multiple stakeholder perspectives. These are all features of what could be termed emotional intelligence. Emotional intelligence involves the ability to recognise the emotional state in both oneself and other people (Goleman, 1995). Through doing so the individual can discriminate
between various feelings and label them accordingly. The emotionally intelligent can use emotional information to guide both their thinking and behaviour, whilst also managing emotions to adapt to different environments. Goleman (1999) extended this consideration in his book ‘Working with emotional intelligence’, proposing that the ability to work collaboratively with others in teams was a benchmark of employability as well as emotional resilience.

Nurse education has a responsibility to enable students to develop resilience as part of a process that build towards preparedness for practice. This process includes promoting the imperative of effective team-working. Thus Goleman’s work on emotional and social intelligence is now worth following up on in the face of what this research has revealed and how students need to adapt to an increasingly pressurised health service. Building resilience is one of the core learning outcomes being built into current curricula, and Goleman’s theories should have a contribution to make to this. The EBL approach contributed to this development by getting the students to reflect together, be sensitive to competing perspectives and consider how they could support each other in challenging circumstances. In many ways the inauthentic fictional accounts were especially helpful because the students could talk vibrantly and enthusiastically about how it was different for them, with their commitment to each other and engagement with evidence based practice.

5.9 Reflexivity

There are many definitions of reflexivity, but in the context of nurse education the interpretations in Timmins’ (2005) paper will be used. In this context the practitioner questions their own personal values and assumptions, truly contemplating how practice can be conceptualised differently, also considering the wider context around them. So personal reflexivity refers to how an individual reflects on their beliefs, values, and how their interests influence their work (Timmins, 2005). This can be seen to be a continuous, inter-related and incrementally developmental process (Dallos and Stedman, 2009). This is exactly
the type of active and potentially shared reflective activity that should be encouraged within EBL. In order for EBL to work well, particularly practice focused EBL, it is essential for the students to fully engage in explicitly developmental critical reflection or reflexivity (Davis, 2011). Fundamentally, truly active reflection like this can be interpreted as referring to cyclical and dialogical relationships between cause and effect (Taylor, 2006). Distinct from reflection alone, reflexivity can be defined as a more dynamic self-critical reflective approach that is informed by asking critical questions of practice and how professional knowledge is constructed. This might be considered in comparison with critical reflection and at times the two terms can be seen to be used interchangeably. Reflexivity encompasses the affective domain (Bloom, 1995), building from reflection towards specific competence development, as well as ‘working through’ the emotional labour of professional practice. Whilst acknowledging the distinctions that might be made between various interpretations of the term reflexivity, the capacity for this approach to support all of the above aspirations is concordant with the aspirations of effective EBL.

Critically reflecting on practice, including challenge, contemplating change and transformation are all features of the type of EBL that was encouraged and achieved within this research. When evidence based practice is shared, when stories of problems within practice are laid bare and debated, the foundation is laid for practice to evolve. Practice can then improve on the basis of a predominantly retrospective review (Taylor, 2006). Some of the reflection within the groups contemplated the contrasts that could be drawn between the real practical experiences of the students and the fictional examples of practice, which provided insight into the intellectual and professional benefits of being proactive and open to new ideas. Pedagogical approaches that stimulate reflection within the EBL group contribute to the development of resilience and preparedness for practice, both of which are essential elements contributing to the success of professional healthcare education (Santo, 2011).

The capacity for reflection to ignite double loop learning (Davis, 2011) also situates this within an approach that can be facilitative of personal development
and transformation, in a way that recognises and values relevant evidence. Narrative approaches draw meaning, emotional engagement and catharsis into the learning situation (Santo 2011). All of these features of effective educational practice have surfaced within this research.

**5.10 Summary**

The students in both groups regarded the use of the fictional films positively and indeed wanted to continue their experience of using them within their practice focused learning. The experience had been regarded as appropriate, relevant, memorable and valuable. This consistent positive student response to the introduction of a new trigger was encouraging, including the use of whole films. The work of Alexander et al. (2004; 2012) on using ‘Cinemeducation’ within medical education as well as other relevant literature (Wilson, 2013; Lumlertgul, et al. 2009) similarly presented the positive impact of this pedagogy on the student experience.

The use of fictional film was also found to be useful as a stimulus to reenergise the less motivated students within the group, contrasting with the application of other more conventional triggers, which had previously failed to achieve that. Attendance at EBL was good within both of these groups. Within this research all of the fictional films used were effective in achieving enhanced student engagement with the learning outcomes leading to a perception of more impactful and memorable learning. Thus there can be confidence in the fictional film resources selected and the process employed within this resource.

Within this current research the students universally reported that they would like to learn in this way far more within their undergraduate programme. Some declared that they intended to buy or borrow the DVD titles and watch the whole ‘Bodies’ series, to re-engage with this learning and to further their experience of the ‘whole stories’. The students could also re-visit the selected dramas on campus as the titles were available within the library, and several of them did so. There had been some changes in terminology and practices over time, but they
still could follow the dramas. The film choices were considered relevant and authentic. The students had wanted more time to discuss the issues, which in itself was a breakthrough as students are usually very fatigued at this stage in their programme and had previously been far less enthusiastic to return to the university to engage with EBL.

Whilst a wide variety of trigger resources can work, in the current climate of rapid and extreme change within nurse education, as well as higher education more broadly, a focus on advancing the student experience is essential. The future political focus on teaching excellence makes this all the more important. In a context where students do not have to attend seminars, the prospect of entering the classroom needs to be inviting to the student who must immediately sense the potential impact of the learning on their practice.

Throughout this research the application of fictional film as a trigger to EBL has been presented as a creative and innovative method of initiating and sustaining learning conversations within the classroom. On commencement of this research one of the aims was to identify appropriate, engaging and effective fictional film triggers that would energise the practice focused discussions within this part of the nursing curriculum. The pedagogical motivation was to enthuse and fully engage the student groups in practice-focused critical reflection, using the fictional film as the stimulus to ignite discussion. The research maintained an open and explorative approach, which was progressed in an enabling and collegiate manner. This is concordant not only with the philosophical positioning of the research but is also appropriate for the student centred EBL approach. It is essential within EBL that the triggers work effectively in initiating fully engaged student led learning and to do so these triggers must be credible, resonant, meaningful as well as perceived to be valuable.

The findings of this study therefore add further evidence that the use of fictional film within EBL can be effectively integrated as a viable educational element of pre-registration nursing studies. This approach draws together narrative
pedagogy delivered in an EBL format and may indeed be helpful as an integrated part of the curricula that prepares nursing students for professional practice specifically and professionalism more broadly. Healthcare professionals need to possess and develop insight into the human condition. If watching film can help to enhance this then the media earns its place within the nursing curricula.
Chapter Six

Conclusions

6.0 Introduction

This thesis has presented a study that conducted an exploration into the use of fictional film as a trigger to enquiry based learning (EBL). EBL has already been established as an important part of the pre-registration nursing curricula within the organisation where this research was conducted, and it involves facilitated student led, practice focused learning in this context. However prior to this research the EBL was not consistently applied in the context, in the way that the literature might advocate (Kahn and O’Rourke, 2004). Conventionally there has been a tendency within nursing curricula in higher education to use traditional methods, such as lectures followed by seminars, to deliver the requisite knowledge and skills that relate to practice (Santo, 2011), which is still a dominant feature now. As an established educator and experienced facilitator of EBL sessions in an undergraduate pre-registration nursing programme, I recognised that there may well be more creative and effective teaching and learning approaches. This idea therefore presented an opportunity to undertake this research that entailed using a select range of fictional films and then attempting to understand the impact this had on the students and their learning.

This final chapter draws conclusions from the research and indicates how this study helps to bring together the theory and practice of education in this specific context, as well as considering the impact that the findings could have on nurse education per se and the role of the nurse educator. It finishes with reflections on the strengths and limitations of the study, as well as future plans for the implementation of the research. In support of the main research aim, three research questions had been identified and they informed the study. The extent to which each question has been answered is now considered.
6.0.1 What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer educationally to the students’ learning experience?

The EBL approach has been developed and a growing body of evidence is presented online through the Centre for Excellence in Enquiry Based Learning based at Manchester University. This research was an opportunity to explore how EBL could be applied with nurse education in the truly open, flexible, student centred manner that was described in that evidence (http://www.ceebl.manchester.ac.uk/ebl/). EBL broadly embraces what can be termed a problem based approach, where the facilitator poses questions or prompts and then facilitates the students to discover their answers. According to Kahn and O’Rourke (2004), EBL uses triggers within the initial scenarios, which may suggest relevant lines of enquiry. Within this research it was the new trigger, the use of fictional film that constituted the innovation. The first research question focuses attention on whether that trigger was effective as an educational tool.

The literature identified in Chapter Two suggested that they had found the use of fictional film to be useful within their classrooms. Practitioners had reported in the literature that the use of fictional film had worked as an educational tool within other professional groups and a variety of international settings, (Alexander et al. 2012; Edwards, 2010; Masters, 2005; Alexander et al. 2005; Raingruber, 2003). The question as to whether this would work within a UK based nursing curricula remained to be answered. The benchmarks of a successful educational tool include student satisfaction with the process, optimal student engagement and the achievement of learning outcomes for that session. The data collected through the three methods confirmed that the new trigger had worked within this research. The students within both groups had confirmed that they enjoyed the process and felt that they had achieved the outcomes identified within those EBL sessions. Alexander et al. (2012) stated that fictional films could effectively trigger group discussions, motivate and inspire students to learn, as well as reenergise the unmotivated amongst them. The research data confirmed all of these assertions.

Santo (2011) described how conventional pedagogies have sought to promote the teacher led presentation of propositional knowledge. This approach does still
have a place in nurse education, for example delivering physiology lectures and clinical skills development within simulation sessions. However this study has shown that the use of fictional film, harnessing the attributes of narrative pedagogy, can enable session content to be far more memorable. The showing of fictional film also facilitated increased group insight into the multifaceted nature of clinical practice. It can be concluded that the application of powerful and visually engaging media within the classroom is a cathartic ‘tool’. Keeping it as part of the teaching ‘toolkit’, this approach can initiate a strong emotional impact on the students, which is likely to make for more memorable learning experiences.

6.0.2 What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer aesthetically to the students’ learning experience?

The second research question related to the use of the media specifically the experience of watching film. The fictional film trigger is, in essence, an art form, and this research question is focusing on the use of fictional film which, although not explicitly designed to deliver formal education, contains within it elements that encourage learning. Alexander (2012), in the second ‘Cinemeducation’ volume, proposed that cinema was an ideal art form to effectively learn what it means to be human, and to promote an appreciation of empathy. This approach was asserted to be a visual and time efficient way for the participants to take on the role of ‘voyeur’, from a safe distance, and briefly inhabit others’ lives. The synergy of image, sound and context contributed to a presentation of powerful storytelling. There were also practical advantages in that the media was easy to obtain at low cost, straightforward to use within the classroom, and with an extensive selection of topics available. The viewing of whole films and complete stories allowed for the context and complexity of the narratives to be considered. This included the perception of verbal and non-verbal cues, which was particularly engaging to the students.

Of concern within this research was the potential for fictional accounts to be ‘unreal’. However the findings revealed that even if the story lines were unreal this could be used to advantage in stimulating group reflection that compared the
fictional film stories to scenarios encountered in real practice. As EBL in this context should enable shared critical reflection, this was another positive outcome.

6.0.3 What does the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL offer emotionally to the students' learning experience?

Lumlertgul, et al. (2009) considered the challenges inherent within medical education, including the struggle to define professionalism. They stated that, however professionalism is defined, it includes value sets, specific behaviours and relationship building, in ways that should inspire public trust (NMC, 2015). Dealing with difficult situations, including breaking bad news and conflict resolution, require emotional resilience. One of the themes within this research relates to how the development of emotional resilience can be facilitated. Alexander, et al. (2012) and Lumlertgul, et al. (2009) considered how fictional films can be emotionally captivating and much of this impact relates to the aesthetic way in which the media is presented, as discussed above. The use of imagery, music, characterisation and plot development can all prove to be emotive. A concern within this research related to whether this was therefore appropriate material to use within the classroom, where up to thirty nursing students would be viewing the films together. I was mindful of other creative arts triggers that had been used in the past which had turned out to be very emotive and had experienced students crying in the classroom. My concern related to the potentially stronger emotive trigger provided by the visual and dramatic genre of fictional film. The literature on the use of fictional film in formal educational settings was, however, encouraging that this was a safe trigger to use, if well facilitated (Alexander et al. 2012; Edwards, 2010; Alexander et al. 2005; Raingruber, 2003). I did indeed find that this issue could be well managed within the classroom. The findings within this research are similar to the findings of the Alexander (2005) research in suggesting that the students enjoyed being entertained while they were learning, this was a powerful stimulus to learning:
“movies allow us to briefly inhabit a conscious dream state, one that is populated by larger-than-life figures...they also provide viewers with profound insights” (Alexander, 2005, p.3).

Healthcare is often delivered under circumstances where resources are under pressure, and where both consumer expectations and emotions are running high. Building the resilience to deal effectively with these types of scenarios is essential and should arguably start in the classroom and not in the clinical area. However, a further consideration is that fictional film can be particularly harrowing, sometimes deliberately so to create effect, whereas real life (and death) situations are upsetting but in different ways. This prompted the consideration as to whether crying in the classroom was therefore a better alternative. The fictional film was potentially emotive, but the setting was safer for rehearsing how to respond to difficult situations. The student responses to the selected fictional films indicated that whilst the material was challenging viewing, and some of them did cry, exposure to emotional situations in the classroom setting and students’ emotional responses is safe in the classroom setting. In the classroom emotional issues can be unpicked, supported, explored in that setting much more easily than in the real life clinical setting.

The approach was therefore impactful as it was suffused with ethical dilemmas, problems, death and trauma, but this could all be discussed at a safe distance from the practice that the students were being prepared for.

6.1 Key conclusions

Having developed an initial idea for the research, the literature review proved crucial in identifying relevant sources, establishing connections to potential themes and revealing good practice guidance. The literature review also revealed gaps in knowledge in relation to the use of fictional film as a trigger to EBL. The use of fictional film within EBL is linked to ‘narrative pedagogy’, a teaching
approach that fully recognises and capitalises upon the educational impact of stories (Santo, 2011; Ironside, 2006). This was a strong theme within the literature review, at least in part, because it connected the use of story with an educational purpose to the use of film with the same aspiration. Narrative pedagogy inherently involves the communication of meanings between people, encompassing past, present and future (Diekelmann 2003). Within nurse education, the main goal of this approach can be harnessed to promote student understanding of the complexities of the caring sciences, processes of care delivery and the rationales for action, along the way to becoming a nurse (Santo, 2011; Ironside, 2006).

Owen-Mills (1995) described a synthesis of caring praxis and critical social theory in an emancipatory curriculum. Owen-Mills (1995) stated that within nurse education, for caring to be received by students as a core value, for caring to be taught and the process experienced by the students as empowering, then a nurturing and caring learning environment must be created by the nurse educator, (Owen-Mills, 1995). This statement strongly underscores the importance of facilitating EBL in a narrative way, to enable professional education that is both meaningful and memorable for the students. In order to establish this caring approach to education, it can be argued that nursing educators need to exemplify the kind of emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1995) they would wish to promote as well as intelligent kindness (Ballatt & Campling, 2011) in order to work effectively with students. At the same time they aim to develop both professional and ethical competence, within challenging healthcare work.

It can be concluded from the literature and the study’s findings that the use of fictional films offers an almost limitless repertoire of learning material, in terms of the number of available relevant film titles and their subject matter (Alexander et al. 2012; Edwards, 2010; Alexander et al. 2005; Raingruber, 2003). This is important because innovative teachers should always be searching out new resources to support their work. The social, cultural and emotional significance of stories is an aspect considered throughout the thesis (Warner, 2014; Warner 1994b), drawing with it important connections to reflective practice, reflexivity, critical debate and practice-focused discussion (Santo, 2011; Taylor, 2006). The
data from this research affirmed these connections, as well as giving rise to key themes specifically related to the use of the new trigger of fictional film. These themes revealed the enduring impact of such films in terms of authenticity, memorability, emotional engagement, practical relevance and sustaining safe learning environments. As such, it is suggested that the use of fictional film can act as a bridge between theory and practice, both within education and clinical practice.

In addition, it can be concluded that the current development in professional education of ‘Cinemeducation’ and narrative pedagogy has relevance within nurse education and gives rise to recommendations for its increased use in nurse education programmes. However, as discussed in Chapter Five, there are reservations about the use of the specific term Cinemeducation in the context of this research because that refers to medical education specifically. The point here is a semantic one, relating to the use of the word medical and in no way detracts from the progress that all healthcare professionals are making in delivering holistic education and care.

6. 2 Implications for nurse education

Taking into account the depth and range of learning outcomes required within the pre-registration nursing curricula, it is essential to deliver curricula in an efficient and effective manner. However, much of the Cinemeducation and narrative pedagogy literature revealed that this could also be enjoyable (Wilson et al. 2013; Santo, 2011; Raingruber, 2003). The literature review revealed a range of creative approaches to professional education, although none of these were based within UK adult nursing education. One of the most influential sources, Alexander et al. (2012), presented an ongoing and evolutionary approach to professional education that catalogued the use of fictional film within medical education, particularly focusing on the issues of ethics, communication skills and emotional resilience training. Alexander et al. (2012) advocated that there are unique advantages to employing fictional film, including television, to educate learners, within professional higher education. There is easy access to almost
limitless case studies, with no associated confidentiality problems. In addition, there is an accessible and broad spectrum of relevant topics that all connect to set learning outcomes. Furthermore, the use of multimedia resources is an appealing format for media-saturated and media-literate generations (Frey, 2011), helping to make learning fun. More importantly, however, is that the approach is facilitative of the development of empathy, critical reflection and emotional intelligence (Santo, 2011; Goleman). This approach can therefore strengthen the teacher-student bond through the application on non-hierarchical shared storytelling and reflection. EBL can flatten down any perceived barrier between those who deliver and receive education.

In the context of a full nursing curriculum, where all learning outcomes are essential (NMC, 2010), time is pressured and the student experience is critically important in terms of the National Student Survey, this research suggests that the use of fictional film in professional education is to be recommended. The essential components of pre-registration nurse curricula can be challenging to deliver within three years. In order to prepare nursing students to communicate effectively, work within effective ethical boundaries and develop emotional intelligence, narrative pedagogy is a valuable approach to take.

Within this study, using fictional film triggers in an overarching context of narrative pedagogy within EBL has been demonstrated to be a creative approach, which makes a valuable contribution to nurse education at a time when the need for innovative delivery is particularly high as student expectations continue to rise. The use of stories with educational purpose has a longitudinal, well established evidence base (Santo, 2011; Warner, 1994b; Bettelheim, 1976). This was further demonstrated within this research, reinforcing that this is a creative approach that could be widely adopted within UK pre-registration nursing programmes. This must be well prepared for, presented to the students with a transparent rationale and supported effectively at every stage. Narrative pedagogy is enshrined in an educational philosophy that promotes and optimises the student learning experience, which is timely in view of funding changes, expedient in terms of time pressures and educationally effective. Within professional programmes, students
often report that they prefer their clinical placements to theory sessions. It is therefore important that nurse educators ensure that the classroom experience is as engaging as possible.

A foundation upon which to support the development of EBL is strengthened by the explicit role modelling of and advocacy for reflexivity to develop professional practice. Promoting the use of reflective models and the application of reflection dovetails into this but in no ways completes that process. This matters because it can contribute strategies to enable deeper learning, learning which is sensitive to the development of empathy, interpersonal communication and care management.

The use of stories and reflection within student led learning is engaging, emancipatory and collaborative (Davis, 2011; Taylor, 2006). As both EBL and narrative pedagogy are open, flexible, reflexive and student-centred (Hutchings, 2007, Kahn and O’Rourke, 2004), these more creative approaches are entirely appropriate for professional education. In both EBL and narrative pedagogy the emphasis moves away from the teacher as the imparter of knowledge and the student as the recipient, to the student being more responsible for their learning (Ironside, 2006; Diekelmann, 1993). In essence there is a shift in the emphasis and balance of power from teaching to learning and from teacher to student and this is important in sweeping away learning barriers alongside inappropriate perceptions of power. Both EBL and narrative pedagogy personalise the learning environment, considering the complexity of human experience in an engaging and memorable way. The use of fictional film also adds depth and detail to the characterisations and stories. This narrative approach can form a platform from which critical discussions of key issues arising from the stories can be translated through to reflections on real practice that can then be further explored.

The literature review identified practical suggestions for the effective delivery of fictional film within EBL, which are referred to as good practice guidelines. This synthesis of good practice guidance, based on careful preparation includes the
selection of film titles negotiated with the students, facilitator presence maintained during the film transmission and critically reflective de-briefing afterwards. The use of fictional film with educational intent should be thoroughly introduced to the students, sharing the rationale for the approach being taken, with supported learning packs offered to inform the process. As with any form of EBL, the students should be reassured that this session has been well prepared for, ideally by the students themselves as well as the facilitator. Ideally part of the preparation for each EBL session involved watching the films in full, usually several times, to identify key learning points to inform the development of supported learning packs. The teacher that facilitates this approach must be confident, competent and fully knowledgeable with regard to the topics likely to be raised by the films in order to sustain focus on the relevant learning outcomes (Persson & Persson, 2008). To complete 360 degree review of the plans for each EBL session, these should be critically considered and discussed with student representatives and other colleagues to enable effective peer review (Edwards, 2010). There is therefore a growing body of evidence to support the pedagogical use of fictional film, but that needs to be developed further in UK nurse education.

Originating within non-UK nurse education, both Raingruber’s (2003) and Santo’s (2011) experiences of conducting their studies using fictional film and narrative pedagogy respectively, added to a developing body of knowledge. In addition to the work of Raingruber (2003) and Santo (2010), this research reported here also now contributes to the developing evidence base that promotes the use of fictional film and narrative pedagogy within nurse education, both critically and reflectively. The research outcomes have been rich and multi-faceted, and inform the use of these approaches within UK nursing education.

The guided group discussions and positive student feedback demonstrated this new pedagogy to be an impactful and important teaching and learning tool. However, due to the breadth of mandatory NMC standards for pre-registration nursing curricula, it is recommended that this approach is used to complement rather than replace existing conventional pedagogies. The literature review indicated that the use of fictional film in teaching should be balanced alongside the use of more traditional methods (Santo, 2011; Raingruber, 2003). This use of
multiple and complementary pedagogies is essential to deliver such a diverse and complex programme which is designed to fully prepare the nursing student to deliver clinically effective care within a fast paced, ever-changing environment.

Practice-focused EBL is respectful of the need to translate theoretical learning into clinical practice, and facilitates the dialogue between these two critically important elements. The nursing student should be a ‘knowledgeable doer’, collegiate, compassionate and reflective, and possess the skills and knowledge required of a graduate healthcare professional. In addition to possessing the knowledge and skills needed to deliver high quality patient care, students also need to develop transferable skills; recognising the need for potential ranges of action within professional practice. Learning to be a professional must therefore involve significant and regular opportunities to debate clinically relevant issues.

6.2.1 Implications for educational practice

In addition to considering the implications for nurse education, this research also has considerations that can be highlighted in the context of higher education more broadly. The use of EBL is enabling of student-centred, critically reflective student learning which, similar to narrative pedagogy, is delivered in a manner that they enjoy (Kahn and O’Rourke, 2004). EBL overtly values the various abilities and experiences that students bring to every learning situation, so the learning should progress within an atmosphere of shared respect (Hutchings, 2007; Hutchings, 2006). Linking EBL with narrative pedagogy, fictional film and reflection is a powerful blend, which is conducive to creating opportunities for in-depth, memorable learning with more potential to enhance student-centred learning approaches.

It is important to situate such a student-centred approach in a social and political climate of rapid change, including for example the government’s proposal for a ‘Teaching Excellence Framework’ (HEFCE, 2015). Despite the challenges concerning the precise definition of what teaching excellence specifically constitutes, the Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF) aims to recognise and
reward excellence in learning and teaching. Student satisfaction with learning will be one metric of the TEF. In addition, course fees in excess of £9000 per annum for undergraduates, will also set high expectations of teaching delivery from students. There is therefore an educational imperative within higher education to sustain a commitment to lifelong learning on the part of both students and teachers, which is entirely concordant with professional education. Within a higher educational climate in the UK that prioritises the student experience as evidenced in, for example, the National Student Survey performance, the importance of delivering education in ways that are popular and meaningful with students also matters profoundly. The students in this study were clearly of the view that the new fictional film triggers had been more effective than traditional teaching triggers in encouraging, initiating and sustaining group discussion. These discussions explicitly moved from considering fictional stories to facilitating wider reflections on their real clinical experiences, which then led to debates regarding clinically effective practice more broadly. This is exactly the direction of movement that EBL needs to facilitate.

6.3 Reflections on the research process

6.3.1 Strengths within the research design

There were a number of strengths within the research. It had one main broad explorative aim, specific enough to be achievable with the use of an in-depth relatively small-scale qualitative approach. The intention of the research was to gather data related to the perspectives of nursing students regarding their experiences of the use of fictional film as a trigger to the EBL within their seminars. Silverman (2013) recommended pursuing investigations into what matters on a personal or professional level, capitalising on the enthusiasm generated by genuine interest. This is certainly the case with this research on both personal and professional levels. Taking a qualitative approach was not the only research design option, but proved to be appropriate for this study. Taking a step-by-step approach to refining the research design has strengthened the study, so that challenges to the process have been risk managed.
One of the earliest opportunities to defend the research design is when the ethics application is drawn up and the research proposal is reviewed through the process of applying for ethical approval. Distinct from the researcher who asserts that human experience can be described in pure terms, the constructivist or ‘interpretivist’ researcher suggests that in order to understand the world and the meanings inherent within it, the researcher must inevitably make interpretations (Clarke and Braun, 2013; Schwandt, 1998; Cohen & Manion, 1994). It is important within this approach to demonstrate fundamental respect for the uniqueness of all individual experiences and inquiry in this context needs to recognise that. The qualitative researcher can celebrate the individuality of “first-person, subjective experience” (Schwandt, 1998, p.223). Therefore whilst this was a creative approach, introducing new and emotionally demanding learning material, it progressed in an ethical and risk managed manner, which the students responded to positively.

Both the students and I made personal, observational and reflective notes during the data collection phases of each EBL session, highlighting aspects of personal development, documenting experiences, and (for me) preparing for the interviews that followed the EBL experiences. The different methods of data collection complemented each other, and provided different perspectives to explore the research questions. The students were well prepared and informed for every part of their participation in the research to enable them to feel empowered and active participants within the process. I always endeavoured to be very transparent with the students about the research design and ethical aspects of the study, which I hope strengthened the study. This transparency certainly engaged their interest in the study.

Within ‘insider research’ there is an enhanced need for sensitivity towards colleagues and student-participants. Costly et al. (2010) considered the experience of being both researcher and practitioner synchronously and how some ‘blurring’ of boundaries might be a risk, especially to impartiality. However in the case of this research it did not feel uncomfortable nor did it raise particular
challenges for me, although this in no way fostered complacency regarding safeguarding the interests of the participants. Insiders can contribute a unique perspective (Alexander, 2005; Raingruber, 2003) as well as experiencing several positive benefits such as ease of access to the sites of data collection. As a member of academic staff who was familiar to all of the participants, my role was very much as an insider researcher. So it was important that this role did not in any way negatively influence the conduct of the research or my position as the EBL facilitator. As an experienced EBL facilitator, the students could have viewed me as an authority figure in a position of power, which in this context would have been ironic and unfortunate. However adopting an approachable and democratic style helped me to ameliorate the risk. Predicated on an approach that allowed for more free and open discussion, the guided group discussions generated rich data across both EBL groups. As discussed previously, there was a great deal of preparation invested in this phase of the research. This included the identification of appropriate fictional film titles with the same fictional film resources being used within both group discussions.

6.3.2 Limitations within the research design

It would have been possible to progress the research design in a variety of different ways. The overarching design could have been that of a quasi-experiment or an action research study. Alternatively, the qualitative approach taken could have been more specific, for example using an overtly phenomenological stance or grounded theory. It could equally be countered that the sample size could have benefited from being larger in terms of recruiting more groups into the study, including EBL across all three years of the undergraduate programme. This could have enabled comparison of student responses across the programme, rather than only in the final year. This could have contributed interesting data in terms of whether the use of fictional film could work as well earlier in to the programme. However, it is considered that the methods of data collection used were appropriate though it could have been additionally helpful if all of the data collection was filmed to create even richer
collection of data. In addition, I would have liked to have conducted individual interviews with all of the participating students to gain an even greater sense of the individual impact of the use of fictional film. Whether this would have fundamentally changed the findings is debateable, as data saturation was being achieved.

6.4 Reflection on my own development

This research has been conducted within the University campus where I learned to be a nurse, a mentor and latterly a nursing tutor. It is therefore a learning environment enmeshed with my own personal history. Having worked as an academic within nurse education for many years, I often consider what makes professional education interesting, resonant, meaningful and memorable. In my role as an educator, I still frequently reflect on many of the strongest stories that I recall from my own pre-registration learning experience as a nursing student within the same organisation. I can trace an interest in stories used in educational settings from that point, considering how the learning was reinforced by the explicit connections revealed through the stories to specific learning outcomes. Therefore I see this research as one of the most important steps in my development as an academic committed to enabling positive learning experiences and who wishes to work creatively within my field.

Both of the participating EBL groups were very enthusiastic about the research and engaged well with this new type of learning, as well as participating in the data collection. I was impressed by how positively the groups enjoyed and worked effectively whilst using the fictional film triggers. Within both the guided group discussions and the interviews it was clear that the students were better enabled to engage with reflecting in depth on their learning experiences, achieving a deeper form of learning and consider how this might be part of a process facilitating their ongoing development, both pre- and post-registration. I was also able to reflect on exactly the same processes for myself as I felt that this creative approach was very cathartic in developing me as a teacher. This experience had transformed my insight into facilitating education.
Previously it felt safe to deliver propositional knowledge through a traditional, didactic approach. However effective and memorable professional education needs to achieve far more than this. This innovative use of fictional film was being both developed and latterly established through the EBL sessions, wherein students experienced very different learning. The students adapted well to being observed whilst watching the films and then critically reflected on their clinical experiences together alongside each other. Whilst traditional teaching methods can operationalise a secure educational approach, using creative approaches such as those discussed in this research, takes the practitioner outside their comfort zone. The positive benefits make it worth doing so.

The findings of this study therefore suggest that the use of fictional film within EBL can be effectively integrated as a viable educational element of pre-registration studies and may indeed be helpful as an integrated part of the pre-registration nursing curricula. There is therefore a theoretical and practical foundation in place to support using a range of fictional film material in the EBL classroom, which has demonstrated its ability to initiate in-depth reflective learning. Within professional education, learning needs to become a way of thinking and living. Working and learning are integral parts of ‘life’s journey’. This EBL experience could be regarded as an example of ‘life place learning’, where self, work and learning in a whole life setting are progressed (Blair, 2005). This is an important position from which to reinforce key transferable learning, challenge current norms and prepare for lifelong learning post-registration.

### 6.5 Future plans

As this research has reached its conclusion, an opportunity has now arisen to implement a similar approach to the one taken within this research within my own organisation and embed both the use of fictional film and narrative pedagogy into a core theory module in year two of an undergraduate nursing programme. From September 2017 the use of fictional film, alongside a range of other creative approaches, including narrative pedagogy will be embedded as a core element of a second year theory module for all adult nursing undergraduate students within
my organisation. As one of the module leaders, I will be able to sustain this innovation, as well as advance the use of creative approaches more broadly, revisiting the use of poetry, prose, documentary, photography and music. Alongside this, it will be particularly important to document the progress of this ongoing innovation, including a publication plan to disseminate reports on the experience. These developments more than vindicate the undertaking of this research study, and my role within it.
References


Department of Health (2012) *No decision about me, without me. Further consultation on proposals to secure shared decision-making.* London: HMSO


Marcus, A.S. (2005) It is as it was: Feature Film in the History Classroom. *The Social Studies*. March/April: 61-67


NMC (2008b) *Standards to support learning and assessment in practice*, London: NMC.


Appendix I: The Participant Information Pack

Project Title: Exploring the use of fictional film within Enquiry Based Learning (EBL)

Interview questions:

What did the use of fictional film as a trigger within EBL offer to your learning experience?

Did you feel that the use of fictional film encouraged you to engage with EBL and the discussion within it?

Was there an emotional impact of the use of fictional film?

How do you evaluate this experience overall?

Is there anything that you would like to add?
Project Title: Exploring the use of fictional film within Enquiry Based Learning (EBL)

Participant Information Sheet

Dear Student...

You are currently attending Work-Based Learning days alongside your clinical placement. These days are a type of Enquiry Based Learning (EBL). This means that you are active learners within this educational experience. You can take the lead in raising issues for discussion and presenting your opinions.

It is conventional to use prompts to ‘trigger’ discussion within EBL. This may take the form of a report, article or editorial. It is also starting to become more familiar to use ‘triggers’ originating from the arts, like photographs, poetry and prose. I propose now to make use of fictional film as a trigger for EBL, in order to explore its application and impact.

There is currently a lack of primary research exploring the use of arts based triggers within pre-registration nursing EBL. With your help I would like to start to address that gap in knowledge. I have arranged for several fictional film titles to be catalogued ready within the campus library, from which titles and topics can be selected by you, should you wish to volunteer to participate in this project. These selected titles will be shown in part at the start of agreed EBL sessions in order to prompt the discussion (for 20-30 minutes). The title will be thereafter relocated back in the library, should you wish to borrow the film to watch in full later.

This project is directly interested on the experiences of students who participate in this research. The design of the research is directly focused on that aim: to explore whether the use of fictional film can trigger effective enquiry based learning (EBL) and if so, whether this is positively experienced by the nursing students involved. I propose to conduct participant observation within the EBL sessions as I will be facilitating the group. I would also appreciate being able to conduct individual interviews with the research participants.

You can be reassured that your participation is completely voluntary and that you can withdraw from the study at any time, without fear of any consequence should
you do so. Field notes will be taken during the participant observation, which will not contain any participant names. You are invited to review these notes should you wish to.

Should you consent to be interviewed, the interview will be conducted by myself separately at a venue and time convenient to your diary. The interview will last 30-60 minutes and will be audio-tape recorded. You will be given a copy of the interview schedule in advance of the interview. Your responses will be kept securely, transcribed efficiently and cited anonymously within the research report.

You are welcome to contact me at any point to discuss this research and ask any questions that you may have.

Nicky Goodall (previously Davis)  
Senior Lecturer & Post-Graduate Research Student  
Adult Nursing  
Glenside Campus  
UWE Bristol  
Blackberry Hill  
Stapleton,  
Bristol BS16 1DD

0117328855  
[14/09/2010 Version 1]
Project Title: Exploring the use of fictional film within Enquiry Based Learning (EBL)

Participant Consent form for Research Study

Name of Researcher: Nicola Carole Davis

Please tick to confirm

- I can confirm that I have read and understand the information sheet dated [14/09/2010 Version 1] for the above study.

- I have had the opportunity to consider the information, ask questions and have had these questions answered to my satisfaction.

- I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw at any time, without giving any reason, without any part of my studies being affected by that decision.

- I understand that data will be collected during the study, suitably anonymised, which may be looked at by academic staff from within the University of the West of England and the Open University. I am aware that this data will be kept securely and only reviewed for the purpose of supervision and dissemination of this research. I give permission for these individuals to have access to my contribution to the data.

- I agree to take part in the above research study.

Name of Participant __________________________ Date ______________ Signature __________________________

Reseacher __________________________ Date ______________ Signature __________________________

When form has been completed:
1 copy for participant: 1 copy for researcher site file: 1 (original) to be kept in a locked filing cabinet in a located office on Campus
Appendix II: Examples of Interview Transcripts

Project Title: Exploring the use of fictional film within Enquiry Based Learning (EBL)

Key to colour codes (highlighting sections of text relating to the five key themes):

1. Authenticity
2. Impact and Recall
3. Relevance to the learning outcomes
4. Emotional Engagement
5. Maintaining a safe, yet creative learning space

[The colour coding surfaces analysis of the five main themes but does not preclude close attention to the rest of the text, all of which is very interesting]

One of the first interviews: with a participant in Group 2.....following full transcription, this data would have been coloured coded with each colour relating to one of the main themes and then annotated throughout with track change comments. As track change comments cannot be replicated in this document, these are here replaced with mid text comments highlighted in red text.
Interview prompts/ questions:

Describe the film clip that you have just seen… ok, so the film that I have just seen is about a lady who is in a domestic violent relationship, who is constantly trying to fight to get her kids back whilst maintaining her relationship with her new husband. The film that I have just watched is about a woman who has multiple kids through…mmn…multiple relationships….mmmnn she has the kids taken away from her by social services and is constantly trying to fight to get her kids back, whilst maintaining a relationship with her new husband [This is reasonable level of recall].

Do you think that the film clip selected was appropriate to your learning?

Mmmnn I do think that this film was appropriate to my learning… it… uhh… what can I say… it made us a bit cry [this was evident in the observations during the film] yes it made myself and other members of the group become aware of other services that are provided to people, so in this circumstance, obviously the social services- something that we are not really, have a lot to do with, in, whilst doing our training. So to see things from that sort of perspective, was very enlightening. To see how it affects the family involved. Mmmnnn… it was taking us towards how it affects the people involved in the situation… it was making them aware of the lady… how she is affected afterwards- the emotional rollercoaster that she goes on when she loses her kids, which is quite harrowing really… the constant fight that she had in court, uh and the fact that she felt that she wasn’t… well that the solicitors weren’t being truthful to her… they were lying to her. Trying to get her into court, she was going to court and then saying something else while she was there.
How did the selected film clip make you feel?

Watching the film brought about quite a lot of emotions in myself...ummm...having been present at domestic violence it was quite emotional. It was pretty upsetting. Obviously that is from my perspective because as I said I have been a witness to that before...[we did talk about this separately as this needed follow up]

I do think that is safe to...uh...to have this film as um part of our learning. Umm in the sense that it just makes people aware...mmmmnn I think depending on the individual like myself, having dealt with this situation. Was as I said quite upsetting, but (it is) how you deal with the situation and I feel that it is safe, because it actually makes people aware of what is going on, because obviously people just hear about domestic violence. What might be just a hot or might be battering. But I think that it is safe and it applies to everybody and is relevant to my learning. As I said.. before that I was not aware of the role of social workers and things like that so...in the sense that it gives me the knowledge to see how they work.

SUB_QUESTION....[Is it maybe...because it is unfolding as a complex drama? Do you feel that it is more than a story on a page? Has it maybe given you a more multi-dimensional insight into that type of scenario? Did it seem more real, even though it was drama?] I'm saying too much here, I try to say less in subsequent interviews].

Yes, definitely...

[So you could identify with the characters in a more realistic way?]

Yeah...in a more realistic way, particularly, yeah...and that is why I think that it was quite an emotional piece. But then having said that, there are other members
of the group who was watching that who may not have had it, who were caring as well.

[ok, so the emotional response may well be linked to prior experience, so the emotional response may be..just...purely... as a reaction from being...][I am having to prompt rather a lot in this interview]

Mmmnnn..yeah, it’s horrible….

[Was it not quite graphic?]

Yeah… like I said it was quite harrowing wasn’t it?... watching that…

[Do you think that there was sufficient preparation... to lead people to expect the level of violence?]

Definitely...definitely because obviously you made us aware that this was quite a graphic film and there there was scenes of violence and that is we needed to that we could leave the room. So I think that there was pretty much preparation and you handed the DVD around for people to look at. We all had a read around what it was based on and what kind of...how it can affect the kids as well because the kids as well.. it was quite upsetting the way that that boy got burned….mmnn.

watching that film was very different than sitting in lectures because if I was just sitting in a lecture and someone was to talk to me, sorry to keep mentioning it but about the involvement of social services. Well it was quite blasé wasn’t it, but having watched the actual film and seeing it. This gives you that further insight doesn’t it into what goes on as to how, as to your perception as to how some services are... and completely.... well it just is not is it? You will perceive things in the way that you want to perceive until proven otherwise.
[There were ground rules?] [not sure now why this is being asked- there are always ground rules as standard]

Uh-huh…mmnnn

[Yes..ok…right..ok…right]

[ok..so if you just say what you have just said…]

What did the use of fictional film offer to your learning experience?

Ok- well I’m a visual learner, so to watch a film or for someone to demonstrate something to me is the way that I take things in, remember it and learn it…mmnnn. so watching that film is going to stick, so remembering that film is going to make me remember social services, going to remind me of, well not that I need reminding of how domestic relationships, what goes on behind closed door which we are not aware of.

Additional Prompt Question : in what ways?

What factors could have improved / made the experience more meaningful for you? Is there anything that you would like to add?

Ok..improvements….could have been, well alongside the- maybe having a social worker there for a follow up- to see whether things are the same or not [outside speakers can be invited to SoLD]. Maybe people who have had interactions with the social services. So we could first hand- evidence then isn’t it, of the experience of social workers. Umm and maybe also- as obviously we discussed that within the group but only brief about the film, umm, about the topic and maybe if we could have had like, came back after the break and did a bit more on the film, whereas as a group we discussed it, had a bit more of an in depth talk and looked at the role of the social worker, and considered it in more detail. Oh the poor lady and the situation. Because obviously it was not just about the social worker it was about he lady herself wasn’t it? Her relationship with her fella, she just kept ending up in violent relationships. So maybe that is something to look at as well, like how always tended to fall that way, attracted to that lovely man.
[yes there has been books, there has been work done on that kind of thing happening in life- I am thinking for example of the work of Erin Pizzey. So that could have been brought as a resource… mmmnn into this discussion- uh that is a very good suggestion]

Yeah because no prejudice against you but it was like we just watched the film, had a discussion about it for about 15 minutes and that was that then and we just went off then to GDP but I think that if it was a whole day, like a proper thing dedicated to it [the student would have very little idea of the preparation for this phase, apart from what was in the participant information pack- but they are asking for more time in SoLd and under these circumstances that is predominantly positive] - because I feel like I have got into it quite deep and benefited from anyway but I think would do so more so with those additional resources, with those extra little things, I think that it probably would have helped get more, just to understand, just so we had that further knowledge services and situations that people get themselves into and then looking at it as a whole picture, you know with the kids and everything. I mean I know that we are doing adult nursing, with the kids for example- what they went through [this seems to be a suggestion for more input on the EU requirements] .[and this is one of the aspects that was explored within the guided group discussions- this positivity which is couched with a call for more- that is however a feature of many student evaluations- they want more but they are not quite sure what of…]

[yes, that is true]

Yes, and that is another thing, well it is not obviously like, like when I said about service users, using social services, maybe even as an adult, maybe even having children but obviously not in uni, being able to talk with children…the experiences they have had, how social services affected them

[mmmmnn….yeah..maybe like podcasts?]  

Yeah.........  

[That would be safer for them wouldn’t it?]  

Yeah

[So you are bringing the drama back into the reality]
Interview Transcript 4

Interview commences…

Ok…this will pick up your voice here…have you been recorded like this before?

No I haven’t so this will be a new experience

You are welcome to play it back and listen to it afterwards if you want to

Well I don’t know if I would want to (laughing)

Ok…our voices always sound different to us than I think we would imagine…from how we sound in our own heads. Ok…so we will go through the questions in the order that you can see on the sheet in front of you. I will make notes but as you know we are also recording now. Q.1. So can you describe the film that you were shown in the SOLD session that we did recently?

Ok, so from my memory um, the film was about uh a mother following um what seemed like unfortunate events that were beyond her control such as domestic violence…um…she went through different experiences of having her children taken away from her… uh…and her involvement with Social Services was social care and followed her life and trying to get her children back. Her development of a new um friendship, which turned into a partnership…um…and then how her life developed with that new partner, leading on to… uh…having children of their own and unfortunately just from past experiences…um her new children were taken away even though her character seemed to have changed…um…in that she had gotten away from…um…the ex-partner that she was with who she experienced the domestic violence with…um…yeah really and the film just tracked her progress of how an unfortunate event of the past can still impact on her future and how that can seem to follow her around really.

Interviewer prompts…Ok…..ok…Can you remember what the film was called?

Ladybird, Ladybird

Interviewer prompts Ok- can you remember why it was called that?

Wasn’t it to do…wasn’t it a piece of writing… a poem…Ladybird, ladybird…fly away something…

Like and old children's…a nursery rhyme isn’t it?
Yes

So it is a play on that because of what happens to one of her children...ok then. Right lovely...thankyou... we will proceed to the next question if you are happy with that?

Yeah

So...ok...Q.2. Do you think that film was appropriate to your learning in that context?

Um...I think so, I think it was a completely different style of learning that I have experienced, well I probably have experienced before but probably not taken that much notice of...um... it was quite refreshing to have something different than just um reading and research all the time...um...and I think it was appropriate in showing...um...quite a realistic story of what is potentially going on to a number of people...um...and it showed a really good side to the story taking the point of view of her and showing how Social Services can be involved and everything like that which I thought was really interesting.

Ok...so you want to move on to the next question?

Um...

Or is there anything that you want to add?

Um...is there anything that I want to add?...um...I think it was a good way of learning in a way I could relate to it although I have not had the same at all experience like that it didn’t take very...it wasn’t like a very academic approach or anything like that. It was really easy to follow and learn from in that sense...just...it was very realistic and a very human approach I think

Ok...so are you happy to move on to the next question?

Yep

OK...Right...Q.3. so how did it make you feel watching that film?

Um... there were scenes in it that I um that really pulled at the heart strings... um...like the scene with the fire and her children in there...um...which part of made me feel like...well that was a really stupid act for her to do but then equally upon reflection after thinking that...you... it was really well portrayed at then showing well actually what other alternative did she have...so...um it made me feel really mixed emotions about it and I think the storyline was really well developed, really easy to follow...um...and although...I don’t know if it... not that it went into lots of her personal details or anything but it I don’t know...because I haven’t experienced anything like that but again it really made of empathise of her...um...and I felt very sorry for her throughout really... just how a couple of events in the past, the fire, the domestic violence, had... that just seemed to follow her around and she could never get away from it...um...which made me think about how there must be so many people who experience that and I have never really thought about it really because I have never had a reason to be
forced into thinking how reality is for them...so...yeah...I don’t know... I did really enjoy the film though. It obviously wasn’t the happiest of stories but at the same time it was...I don’t know if good is the word...I don’t know, it was almost enjoyable watching just because it was such a well-developed storyline.

**Interviewer prompts: was it a good use of your time?**

I THINK SO...UM... just because it was something completely different and although it was educational...um...it was just a completely different style and different approach...um...which as I said was quite refreshing really.

**Interviewer prompts: ok...lovely...right...ok... can I ask you a sort of sub-question?**

Mmmnn..of course

*Which is...um you have shared how you felt watching through the film. How did it feel to be in a classroom watching that film, when you were with your personal tutor group, some of whom were having some sort of emotional response to the film so...what does it feel like to learn in a classroom where somebody else is crying?*

Um...well I was quite zoned into it really...I had got quite attached, almost fixated on just watching it... so I think that while I was aware that there were people around me but I had almost just channelled myself into it, because I was quite fascinated by it, because I don’t come from a background or anything, the same like this lady in the film had...so it was quite interesting for me to see that side of things but to know that I am in the room with potentially people who are have or may have experienced similar growing up...is quite interesting...I have had quite a sheltered childhood...um...but I think it is quite um...I don’t know what the word is but...just when you know that other people around you have maybe had something similar, it makes you think a bit more of maybe the way that you are going to respond to them...um...I almost felt a bit awkward because I don’t really know how to relate to it so

**Um... So awkward about how they might feel and whether they might want to talk about it?**

Um yeah.. if they were to turn to me to discuss it... not the film with me specifically but how they were feeling...um...yeah...I don’t know. I always find it quite hard to respond to people when they completely open up like that...I think that it is something that I am developing but um I don’t know.

**Interviewer prompts: Well I think that is a good point.**

*OK...well if you are happy we will move on to the last main question, which is: Q.4. what did the use of that film offer to your learning experience?*

Um...well I think that quite relates to the last point we just made...um...that if I had watched the film alone it would have been a totally different experience to watching it in a group, because I felt like at times there were almost moments that I thought...oh gosh...I am going to well up in a minute, but I tried to control it
whereas if I had been on my own it’s a bit natural to let it go…um…so I think…learning experience…um…I think not only watching the film was a learning experience in seeing the storyline going on but also a learning experience to watch something like that alongside everyone else.um…and…I think it was a really beneficial learning experience…um…I really enjoyed it…um…and I think it was a really appropriate film as well because, although at time it did not really seem like it was that related to the course we are doing (nursing)- I think it is because a lot of…a lot of today’s society experience similar issues and you need to have an awareness of it so…I think it was a really good way of portraying…um…reality for some people really.

Interviewer prompts: Ok, so it was realistic?

Yeah

OK… so… what would you suggest could have developed that? If it was to happen again….um…if you were to be offered that type of learning opportunity in the future…what would you suggest would make it even better?… as a learning experience for you... what things could support it?

Um…well I am quite glad that there wasn’t a questionnaire that we had to fill out while we were watching the film because if I had ben distracted by having to not take it would have put me off of watching, so I am quite glad that we were just left to it…to watch it and just experience it. I think perhaps… I mean we did discuss afterwards didn’t we…um, maybe we could have gone into it a bit more…and perhaps if it was watched in a smaller group because I think when you are in a large group it is quite easy to watch, then take it in, but not discuss it afterwards or even when you are watching not to really too much emotion because it was like I said before I kind of don’t want to in front of such a big group, so maybe if it was just a group pf say six or seven, it’s a bit more of a relaxed atmosphere…I don’t know…um…I don’t know how I could have made it more meaningful to me…um…so those are maybe suggestions for improvements…um…I think possibly maybe it might have helped to have a little well…I don’t know…if you have a bit of a background first like if you can perhaps read a little summary, so you know what to expect, but equally quite a big part of the storyline was you didn’t know what to expect and it was showing her life develop and evolve…um…I don’t know….

Interviewer prompts: ok... something I have asked other people, its its not on the list, so it is not something that you may want to or be able to answer, but it is just a fairly open question... um...obviously |I brought in six different titles that, that the students could negotiate to select from and the one that they selected surfaced quite quickly as the one that everyone could sign up to watching…um… but that is one of hundreds, thousands even of films out there that can and sometimes already are being used in educational um arenas. So from films that you have seen yourself in the past are there any that you think would be similarly useful in that kind of context.
Uh... I am usually really bad at remembering names of films, so I am not the best person to ask...oh...I don't know...I can't remember any that particularly relate to healthcare or anything like that...um...the only one that can spring to mind is the one that I watched when I was younger at school. In RE we always used to watch it every year, 'Ben Hur'...um...I don't know why...this was at primary school age as well

**Oh my goodness**

So I don't know if that was quite appropriate

**That was quite an extraordinary title for a child to watch**

That is the only other film that I had had a similar experience to this but at the time I did not really think of it as educational but I suppose it was...I don’t know...I don’t know what else I watched...I am terrible with films.

**Interviewer prompts: Have you been to the cinema recently?**

Uh...I did...to watch 'The Hobbit'...uh...I don't know...you have put me on the spot...um I don’t know why ...but I have always really liked 'the Truman Show'...um...and I find that personally very interesting just because I personally really like the storyline of the ...the whole is this real, is this not? Um...I don't know It is quite good from a psychological point of view and an ethical, point of view.
Appendix III:

Example of Guided Group Discussion Notes:

Group 2 (Conceptual/ ‘Mind’ Map 1)

The whole group split off into small groups of 4-6 students to discuss their experiences and unprompted presented summarised notes in this way.

**Learning Experience:**

- Decision-Making
- Prioritising
- Whistle-Blowing
- Responsibility

**Describe the film:**

- Eye Opening
- Bad Practice
- Hierarchy

**Enquiry Based Learning**

**Appropriate?:**

- Relevant to placement
  - Thinking about
- NMC Requirements - how they weren’t followed

**Feelings:**

- Emotional
- Anger
- Guilt

**Anything to add?**

- Didn’t show team-work or a pleasant working environment
09/10/2014 Group 1 discussion in Sold post seeing @Bodies’ Finale (summary notes from Flip chart)

Initial impressions: Interesting the journalist who is back to nursing but in deeper colour uniform and at case review! Acts different considering that she is Agency. Tape recorder in the pocket- conflict of interest? NMC view? This happened in the ‘Panorama’ programme.

Learning importance:

- Whistle-blowing – possible/ safe or not
- CJD- still a risk- questions stilled asked in real practice
- The need to question your own practice
- Who was the victim?
- Wary of cliques and hierarchies in practice- so Doctors stick together? Closed shop
- It makes you question practice and that has to be a good thing
- Drama is sensationalised but still basis in reality
- It was a useful thing to do in the time.
- Initial scepticism but now can see the relevance
- It has to have a context-links to case studies would be even better
- It was quite realistic, apart from the CPR
- The unhelpful scanner- it can be hard to get a scan
- Why is bad practice or attitudes tolerated
- Useful to see the Consultants perspectives
- Some change in terminology but not much
- Why was the junior doctor crying? Sad or shocked? Emotional impact of the loss.
- It makes you think about how you might deal with similar situations
- Guilty feelings related to whistle-blowing
- Would like to see it again

One/ Phrase word reactions….

- Thought-provoking
- Tense
- Emotive
- Challenging
- Educational
- Exhausting
- Yuck factor
- Insight
- Infuriating
- Frustrating
- Relevant
• Frightening- reality- cover ups
• Opportunity for reflection
• Morally challenging- ethical dilemmas
Appendix IV:

Example of Observation notes:

Observation Notes: Group 2/ Session 2/ January 12 Cohort/ EBL 2014/ 10.30am

[09.00-10.00 is time for ‘round robin’ type shared reflection and 10.00-10.30 was a refreshment break].

1. Year 3 Supervision of Learning Day/ On Campus/ Seminar Room


3. Sensory impressions: the room is very quiet apart from the auditory content within the film. There is no talking amongst the students, which is normally unusual within these sessions. The room is only dimly lit but I can still observe the reactions of the students to the film. The students are concentrating on watching the film, they are not acknowledging me in the room: that is good, my presence is not intruding into this experience.

4. Personal responses to the film: there is no talking but there are several non-verbal reactions amongst students- to the film, which are concordant with the scenes being shown. During one of the very violent scenes there are gasps form some of the students (the main characters in the film is being physically assaulted by her partner). Some of the students are crying when the same character goes to visit her injured children in hospital (they have been badly burnt in a fire). There are also clear signs of emotional engagement when the woman’s new baby is taken from her by social workers slightly after the birth. There is some dabbing of eyes and other obvious signs of sadness.

5. I offer the students the option of a comfort break 1 hour into the viewing, which they decline. They all want to carry on watching the film. This is also unusual- SOLD sessions usually have ‘natural’ rest periods built into them after each hour. The students are ‘gripped’ by what they are watching, they want to know how this story ends. This is the first time that I have seen such focus amongst all members of the group all at the same time.

6. Reflection on what I learned of a personal nature. This was an important stage in this research. Although well prepared for this data collection- I felt
uncomfortable and ‘out of control’ of the classroom. I knew what to expect from this film, I had watched it several times, but I was concerned how the students would react. In what ways did I connect with participants? – I wanted to be considered as a resource, but not directly needed as the film was playing. My responsibility sits with careful preparation- which they won’t have been witness too, but also being ready to facilitate the discussion afterwards- this is stepping into uncharted territory. This is not the first time that I have used this approach, but the first time using this particular title. [This is extremely important information but separate in terms of moving forward to analysis].

Process/ Structure influenced by:

Chiseri-Strater, E. and Stone Sunstein, B (1997) FieldWorking: Reading and Writing Research. NJ: Blair Press. (Chiseri-Strater and Sunstein (1997) have developed a list of what should be included in all field notes).
Appendix V:

Teaching Plan: SoLD EBL with fictional film

Module: Managing the Practice of Adult Nursing

Supervision of Learning Day/ Enquiry Based Learning: Safeguarding Vulnerable Clients

FACILITATION ACTIVITY PLAN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Nicola Davis/ Goodall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject/topic:</td>
<td>Location:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safeguarding Vulnerable Clients</td>
<td>On Campus/ Seminar Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Module/Course:</td>
<td>No. of students:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-registration Adult Nursing students – Level 3</td>
<td>Max 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Duration:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>09.00-13.00, including comfort breaks</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Students’ previous knowledge:

- Completion of Year 1 and 2 Supervision of Learning Days alongside four practice placements
- Completion of Year 1 and 2 European Union Requirement learning outcomes, including Care of the Child and Mental Health
- Prior reading/preparation of resources on Blackboard
- Students will currently be on Year 3 Practice Placements

Resources:

- PC and/ or Laptop & Projector, including DVD Drive
- Internet access
- Selected range of DVDs from University library on relevant topics: Suggested Titles:
  - ‘Ladybird, Ladybird’ (Ken Loach)
‘My name is Joe’ (Ken Loach)
‘Melancholia’ (Lars von Trier)
‘Bodies’ (Drama Series- Jed Mercurio)

(Facilitator should have pre-viewed any of the titles used).

- Flip chart/ Glass boards or Smart notepad/pen; Visualizer
- A4 Paper; Flipchart/ Dry wipe Pens
- **Spare copies of student/ participant information pack**
- Paper copies of topic related prompt question sheets and module learning outcomes

**Module Learning Outcomes:**

On successful completion of this module students will be able to:

- □ Demonstrate competence in providing and evaluating care
- □ Demonstrate an increased understanding of theories that influence service provision
- □ Work in partnership with all relevant groups towards ongoing service improvement initiatives
- □ Act as a resource, contributing to an effective learning environment in which safe evidence based practice is fostered, implemented and evaluated
- □ Manage the complexities that influence partnership and negotiation in nursing care
- □ Recognise through self-management how strengths and limitations can affect outcomes of care
- □ Explore evidence based approaches to enhance nursing care delivery and health outcomes
- □ Analyse the principles and practices of effective learning and assessment in the workplace
- □ Demonstrate ability to critically reflect in action
- Demonstrate safe, evidence based care

- Demonstrate ability to change care approaches in practice

- Work within relevant codes of conduct, policy and guidance – recognising the ethical and legal issues in practice

- Within the confines of safe practice, initiate and maintain professional boundaries that are sufficiently flexible for providing inter-professional care

- Demonstrate the ability to accurately calculate and safely administer medicines

- Demonstrate the ability to offer and receive constructive formal and informal feedback

- Reflect on personal learning needs and identify future support systems and career pathways

- Co-ordinate effective multi-disciplinary and interagency team working

- Reflect on experience to develop insight and discover new ways of working

- Communicate in a manner consistent with professional behaviour

- Establish effective working relationships that facilitate personal development in self and others and positively influence organisational change

**Aim:** Students to fully engage with EBL session- i.e. take the lead: setting the timing of the activities within the four hours, selecting the film title, identifying the most relevant learning outcomes from those listed above.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>ACTIVITY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Pre- | Preparation/Theory:  
Students are expected to be able to verbally reflect upon their practice learning experiences within shared group reflection time, so should be prepared for this. Students are expected to have read the module handbook, including the learning outcomes. |
| 5 min | Welcome, Facilitator introductions  
Introduce self, referring to participant information pack, briefly outline plan of seminar (as detailed below) to students, and expected learning outcomes. Set Ground rules (session 1) can be referred to.  
Housekeeping info: Phones off/silent mode, check no fire drill expected. Students will know where the restrooms are and can leave the room at any time. |
| 60 mins | Round Robin discussion of students practice experiences, all students to have equal opportunity to participate in open group reflection of recent critical incidents, learning achievements and issues of note. (Chairs to be moved to learning circle so all participants can see each other). |
| 15+ mins | Suggested break- however where this is situated during the 4 hours is open to negotiation with the group. |
| 5 mins | Chairs to be moved back to conventional classroom style for ease of viewing the film. |
| 5 mins | Students to select the film title of their choice from the list above or viable alternative. Film information may be circulated round the room or presented through the visualizer. |
| 60-90 mins | Caring for vulnerable clients (both adults and children) including considering both psychological impact and sociological aspects. |
Whole group to watch the fictional film title or series episode that the students have selected.

After the film has finished screening, promote the suggested option of re-watching film again in the future and suggest similar titles to expand learning opportunities.

These titles might include:

- ‘The Kingdom’ (Lars von Trier)
- ‘Antichrist’ (Lars von Trier)
- ‘NEDs’ (Peter Mullan)
- ‘Morvern Callar’ (Lynne Ramsay)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15+ mins</td>
<td><strong>Suggested break- where this is situated during the 4 hours is open to negotiation with the group.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 mins</td>
<td><strong>Communication</strong> Reflect on examples of positive and negative communication in practice. Barriers to communication – from either the patient or the health care professional. Skills and behaviours – think of examples of each of the different skills and behaviours. Blocking behaviours- difference between overt and distancing. Psychological impact on carers - discuss as a group then move onto discussion of potential impact on carers and assessment tools. Suggested further discussion points: Compassion Fatigue, power relationships, non-judgemental positive regard, mental capacity act, Deprivation of liberty,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-30 mins</td>
<td><strong>Break into sub-groups of 4-5 students situated around the room. Students invited to engage in small group discussion and to make notes on the film they have watched and how this links to the learning outcomes and their experiences within practice.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-40 mins</td>
<td><strong>Re-group for open discussion reflecting on small group work, with flip chart notes displayed on the walls. Discuss as a group the emotions they experienced when watching the film.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Suggested Prompts: This can be very emotional – give students time and space to discuss their own feelings. Reflect on examples of both positive and negative interpersonal skills as applied in practice. What are the barriers to communication – from either the client, carers or the health care professional- or representatives from other organisations, e.g. the Police?

Interpersonal skills and behaviours – invite the students to think of examples of each of the different verbal and non-verbal skills and behaviours. Blocking behaviours- differences between overt and distancing.

Did they empathise with any of the characters?
How does this all link up with the learning outcomes that they must achieve?
Any comparisons or contrasts with practice experiences?