Memories of pre- and post-migration consumption: better times or embodiments of a defensive mental state?

Conference or Workshop Item

How to cite:

For guidance on citations see FAQs.

© [not recorded]

Version: Accepted Manuscript
Stereotypes, memories and nostalgia: 
Contested states of longing, belonging, and being within consumer acculturation

Chair: Andrew Lindridge, The Open University Business School  
Discussant leader: Professor Lisa Peñaloza, EDHEC, France  
Presenters:  
• Natalia Tolstikova, SUSB, and Susanna Molander, SUSB, Sweden. 
  “Russians always wear red lipstick”: Acculturation, Identity and Stereotypes  
• Andrew Lindridge, The Open University Business School, Great Britain.  
  Memories of pre- and post-migration consumption: 
  Better times or embodiments of a defensive mental state?  
• Celina Stamboli, Iseg School, France, and Luca M. Visconti, ESCP Europe, France.  
• Mine Üçok Hughes, Woodbury University, USA. 

Social Status Implications of Transmigrants’ Consumer Practices in Their Cultures of Origin


***************************************************************************

Stereotypes, memories and nostalgia: 
Contested states of longing, belonging, and being within consumer acculturation

The theme of this year’s ACR conference is “Appreciating Diversity”. In congruence with this theme, this session explores various stages of consumer acculturation as they relate to the experience of immigrants both in the country of re-rooting and in their home country. Consumer acculturation then is viewed as a manifestation of wider interactions and power play between the dominant host society, the immigrant populations, and their ethnic networks in the home countries, as these groups negotiate inevitable cultural and societal changes. Extant acculturation research has tended to be either American centric favouring comparative studies of assimilation amongst different ethnic groups (Waters 2005) or focuses mostly on the way immigrants confront the consumption practices of the host nation (Wamwara-Mbugua, Cornwell, and Boller 2007). The four presentations together address these criticisms through illustrating the varying stages in the consumer acculturation process, ranging from initial immigrant contact, through to negotiating feelings of loss and dislocation, culminating in consumer acculturation problems related to the migrants’ return to their original home country. By drawing upon research from a European centric perspective we illustrate the complex roles that consumption undertakes in how immigrants negotiate and construct their sense of identity, self-esteem and place in the world.

The first paper explores the role of consumption in stereotyping and stigmatising amongst Russian immigrants living in Sweden. To handle the stereotypes ascribed to them the Russian informants seemed inclined to conform to the stereotypes they ascribed to the Swedes and to thus consume accordingly. The sense of dislocation inferred in this paper is continued in the next paper, which explores the role of real and re-created memories amongst immigrants. Negative acculturation experiences lead to migrants recalling and re-creating pre-migration memories and making these memories real through consumption cues. In doing so immigrants tended to split their memories distinctly between pre- and post-migration, recreating pre-migration consumption memories as a defence mechanism against acculturation stress. The third paper continues the theme of dislocation and recreating pre-migration through understanding the role of nostalgia within consumer acculturation. In particular, this paper deconstructs the nostalgia of Turkish immigrants living in France into four categories indicative of their acculturation processes, including a nostalgia based around
the desire to identify with the country of their ancestral origin. Nostalgia and the desire to return to Turkey by Turkish immigrants are discussed in our final paper, which also touches upon stereotypes and stigma among those who do return to visit Turkey. Exposure to Western European culture and consumer acculturation renders these returning Turks as foreigners in a country that they feel a close connection with. The four papers in this session thus firmly locate the migrant not as a welcomed, integrated embodiment of wider society, but forever a group in transition and constantly adapting, recreating and reconstructing a sense of identity. Notably, migrant identity practices implicate consumption to simultaneously integrate into the dominant culture, while yielding protection from the wider pressures of acculturation.

Three of the session papers are completed projects, with one representing an ongoing project, and all present differing theoretical perspectives. Methodologically, the papers adhere to the interpretivist approach and provide empirical knowledge based on ethnographic data. This special session is then expected to appeal to an audience interested in the interactions between culture, ethnicity, identity and consumption, whilst being of interest to those academics with an interest in memories and nostalgia.

Finally, the focus of the proposed session on immigrants and the role of consumer acculturation from a European centric perspective addresses the diverse audience of ACR and resonates with Vancouver’s diverse population.

Abstracts

“Russians always wear red lipstick”: Acculturation, Identity and Stereotypes
Natalia Tolstikova, and Susanna Molander, USB, Sweden

The paper investigates how stereotyping affects consumer acculturation illustrated through the study of Russians living in Stockholm, Sweden. Stereotypes can be seen as subjective positions mutually constructed by Swedes and Russians; positions that operate as a reference points from which people compare/distinguish themselves within consumer acculturation.

Memories of pre- and post-migration consumption:
Better times or embodiments of a defensive mental state?
Andrew Lindridge, The Open University Business School, Great Britain.

Previous studies have focused on the relationship between consumption and post-migration with little consideration of the traumatic effects of migration. We question the assumptions of migration being a positive process by exploring consumption as an embodiment of traumatic shift in migrants psyche and subsequent memories and behaviors.

Home Sweet Home: The Role of Home Country Nostalgia on Immigrants’ Acculturation and Consumption

This work helps advance acculturation research by locating immigrant’s home country nostalgia in the middle of the acculturation process. We detect a circular process connecting home country nostalgia to immigrants’ consumption, and elaborate four manifestations of nostalgic consumption: shelter, tribute, solidarity, and reculturation.

Social Status Implications of Transmigrants’ Consumer Practices in Their Cultures of Origin
Mine Üçok Hughes, Woodbury University, USA

Rooted in ethnographic empirical research, this paper explores the consumption practices, experiences, perceptions and identity negotiations of Turkish transmigrants during their annual visits to Turkey and the subsequent implications on their social status. Building on previous literature, the contributions emphasize the importance of transmigrant identity positioning in their cultures of origin.
During the last few decades the world has experienced migration on a global scale resulting in a growing number of consumers with a foreign background living in Sweden; something which has put acculturation on the political agenda. Immigrants both forge and are subjected to various processes of acculturation and previous consumer acculturation research has documented the play of multiple cultures: the host, the migrant, and the transnational.

Since the acculturation process is a mutual adjustment where the parties are learning to co-exist, it is important to study the ways in which migrants and hosts develop understandings of each other. Both the migrant and the host are often a subject of mutual stereotyping where particular traits and values are ascribed to them. Those stereotypes can be positive but are more often biased and oversimplified. The stereotyping has to do with normative expectations regarding conduct or character of people “who are passing strangers to us” (Goffman 1963, p. 68). The concept of stereotyping has been well developed in other disciplines but not in literature dealing with acculturation through consumption (i.e. Askegaard et al. 2005, Luedicke 2011). This study intends to fill this literature gap by exploring how stereotyping affects the process of acculturation through consumption. The analysis will be based on the multi-disciplinary literature on stereotypes (e.g., Hinton 2000), as well as on stigma (Goffman 1963).

We have chosen to study Russian immigrants in Sweden and conducted a pilot study consisting of three in-depth interviews with young Russian females living in Stockholm. The informants were asked about why they came to Sweden, what they do now and what their everyday life looks like. In the course of these “oral stories” the goal was to identify stereotypes as well as the coping practices. The main study consists of 20 interviews with Russians of diverse ages and backgrounds. Complimenting this, a critical review was undertaken of Swedish media portrayals of Swedish stereotypes of Russians connected to historic-political developments. From the data, three main stereotypes are highlighted:

- A cultivated culture: refined, formed through literature, music, theater: pre-revolutionary Russia;
- A feared culture: characterized by strong ‘bullying’ power, military domination: a Communist ideological stronghold throughout, especially during the cold war;
- A materialist culture: non-sophisticated consumption, nouveau rich: post-Communism.

When summarizing the interviews we found that, remarkably, only negative stereotypes, similar to those propagated by Swedish popular culture, were identified by the interviewees: “Russians can always be identified as Russians. [They] always [wear] red lipstick and too much eye make-up, stiletto heels. The colors [of their dress and make-up] are always standing out” (interview with A). The same woman was eager to point out that she did not belong to this category and was similar to a Swede who dressed more “low key.”

The preliminary analysis of the interviews show that the emerging stereotypes are “the extreme materialist” (Russian stereotype of Russians) and “the rational functionalist” (Russian stereotype of Swedes). These stereotypes could be partially explained by the power dynamics between the groups, where Swedishness holds the dominating position and Russianness is perceived an abnormality, a deviant expression, and a stigma (Goffman 1963). Stigma is a mark of distinction and articulation of distinctions and is a social construct, not an inherent quality (ibid). As an ascribed way of behavior and appearance it renders Russians to be socially inferior. All three interviewees, both verbally and in their appearance, were inclined to conform to the Swedish cultural ideology of “lagom” or “just enough”. “Lagom” propagates moderation which seems to diametrically oppose the Russian materialist
stereotype – the garishness and the tendency to “show off”. We hope to develop this finding further at a later research stage.

Our preliminary research also demonstrates that although created externally, stereotypes are internalized by those subjected to them, so a Russian can always recognize another Russian. Furthermore, Russians also seem to use stereotyping as part of a power play. For example, “It is easy to recognize a Russian… In Russia … we dress on our best when [going out]. Swedes can show up in a pajama, it is considered normal” (interview with N).

The stereotypes presented here can be seen as subject positions mutually constructed by Swedes and Russians; positions that operate as a reference points from which people compare/distinguish themselves. The analysis shows that these stereotypes seem to play a major part in the acculturation process and mostly manifest themselves through consumption.

Memories of pre- and post-migration consumption:
Better times or embodiments of a defensive mental state?
Andrew Lindridge, The Open University Business School, Great Britain.

Previous migration studies tend to draw an implicit line between the place and time of migration (past) and the current place and time (present). Yet this approach fails to address how pre-migration memories emerge and appear in migrants’ daily lives. In particular, research has not addressed: (i) how migrants’ present lives evoke memories of their past, or how consumption may reproduce pre-migration routines and knowledge, and (ii) how consumption is used in recalling past memories into the present, even if this leads to conflict between what is remembered and what is experienced. We explore these questions through migrants’ pre- and post-migration memories, and how they manifest through consumption. In doing so we address research calls to understand how people encode and retrieve memories (Hastie and Dawes 2001) and identity-based consumer memories (Mercurio and Forehand 2011).

The concept of memories and consumption, extensively addressed within consumer literature, offers interesting insights into the relationship between migration memories and consumption. For example, migrants’ consumption of products indicative of pre-migration, such as food, may reinforce positive memories (Schlosser 2006), yet such consumption acts may be undertaken to create false pre-migration memories. Indeed, Schlosser (2006, p. 377) notes that object interactivity may lead to “the creation of vivid, internally generated recollections that pose as real memories”. Real experiences of a pre-migration life subsequently may become modified based around autobiographical events into false memories (Loftus and Pickrell 1995) or be induced by product consumption that the individual has not previously used (Rajagopal and Montgomery 2011). Hence, Aaker, Drolet and Griffin (2008), drawing upon the psychological theory of memory, argue that memories are not a direct copy of the individual’s past but instead are reconstructed and re-imagined, brought alive through a variety of cues that assist individuals in making inferences about their past. The extent then that acculturation produces stress and this stress is managed through positive real and re-imagined memories of a pre-migration through consumption cues forms the basis of this research.

A sample group (n=8) of first generation Indian immigrants living in Britain were repeatedly interviewed to gather their pre- and post-migration experiences, lived lives, memories and consumption behaviors. Interviews were recorded, transcribed and analysed.

Data analysis revealed a clear splitting in participants’ memories between their pre- and post-migration experiences, and consequently their memories. Of interest was how consumption featured in these memories and the sensory aspects of these memories differed.

Migration memories for participants were vividly recalled in terms of colours, smells and textures. For example, Margey describes her childhood memories of life in India as ‘...bright
and warm and very real almost...the colours are more vivid and alive, the smells I can recall are like I am actually there [in India]'. References are made to cultural symbolisms such as brightly coloured bracelets and cloth being purchased to make clothes. In contrast, Margey’s post-migration life in Britain, one where acculturation stress manifested in family tensions, is described as feeling ‘...a bit cold because it’s wintry quite a lot. Maybe I felt the cold more because I was from a warm place, but it felt cold ... and me wearing ...a grey duffle coat I used to have...so it feels like a black and white film.’ The association of memories of life in Britain in black and white terms is later associated with consumption experiences, such as collecting the coal for the lounge fire, the brown lino floor covering and so on. Similar findings were shared with other participants.

The recall of memories in sensory terms is somewhat similar to Aaker, Drolet and Griffin’s (2008) and Loftus and Pickerell’s (1995) work on reconstruction of memories. The focussing on pre-migration memories predominately represented happier times for participants, when issues of identity difference and related stresses were less pronounced. Consequently, participants appear to be engaging in a process of re-imagining pre-migration memories and related experiences, as suggested by Rajagopal and Montgomery (2011). Participants achieved these re-imagining symbolic consumption experiences, such as their mother’s cooking, indicative of pre-migration. Whilst clothing and religious artifacts, to some extent supported these memory recalls, food production and consumption was seen as central to memory recall. For instance, Tracey commented how she recreates childhood pre-migration memories through consuming potato poratas (a potato-bread dish): ‘When my older sister makes it [potato poratas], it does take you back. You remember her [participant’s sister] making it for you and putting it on your plate, you used to think, ‘Oh, I remember this, eating this on [this pre-migration date]’, call it the baby turn...reminds you of old times’. These consumption experiences tended to occur during moments of heightened stress levels.

The question then arises why do participants split their pre- and post-migration memories so distinctly? We suggest that the answer may lie in the psychodynamic term ‘splitting’, where traumatic events are separated and compartmentalised by the individual between good and bad events. In this instance, participants effectively were splitting their migration memories between pre-migration (colourful and positive) and post-migration (black and white, and negative). This act of splitting then represents a psychological defence mechanism to protect the individual’s self-identity. Participants’ pre-migration memories tended to be provoked during stressful experiences (feelings surrounding acculturation stress, such as ethnic difference) or illness (comforting). In the former, consumption was actively used to recall pre-migration memories to relieve symptoms of acculturation stress, whilst in the latter consumption invoked positive, comforting, pre-migration memories.

For those migrants who migrated as children, post-migration is reflected in various acculturation stresses, suggesting a wider sense of disempowerment arising from migration. Recreating consumption experiences based on pre-migration memories offered a means of relieving acculturation stresses, offering a sense of empowerment. For example, Peter watching old Bollywood films remembered from his childhood in India. The extent that these memories are re-imagined is inferred by the participants themselves, which may explain the contrasting colours used in memory recall. In contrast, only one participant differed in her memory narratives. A woman who actively sought out and chosen migration to emancipate herself from Indian cultural patriarchy.

Home Sweet Home: The Role of Home Country Nostalgia on Immigrants’ Acculturation and Consumption
Nostalgia has been defined as a psychological obsession “to be back”, that is, “a sentimental longing for the past”, which people may develop with reference to things, significant-others, places or experiences that are no longer existing or at direct reach.

Acculturation studies and nostalgia research have developed quite independently. While extant works on nostalgia have largely advanced, and identified various facets of this emotion and its implications on consumption, acculturation studies have only marginally addressed nostalgia. Within the body of works investigating nostalgia, it has been argued that nostalgia can be either a state of personal (Holbrook and Schindler 1991) or social emotion (Zauberman, Ratner, and Kim 2009). Also, it has been proved that nostalgia can be activated from: (i) an idealization of direct memories (true or real nostalgia), (ii) from an indirect experience via the memories of the people close to us (simulated nostalgia) and, (iii) from the collective evocation of some pretended origins (collective nostalgia) (Baker and Kennedy 1994). Finally, (iv) time orientation marks the distinction between retrospective (“if only” fantasies) versus prospective forms of nostalgia (“someday” fantasies) (Akhtar 1996).

Whilst nostalgia recurs within acculturation studies this is mostly as a side-effect. Immigrants developing new cultural competences in the host culture are described as nostalgic individuals who indulge in the consumption of artifacts (food, media, novels, clothes, etc.). These artifacts are dense in memories of their “other life” and, for many of them, of the “dreamed future life” once back to the country of origin (i.e., the myth of return) (Akhtar 1996). As such, nostalgia is seen as an effect or an implication of acculturation.

Our work argues that nostalgia is not only an outcome of immigration and the related pains of integrating in a frequently hostile, resisting, culture, but also plays a major role in the way immigrants acculturate to the host culture. Nostalgia then may be a constituent of the acculturation process that extant research has undervalued. In detail, this paper aims at answering to two main research questions: (i) what is the role of home country nostalgia in the processes of immigrants’ acculturation? and (ii) what is the connection between immigrants’ nostalgia for their home country and their consumption behaviors?

This study is based on an ethnographic research, conducted in France, on 18 Turkish immigrants (seven first generation and 11 second generation participants) followed during a period of 18 months. Data was mainly collected by means of in-depth interviews and participant observation, and complemented by factual data on the narrators, indirect indicators (e.g., social capital indicators captured during the interviews), and photography, in order to increase the richness of the data set. During the semi-structured interviews, questions covered the interviewees’ life histories, their feelings about their host and the home society, their food and media consumption habits, and more. Data was analyzed iteratively consistently with interpretive research logics and through a circular theory-field process.

Our findings are two-fold. First, we detect four main nostalgia consumption patterns deployed by immigrants’ along their process of acculturation: shelter, tribute, solidarity, and reculturation. More expectedly, when immigrants are dissatisfied with their extant life due to isolation, negative stereotypes or marginality (cfr. Tolstikova and Molander’s, Lindridge’s, and Ucok Hughes’ papers in this session), they may indulge in nostalgic consumption — typically of food, given its pervasive capability of activating various senses and Turkish soap operas — so to build a shelter in which to escape the arduousness of their life. More notably, nostalgic consumption can be used as a tribute to the home country. The largest majority of Turkish immigrants in France, including our informants, migrated for economic reasons looking for better job opportunities. As a consequence, many of these immigrants later developed a sense of guilt because they felt they had abandoned their country for personal financial gain. Paradoxically, the perceived betrayal of a beloved Turkey, due to personal materialistic reasons, is emended through materialistic purchase and consumption of
nostalgic goods (cultural products as DVDs, albums, decoration objects, etc.). These purchases then become a tribute to their home country where their achieved economic capital is transformed into symbolic and cultural capital (cfr. Üçok Hughes’ paper in the session).

Nostalgic consumption may also serve at a social level, and notably within the local ethnic community, as an expression of solidarity. Our data shows that Turkish immigrants are evaluated and sanctioned by relatives and other Turkish acquaintances living in France. As such, the decision of indulging in nostalgic consumptions (folklore, food, narratives, etc), as a form of reciprocal support, testifies to their common belongingness; the celebration of an “ideal us”, as opposed to the dominating French society. Finally, and especially for second generations, nostalgic consumptions serve as means of reiculturation. Food, Turkish art, media, and ethnic retailing shops respond to the quest of yearning and understanding of Turkish culture for Turks living in France, who have grown up in a different cultural context. Reculturation applies also to first generation immigrants, but in this case nostalgic consumptions are used to revisit, revise, and groom their pristine cultural background.

A second order of findings illustrates the nature of the connection between home country, nostalgia and consumption. Empirical evidence demonstrates a circular, self-feeding process through either the exposure of Turkish immigrants to nostalgic consumption activates nostalgic feelings, or the search for nostalgic consumption is guided by a pre-existing nostalgic emotion for the home country.

This work helps advance acculturation research by locating immigrants’ nostalgia for the home country in the middle of the acculturation process. Nostalgic consumption is not only an effect of acculturation but also a powerful part of it. A part that is capable of increasing/reducing immigrants’ chances to succeed in their double integration into the host culture and the local ethnic community.

Social Status Implications of Transmigrants’ Consumer Practices in Their Cultures of Origin
Mine Üçok Hughes, Woodbury University, USA

While substantial research focuses on the consumption practices and identity projects of immigrants in their cultures of settlement, this phenomenon is largely ignored with regards to transmigrants’ cultures of origin. Rooted in ethnographic empirical research, this paper explores the consumption practices, experiences, perceptions and identity negotiations of Turkish transmigrants, living in Denmark, during their annual visits to Turkey and the subsequent implications on their social status.

Research literature abounds with studies of acculturation patterns of people moving into a new culture, including patterns of immigrant consumer acculturation from one extreme (hyper identification) to the other (rejection). Transmigrant studies (Basch et al., 1994) have analyzed immigrants as being global, transnational, consumers whose lives and consumption practices are affected not only by interactions with their cultures of migration, but also with their cultures of origin (Üçok and Kjeldgaard 2005). These transmigrants are described as immigrants who continue to forge and sustain ties with their home/host cultures, implying connections to their countries of origin (Basch et al. 1994).

Transmigrants often acquire several identities, as their social status and class varies across social and national contexts. Many carry their possessions with them, often as status symbols. Yet, these possessions may connote different meanings in different contexts. For example, Caglar (2002) found that the decoration and organization of Turkish immigrants’ homes, in Germany and Turkey differed strikingly, due to German Turks’ quest for recognition. Being stigmatized in Germany as a foreign, non-European group, they suffer from a lack of social recognition. In contrast to their low status in Germany, working class German Turks find themselves economically closer to the middle class in Turkey. However, because Turkey is a class structured society, with invisible barriers to class mobility, transmigrants experience
resistance from the Turkish middle class who find German Turks’ symbolic capital to be insufficient for inclusion.

Beginning in the early 1960s, Turkey has witnessed major migratory movements, domestically and internationally. Üstüner and Holt (2007) researched the social status struggles of domestic migrants and their descendants who settled in big city squatters, and found that their efforts at social mobility were restricted by their lack of capital.

Turkish immigrants in Denmark constitute a heterogeneous group with regards to age, gender, education level, and occupation. For example, Üçok and Kjeldgaard (2005) found that within one group, savings accumulated in Denmark are transferred to Turkey to buy status-symbol goods, whilst in another group, economic capital is transferred, within Denmark, into social and cultural capital to facilitate successful integration. Typically, first-generation immigrants are likely to invest in Turkey by accumulating houses, land and shops in their hometown, and summer houses in coastal towns. They continue to support their relatives financially and contribute to the local community by donating towards the building of mosques or other communal buildings. Vacationing at five star holiday resorts on the Turkish Riviera also is popular, especially among the descendants (ibid).

Data for the current research were collected in Turkey and Denmark, amongst Turkish transmigrants, in five towns, over a period of two years. Semi-structured and in-depth interviews were conducted with members of Turkish immigrant communities in Denmark, as well as with their families living in Turkey. The author also participated in several cultural events in both countries and documented her observations via a research journal. Photographs were taken to document immigrants’ homes (inside and outside), personal possessions and their cultural functions. Secondary data was also collected, mainly, through Turkish and Danish print media. All immigrants interviewed still held strong ties with their friends and families living in Turkey. This paper focuses on the immigrant experiences encountered during the annual visits to Turkey.

Vedat, a male, first generation immigrant informant, is typical of participants when he spoke about the stigmatization Turks living in Denmark faced in their “home” town/country: “When we go to Turkey they say we are tourists, they don’t look at us. We have become strangers. The villagers . . . they look at us and call us gavurcusun [you are a foreigner] … everywhere! Once you are in Turkey, everywhere”. Gavur, meaning “an infidel”, is a term, heavily laden with negative connotations, applied by Turks to Islamic disbelievers, especially Christians. Similarly, the word Almancı, “Germanite”, connotes that the emigrants are non-Turkish “foreigners”, associated with Europeans and Christians. Thus, Turks visiting Turkey are seen as tourists in a place they consider their home. This stigmatization is common among the upper-middle class Turks, who often perceive Turkish immigrants as nouveau rich, working class, peasants.

Üstüner and Holt’s (2007) description of second-generation squatter women in Turkey, also applies to the second-generation informants in this study, whose relation to their parents’ villages is one of deterritorialization, lacking in a natural connection. Many of these informants migrated to European cities, often having never experienced the consumer acculturation that they would have gained had they lived in large Turkish cities. Upon arriving in Europe, they lived in immigrant enclaves and stuck to their roots, thus severely affecting their acculturation process, resulting in lower cultural and social capital.

In summary, in a less industrialized country, such as Turkey, where socio-cultural structures create barriers for social mobility, Turkish transmigrants may hold economic capital but this does not necessarily transfer into cultural and social capital, necessary to allow them to be accepted and participate in Turkish society. This can manifest itself as stigmatization of the consumers, which then can result in them feeling alienated from the community of which they consider themselves to be a part. The transmigrants’ identity
positionings in various national and socio-cultural contexts are problematic because they are far from being fluid. Building on previous literature (Caglar 2002; Üstüner and Holt 2007; 2010) the contributions suggest conceptualization of transmigrant identity positionings in the cultures of origins similar to those that have been conceptualized in the cultures of destination.

References