Music in advertising and consumer identity: The search for Heideggerian authenticity

How to cite:

© 2017 The Authors

Version: Version of Record

Link(s) to article on publisher’s website:
http://dx.doi.org/doi:10.1177/1470593117692021

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online's data policy on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.

oro.open.ac.uk
Music in advertising and consumer identity: The search for Heideggerian authenticity

Morteza Abolhasani
University of Liverpool Management School, UK

Steve Oakes
University of Liverpool Management School, UK

Helen Oakes
Sheffield University Management School, UK

Abstract
This study discusses netnographic findings involving 472 YouTube postings categorized to identify themes regarding consumers’ experience of music in advertisements. Key themes relate to musical taste, musical indexicality, musical repetition and musical authenticity. Postings reveal how music conveys individual taste and is linked to personal memories and Heidegger’s coincidental time where moments of authenticity may be triggered in a melee of emotions, memories and projections. Identity protection is enabled as consumers frequently resist advertisers’ attempts to use musical repetition to impose normative identity. Critiques of repetition in the music produce Heideggerian anxiety leading to critically reflective resistance. Similarly, where advertising devalues the authenticity of iconic pieces of music, consumers often resist such authenticity transgressions as a threat to their own identity. The Heideggerian search for meaning in life emphasizes the significance of philosophically driven ideological authenticity in consumers’ responses to music in advertisements.

Keywords
Advertising, authenticity, Heidegger, identity, indexicality, music, repetition, taste

Introduction
As one of the most important creative elements, music is incorporated in more than 90% of television advertisements (Kellaris et al., 1993). The current study is designed to contribute to the
consumer identity and authenticity literature by analysing and categorizing a comprehensive compilation of consumer postings regarding the influence of various types of music in advertisements upon perceptions and expressions of identity. It shows how music linked to advertisements can evoke Heideggerian, philosophically driven ideological authenticity as well as material authenticity.

There is a general gap in terms of the lack of qualitative research in music and advertising, compounded by a more specific gap regarding netnographic research. This is reflected in the literature review of music in advertising by Oakes (2007) in which the highlighted studies are almost exclusively from a positivist, managerial perspective and the influence of music in advertising upon consumer identity is not addressed. While consumer identity is addressed by literature from different disciplines, the current study provides an original angle in examining it within the context of music and advertising. In addition, the qualitative approach allows the researchers to analyse the in-depth phenomenological experiences of music highlighted by the consumers. Postings relate to comments about music in advertisements uploaded on YouTube featuring various goods and services. Such online communities have become an increasingly important marketing research resource through netnography (Kozinets, 2002a, 2006). These communities ‘have a “real” existence for their participants’ (Kozinets, 1998: 366), help marketing researchers to enhance their knowledge of the needs, motivations and subsequent behaviour of consumers (Oakes et al., 2013) and develop understanding of the ways in which consumers may achieve emancipation from the market (Kozinets, 2002b). Consumer postings and subsequent discursive interaction are also valuable for organizations in terms of monitoring and improving the effectiveness of advertising (Kozinets et al., 2010).

In the context of the current study, YouTube acts as an interactive forum within which users discuss music in the advertising videos to which they are exposed (often actively seeking out the music and advertisement), thus providing an important source of advertising feedback. In the process, the relationship between music and consumer identity is brought into heightened focus. From a phenomenological perspective, the current netnographic study seeks to examine consumers’ lived experiences of music and the role of music in helping to construct and manage their identities and achieve authentic lives.

Music and consumer identity

Frith (2003: 46) suggests that ‘what people listen to is more important for their sense of themselves than what they watch or read’. Music may express differentiation and ‘function as a “badge” which conveys information about the person who expresses a particular preference’ (North and Harigreaves, 1999: 77) and consumers may hold normative expectations concerning characteristics of people who like different musical genres. Choice of music may become an extension of an individual’s identity. Consequently, identity may be regarded as a project that has to be worked on and carefully managed since consumers are continuously in the process of ‘actively constructing, maintaining and communicating their identity, partly by using the symbolic meaning of brands, leisure and lifestyle pursuits’ (Shankar et al., 2009: 77).

Preference for specific musical genres and subgenres may express identity through signposting membership of reference groups and excluding others who belong to separate groups, frequently enabling segregation of consumers according to a range of demographic variables such as age, gender, ethnicity and social class. Musical taste and knowledge have the potential to communicate distinctiveness, status and class (Bourdieu, 2010: 10). Indeed ‘music can be part of status battles’ to
show one’s superior emotional sensitivity to music (Hesmondhalgh, 2008: 337). In such status battles, identities as discursive constructs enable the operation of power relations (Foucault, 1984).

Identity projects are co-created and ‘realized through social interaction and validation’ (Shankar et al., 2009: 90). ‘Social constructionist theories suggest that people have many identities, each of which is created in interaction with other people, rather than having a single, core identity’ (Hargreaves et al., 2002: 10), indicating that identities are continually evolving. In contrast to the social constructionists’ perspective of multiple and shifting identities, music consumers may communicate their identities through autobiographical narratives in order to convince others (and themselves) of their unshifting, core identity (Bruner, 1990). The current article finds evidence to suggest both views have relevance in identity construction and may not be mutually exclusive. The multifaceted role of music is therefore an important element in the development and disclosure of consumer identity. Our findings suggest that for some consumers, music in conjunction with an advertisement elicits powerful and deep-rooted emotions and thoughts. We draw on Heidegger’s (1978) notion of authenticity as an overarching framework to interpret these findings.

**Heideggerian authenticity**

Wang (1999) discusses existential authenticity as an alternative to objective and constructive authenticity. Objective authenticity concerns the authenticity of originals, while constructive authenticity is subjective, resulting in numerous, symbolic versions of authenticities involving the same objects. Consumers’ interpretations of constructive authenticity are valid, regardless of opposing, expert viewpoints from an objective perspective. Reisinger and Steiner (2006) suggest that Heidegger resolves key tensions around (and between) subjectivity and objectivity arising from philosophical dualism by arguing that humans are automatically, inextricably connected to the world.

Steiner and Reisinger (2006: 303) discuss how ‘Heidegger uses the term “authenticity” to indicate that someone is being themselves existentially’ by existing according to one’s essence and rejecting conformity to superficial or unquestioned and dogmatic views, which Heidegger refers to as idle talk. Wang (1999: 352) identifies how ‘existential authenticity refers to a potential existential state of Being’, discussing how existential authenticity involves the search for one’s authentic self in activities where ‘people feel they themselves are much more authentic and more freely self-expressed than in everyday life’ (pp. 351–52) and where people ‘are engaging in non-ordinary activities’, free from daily constraints (p. 352). Unlike objective authenticity, ‘existential experience involves personal or intersubjective feelings’ (p. 351). Responding ‘to the ambivalence of the existential conditions of modernity’ (p. 360), existential authenticity may be linked to nostalgia through the desire to relive an idealized past and also linked to romanticism ‘because it accentuates the naturalness, sentiments, and feelings in response to the increasing self-constraints by reason and rationality in modernity’ (p. 360). It involves being ‘true to one’s self’ (Steiner and Reisinger, 2006: 301) and ‘can be manifest in bodily sensations and in selfmaking’ (p. 302). Existential authenticity entails individuals claiming and exercising personal freedom to ‘define themselves, determine their own identity, discover their own meaning and respond to the world in their own way, not as others expect’ (p. 312).

For Heidegger, the search for authenticity (a fundamental category of human existence) is a deep and spiritual search for ‘genuine individuality or selfhood’ that includes the search for who I am, my purpose and my relationship to the world and others (Mulhall, 2005: xi). Heidegger champions autonomy and free thought, emphasizing that ‘to be human is to have possibilities and
the capacity to choose among them’ (Steiner and Reisinger, 2006: 303). The human is portrayed as constantly projecting forward to future possibilities in a conceptualization of time ‘where past (heritage), present (openness) and future (possibilities) coexist’ (p. 305), and moments of existential authenticity may come and go. However, although Heideggerian authenticity is personal and unique, it is not selfish or hedonistic because the search for a meaningful life may involve care and concern for others. The ‘phenomenon of care’ (Heidegger, 1978: 365) is a basic structure of human existence which is linked to concern for others and moods (Mulhall, 2005) such as reflective anxiety that can trigger disclosure of authenticity.

We deploy Heidegger’s (1978) concepts of idle talk (the superficial discourse of mass culture), coincidental time (the simultaneous experience of past, present and future) and moods (including anxiety) to explore common themes of musical taste, musical indexicality, musical repetition and musical authenticity observed in the data. For Heidegger, while the human being is perpetually projecting forwards, searching for meaning and simultaneously reflecting on the past, moods such as anxiety and the phenomenon of care and concern for others can trigger a questioning of the everyday idle talk in which we are naturally absorbed, revealing existential, emancipatory possibilities.

Leigh et al. (2006: 481) discuss existential authenticity, indicating how a consumer ‘authenticates his or her identity through role performance and communal commitment’. We contribute to the consumer identity and authenticity literature by extending Leigh et al.’s (2006) application of the concept of existential authenticity, highlighting the significance of philosophically driven ideological authenticity in consumers’ responses to music and advertisements. In addition, we build on Kozinets’ (2002b: 33) discussion of communal authenticity where communities exhibit ‘caring’ and ‘sharing’ activities ‘counterposed against the alleged inauthenticity of the mainstream or mass market’. Kozinets (2002b: 22) argues that with the rise of industrialization and post-industrialization, ‘the influence of the market has increasingly encroached upon times, spaces, and roles previously reserved for communal relations’. Such communal authenticity is a dimension of existential authenticity that includes altruism, civic involvement and Wang’s (1999: 364) interpersonal authenticity of ‘intimacy’, ‘friendship’ and ‘sociality’. For Heidegger, our automatic, non-dualistic connection with others should focus on care and concern for them. His emphasis of ‘care’ and ‘concern’ as primordial existential structures suggests a non-instrumental human with a quasi-religious moral dimension.

According to Guignon (2006: 288), the authentic Heideggerian human recognizes their links with the community and the shared quest for ‘fairness, honesty, dignity, benevolence, achievement, and so on’. Kozinets (2002b) shows how art can become involved in the attempt to recreate communal authenticity. Similarly, the current study observes how music combined with the advertisement arouses Heideggerian care for others, and we show how some consumers attempt to reject the logics of the mass market through demonstrating allegiance to musical subcultures. For other consumers, music combined with the advertisement arouses material authenticity as desire for particular material possessions that may enhance the search for meaning, for example as utilities, symbols of status or for their aesthetic qualities. For Heidegger (1978: 239), if these experiences become linked to wishing and perpetually ‘hankering after’ new possessions, this may potentially sublimate the person’s ability to achieve awareness of their own possibilities.

**Method**

While most previous studies on responses to music in advertising have used quantitative techniques, Goulding (2003) emphasized the need for more varied methods of consumer behaviour
data collection to obtain a richer, deeper understanding of consumers. Therefore, rather than focusing upon narrowly prescribed advertising issues where the research agenda has been set by advertising agency and client, the current netnographic research enables disclosure of a broader scope of music in advertising themes from the consumer perspective.

Following preliminary discussions of television advertisements famous for using music, we examined advertisements for these goods and services posted on YouTube. In order for an advertisement to be included in this research, posted comments needed to be relevant in focusing upon music in advertising, and substantial enough to ‘have a critical mass of communicators’ (Kozinets, 2015: 168). Consequently, we chose advertisements with a minimum of five relevant postings concerning music. After reviewing the selected consumer postings on YouTube, a total of 472 relevant comments were chosen for analysis. The YouTube comments were posted by consumers between the years 2006 and 2014.

YouTube postings provide a platform for witty repartee, social commentary, self-promotion and many other activities (Kozinets, 2016). Through storytelling and disclosure of personal, cathartic experiences, consumers ‘not only refine their self-identities but also gain recognition from others’ (Leigh et al., 2006: 487). While postings may involve exaggeration for humour or shock effect rather than talking more earnestly as in a focus group, the anonymity of YouTube may make those involved feel ‘less inhibited about expressing their ideas and feelings on the online platforms’ (Schiele and Venkatesh, 2016: 9). Such frank exposition may ‘flourish in the anonymous confines of online discussion groups’ (Oakes et al., 2013: 620), and the openness, anonymity and de-contextualization of an online environment such as YouTube may encourage more reserved consumers to share their thoughts (Cooke, 2008).

Netnographic research in the current study was purely observational and involved no communicative interaction between researchers and online users during the process of identifying and analysing comments. According to Langer and Beckman (2005), the observational role of the researchers and lack of interaction with web forum users should be a norm for this type of study as observational netnography allows researchers to conduct studies without the need to acquire consent which might contaminate the findings (Oakes et al., 2013). Viewers’ YouTube names and user ID were deleted when using their postings in order to ensure complete anonymity.

Careful re-reading of postings allowed discrete thematic categories to emerge from the data, after which the researchers finalized specific key themes for in-depth analysis. Although the use of qualitative data analysis software packages such as NVivo 11 can be helpful in coding and classifying a large data set, the current research uses a manual thematic approach in analysing the data as software packages ‘inevitably involve trading off symbolic richness for construct clarity’ (Kozinets, 2002a: 64).

Kozinets (2015: 140) suggests that ‘the collection and analysis of archived messages does not officially constitute human subjects’ social research’ and it has been argued that comments posted in a public setting ‘should be considered to be in the public domain’ (Clegg Smith, 2004: 232). Just as a book author’s permission is not required prior to citation, there is no reason to believe that subjects consider their ‘online social interactions are private’, especially when no faces or identities are revealed and there is no probability of harm to individuals or groups (Kozinets, 2015: 141). Where no login is required in an online public space, previous netnographic research has proposed that ‘no informed consent is required’ for interaction observation provided that researchers maintain subject anonymity (Bertilsson, 2015: 453).
Netnographic findings

This section discusses the four key themes revealed in the findings: musical taste, musical indexicality, musical repetition and musical authenticity.

Musical taste

Musical subcultures emerge due to dissatisfaction with mainstream musical tastes. Subcultures have been theorized as rebelliously political due to ‘their ritualistic resistance to capitalist incorporation’ (Weinzierl and Muggleton, 2006: 8). Subcultural music may evoke correspondingly rebellious images and ideals that are markedly different from those evoked by more commercially mainstream music. However, ‘musical taste, as with music itself, is both a multi-faceted and distinctly fluid form of expression’ (Bennett, 1999: 611) as distinctions between subcultural and mainstream classifications have become blurred. For example, the musical subculture dubstep has recently gained wider recognition through endorsement by mainstream music stars (e.g. Rihanna and Taylor Swift), ‘as well as mainstream advertising by brands such as Apple, Samsung, Heineken, Skoda and BMW’ that tap into subcultural authenticity by using dubstep (Hietanen and Rokka, 2015: 1565). Nevertheless, individuals still strive to use subcultural capital to define their taste as authentic and to accrue ‘cool’ status that is valuable through its exclusivity. The distinctiveness of subcultural capital is defended through construction of a ‘mainstream “Other” as a symbolic marker against which to define one’s own tastes as “authentic” (Weinzierl and Muggleton, 2006: 10).

A number of postings suggested that allegiance to a musical genre and associated subculture triggers purchase intent as exemplified below:

I ended up buying two boxes because of this ad. Dubstep is epic and I ran around the house shouting ‘DUBSTEP ON TV!’ (Weetabix, Mord Fustang, ‘A New World’, 2013, hereafter WMF)

Some consumers claim that they dislike a product, but cannot resist buying it because they like the genre of music used in the advertisement:

Weetabix tastes like S***, but it’s got Dubstep in the commercial. So, you’ll buy it anyway. (WMF, 2013)

If the music is perceived as incongruous because its values are believed to be undermined by the advertisement, it may pose an indirect identity or authenticity threat, resulting in avoidance of the advertisement and product:

Love this song but it’s out of place in this commercial...makes me want to buy the Kia Soul less because I don’t want people associating me with these strange commercials. (Kia Soul, Lady Gaga, ‘Applause’, 2014)

Several consumers present themselves as arbiters of good taste and authenticity, typified by the comment below:

Worst ad ever + worst browser ever! Anyone who likes this song clearly has no idea what good music is. (Microsoft, Alex Clare, ‘Too Close’, 2012)
The concepts of authenticity and taste can be linked through Heidegger’s notion of superficial ‘idle talk’. Some consumers claim to have achieved a level of authenticity where they have transcended the opinions of inauthentic mass culture. In Heidegger’s (1978: 220) terms, they believe they have avoided idle talk and do not automatically follow mainstream tastes and fashions, without prior reflection or critique:

I applaud the courage to create commercials that are artistic and different. At least one company doesn’t bend to the average bourgeois taste of the masses. (United Airlines, George Gershwin, ‘Rhapsody in Blue’, 2009)

YouTube consumers demonstrate conspicuous musical consumption by communicating their personal musical tastes to other readers. Some consumers attempt to validate their ‘good’ taste in music by quantifying the number of people with similar taste, using their perceived shared experiences to reinforce their own authenticity:

Came on here to find the song off this advert and it’s in the top viewed. 31,000 other people with good taste in music . . . nice guys (John Lewis, Fyfe Dangerfield, ‘She’s Always a Woman’, 2010)

The style of music used in advertisements frequently appeals to consumer segments that are happy to demonstrate their musical knowledge and taste. The posting below implies that the consumer is well grounded through musical knowledge which helps to create a stable sense of identity. The consumer creates the impression of having achieved a more authentic state through the wisdom of seeing beyond tribal paradigms:

I could write an essay on how this video is ideal for breaking down paradigms of OLDSKOOL vs new age/establishment vs niche, etc. (Kia, Ivan Gough/Feenixpawl, ‘In My Mind’, 2012)

In the following comment, the consumer’s superior taste in music and enhanced appreciation of musical authenticity is justified by categorizing music used in an advertisement as art. In addition, from a Heideggerian perspective, it can be viewed as an example of a demonstration of achieving a more meaningful life through a critique of commodification:

What the Beatles made was art, not just a product, like today’s pop stars. (Nike, The Beatles, ‘Revolution’, 2013, hereafter NTB)

Arsel and Thompson (2011: 795) discuss how, through media representation, hipsters are denuded ‘of any connotations of social protest’. Similarly, the current study reveals the link between musical taste and the search for an authentic identity as consumers seek to prevent the erosion of their countercultural identities through criticizing the Nike relationship with John Lennon’s idealistic social protest song Revolution. This demonstrates resistance to the way ‘cultural symbols are co-opted by the mainstream’ in order to present corporatized versions of counterculture, thereby diminishing its rebellious connotations through the commodification process (Schiele and Venkatesh, 2016: 4). Thus, when advertisers attempt to ‘appropriate the rebellious allure’ of countercultural groups in a mainstream context, such inauthenticity may devalue countercultural meaning and threaten identity (p. 8).

The consumer posting below exemplifies a number of consumer postings about an Air France advertisement that reveal how incorporating a congruous, sophisticated piece of classical music (Mozart’s Concerto No. 23) creates associations between the advertised service and characteristics
such as elegance and class. Shankar et al. (2009: 89) discuss how our relative social position is reinforced by ‘narratives of socialization’ (the stories and expectations through which we are socialized). In this context, perception of leading an authentically meaningful life through membership of an aspirational social class is demonstrated through overseas air travel usage and a refined understanding of the music of a great classical composer. The consumers are displaying their cultural capital in implying the sophistication and superiority of their own musical taste and judgement.

Klasse! The piece of course in and of itself is Mozart’s genius! But even if a premier airline uses it to depict the grandeur and elegance of what it has to offer... I think it’s well served. (Air France, Mozart, ‘K488 Adagio’, 2013, hereafter AFM)

This is possibly the MOST beautiful commercial in years – Mozart and Air France... Exquisite!!! (AFM, 2012)

Meanwhile, some consumers become involved in online disputes if they consider that their good taste, identity and search for an authentically meaningful life are threatened because an advertisement containing liked music is criticized online. An extract from such a dispute is included below:

Someday you’ll hear Mozart’s Concerto No. 23 and without realizing why, you’ll be reminded of Air France. I pity your lack of imagination. (AFM, 2012)

**Musical indexicality**

Previous research indicates that music has a memory-triggering element capable of stimulating nostalgia for past events (Holbrook and Schindler, 2003; Kerrigan et al., 2014). MacInnis and Park (1991: 162) define musical indexicality ‘as the extent to which music arouses emotion-laden memories’, discussing how musical indexicality in advertisements may make associations with consumers’ past emotional experiences. If a piece of music is associated with a meaningful earlier episode in a consumer’s life, upon hearing the music again, memories and emotions tied to the original episode may be evoked (Dowling and Harwood, 1986). In this context, musical meaning is context-specific and referential (Sawyer, 2005). Music may retrieve favourable or unfavourable emotions from memory, thus influencing ‘consumers’ feelings and ad attitudes’ (MacInnis and Park, 1991: 162).

Although consumers’ identities may change over time, music with autobiographical resonance may enable the temporary retrieval of one of their former identities, for example, through deliberately revisiting an old, beloved record collection acting as a symbolic representation of past selves (Shankar et al., 2009). The comment below emphasizes the power of music combined with the advertisement to retrieve childhood experience, enhancing the memorability of the advertisement in the process:

I still remember seeing this commercial when I was just a kid and being completely enthralled by the whole thing. The melody of this song has been playing in the back of my mind all these years. (VW, Nick Drake, ‘Pink Moon’, 2011, hereafter VWND)

The posting below provides an example of indexicality in showing how music combined with the advertisement can be used for retrieving memories and reconstructing previous identities, enabling the past to come alive:
This song and commercial bring back such a flood of memories from my youth: driving on a hot summer night with full moon and myriad of stars with good friends. (VWND, 2011)

Conversely, exciting experiences can also trigger memories of the advertising music:

I’m so glad I saw this commercial when it first came out. Now, when I go kayaking, I remember the first scene and this song comes to mind. (Nissan, Lenny Kravitz, ‘Fly Away’, 2012)

Some postings suggest evidence of Heidegger’s (1978) coincidental time, where past, present and future coexist and are linked to the search for authenticity. Thus, for Heidegger, the human being is constantly projecting forward, and such projections have the potential for a more authentic life. Future projections are always linked to the past and rendered intelligible by past meanings (Mulhall, 2005).

The comment below about an advertisement for the Vodafone mobile network clearly demonstrates how a liked, nostalgia-inducing song combined with the advertisement can bring back good memories and conjure up a rejuvenated, more authentic future identity, which in turn can lead to creating a positive attitude towards the advertisement and the brand:

More than an advert. It brings me back my young years full of outstanding memories. Hope to bring them back again… (Vodafone, The Dandy Warhols, ‘Bohemian Like You’, 2008)

The following posting demonstrates how Nick Drake’s memorable Pink Moon recording combined with the advertisement enables personalized reconstruction of a previous identity, arousing memories of carefree happiness and making the consumer think about future purchasing of the product, thus evoking Heidegger’s (1978) concept of coincidental time:

It reminds me of driving with the top down, in a good mood, driving down the Pacific coast. Every time I see this commercial or hear this song, a happy memory comes to mind. I guess it’s time to buy a convertible to feel that again. (VWND, 2010)

The posting below illustrates how music and advertisement are fused together to create coincidental time where past, present and future merge involving social values. It also suggests Kozinets’ (2002b) notion of communal authenticity and Heideggerian authenticity through care and concern for others:

I totally loved this commercial when I was a kid. I thought I would grow up and the world would be a happy peaceful place. (Coca-Cola, The Hillside Singers, ‘I’d Like to Teach the World to Sing’, 2013)

**Musical repetition**

Despite consumers’ best efforts to prevent it, music may infiltrate the mind, repeat itself continuously and become extremely difficult to dislodge. This widely experienced involuntary cognition is comparable to a cognitive itch in need of scratching and has been referred to as ‘brainworms’ or ‘sticky music’ (Sacks, 2011). From a Heideggerian perspective, our engagement with repetitive music can be similar to our relationship with ‘ready-to-hand’ tools in the external world, where we become absorbed in their use and they help us to feel ‘at-home’ (Heidegger, 1978: 233). Thus, the use of extremely addictive and repetitive types of music in advertisements may
have positive effects on consumers’ responses. The comment below indicates how continual repetition of songs in people’s minds may positively influence attitudes to the advertisement:

I love this advert, you can’t get it out of your head once you’ve heard it. I keep on randomly singing it! (Dell, Daddy Cool, ‘Lollipop’, 2010)

However, there were also many examples of negative responses to musical repetition arousing strong emotions:

Looks like I’m not the only one seeing this commercial EVERY TWO SECONDS. This song can get REALLY annoying sometimes. (Honda, Vampire Weekend, ‘Holiday’, 2011, hereafter HVW)

I hate this stupid jingle. It must have played 100 times yesterday alone. I felt like shooting the TV just because of the abuse. I would never buy a Honda. (HVW)

In the comment below, involuntary and repetitive exposure to a piece of music leads to displeasure and evocation of the brainworm image:

That tune is becoming like a worm eating its way through my brain. Make it stop! (HVW, 2011)

Sacks (2011: 100) describes how repeated sounds can reach the point of annoyance:

This endless repetition and the fact that the music in question may be irrelevant or trivial, not to one’s taste, or even hateful, suggest a coercive process, that the music has entered and subverted a part of the brain, forcing it to fire repetitively and autonomously.

In Heideggerian terms, negative moods such as those associated with musical repetition can trigger resistance to the homogenizing routines of the market, highlighting a critique of market manipulation, and the desire and potential for a more authentic existence. Through negative moods such as anxiety, the human may become detached from its taken for granted, unreflective absorption in the mass market. The human may become alienated or ‘not-at-home’ (Heidegger, 1978: 233) and may search for emancipatory possibilities. Such striving may enable consumers ‘to assert their identities in resistance to dominant meanings and power structures’ (Rumbo, 2002: 135) including the dominant cultural hegemony epitomized by relentless musical repetition in advertising. Repetition may provide security through its predictability, but can also elicit resistance by making people want to find other, more meaningfully authentic experiences.

Musical authenticity

Klein (2013: 9) argues that the use of popular music in advertising has engaged with the arguments relating to the ‘status of popular music as art, the status of art as commodity, and the existing tensions between artistic and commercial use of popular music’. Such musical authenticity debates reflect the tension ‘between cultural forms aspiring to creative integrity and those seeking commercial success’ (Holbrook, 2005: 22). As the differences in opinion around the commercialized use of music suggest, the concept of authenticity in consumption is considered to be a contested phenomenon. Adorno and Horkheimer (1997) argue that a work of art should be created for more noble purposes than mere commercialization and profit. They consider the popular music concept as commercial and inauthentic. Although the use of popular music in advertising gives companies the opportunity to communicate a favourable brand image and build a link between the music and
the advertised brand, there has been growing concern from music fans and musicians about such commercialization. In this context, Corciolani (2014) reveals how bands’ participation in advertising campaigns has been considered a breach of authenticity that may severely damage their reputation and their relationship with their fans. Many critics prefer their music to remain genuine by refusing to allow it to be used in advertisements, arguing against its commoditization and detachment from its social and cultural origins. Some postings object to the use of revered songs in advertisements. They consider musical authenticity to be compromised in the process because musicians like Brandi Carlile wrote and recorded their songs as artists, not simply to advertise any product. Such postings do not associate the market and its logic of efficiency and economic rationality with aesthetic beauty.

It’s a shame how they used Brandi’s song for a car commercial, it’s such a beautiful song. (GM, Brandi Carlile, ‘I was made for You’, 2009, hereafter GMBC)

In the following car advertisement example, the posting suggests that consumers may passionately oppose liked music being used in advertisements:


Popular music has frequently been regarded as a context for individuals’ resistance to meanings that are being imposed on them from the dominant hegemony, resistance to the market and an important means for satisfying consumer needs and expressing identity (Shankar et al., 2009). Inappropriate use of music in advertising underlines ‘concerns that culture is degraded by marketers as a means of social control’ (Bradshaw and Holbrook, 2008: 25), thus undermining the aesthetic qualities of music. In this context, use of The Beatles’ song Revolution in a Nike advertisement was considered controversial. Some of the YouTube comments regarding Nike’s use of the song suggest that it degrades the Heideggerian authenticity and value of the music as such songs carry meaningful, deeply felt social and political messages and are not created to sell goods:

Songs like Revolution don’t mean a pair of sneakers, they mean Revolution. (NTB, 2009)

Many consumers fear that advertising dilutes the aesthetic credentials of the music it uses. When the authenticity of favourite bands is indirectly questioned by association with the advertising of mundane products, the consumer’s own present or former identity is also threatened through concern about ‘the character he was trying to be – the ineffective reproduction of a desired identity’ (Shankar et al., 2009: 83):

Now there’s a big disconnect. You’d better change yourself instead. John didn’t mean change the brand of your trainers! (NTB, 2011)

Exploitation of John Lennon’s lyrics to sell shoes makes existing Nike users angry enough to boycott the brand because of the degrading of one of their favourite songs:

This is disgusting. Shame on Nike for exploiting priceless art. I will never buy another Nike shoe again. (NTB, 2008)
Consistent with the previous example, the following example demonstrates how consumers defend their musical identity from disruptions and assaults. In turn, their musical identity also defends them ‘from other people and also from own fears and insecurities’ by proclaiming their specialness (Gabriel, 2015: 29).


Sometimes advertisements may be the medium through which people become familiar with a particular musician or band. If consumers subsequently become fans, then the bands that they adopt reflect an identity choice, symbolizing social groups they wish to identify with and rejecting those to which they do not wish to belong (Bourdieu, 2010). Indeed, many people became Nick Drake fans because of the use of Pink Moon in Volkswagen advertisements:

There are many other people with similar experiences who discovered Nick Drake thanks to VW. (VWND, 2011)

Postings revealed how music associated with a particular country evoked strong feelings of national identity linked to perceived achievement of a Heideggerian, authentically meaningful life and the evocation of powerful moods:

I don’t know why this commercial literally brought tears to my eyes. It made me so emotional that I began crying uncontrollably. It is the power of music combined with the beautiful cinematography and evocative imagery, I suppose. Like most of you, I love America and I love American culture. Our automotive heritage is part of our culture and we must treasure it. (GMBC, 2009)

In some cases, music associated with national identity increased likelihood of purchase intent due to country of origin effects:

This actually makes me wanna buy an american car! Go USA! (GMBC, 2012)

Occasional postings conveyed a sense of irony regarding advertising music and the influence of multiculturalism upon a changing sense of national identity:

A song from an American musical based on a Spanish book sung for a Japanese company’s commercial. Do you feel it? Do you feel the multiculturalism? (Honda, Andy Williams, ‘The Impossible Dream’, 2011, hereafter HAW)

Particular songs evoked some of the big questions in life relating to the Heideggerian search for meaning and how to live an authentic life. For one consumer, the song translated to a life given meaning through material possessions:

They so got this so very right, a very holly-wood feel but in the right way! . . . It makes so much sense, a great song done by one of the best . . . rest in peace Andy. I want that house with the hot tub. (HAW, 2013)

For one consumer, Nick Drake’s song combined with the advertisement conveyed musical authenticity and suggested a projection towards the big issues of individual freedom, but also
demonstrated awareness of market manipulation, showing ‘how consumers willingly become complicit in their own seduction by marketplace narratives’ (Arnould and Thompson, 2005: 875):

Nick Drake’s music FINALLY got the wide recognition it so richly deserved. Watch the commercial again, note the artistry, and best of all the message of individual freedom. I’m not one easily marketed to, but I do love this commercial. (VWND, 2010)

For another consumer, the same song directly raised the question of an authentic life where an awareness of the importance of the journey in life is heightened by recognition of human mortality:

This is a great ad. It is rare that you will get a commercial that is not just a commercial but that actually says something important. This is what I think that something is; the journey is more important than the destination. Thus, the irony of the inevitability of death. (VWND, 2009)

For some, Nick Drake’s song was associated with positive, life-affirming feelings. For example, in Heideggerian terms, the song combined with the advertisement aroused romantic memories of a meaningful life through caring for another:

Rarely do I get sentimental with commercials, but this one takes me back to the time when I was dating my wife and when we were first married. We used to take drives like this in the mountains and I remember looking at her beautiful face in the moonlight. The music is perfect. The sentiment is perfect. (VWND, 2009)

Indeed, some music and advertisements were alleged to have triggered a more meaningfully authentic life in very concrete terms:

This may sound flip, but this ad, the Nick Drake track, inspired me to leave my cr! p job in Montreal and move back west to live in the mountains again. (VWND, 2010)

Discussion and conclusions

The current research builds upon and extends the findings of previous reviews of the music in advertising literature (e.g. Oakes, 2007) by revealing contrasting perspectives. On one level, it shows how music influences attitudes to the advertisement and brand, as well as potential purchase intent, but on another level, it reveals consumers’ critical awareness and frequent resistance to the use of music in advertising. The findings suggest that consumers demonstrate allegiance to musical subcultures through expressions of musical taste and they sometimes demonstrate resistance to perceived commodification of those beloved musical subcultures. From the advertisers’ perspective, observed consumer devotion to minority musical genres suggests the potential benefits of positioning brands to appeal to niche subcultures displaying passionate musical allegiance (e.g. fans of electronic dance music genre dubstep). The current study suggests that ‘listeners are not passive consumers, but active partners in a cultural process who use music to fulfil different functions according to different social contexts’ (Hargreaves et al., 2002: 13). Our findings suggest that the Heideggerian concept of authenticity is an overarching framework that binds together analysis of musical taste, musical indexicality, musical repetition and musical authenticity. For example, in some cases, consumers indicate they have achieved a more authentically meaningful life and higher social status by claiming to be able to distinguish between good and bad taste in
music and advertisements. In Heidegger’s terms, they suggest they have enhanced their authenticity by being able to identify idle talk.

Findings regarding indexicality reveal how emotional responses to advertising music may be due to the triggering of autobiographical memories, thus making such responses unpredictable and difficult to control for advertisers due to the individualized nature of the memories. Data in the current study associates indexicality with personalized reconstruction of previous identities, demonstrating how music may serve as an aide-memoire that allows consumers to relive experiences from their past and reflect upon them (Nowak, 2016). Functioning as an aesthetic marker, music may illuminate a narrative that enables recall of significant passages in life that sometimes reinforce the maintenance of identity over time, and at other times suggest that identity involves ‘continuous discourse in an ever changing and evolving communication of oneself to others’ (Parsons, 2010: 284). For example, the data demonstrates the gradual evolution of a shifting sense of national identity within the context of increased multiculturalism. In contrast, the data also shows how the recall of critical incidents in consumers’ lives helps to maintain a unified sense of individual identity over time through memory evocation (e.g. when the music brings a consumer back to their young years). Furthermore, findings suggest that music and advertisements can be linked to Heideggerian time, where past, present and future are experienced simultaneously. Moments of authenticity may be triggered in the melee of emotions, memories and projections.

Grayson and Martinec (2004: 298) suggest that ‘evaluating whether one’s self is authentic is qualitatively different from evaluating whether something else is authentic’. However, within the context of responses to music in advertising, the current article argues that such evaluations are inevitably interconnected in the construction of an authentic identity. When a piece of music associated with a consumer’s sense of self-identity becomes less authentic through commodification, the consumer may feel that their own identity is threatened. Indeed, findings indicate consumer resistance to advertising that attempts to control consumer behaviour, including attempting to impose ‘normative social identity’ (Rumbo, 2002: 130) through musical repetition. Anxiety is a key emotion for Heidegger that the current data suggests can trigger critically reflective resistance as the human being becomes aware of its freedom to choose certain paths.

In addition, there is resistance to advertising that is perceived to undermine the musical authenticity of favourite bands through excessive commercialization that some consumers allege debases fine art and ruins the experience and memories of many people, highlighting ‘antagonisms between music and advertising’ (Eckhardt and Bradshaw, 2014: 169). Furthermore, some consumers are extremely sensitive to the use of music composed and sung by popular musicians to transmit social and political messages, which is then used for the purpose of selling products in advertisements. Thus, the data indicates that music is not simply regarded as an instrumental commodity that may influence intent to purchase advertised products, but is frequently considered a sacred product in its own right. In such contexts, ‘consumers build and maintain identity boundaries between insiders and outsiders and protect tribal resources from appropriation by marketers’ through resistance that helps to sustain their identities (Healy and Beverland, 2016: 224). In seeking the emancipatory preservation of their own identities, they are resisting the temptation to ‘adopt identities that are pre-established by the market agents’ (Ulusoy, 2016: 251). Retention of individual and collective identity through music may assist ‘consumers in their quest for existential meanings’ as well as providing a form of ‘resistance to and emancipation from oppression’ (p. 252) evident in excessive musical repetition and authenticity threats.

In general, the findings suggest that the power of music can often link the advertisement to deep-rooted identity projects and values which can be usefully interpreted through Heidegger’s
concept of authenticity. Thus, from a Heideggerian perspective, our findings reveal that the music and the advertisement (whether perceived as congruous or incongruous) are often connected to the fundamental human search for meaning in life, contributing to understanding one’s place in the world and one’s relationship to others, in a variety of ways, often mediated or triggered by moods. For some consumers in our study, this takes the form of material authenticity (seeking authenticity through material possessions), illustrating Heidegger’s notion of ‘wishing’ (absorption in the market with an uncritical stance). For other consumers, music (linked to advertised brands) has the power to evoke questions in life relating to individual freedom and a more critical stance towards the market.

In some cases, music is implicated in Heidegger’s care and concern for others (e.g. ethical concerns with poverty, justice, equality and peace) which he regards as fundamental to achieving authenticity. For example, our findings reveal Heidegger’s care for others where the world is envisioned by one consumer as ‘a happy peaceful place’ on hearing the song ‘I’d like to teach the world to sing’. In addition, findings in the current study also reveal Heidegger’s care for others in the expression of romantic memories of lifelong, personal relationships. These examples extend Kozinets’ (2002b) notion of communal authenticity, and the Heideggerian perspective shows how they link to care as a fundamental structure of human existence. Furthermore, the Heideggerian perspective (including concepts such as idle talk, coincidental time and moods) emphasizes the significance of philosophically driven ideological authenticity in consumers’ responses to music and advertisements. Thus, by exploring what it means to exist from a philosophical perspective, we extend Leigh et al.’s (2006) application of the concept of existential authenticity which focuses on role performance and communal commitment.

The research contributes to marketing theory by interpreting consumers’ responses to music and advertisements through Heidegger’s (1978) authenticity concept as a perpetual search for (or projection towards) meaning where the past, the present and the future reciprocally question and illuminate one another (Mulhall, 2005), and the human being can potentially become aware of individual freedom to choose certain paths, triggered by moods such as anxiety and the phenomenon of care and concern. From this perspective, the Heideggerian concept of authenticity indicates that music and advertising may become implicated in long-term projects for consumer emancipation rather than emancipation only being conceived ‘as temporary and local’ as was suggested by Kozinets (2002b: 36). Future netnographic research building upon the findings from the current study could consider consumers’ experience of the interplay between music, visual images and words in specific advertisements in order to ‘analyze rhetorical and imagistic qualities that contribute to advertising resonance’ (Arnould and Thompson, 2005: 875) and ‘interpret music as part of an overall rhetorical intention’ (Scott, 1990: 223), thus enriching the analysis of themes that emerge.

**Declaration of Conflicting Interests**

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

**Funding**

The author(s) received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.
References


**Morteza Abolhasani** is a doctoral researcher and teaching assistant at the University of Liverpool Management School. He received a Civil Engineering Associate’s degree in Iran, after which he worked as a civil engineer. He received the Bachelor of Business Administration degree (first class) from Symbiosis International University, Pune, India, followed by the MSc Consumer Marketing (with distinction) from the University of Liverpool Management School. His main research interests focus upon the interpretation of consumer responses to background music in advertising and service environments. Address: University of Liverpool, G3/207, Crown Place 200 Brownlow Hill, Liverpool L35UE, UK. [email: morty@liv.ac.uk]

**Steve Oakes** is a senior lecturer in marketing at the University of Liverpool Management School whose research focuses upon consumer responses to music in advertising and service environment contexts. An additional strand of his research examines key issues for arts (especially music) marketing. He has published in various journals including *Psychology & Marketing, Journal of Advertising Research, Marketing Theory, Journal of Marketing Management, Applied Cognitive Psychology, Journal of Marketing Communications, The Service Industries Journal and Journal of Services Marketing*, among others. Address: University of Liverpool Management School, Chatham Street, Liverpool L69 7ZH, UK. [email: soakes@liverpool.ac.uk]

**Helen Oakes** is a senior lecturer in accounting. Her broad research interests include the roles of accounting and marketing communications in generating organizational and societal progress. She has published empirical and theoretical work in various journals, including *Accounting Forum, Journal of Marketing Management, Accounting and Business Research, Critical Perspectives on Accounting and International Journal of Critical Accounting*. The focus of the current article upon music and Heidegger draws upon research interests developed during her additional degrees in music and philosophy. Address: University of Sheffield, Sheffield S10 2TN, UK. [email: h.oakes@sheffield.ac.uk]